

**CONSTITUTION, EUROPE, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS AND CULTURE
COMMITTEE**

6th Meeting 2021, Session 6

30 September 2021

Climate Justice

1. As part of its international development remit, the Committee is looking at Climate Justice (and specifically the Climate Justice Fund) in the run up to COP26 in Glasgow. Members previously agreed to consider the matter in terms of—

- The part Scotland can play in promoting global climate governance
- Where climate justice fits in the context of our international development commitments
- How we measure up against the [Principles of Climate Justice](#)
- The impact of the pandemic and post-COVID recovery on our approach
- What – given the emphasis of Scotland’s Climate Assembly on fairness – climate justice looks like locally and globally

2. Under agenda items 3 and 4, Members will hear from the following witnesses, who will join the meeting remotely—

Panel 1

- Jamie Livingstone, Head of [Oxfam Scotland](#)
- Carolyn Sawers, Acting Chief Executive, [Corra Foundation](#)

Panel 2

- [Tahseen Jafry, Director, Glasgow Caledonian University Centre for Climate Justice](#)
- Muthi Nhlema, Managing Director of [Baseflow Ltd](#)
- [Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund \(SCIAF\)](#)

3. [Baseflow](#) are a company in Malawi who work with the [Scotland Malawi Partnership](#).

4. Members can find written submissions from SCIAF and the Corra Foundation in **Annexe A**.

5. A SPICe briefing is provided in **Annexe B**.

Committee Clerks
September 2021

Written submission from Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund (SCIAF)

The Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund (SCIAF) is the official overseas aid and development charity of the Catholic Church in Scotland. In 2020, SCIAF worked with over 90 partners around the globe to address both the consequences and the causes of poverty, injustice and humanitarian crises. In total around 2.2 million people benefitted directly and indirectly from SCIAF's international partnerships.

Key points from SCIAF's evidence:

1. Scotland's Role in Promoting Global Climate Action

1. Scotland is obliged to be a climate leader
2. Scotland's climate legislation is strong – so why do we keep missing targets?
3. Scotland should champion the whole of the Paris Agreement at COP26

2. Climate Justice and International Development

1. The climate justice fund is most effective when it takes a locally-led adaptation approach
2. Climate finance must be accessible
3. Climate finance must be additional
4. Taxing for climate justice

3. Climate Justice – From Local to Global

1. Embedding climate justice requires political solutions to climate crisis
2. Assessing Scotland's climate justice credentials

1. Scotland's Role in Promoting Global Climate Action

1.1 Scotland is obliged to be a climate leader

Scotland is uniquely well placed to tackle climate change. Its renewables capacity has already enabled huge reduction in greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from energy, our strong systems of governance have produced very strong climate legislation and scrutiny, and our academic institutions have driven innovations that will help Scotland, and the world, transition to a post-carbon world.

Moreover, compared to other countries, Scotland has a moral and legal duty to reduce its emissions as quickly as possible, beyond global average efforts. This moral duty comes from the fact that Scotland was one of the first countries to industrialise, and helped build the industrial revolution which has driven this crisis. The industrial revolution led to massive benefits home and abroad, including reductions in poverty and enhancement of livelihoods across the world. However, we must now also acknowledge that we are now seeing dramatic negative consequences of the burning of fossil fuels. Through increased concentrations of Green House Gases (GHG) in the atmosphere, global average temperatures have already increased by 1.2C, and this is leading to an increase in droughts, floods, wildfires and extreme weather, sea-level rise devastating for low-lying communities. On current trajectories of warming, we are on track to a planet that will not sustain lives and livelihoods in the way we have become accustomed, will undo development progress, and make the achievement of human rights for billions of the world's poorest people impossible.

Aside from the moral obligation for Scotland to act on the basis of its historical emissions, it also has a legal duty to do so. As part of the UK, Scotland is party to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) and to the Paris Agreement, signed in 2015. The Scottish Government has furthermore continually signalled its support for the Paris Agreement in its new climate legislation, and more recently publishing an “indicative” Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC) – commitments required by parties to the Paris Agreement ahead of COP26 to demonstrate their domestic contribution to the global targets. Both the Paris Agreement and the UNFCCC commit signatories to follow the principles of “equity” and “common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities” (CBDR+RC).

These commitments require developed countries to reduce their emissions ahead of global average efforts in line with their historical responsibility. These principles are also included in the Climate Change Act, and the Scottish Government’s support for them affirmed again in their indicative NDC. Therefore, Scotland has a moral and legal responsibility to reduce emissions beyond average efforts in line with their historical contribution to climate change. It should not be remarkable that Scotland has the targets it has set – it is the minimum the country should do, and more needs to be done.

2. Scotland’s climate legislation is strong – so why do we keep missing targets?

The Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2019 is a very strong piece of legislation. It sets strong targets which, whilst not enough to meet its fair share based on historical emissions, are amongst the strongest in the world. Scotland’s GHG accounting also includes its share of international aviation and shipping, something many other countries do not include, and this is welcome. Furthermore, the legislation requires setting targets which consider the principles of equity and **Common But Differentiated Responsibilities (CBDR) +Respective Capabilities (RC)** and includes opportunities for rigorous scrutiny of missed targets and of the Climate Change Plans (CCP) designed to achieve these targets.

However, with three years of missed targets and a Climate Change Plan Update for which all Parliamentary and civil society scrutiny was ignored, the credibility of this Act appears to be wearing thin. For Scotland to be meaningfully regarded as a climate leader, it is essential that there is a step-change in action to get Scotland on track to achieve and surpass its legal GHG reduction targets.

3. Scotland should champion the whole of the Paris Agreement at COP26

In a few weeks’ time, representatives from every country in the world will come to Glasgow for the 26th Conference of the Parties (COP26) to the UNFCCC. This is a huge opportunity for Scotland to show climate leadership and play a critical role in driving up climate action and getting the world on track to achieve the Paris Agreement.

Contrary to how it is often portrayed, the Paris Agreement has three pillars of action:

- **Mitigation:** Reducing emissions in a manner consistent with the global temperature goal of “well-below” 2C global average temperature increase and “pursue efforts” to limit to 1.5C
- **Adaptation:** Paris Agreement establishes the “global goal on adaptation” to strengthen resilience and reduce vulnerability to climate change

- **Loss and Damage:** Parties to Paris “recognize the importance of averting, minimizing and addressing loss and damage” which includes “extreme weather events and slow onset events”

On mitigation, Scotland can hold up its Climate Change Act as its effort towards achieving this goal. Furthermore, the Climate Change Act’s commitments to the principles of equity and CBDR+RC, alongside commitments to align progress with the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and to support developing countries tackle climate change, are all genuinely world-leading aspects of the legislation which should be promoted at the conference. When promoting Scotland’s record on mitigation, it would be advisable for the Scottish Government to do so with a spirit of modesty in acknowledging its missed targets in recent years, and to harness COP26 as an opportunity to inspire more action across government and society to get on track.

It is vital that the other two pillars of the Paris Agreement are not side-lined by an emphasis on mitigation measures, however. Focusing only on mitigation is a privileged position for developed countries. In many countries in the Global South, climate change is already destroying lives and livelihoods. Governments in the Global South are ill-equipped to pay the huge costs required for adaptation efforts which would enable communities to cope with the devastating impacts of climate change. Furthermore, they are not in a position to help people recover from the losses and damages caused by climate disasters or to relocate to avoid disasters or sea-level rise.

At COP26, Global South countries will demand adaptation is finally taken seriously, and this fight will mostly happen in pushing for climate finance. Under the Paris Agreement, developed countries are committed to providing \$100bn in climate finance annually from 2020 to developing countries, and this should be balanced between funding for mitigation and adaptation. The world is not on target to achieve this, and success at COP26 will rest on whether or not new commitments are forthcoming, especially for public finance for adaptation (which should make up 50% of the annual \$100bn target). There is also the need to commit to a new target for post 2025 finance.

On Loss & Damage, Global South countries will demand that money is finally forthcoming to support communities recover from climate impacts that go beyond adaptation efforts. Action on this issue has for too long been delayed at successive meetings of the COP. As it stands, when countries are hit by climate disasters (which we can now prove are “climate disasters” through improved attribution science), there is no mechanism to provide them with compensatory financial support to recover from this. They are paying for disasters which we have caused. This is an injustice which must be addressed if COP26 is to be a success.

For Scotland to be known as a genuine world leader and advocate of the Paris Agreement, it cannot stay silent on the issues of adaptation and Loss & Damage. Scotland’s Climate Justice Fund is already a strong signal that Scotland is not blind to these issues, as is its commitment in the Climate Change Act to provide support for developing countries to grow low-carbon economies and adapt to climate change. However, to play its full part in promoting global climate governance, the Scottish Government should also call for global action on these issues at COP26.

One way of the Scottish Government doing this is through promoting the Glasgow Climate Dialogues. These dialogues were a series of virtual meetings with experts from the Global South held at the beginning of September, which were hosted jointly by the Scottish Government and Stop Climate Chaos Scotland, exploring the issues :

- Access, Participation and Voice
- Adaptation
- Loss & Damage
- Just Transition.

A communique has been produced from these sessions, which will be shared with negotiators at COP26. The Scottish Government should prioritise promotion of this communique that it has helped compile in its COP26 engagements to play its full part in promoting global climate governance.

2. Climate Justice & International Development

2.1 The climate justice fund is most effective when it takes a locally-led adaptation approach

Scotland's Climate Justice Fund (CJF) makes a significant contribution to the lives of thousands of people across Scotland's partner countries. SCIAF has been glad to implement a number of projects funded by the CJF since it was first established in 2012. Most notably in recent years, SCIAF through its partner agencies has delivered the Climate Challenge Programme Malawi (CCPM) a £4.5m project which started implementation in October 2017.

To date, the programme has helped over 40,000 people, the majority of them women and girls in Southern Malawi improve their access to food, water and energy so they are better prepared for climate disasters. The programme took a locally-led approach to its design, which meant that participants co-designed the interventions based on their local knowledge and priorities. Programme interventions included the training of farmers in climate-resilient agroecological farming methods, the establishment of irrigation schemes which prevent devastation of irregular weather patterns, and the introduction of sustainable solar energy hubs. The CCPM has been a huge success, especially in relation to female empowerment, increasing household income and protecting volatile livelihoods from extreme weather (such as Cyclone Idai, which hit during the programme's implementation). The success of this programme demonstrates the effectiveness of the CJF, and in particular the locally-led adaptation approach that was enabled by the design of this fund.

2. Climate finance must be accessible

SCIAF has seen first-hand the effectiveness of the CJF, and therefore has loudly welcomed the commitment from the Scottish Government to double this fund from £3m to £6m per year during this Parliament. Whilst a modest contribution to the global need for action, SCIAF can testify that the impact on people's lives does not feel modest at all when you see such projects first hand.

Furthermore, one of the key advantages of the CJF is perhaps due to its relative size compared to other global climate funds. The Green Climate Fund (GCF) for example, is the UNFCCC mandated fund which exists to allocate climate finance committed to under the

Paris Agreement. Since its establishment, the GCF has been beset by issues relating to access. Due to the complicated requirements to apply for GCF funding and its convoluted systems of governance, a huge amount of investment is required to even put together a GCF proposal. In effect, this excludes smaller organisations & countries with fewer resources from even applying for funding. GCF grants are resultingly largely controlled by large multinational institutions which ostensibly act as an intermediary to delivering funding for communities on the frontline, but in reality result in large amounts of funding being lost on governance, management and bureaucracy.

The CJF, on the other hand, is a small fund which can be managed with agility and through direct engagement with project participants, as exhibited in the case of the CCPM. This works to the advantage of projects seeking to implement a locally-led adaptation approach, and can be expected to produce greater impact per £ spent, compared to larger climate finance interventions. As the climate crisis deepens, it is vital that more money is quickly getting to help communities on the frontlines to adapt to the impacts of climate change, and funds like the CJF make an important contribution to what needs to be a global effort.

3. Climate Finance Must be Additional

One of the key debates around climate finance which we see at every meeting of the COP, and we can expect to bubble up to the surface again at COP26, relates to the question of “additionality”. This refers to the need for climate finance to be additional to existing flows of aid, humanitarian or development assistance. Since climate impacts themselves are additional to the need for these types of assistance, the finance for them must also be additional. Many countries are said to “double-count” their climate finance, including the UK. For example, the UK’s current commitment to provide £11.6bn in climate finance over the next 5 years is wholly taken from its aid budget. This is robbing Peter to pay Paul, and does not present an adequate solution to the crisis we are in.

We believe that Scotland should be a champion of the principle of additionality in climate finance, and that this could be another policy position in Scotland where global leadership can be demonstrated. At present, all of Scotland’s international development contributions (including the CJF) are counted towards the UK’s Official Development Assistance (ODA) commitments. However, the current separation of the CJF and the International Development Fund (IDF) can be interpreted as a welcome gesture of support for the principle of additionality.

This also presents opportunities to develop the effectiveness of the CJF further in years to come, through more emphasis on the sharing of technology and capacity building.

2.4 Taxing for climate justice

SCIAF advocates for the CJF to be increased through new and innovative climate tax with a ‘polluter pays’ principle and for the Scottish Government to ensure its additionality by separating it from the UK’s calculation of its ODA commitments. The introduction of a tax on high emitters in Scotland has the potential to be globally significant with financing climate justice one of the greatest challenges of the next decade. Costs for adaptation and loss & damage alone amount to hundreds of billions every year, and the current \$100bn global target for climate finance will quickly become a drop in the ocean as temperatures increase. It is clear that we need to consider how to include the true cost of carbon into our economies and explore different instruments to raise money.

Developing countries and people living in these countries are already paying for the impacts of climate change already e.g. people in developing countries taking out insurance against climate impacts with premiums rising. Developing countries did not cause climate change and the promise made in 2009 to deliver \$100bn a year split between adaptation and mitigation projects has not been reached. The majority of climate finance is in the form of loans which is unjust. That's why we need to embed a 'polluter pays' principle.

Whilst private finance is available for mitigation projects, and green development can provide bankable projects for developing countries, public finance will be required for adaptation and L&D for many years to come. Developed countries who are responsible for this crisis therefore need to significantly increase their ambition on climate finance.

Climate taxation can provide the solution to this global financial injustice though there may be different ways for this to work. Done well, a climate tax could help reduce emissions by discouraging high-emitting practices of businesses and individuals and generating revenue for investment in mitigation and adaptation at home and overseas. If Scotland is to continue to be a climate leader, it must keep pushing the boundaries and be at the vanguard of climate solutions.

Taking a lead on instituting a climate tax, which helps Scotland deliver climate action domestically and meet its obligations to the global south for the climate crisis, is where Scotland can be at the vanguard of positive action.

3. Climate Justice – Local to the Global

Climate justice is both intra and inter-state problem. It is an injustice that here in Scotland, and within all countries, those who are objectively least responsible for causing climate breakdown are the most likely to suffer its impacts. On a global scale, it is an injustice that whole countries which are innocent of crimes against the climate are already having to pay to protect themselves against. Delivering climate justice must mean application of the polluter-pays principle to domestic and global climate solutions. We must deliver a just transition which distributes the costs and benefits of a new economy more fairly than we have in this economy, and on a global scale ensure genuine application of the principles of equity when developing policy on climate mitigation, adaptation and loss & damage. It is essential that our conceptions and application of "climate justice" recognises and addresses both the unfair distribution of climate risks & impacts within states and between states. A Just transition would help us address deep seated inequalities across gender, race, age, geography.

3.1 Embedding climate justice requires political solutions to climate crisis

It is essential that climate justice is viewed holistically and globally. The unequal distribution of climate impacts in Scotland, internationally, and within countries based on class, gender, disability etc. are all important considerations in a climate justice approach. However, a holistic climate justice approach must also tackle the root cause of climate impacts. The Scottish Government can institute this by applying a rigorous policy coherence approach to all areas of government policy, activity and expenditure.

If Scotland does not reduce its emissions rapidly, or if our government promotes policies which undermine climate action, then the impacts of the climate justice fund will be undermined. To follow a fair shares approach would result in a significant rise in the Climate

Justice Fund budget. A truly world-leading climate justice fund would recognise the need for policy coherence in such a way.

Within the delivery of projects, it is also vital that there is confident investment in advocacy & policy initiatives which can help deliver lasting change. It is climate policy that will deliver the real long-term impacts we need to see to protect communities from the impacts of this crisis, and yet all too often due to bureaucratic & budgetary constraints there is insufficient public & civil society engagement in climate policy across the world. Supporting policy & advocacy work in this area which helps inform the global climate policy architecture can make a very significant impact on improving policy with significant long-term benefits.

3.2 Assessing Scotland's climate justice credentials

In light of the requirement of a holistic conception of climate justice and policy coherence approach, when assessing Scotland's contribution to climate justice, we must assess both our contributions to climate injustice at home and abroad. An adequate assessment of Scotland's climate justice credentials would include assessment of:

- How Scotland's climate targets compare to its fair share of global effort, based on historical emissions.
- How Scotland's climate policies are getting on at achieving these targets.
- How climate impacts are distributed in Scotland and overseas, and what steps are being taken to reduce the unfair disproportionate impact on people and communities that are low-emitters.
- The distribution of positive and negative impacts of climate policies on different groups, based on their relative marginalisation and means, both domestically and in international projects
- The carbon footprint of Scotland, including the contribution of Scottish consumption to high-emissions of other countries
- How much Scotland pays for adaptation & loss & damage overseas, and how this compared to its fair share of global action based on historical responsibility.

Written submission from Corra Foundation

About Corra Foundation

Corra Foundation welcomes the opportunity to respond to the Committee's call for evidence on climate justice. Climate justice approaches, that prioritise work with communities most affected and support them to have greater voice and agency, are aligned with our values. Our funding approach is based on a belief in the power of partnership and collective action to effect change, and we see work on climate as a shared responsibility to address a serious and urgent need that affects us all.

Corra Foundation exists to make a difference to the lives of people and communities. It works with others to encourage positive change, opportunity, fairness and growth of aspirations which improve quality of life. Corra wants to see a society in which people create positive change and enjoy fulfilling lives.

In 2020 Corra launched a ten-year strategy. It is long term because making a difference on the big challenges will take time. At its heart is the strong belief that when people find their voice, they unlock the power to make change happen.

Corra has taken strategic and operational action to contribute to tackling the climate crisis. This includes signing the *Funder Commitment on Climate Change*¹, committing resources, recognising the role our investments play in making the transition to a post-carbon economy, and taking action to reduce the carbon footprint of our own operations.

- **The part Scotland can play in promoting global climate governance**

We must all play our part

Recognising the responsibility we share, as well as the advantages Scotland has gained from industrialisation and past emissions, is essential. There must be a clear focus on the fact that all levels of government, all sectors of society, need to make important changes and take meaningful steps if we are to tackle the climate crisis.

Scottish institutions, businesses and civil society have important voices with power to influence the UK's national engagement in inter-governmental efforts and global climate governance. Beyond this, Scotland can model progressive commitments, policies and implementation that recognise the severity of the situation. Stepping up, accepting our moral responsibility and shared obligations should be part of who we are.

There is an important opportunity to connect climate justice with other progressive priorities in Scotland. For example, community empowerment, place-based approaches and the diversity, equity and inclusion agenda. Corra's strategy is about voice, power and change and we advocate a focus on listening to communities most impacted by environmental issues, with action that gets alongside them and supports their rights and agency.

¹ [Funder Commitment on Climate Change \(fundercommitmentclimatechange.org\)](https://www.fundercommitmentclimatechange.org)

The Scottish Government has a crucial leadership role to play but should also support and encourage awareness and efforts across our society, facilitating independent and collective action.

As the *Funder Commitment to Climate Change* highlights, we must all contribute to this collective action: “The scale of the climate threat, and the scale of the solutions needed, means that this is an issue for all parts of civil society... Climate change is a health issue, an equality issue, and educational issue, and economic issue, a cultural issue, a scientific issues, a security issue and a local community issue, as well as an environmental issue”.

- **Where climate justice fits in the context of our international development commitments**

Mainstreaming climate, supporting innovation and learning

Corra has managed the Scottish Government’s Climate Justice Innovation Fund (CJIF) since its launch in 2017. A component of the Climate Justice Fund, the three annual cycles of the CJIF in 2017, 2018 and 2019 have seen 15 grants with a total value of just over £1.5 million.

As highlighted in the title, the CJIF has a focus on innovation and is progressive in the opportunity it provides for organisations to try new things. Unlike many other international grants programmes, it does not require proof that an approach works before offering funding. This support for innovation has significant value in allowing the exploration of creative new approaches. With the experience gained and results recorded through CJIF grants, organisations are then well-placed to apply for longer-term funding and to share their learning. The feedback Corra received from grantholders was that this approach was valuable and very welcome. Our recommendation is that future funding instruments continue to provide space and support for organisations to trial innovation in this fast-changing field.

Of the 15 CJIF grants made in the 2017-2020 period, just over half have involved the introduction and trialling of new technology, most related to renewables, while the others have explored new community approaches or innovative farming techniques. The grants led to substantive positive change for over 31,000 people and the development of a number of knowledge products to share learning, including guides, documentaries and training manuals.

These included, for example, work by SOLDEV and Tearfund to promote conservation agriculture methods to combat crop pests in Malawi, which saw 360 farmers lead trials that improved their yields by 90% without pesticides and generated research findings which changed government practices.

Community Energy Scotland and Community Energy Malawi supported two co-operatives to establish solar bakeries and helped over 200 rural community members build the skills needed to manage new solar electricity supply. This resulted in trained technicians and the launch of new small businesses, as well as the publication of a guide to solar mini-grid development.

The University of Glasgow worked in a coalition which successfully developed and trialled with communities a new bioenergy prototype that continues to benefit 275 school pupils and is now being produced by its Malawian partners, Leadership for Environment and Development Southern and Eastern Africa, Abundance and FABEngineering.

The Malawian organisation BASEflow's collaborations with the University of Strathclyde on artesian well capture and with the Scottish Environmental Protection Agency on water accountability have led to direct daily benefits for over 600 families and the production of a series of videos to share knowledge on water management.

The positive impacts of these CJIF grants continue in the concrete benefits experienced in the lives of people who now have access to clean water, electricity to recharge phones and access the internet, more food and income security from their farms and more information to advocate for and take action for their environment.

The learning which has come from the grants is an important aspect of this fund and both the formal publications and informal exchanges continue to influence practice. During our management of the CJIF Corra has provided introductions among a number of grantholders on an informal basis. We have seen that there is a clear appetite and interest in exchange, both across Scottish partners and overseas partners keen for 'South-South' conversations. The people working on these grants, both in and outside of Scotland, value hearing others' experiences and they would welcome more formal and consistent opportunities to share learning and connect with others. In future climate justice funding, we would recommend Scottish Government consider providing accompanying support for platforms for grantholders to exchange experience and for spaces to help promote and disseminate their learning more widely.

Corra has also managed the Scottish Government's International Development Small Grants programme since 2014, supporting 90 grants to Scotland-based organisations and their partners based in the country where the work is implemented. Over one fifth of these grants were for initiatives supporting those affected by climate change, many of them smallholder farmers, to mitigate its effects or contribute to prevention through

improved farming or livelihoods approaches or the introduction of renewable technology.

Similarly, the International Development Main Grants programme (for which Corra has provided assessment support) has in the past also included renewable energy and sustainable development strands, and we see this as important to continue. We would also recommend that Scottish Government consider including a 'climate impact' or 'footprint' assessment point in future international development grant-making, encouraging the sector to consider how projects on education or health for example could be designed in more climate responsive and effective ways.

- **How we measure up against the *Principles of Climate Justice***

Equity, participation and partnership

The *Principles of Climate Justice* have a clear focus on human rights and the urgent need to address inequity, with those bearing most responsibility and capacity to act supporting those who bear the greatest consequences. In this respect, the Scottish Government's recognition of the moral responsibility we have to act and its commitment to increasing funding for climate justice projects are very welcome. Also welcome is the proposed new human rights framework for Scotland, and the potential for this to include the right to a healthy environment. Corra has been working alongside human rights organisations and other independent funders to build on the significant interest that exists in taking a human rights-based approach to funding.²

Funding which is structured to encourage the participation of the communities involved in shaping the work undertaken, which sees organisations working alongside communities, also reflects key points made in the *Principles* about voice and partnership. The Climate Challenge Programme Malawi is structured to provide for such participation, and the CJIF was also structured on partnership principles which valued participatory approaches.

Application criteria to the CJIF ask organisations to tell the story of how their proposals have been designed on the basis of consultation with the communities affected by climate change and to demonstrate how they will ensure their work includes those affected by particular challenges. The sustainability of the proposal, consideration of gender equity within its design, its complementarity with national policy frameworks, and the opportunity presented for sector-wide learning are also key factors considered in selection. We recommend that future climate justice funding continues to ensure projects supported have a strong focus on participation, inclusion and sustainability.

CJIF awards were made to partnerships of Scottish organisations working with organisations based in the countries where the work is undertaken. A greater focus on

² For more information please see <https://www.corra.scot/news/rightsreal/>.

recognising and valuing joint leadership within these partnerships was introduced in the 2019 round which ensured that overseas partner organisations were locally-led (and not just an organisation based in the project country). Going forward, we would recommend that future grants programmes retain this requirement for a partnership approach and also consider other adaptations in the funding process that could support a stronger role for the overseas partner and a more equitable approach between partners.

While the Small Grants programme has now ended, the opportunity it provided for smaller-scale climate action initiatives was valuable. Corra would encourage the Scottish Government to consider options for including smaller third sector organisations in funding efforts with specific climate action goals. While the work of universities and larger, specialist organisations is essential in the development of the new approaches we need, smaller organisations can also make important contributions, not least as they are often more closely linked to the communities involved on both sides of the partnership. These closer links have important implications – not only for sustainability but also for the relationships, vibrancy of civil society and climate awareness which will be important factors in helping to achieve societal change.

- **The impact of the pandemic and post-COVID recovery on our approach**

Building forward better, support and flexibility

With the grants through the CJIF running until spring of 2021, the pandemic has not impacted directly on the potential flow of Scottish Government funds managed by Corra to grantholders, though of course it has affected the work of organisations implementing the grants in a number of ways. All CJIF projects were affected in some respect, with almost all requiring time extensions or budget or activity amendments. Ensuring good communication with grantholders as they face unexpected and often stressful situations and supporting flexible approaches as organisations adjust to changed conditions, are key approaches which we recommend Scottish Government apply to future international funding.

More broadly, our learning from distribution of significant Scottish Government pandemic response funds to the third sector in Scotland across the last 18 months has highlighted the value of flexible, and in particular unrestricted, funding. We would also recommend that the Scottish Government consider the valuable role that unrestricted funding can play in emergent and fast changing situations in the future. In April 2020 Corra made a number of immediate and unrestricted international micro-grants from its own funds to organisations it was already working with to cover unexpected costs resulting from the pandemic, such as additional data top-ups, staff salaries or supplies

of soap and face masks.³ Organisations reported back to us how valuable these fast and flexible grants had been for them.

The pandemic-related closures and economic disruption have also exacerbated inequalities not only within Scotland but also in lower income countries, with those most vulnerable most negatively affected, among them many women and girls. Corra has heard from many grantholders that while needs in the communities they work with overseas are greater, organisations are finding that both funding and fundraising opportunities are reduced. Given the value which active third sector organisations with expertise in international development and climate action have for our collective efforts both at home and abroad, Corra recommends that in reviewing options for structuring its climate justice funding going forward, the Scottish Government consider increasing the options available to Scottish third sector organisations whose work contributes to climate justice.

- **What – given the emphasis of Scotland’s Climate Assembly on fairness – climate justice looks like locally and globally**

Voice, relationships, and collective action

Globally, climate justice needs to include the wealthier nations, who have benefitted economically from higher emissions rates in the past, providing more funding and resourcing to support communities in lower income countries mitigate and adapt to the climate change they are experiencing now. This funding should be transparent, accountable and respectful: it should not look like ‘paying a bill’. Rather, this is resourcing for joint work which acknowledges our past, and continuing, responsibilities, and which is built on an approach of partnership.

Partnerships are built on relationships and mutual understanding, and this is a thread which needs to run through our global-level efforts to our local approaches to tackling climate change. Understanding how lives in different parts of the world are affected will be a key element in our society and institutions making and supporting the significant change that is required. Connecting across the distances between those whose lives have not been affected and those whose lives have already been profoundly changed will be crucial.

Work in the international development, education, arts and media sectors all has a role to play in helping to build these connections with our peers internationally and informing a change in societal attitudes to climate change and action. Opportunities to learn from others and exchange experience, whether on innovative technology or youth-led community initiatives, will be equally vital in building genuine partnerships for action at both global and local levels, in and outside Scotland.

³ For more information on the Corra Coronavirus Response Micro Grants and the nearly 50,000 people reached, please see [International Development - Corra](#), and the report available here: [Corra International Coronavirus Response Micro-grants - Corra](#). Three case studies are available here: [Malawi Solar Power Schools: A Corra micro-grant project story - Corra](#); [On Call Africa: A Corra micro-grant project story - Corra](#); [From Scotland to Pakistan: A Corra micro-grant project story - Corra](#).

As part of our own commitment to what 'local' climate justice looks like, Corra is a partner supporting Scotland's Young People's Forest. A young people's panel is leading the design of the forest, from planting to practical use and stewardship of the land. By supporting young people to lead, the work aims to achieve a wider vision where young people champion community engagement and support the creation of more forest and woodland.

We also launched a learning process in July this year aimed at continuing to improve our approach to international development grantmaking. The process is focused on exploring how funders can better support powerful and equitable partnerships that: generate lasting positive change; help ensure the voices of all those involved are heard; and which facilitate learning and connections of value to all those involved. Based on a co-design approach, the process has included pilot grants to five partnerships and will run until early next year. The process has already seen learning on a number of areas which have informed this evidence, including on voice and partnerships, on climate impact and on sustainability and community ownership.⁴

With this in mind, Corra welcomes the fact that the Climate Justice Fund included an emphasis on community voice, action and partnership, employing similar principles to the Scottish Climate Assembly's consultative and inclusive approach, and recommends this focus continues for future funding.

22 September 2021

Corra Foundation, Riverside House, 502 Gorgie Road Edinburgh EH11 3AF

e: hello@corra.scot t: 0131 444 4020 www.corra.scot

(The) Corra Foundation is a charity registered in Scotland (No SC009481) and is also a company limited by guarantee (No SC096068)

⁴ More information on this learning process is available here: [International Development - Corra](#).

Constitution, Europe, External Affairs and Culture Committee

Climate Justice – 30 September 2021

Background

The remit of the CEEAC Committee includes international development; and the **Climate Justice Fund** sits within international development.

The term **Climate justice** is used to frame climate change as an ethical and political issue, rather than one that is purely environmental or physical in nature. This is done by relating the causes and effects of climate change to concepts of justice, particularly environmental justice and social justice. Climate justice examines concepts such as equality, human rights, collective rights, and the historical responsibilities for climate change.

Climate justice actions are increasingly considered to include legal action on climate change issues and related activism. There has been a [notable recent rise in climate change activism](#), with protests on the streets and Greta Thunberg's solo school strike for climate action becoming [Fridays for Future](#), a globally co-ordinated movement, bringing together concerned young people from across the world. Six [Extinction Rebellion](#) protesters were recently cleared by jury of causing criminal damage, despite the judge instructing that there was no defence in law for their actions. The protesters, defending themselves, had argued that their actions were a "necessary" and "proportionate" response to the harm being caused.

Further legal cases across Europe have focussed on state support for fossil fuel companies and human rights:

- In Holland, the Supreme Court ruled that the Government must act urgently to reduce emissions and to bring them in line with their human rights obligations
- Again in Holland, a civil court has ruled that by 2030, Shell must cut its CO₂ emissions by 45% compared to 2019 levels
- In Germany, the Constitutional Court ruled that climate protection is a human right, and that the actions of current generations are to the detriment of future generations
- In Spain, the Parliament has passed a law banning new permits for fossil fuel exploration and extraction, and for an end to all extraction by 2042
- A High Court action has also been lodged in the UK which challenges the tax breaks given to domestic oil and gas companies, and the official policy of maximising economic recovery.

Relevant SPICe Briefings include:

- [Climate Change - Subject Profile | Scottish Parliament](#)
- [COP26 - An Introduction to the UN Conference of the Parties | Scottish Parliament](#)
- [Human Rights and the Environment | Scottish Parliament](#)

Witness Panels

In advance of the [26th Conference of the Parties \(COP26\) UN Climate Change Conference](#) in Glasgow the CEEAC Committee has undertaken to take evidence on climate justice; in particular:

- The part Scotland can play in promoting global climate governance
- Where climate justice fits in the context of our international development commitments
- How we measure up against the [Principles of Climate Justice](#)
- The impact of the pandemic and post-COVID recovery on our approach
- What – given the emphasis of Scotland’s Climate Assembly on fairness – climate justice looks like locally and globally

Two panels will give evidence on 30 September; comprising:

Panel 1

- Jamie Livingstone, Head of [Oxfam Scotland](#)
- Carolyn Sawers, Acting Chief Executive, [Corra Foundation](#)

Panel 2

- [Tahseen Jafry, Director, Glasgow Caledonian University Centre for Climate Justice](#)
- Muthi Nhlema, Managing Director of [Baseflow Ltd](#) (Baseflow are a Malawi-based partner organisation of the [Scotland Malawi Partnership](#))
- Dr Geraldine Hill, Advocacy Manager, [Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund \(SCIAF\)](#)

Principles of Climate Justice

Climate Justice links human rights and development to achieve a human-centred approach, safeguarding the rights of the most vulnerable and sharing the burdens and benefits of climate change and its resolution equitably and fairly. Climate justice is informed by science, responds to science and acknowledges the need for equitable stewardship of the world’s resources.

The Principles of Climate Justice are as follows:

- Respect and Protect Human Rights
- Support the Right to Development
- Share Benefits and Burdens Equitably
- Ensure that Decisions on Climate Change are Participatory, Transparent and Accountable
- Highlight Gender Equality and Equity
- Harness the Transformative Power of Education for climate stewardship
- Use Effective Partnerships to Secure Climate Justice.

1. Climate Justice

Members might like to explore:

- **Our approach to respecting and protecting human rights thresholds and the standards applied.**
- **The meaning of the right to development in practice.**
- **The criteria for what is sustainable and net-zero compliant.**
- **Sharing the benefits and burdens from the stewardship of the world's resources; and recognition of Scotland's role in climate change.**

Scotland's Role

The [Scottish Government states that it is:](#)

[...] promoting the economic benefits of a just and fair transition to a low carbon economy and the moral message of climate justice - particularly through our [Climate Justice Fund](#).

[PQ S5W-31443 \(August 2020\) asks about the Climate Justice Fund](#), and the response states:

At the UN Climate Conference - COP21 - in Paris in December 2015 the First Minister committed a total of £12 million over the following four years to be spent through the Climate Justice Fund.

That commitment has been exceeded.

The Climate Justice Fund currently operates through three major programmes:

- The Climate Challenge Programme Malawi (CCPM) (2017-present)
- The Climate Justice Innovation Fund (CJIF) (2017-present)
- The Water Futures Programme (2012-present)

Total spend on Climate Justice Programmes 2016-20:

Financial Year	Water Futures	CCPM	CJIF	Other Climate Justice Grant Funding	Total
2016-17	£1,027,906	-	-	£1,865,000	£2,892,906
2017-18	£1,850,054	£61,382	£173,341	£911,277	£2,996,054
2018-19	£1,731,121	£1,026,167	£469,764	£433,069	£3,660,121
2019-20	£1,300,423	£1,403,414	£532,434	£45,000	£3,281,271
Totals	£5,909,504	£2,490,963	£1,175,539	£3,254,346	£12,830,352

In recent oral evidence to the Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee (NZET), [COP26 President Designate Alok Sharma MP stated](#):

Finance will be critical. The figure of \$100 billion has become a matter of trust for developing countries, so it is vital that we are able to show a delivery path to \$100 billion a year over the five year period from 2020 to 2025. As I said in my opening remarks, we are working on a delivery plan, which is being put together with colleagues in the German and Canadian Governments. We hope that it will possible to demonstrate the funding that is coming from sovereigns, the funding that is being mobilised from the private sector as a result of public funding going in, the funding that is coming from multilateral development banks and any other finance mobilisation that is taking place.

At the G7 leaders meeting, we saw additional new money coming from Germany, Canada and Japan and, of course, in 2019, the UK also committed to double our international climate finance commitments. Clearly, we need all the G7 countries to come forward with more money. In the communiqué that I referred to, there was a clear agreement that further funding would come forward for climate finance.

The Scottish Government has [recently announced](#) that it will double the Climate Justice Fund to £6 million per year, providing £24 million across this Parliament; stating:

To play our full role in supporting the aims of the Paris Agreement, we must also be an ally to the nations most urgently impacted by climate change. By doubling our funding for those countries, we will provide much needed support for those that,

while making up only a fraction of the world's emissions, are already feeling the effects severely.

Scotland is also European Co-Chair of the [Under2Coalition](#), a network of more than 200 governments set up to drive climate action across the world. One of the key work streams of the Coalition is the [Future Fund](#). Which offers:

- Strategic funding that supports capacity building in developing and emerging economy regions.
- Strategic access to global climate platforms and events that they otherwise would not be able to attend to ensure fair representation.

2. Scotland's Role

Members might like to explore:

- **Embedding the Principles of Climate Justice in our approach to international development.**
- **How those principles are represented in the Climate Justice Fund.**
- **The relationship between increased funding from 2022 and the Fund's focus – e.g. prioritising new or existing programmes.**

Green Recovery and Just Transition

Green recovery seeks to achieve the dual aims of lifting an economy out of recession, and society out of a crisis, alongside protecting and improving the environment. Rebuilding from the Covid-19 pandemic provides an opportunity for green recovery. As part of this recovery, any transition to a decarbonised economy must be a Just Transition, to ensure that decent, fair and high-value work is created in environmentally and socially sustainable industries.

The Just Transition concept features in the Paris Climate Agreement, and has been high on the agenda in Scotland for several years, in part due to the efforts of a broad coalition of trade unions and environmental charities organising under the banner of the [Just Transition Partnership](#). It is particularly aligned with declining industries or regions undergoing transitions, for example coal mining or oil and gas.

To support the application of Just Transition principles, the Scottish Government established a [Just Transition Commission](#) (JTC) in 2018. This commission was tasked with providing practical and independent advice on how to maximise the economic and social benefits of decarbonisation whilst managing the risks and challenges.

In March 2021, the JTC published their [final advice to Scottish Ministers: A National Mission for a fairer, greener Scotland](#). The Scottish Government has subsequently undertaken to implement the recommendations of the JTC.

In December 2020 the UK Government [announced that it would end support for overseas fossil fuel projects](#).

The NZET Committee [took evidence from the Climate Change Committee on 31 August 2021](#), who highlighted:

- Climate change is a global problem that requires a global answer, there must therefore be a strong argument to overcome the need to stop using fossil fuels. There must be an acceptance that more fossil fuels will not be produced because they will not be used.

More recently, on 7 September, the Committee [heard from members of the former Just Transition Commission](#). Key points included:

- The concept of a Just Transition is beginning to “catch fire” internationally – IPCC is looking at these principles for a forthcoming report.
- Even in scenarios where warming is limited to 1.5°C, there is still a need for future oil. The difficult question is who will deliver this? The middle east is likely to be cheapest, but new sources like Ghana will have most economic development impact.
- If we are to fulfil Paris agreement targets, there will have to be less oil and gas used. The question is whether new O&G projects are coherent/compatible with Scotland’s vision / trajectory as a leading voice on climate change.
- To date, and internationally, JT has focussed on financial compensation, rather than the consultation and processes, which is unique to the Scottish approach. Equally the demand side, and the role of consumers/people/places is important.

3. Green Recovery and Just Transition

Members might like to explore:

- **Developing Scotland’s approach to a Just Transition internationally.**
- **Risks and opportunities of ending support for overseas fossil fuel projects and the impact on the “right to development”.**

Scotland’s Climate Assembly

Scotland’s Climate Assembly was made up of people who were broadly representative of the Scottish population. They took on the task of learning about, discussing and making recommendations on how Scotland can best tackle climate change. [The Assembly reported in June 2021](#) with wide ranging recommendations from decarbonising internal flights to de-incentivising imports and establishing more innovative businesses and low carbon manufacturing industries in Scotland.

The issue of fairness was embedded throughout the Assembly process including the question:

How should Scotland tackle the climate emergency in an effective and fair way?

Evidence presented to the Assembly highlighted that climate change, and some policies to tackle it, disproportionately affect some people more than others. Based on this evidence, Assembly members developed 22 “propositions of fairness”. These propositions completed the statement:

To be fair, the recommendations that we as an Assembly present to Parliament should...

The top proposition (prioritised by over 70%) was:

1) Take into account the needs of different communities across Scotland, recognising that there is not a ‘one size fits all’ solution

With the following being prioritised by 20% - 50% of Assembly Members:

15) Not have a negative impact on developing countries

The Scottish Government has not yet responded to the Assembly’s recommendations, which it is [required to do within 6 months](#) (by 23 December 2021).

4. Climate Assembly

Members might like to explore:

- The findings of Scotland’s recent Climate Assembly in the context of international development.

Alasdair Reid
SPICe Research
24 September 2021

Note: Committee briefing papers are provided by SPICe for the use of Scottish Parliament committees and clerking staff. They provide focused information or respond to specific questions or areas of interest to committees and are not intended to offer comprehensive coverage of a subject area.

The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP www.parliament.scot