



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## Official Report

### **PUBLIC AUDIT COMMITTEE**

Wednesday 12 May 2010

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2010

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Information Policy Team, Office of the Queen's Printer for Scotland, Admail ADM4058, Edinburgh, EH1 1NG, or by email to:  
[licensing@ogps.gov.uk](mailto:licensing@ogps.gov.uk).

OQPS administers the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

Printed and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by  
RR Donnelley.

---

**Wednesday 12 May 2010**

**CONTENTS**

|   | <b>Col.</b> |
|---|-------------|
| <b>DECISION ON TAKING BUSINESS IN PRIVATE .....</b>   | <b>1685</b> |
| <b>PUBLIC AUDIT COMMITTEE REPORT (RESPONSES).....</b> | <b>1686</b> |
| "Review of Cairngorm funicular railway" .....         | 1686        |
| <b>SECTION 23 REPORT (RESPONSE).....</b>              | <b>1687</b> |
| "Managing NHS waiting lists" .....                    | 1687        |

---

**PUBLIC AUDIT COMMITTEE**  
**9<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2010, Session 3**

**CONVENER**

\*Hugh Henry (Paisley South) (Lab)

**DEPUTY CONVENER**

\*Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

\*Willie Coffey (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP)  
\*Cathie Craigie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)  
George Foulkes (Lothians) (Lab)  
Bill Kidd (Glasgow) (SNP)  
\*Anne McLaughlin (Glasgow) (SNP)  
\*Nicol Stephen (Aberdeen South) (LD)

**COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES**

Derek Brownlee (South of Scotland) (Con)  
\*Linda Fabiani (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
\*James Kelly (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)  
John Farquhar Munro (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)  
\*attended

**THE FOLLOWING ALSO ATTENDED:**

Mr Robert Black (Auditor General for Scotland)  
Angela Cullen (Audit Scotland)  
Caroline Gardner (Audit Scotland)  
Ffion Heledd (Audit Scotland)  
Jillian Matthew (Audit Scotland)  
Tricia Meldrum (Audit Scotland)

**CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE**

Jane Williams

**LOCATION**

Committee Room 3



## Scottish Parliament

### Public Audit Committee

*Wednesday 12 May 2010*

[The Convener *opened the meeting at 10:03*]

### Decision on Taking Business in Private

**The Convener (Hugh Henry):** I welcome everyone to the Public Audit Committee's ninth meeting in 2010 and I ask for all electronic devices to be switched off. I have apologies from George Foulkes and Bill Kidd and I welcome James Kelly and Linda Fabiani as their substitutes.

Under agenda item 1, do we agree to take in private items 5 and 6?

**Members** *indicated agreement.*

## Public Audit Committee Report (Responses)

### "Review of Cairngorm funicular railway"

10:03

**The Convener:** Item 2 is consideration of responses to the committee's report "Review of Cairngorm funicular railway". Committee members have copies of the accountable officers' responses. Members will note the positive response to most recommendations, although there is a slight disagreement about paragraph 16 of our report. Do members have comments?

**Willie Coffey (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP):** I will focus on the business plan. I am sure that members will recall that interest was expressed in seeing how the plan develops in the coming years. I note from the papers that we have requested sight of the plan, but is that now our concern or should it be for one of our sister committees, such as the Finance Committee, to investigate?

**The Convener:** I recommend that we note the responses and refer them to another committee for consideration. Any follow-up work would probably be more relevant to another committee than to us, unless members are otherwise minded.

**Willie Coffey:** I agree.

**The Convener:** Do we agree to note the responses and refer them to the Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee, which is the relevant committee? We will also send them to the Finance Committee for information.

**Members** *indicated agreement.*

## Section 23 Report (Response)

### “Managing NHS waiting lists”

10:05

**The Convener:** Under item 3, members have a response to “Managing NHS waiting lists” from the accountable officer. Do members have comments? If not, do we agree to note the response and refer it to the Health and Sport Committee for information?

**Members** *indicated agreement.*

**The Convener:** Item 4 is in private and we have agreed to take items 5 and 6 in private, so that ends the public part of the meeting.

10:05

*Meeting continued in private until 10:33.*

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

Members who wish to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the report or send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP.

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

##### OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

*Single copies: £5.00*

*Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00*

##### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

*Single copies: £3.75*

*Annual subscriptions: £150.00*

Printed and published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and available from:

##### Scottish Parliament

**All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:**

**[www.scottish.parliament.uk](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk)**

For more information on the Parliament, or if you have an inquiry about information in languages other than English or in alternative formats (for example, Braille, large print or audio), please contact:

##### Public Information Service

The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh EH99 1SP

**Telephone: 0131 348 5000**

**Fòn: 0131 348 5395** (Gàidhlig)

**Textphone users** may contact us on  
**0800 092 7100.**

We also welcome calls using the Text Relay service.

**Fax: 0131 348 5601**

**E-mail: [sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk](mailto:sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk)**

We welcome written correspondence in any language.

##### Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation

**Helpline** may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

##### Telephone orders and inquiries

**0131 622 8283 or**

**0131 622 8258**

##### Fax orders

**0131 557 8149**

**E-mail orders, subscriptions and standing orders**  
**[business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk](mailto:business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk)**

##### Blackwell's Bookshop

**53 South Bridge  
Edinburgh EH1 1YS  
0131 622 8222**

##### Blackwell's Bookshops:

243-244 High Holborn  
London WC1 7DZ  
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

##### Accredited Agents

(see Yellow Pages)

and through other good booksellers