MEETING OF THE PARLIAMENT

Wednesday 9 May 2007

Session 3

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2007. Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division, Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body. Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by RR Donnelley.

CONTENTS

Wednesday 9 May 2007

Debates

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS

	Col.
OATHS AND AFFIRMATIONS	1
RULE 8.16 (SUSPENSION)	8
Motions moved—[Alasdair Morgan]—and agreed to.	

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS

(Returned at the election on 3 May 2007)

- Adam, Brian James (Aberdeen North) (SNP)
 Ahmad, Bashir (Glasgow) (SNP)
 Aitken, William Mackie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Alexander, Wendy (Paisley North) (Lab)
 Allan, Alasdair James (Western Isles) (SNP)
- B Baillie, Jacqueline Marie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire Josephine (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Baker, Richard James (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah Herriot (Edinburgh Central) (Lab)
 Brankin, Rhona Margaret (Midlothian) (Lab)
 Brocklebank, Edward (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Brown, Gavin (Lothians) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Ochil) (SNP)
 Brown, Robert Edward (Glasgow) (LD)
 Brownlee, Derek Scott (South of Scotland) (Con)
 Butler, William Gerard (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)
- C Campbell, Aileen Elizabeth (South of Scotland) (SNP)
 Carlaw, David Jackson (West of Scotland) (Con)
 Chisholm, Malcolm George Richardson (Edinburgh
 North and Leith) (Lab)
 Coffey, William Lynch (Kilmarnock and Loudon) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Livingston) (SNP)
 Craigie, Catherine (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)
 Crawford, Robert Hardie Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perth) (SNP)
 Curran, Margaret Patricia (Glasgow Baillieston) (Lab)
- D Don, Nigel Anderson (North East Scotland) (SNP) Doris, Robert Joseph (Glasgow) (SNP)
- E Eadie, Helen Stirling (Dunfermline East) (Lab) Ewing, Fergus Stewart (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP)
- F Fabiani, Linda (Central Scotland) (SNP)
 Ferguson, Patricia Josephine (Glasgow Maryhill) (Lab)
 Fergusson, Alexander Charles Onslow (Galloway and
 Upper Nithsdale) (Con)
 Finnie, James Ross (West of Scotland) (LD)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee West) (SNP)
 Foulkes, George (Lothians) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
- Gibson, Kenneth James (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gibson, Robert McKay (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Gillon, Karen Macdonald (Clydesdale) (Lab)
 Glen, Marlyn Laing (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Godman, Patricia (West Renfrewshire) (Lab)
 Goldie, Annabel MacNicoll (West of Scotland) (Con)
 Gordon, Charles (Glasgow Cathcart) (Lab)
 Grahame, Christine (South of Scotland) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain Cumming (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Lab)
- H Harper, Robin Charles Moreton (Lothians) (Green)
 Harvie, Christopher (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Henry, Hugh (Paisley South) (Lab)
 Hepburn, James Douglas (Central Scotland) (SNP)
 Hume, Jim (South of Scotland) (LD)
 Hyslop, Fiona Jane (Lothians) (SNP)

- Ingram, Adam Hamilton (South of Scotland) (SNP)
- J Jamieson, Catherine Mary (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (Lab) Johnstone, Alexander (North East Scotland) (Con)
- K Kelly, James (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab) Kerr, Andrew Palmer (East Kilbride) (Lab) Kidd, William Hill (Glasgow) (SNP)
- L Lamont, Johann MacDougall (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab) Lamont, John (Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con) Livingstone, Marilyn Margaret (Kirkcaldy) (Lab) Lochhead, Richard Neilson (North East Scotland) (SNP)
- M MacAskill, Kenneth Wright (Edinburgh East) (SNP) MacDonald, Margo (Lothians) (Ind) Macdonald, Roderick Lewis (Aberdeen Central) (Lab) Macintosh, Kenneth Donald (Eastwood) (Lab) Martin, Paul (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab) Marwick, Tricia (Central Fife) (SNP) Mather, James Stuart (Argyll and Bute) (SNP) Matheson, Michael Stephen (Falkirk West) (SNP) Maxwell, William Stewart (West of Scotland) (SNP) McArthur, Liam (Orkney) (LD) McAveety, Francis (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab) McCabe, Thomas (Hamilton South) (Lab) McConnell, Jack Wilson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab) McGrigor, James Angus Roderick Neil (Highlands and Islands) (Con) McInnes, Alison (North East Scotland) (LD) McKee, Ian Hume (Lothians) (SNP) McKelvie, Christina (Central Scotland) (SNP) McLetchie, David William (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Con) McMahon, Michael Joseph (Hamilton North and Bellshill) (Lab) McMillan, Stuart (West of Scotland) (SNP) McNeil, Duncan (Greenock and Invercivde) (Lab) McNeill, Pauline Mary (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab) McNulty, Desmond (Clydebank and Milngavie) (Lab) Milne, Nanette Lilian Margaret (North East Scotland) (Con) Mitchell, Janet Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con) Morgan, Alasdair Neil (South of Scotland) (SNP) Mulligan, Margaret Mary (Linlithgow) (Lab) Munro, John Farguhar (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD) Murray, Elaine Kildare (Dumfries) (Lab)
- Neil, Alexander (Central Scotland) (SNP)
- O'Donnell, Hugh (Central Scotland) (LD)
 Oldfather, Irene (Cunninghame South) (Lab)
- Park, John William (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Paterson, Gil Martin (West of Scotland) (SNP)
 Peacock, Peter James (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Peattie, Catherine Campbell (Falkirk East) (Lab)
 Pringle, Michael Stanley Robert (Edinburgh South)
 (LD)
 Purvis, Jeremy (Tweeddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale)
 (LD)

- R Robison, Shona (North East Scotland) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Michael John (West Aberdeenshire and
 Kincardine) (LD)
 Russell, Michael William (South of Scotland) (SNP)
- Salmond, Alexander Elliot Anderson (Gordon) (SNP)
 Scanlon, Mary Elizabeth (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Scott, Tavish Hamilton (Shetland) (LD)
 Scott, William John Graham (Ayr) (Con)
 Simpson, Richard John (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine Agnes (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab)
 Smith, Elizabeth Jane (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smith, Iain William (North East Fife) (LD)
 Smith, Margaret Joy (Edinburgh West) (LD)
 Stephen, Nicol Ross (Aberdeen South) (LD)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banff and Buchan) (SNP)
 Stewart, David John (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stone, Jamie Hume (Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross) (LD)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Govan) (SNP)
 Swinney, John Ramsay (North Tayside) (SNP)

T Thompson, David George (Highlands and Islands) (SNP) Tolson, James (Dunfermline West) (LD) Tymkewycz, Stefan (Lothians) (SNP)

W Watt, Maureen Elizabeth (North East Scotland) (SNP)
Welsh, Andrew Paton (Angus) (SNP)
White, Sandra (Glasgow) (SNP)
Whitefield, Karen (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab)
Whitton, David (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)
Wilson, Bill (West of Scotland) (SNP)
Wilson, John Gordon (Central Scotland) (SNP)

Abbreviations

Con Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party

Green Scottish Green Party Ind Independent Lab Scottish Labour

LD Scottish Liberal Democrats SNP Scottish National Party

Scottish Parliament

Wednesday 9 May 2007

[THE PRESIDING OFFICER opened the meeting at 09:30]

Oaths and Affirmations

The Presiding Officer (Mr George Reid): The third session of the Scottish Parliament is now convened. I warmly welcome all new and returning members.

We proceed directly to members' oaths and affirmations. I will call each member in turn. When a member is called, they should proceed to the well of the chamber to take the oath or make an affirmation.

Alex Salmond (Gordon) (SNP): The Scottish National Party's primary loyalty is with the people of Scotland, in line with the Scottish constitutional tradition of the sovereignty of the people.

The following member took the oath:

Alex Salmond (Gordon) (SNP)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Mr Jack McConnell (Motherwell and Wishaw) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Annabel Goldie (West of Scotland) (Con) Nicol Stephen (Aberdeen South) (LD)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Robin Harper (Lothians) (Green)

The following member made a solemn affirmation and repeated it in Doric:

Brian Adam (Aberdeen North) (SNP)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Urdu:

Bashir Ahmad (Glasgow) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Bill Aitken (Glasgow) (Con)

Ms Wendy Alexander (Paisley North) (Lab)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Gaelic:

Alasdair Allan (Western Isles) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Claire Baker (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

The following member took the oath:

Richard Baker (North East Scotland) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Sarah Boyack (Edinburgh Central) (Lab) Rhona Brankin (Midlothian) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Ted Brocklebank (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con) Gavin Brown (Lothians) (Con)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Keith Brown (Ochil) (SNP) Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD)

The following member took the oath:

Derek Brownlee (South of Scotland) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Bill Butler (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Aileen Campbell (South of Scotland) (SNP) Jackson Carlaw (West of Scotland) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Malcolm Chisholm (Edinburgh North and Leith) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Angela Constance (Livingston) (SNP)
Cathie Craigie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Bruce Crawford (Stirling) (SNP)

Roseanna Cunningham (Perth) (SNP): Under protest.

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Roseanna Cunningham (Perth) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Margaret Curran (Glasgow Baillieston) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Nigel Don (North East Scotland) (SNP) Bob Doris (SNP) (Glasgow)

The following members took the oath:

Helen Eadie (Dunfermline East) (Lab) Fergus Ewing (Inverness East, Nairn and Lochaber) (SNP) The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Linda Fabiani (Central Scotland) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Patricia Ferguson (Glasgow Maryhill) (Lab) Alex Fergusson (Galloway and Upper Nithsdale) (Con) Ross Finnie (West of Scotland) (LD)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Joe FitzPatrick (Dundee West) (SNP) George Foulkes (Lothians) (Lab)

The following member took the oath:

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP)

The following member made a solemn affirmation and repeated it in Gaelic:

Rob Gibson (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

10:08

Meeting suspended.

10:30

On resuming—

The Presiding Officer: We now resume the oaths and affirmations ceremony.

The following member took the oath:

Karen Gillon (Clydesdale) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Marlyn Glen (North East Scotland) (Lab)

The following member took the oath:

Trish Godman (West Renfrewshire) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Charlie Gordon (Glasgow Cathcart) (Lab) Christine Grahame (South of Scotland) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab) lain Gray (East Lothian) (Lab) Christopher Harvie (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green)

The following member took the oath:

Hugh Henry (Paisley South) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Jamie Hepburn (Central Scotland) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Jim Hume (South of Scotland) (LD)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Fiona Hyslop (Lothians) (SNP)
Mr Adam Ingram (South of Scotland) (SNP)
Cathy Jamieson (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Alex Johnstone (North East Scotland) (Con) James Kelly (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab) Andy Kerr (East Kilbride) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Bill Kidd (Glasgow) (SNP)
Johann Lamont (Glasgow Pollok) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

John Lamont (Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con) Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Richard Lochhead (Moray) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Liam McArthur (LD) (Orkney)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Kenny MacAskill (Edinburgh East and Musselburgh) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Mr Frank McAveety (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab) Tom McCabe (Hamilton South) (Lab) Lewis Macdonald (Aberdeen Central) (Lab) Margo MacDonald (Lothians) (Ind) Mr Jamie McGrigor (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Alison McInnes (North East Scotland) (LD)

The following member took the oath:

Ken Macintosh (Eastwood) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Ian McKee (Lothians) (SNP)
Christina McKelvie (Central Scotland) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

David McLetchie (Edinburgh Pentlands) (Con)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Michael McMahon (Hamilton North and Bellshill) (Lab) Stuart McMillan (West of Scotland) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Mr Duncan McNeil (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab) Pauline McNeill (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab) Des McNulty (Clydebank and Milngavie) (Lab) Paul Martin (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Tricia Marwick (Central Fife) (SNP) Jim Mather (Argyll and Bute) (SNP) Willie Coffey (Kilmarnock and Loudoun) (SNP)

11:05

Meeting suspended.

11:30

On resuming—

The Presiding Officer: We now resume the oaths and affirmations ceremony.

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Michael Matheson (Falkirk West) (SNP) Stewart Maxwell (West of Scotland) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con) Margaret Mitchell (Central Scotland) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Alasdair Morgan (South of Scotland) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Mary Mulligan (Linlithgow) (Lab)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Gaelic:

John Farquhar Munro (Ross, Skye and Inverness West) (LD)

The following members took the oath:

Elaine Murray (Dumfries) (Lab) Alex Neil (Central Scotland) (SNP)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Hugh O'Donnell (Central Scotland) (LD)

The following member took the oath:

Irene Oldfather (Cunninghame South) (Lab)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

John Park (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

The following members took the oath:

Gil Paterson (West of Scotland) (SNP) Peter Peacock (Highlands and Islands) (Lab) The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Cathy Peattie (Falkirk East) (Lab)

The following member took the oath:

Mike Pringle (Edinburgh South) (LD)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Jeremy Purvis (Tweeddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale) (LD) Shona Robison (Dundee East) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Gaelic and Scots:

Michael Russell (South of Scotland) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Mary Scanlon (Highlands and Islands) (Con) John Scott (Ayr) (Con) Tavish Scott (Shetland) (LD) Dr Richard Simpson (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Elaine Smith (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab): Before taking the oath, I state that I believe that the people of Scotland should be citizens, not subjects, and hold firmly that my allegiance should be first and foremost to them. However, I recognise that to serve my constituents in the Parliament I must meet the legal requirement of taking the oath and will, therefore, do so.

The following members took the oath:

Elaine Smith (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Lab) Elizabeth Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Iain Smith (North East Fife) (LD)

The following members took the oath:

Margaret Smith (Edinburgh West) (LD) Stewart Stevenson (Banff and Buchan) (SNP) David Stewart (Highlands and Islands) (Lab) Mr Jamie Stone (Caithness, Sutherland and Easter Ross) (LD)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Nicola Sturgeon (Glasgow Govan) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

John Swinney (North Tayside) (SNP)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Doric and Gaelic:

Dave Thompson (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

The following member took the oath:

Jim Tolson (Dunfermline West) (LD)

The following member made a solemn affirmation:

Stefan Tymkewycz (Lothians) (SNP)

The following member took the oath and repeated it in Doric:

Maureen Watt (North East Scotland) (SNP)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Andrew Welsh (Angus) (SNP) Ms Sandra White (Glasgow) (SNP)

The following members took the oath:

Karen Whitefield (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab) David Whitton (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Lab)

The following members made a solemn affirmation:

Bill Wilson (West of Scotland) (SNP) John Wilson (Central Scotland) (SNP)

Rule 8.16 (Suspension)

12:06

The Presiding Officer (Mr George Reid): I am now minded to take a motion without notice, that motion S3M-1, a copy of which has been placed on members' desks and which is supported by all parties in the chamber, be taken at this meeting of Parliament.

Motion moved,

That motion S3M-1 be taken at this meeting of the Parliament.—[Alasdair Morgan.]

The Presiding Officer: This is a two-step process. The first question is, that the motion without notice be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Motion agreed to.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that, for the purposes of electing a Presiding Officer and two Deputy Presiding Officers, the third sentence of Rule 8.16 of Standing Orders be suspended and that under Rule 8.16 thus varied, this meeting of the Parliament be adjourned until 3.00 pm on Monday 14 May 2007.—[Alasdair Morgan.]

The Presiding Officer: The second question is, that motion S3M-1, on suspension of standing orders, to allow this meeting of Parliament to be adjourned, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Motion agreed to.

12:07

Meeting adjourned until 15:00 on 14 May 2007.

As directed by rule 1.2.5 of the standing orders of the Scottish Parliament, the text of the oath of allegiance, in accordance with section 2 of the Promissory Oaths Act 1868, is as follows:

I, [name of Member], do swear that I will be faithful and bear true Allegiance to Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth, Her heirs and successors, according to Law, so help me God.

The text of the solemn affirmation, in accordance with section 6(1) of the Oaths Act 1978, is as follows:

I, [name of Member], do solemnly, sincerely and truly declare and affirm, that I will be faithful and bear true allegiance to Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth, Her heirs and successors, according to Law.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Wednesday 16 May 2007

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

Single copies: £5.00

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the Official Report of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at Document Supply.

Published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and available from:

Blackwell's Bookshop

53 South Bridge Edinburgh EH1 1YS 0131 622 8222

Blackwell's Bookshops: 243-244 High Holborn London WC1 7DZ Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries 0131 622 8283 or 0131 622 8258

Fax orders 0131 557 8149

E-mail orders business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Subscriptions & Standing Orders business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Scottish Parliament

RNID Typetalk calls welcome on 18001 0131 348 5000 Textphone 0845 270 0152

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

Accredited Agents (see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers

Printed in Scotland by RR Donnelley