

# **JUSTICE 1 COMMITTEE AND JUSTICE 2 COMMITTEE (JOINT MEETING)**

Tuesday 14 November 2006

Session 2

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2006.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division,  
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ  
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate  
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by Astron.

---

# CONTENTS

Tuesday 14 November 2006

Col.

ITEM IN PRIVATE.....435

---

## JUSTICE 1 COMMITTEE

† 42<sup>nd</sup> Meeting 2006, Session 2

### CONVENER

\*Pauline McNeill (Glasgow Kelvin) (Lab)

### DEPUTY CONVENER

\*Stewart Stevenson (Banff and Buchan) (SNP)

### COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Marlyn Glen (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Mr Bruce McFee (West of Scotland) (SNP)

\*Margaret Mitchell (Central Scotland) (Con)

\*Mrs Mary Mulligan (Linlithgow) (Lab)

\*Mike Pringle (Edinburgh South) (LD)

### COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Brian Adam (Aberdeen North) (SNP)

Bill Aitken (Glasgow) (Con)

Karen Gillon (Clydesdale) (Lab)

Mr Jim Wallace (Orkney) (LD)

\*attended

### CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Callum Thomson

### SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Euan Donald

Douglas Wands

### ASSISTANT CLERK

Lewis McNaughton

### LOCATION

Committee Room 1

† 41<sup>st</sup> meeting 2006, Session 2—meeting held  
in private.

---

## JUSTICE 2 COMMITTEE

31<sup>st</sup> Meeting 2006, Session 2

### CONVENER

\*Mr David Davidson (North East Scotland) (Con)

### DEPUTY CONVENER

Bill Butler (Glasgow Anniesland) (Lab)

### COMMITTEE MEMBERS

\*Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab)

Colin Fox (Lothians) (SSP)

\*Maureen Macmillan (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Michael Matheson (Central Scotland) (SNP)

\*Jeremy Purvis (Tweddale, Ettrick and Lauderdale) (LD)

### COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Cathie Craigie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (Lab)

Kenny MacAskill (Lothians) (SNP)

Margaret Mitchell (Central Scotland) (Con)

Mike Pringle (Edinburgh South) (LD)

\*attended

### CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Tracey Hawe

Alison Walker

### SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Anne Peat

### ASSISTANT CLERK

Steven Tallach



**Scottish Parliament**  
**Justice 1 Committee and**  
**Justice 2 Committee**  
**(Joint Meeting)**

*Tuesday 14 November 2006*

[THE CONVENER *opened the meeting at 16:14*]

**Item in Private**

**The Convener (Mr David Davidson):** Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen, and welcome to the joint meeting of the Justice 1 Committee and the Justice 2 Committee. This is the Justice 1 Committee's 42<sup>nd</sup> meeting in 2006 and the Justice 2 Committee's 31<sup>st</sup> meeting in 2006.

The first agenda item is to seek the committees' permission to hold in private the rest of the meeting, during which we will discuss our joint report. Is that agreed?

**Members** *indicated agreement.*

**The Convener:** I am sorry; I forgot to say that we have received apologies from Bruce McFee, Michael Matheson, Bill Butler, Colin Fox, Marlyn Glen and Stewart Stevenson. We are aware that Mike Pringle might have to leave early.

16:15

*Meeting continued in private until 17:02.*



Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

**Wednesday 22 November 2006**

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

##### OFFICIAL REPORT daily editions

*Single copies: £5.00*

*Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00*

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

##### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

*Single copies: £3.75*

*Annual subscriptions: £150.00*

Standing orders will be accepted at Document Supply.

Published in Edinburgh by Astron and available from:

#### **Blackwell's Bookshop**

**53 South Bridge  
Edinburgh EH1 1YS  
0131 622 8222**

**Blackwell's Bookshops:**  
243-244 High Holborn  
London WC1 7DZ  
Tel 020 7831 9501

All trade orders for Scottish Parliament documents should be placed through Blackwell's Edinburgh.

**Blackwell's Scottish Parliament Documentation**  
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:

**Telephone orders and inquiries**  
**0131 622 8283 or**  
**0131 622 8258**

**Fax orders**  
**0131 557 8149**

**E-mail orders**  
**business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk**

**Subscriptions & Standing Orders**  
**business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk**

#### **Scottish Parliament**

**RNID Typetalk calls welcome on**  
**18001 0131 348 5000**  
**Textphone 0845 270 0152**

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk

**Accredited Agents**  
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers