# HEALTH COMMITTEE

Tuesday 23 September 2003 (*Afternoon*)

Session 2

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body 2003.

Applications for reproduction should be made in writing to the Licensing Division, Her Majesty's Stationery Office, St Clements House, 2-16 Colegate, Norwich NR3 1BQ Fax 01603 723000, which is administering the copyright on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

Produced and published in Scotland on behalf of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body by The Stationery Office Ltd.

Her Majesty's Stationery Office is independent of and separate from the company now trading as The Stationery Office Ltd, which is responsible for printing and publishing Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body publications.

## CONTENTS

## **Tuesday 23 September 2003**

Col

	001.
ITEMS IN PRIVATE	195
SUBORDINATE LEGISLATION	196
Collagen and Gelatine (Intra-Community Trade) (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/328)	196
National Health Service (Compensation for Premature Retirement) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/344)	
National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/376)	
Food (Hot Chilli and Hot Chilli Products) (Emergency Control) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/382)	196
Food (Brazil Nuts) (Emergency Control) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/396)	
Nursing and Midwifery Student Allowances (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/401) Collagen and Gelatine (Intra-Community Trade) (Scotland) Amendment (No 2) Regulations 2003	196
(SSI 2003/405)	196

### HEALTH COMMITTEE 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting 2003, Session 2

#### CONVENER

\*Christine Grahame (South of Scotland) (SNP)

#### **D**EPUTY CONVENER

\*Janis Hughes (Glasgow Rutherglen) (Lab)

#### COMMITTEE MEMBERS

\*Mr David Davidson (North East Scotland) (Con) \*Helen Eadie (Dunfermline East) (Lab) \*Kate Maclean (Dundee West) (Lab) \*Mr Duncan McNeil (Greenock and Inverclyde) (Lab) Shona Robison (Dundee East) (SNP) \*Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD) \*Dr Jean Turner (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (Ind)

#### \*attended

#### COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTES

Robert Brown (Glasgow) (LD) Paul Martin (Glasgow Springburn) (Lab) Mrs Nanette Milne (North East Scotland) (Con) \*Ms Sandra White (Glasgow) (SNP)

**C**LERK TO THE COMMITTEE

Jennifer Smart

SENIOR ASSISTANT CLERK

Graeme Elliot

ASSISTANT CLERK

Hannah Reeve

Loc ATION Chamber

# **Scottish Parliament**

## **Health Committee**

Tuesday 23 September 2003

(Afternoon)

[THE CONVENER opened the meeting at 14:03]

The Convener (Christine Grahame): I welcome everyone to the seventh meeting of the Health Committee in the second session of Parliament. We have received apologies from Shona Robison and we welcome Sandra White, who is attending as the SNP substitute.

## **Items in Private**

**The Convener:** Item 1 on the agenda is to consider whether to discuss in private items 3 and 4 for the following reasons. Item 3 will be a briefing by the committee adviser on the budget and discussion of possible witnesses and lines of questioning. Does the committee agree to discuss that item in private?

Members indicated agreement.

**The Convener:** Item 4 is the draft report on stage 1 of the Primary Medical Services (Scotland) Bill. As we are all aware, draft reports are usually discussed in private; the final stage 1 report will be public.

Mike Rumbles (West Aberdeenshire and Kincardine) (LD): I am sorry—I did not catch what you said at the end.

**The Convener:** I said that draft reports are usually discussed in private, but the final report is in the public domain.

Mike Rumbles: Can I comment on that?

The Convener: Of course.

**Mike Rumbles:** You are correct to say that stage 1 reports are usually discussed in private; however, they are not always discussed in private. I understand that the majority of the committee probably want to discuss the item in private, but I flag up for future reference that I would like us to try at some stage to discuss stage 1 reports in open session if that is at all possible. I understand, however, if members want to discuss this item in private session.

**The Convener:** I hear what Mike Rumbles is saying—we could discuss the matter at some point. Do members agree to discuss this draft report in private?

Members indicated agreement.

## **Subordinate Legislation**

Collagen and Gelatine (Intra-Community Trade) (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/328)

National Health Service (Compensation for Premature Retirement) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/344)

National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/376)

Food (Hot Chilli and Hot Chilli Products) (Emergency Control) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/382)

Food (Brazil Nuts) (Emergency Control) (Scotland) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/396)

Nursing and Midwifery Student Allowances (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/401)

Collagen and Gelatine (Intra-Community Trade) (Scotland) Amendment (No 2) Regulations 2003 (SSI 2003/405)

#### 14:04

**The Convener:** We now move on to item 2, which is subordinate legislation. The instruments that are before the committee are all subject to the negative procedure.

The committee will be delighted to learn that we have resolved the issue of reading all of the instruments' titles out aloud. I have only to read out the statutory instrument numbers for the seven instruments.

No members' comments have been received in relation to Scottish statutory instrument 2003/328, SSI 2003/344, SSI 2003/376, SSI 2003/382, SSI 2003/396, SSI 2003/401 SSI 2003/405. The Subordinate Legislation Committee has no comments in relation to SSI 2003/328, SSI 2003/401 or SSI 2003/405.

The Subordinate Legislation Committee has commented on SSI 2003/344, SSI 2003/376, SSI 2003/382 and SSI 2003/396; members have those comments in committee paper HC/S2/03/07/01.

No motion to annul has been lodged in respect of any of the instruments. The recommendation is that the committee does not wish to make any recommendation in relation to the seven instruments. Are we all agreed?

Members indicated agreement.

**The Convener:** We now move into private session, so I ask the vast number of members of the public who are sitting listening to the meeting to leave. [*Laughter.*] There is no one.

14:06

Meeting continued in private until 15:24.

Members who would like a printed copy of the *Official Report* to be forwarded to them should give notice at the Document Supply Centre.

No proofs of the *Official Report* can be supplied. Members who want to suggest corrections for the archive edition should mark them clearly in the daily edition, and send it to the Official Report, 375 High Street, Edinburgh EH99 1SP. Suggested corrections in any other form cannot be accepted.

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

#### Wednesday 1 October 2003

Members who want reprints of their speeches (within one month of the date of publication) may obtain request forms and further details from the Central Distribution Office, the Document Supply Centre or the Official Report.

#### PRICES AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

DAILY EDITIONS

Single copies: £5 Meetings of the Parliament annual subscriptions: £350.00

The archive edition of the Official Report of meetings of the Parliament, written answers and public meetings of committees will be published on CD-ROM.

WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, compiled by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre, contains details of past and forthcoming business and of the work of committees and gives general information on legislation and other parliamentary activity.

Single copies: £3.75 Special issue price: £5 Annual subscriptions: £150.00

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO PARLIAMENTARY QUESTIONS weekly compilation

Single copies: £3.75 Annual subscriptions: £150.00

Standing orders will be accepted at the Document Supply Centre.

Published in Edinburgh by The Stationery Office Limited and available from:

The Stationery Office Bookshop 71 Lothian Road Edinburgh EH3 9AZ 0870 606 5566 Fax 0870 606 5588	The Stationery Office Scottish Parliament Documentation Helpline may be able to assist with additional information on publications of or about the Scottish Parliament, their availability and cost:	The Scottish Parliament Shop George IV Bridge EH99 1SP Telephone orders 0131 348 5412
<b>The Stationer y Office Bookshops at:</b> 123 Kingsway, London WC2B 6PQ Tel 020 7242 6393 Fax 020 7242 6394 68-69 Bull Street, Birmingham B4 6AD Tel 0121 236 9696 Fax 0121 236 9699 33 Wine Street, Bristol BS1 2BQ Tel 01 179 264306 Fax 01179 294515 9-21 Princess Street, Manchester M60 8AS Tel 0161 834 7201 Fax 0161 833 0634 16 Arthur Street, Belfast BT1 4GD Tel 028 9023 8451 Fax 028 9023 5401 The Stationer y Office Oriel Bookshop, 18-19 High Street, Car diff CF12BZ Tel 029 2039 5548 Fax 029 2038 4347	Telephone orders and inquiries 0870 606 5566 Fax orders 0870 606 5588	RNID Typetalk calls welcome on 18001 0131 348 5412 Textphone 0131 348 3415 sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk www.scottish.parliament.uk Accredited Agents (see Yellow Pages)
		and through good booksellers

ISBN 0 338 000003 ISSN 1467-0178