



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## PUBLIC AUDIT AND POST-LEGISLATIVE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

### MINUTES

22nd Meeting, 2019 (Session 5)

Thursday 3 October 2019

Present:

Colin Beattie	Bill Bowman
Willie Coffey	Liam Kerr (Deputy Convener)
Jenny Marra (Convener)	Alex Neil
Anas Sarwar	

The meeting opened at 9.00 am.

1. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to take items 4, 5 and 6 in private.
2. **Post-legislative Scrutiny - Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002:** The Committee took evidence from—

Professor Kevin Dunion, Honorary Professor in the School of Law and Executive Director of the Centre of Freedom of Information, University of Dundee;

Dr Karen McCullagh, Lecturer in Law and Course Director, LLM Media Law, Policy and Practice, UEA Law School, University of East Anglia;

Professor Colin Reid, Professor of Environmental Law, University of Dundee;

Alistair Sloan, Solicitor, Inkster Solicitors;

Dr Ben Worthy (by video link), Senior Lecturer in Politics at Birkbeck College, University of London.

3. **Section 23 report - Finances of Scottish universities:** The Committee took evidence from—

Caroline Gardner, Auditor General for Scotland;

Antony Clark, Audit Director, Mark MacPherson, Senior Manager, and Adam Bullough, Audit Manager, Performance Audit and Best Value, Audit Scotland.

4. **Section 23 report - Finances of Scottish universities (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence heard at agenda item 3 and took further evidence from—

Caroline Gardner, Auditor General for Scotland;

Antony Clark, Audit Director, Mark MacPherson, Senior Manager, and Adam Bullough, Audit Manager, Performance Audit and Best Value, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to consider its next steps at a future meeting.

5. **Post-legislative Scrutiny - Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence heard at agenda item 2.
6. **Work programme (in private):** The Committee considered its work programme.

The Committee considered its future scrutiny of the Auditor General for Scotland's report entitled "The 2018/19 audit of the Scottish Prison Service". The Committee agreed to invite a selection of stakeholders, the Scottish Prison Service and the Scottish Government to provide oral evidence at a future meeting.

The meeting closed at 11.21 am.

Lucy Scharbert  
Clerk to the Public Audit and Post-legislative Scrutiny Committee  
Room T3.60  
The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
Tel: 0131 348 5390  
Email: papls.committee@parliament.scot