# **STANDARDS COMMITTEE**

Tuesday 23 September 2003 (*Morning*)

Session 2

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2003. Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division, Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body. Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by The Stationery Office Ltd. Her Majesty's Stationery Office is independent of and separate from the company now

trading as The Stationery Office Ltd, which is responsible for printing and publishing Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body publications.

#### **CONTENTS**

## Tuesday 23 September 2003

	Col.
CROSS-PARTY GROUPS	91

#### **STANDARDS COMMITTEE**

6<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2003, Session 2

#### CONVENER

Tricia Marwick (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP)

#### **D**EPUTY CONVENER

\*Mr Kenneth Macintosh (Eastwood) (Lab)

#### **C**OMMITTEE MEMBERS

\*Bill Butler (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)

\*Alex Fergusson (Gallow ay and Upper Nithsdale) (Con)
\*Donald Gorrie (Central Scotland) (LD)

\*Alex Neil (Central Scotland) (SNP)

\*Karen Whitefield (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab)

\*attended

#### **C**OMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Lord James Douglas-Hamilton (Lothians) (Con) Marilyn Livingstone (Kirkcaldy) (Lab) \*Alasdair Morgan (South of Scotland) (SNP)

#### **C**LERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Sam Jones

#### SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Sarah Robertson

#### LOC ATION

The Hub

# Scottish Parliament Standards Committee

Tuesday 23 September 2003

(Morning)

[THE DEPUTY CONVENER opened the meeting at 10:00]

### **Cross-party Groups**

The Deputy Convener (Mr Kenneth Macintosh): Good morning everyone, and welcome to the sixth meeting of the Standards Committee in this session. We have two items of business today. The second deals with the complaint against Ken MacAskill and Tricia Marwick. At our previous meeting we agreed to take that item in private, as we will be discussing the progress of the committee's investigation.

Our first item is two applications to establish new cross-party groups. Marilyn Livingstone, whose name is on the first application, will not be with us this morning, but members have had a chance to examine the application to register a cross-party group on construction. Do members have any comments on that group?

Alex Neil (Central Scotland) (SNP): I am involved with that group. I urge the committee to approve the application, because the construction industry is a much ignored but crucial sector of the Scottish economy. It is also a diffuse industry, in terms of its representation and organisation and its interface with the Parliament. We hope that one of the main benefits of a cross-party group will be to provide a platform for the industry to come together and speak with one voice, which would make life easier for the Parliament. In addition, as members know, the Executive is carrying out a review of various aspects of the industry. I hope that the committee will support the application.

**The Deputy Convener:** Absolutely. Are there any other comments?

**Bill Butler (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab):** The application would seem to be in order, and after Alex Neil's eloquence I do not see how we could possibly turn it down.

Alex Fergusson (Galloway and Upper Nithsdale) (Con): I agree. I could not possibly reject a proposal that had on it the name of my colleague and friend David Mundell. On that ground I am happy for the group to proceed.

The Deputy Convener: It is worth noting in passing the large number of external organisations that are involved with the group, with which I do not have a problem. We will return to that point when we talk about cross-party groups later in the year or early next year. The contrast between the numbers of MSPs and external groups on this application and the numbers on the next application that we will consider is clear and we will need to bear that in mind. However, I certainly do not doubt the usefulness of a cross-party group on construction or its worth to the Parliament.

If we are all agreed, we will approve the application to establish the cross-party group in the Scottish Parliament on construction.

The second application is for a cross-party group on the Scottish economy. Alex Neil is one of the co-conveners of the group. Do you wish to comment, Alex?

Alex Neil: It may be useful if I outline the background to the group. In the previous session there was a cross-party group on international trade and investment, which was headed up by Annabel Goldie. There was also a cross-party group that was chaired by Robin Harper, which started off as a cross-party group on citizens' income and then widened to include other economic matters. Also, Angus MacKay led a proposal to establish a cross-party group on small and medium-sized enterprises.

A number of us got together and suggested that it was a bit daft having all those separate crossparty groups duplicating one another's work and effort, and that it would be better just to have a cross-party group on the Scottish economy, which could then look into specific issues such as SME development. There was consensus on that proposal. Members can see the number of MSPs who support the establishment of a cross-party group on the Scottish economy, and the number of outside organisations, some of which are very prestigious. The sensible thing to do is to approve the cross-party group, which will mean that we will go from what could have been three cross-party groups to one.

The clerks had a question about whether the group that Robin Harper chaired was happy not to pursue its application. I checked with Robin, I think the clerks checked with Robin, and Robin in turn checked with the other key players in that group. As long as he is satisfied—which he is at the moment—that the cross-party group on the Scottish economy adequately covers the issues that he wants to raise, he is happy for the cross-party group on the Scottish economy to be the cross-party group.

The Deputy Convener: That is good. For clarification, is the cross-party group on

international trade and investment going to continue?

Alex Neil: No. It is terminated.

The Deputy Convener: Are there any other comments?

Karen Whitefield (Airdrie and Shotts) (Lab): Is the other group to which Alex Neil referred the cross-party group on business, economy, environment and society in the Scottish Parliament? I had never heard of that group, but its remit and objectives are similar to the ones that Alex Neil outlined. Although it might be helpful if three cross-party groups were amalgamated into one, I would be a little concerned if we had both the cross-party group on business, economy, environment and society and the cross-party group on the Scottish economy, because they seem to be trying to do the same thing, which leads to duplication.

Alex Neil: My understanding from talking to Robin Harper is that the cross-party group on business, economy, environment and society is deregistering, and that its members will subsume their activity into supporting the cross-party group on the Scottish economy. I think that he has confirmed that to the clerks.

The Deputy Convener: He has actually reregistered his cross-party group on business, economy, environment and society, although he may not wish to continue with it. There are some queries about the group anyway so, if the committee is happy, as convener of the Standards Committee, I will write to Robin Harper, send him a copy of the Official Report, and ask whether he is happy for his group to be included in Alex Neil's cross-party group on the Scottish economy or whether he will continue with his group.

**Alex Neil:** You will notice that the five largest parties are represented in our group.

The Deputy Convener: I was quite taken with the decision of the cross-party group on the Scottish economy, as well as that of the cross-party group on autistic spectrum disorder and other groups, to have co-conveners. I hope that that works. It is to be commended if it does, as it is a good idea. In addition, the list of MSP members of the cross-party group on the Scottish economy is quite impressive. Are there any other comments?

Donald Gorrie (Central Scotland) (LD): The group deserves support. My mind was sharpened up on this issue by being researched by an academic yesterday on my views on cross-party groups. Looking down the list of groups, I think that some could be criticised as being too specific, and possibly Alex Neil's group could be criticised as being too diffuse. A balance has to be struck—

one cannot be all things to all men—but reducing the number of groups is desirable. From what Alex has said, this application may achieve that in the economic world. The group should be supported, but it will have to focus efficiently, or it will just replicate the Scottish Parliament.

The Deputy Convener: Given the comments of the chief executive of HBOS plc recently, I welcome the formation of the group, which reflects members' interest in economic and financial matters in Scotland.

**Alex Neil:** I have contacted Lord Stevenson and invited him along to a meeting of the group, but so far he cannot find a place in his diary.

**The Deputy Convener:** Excellent. Does the committee agree to the formation of the crossparty group in the Scottish Parliament on the Scottish economy?

Members indicated agreement.

The Deputy Convener: We shall now move to item 2, which we agreed previously to take in private. I ask members of the public, press, official report and broadcasting to please leave the meeting.

10:09

Meeting continued in private until 11:54.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, 375 High Street, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

#### Wednesday 1 October 2003

Members who want reprints of their speeches (within one month of the date of publication) may obtain request forms and further details from the Central Distribution Office, the Document Supply Centre or the Official Report.

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

#### DAILY EDITIONS

Single copies: £5

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the Official Report of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, compiled by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre, contains details of past and forthcoming business and of the work of committees and gives general information on legislation and other parliamentary activity.

Single copies: £3.75 Special issue price: £5 Annual subscriptions: £150.00

7 tilliaar dab donptons. 2 roo.co

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at the Document Supply Centre.

Published in Edinburgh by The Stationery Office Limited and available from:

The Stationery Office Bookshop 71 Lothian Road Edinburgh EH3 9AZ 0870 606 5566 Fax 0870 606 5588

The Stationer y Office Bookshops at: 123 Kingsway, London WC2B 6PQ Tel 020 7242 6393 Fax 020 7242 6394 68-69 Bull Street, Bir mingham B4 6AD Tel 0121 236 9696 Fax 0121 236 9699 33 Wine Street, Bristol BS1 2BQ Tel 01179 264306 Fax 01179 294515 9-21 Princess Street, Manchester M60 8AS Tel 0161 834 7201 Fax 0161 833 0634 16 Arthur Street, Belfast BT1 4GD Tel 028 9023 8451 Fax 028 9023 5401 The Stationer y Office Oriel Bookshop, 18-19 High Street, Car diff CF12BZ Tel 029 2039 5548 Fax 029 2038 4347

The Stationery Office Scottish Parliament Documentation Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries 0870 606 5566

Fax orders 0870 606 5588

The Scottish Parliament Shop George IV Bridge EH99 1SP Telephone orders 0131 348 5412

RNI D Typetalk calls welcome on 18001 0131 348 5412 Textphone 0131 348 3415

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

www.scottish.parliament.uk

Accredited Agents (see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers