

STANDARDS, PROCEDURES AND PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE

Tuesday 28 April 2009

Session 3

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2009.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division,
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by RR
Donnelley.

CONTENTS

Tuesday 28 April 2009

Col.

DECISIONS ON TAKING BUSINESS IN PRIVATE	313
CROSS-PARTY GROUPS.....	314
ANNUAL REPORT.....	316

STANDARDS, PROCEDURES AND PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE

6th Meeting 2009, Session 3

CONVENER

*Gil Paterson (West of Scotland) (SNP)

DEPUTY CONVENER

*Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab)

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

*Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD)

*Aileen Campbell (South of Scotland) (SNP)

*Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con)

Peter Peacock (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

*Dave Thompson (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Alasdair Morgan (South of Scotland) (SNP)

Mary Mulligan (Linlithgow) (Lab)

Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)

Elizabeth Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

*attended

THE FOLLOWING ALSO ATTENDED:

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Mr Frank McAveety (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab)

CLERKS TO THE COMMITTEE

Gillian Baxendine

Alison Walker

SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERKS

Mary Dinsdale

Jane Williams

ASSISTANT CLERK

Catherine Fergusson

LOCATION

Committee Room 6

Scottish Parliament

Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee

Tuesday 28 April 2009

[THE CONVENER *opened the meeting at 14:15*]

Decisions on Taking Business in Private

The Convener (Gil Paterson): Welcome to the sixth meeting in 2009 of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee. I welcome Murdo Fraser and Frank McAveety. I might get my own back on Frank today; I have appeared before him on a number of occasions.

Mr Frank McAveety (Glasgow Shettleston) (Lab): All positive, I hope.

The Convener: They were all positive, I must say.

We have received apologies from Peter Peacock. Are members content to take in private agenda item 5 on hybrid bills?

Members indicated agreement.

The Convener: Are members also content to consider the matter in private at future meetings until further notice? I ask for the committee's indulgence in that regard.

Members indicated agreement.

Cross-party Groups

14:15

The Convener: The committee's approval is sought for the registration of cross-party groups. Murdo Fraser is here to respond to members' questions on the proposed group on Scottish universities.

Dave Thompson (Highlands and Islands) (SNP): I understand that some individual members of the proposed group are members of the same organisation. How will that situation be dealt with in practice, for example when there is a vote?

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I have been a member of various cross-party groups during the past eight years and I cannot recall an occasion on which a vote took place, so perhaps the question is largely academic. However, when non-MSP members attend a meeting in a representative capacity, it would be inequitable to allow more than one person from the same organisation to vote on an issue. It would seem sensible to ask Universities Scotland, for example, to nominate a person to vote, instead of allowing several individuals to cast a vote, which might unfairly skew the outcome.

The Convener: If there are no further questions, are members content to approve the cross-party group on Scottish universities?

Members indicated agreement.

Murdo Fraser: Thank you.

The Convener: Frank McAveety is here to respond to questions on the proposed cross-party group on credit unions.

Dave Thompson: I put to Mr McAveety the question that I put to Mr Fraser. What happens when individual members are members of the same organisation? Perhaps Murdo Fraser will answer the question for you.

Mr McAveety: In a much more eloquent fashion, I am happy to respond.

In essence, we will use the criteria that Mr Fraser described. If more than one person from the same organisation is keen to participate and there is to be a vote, we will identify a lead person. However, votes have not been custom and practice in cross-party groups. Given that we will be considering the credit union model, co-operation will be the group's guiding principle.

Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD): I should say for the record that I will be an office-bearer of the proposed cross-party group on credit unions and a member of the proposed group on town and city

centre development. I am not sure whether those are declarable interests.

The Convener: If there are no further questions, are members happy to approve the cross-party group on credit unions?

Members indicated agreement.

Mr McAveety: Thank you.

The Convener: We turn to the proposed cross-party group on town and city centre development. Do members have questions for Marilyn Livingstone, who is to be the group's convener? Perhaps Dave Thompson wants to ask his question.

Dave Thompson: I will pass on that.

The section in the registration form on the group's purpose is very weighty. Perhaps the final sentence would have been sufficient. Of course, that is a matter for the proposed group.

Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab): Those paragraphs were put together by the group to set out our aims and objectives, because our agenda is quite big, and the process was democratic. However, you are right to say that the final sentence explains the group's purpose.

Dave Thompson: Quite often, the more we write down, the more we restrict ourselves, but that is a matter for the group.

Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con): Perhaps it would have been better to put the final sentence at the start of the section. That is a minor point.

The Convener: According to the registration form, it is proposed that the subscription will be a maximum of £50. Does Marilyn Livingstone envisage that £50 will be charged, or is there scope for the subscription fee to be less?

Marilyn Livingstone: I think that the charge is intended to cover teas, coffees, sandwiches and so on, given that members of the group will come from quite a distance. I think that there will be one payment per organisation. The fee is intended purely to cover refreshments.

The Convener: Okay. On the basis of the information on the form and the information that Marilyn Livingstone has given us, are members happy to approve the group?

Members indicated agreement.

Marilyn Livingstone: Thank you.

Annual Report

14:21

The Convener: Item 3 is consideration of a draft of the committee's annual report. I take it that members have had an opportunity to consider it. Are you happy with it, or do you want to propose changes or additions?

Aileen Campbell (South of Scotland) (SNP): Will the report take account of the decisions on cross-party groups that we made today?

Gillian Baxendine (Clerk): Yes.

Nanette Milne: Will the change in committee membership be mentioned?

Gillian Baxendine: The information will appear on the title page, but it is open to members to mention it elsewhere.

The Convener: Okay. I take it that we are happy to accept the draft report.

Members indicated agreement.

14:22

Meeting continued in private until 16:57.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Wednesday 6 May 2009

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

Single copies: £5.00

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at Document Supply.

Published in Edinburgh by RR Donnelley and available from:

Blackwell's Bookshop

**53 South Bridge
Edinburgh EH1 1YS
0131 622 8222**

Blackwell's Bookshops:
243-244 High Holborn
London WC1 7DZ
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries
0131 622 8283 or
0131 622 8258

Fax orders
0131 557 8149

E-mail orders
business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Subscriptions & Standing Orders
business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

Scottish Parliament

RNID Typetalk calls welcome on
18001 0131 348 5000
Textphone 0845 270 0152

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

Accredited Agents
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers