



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## **PUBLIC AUDIT AND POST-LEGISLATIVE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

### **MINUTES**

**9th Meeting, 2019 (Session 5)**

**Thursday 21 March 2019**

Present:

Colin Beattie	Finlay Carson (Committee Substitute)
Willie Coffey	Liam Kerr (Deputy Convener)
Jenny Marra (Convener)	Alex Neil
Anas Sarwar	

Also present: Christine Grahame

Apologies were received from Bill Bowman.

The meeting opened at 9.00 am.

1. **Declaration of interests:** Finlay Carson was invited to declare any relevant interests. Finlay Carson indicated he had no interests to declare. In relation to agenda item 4, Finlay Carson declared an interest as an owner of a small holding. He also indicated that he is a member of the National Farmers Union Scotland.
2. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to take item 5 in private.
3. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to consider a draft report on the Auditor General for Scotland's reports entitled "The 2016/17 audit of NHS Tayside and "The 2017/18 audit of NHS Tayside" in private at future meetings.
4. **Post-legislative scrutiny - Control of Dogs (Scotland) Act 2010:** The Committee took evidence from—

Christine Grahame MSP;

Ash Denham MSP, Minister for Community Safety, and Philip Lamont,

Criminal Justice Division, Scottish Government.

5. **Post-legislative scrutiny - Control of Dogs (Scotland) Act 2010 (in private):**  
The Committee considered the evidence heard at agenda item 4.

The meeting closed at 10.53 am.

Lucy Scharbert  
Clerk to the Public Audit and Post-legislative Scrutiny Committee  
Room T3.60  
The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
Tel: 0131 348 5390  
Email: [papls.committee@parliament.scot](mailto:papls.committee@parliament.scot)