



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

Official Report

MEETING OF THE PARLIAMENT

Wednesday 25 May 2011

Session 4

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2011.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Information Policy Team, Office of the Queen's Printer for Scotland, Admail ADM4058, Edinburgh, EH1 1NG, or by email to:
licensing@ogps.gov.uk.

OQPS administers the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

Printed and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by
RR Donnelley.

Wednesday 25 May 2011

CONTENTS

	Col.
BUSINESS MOTION	43
<i>Motion moved—[Bruce Crawford]—and agreed to.</i>	
MINISTERS, JUNIOR MINISTERS AND LAW OFFICERS	45
<i>Motions moved—[First Minister]—and agreed to.</i>	
The First Minister (Alex Salmond)	45
Iain Gray (East Lothian) (Lab)	49
Annabel Goldie (West Scotland) (Con)	50
Willie Rennie (Mid Scotland and Fife) (LD)	51
Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green)	51
Margo MacDonald (Lothian) (Ind).....	52
The First Minister	53
SCOTTISH PARLIAMENTARY CORPORATE BODY	56

Scottish Parliament

Wednesday 25 May 2011

[The Presiding Officer *opened the meeting at 11:00*]

Business Motion

The Presiding Officer (Tricia Marwick): Good morning. The first item of business is consideration of business motion S4M-00095, in the name of Bruce Crawford, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a business programme.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees the following programme of business—

Wednesday 1 June 2011

2.30 pm Time for Reflection
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by Scottish Government Debate: Taking
 Scotland Forward – Finance,
 Employment and Sustainable Growth
followed by Business Motion
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
 5.00 pm Decision Time

Thursday 2 June 2011

9.15 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by Scottish Government Debate: Faster
 and Further to Secure Scotland's Place
 as the Green Energy Powerhouse of
 Europe
 11.40 am General Question Time
 12.00 pm First Minister's Question Time
 2.30 pm Scottish Government Debate:
 Contribution of Sport to Scotland
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
 5.00 pm Decision Time

Wednesday 8 June 2011

2.30 pm Time for Reflection
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by Scottish Government Business
followed by Business Motion
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
 5.00 pm Decision Time
followed by Members' Business

Thursday 9 June 2011

9.15 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by Scottish Government Business
 11.40 am General Question Time

12.00 pm First Minister's Question Time
 2.30 pm Scottish Government Business
followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions
 5.00 pm Decision Time
followed by Members' Business—[Bruce Crawford.]
Motion agreed to.

Ministers, Junior Ministers and Law Officers

The Presiding Officer (Tricia Marwick): The next item of business is consideration of motions S4M-00089, S4M-00090 and S4M-00091, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of Scottish ministers, junior Scottish ministers and the law officers.

I shall invite the First Minister to move the motions. I then intend to invite party leaders and Margo MacDonald to make a short contribution. Thereafter, I will ask the First Minister to reply.

11:01

The First Minister (Alex Salmond): I rise to move and speak to all three motions in my name.

Cabinet secretaries and ministers do not require to be renominated, so the first of the motions specifically asks for the nomination of the two members of the Cabinet who have not previously been cabinet secretaries: Bruce Crawford and Alex Neil; the second motion on ministers is drawn up in similar terms; and, as we will have both a new Lord Advocate and a new Solicitor General, both are named in the third motion. However, I think that it will be helpful to the chamber if I say something about the overall ministerial team.

Our manifesto in the recent election was founded on record, team and vision. Tomorrow, before Parliament, we will set out our vision and priorities in the legislative programme. Today's debate is therefore about the team, but let me touch on the record of the previous Scottish National Party Administration.

Against the background of being a minority Administration, with a plurality of only one in the chamber, tackling the worst economic conditions in living memory, I think that that Administration achieved a great deal. More important, the electorate—the people—took a similar view. Before coming to the issue before us, let me therefore say that that emphasis on the team aspect is what has guided me in the nomination of the ministers.

The record is of a team that has delivered, and that is why the new Scottish Cabinet, in particular, shows continuity, with one additional new face around the Cabinet table—Alex Neil—although Bruce Crawford and Fiona Hyslop will now be in Cabinet as full cabinet secretaries.

I want to say something about the team members individually, but let me make two points about the team as a whole. First, it is in line with the clear expectation of the Scottish people that we strengthen the team to raise our ambitions for

Scotland over the next five years. Secondly, as before, all ministers will have ministerial and MSP salaries frozen at the 1 April 2008 level, and law officers' salaries are similarly frozen. By this financial year's end, that will amount to savings to the public purse of some £100,000.

Now let me touch on the individual cabinet secretaries. Kenny MacAskill, Mike Russell and Richard Lochhead will continue as cabinet secretaries for, respectively, justice, education, and the environment and rural affairs. Nicola Sturgeon continues as Deputy First Minister in charge of health and wellbeing, and now has a new role, as promised in our manifesto, as minister for cities.

John Swinney has been—by common consent, I think—an outstanding finance secretary, and as jobs are the key priority for this Administration he will now be the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Employment and Sustainable Growth.

Just last week, the Scottish unemployment rate fell for the sixth consecutive month to below the rate in England. John Swinney knows—as we all know, across the chamber—that continuing the trend of driving down the unemployment rate will be a key feature of this Administration. In that light, the whole chamber will want to welcome the announcement by Amazon, which was made this morning, of a further 900 jobs for the city of Edinburgh. [*Applause.*]

The appointment of Alex Neil will allow John Swinney to focus on employment. A number of things have always impressed me about Alex Neil's record in administration and in politics in general. I was exceptionally pleased that, as the Minister for Housing and Communities, he managed to drive forward the conditions that allowed 3,300 new council houses to be built under our last Administration compared with six built in the four years before that. I know that Alex Neil will be able to deploy that ability to get things done across infrastructure and capital investment on a large scale, reflecting the Government's priority of sustaining capital spending in the face of Westminster cuts in order to strengthen Scotland's recovery. His appointment also reflects the coming increase, we hope, in our ability to fund that capital investment through enlarged powers over borrowing under the forthcoming Scotland Bill.

Events such as the first year of homecoming, the state visit of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI and the election just past have focused international attention on Scotland. As major new opportunities open up, with the coming Commonwealth games and a second year of homecoming, Fiona Hyslop will capitalise on that to the commercial and cultural benefit of the country.

Bruce Crawford has been a brilliant tactician in guiding Parliament through four years of minority government, as Patrick Harvie acknowledged graciously last week. We are now on slightly firmer ground in terms of the numbers, so Bruce Crawford's role in the new Administration will move from being a tactical one to a strategic one, as Cabinet Secretary for Parliamentary Business and Government Strategy.

Before coming to the new ministers, I will say a few words about the two ministers who are demitting office. Jim Mather, who has stood down as a member of Parliament, made a huge impact as the Minister for Enterprise, Energy and Tourism. Adam Ingram achieved a substantial success in improving the care and protection of our most vulnerable children, and he is held in the highest regard by the many organisations that work in that field. In the election, he succeeded after a number of attempts in winning a constituency seat, which was one of his dearest wishes. I am sure that he will be a first-rate representative for the people of Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley. *[Applause.]*

Tackling the scourge of sectarianism is a key responsibility for the Government and Roseanna Cunningham will discharge that, working alongside Kenny MacAskill. Fergus Ewing moves from the community safety portfolio to the energy, enterprise and tourism portfolio; Keith Brown adds housing to his transport responsibilities; and, as we approach the 2014 Commonwealth games, Shona Robison will focus on their organisation and on sport in general as Scotland's first dedicated sport minister. Stewart Stevenson returns to the ministerial team as the Minister for Environment and Climate Change. As the chamber will remember, he was responsible for piloting through the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009, so it is entirely appropriate that he has the opportunity to guide that legislation into practice.

Added to the new ministerial team are Brian Adam, Alasdair Allan, Aileen Campbell and Michael Matheson. Brian Adam will support Bruce Crawford as the Minister for Parliamentary Business and chief whip; Alasdair Allan will be the Minister for Learning and Skills; and Aileen Campbell takes the local government and planning brief, building on the relationship between central Government and local government.

I turn now to the law officers. The positions of the Lord Advocate and the Solicitor General are of ancient lineage and predate the union of the Parliaments, the office of the Lord Advocate being more than half a millennium old. The positions are of no little antiquity but are now fully adapted to modernity. In a wise move, the previous Labour and Liberal Democrat Administration took the step of appointing, for the first time, a professional

prosecutor, Elish Angiolini, to the role of, first, Solicitor General and then Lord Advocate. As she demits office, I pay tribute to her remarkable achievements, especially in relation to victims' rights and the prosecution of the crime of rape. She will be greatly missed as Lord Advocate.

The new Scottish Government built on that innovation in 2007 by for the first time continuing a Lord Advocate in office across a change of Administrations and confirming the now much less directly political nature of the role by separating its functions and those of the Solicitor General in prosecution and legal advice from the political workings of the Scottish Cabinet. That approach will continue in this Administration. In Frank Mulholland and Lesley Thomson, we have the right individuals to fill the roles of Lord Advocate and Solicitor General.

Lesley Thomson comes to the role of Solicitor General from Scotland's most senior procurator fiscal post, which is the area procurator fiscal for Glasgow. She is Scotland's leading expert on the confiscation of proceeds of crime. Indeed, I am told that her textbook on proceeds of crime is the most consulted volume in the prison library of Barlinnie. Lesley will make substantial moves to increase even further our success in taking money from bad people and distributing it to good people across Scotland.

I invite the Parliament to agree to my recommendation to Her Majesty of Frank Mulholland QC as Lord Advocate and Lesley Thomson as Solicitor General for Scotland.

The incoming set of cabinet secretaries, ministers and law officers is a trusted team strengthened. We have a strong Scottish Government, fit to serve a strong Scottish people. In the past four years, we have established a substantial record of delivery. In the next five, we will work constructively with parties across this Parliament and with people across this country to deliver our vision of a better nation—of a Scotland renewed, reindustrialised and responsible for our own affairs.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that Alex Neil and Bruce Crawford be appointed as Scottish ministers.

That the Parliament agrees that Michael Matheson, Aileen Campbell, Dr Alasdair Allan, Brian Adam and Stewart Stevenson be appointed as junior Scottish ministers.

That the Parliament agrees that it be recommended to Her Majesty that Frank Mulholland QC be appointed as the Lord Advocate and that Lesley Thomson be appointed as Solicitor General for Scotland.

11:11

Iain Gray (East Lothian) (Lab): I rise to offer our congratulations to those ministers to be appointed and reappointed today.

When I heard on the radio this morning that a major television personality was retiring to look after other interests, my thoughts, of course, turned to Mr Neil. Alas, however, it was only Oprah Winfrey. I congratulate Mr Neil, and all those new SNP back benchers who will be able to launch their late-night TV careers by filling the vacuum that he leaves in the “Newsnight Scotland” studio.

Mr Neil’s post, of course, reduces Mr Swinney’s portfolio, which I welcome because, four years ago, we were clear that Mr Swinney’s portfolio was too broad and combined too closely control of the budget and major spending responsibilities. Mr Neil’s appointment goes some way towards addressing that.

In any case, I am personally delighted to see Mr Swinney continuing at the highest level of Government. After all, he was once the defeated and devastated ex-leader of his party, but look at him now. There is hope for us all.

The First Minister has suggested that these changes will allow Mr Swinney to have an intensified focus on jobs. I welcome that, too, as I welcome today’s Amazon jobs announcement, although it is the case that the key areas of enterprise support, infrastructure and skills are now split across three portfolios. The three cabinet secretaries involved will have to work together very closely if they are to secure the recovery that we all want. Making that happen is perhaps the task of Mr Crawford in his new Government strategy role. I genuinely wish him good luck with that.

In offering our congratulations to the new junior ministers and to the law officers, I cannot pass by without specifically welcoming back Stewart Stevenson. Mr Stevenson’s return to the climate change brief was heralded in spectacular fashion by a cataclysmic deterioration in the climate, unleashing gale-force winds and closing down road, rail and air networks in a fashion that I confess that I found almost nostalgic. Further, as if that was not enough, right on cue, the arc of prosperity erupted again, engulfing Scotland in volcanic ash. Apparently, it is not only the First Minister who has been endowed with God-like powers by a majority mandate. Mr Stevenson’s apocalyptic touch seems only to have been intensified by his brief sabbatical from ministerial office. I am happy to welcome him back, although I fear that I might not speak for the commuters of Scotland.

All the ministers who have been appointed and reappointed today face significant challenges, and we will challenge them, too. However, in all portfolios there is common ground and we look forward to working with them there. We wish them well.

11:15

Annabel Goldie (West Scotland) (Con): In relation to the appointment of Scottish Government ministers, I too welcome some old, new and recycled faces. I congratulate the new ministerial appointees and wish them well, as I do the new law officers.

As someone observed last week, a Cabinet increased by three is maybe not the best advertisement for good housekeeping. Although, over the past four years, I might have disagreed with policies and politics advanced by the then smaller Cabinet, I never heard Alex Salmond blame failure or non-delivery on a lack of cabinet secretaries. He blamed just about everything and everyone else, but not having too few ministers.

The achievements of the previous Cabinet were in no small measure down to the arch Mr Fixer, Bruce Crawford—a man whom I admire. I hope that that commendation does not blight his glittering career. Over the past four years, his successes in negotiating, smooth talking and, at times, simply herding together disparate Opposition parties look like a stroll in the park compared with his new challenge of managing those other disparate presences—the serried ranks of his SNP back benchers. The First Minister said that that reflects a move from tactical to the strategic. That might go down as one of the all-time euphemisms of this Parliament.

Like Mr Gray, I cannot help but notice that on the day that the volcano stopped erupting, the gales abated and the rain reduced to a mere drizzle, there returns to Government a new Minister for Environment and Climate Change—Mr Stewart Stevenson. May conditions remain tranquil.

Like Mr Gray, I welcome the new appointees and wish them well in their jobs. These are challenging times and they will have their work cut out for them.

I was proud of Conservative achievements in the previous session. One of the most significant of those was one of the earliest—a new drugs strategy for Scotland that focused on recovery. I pay tribute to Fergus Ewing for the important role that he played in getting it under way. However, there is so much more to do. There is unfinished business, with major challenges still to overcome. I ask the First Minister to clarify who among his

many ministerial colleagues will drive forward that particular strategy.

The Presiding Officer: I call Willie Rennie. *[Interruption.]*

I apologise for the sounding of the division bell, Mr Rennie, but it wisnae me. *[Laughter.]*

11:18

Willie Rennie (Mid Scotland and Fife) (LD): I, too, congratulate the ministerial team on its appointment. This is an exciting moment and an exciting time ahead for the new ministers, particularly those entering Government for the first time. I wish them well.

Majority government is a huge responsibility. As the size of the ministerial team increases, so do our expectations of what it can achieve. I am sure that members of the new team will not take that responsibility lightly. They are answerable to the people of Scotland for the promises made during the election. Unlike last time, as a majority Government, the SNP will find that it has nowhere to hide. The SNP will be judged on how it uses its majority—and how it does not. As we have heard this morning, the Opposition parties in this place will work with the SNP on its positive promises to make sure that they are kept.

I hope that ministers will agree to engage with us so that, where possible, we can agree a joint approach on the many areas in which disagreement might be over detail rather than ambition.

My fear, however, is that the First Minister will not choose to use his enlarged team wisely; that instead of the focus on jobs, on growing the economy and on excellence in education and public services there will be a focus on breaking up Britain; and that what we see before us this morning is Alex Salmond's new independence army. However, the First Minister's loyal foot soldiers have a choice: services over separation; picking up the economy, not picking fights with Westminster; and putting the needs of Scotland before their party-political agenda.

During the election, we heard from the Scottish National Party many welcome promises on health, education, justice and more; last week in the First Minister's speech, we heard not one single mention of them. I hope that his new team will not make the same mistake.

11:21

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green): I, too, congratulate the ministers who are being reappointed to the new Administration, those who are joining it for the first time, and Frank

Mulholland and Lesley Thomson on their appointments.

As I said to the First Minister last week, the SNP has been given a huge opportunity in governing with a majority, but along with that comes a huge responsibility. Some of us will not be terribly surprised to find that, while it tries to do that, it talks about independence once in a while; however, the circumstances in which it is doing all this are really difficult and, in every portfolio, serious challenges need to be taken on.

So many people have mentioned Stewart Stevenson that I couldn't not do so myself. I hope that he does not take this as a hostile remark—it is not intended as such—but one of my concerns about the climate change legislation that we passed last session was that its structure could have allowed ministers not to be held responsible for actions taken in their own term of office. With his reappointment as the minister with responsibility for taking forward climate change policy in this session, having introduced the Climate Change (Scotland) Bill itself, Stewart Stevenson will be held accountable for his actions throughout that entire term of office. I look forward to robust parliamentary scrutiny of those issues.

A minor concern is that certain themes, from sustainable development to social justice, have now been spread over a number of portfolios, which means that not only will ministers have to work together constructively across portfolios but parliamentary scrutiny, too, will have to be cross-cutting. I hope that it can be.

On that note, I wish the new ministerial team well in their endeavours.

11:22

Margo MacDonald (Lothian) (Ind): I, too, give my good wishes to the front bench team and the ranks behind them. However, I must first offer a word of comfort to Willie Rennie: we do not have to choose between picking fights with Westminster and picking up the economy—we can do both. That said, I do not expect Mr Swinney and his team to be able to undo all the damage that has been done to the economy by people in another place.

I congratulate the First Minister on Shona Robison's appointment. I would like to be able to say something of comfort to all the ministers but I do not have the time and perhaps what I had to say would not be all that welcome. However, Shona Robison is the correct person in the correct job at the right time. So much is happening in sport in Scotland that someone such as her can genuinely act as a spearhead and pull together very disparate threads. I want her to do more—for example, I want her to see to the teaching of

physical education—but we will talk about that later.

I wish everyone the very best.

11:24

The First Minister: First, I thank Iain Gray for his gracious remarks. With regard to the circumstances in which ministers are appointed and the functions that they have, I can well understand his slight cynicism about their powers over the elements. I was in London on Monday morning, and when I saw Philip Hammond on Sky giving an assurance that there was no expectation of disruption to air travel, I immediately booked a train so that I could come north yesterday. That was a good thing; I would not have been here to outline the ministerial team otherwise.

I thank Iain Gray for the gracious way in which he responded. Many of the points that he made, particularly on the concentration and clear focus on employment, have been taken on board in shaping the ministerial team.

I also thank Annabel Goldie. The answer to the specific question that she asked is Roseanna Cunningham, in liaison with the health and welfare department and Nicola Sturgeon and her team, obviously.

I was surprised to hear Annabel Goldie's complaint about the size of the ministerial team. Iain Gray did not make that point, which was wise because, in respect of the number of both cabinet secretaries and ministers, the ministerial team is, of course, rather smaller than previous Labour-Liberal Administrations. I thought that I would cast my eye a little bit wider and look down south to do a wee bit of comparison between the ministerial team in Scotland and the coalition Government's ministerial team. Currently, there are 123 ministers in government in London. I know that certain political machinations were necessary to accommodate the Liberal Democrat party and that if Willie Rennie had managed to hang on to his seat, he could have been one of the 21 Liberal ministers currently in Westminster. That must be the highest ratio of ministers to a parliamentary group in political history; in fact, the Liberal Democrat component of the Westminster Government is as big as the entire Scottish Government. I know that Annabel Goldie will be delighted to find out that our health department in Scotland works with three ministers compared with the five ministers for the United Kingdom, that education works with three ministers in Scotland compared with the five for the UK, and that our rural affairs and environment department works with two ministers compared with the four UK ministers. I merely make the point that, compared with the bloated bureaucracy that currently

prevails in the city of London, the streamlined and efficient ministerial team here is a credit to Scotland and the Parliament.

I say to Willie Rennie that the use of the bell at the start of his speech was not inadvertent; it will be used during his remarks in future. I think that the "Avon calling" bell will be a significant measure that could be used with speeches that could be better judged.

It is important for members to recognise that many of the priorities that I have outlined are necessary to boost employment and Scotland's economy; it is also important for the Liberal Democrat party to recognise that Liberal Democrats profess to believe in the policies that I outlined in my acceptance speech to the Parliament last week. I understand that being vehemently attacked when there is a policy disagreement is part of the democratic process, but I have never before heard that we should be vehemently attacked for trying to enhance the Scottish Parliament's powers and responsibilities with a view to improving the health, welfare and economy of Scotland with policies that the Liberal Democrats should be in accordance with. I say to the Liberal Democrats that they should join us, add to our numbers—marginally—and give us full backing. If Willie Rennie is prepared to do that, we will see whether we can do something about that bell stopping his remarks in due course.

Patrick Harvie's point that the minister who shaped the climate change legislation—with unanimity in the Parliament, if I remember correctly—should have responsibility for bringing it into practice was a serious one that was worth making. The point about continuity between the previous Administration and this Administration is very strong.

As ever, I thank Margo MacDonald for not going through the entire ministerial team, but picking on only one or two ministers. Nonetheless, her remarks were well made, well thought of and much appreciated.

The Presiding Officer: There are three questions to be put. The first question is, that motion S4M-00089, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of Scottish ministers, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that Alex Neil and Bruce Crawford be appointed as Scottish ministers.

The Presiding Officer: As the Parliament has agreed to the First Minister's recommendations, he may now invite Her Majesty to approve the appointment of Alex Neil and Bruce Crawford as ministers.

The next question is, that motion S4M-00090, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of junior Scottish ministers, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that Michael Matheson, Aileen Campbell, Dr Alasdair Allan, Brian Adam and Stewart Stevenson be appointed as junior Scottish ministers.

The Presiding Officer: As the Parliament has agreed to the First Minister's recommendations, he may now invite Her Majesty to approve the appointment of Michael Matheson, Aileen Campbell, Dr Alasdair Allan, Brian Adam and Stewart Stevenson as junior Scottish ministers.

The next question is, that motion S4M-00091, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of law officers, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that it be recommended to Her Majesty that Frank Mulholland QC be appointed as the Lord Advocate and that Lesley Thomson be appointed as Solicitor General for Scotland.

Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

11:31

The Presiding Officer (Tricia Marwick): The next item of business is the selection of four members for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body. Copies of guidance explaining the voting procedure to be followed have been placed on each member's desk.

I have received four valid nominations for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body. I ask the candidates, as their names are announced, to make themselves known to members. In alphabetical order, the nominations are: Linda Fabiani, Liam McArthur, Mary Scanlon and David Stewart. Members will be aware that Liam McArthur did not make himself known to you. He is stuck in Orkney and he hopes to be here at lunch time.

As the number of candidates is equal to the number of vacant positions on the SPCB, I invite members to agree that there be a single vote to elect all the candidates. If any member objects to a single question being put, please say so now.

As no member objects, the question is, that the following members be selected for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body: Linda Fabiani, Liam McArthur, Mary Scanlon, David Stewart.

Members voted.

For

Adam, Brian (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Central Scotland) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Baker, Richard (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Biagi, Marco (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brodie, Chic (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Brown, Gavin (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burgess, Margaret (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Campbell, Roderick (North East Fife) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (West Scotland) (Con)
 Chisholm, Malcolm (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Glasgow) (Con)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Nigel (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dugdale, Kezia (Lothian) (Lab)
 Eadie, Jim (Edinburgh Southern) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ferguson, Patricia (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gibson, Rob (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Goldie, Annabel (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Henry, Hugh (Renfrewshire South) (Lab)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hume, Jim (South Scotland) (LD)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Ingram, Adam (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alex (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Keir, Colin (Edinburgh Western) (SNP)
 Kelly, James (Rutherglen) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab)
 Lamont, John (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lyle, Richard (Central Scotland) (SNP)
 MacAskill, Kenny (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Macintosh, Ken (Eastwood) (Lab)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackenzie, Mike (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Malik, Hanzala (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Paul (Glasgow Provan) (Lab)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 Maxwell, Stewart (West Scotland) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McCulloch, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (North East Scotland) (SNP)
 McDougall, Margaret (West Scotland) (Lab)
 McGrigor, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 McInnes, Alison (North East Scotland) (LD)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLeod, Aileen (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McLeod, Fiona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 McLetchie, David (Lothian) (Con)
 McMahon, Michael (Uddingston and Bellshill) (Lab)
 McMahon, Siobhan (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McMillan, Stuart (West Scotland) (SNP)
 McTaggart, Anne (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Milne, Nanette (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Murray, Elaine (Dumfriesshire) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Park, John (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Pearson, Graeme (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Pentland, John (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (Mid Scotland and Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Dennis (Aberdeenshire West) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Salmond, Alex (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Scanlon, Mary (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Scott, John (Ayr) (Con)
 Simpson, Dr Richard (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Smith, Drew (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thompson, Dave (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Urquhart, Jean (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Walker, Bill (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wilson, John (Central Scotland) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow) (SNP)

Abstentions

MacDonald, Margo (Lothian) (Ind)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the vote is: For 120, Against 0; Abstentions 1. As a majority of members voted in favour, Linda Fabiani, Liam McArthur, Mary Scanlon and David Stewart are duly selected for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body. I congratulate all four members. I look forward to working with them on the corporate body. [*Applause.*]

Meeting closed at 11:34.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice to SPICe.

Members who wish to suggest corrections for the revised e-format edition should mark them clearly in the report or send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP.

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

Single copies: £5.00

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Available in e-format only. Printed Scottish Parliament documentation is published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and is available from:

Scottish Parliament

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

For more information on the Parliament, or if you have an inquiry about information in languages other than English or in alternative formats (for example, Braille, large print or audio), please contact:

Public Information Service

The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh EH99 1SP

Telephone: 0131 348 5000

Fòn: 0131 348 5395 (Gàidhlig)

Textphone users may contact us on **0800 092 7100**.

We also welcome calls using the Text Relay service.

Fax: 0131 348 5601

E-mail: sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

We welcome written correspondence in any language.

Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation

Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries

0131 622 8283 or

0131 622 8258

Fax orders

0131 557 8149

E-mail orders, subscriptions and standing orders
business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Blackwell's Bookshop

**53 South Bridge
Edinburgh EH1 1YS
0131 622 8222**

Blackwell's Bookshops:

243-244 High Holborn
London WC1 7DZ
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

Accredited Agents

(see Yellow Pages)

and through other good booksellers

e-format first available
ISBN 978-0-85758-634-6

Revised e-format available
ISBN 978-0-85758-635-3

Revised e-format ISBN 978-0-85758-635-3