Thank you for your letter of 8 September seeking a response to the Committee’s report - Teacher Workforce Planning for Scotland’s Schools.

I would like to take the opportunity to thank the Committee for undertaking a comprehensive review of this issue. Teacher recruitment is, as we know, not just a challenge for Scotland. The International Summit of the teaching profession in March this year identified it as a global issue. That said maintaining teacher numbers is a key plank of this government’s ambitions to achieve excellence and equity in Scottish education and I thank the Committee for recognising the extensive work that is already underway in meeting the challenge of teacher recruitment.

Please find attached a response to the Committee’s recommendations that are directed to the Scottish Government and the Teacher Workforce Planning Advisory Group.

JOHN SWINNEY
Recommendation 4
The Committee recommends that the Government should commission an independent evaluation of the data required to inform its national workforce planning processes. The Committee also requests a response to this report from the Teacher Workforce Planning Advisory Group (TWPAG) detailing its position on each of the suggestions for improvement received in evidence.

Scottish Government Response
Scotland is unique in that we have over the years developed a very robust model for workforce planning which incorporates the key data controls for managing the workforce planning requirement. The workforce planning model takes into consideration:

- Pupil Projections and Staying on rates
- Pupil Census figures
- Teacher Census figures
- Age Profile of Teachers
- Working Patterns
- Teacher vacancy data
- Assumptions on leaver and returner rates including maternity leave
- Assumptions for the need for a pool of Supply Teachers

We believe that this is a robust process but the TWPAG is actively considering, on an on-going basis, how that process may be strengthened. The suggestions from the Committee will be considered in that process.
Recommendation 5
The Committee further recommends that TWPAG works with the Government, education authorities, teacher training institutions and any other relevant parties to ensure the data that will make its processes better informed is collated and provided to it in a timely fashion and as frequently as necessary. Specifically, the relationship between TWPAG and local authorities needs to be developed further. This should include the collation of data at a local level on the level of need for teachers as opposed to focusing on vacancies. Where any bodies do not agree to provide the necessary information, to the extent that TWPAG’s work is inhibited, the Committee would ask that this matter is highlighted to it.

Scottish Government Response
The relationship between TWPAG and local authorities is already well developed. TWPAG works closely with a range of relevant parties in the teacher workforce planning process. The TWPAG is made up of the following representatives, and is chaired by the Scottish Government:

- ADES
- AHDS
- COSLA
- Education Scotland
- General Teaching Council for Scotland
- School Leaders Scotland
- Scottish Council of Deans of Education
- Scottish Funding Council
- Society of Personnel Directors in Scotland
- SNCT Teachers Panel
- Universities Scotland

The TWPAG do not currently perceive any barriers to the collection of data. Indeed it is in the interest of the bodies represented on the TWPAG to work in partnership with the Scottish Government to provide the necessary data and this takes place. While local authorities are currently represented in the TWPAG through COSLA and the Association of Directors of Education, the TWPAG is actively considering how its relationship with local authorities can be developed. For example the TWPAG is actively considering how the introduction of Regional Improvement Collaboratives may change the dynamics of the relationship between it and local authorities, recognising that one of the agreed core functions of the RICs will be to: “Take a regional approach to supporting staffing challenges, including recruitment and retention; promoting shared approaches to building capacity and securing improvement.”
Recommendation 6
The Committee recommends that there should also be an increased focus on localised planning. The evaluation of required data should assess what information collated at a local level would inform TWPAG’s work. Localised planning, and associated ITE placements, twinned with education authority efforts to attract candidates locally, should assist in improving targeted recruitment.

Scottish Government Response
The Scottish Government believes that the workforce planning process should continue to be undertaken at a national level. The TWPAG already takes into account a range of local information, including local authority vacancy data and student teacher intake numbers, together with other localised factors such as staffing requirements flowing from Scotland Attainment Challenge and Pupil Equity Funding. The TWPAG will continue to strengthen local and regional input into the national workforce planning process.

Recommendation 7
The Committee recommends that the TWPAG considers ways in which it could become more transparent. Specifically, the Committee recommends that TWPAG publishes: its minutes; details of all of the data it uses and more detail on its methodology. The Committee recommends that any independent evaluation commissioned by the Government also considers the transparency of the Group.

Scottish Government Response
TWPAG has recently agreed that minutes and papers of meetings will be published on the Scottish Government website from the December 2017 meeting onwards. A range of information relating to the workforce planning process is already published, including the Scottish Government guidance letter which is published on the Scottish Funding Council website alongside the Scottish Funding Council announcement of target intakes for Universities. Teacher census data and population data, used in the modelling, is also already in the public domain. We will look to ensure there is further transparency in the work of the TWPAG.

Recommendation 8
The Committee recommends that TWPAG revisits the criteria it uses to estimate the number of additional teachers required. The Committee does not consider that sufficient weighting is placed on the factors that influence the retention of classroom teachers and senior management in schools. The impact of increased workload across school education is a well-known and longstanding issue. The Committee recommends that this and other factors impacting on retention are not underestimated by the TWPAG in the future (as was the case after 2011)

Scottish Government Response
The TWPAG is actively considering what additional information might be included in the modelling to strengthen the workforce planning process. TWPAG already takes account of not only the statistical modelling exercise but also other intelligence relating to teacher supply and demand for example the policy changes for the expansion of Early Years provision before agreeing on intake figures for the coming
year. As set out above the modelling does take into account assumptions on retention rates.

**Recommendation 10**

The Committee recommends that, in the short term at least, the planning cycle should remain annual but subject to:
- Improvements in the workforce planning processes outlined in recommendations above; and
- Progress to bring forward the point in the calendar year when the announcement of the number of ITE places is made.

**Scottish Government Response**

Improvements to the workforce planning process have been introduced over the last year for example by including local teacher vacancy data and beginning the process in October rather than December. A more regular series of meetings have also been undertaken this year to allow the TWPAG to consider what further improvements could be introduced.

While the October meeting provides an opportunity for the TWPAG to consider provisional numbers, the final agreed position includes consideration of data from the Teacher Census which is published in December and the local vacancy survey which may not be available at this stage. So while it may be possible to bring forward the process it would potentially reduce the accuracy of the modelling.

The TWPAG normally aims to conclude the planning process and issue advice to Ministers, and subsequently the Scottish Funding Council, before the end of each year, so that the Funding Council can confirm allocations to Universities in January. In 2017 this announcement was delayed, in agreement with all relevant parties, to allow universities to have further time to collectively consider how they would meet the increased secondary PGDE targets. The TWPAG will aim to complete this process in line with normal timescales in future years.

**Recommendation 11**

The Committee appreciates the benefit to workforce planning processes that 3 to 5 year projections would provide. The Committee recommends that the potential for setting ITE place numbers for multiple years, based on such projections, should be explored.

**Scottish Government Response**

The statistical model already provides 5 year projections and this is included in the guidance letter to the Scottish Funding Council, which is subsequently shared with universities by the Funding Council. Current modelling is undertaken on an annual basis to ensure that up to date information, for example annual teacher census data, pupil projections and local vacancy data, is taken into account. While setting targets for multiple years is possible it would potentially have a significant impact on the accuracy of the modelling.
RECRUITMENT AND INITIAL TEACHER EDUCATION (ITE)

Recommendation 12
The Committee recommends that the Government reviews the practice of raising the number of training places to improve recruitment levels. This approach does not address the factors influencing interest in becoming a teacher. These factors include: the perception of teaching in society (including the perspective of pupils and parents); the experiences of existing teachers; and pay. Teachers are crucial to the success of the education system and addressing challenges facing existing teachers is fundamental to increasing the number of people who want to become a teacher.

Scottish Government Response
We would not agree with this recommendation linking ITE intake targets with the perception of teaching. Increasing ITE intake targets is not intended to address other issues regarding the perception of teaching. Student teacher intake targets are set at a level that the TWPAG considers necessary to address need.

The Scottish Government will continue to take action to address issues of perception through the Teaching Makes People recruitment campaign. The key messages of the campaign are to show that teaching provides unique satisfaction and rewards for graduates and career changers, provides personal growth, stimulation, creativity and challenge, as well as the satisfaction of helping others develop and interacting with young people. The Teaching Makes People campaign highlights the importance of teachers not just to education but to Scotland's economy as a whole.

We recognise that this alone will not address the issue hence why we have invested in 11 new innovative routes to attract wider people into teaching and offering bursaries of £20,000 for career changer to train as teachers in Maths, Computing Science, Technical Education and Physics, subjects for which there is the highest pressure.
Recommendation 17
The Committee welcomes the Government's acknowledgement of the issues raised in evidence. The Committee recommends that the actions to be undertaken in response include an investigation into the extent of the problems raised in relation to literacy and numeracy. This should include assessing baseline standards on all courses for student primary teachers. It should also include an assessment of the entry requirements for these courses and the standards achieved on qualification. The Committee notes that certain issues, including in relation to primary school courses and student entry levels, have been raised previously by the 2011 Donaldson Report and the 2016 STEMEC Report.

Scottish Government Response
The General Teaching Council for Scotland is aware of the need to review entry requirements and have begun the process of reviewing and revising the Memorandum on entry requirements. We understand that this process will be completed by January 2019.

We have written to the University Heads of Schools of Education to inform them that Education Scotland have been asked to develop a new self-evaluation framework to support the universities that provide initial teacher education to evaluate their work. The framework will be developed in partnership with teacher education universities and the General Teaching Council for Scotland given their responsibility for course accreditation.

The framework will be designed to support teacher education universities in identifying what is working well, including highlighting features of their own highly-effective practice. It will also help recognise and develop a shared understanding of what is needed to do collectively to secure improvements. The focus will be on the quality of learning and teaching within initial teacher education and key priorities, including literacy, numeracy health and wellbeing as well as Additional Support Needs. The framework will be available in time for universities to start this work during academic year 2017/18.

Recommendation 18
The Committee recommends that the cycle of revisiting existing courses to renew accreditation should be shorter to ensure course content is responsive to the changing needs of Scottish education. The Committee recommends that the Government considers the benefits of making one organisation responsible for the accreditation of ITE courses and the assessment of the delivery of these courses.

Scottish Government Response
The Scottish Government will discuss with GTCS the cycle of accreditation and on-going oversight of programmes. GTCS have tightened accreditation procedures and Education Scotland will work with ITE providers on self-evaluation.
**Recommendation 20**
The Committee recommends that the Scottish Government works with the GTCS to address the inconsistency in additional support needs education during Initial Teacher Education, with the aim of ensuring that all teachers receive high quality baseline training which prepares them to assist pupils with a range of additional needs, regardless of which institution and course they receive their initial teacher education in.

**Scottish Government Response**
The Scottish Government will work with GTCS to embed this in the Professional Standards and in the accreditation of all courses.

**Recommendation 21**
The Committee is also concerned at evidence from student teachers reflecting a lack of content in their courses on online safety for children. The Committee welcomes the Government’s acknowledgement of this issue and recommends that the Government works with the GTCS to ensure high quality baseline training is received by all student teachers.

**Scottish Government Response**
The Scottish Government will work with GTCS to ensure that the required high standard of training is met during the accreditation of all courses.

**Recommendation 24**
Given the increased number of teachers that are likely to become mentors under the opt-out system, and that all teachers should be prepared to take on such a role for student teachers or probationers where possible and beneficial, the Committee recommends that emphasis on the importance of mentoring should feature in local working time agreements. This could include a specific allocation of non-contact time.

**Scottish Government Response**
Teachers working time is set nationally by the SNCT. Class contact time is set nationally at 22.5 hours per week with the remainder of the 35 hour working week designated as non-contact time. Local working time arrangements are agreed locally at school level and the SNCT advises schools to take cognisance of workload when developing these agreements. There is a contractual obligation in the SNCT for teachers to contribute to the professional development of colleagues including probationary and student teachers. The Scottish Government provides local authorities with funding of 0.1 (FTE) per probationer as part of the teacher induction scheme funding arrangements to support mentoring.
ATTRACTION TEACHERS AND STUDENT TEACHERS FROM OUTSIDE THE UK

Recommendation 31
The Committee notes that if it was within the gift of the Scottish Government the visa restrictions in a time of teacher shortages would be relaxed in more subject and specialism areas. The Committee supports the Scottish Government's efforts where it seeks to have the list of subjects and specialisms deemed to be suffering from shortages extended. The Committee urges the UK Government to reconsider its approach to immigration, specifically in relation to the Post-Study Work Visa.

Scottish Government Response
Under the current constitutional arrangements in the United Kingdom, immigration is fully reserved to the United Kingdom Government. The Scottish Government therefore has no control over the operation of the immigration system, which is dealt with by the Home Office. However, it is clear that the UK Government’s approach to immigration undermines the Scottish Government’s efforts to attract the best international talent to our universities and our workforce. Scottish Ministers will continue to push the UK Government for an immigration system that meets Scotland’s needs and provides a welcoming environment for new Scots. The longer we wait for the UK Government to act on the cross party and cross sector support for a Post Study Work route in Scotland, the greater the social, cultural and economic impact will be.

Factors influencing the retention and promotion of classroom teachers

Recommendation 36
There is a need for a means to provide financial reward, recognition and increased status to experienced and valued teachers who wish to remain in the classroom. The Committee recommends that the introduction of something akin to the chartered teacher scheme is considered to ensure classroom teachers feel valued and have increased motivation to keep teaching.

Scottish Government Response
As part of the education reform agenda, the Scottish Government is committed to working with our partners, and particularly the profession to establish new career pathways for teachers, allowing greater opportunity for development and progression.
Recommendation 38
The Committee recommends that the Government reforms address the issue with the structure of roles in schools to ensure the existing structure does not prevent talented candidates from achieving promotion to headteacher level. In this respect, the Committee welcomes Government reforms that seek to give teachers the opportunity to develop leadership skills. Proposals include streamlined professional learning; and new leadership pathways including a fast-track leadership route.

Scottish Government Response
As per the response to recommendation 36, the Scottish Government is committed to working with the teaching profession and employers and other key stakeholders to develop new career pathways, allowing greater opportunity for development and progression into leadership, specialist or improvement roles.

Recommendation 40
The Committee recommends that pay negotiations give consideration to the scope to amend the terms and conditions for supply teachers to address the concerns raised in evidence that the pay for the initial days of a placement is insufficient.

Scottish Government Response
Teachers' pay and conditions of service are negotiated through the Scottish Negotiating Committee for Teachers (SNCT), a partnership made up of local government, teacher unions and Scottish Government. The Scottish Government will play its part in this on-going process.
Recommendation 46
The Committee recommends that the TWPAG takes into account, in its workforce planning processes, the real risk that the above factors could combine to create an increasing shortage in the numbers of headteachers in the future.

Scottish Government Response
The recruitment of headteachers does not fall under the remit of TWPAG.

The Programme for Government commits the Scottish Government to undertaking a specific recruitment campaign for headteachers and we will be developing this in partnership with wider stakeholders including the headteacher recruitment working group in the next financial year. The headteacher recruitment working group includes representation from ADES, SCEL, SCES Teacher unions, professional associations, GTCS and local authorities.