

HEALTH COMMITTEE

Tuesday 27 January 2004
(*Afternoon*)

Session 2

£5.00

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2004.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division,
Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ
Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate
Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by The
Stationery Office Ltd.

Her Majesty's Stationery Office is independent of and separate from the company now
trading as The Stationery Office Ltd, which is responsible for printing and publishing
Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body publications.

CONTENTS

Tuesday 27 January 2004

	Col.
ITEMS IN PRIVATE.....	605

HEALTH COMMITTEE

4th Meeting 2004, Session 2

CONVENER

*Christine Grahame (South of Scotland) (SNP)

DEPUTY CONVENER

*Janis Hughes (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

*Mr David Davidson (North East Scotland) (Con)

*Helen Eadie (Dunfermline East) (Lab)

*Kate Maclean (Dundee West) (Lab)

*Mr Duncan McNeil (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab)

*Shona Robison (Dundee East) (SNP)

*Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD)

*Dr Jean Turner (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Ind)

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD)

Paul Martin (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab)

Mrs Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con)

Ms Sandra White (Glasgow) (SNP)

*attended

CLERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Jennifer Smart

SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Graeme Elliot

ASSISTANT CLERK

Hannah Reeve

LOCATION

Committee Room 2

Scottish Parliament

Health Committee

Tuesday 27 January 2004

(Afternoon)

[THE CONVENER *opened the meeting at 14:01*]

Items in Private

The Convener (Christine Grahame): I open the fourth meeting of the Health Committee in 2004 and I ask everybody to switch off their mobile phones. There are no apologies.

Item 1 on the agenda is to ask the committee to consider whether to take item 2 in private at this meeting. That item is consideration of the draft stage 1 report on the National Health Service Reform (Scotland) Bill. In addition, we must consider whether at our next meeting on 3 February we will discuss in private the work-force planning civic participation bid.

Could I have members' views, please?

Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD): There is an assumption in standing orders that our committee meetings should be heard in public. I am content to assume that we will conduct our business in public according to the standing orders, unless there are exceptional circumstances in which we need to meet in private. If we were to go into private session now, we would also be talking about going into private session at the next meeting.

Exceptional circumstances include times when we discuss individuals, or when individuals could be unfairly highlighted, but I do not see that that will happen in the discussions in question. I would be content for us to hold to standing orders.

The Convener: Do you want both items to be discussed in public, or only one of them?

Mike Rumbles: The position is that according to standing orders we assume—

The Convener: Yes. Thank you.

Mike Rumbles: May I finish, convener?

The Convener: I presume that you want both items to be taken in public.

Mike Rumbles: If you would let me finish. The standing orders say that we should assume that both items be taken in public session unless the case is made that we discuss them in private. I am willing to listen to that case.

The Convener: Does any other committee member share those views?

Members indicated disagreement.

The Convener: No one shares those views. As I think that we had a full discussion of the issue at a previous meeting and as no one else shares Mike Rumbles's view, I rule that the items will be taken in private session.

Is that agreed?

Members indicated agreement.

Mike Rumbles: No.

The Convener: It is agreed with one exception that we will discuss the items in private; that can be noted.

I move now to item 2 on the agenda.

14:04

Meeting continued in private until 15:22.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, 375 High Street, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Wednesday 4 February 2004

Members who want reprints of their speeches (within one month of the date of publication) may obtain request forms and further details from the Central Distribution Office, the Document Supply Centre or the Official Report.

PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

DAILY EDITIONS

Single copies: £5

Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the *Official Report* of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, compiled by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre, contains details of past and forthcoming business and of the work of committees and gives general information on legislation and other parliamentary activity.

Single copies: £3.75

Special issue price: £5

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75

Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at the Document Supply Centre.

Published in Edinburgh by The Stationery Office Limited and available from:

The Stationery Office Bookshop
71 Lothian Road
Edinburgh EH3 9AZ
0870 606 5566 Fax 0870 606 5588

The Stationery Office Bookshops at:
123 Kingsway, London WC2B 6PQ
Tel 020 7242 6393 Fax 020 7242 6394
68-69 Bull Street, Birmingham B4 6AD
Tel 0121 236 9696 Fax 0121 236 9699
33 Wine Street, Bristol BS1 2BQ
Tel 01179 264306 Fax 01179 294515
9-21 Princess Street, Manchester M60 8AS
Tel 0161 834 7201 Fax 0161 833 0634
16 Arthur Street, Belfast BT1 4GD
Tel 028 9023 8451 Fax 028 9023 5401
The Stationery Office Oriel Bookshop,
18-19 High Street, Cardiff CF1 2BZ
Tel 029 2039 5548 Fax 029 2038 4347

The Stationery Office Scottish Parliament Documentation
Helpline may be able to assist with additional information
on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament,
their availability and cost:

Telephone orders and inquiries
0870 606 5566

Fax orders
0870 606 5588

The Scottish Parliament Shop
George IV Bridge
EH99 1SP
Telephone orders 0131 348 5412

RNID Typetalk calls welcome on
18001 0131 348 5412
Textphone 0131 348 3415

sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

www.scottish.parliament.uk

Accredited Agents
(see Yellow Pages)

and through good booksellers