

# **ENTERPRISE AND LIFELONG LEARNING COMMITTEE**

Wednesday 12 June 2002  
*(Morning)*

Session 1

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2002.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Copyright Unit,  
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ  
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate  
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by The  
Stationery Office Ltd.

Her Majesty's Stationery Office is independent of and separate from the company now  
trading as The Stationery Office Ltd, which is responsible for printing and publishing  
Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body publications.

---

# CONTENTS

Wednesday 12 June 2002

	Col.
ANNUAL REPORT.....	2641
LOCAL ECONOMIC FORUMS .....	2642

---

## ENTERPRISE AND LIFELONG LEARNING COMMITTEE 18<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2002, Session 1

### CONVENER

\*Alex Neil (Central Scotland) (SNP)

### DEPUTY CONVENER

Miss Annabel Goldie (West of Scotland) (Con)

### COMMITTEE MEMBERS

\*Rhona Brankin (Midlothian) (Lab)  
\*Brian Fitzpatrick (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)  
Mr Adam Ingram (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
\*Gordon Jackson (Glasgow Govan) (Lab)  
\*Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)  
\*Mr Kenneth Macintosh (Eastwood) (Lab)  
\*David Mundell (South of Scotland) (Con)  
\*Tavish Scott (Shetland) (LD)  
\*Andrew Wilson (Central Scotland) (SNP)

### COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

\*Mr David Davidson (North-East Scotland) (Con)  
Fergus Ewing (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP)  
John Farquhar Munro (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)  
\*attended

### CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Simon Watkins

### SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Judith Evans

### ASSISTANT CLERK

Jane Sutherland

### LOCATION

Committee Room 3



## Scottish Parliament

### Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Committee

Wednesday 12 June 2002

(Morning)

[THE CONVENER opened the meeting at 09:33]

**The Convener (Alex Neil):** I welcome everyone to the 18<sup>th</sup> meeting in 2002 of the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Committee. There are a few housekeeping announcements before we move to the first item of business. Members will find a pack in front of them containing the arrangements and tickets for Shetland. David Davidson can sort out his arrangements with the clerks after the meeting.

I have received apologies from Annabel Goldie, who is still ill, and Adam Ingram, who is at the Transport and the Environment Committee, which is also meeting at 9.30 this morning. Brian Fitzpatrick missed his train but will be joining us later.

**Mr David Davidson (North-East Scotland) (Con):** I declare that I am the substitute member for Annabel Goldie.

**The Convener:** Before we move to item 1, I should congratulate England on its result this morning. Until this morning I thought that an African nation should win the world cup, but now I think that a Scandinavian nation should win it.

**Rhona Brankin (Midlothian) (Lab):** I object to cultural fascism in the committee. [*Laughter.*]

**Mr Davidson:** On a point of information, convener, what was the score?

**The Convener:** It was nil-nil.

**Rhona Brankin:** England goes through.

**Tavish Scott (Shetland) (LD):** It was dire.

### Annual Report

**The Convener:** The first item of business is the committee's annual report. Members have a draft of the report in front of them. It seems straightforward. Are members happy with the report?

**Members indicated agreement.**

## Local Economic Forums

**The Convener:** The second item is a draft letter to Iain Gray on our response to the evidence from the lowland local economic forums. Are there any comments on the letter?

**David Mundell (South of Scotland) (Con):** I do not like it.

**The Convener:** Do you want to tell us why?

**David Mundell:** As you know, I am sceptical about the forums and have been all along. The evidence that we received did not lead me to form a different view. We are back at the situation where we must question the rationale behind LEFs. What are they attempting to achieve? If it is simply the limited objective of rationalising services to businesses, then some LEFs have succeeded and some have not. If the objective is something wider, we need a wider debate about how we are going to deal with local economic development.

The letter—without any disrespect to the person who drafted it—is wishy-washy.

**Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab):** The committee will not be surprised to hear that I totally disagree with David Mundell—perhaps for the first time. The Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Committee recommended that local economic forums be set up. I realise that some forums are working better than others, but that is to be expected. We should not give up on local economic forums just because one or two are not working as well as the others. In my area and in other areas the LEF is working well. The LEFs are encouraging partnership and collaboration and we are seeing the benefits of that.

It is important that the LEFs link into the community planning process. That is highlighted in the letter. I support the draft letter and I propose that we send it as it is.

**Tavish Scott:** I have a brief point about the second bullet point in the letter. I do not think that taking a minimalist approach is necessarily a disadvantage. For a variety of reasons, in some areas the bodies that are now formally represented on local economic forums already have close working relationships. Diversity of approach is not a bad thing and we should not be down on those who have chosen a minimalist approach. Perhaps the sentence could be more elegantly phrased to suggest that a minimalist approach is appropriate in circumstances where the partners consider it necessary.

**Marilyn Livingstone:** I support that.

**David Mundell:** I do not want us to rehearse all the arguments about local economic forums. I am happy to dissent formally from the letter.

**Mr Davidson:** I, too, dissent from the letter.

**The Convener:** We must also stress in the letter that this is our response to the lowland local economic forums because we have not yet had a review of the Highlands and Islands local economic forums. Do members agree to send the letter with those changes?

**Members** *indicated agreement.*

**The Convener:** The *Official Report* will record the dissent of Mr Mundell and Mr Davidson.

We now move into private to consider two items: the preparation of a report and the shortlist of candidates for the post of committee adviser for the tourism inquiry.

09:39

*Meeting continued in private until 12:40.*

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, 375 High Street, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

**Wednesday 19 June 2002**

Members who want reprints of their speeches (within one month of the date of publication) may obtain request forms and further details from the Central Distribution Office, the Document Supply Centre or the Official Report.

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

##### DAILY EDITIONS

*Single copies: £5*

*Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00*

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, compiled by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre, contains details of past and forthcoming business and of the work of committees and gives general information on legislation and other parliamentary activity.

*Single copies: £3.75*

*Special issue price: £5*

*Annual subscriptions: £150.00*

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

*Single copies: £3.75*

*Annual subscriptions: £150.00*

Standing orders will be accepted at the Document Supply Centre.

Published in Edinburgh by The Stationery Office Limited and available from:

**The Stationery Office Bookshop**  
71 Lothian Road  
Edinburgh EH3 9AZ  
0131 228 4181 Fax 0131 622 7017

**The Stationery Office Bookshops at:**  
123 Kingsway, London WC2B 6PQ  
Tel 020 7242 6393 Fax 020 7242 6394  
68-69 Bull Street, Birmingham B4 6AD  
Tel 0121 236 9696 Fax 0121 236 9699  
33 Wine Street, Bristol BS1 2BQ  
Tel 01179 264306 Fax 01179 294515  
9-21 Princess Street, Manchester M60 8AS  
Tel 0161 834 7201 Fax 0161 833 0634  
16 Arthur Street, Belfast BT1 4GD  
Tel 028 9023 8451 Fax 028 9023 5401  
The Stationery Office Oriel Bookshop,  
18-19 High Street, Cardiff CF1 2BZ  
Tel 029 2039 5548 Fax 029 2038 4347

**The Stationery Office Scottish Parliament Documentation**  
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information  
on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament,  
their availability and cost:

**Telephone orders and inquiries**  
**0870 606 5566**

**Fax orders**  
**0870 606 5588**

**The Scottish Parliament Shop**  
George IV Bridge  
EH99 1SP  
Telephone orders 0131 348 5412

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

www.scottish.parliament.uk

**Accredited Agents**  
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers