

WAVERLEY RAILWAY (SCOTLAND) BILL COMMITTEE

Thursday 20 May 2004
(*Afternoon*)

Session 2

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2004.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division,
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by The
Stationery Office Ltd.

Her Majesty's Stationery Office is independent of and separate from the company now
trading as The Stationery Office Ltd, which is responsible for printing and publishing
Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body publications.

CONTENTS

Thursday 20 May 2004

	Col.
ACCOMPANYING DOCUMENTS (CONSIDERATION).....	19

WAVERLEY RAILWAY (SCOTLAND) BILL COMMITTEE 4th Meeting 2004, Session 2

CONVENER

*Tricia Marwick (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)

DEPUTY CONVENER

*Christine May (Central Fife) (Lab)

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

*Mr Ted Brocklebank (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gordon Jackson (Glasgow Govan) (Lab)

*Margaret Smith (Edinburgh West) (LD)

*attended

CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Callum Thomson

SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Fergus Cochrane

LOCATION

Committee Room 2

Scottish Parliament

Waverley Railway (Scotland) Bill Committee

Thursday 20 May 2004

(Afternoon)

[THE CONVENER opened the meeting at 12:45]

Accompanying Documents (Consideration)

The Convener (Tricia Marwick): I welcome members to the meeting and remind them to switch off their mobile phones and pagers. We have received no apologies.

I invite members to consider paper WAV/S2/04/4/1 and annex A to it, which the committee's adviser has prepared, and to make general comments. The paper is the result of a verbal briefing that the adviser gave the committee last week and raises a number of points about how we might handle the accompanying documents, on which I would like comments from members.

Christine May (Central Fife) (Lab): The key question is whether there was, in the documentation that we received last week, sufficient evidence for us to scrutinise properly the Waverley Railway (Scotland) Bill in order to take a decision on it. It is clear from what the adviser told us that elements of the environmental statement require clarification. Therefore, it seems that it would be reasonable to give the promoter time to improve the information in the environmental statement. That will allow us thereafter to begin the proper scrutiny that we are obliged to carry out.

Mr Ted Brocklebank (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I agree with Christine May. The adviser drew to our attention a number of matters, particularly in relation to the proposed project's impact on the environment, which are listed in annex A to paper WAV/S2/04/4/1. Appendix A of annex A refers to: "Noise and Vibration"; "Traffic and Transport"; "Ecology and Nature Conservation"; "Listed Buildings and Structures"; and the "Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment". We need much more information about those matters, so I fully support Christine May's view.

Margaret Smith (Edinburgh West) (LD): I agree with colleagues' points. It is unfortunate that there will be some delay in our getting the

information, but we will be delayed until we get the business case, anyway. There is a question about the extent to which we will have a clearer picture about the extra cost that might be involved in the mitigation measures and environmental works. Is that part of what we are asking the promoters to come back with?

The Convener: No.

Margaret Smith: Would it form part of the business case generally?

The Convener: Yes—that would have to form part of the business case. If the costs are not covered in the environmental statement, the business case will have to be updated at some point to take account of that.

Margaret Smith: The promoter will be aware that we are trying to ensure that the business case covers in its costings all the issues on which we want further information.

The Convener: Yes. As members know, the committee must satisfy itself that the accompanying documents conform to rule 9A.2.3; it is the unanimous view of the committee that we are not satisfied that we have sufficient information to allow us further to scrutinise the bill.

I invite the committee to consider the specific issues in the paper. Do we agree to request that the promoter submit a supplementary memorandum on the environmental statement in response to the issues that are raised in annex A to paper WAV/S2/04/4/1, in accordance with the deadline indicated in paragraph 4 of the paper?

Members indicated agreement.

The Convener: Do we agree to notify the Scottish Environment Protection Agency, Scottish Natural Heritage and Historic Scotland of the request that has been made of the promoter to provide a supplementary memorandum on the environmental statement and, subsequently, to give them the opportunity to submit written evidence on the environmental statement and the supplementary memorandum, in accordance with the deadline indicated in paragraph 4 of the paper?

Members indicated agreement.

Christine May: In agreeing to that, are we also agreeing that any other objectors who have a legitimate interest will be given that opportunity?

The Convener: That is a fair question. We need also to decide whether to give objectors the opportunity to submit written evidence on other accompanying documents, in particular the promoter's memorandum, the promoter's statement, the book of reference, the maps, and the plans and sections, in accordance with the

deadline indicated in paragraph 5 of the paper.
Does the committee agree to that?

Members *indicated agreement.*

The Convener: Finally, does the committee agree to invite the promoter to submit comments in relation to that written evidence in accordance with the deadline indicated in paragraph 5 of the paper?

Members *indicated agreement.*

The Convener: Thank you. I am sure that the clerks will draft the letters that need to be sent as quickly as possible to meet the deadlines.

Meeting closed at 12:50.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, 375 High Street, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Friday 28 May 2004

Members who want reprints of their speeches (within one month of the date of publication) may obtain request forms and further details from the Central Distribution Office, the Document Supply Centre or the Official Report.

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

DAILY EDITIONS

Single copies: £5

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, compiled by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre, contains details of past and forthcoming business and of the work of committees and gives general information on legislation and other parliamentary activity.

Single copies: £3.75

Special issue price: £5

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at the Document Supply Centre.

Published in Edinburgh by The Stationery Office Limited and available from:

The Stationery Office Bookshop
71 Lothian Road
Edinburgh EH3 9AZ
0870 606 5566 Fax 0870 606 5588

The Stationery Office Bookshops at:
123 Kingsway, London WC2B 6PQ
Tel 020 7242 6393 Fax 020 7242 6394
68-69 Bull Street, Birmingham B4 6AD
Tel 0121 236 9696 Fax 0121 236 9699
33 Wine Street, Bristol BS1 2BQ
Tel 01179 264306 Fax 01179 294515
9-21 Princess Street, Manchester M60 8AS
Tel 0161 834 7201 Fax 0161 833 0634
16 Arthur Street, Belfast BT1 4GD
Tel 028 9023 8451 Fax 028 9023 5401
The Stationery Office Oriel Bookshop,
18-19 High Street, Cardiff CF1 2BZ
Tel 029 2039 5548 Fax 029 2038 4347

The Stationery Office Scottish Parliament Documentation
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information
on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament,
their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries
0870 606 5566

Fax orders
0870 606 5588

The Scottish Parliament Shop
George IV Bridge
EH99 1SP
Telephone orders 0131 348 5412

RNID TYPETALK calls welcome on
18001 0131 348 5412
Textphone 0845 270 0152

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

www.scottish.parliament.uk

Accredited Agents
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers