

# **MEETING OF THE PARLIAMENT**

Thursday 17 May 2007

Session 3

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2007.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division,  
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ  
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate  
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by RR  
Donnelley.

---

## CONTENTS

Thursday 17 May 2007

### Debates

Col.

<b>MINISTERS AND JUNIOR MINISTERS .....</b>	<b>37</b>
<i>Motions moved—[First Minister].</i>	
<i>Amendment moved—[Murdo Fraser].</i>	
<i>Amendment moved—[Tavish Scott].</i>	
The First Minister (Alex Salmond) .....	37
Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con).....	39
Tavish Scott (Shetland) (LD) .....	41
Jack McConnell (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab) .....	43
Margo MacDonald (Lothians) (Ind).....	45
The First Minister .....	45

---



## Scottish Parliament

*Thursday 17 May 2007*

[THE PRESIDING OFFICER *opened the meeting at 11:15*]

### Ministers and Junior Ministers

**The Presiding Officer (Alex Fergusson):** Good morning. The first item of business is consideration of motions S3M-26 and S3M-27, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of Scottish ministers and junior Scottish ministers. When I invite the First Minister to move motion S3M-26, on the appointment of Scottish ministers, I will also ask him to speak to both the motions. I then intend to invite members to speak to and move the amendments that I have selected to motion S3M-26, on the appointment of Scottish ministers. Thereafter, I will invite the First Minister formally to move motion S3M-27, on the appointment of junior Scottish ministers, to which there are no amendments.

11:16

**The First Minister (Alex Salmond):** In moving the first motion in my name and in speaking to both the motions, I bring to the Parliament for approval a team of Cabinet secretaries and ministers but, just as—or more—important, a fresh approach to the government of Scotland. I have no doubt that Nicola Sturgeon, John Swinney, Fiona Hyslop, Kenny MacAskill, Richard Lochhead and our ministerial teams will do everything in their power to focus government on public services and on creating a more successful country, with opportunities for all Scotland to flourish through increasing and sustainable economic growth. That is the benchmark against which the Parliament should and, I hope, will judge the ministerial team. It is designed as a clear signal to every part of the Government of the direction in which we must travel.

The team that I present to members today is designed to deliver smaller and more effective government. We have slimmed down the Government from nine departments to six, thereby delivering a welcome reduction in the cost of the ministerial team. Government will be strategically focused, with five Cabinet secretaries, supported by 10 ministers, who are charged with responsibility as individuals and as a Cabinet team to drive forward policies to grow wealth and share success throughout Scotland.

Our aim is to break down the boundaries and barriers that exist in government, which can often

hinder the most effective strategic outcomes and a focused approach. The realignment of the Cabinet is therefore matched with a restructuring of the senior civil service. Our Cabinet team will work alongside a new strategic board, so that the Government as a whole pulls in the same direction. Any action or proposal will be measured against a clear template—does it make Scotland wealthier, fairer, safer, stronger, healthier, smarter and greener?

Probably unusually in the Parliament, I have been a civil servant and I have worked in the private sector. In my career as a Scottish Office civil servant, I was incredibly junior—it was the first job that I had after I left university. I believe that our civil service in Scotland is among the finest in the world. As a body, it knows the objective and point of public service. In the best traditions of the service, over the past week or so, it has responded to the substantial challenge of a radical departure in the management of the Scottish Executive civil service team and found a template to make progress.

During the election debate, there was discussion about the extent to which we should seek efficiencies in the public service in Scotland. We will look for efficiencies. Our objective of 1.5 per cent year-on-year efficiency savings is rather more manageable than some of the efficiencies that are being suggested, for example, for Whitehall departments. Perhaps we can see the consequences of some of those efficiencies, through departmental restructuring, in today's announcement on post offices. The objectives that we have in Scotland are sustainable and manageable and will allow us to implement changes to government in Scotland without, for example, closures and compulsory redundancies.

It is important that we mobilise the full skill range within our civil service. I note that, within four years, Scottish Enterprise accumulated a bill of more than £100 million in consultancy fees. Much of what we are doing in restructuring and changing the direction of public services in Scotland will, I accept, be bad news for consultants, but it will be good news for the nation and public services in Scotland.

I will give two examples of how the new approach will work. The first is in a particular policy area and the second illustrates a cross-Government approach. Nicola Sturgeon will lead on health and well-being, a portfolio that will be expanded to include not only the health service and public health, but wider social policy, sport, deprivation and housing. That will allow a cross-cutting approach, which means that her responsibilities will include creating a healthier Scotland that is about fitness and treatment, good-quality homes and good-quality health care.

Building a wealthier Scotland will be as much the responsibility of the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning, for example, as of any other member of the Cabinet. There will be clear benefits from bringing together responsibility for our universities and colleges with responsibility for the rest of the education system. After all, schools should not mark an end point in education; opportunities for learning should be present throughout life. The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning will have to focus as much on the link between higher and further education and our enterprise structure as on the transition from school.

The ministerial team has learned much in opposition—it has had substantial time to do so—and has grown as the Parliament has grown. As I indicated yesterday, I have asked the members of that team, in the work that they are asked to do, to engage with all parties in the Parliament so that, where possible, we can agree a joint approach on the many areas on which all that divides us might be the detail, not the substance. That is a new way of doing business for all of us in the Parliament, and I hope that all parties will bring good ideas and open minds to the many debates that we will have in the months and years to come. Their relationship with the Parliament must be strong, as must ours. It must be based on mutual respect and I hope that it will be based on a growing trust, co-operation and confidence. The team has the right roots and right experience to perform the task well. It is a team that can help to make Scotland more successful and, therefore, I am proud to move the motion.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that Nicola Sturgeon, John Swinney, Kenny MacAskill, Fiona Hyslop and Richard Lochhead be appointed as Ministers.

11:22

**Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con):** I have pleasure in speaking to amendment S3M-26.2, in my name, which seeks to delete the name of Richard Lochhead from the list of Cabinet secretaries who are to be appointed.

I make it clear that neither I nor my party bear any particular ill-will towards Mr Lochhead. He has had his reward for years of slavish loyalty to his leader, and we wish him well with his new appointment. We might just as easily have substituted the name of another appointee for Mr Lochhead's in our amendment. For example, I considered opposing Mr Swinney's appointment, as Tavish Scott has done. However, as Mr Swinney knows, I have had little success in opposing him in recent contests and I suspect that today would have proved no different. Moreover, I fear that it will be punishment enough for Mr

Swinney that he will have to sit in the same Government as his old friend and trusted colleague Michael Russell—a man who, despite his many qualities, possesses only a passing acquaintance with the concept of slavish loyalty.

However, I come to praise the new Executive, not to bury it. The Scottish Conservatives wish the new Government well. Indeed, we are delighted that the new Administration's first act has been to adopt a sound Conservative principle: smaller Government with a slimmed-down Cabinet. I look forward to that new spirit of Conservative thinking infusing the approach of the Scottish National Party Government. If Mr Salmond would like me to point out to him other sound proposals in the Conservative manifesto that his Government can adopt, I will be only too happy to oblige. Perhaps that is expecting too much, even from this consensual Administration.

The new Executive has been classified as slimmed down. We have fewer ministers than before, but only by two. I hope that the new approach will not stop at the ministerial level of Government, but will be followed at all levels. Will there be a reduction in the ever-increasing fleet of ministerial cars? Will there be a reduction in overall administration costs? Will there be a cut in the number of spin doctors working at the taxpayers' expense? The Scottish Conservatives will ask those questions in the coming weeks. We need to know that today's announcement is not window dressing, but the start of a commitment to reducing government.

We welcome not only the slimline nature of the Cabinet, but its new structure. We believe that the new portfolios will bring greater focus and coherence to key policy areas. That is particularly relevant in relation to matters such as enterprise—or should I say sustainable development—where transport, finance and Scottish Water are all in the same stable, and in education where pre-school, school and post-school learning are all combined.

Of course, the question of who is in the new Cabinet is much less important than the question of what those new ministers will do and what they will achieve in those roles. The Scottish Conservatives have made it clear that we do not want to see an Executive that spends its time picking fights with Westminster and indulging in the distraction of endless constitutional debate. We want to see an Executive that, in a departure from the practices of the past eight years, starts to tackle the people's priorities.

In the election campaign, my party talked relentlessly about bread-and-butter issues. We make no apology for doing so and today I make no apology for repeating that call. What people in Scotland want from their Government is simple—they want the Government to be committed to

tackling problems such as the scourge of drugs, which blights many of our communities; the lack of police officers on our streets; the lack of affordable housing, which holds back many of our young people; the centralisation of health services far away from where people live; the decline of our town centres and the overburdening of our small businesses with costs and red tape; and the crying need for improvements in our transport infrastructure. Those are the people's priorities. They are our priorities, and they should be the Scottish Executive's priorities too.

We wish the new ministers success. It is clear what needs to be done. I hope that this new Government will get on and do it, and if it demonstrates that it will tackle the people's priorities, the Scottish Conservatives will give it a fair wind.

I move amendment S3M-26.2, to leave out "and Richard Lochhead".

11:27

**Tavish Scott (Shetland) (LD):** John Swinney is a fair and decent man. I reflected this morning on Mr Swinney's fairness and decency as his ministerial Volvo swept past the bus that I was on.

The Liberal Democrats do not oppose the appointment of ministers that the First Minister proposes this morning. It is his right to bring forward a Government today. However, the motion in his name allows us to question the enormous and unwieldy department of finance and sustainable growth that he proposes to give to Mr Swinney to manage. Enterprise, transport, finance, local government, planning and climate change—it would take four minutes just to read out Mr Swinney's responsibilities.

The separation of enterprise and lifelong learning is wrong. Donald Dewar agreed to the change in 1999 as Jim Wallace argued that such a radical and progressive approach to government was needed to drive forward the economy. The change was widely welcomed by the business, university and college sectors. The coming together of business and further and higher education, led by one Cabinet minister, should be preserved. We therefore do not agree with the First Minister's approach.

We are also concerned that Scotland's biggest industry, tourism, will now have to compete for attention with climate change, transport, infrastructure, energy and planning, to name but a few areas. When the previous Cabinet was appointed, Kenny MacAskill called for more powers for the Minister for Tourism, Culture and Sport. Only a few months ago, he made the case for having a "distinct minister for culture". Fergus

Ewing has previously called for a Cabinet minister for tourism

"so that the buck stops with one person."—[*Official Report*, 22 September 1999; Vol 2, c 651.]

Now the portfolios of tourism, culture and sport are being thrown to the four winds.

Those are not the only examples of today's Cabinet line-up having little resemblance to the ministerial wish list that we heard from the former Opposition. What happened to Fiona Hyslop's pledge to have a minister for voluntary organisations? What happened to Rob Gibson's plea for a minister for the marine environment? I trust that the First Minister will explain why the Scottish National Party demanded so many more ministers when it was in opposition; and why, now that he has the responsibility of appointing ministers, it has abandoned the plans that it said were so important.

Within Mr Swinney's enormous department, the new post of minister for climate change will certainly be a challenging role. Despite the title, and despite the SNP manifesto's plans for our nation's roads, we will assume that Stewart Stevenson is at least broadly against climate change. The central point is that the Government cannot both tackle climate change and cancel public transport projects. The First Minister will be very wrong if he cancels the Edinburgh airport rail link and Edinburgh trams projects. As for the Greens, who will support today's appointments, I point out that building new roads while cancelling rail projects is not very green at all.

Those of us who have dealt with transport matters in the past few years are genuinely sad to lose Mr Ewing from that noble area of Government policy. However, as he will be Minister for Community Safety, we know that Scotland's neighbourhood watch schemes will be in good hands.

If anyone can marry transport and climate change, it will be Mr Stevenson. Many of us thought that he was already a minister in the previous session. There are not many jobs that Mr Stevenson has not already done. In fairness, I suspect that a transport minister with a pilot's licence is a first and I congratulate him on his appointment.

Mr Swinney is also to be supported in his huge department by Mr Mather. Presiding Officer, I presume that you have planned the installation of a PowerPoint projector and screen for the first economics debate. If not, a liberal sprinkling of Mr Mather's fiscal fairy dust will solve all our problems.

The First Minister's structure needs rethinking, and the Liberal Democrats urge him to do that.

Government is about doing. Expectations on the ministers are very high. We genuinely wish them well in their work. They will be judged on what they do, not just on what they say.

I move amendment S3M-26.1, to leave out "John Swinney".

11:33

**Jack McConnell (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab):** I will start by outlining the position of the Labour MSPs in this debate. We will not copy the ritual abuse that tended to be central to previous debates on ministerial appointments and the ritual opposition that went with it. I said yesterday that we would not oppose the new First Minister's decisions for opposition's sake, and we will carry out that promise today. I also said that the new First Minister would have our support only when his decisions were right. For that reason, my group will abstain from voting today. That is not just because of the individual contradictions in the package that has been presented to us—Mr Salmond did not talk about that package very much in his speech—although those contradictions could be entertaining. The fact that Mr MacAskill once said,

"I object to the creation of a hybrid—ministers who attend the full Cabinet, but who receive the pay of a deputy minister",—[*Official Report*, 21 May 2003; c 48]

might be of interest to Mr Crawford. The fact that Mr Crawford, at the time of the creation of Ross Finnie's new portfolio by my predecessor, said,

"It must surely be unwise and inappropriate to add the environment portfolio to that of rural development",—[*Official Report*, 22 March 2001; Vol 11, c 884]

might be of interest to Mr Lochhead and Mr Russell.

Mr Swinney's portfolio is the biggest challenge that the new Government will face. I am not sure whether I have enough time to read out the full list of responsibilities, but I will try. They are the economy; the budget; public service reform; deregulation; local government; public service delivery; cities and community planning; the General Register Office for Scotland; Registers of Scotland; relocation; e-government, the Scottish Public Pensions Agency; procurement; budgetary monitoring—the list goes on and on—enterprise; inward investment; corporate social responsibility; the voluntary sector; European structural funds; energy; tourism; planning; climate change; transport; Scottish Water; and many more. I do not think that even Wendy Alexander could handle that range of responsibilities. Mr Swinney himself pointed that out back in 2002, when he said, of Wendy Alexander's resignation:

"One of the clear factors in that resignation was that Wendy Alexander had too much to do and too many

responsibilities, and did not receive the support that she needed to focus on the formidable challenge of improving the Scottish economy."—[*Official Report*, 8 May 2002; c 11621.]

The economy has been the top priority of the Government of Scotland for the past four years. Today, it is deprioritised by the new First Minister, who has put it inside a shambles of a department. I think that he will regret that.

My predecessor had problems over a muddle. I can only describe Mr Salmond's first decisions as a guddle. He has learned nothing in opposition, despite what he said about doing so. He will regret deprioritising culture, sport and housing, but those who value them will regret it more. Those who want to see action on affordable homes will regret it too.

Mr Salmond will regret putting climate change in one department and the environment in another. I know that the Green party chose its title because of the colour of the grass, but it was not also intended to mean that the party was naive. The Green party will regret its shoddy and unprincipled support for the decision that has been put before us today and environmentalists throughout Scotland will worry about the fact that the new Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and the Environment, Mr Lochhead, has consistently taken a cavalier approach to science and conservation in his policies on fishing.

Most of all, Mr Salmond will regret breaking the link between enterprise and lifelong learning. Companies in Scotland that create jobs and want to create jobs and people who want and need good jobs will regret that decision even more. Yesterday, unemployment in Scotland fell again, employment reached a new record high of 76.6 per cent and economic activity rose above 80 per cent for the first time ever. By every criterion—employment, unemployment, the claimant count and economic activity—the Scottish labour market is outperforming that of the rest of the United Kingdom and most of Europe. In recent years, Scotland's skills have given us our competitive advantage. This is no time to rip up the policy and structure that have delivered that success. I appeal to Mr Salmond to listen to companies in Scotland and abroad and to the further and higher education sectors, to truly put the national interest first and to rethink his decision.

We will not vote against the appointment of ministers today but will abstain, to give Mr Salmond the opportunity to think again in the months ahead. There will be many regrets as a result of his first decisions. I regret the fact that although the new First Minister indicated yesterday that he would be interested in working together, achieving consensus and listening, he has not followed that through in the first 24 hours.

We will give him other opportunities to do so but with a warning: the committee structure of the Parliament has been central and important to the Parliament from day one, so if there is any attempt to rip up that structure without consultation, discussion and agreement with other parties, we will vote against such proposals in the chamber. The committees will be vital in this Parliament of minorities and we will not only defend them but ensure that they are strong and capable. I would welcome an assurance from Mr Salmond, in his final contribution to the debate, that the new ministers will work with the committees of the Parliament and respect their authority.

11:39

**Margo MacDonald (Lothians) (Ind):** I rise to support Tavish Scott's amendment S3M-26.1. It is nothing personal against Mr Swinney, although some people think that it could be. I am letting bygones be bygones and am looking forward to the sustainable development of Scotland.

I should say to Mr Swinney that, if I get the assurances that I am looking for, my vote could be won. However, that will happen only if Edinburgh gets the fair deal that was asked for yesterday by the Edinburgh business assembly. Part of that fair deal is a tram system, which is an absolute necessity, and the airport link, which should be seen not as an Edinburgh venture but as one that will help to open up the entire Scottish economy. I have written proof of that, should Mr Swinney want to visit me in my eyrie.

I am seeking not unfair advantage, but a fair deal for Edinburgh. If I get the assurance that I ask for, Mr Swinney will get my vote; otherwise, he will not.

**The Presiding Officer:** It would be right to offer the First Minister an opportunity to respond to the debate before we consider the amendments.

11:41

**The First Minister:** I understand that I should respond to the debate when rising to move the second motion, but I will accept your guidance.

**The Presiding Officer:** You do not have to take the opportunity that I am affording you. However, I felt that you might want to respond to the debate.

**The First Minister:** In that case, I shall briefly respond to the points that have been made.

Murdo Fraser's speech was constructive in a number of ways, although I was disappointed by his lack of enthusiasm for any further constitutional change. I read an excellent book last year, a compilation of essays. I have been asking my colleagues for the name of the book, but no one

can remember it. I do remember, however, that it was edited by Murdo Fraser and that it contained an array of suggestions for positive constitutional change for Scotland. Of course, I understand that the editors of books do not agree with every scintilla of argument that they contain, but I think that every chapter of that book made suggestions about further constitutional change. I am sure that Mr Fraser agreed with some of the suggestions that he managed to marshal. No doubt that enlightened approach will develop as the debates progress.

Tavish Scott has taken wonderfully to opposition and I now see why he was so keen to go there. Many of the points that he made were constructive and I know that John Swinney understands that there was nothing personal in the remarks. I accept that the Liberal Democrats, in Westminster and elsewhere, have pursued a consistent line on the size of Government departments. I find it less easy to take that argument from the Labour Party, given that the current chancellor—soon to be Prime Minister—has, effectively, run every department of Government during the past 10 years. Nonetheless, if the Chancellor of the Exchequer has a brain the size of Mars—that is according to John McDonnell, the Labour leadership candidate—John Swinney certainly has a work rate the size of Jupiter. I am certain that he will be available to maintain those particular areas and responsibilities.

I am delighted that Jack McConnell's speech was developed in such a constructive fashion. I am desperately sorry that, over the past 24 hours, I have not been sufficiently in contact with him about the development of the size and structure of the consensual Government that we propose to have.

The central point is the fact that, until today, we have had nine Government departments, 27 executive agencies and 152 quangos. My belief is that that was too many Government departments, too many executive agencies and too many quangos for a country of 5 million people. Furthermore, I am not certain that many people across Scotland, apart from all those to whom the previous First Minister had to give jobs, believed that we needed that level or complexity of Government.

Many small, independent European nations are successful. In fact, the growth rate of such countries far exceeds that of their larger neighbours. Two arguments have been voiced as to why that should be the case. The first argument is the social cohesion that small nations often have. I believe that Scotland has that social cohesion. The second argument is the smartness and efficiency of Government and rapid decision making. My belief is that Scotland does not have

that rapid decision making at present. We should aspire to have it. If we are to have joined-up government, the first characteristic should be less bits to join up. It seems rather important that we develop an efficient governmental structure in Scotland.

As far as the committees of the Parliament are concerned, that is a matter for the Parliament. My feeling is that the Parliament, across the parties, will want to take into account the structure of Government. That seems sensible, because one of the roles of committees is to hold the ministerial team and the Government to account, but, of course, these are matters for the whole Parliament. The matter for the motion and the Government is to bring forward a coherent ministerial structure. That we have done, and I think it is rather better, since Scotland needs a Government, to proceed on that basis. No doubt we will listen with great interest to the points that are developed so constructively on Labour's side of the chamber.

**Margo MacDonald:** Will the First Minister give way?

**Alex Salmond:** Finally, to Margo MacDonald—

**Margo MacDonald:** Ah! Thank you.

**Alex Salmond:** Obviously, this Administration will seek to be fair to all parts of Scotland. We will develop that policy as we may, of course. The Parliament may wish to disagree with some of the measures that the Government proposes, but I hope that the Parliament will accept that the departmental structure that we propose, the ministerial team that I seek to appoint and the proposals that we make are in the best interests of all parts of Scotland.

With that in mind, I have pleasure in moving,

That the Parliament agrees that Bruce Crawford, Linda Fabiani, Jim Mather, Stewart Stevenson, Maureen Watt, Adam Ingram, Shona Robison, Stewart Maxwell, Fergus Ewing and Michael Russell be appointed as junior Scottish Ministers.

**The Presiding Officer:** I understand that the Conservative and Liberal Democrat parties wish to withdraw their amendments. Is that the case?

**Murdo Fraser** *indicated agreement.*

**Tavish Scott** *indicated agreement.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Does any member object to those amendments being withdrawn?

**Margo MacDonald:** I do.

**The Presiding Officer:** Which amendment do you wish to support?

**Margo MacDonald:** The nice one from Tavish Scott.

*Amendment S3M-26.2, by agreement, withdrawn.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment S3M-26.1, in the name of Tavish Scott, which seeks to amend motion S3M-26, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of Scottish ministers, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

MacDonald, Margo (Lothians) (Ind)

**AGAINST**

Adam, Brian (Aberdeen North) (SNP)  
 Ahmad, Bashir (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Western Isles) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Ochil) (SNP)  
 Campbell, Aileen (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Livingston) (SNP)  
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perth) (SNP)  
 Don, Nigel (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP)  
 Fabiani, Linda (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Rob (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harper, Robin (Lothians) (Green)  
 Harvie, Christopher (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Ingram, Mr Adam (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacAskill, Kenny (Edinburgh East and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Marwick, Tricia (Central Fife) (SNP)  
 Mather, Jim (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 Maxwell, Stewart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ian (Lothians) (SNP)  
 McKelvie, Christina (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Morgan, Alasdair (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Neil, Alex (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Paterson, Gil (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee East) (SNP)  
 Russell, Michael (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Salmond, Alex (Gordon) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banff and Buchan) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Govan) (SNP)  
 Swinney, John (North Tayside) (SNP)  
 Thompson, Dave (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Tymkewycz, Stefan (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Watt, Maureen (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Welsh, Andrew (Angus) (SNP)  
 White, Sandra (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Wilson, Bill (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Wilson, John (Central Scotland) (SNP)

**ABSTENTIONS**

Aitken, Bill (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Alexander, Ms Wendy (Paisley North) (Lab)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Baker, Richard (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Edinburgh Central) (Lab)  
 Brankin, Rhona (Midlothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Gavin (Lothians) (Con)  
 Brown, Robert (Glasgow) (LD)  
 Brownlee, Derek (South of Scotland) (Con)  
 Butler, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Chisholm, Malcolm (Edinburgh North and Leith) (Lab)  
 Craigie, Cathie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)  
 Curran, Margaret (Glasgow Baillieston) (Lab)  
 Ferguson, Patricia (Glasgow Maryhill) (Lab)  
 Finnie, Ross (West of Scotland) (LD)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gillon, Karen (Clydesdale) (Lab)  
 Glen, Marilyn (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Godman, Trish (West Renfrewshire) (Lab)  
 Goldie, Annabel (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Gordon, Charlie (Glasgow Cathcart) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)  
 Henry, Hugh (Paisley South) (Lab)  
 Hume, Jim (South of Scotland) (LD)  
 Jamieson, Cathy (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (Lab)  
 Johnstone, Alex (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kelly, James (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Andy (East Kilbride) (Lab)  
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab)  
 Lamont, John (Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Livingstone, Marilyn (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)  
 Macdonald, Lewis (Aberdeen Central) (Lab)  
 Macintosh, Ken (Eastwood) (Lab)  
 Martin, Paul (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab)  
 McAveety, Mr Frank (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab)  
 McCabe, Tom (Hamilton South) (Lab)  
 McConnell, Jack (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab)  
 McGrigor, Mr Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 McInnes, Alison (North East Scotland) (LD)  
 McLetchie, David (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Con)  
 McMahon, Michael (Hamilton North and Bellshill) (Lab)  
 McNeil, Duncan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab)  
 McNulty, Des (Clydebank and Milngavie) (Lab)  
 Milne, Nanette (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Mulligan, Mary (Linlithgow) (Lab)  
 Munro, John Farquhar (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)  
 Murray, Elaine (Dumfries) (Lab)  
 O'Donnell, Hugh (Central Scotland) (LD)  
 Oldfather, Irene (Cunninghame South) (Lab)  
 Park, John (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Peacock, Peter (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Peattie, Cathy (Falkirk East) (Lab)  
 Pringle, Mike (Edinburgh South) (LD)  
 Purvis, Jeremy (Tweeddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale) (LD)  
 Rumbles, Mike (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)  
 Scanlon, Mary (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Scott, John (Ayr) (Con)  
 Scott, Tavish (Shetland) (LD)  
 Simpson, Dr Richard (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elaine (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elizabeth (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smith, Iain (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Stephen, Nicol (Aberdeen South) (LD)  
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Stone, Mr Jamie (Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross) (LD)  
 Tolson, Jim (Dunfermline West) (LD)  
 Whitefield, Karen (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab)

Whitton, David (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 1, Against 49, Abstentions 73.

*Amendment disagreed to.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The next question is, that motion S3M-26, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of Scottish ministers, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, Brian (Aberdeen North) (SNP)  
 Ahmad, Bashir (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Western Isles) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Ochil) (SNP)  
 Campbell, Aileen (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Livingston) (SNP)  
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perth) (SNP)  
 Don, Nigel (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP)  
 Fabiani, Linda (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Rob (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harper, Robin (Lothians) (Green)  
 Harvie, Christopher (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Ingram, Mr Adam (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacAskill, Kenny (Edinburgh East and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Marwick, Tricia (Central Fife) (SNP)  
 Mather, Jim (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 Maxwell, Stewart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ian (Lothians) (SNP)  
 McKelvie, Christina (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Morgan, Alasdair (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Neil, Alex (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Paterson, Gil (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee East) (SNP)  
 Russell, Michael (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Salmond, Alex (Gordon) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banff and Buchan) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Govan) (SNP)  
 Swinney, John (North Tayside) (SNP)  
 Thompson, Dave (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Tymkewycz, Stefan (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Watt, Maureen (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Welsh, Andrew (Angus) (SNP)  
 White, Sandra (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Wilson, Bill (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Wilson, John (Central Scotland) (SNP)

**ABSTENTIONS**

Aitken, Bill (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Alexander, Ms Wendy (Paisley North) (Lab)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Baker, Richard (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Boyack, Sarah (Edinburgh Central) (Lab)  
 Brankin, Rhona (Midlothian) (Lab)  
 Brocklebank, Ted (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Brown, Gavin (Lothians) (Con)  
 Brown, Robert (Glasgow) (LD)  
 Brownlee, Derek (South of Scotland) (Con)  
 Butler, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Chisholm, Malcolm (Edinburgh North and Leith) (Lab)  
 Craigie, Cathie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)  
 Curran, Margaret (Glasgow Baillieston) (Lab)  
 Ferguson, Patricia (Glasgow Maryhill) (Lab)  
 Finnie, Ross (West of Scotland) (LD)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gillon, Karen (Clydesdale) (Lab)  
 Glen, Marilyn (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Godman, Trish (West Renfrewshire) (Lab)  
 Goldie, Annabel (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Gordon, Charlie (Glasgow Cathcart) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)  
 Henry, Hugh (Paisley South) (Lab)  
 Hume, Jim (South of Scotland) (LD)  
 Jamieson, Cathy (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (Lab)  
 Johnstone, Alex (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kelly, James (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Andy (East Kilbride) (Lab)  
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab)  
 Lamont, John (Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Livingstone, Marilyn (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)  
 Macdonald, Lewis (Aberdeen Central) (Lab)  
 MacDonald, Margo (Lothians) (Ind)  
 Macintosh, Ken (Eastwood) (Lab)  
 Martin, Paul (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab)  
 McAveety, Mr Frank (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab)  
 McCabe, Tom (Hamilton South) (Lab)  
 McConnell, Jack (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab)  
 McGrigor, Mr Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 McInnes, Alison (North East Scotland) (LD)  
 McLetchie, David (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Con)  
 McMahon, Michael (Hamilton North and Bellshill) (Lab)  
 McNeil, Duncan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab)  
 McNulty, Des (Clydebank and Milngavie) (Lab)  
 Milne, Nanette (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Mulligan, Mary (Linlithgow) (Lab)  
 Munro, John Farquhar (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)  
 Murray, Elaine (Dumfries) (Lab)  
 O'Donnell, Hugh (Central Scotland) (LD)  
 Oldfather, Irene (Cunninghame South) (Lab)  
 Park, John (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Peacock, Peter (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Peattie, Cathy (Falkirk East) (Lab)  
 Pringle, Mike (Edinburgh South) (LD)  
 Purvis, Jeremy (Tweeddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale) (LD)  
 Rumbles, Mike (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)  
 Scanlon, Mary (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Scott, John (Ayr) (Con)  
 Scott, Tavish (Shetland) (LD)  
 Simpson, Dr Richard (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elaine (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elizabeth (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smith, Iain (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Stephen, Nicol (Aberdeen South) (LD)  
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Stone, Mr Jamie (Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross) (LD)  
 Tolson, Jim (Dunfermline West) (LD)  
 Whitefield, Karen (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab)

Whitton, David (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 49, Against 0, Abstentions 75.

*Motion agreed to.*

That the Parliament agrees that Nicola Sturgeon, John Swinney, Kenny MacAskill, Fiona Hyslop and Richard Lochhead be appointed as Ministers.

**The Presiding Officer:** The next question is, that motion S3M-27, in the name of the First Minister, on the appointment of junior Scottish ministers, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**FOR**

Adam, Brian (Aberdeen North) (SNP)  
 Ahmad, Bashir (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Western Isles) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Ochil) (SNP)  
 Campbell, Aileen (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Livingston) (SNP)  
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perth) (SNP)  
 Don, Nigel (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP)  
 Fabiani, Linda (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Rob (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harper, Robin (Lothians) (Green)  
 Harvie, Christopher (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Ingram, Mr Adam (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacAskill, Kenny (Edinburgh East and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Marwick, Tricia (Central Fife) (SNP)  
 Mather, Jim (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 Maxwell, Stewart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ian (Lothians) (SNP)  
 McKelvie, Christina (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Morgan, Alasdair (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Neil, Alex (Central Scotland) (SNP)  
 Paterson, Gil (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee East) (SNP)  
 Russell, Michael (South of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Salmond, Alex (Gordon) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banff and Buchan) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Govan) (SNP)  
 Swinney, John (North Tayside) (SNP)  
 Thompson, Dave (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Tymkewycz, Stefan (Lothians) (SNP)  
 Watt, Maureen (North East Scotland) (SNP)  
 Welsh, Andrew (Angus) (SNP)  
 White, Sandra (Glasgow) (SNP)  
 Wilson, Bill (West of Scotland) (SNP)  
 Wilson, John (Central Scotland) (SNP)

**ABSTENTIONS**

Aitken, Bill (Glasgow) (Con)

Alexander, Ms Wendy (Paisley North) (Lab)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Baker, Richard (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Edinburgh Central) (Lab)  
 Brankin, Rhona (Midlothian) (Lab)  
 Brocklebank, Ted (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Brown, Gavin (Lothians) (Con)  
 Brown, Robert (Glasgow) (LD)  
 Brownlee, Derek (South of Scotland) (Con)  
 Butler, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Chisholm, Malcolm (Edinburgh North and Leith) (Lab)  
 Craigie, Cathie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)  
 Curran, Margaret (Glasgow Baillieston) (Lab)  
 Ferguson, Patricia (Glasgow Maryhill) (Lab)  
 Finnie, Ross (West of Scotland) (LD)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gillon, Karen (Clydesdale) (Lab)  
 Glen, Marlyn (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Godman, Trish (West Renfrewshire) (Lab)  
 Goldie, Annabel (West of Scotland) (Con)  
 Gordon, Charlie (Glasgow Cathcart) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)  
 Henry, Hugh (Paisley South) (Lab)  
 Hume, Jim (South of Scotland) (LD)  
 Jamieson, Cathy (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (Lab)  
 Johnstone, Alex (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kelly, James (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Andy (East Kilbride) (Lab)  
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab)  
 Lamont, John (Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Livingstone, Marilyn (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)  
 Macdonald, Lewis (Aberdeen Central) (Lab)  
 MacDonald, Margo (Lothians) (Ind)  
 Macintosh, Ken (Eastwood) (Lab)  
 Martin, Paul (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab)  
 McAveety, Mr Frank (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab)  
 McCabe, Tom (Hamilton South) (Lab)  
 McConnell, Jack (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab)  
 McGrigor, Mr Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 McInnes, Alison (North East Scotland) (LD)  
 McLetchie, David (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Con)  
 McMahon, Michael (Hamilton North and Bellshill) (Lab)  
 McNeil, Duncan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab)  
 McNulty, Des (Clydebank and Milngavie) (Lab)  
 Milne, Nanette (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Mulligan, Mary (Linlithgow) (Lab)  
 Munro, John Farquhar (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)  
 Murray, Elaine (Dumfries) (Lab)  
 O'Donnell, Hugh (Central Scotland) (LD)  
 Oldfather, Irene (Cunninghame South) (Lab)  
 Park, John (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Peacock, Peter (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Peattie, Cathy (Falkirk East) (Lab)  
 Pringle, Mike (Edinburgh South) (LD)  
 Purvis, Jeremy (Tweeddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale) (LD)  
 Rumbles, Mike (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)  
 Scanlon, Mary (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Scott, John (Ayr) (Con)  
 Scott, Tavish (Shetland) (LD)  
 Simpson, Dr Richard (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elaine (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab)  
 Smith, Elizabeth (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smith, Iain (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Stephen, Nicol (Aberdeen South) (LD)  
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Stone, Mr Jamie (Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross) (LD)  
 Tolson, Jim (Dunfermline West) (LD)  
 Whitefield, Karen (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab)  
 Whitton, David (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 49, Against 0, Abstentions 75.

*Motion agreed to.*

That the Parliament agrees that Bruce Crawford, Linda Fabiani, Jim Mather, Stewart Stevenson, Maureen Watt, Adam Ingram, Shona Robison, Stewart Maxwell, Fergus Ewing and Michael Russell be appointed as junior Scottish Ministers.

**The Presiding Officer:** As the Parliament has agreed to the First Minister's recommendations, he may now invite Her Majesty to approve the appointment of Bruce Crawford, Linda Fabiani, Jim Mather, Stewart Stevenson, Maureen Watt, Adam Ingram, Shona Robison, Stewart Maxwell, Fergus Ewing and Michael Russell as junior ministers.

*Meeting closed at 11:52.*



Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

**Thursday 24 May 2007**

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

##### OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

*Single copies: £5.00*

*Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00*

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

##### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

*Single copies: £3.75*

*Annual subscriptions: £150.00*

Standing orders will be accepted at Document Supply.

Published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and available from:

#### **Blackwell's Bookshop**

**53 South Bridge  
Edinburgh EH1 1YS  
0131 622 8222**

**Blackwell's Bookshops:**  
243-244 High Holborn  
London WC1 7DZ  
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

**Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation**  
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

**Telephone orders and inquiries**  
**0131 622 8283 or**  
**0131 622 8258**

**Fax orders**  
**0131 557 8149**

**E-mail orders**  
**business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk**

**Subscriptions & Standing Orders**  
**business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk**

#### **Scottish Parliament**

**RNID Typetalk calls welcome on**  
**18001 0131 348 5000**  
**Textphone 0845 270 0152**

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

**Accredited Agents**  
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers