



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

Official Report

STANDARDS, PROCEDURES AND PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE

Tuesday 2 November 2010

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2010

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Information Policy Team, Office of the Queen's Printer for Scotland, Admail ADM4058, Edinburgh, EH1 1NG, or by email to:
licensing@ogps.gov.uk.

OQPS administers the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

Printed and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by
RR Donnelley.

Tuesday 2 November 2010

CONTENTS

	Col.
DECISION ON TAKING BUSINESS IN PRIVATE	429
COMMISSIONER FOR PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS IN SCOTLAND (REPORT)	430

STANDARDS, PROCEDURES AND PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE
12th Meeting 2010, Session 3

CONVENER

*Gil Paterson (West of Scotland) (SNP)

DEPUTY CONVENER

*Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

*Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD)

*Aileen Campbell (South of Scotland) (SNP)

*Angela Constance (Livingston) (SNP)

*Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con)

*Peter Peacock (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Alasdair Morgan (South of Scotland) (SNP)

Mary Mulligan (Linlithgow) (Lab)

Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)

Elizabeth Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

*attended

CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Gillian Baxendine

Alison Walker

LOCATION

Committee Room 6

Scottish Parliament

Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee

Tuesday 2 November 2010

[The Convener *opened the meeting at 14:16*]

Decision on Taking Business in Private

The Convener (Gil Paterson): I welcome everyone to the 12th meeting in 2010 of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee. There are no apologies.

Item 1 is a decision on whether to take in private items 3 and 7. Item 3 relates to a complaint report from the Scottish Parliamentary Standards Commissioner, which would always be considered in private. Item 7 relates to consideration of members' interests, following the committee's report on Calman, and will involve a discussion on the committee's approach to proposed changes to the Scotland Act 1998. Do members agree to take the items in private?

Members *indicated agreement.*

Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland (Report)

14:16

The Convener: Item 2 is a report from the Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland on a complaint investigation regarding an application for the Scottish Legal Aid Board. In summary, the complaint was that the Scottish Government had not provided an applicant with constructive feedback about his application, that the detailed feedback did not, in the complainant's opinion, provide a fair assessment of his application, and that the feedback referred to an additional criterion against which his application was measured but which had not been part of the publicised criteria for the role.

The commissioner noted that in 2006 she dealt with a similar complaint in relation to an appointment to the same body. She upheld the complaint in respect of the quality of the feedback that was provided and she issued guidance at the time in respect of the provision of feedback, which was noted and accepted by the Justice Department.

I invite members to consider what action, if any, to take in relation to the report. Action might include writing to the Cabinet Secretary for Justice, to invite his response on the points that the commissioner raised in her report and, in particular, to ask whether the Government accepts the commissioner's findings and will ensure that systems are put in place to take account of the guidance that she issued.

Peter Peacock (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): As you said, the right course of action is perhaps to write to the cabinet secretary, as is proposed in paragraph 15 of paper SPPA/S3/10/12/1. That seems to be an appropriate way to proceed.

The Convener: Are members happy with that view?

Members *indicated agreement.*

The Convener: Thank you. We will write to the cabinet secretary and see what response we get.

14:19

Meeting continued in private until 15:11.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice to SPICe.

Members who wish to suggest corrections for the revised e-format edition should mark them clearly in the report or send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP.

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

Single copies: £5.00

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Printed and published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and available from:

Scottish Parliament

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

For more information on the Parliament, or if you have an inquiry about information in languages other than English or in alternative formats (for example, Braille, large print or audio), please contact:

Public Information Service

The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh EH99 1SP

Telephone: 0131 348 5000

Fòn: 0131 348 5395 (Gàidhlig)

Textphone users may contact us on **0800 092 7100**.

We also welcome calls using the Text Relay service.

Fax: 0131 348 5601

E-mail: sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

We welcome written correspondence in any language.

Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation

Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries

0131 622 8283 or

0131 622 8258

Fax orders

0131 557 8149

E-mail orders, subscriptions and standing orders
business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Blackwell's Bookshop

**53 South Bridge
Edinburgh EH1 1YS
0131 622 8222**

Blackwell's Bookshops:

243-244 High Holborn
London WC1 7DZ
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

Accredited Agents

(see Yellow Pages)

and through other good booksellers

e-format available
ISBN 978-0-85758-179-2

Printed format published
ISBN 978-1-4061-6913-3