



OFFICIAL REPORT  
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

# Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 27 January 2026

Session 6



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - [www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

---

**Tuesday 27 January 2026**

**CONTENTS**

	<b>Col.</b>
<b>TIME FOR REFLECTION</b> .....	1
<b>BUSINESS MOTION</b> .....	3
<i>Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.</i>	
<b>TOPICAL QUESTION TIME</b> .....	5
Queen Elizabeth University Hospital (Independent Audit) .....	5
Licensed Premises (Non-domestic Rates) .....	7
Scottish Information Commissioner Legal Action .....	10
<b>BUSINESS MOTION</b> .....	14
<i>Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.</i>	
Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con)	
.....	14
The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey)	
.....	15
<b>NATURAL ENVIRONMENT (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3</b> .....	17

---



# Scottish Parliament

Tuesday 27 January 2026

*[The Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]*

## Time for Reflection

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):** Good afternoon. The first item of business is time for reflection, and our time for reflection leaders are Emily Stephen and Julian Staniszewski, who are Holocaust Educational Trust ambassadors.

**Emily Stephen (Holocaust Educational Trust):** My name is Emily Stephen and this is Julian Staniszewski, and we are ambassadors for the Holocaust Educational Trust. Last November, we took part in the trust's lessons from Auschwitz project as students from Alva academy in Clackmannanshire. As part of the project, we heard from Holocaust survivor Janine Webber BEM, took part in a one-day visit to former Nazi concentration and death camp Auschwitz-Birkenau, and, on our return, shared what we learned with our school and community.

Learning about the Holocaust is important to me, because it is a piece of history that should never be forgotten. I believe that lack of learning causes lack of understanding. Through the project, we were fortunate to learn from the individual stories of victims and survivors, and that is something that will always stay with me.

One such story is that of Holocaust survivor Janine Webber BEM. During her testimony, Janine shared that she had to live in a hole in the ground to ensure her safety. She was there for a year, with little to no room to move and no daylight. Janine's story really resonated with me. I felt so emotional—I could not fathom the fear that she must have felt. Her bravery and determination were admirable, especially as she was only nine years old.

**Julian Staniszewski (Holocaust Educational Trust):** By taking part in the project, we have had a different experience to most who learn about the Holocaust. We stood at a site of the Holocaust, saw victims' personal belongings, baby items, clothes and human hair that was inhumanely taken, sparking a feeling that cannot be replicated in a classroom via a textbook.

That is why, on our return, it was important for us to share our project at our school's remembrance evening, speaking in front of parents and senior students. It was important to us that we spoke about Jewish life before the war and specifically about the individuals behind the

statistics, as that is what needs to be remembered.

Both Emily and I believe that it is our responsibility as ambassadors to support and guide younger pupils. We hope that the people who heard our speech on remembrance evening, and everyone here today, will play their part in educating future generations, to safeguard the memory of the Holocaust, prevent such actions from ever being repeated and stand up to antisemitism and hate wherever and whenever we see it.

Thank you so much to the Rt Hon Alison Johnstone MSP and the Scottish Parliament for inviting us here today to share our experience and reflections. *[Applause.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Emily. Thank you, Julian.

## Business Motion

5.25 pm

Decision Time.—[*Graeme Dey*]

*Motion agreed to.*

14:03

### **The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-20568, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme.

*Motion moved,*

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 27 January 2026—

delete

9.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

10.00 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 28 January 2026—

after

*followed by* Motion on Legislative Consent:  
Sustainable Aviation Fuel Bill – UK  
Legislation

insert

*followed by* Stage 3 Proceedings: Natural  
Environment (Scotland) Bill

delete

5.30 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

and insert

9.30 pm Decision Time

(c) Thursday 29 January 2026—

delete

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Education and Skills

and insert

2.15 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.15 pm Portfolio Questions: Education and Skills

after

*followed by* Stage 1 Debate: Greyhound Racing  
(Offences) (Scotland) Bill

insert

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: Common  
Organisation of the Markets in  
Agricultural Products (Fruit and  
Vegetables) (Miscellaneous  
Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations  
2026 [draft]

delete

5.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

## Topical Question Time

14:03

### Queen Elizabeth University Hospital (Independent Audit)

1. **Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to reports that then health secretary, Shona Robison, U-turned on a promise to carry out an independent audit of the Queen Elizabeth university hospital before it opened to patients. (S6T-02862)

**The Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care (Neil Gray):** Once again, I pay tribute to the patients and families at the heart of the inquiry, who have already faced immense pain and trauma. I also commend the work of the inquiry team and Lord Brodie. It is vital that we allow the inquiry to deliberate and consider its findings, which we will respond to in full.

The Scottish Government provided all relevant evidence to the inquiry, which is being considered by Lord Brodie in advance of his final report and recommendations later this year. It would be inappropriate to comment further at this stage.

However, I note that it is a matter of parliamentary record that Ms Robison responded on the matter via written correspondence to Jackie Baillie as a member of the Health and Sport Committee on 24 February 2015. I refer Ms Baillie to the parliamentary record.

**Jackie Baillie:** In the light of the Vale of Leven hospital inquiry, which was chaired by Lord MacLean, I asked Shona Robison at the Health and Sport Committee on 24 February 2015 whether an independent audit of the new hospital had, in fact, been carried out. After some pressing, she said:

“If it has not taken place, it will. We will check that.”—*[Official Report, Health and Sport Committee, 24 February 2015; c 32.]*

A week later, Shona Robison did a complete U-turn. The result? No independent audit of the hospital took place before it opened its doors to staff and patients. Does the cabinet secretary understand that the failure to carry out an expert, independent investigation cost lives?

**Neil Gray:** I have set out that the matters that are before us are the subject of an independent, judge-led public inquiry. It is important that that inquiry is allowed to carry out its business without interference from any politician and that it does so with the full evidence before it. The Scottish Government has provided all relevant material that has been asked of us by Lord Brodie’s inquiry, and we intend to continue that co-operative approach.

We resolve to respond to the recommendations when that inquiry concludes.

**Jackie Baillie:** The cabinet secretary did everything but answer my question. Frankly, I find the response extraordinary. The evidence is there in black and white: there is no getting away from the fact that people died as a result of this Government’s incompetence. Senior Government ministers chose not to have the new hospital inspected, which had deadly consequences.

Shona Robison told the committee:

“The new hospital’s facilities are second to none and state of the art, and all the processes and procedures will be tested before staff and patients migrate to the site from April onwards.”—*[Official Report, Health and Sport Committee, 24 February 2015; c 30.]*

Given what we know now, does the cabinet secretary agree that she did not tell the truth and that the Government now stands accused of criminal negligence?

**Neil Gray:** Jackie Baillie knows full well that, while those live inquiries are on-going, it would be completely inappropriate for Scottish ministers to intervene or comment. She also knows that it is a matter of public record from evidence led at the inquiry that information was withheld from the Government by NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. Given the evidence that is before the inquiry, it is important that it is allowed to pursue its deliberations free from political interference. That is the tenor of a public inquiry, as it should be, and we will obviously take the inquiry’s recommendations seriously.

At the centre of all this are the families, to whom my heart goes out and who should be, above all else, at the forefront of our considerations. We instigated this independent, judge-led public inquiry so that the families’ questions could be answered. I believe that, as a result of the evidence that is being led through the public inquiry, we are getting to the truth of the matter.

**Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP):** The cabinet secretary is absolutely right that patients and their families are at the heart of this inquiry. I pay tribute to him and to the whistleblowers who have campaigned tirelessly. The cabinet secretary will know that this Parliament enshrined in legislation the independence of inquiries through the Inquiries Act 2005, and it is vital that members in this chamber remember that.

For the benefit of the chamber, will the cabinet secretary again outline the importance of ensuring that Lord Brodie, as chair of the inquiry, has the space to consider all the evidence and get to the truth for families and patients?

**Neil Gray:** Rona Mackay is absolutely right. Under the Inquiries Act 2005, this Parliament put in place a range of powers that are available to any established public inquiry. Those wide-ranging powers, which include powers to compel witnesses and the production of all relevant information, are extensive, and they enshrine the independence of the public inquiry. They ensure that any inquiry is protected from any undue influence. It is therefore right that we allow Lord Brodie the time and space to deliberate fully on the evidence before the inquiry, and we look forward to responding to its findings in due course.

**Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con):** The continued obfuscation of the facts by this Government is leaving the confidence of patients, NHS staff and the public in the management of the NHS at an all-time low. Does the cabinet secretary not realise that, to rebuild trust, it is crucial that the Scottish Government and NHS boards are transparent and honest with the public?

Transparency has been an issue in this place since I first arrived here, and the Scottish Government needs to learn that lesson. When will the Scottish Government and the cabinet secretary stop hiding behind endless inquiries and face up to the fact that there is a real culture problem in NHS management?

**Neil Gray:** I hope that we all agree that the independence of public inquiries must be protected from any influence by politicians. I respect that independence. This is not about hiding behind the inquiry; it is about allowing the inquiry to carry out its business free from political interference.

We established the public inquiry because we want to give the families at the centre of this answers to the legitimate questions that they have raised. Lord Brodie has the opportunity to call witnesses and garner evidence. We have fully cooperated with the inquiry and have been fully transparent in relation to all the requests for information to be supplied to the inquiry. It is important that Lord Brodie and the inquiry team are allowed the time and space to come to their conclusions, which we will respond to imminently.

### **Licensed Premises (Non-domestic Rates)**

**2. Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what action it will take in response to the finding from UKHospitality Scotland that licensed premises face, on average, an 86 per cent increase in non-domestic rates as a result of the current revaluation. (S6T-02861)

**The Minister for Public Finance (Ivan McKee):** Although we appreciate the concerns that businesses have raised, particularly after the

United Kingdom Government's choice to increase employer national insurance contributions last year, we do not recognise the figure that Murdo Fraser has quoted.

For example, public houses are expected to see an average increase in their overall rateable value of 15 per cent over the three-year period following the 2026 revaluation, while hotels are expected to see a 29 per cent increase over that three-year period. Gross bills are set to increase by less than that, due to a decrease in the basic, intermediate and higher property rates in 2026-27. If we include properties that are eligible for 100 per cent relief, such as small business bonus scheme relief, we estimate that net bills in 2026-27 will rise by significantly less than has been claimed, once all reliefs are taken into account. In fact, total NDR revenue is now 6 per cent less in real terms, using the consumer prices index, than it was before Covid, despite the increase in the number of businesses.

**Murdo Fraser:** I dare say that the minister can engage directly with UKHospitality Scotland in disputing its figures. It says that the average pub in Scotland will see an increase of £36,523 over three years and that the average hotel will see an increase of £68,007 over the same period. Whatever the detailed figures might be, the fact is that any increases will simply not be affordable. Such businesses are currently struggling with high costs and flat customer demand, so more businesses will simply close.

We expect the Labour Government in London to announce a U-turn today on rates relief for pubs in England. In the past, the Scottish National Party Government has not passed on Barnett consequential from rates announcements down south. Will it do so this time so that pubs in Scotland do not lose out once more?

**Ivan McKee:** An extensive amount of data regarding the revaluation was published at the time of the budget, so Murdo Fraser can and should look at that data, which is set out by sector, to understand what it tells him.

We will continue to engage with business organisations on any specific concerns that they want to raise. However, I again draw Murdo Fraser's attention to the point that, despite the growing business base, total NDR take is now 6 per cent less in real terms, using CPI, than it was before Covid. We are taking less money in real terms from businesses through NDR than we were previously.

With regard to UK consequential, we have already made a commitment that we will pass on in full any additional reliefs for businesses that the UK Government announces. We have already had discussions with the NDR consultation group and

organisations that represent businesses about how that would take place.

**Murdo Fraser:** Overall take might well be down, but it is undoubtedly the case that some sectors, including hospitality, are really suffering at present due to the increases.

At the root of this is the methodology that is being used for the current revaluation. The increases will come in from April and, unless something is done, more businesses will fold. What is the minister doing about engaging with the assessors on the methodology that is being used? If there are issues with the methodology, will he agree not to implement the increases that are coming as a result of the current revaluation until the methodology issue is resolved?

**Ivan McKee:** The average increase for pubs over a three-year period is 15 per cent. The reliefs that are in place—there is £320 million over the three-year period for the transition reliefs, and next year's estimated relief package is £864 million—will make a significant impact on the bills that businesses pay. We appreciate that some businesses are in a difficult position, but that is why those significant relief packages are in place to support them.

With regard to the valuation methodology, the member should know that, as requested by the business community, B J Gill has already started to conduct an independent review of the valuation methodology for licensed premises. That work is on-going, and we will review its findings when it reports later this year.

**Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (LD):** Tourism, hospitality and self-catering businesses in particular have been absolutely clear with us as MSPs that they believe that the methodology behind the revaluations has hit some sectors hard. They are looking not at averages but at the massive spikes that some sectors are facing. They have been clear that some businesses will go bust as a result. I do not think that any of us wants that, so surely the cost of doing something will far outweigh the cost of doing nothing.

The best course of action would be a complete postponement of the new rates, to give businesses some breathing space for a year. If that cannot happen, will the minister at least agree to continue to work with me as part of our budget negotiations to put as much support as possible back into these much-needed businesses? None of us wants any business to close as a result of business rates going up through revaluation.

**Ivan McKee:** The member makes a valid point. The self-catering sector has seen an average increase of 88 per cent, which is significant. Not all businesses will pay that—far from it—because of the relief package that is in place, but there has

been a change in the methodology that assessors use in the sector.

I have met representatives of the sector and the assessors to discuss the issue. We will continue to engage with the sector to take into account the points that the member has raised.

**Bill Kidd (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP):** The Scottish Government's small business bonus scheme and the business growth accelerator reliefs are the most generous of their kind in the United Kingdom. Will the minister say any more about the total support that is available across revaluation to retail, hospitality and leisure businesses in Scotland?

**Ivan McKee:** The Scottish budget for next year reduces the basic, intermediate and higher property rates, which will ensure the lowest basic property rate since 2018-19, and it supports a package of reliefs that will be worth an estimated £864 million in 2026-27. It offers more than £320 million of support through transitional relief schemes and retail, hospitality and leisure relief in the next three years.

We estimate that more than 100,000 properties will remain eligible for our small business bonus scheme, which will remain the most generous of its kind in the UK. We will continue to offer the most generous relief package for renewable energy generation in the UK, and unique reliefs such as day nursery relief, our business growth accelerator and fresh start reliefs will also remain the most generous in the UK.

#### Scottish Information Commissioner Legal Action

3. **Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to the Scottish Information Commissioner taking legal action against it in relation to its missing deadlines to produce documents regarding James Hamilton's investigation into alleged breaches of the ministerial code. (S6T-02866)

**The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey):** The First Minister has made it clear that the Scottish Government will comply with the Information Commissioner's decision on the case as soon as possible. Court orders make it clear that those who complain of sexual assault must have their identities protected. We cannot release information that would breach those court orders, as it would amount to contempt of court. Accelerated work—I stress that it is accelerated—is under way to consider each document for release. The assessment is complex, given the need to avoid jigsaw identification.

**Katy Clark:** The freedom of information request was made in October 2024. Following both a

review and an investigation, the Information Commissioner ruled that the Scottish Government had wrongfully withheld information and that that information should be released by 15 January. Ministers failed to comply with the 15 January deadline and then failed to comply with another deadline on 22 January—only notifying the Information Commissioner of that decision just minutes before the deadline.

The Information Commissioner is clear that he is asking the Scottish Government not to break the law but to comply with it. Does the minister believe that the Scottish Government's actions so far have been in compliance with freedom of information law?

**Graeme Dey:** The Scottish Government has a responsibility to act responsibly. I recognise the point that Katy Clark has made, but I draw her attention to the fact that Scottish Government officials wrote to the Information Commissioner on both 16 and 22 January to confirm that the Scottish Government will comply with the decision as soon as is practically possible. I am sure that Katy Clark would understand the need to look very carefully at the information that is released, for reasons of which she is well aware.

**Katy Clark:** The Information Commissioner has never before reported a public authority to the Court of Session for non-compliance, which means that the legal action that is now being taken against the Scottish Government is unprecedented. He is clear that, if there is a jigsaw identification issue, ministers have the opportunity to make that case. Has the Scottish Government made that case? Has it responded to the applicant to explain the position? Will the minister provide the Parliament with a timetable—a date when the information will be published?

**Graeme Dey:** I would be reluctant to provide a date, because I am sure that, if that date slipped by a day, we would be criticised for it. I genuinely offer Katy Clark the assurance that the matter is being worked on at pace. I hope that she would also accept that there is a real need to be extremely careful to ensure that the information—which will be released—does not inadvertently provide jigsaw identification of any of the individuals.

I am sure that, if the Government was to commit a contempt of court, it would be criticised by members for doing so. I hope that reasonable-minded members will recognise the need to exercise care in fulfilling the commitment that we have given to release the information.

**The Presiding Officer:** Several members have pressed their request-to-speak buttons. Concise questions and responses would be appreciated.

**Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con):** The Scottish Government has previously acknowledged using artificial intelligence to answer FOI requests from the Scottish Conservatives. Did using AI filtering have any impact whatsoever on the Government's assessment of and/or release of the documents in this case?

**Graeme Dey:** I have to be honest—I do not fully understand the question that the member is asking. This is a simple and straightforward case; we have committed to releasing the information, and we are undertaking a detailed process to ensure that we do not commit contempt of court.

**Liam Kerr:** Did AI have—

**Graeme Dey:** I hear the member speaking from a sedentary position, but I cannot make out what he is saying. I offer him the assurance—as I have done to Katy Clark—that the Government is working at pace to provide the release of the information while acting responsibly.

**Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind):** When Alex Salmond defeated the Scottish Government in his court case, the judge in the case, Lord Pentland, said that the Government's actions were “tainted with apparent bias”. The dean of the Faculty of Advocates, Roddy Dunlop, in advice to the Government, said that, thankfully, an affidavit by a senior civil servant was not lodged. Leslie Evans, the then permanent secretary, said on the day after the verdict that the battle may be lost, but not the war.

The incontrovertible inference is surely, to paraphrase Shakespeare, that there is something rotten in the state of Scotland. Will the minister consult the permanent secretary to get fresh advice with a view to opening up the books and making public all the redacted and withheld documents from that period?

**Graeme Dey:** I do not in any way accept Fergus Ewing's characterisation of the matter. We are content with the advice that we have received.

**Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** Civil servants are impartial of the Scottish Government. As has been said today, it is an unprecedented move for the Information Commissioner to make a referral to the Court of Session. Do apparently impartial civil servants support the Government delaying the release of the information? If not, why are Government ministers going against them? If they do support that, does the minister accept that that puts into question their impartiality?

If the minister will not provide a specific date, will he at least assure the Parliament that the information will be released ahead of the Scottish

Parliament election purdah period, so that the Parliament can receive it before the election?

**Graeme Dey:** The intention is to release the information as soon as it is practical to do so.

In Douglas Ross's central point, he appears to suggest—I absolutely refute this—that it is a deliberate act to delay the release of the information. I could not have been clearer that that is not what is happening here. Surely even Mr Ross would accept that we have a responsibility to the individuals who are captured by the contempt of court protections to act responsibly and carry out due diligence to ensure that, in complying with the commissioner's instruction, we do not inadvertently create another problem, particularly for those individuals.

**Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab):** The minister has talked about this not being a deliberate act, but it must be, because the Government is withholding the information while it scrutinises it. The Government seems to be caught between the risk of a contempt of court and a statute. What advice was given as to which legal obligation it was not going to comply with?

**Graeme Dey:** This is not about not complying with a legal obligation. I do not expect to receive sympathy in the chamber, but the Government is between a rock and a hard place on the issue. On the one hand, the commissioner is threatening contempt of court because we are not complying with the timescale that he would like. On the other hand, if we rushed to do this and made an error, we would fall foul of contempt of court in another regard through the courts.

It is not a deliberate act to delay issuing the information, because we intend to issue it. We are simply taking the appropriate time to ensure that we comply with the ruling of the commissioner in a way that does not create difficulties for the individuals I have referenced.

## Business Motion

14:27

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):** The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-20557, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a timetable for stage 3 consideration of the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill. Any member who wishes to speak should press their request-to-speak button now.

*Motion moved,*

That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limits indicated, those time limits being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 3: 1 hour 25 minutes

Groups 4 to 5: 2 hours 55 minutes

Groups 6 to 8: 5 hours

Groups 9 to 11: 7 hours 15 minutes

Groups 12 to 15: 8 hours 50 minutes

Groups 16 to 19: 9 hours 50 minutes—[*Graeme Dey*]

14:27

**Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I rise to speak on the business motion. My issue with it is simple, and I will start with a quote from Winston Churchill, who said:

“democracy is the worst form of Government except all those other forms that have been tried from time to time”.— [Official Report, House of Commons, 11 November 1947; Vol 444, c 207.]

What we are doing here is part of the democratic process. My concern with the business motion, which was agreed to by the Parliamentary Bureau yesterday—when I was in the process of my four-hour drive down to the Parliament, and therefore unable to feed in my concerns on the timetable—is that it is difficult to understand how each of the timings have been worked out.

In the stage 3 debate that we had on the Land Reform (Scotland) Bill, I ended up with a considerable number of amendments in some groups. In one group, I had more than 30 amendments, yet I was given five minutes to speak to those 30 amendments.

There appears to be a repetition today. In group 5, I have 36 amendments. If I am given only five minutes to speak to those amendments, maths tells me that I have about eight seconds per amendment, during which I might just be able to

read out what the amendment says. On group 8, in which I have 26 amendments, the time is a little bit more generous, because I will have 11 seconds per amendment, so I might be able to explain what the first line of each amendment is about.

Presiding Officer, I know that, when you and the bureau sit down to work out the timings, you do so with care, to ensure that you comply with rule 9.8 of standing orders and, specifically, paragraph 4A(a), which is on enabling members to be

“given a right to speak on an amendment”

in the debate.

My concern is that I will be in a position where I have considerable numbers of amendments in a small number of groups and will not be able to explain them as I would hope to, which will not allow me to have the democratic process that I expect to have in this Parliament and that I believe people in Scotland expect to see when members stand up to speak and to express their views.

Presiding Officer, I would be grateful if, when we consider the motion moved by Mr Dey—which I do not intend to object to—I could be given some reassurance that, in groups where members have a considerable number of amendments, they will not be limited to eight seconds to speak to each amendment.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the minister to respond on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau.

14:30

**The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey):** The timings provided are the result of detailed work conducted by Parliament staff, and business managers were of the view that the timings strike the right balance between allowing the proper airing of amendments and going beyond that. It is, of course, for the chair—and we should all respect the authority of the chair—to determine how each group of amendments, and indeed the entire stage 3 process, is conducted.

On the accuracy of the predicted timings and of the time offered, I draw the member’s attention to last week’s stage 3 business, when the predicted timings were accurate almost to the minute and, indeed, also catered for one of his colleagues taking 17 minutes to make a single spoken contribution. I think I speak for the majority of those here when I express the view that I hope we will avoid any contributions of a similar length today or tomorrow, from either Mr Mountain or anyone else, but I have confidence that, in the charring and handling of the stage 3 process, he, and all members, will be afforded the appropriate opportunity to have their say.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that motion S6M-20557, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a timetable for stage 3 consideration of the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill, be agreed to.

*Motion agreed to,*

That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limits indicated, those time limits being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 3:	1 hour 25 minutes
Groups 4 to 5:	2 hours 55 minutes
Groups 6 to 8:	5 hours
Groups 9 to 11:	7 hours 15 minutes
Groups 12 to 15:	8 hours 50 minutes
Groups 16 to 19:	9 hours 50 minutes

## Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

14:31

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2—that is, Scottish Parliament bill 59A—the marshalled list and the groupings of amendments. The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for around five minutes if there is a division. The period of voting for the division will be 30 seconds.

Members who wish to speak in the debate on an amendment should press their request-to-speak button or enter RTS in the chat function as soon as an amendment is called.

Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

### Section 1—Targets for improving biodiversity

**The Presiding Officer:** Group 1 is on targets for improving biodiversity. Amendment 22, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, is grouped with amendments 23, 63, 46, 47, 24, 64 to 67, 25 to 27 and 68 to 70.

**Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD):** Amendment 22 would place an obligation on our public bodies and office-holders to take the biodiversity targets into account when they are fulfilling their public sector biodiversity duty. By linking that biodiversity duty with the new statutory targets, amendment 22 would ensure that the whole public sector is aligned behind our biodiversity ambitions, something that we would all agree is essential. That would reduce the risk of having a top-down framework and would ensure that the delivery of those ambitions is considered across the public sector.

For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 22. I will leave other members to speak to the other amendments in the group.

I move amendment 22.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Lorna Slater to speak to amendment 23 and other amendments in the group.

**Lorna Slater (Lothian) (Green):** Amendment 23 reflects the fact that Scotland has already signed up to a number of international commitments that aim to tackle the biodiversity crisis, including the United Nations Convention on Biological Diversity. It is therefore entirely appropriate that those commitments are

referenced as key purposes for our domestic nature targets. Amendment 23 would add supporting and measuring progress on implementing the convention as a purpose of those targets, alongside our domestic biodiversity strategy and duty. The aim is to help to align our domestic priorities with our prior international commitments and to ensure that we are taking the right actions to halt biodiversity loss by 2030 and to substantially restore nature by 2045.

For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 23.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Tim Eagle to speak to amendment 63 and other amendments in the group.

**Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** In beginning what will be, I think, 10 hours or so in the chamber, I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests.

As I set out at stage 2, Scotland's future food security relies on getting the right careful balance. We must ensure that domestic supply can meet demand and that we do not drift into an overreliance on imported food. The vulnerability of our current position was underlined last year by the Scottish Association of Meat Wholesalers, which warned that beef supplies had reached a critical point. Quality Meat Scotland has also been clear that meeting future demand will require more cows and not fewer, estimating that Scotland needs around 80,000 additional animals.

My amendment 63 would strengthen the bill by requiring ministers, when setting targets under section 1, to have proper regard to the importance of local food production and domestic food security. It would place a clear duty on ministers to support local food producers and to consider the impacts of targets on Scotland's future ability to produce food. Importantly, the amendment would help to ensure that environmental targets do not result in a decline in beef and dairy herd numbers or create incentives that encourage a reduction in red meat and dairy consumption.

In an increasingly uncertain world, I cannot overstate the importance of protecting Scotland's food producers. Ensuring that our country can feed itself is not optional—it is a core responsibility of any Government.

**Mercedes Villalba (North East Scotland) (Lab):** I have three amendments in the group. Amendments 46 and 47 seek to separate the target topic of habitat condition and habitat extent into two distinct topics. I am concerned that the bill allows for one or the other to be sufficient to meet a target, rather than requiring both to be included. That would mean that the condition of a habitat could decline while the extent grows or that the

extent could shrink while the condition improves, and those situations would still satisfy the target.

I lodged similar amendments at stage 2, which the Government could not support due to the inclusion of the phrase “conservation importance”. The Cabinet Secretary for Climate Action and Energy stated:

“I understand why Ms Villalba lodged amendments 19 and 20, but I am concerned that they would have the effect of narrowing the target topic by restricting it to habitats of conservation importance ... The term “conservation importance”, which is used in the amendments, would limit the scope of habitats in that target topic and, in turn, the available set of indicators that could be used to set targets against. On that basis, I ask the committee not to agree to amendments 19 and 20.”—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 19 November 2025; c 16.]

I therefore did not move those amendments at stage 2. Instead, I have worked on them to remove the phrasing that was highlighted and I have brought them back at stage 3, where I hope to receive Scottish Government support for them.

Amendment 70 addresses some of the concerns that I expressed at stage 2 about ensuring that, if there is a need for a new independent review body to be appointed to monitor the Scottish Government’s progress on targets, appropriate safeguards are in place. Accordingly, amendment 70 seeks to add some additional qualifications to the power in proposed new section 2G(4) of the Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004, so that any new body must be an independent public body or office-holder.

Although I understand that there is no intention at this time for that function to be carried out by anyone other than Environmental Standards Scotland, it is important that we, as a responsible and forward-looking Parliament, future proof the power. The restrictions seek to place appropriate limits on the powers of any future Government by ensuring that the crucial independent review body function may be carried out only by an independent public body.

I put on the record my thanks to Scottish Government officials for working constructively with me on the wording of amendment 70, and my thanks to the legislation team for their support on amendments 46 and 47. I look forward to hearing the cabinet secretary’s response, particularly with regard to amendments 46 and 47, and I urge all members to support all my amendments in the group.

**John Mason (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind):** I will focus on my amendments in the group. As members may be aware, their subject is the sheep on St Kilda and especially on the main island of Hirta. That subject landed on my desk recently out of pretty well nowhere.

I have visited St Kilda in the past and I consider the islands right up there with other amazing natural phenomena around the world, such as Everest and Victoria falls, which I have also seen. In recent months, however, both BBC Alba and *The Herald* have reported on the numbers of sheep that are starving to death on the islands each year, with no human intervention whatsoever. From reports that I hear, perhaps 600 sheep are starving to death each year, or 800 if lambs are included, and that has been the case every year for the past 20 years, on average. That is roughly one third of the population on the islands. I wonder whether the sheep farmers among us find that acceptable.

**Tim Eagle:** As a sheep farmer, I do not find that acceptable. I have discussed the topic at length with the National Trust for Scotland, and my understanding is that it is carrying out a full review and working with the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission, and that a press release will come out in the next few months, following that review. Does John Mason recognise that his amendments are a bit premature and that we should wait for that first?

**John Mason:** We did not even get that much assurance from the Government on 8 January, when I raised the issue, and it is because of the Government’s poor response on that date that I have lodged my amendments in this group, at the suggestion of one of my colleagues, who shall remain nameless.

I also spoke to the National Trust for Scotland. Its argument, and that of the Government, is that the sheep are wild, not feral, so are not covered by the Animal Health and Welfare Act (Scotland) Act 2006. However, one of the definitions of a protected animal in the 2006 act is that it is

“of a kind ... commonly domesticated in the British Islands”.

Sheep are definitely in that category, in my opinion and according to the legal advice that I and the Government have received. I have to say that I was disappointed in the Government’s previous response, which did virtually nothing but restate the Government’s position, which is why I lodged my amendments.

I confess that I do not generally agree with amendments appearing out of the blue at stage 3; however, given that I am retiring shortly, I might as well break that rule. [*Laughter.*]

My key argument is twofold. First, public expectations about animal welfare have moved on since the 1930s, when people left St Kilda and its sheep were moved to Hirta and, effectively, abandoned there. It is my contention that, if those sheep were kept in a field in Angus or Perthshire by Jim Fairlie, Douglas Ross, Edward Mountain or Tim Eagle, that would not be acceptable.

Secondly, the island itself is suffering from too many sheep and serious overgrazing. Last summer, I visited Mingulay, which people left in around 1912 and from which all sheep and cattle have been removed. The difference is stark. Mingulay is covered in long grass and other plants, and it seems to be an environment that supports a wide range of flora and fauna. I argue, therefore, that not just the sheep on Hirta are suffering; the island itself is suffering from the sheep. Perhaps that is the most relevant point when it comes to the bill.

There are comparisons to other locations where sheep and goats are, largely, allowed to live in a wild state but are subject to some human intervention. One is the island of Lundy, off the north coast of Devon, which I have also visited and to which, I understand, some of the same Soay sheep were relocated in 1942. There, sheep continue to be feral but now live in a fairly wild state. However, there is a regular cull, in order to prevent the problems of overpopulation and starvation that are in St Kilda.

Another example of limited intervention is the feral goats that live in the Great Orme, a hill beside Llandudno in north Wales. I happen to be familiar with that, as my brother is one of the local vets. Members might have seen pictures of those goats in the town. Again, the goats are left largely to themselves. However, there is some human intervention: for example, one got stuck in a cave, was tranquilised and had its horns trimmed.

I have been contacted by a variety of people since my question was asked, including vets in the Western Isles, who have long sought to raise the issue, and the National Trust for Scotland, which arranged a call with me last week and confirmed that it is carrying out a review, as Tim Eagle said. I believe that the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission is also conducting a review, and that the National Trust for Scotland will liaise with it.

I am looking for the Government's acknowledgement that those sheep are not wild animals; its acceptance that sheep are dying of starvation in unacceptable numbers; and its agreement that the status quo is not an option. If I get those assurances, I will probably not move amendment 24.

**Douglas Lumsden (North East Scotland) (Con):** I will speak only to amendment 64, which relates to the impact of new energy infrastructure on our biodiversity. I have spoken many a time in the Parliament about the impact of monster pylons, substations and battery storage on our communities and on people's lives, homes and health. All of that infrastructure has an impact on people; however, it also has an impact on our countryside and our tourism industry.

At present, the devolved Government is content to bury its head in the sand and ignore the damage that is caused by that energy infrastructure—to turn a blind eye and look the other way. However, damage is being caused. That infrastructure can have a huge impact on surrounding areas of distinct natural significance and plant life, as well as disrupting the local bird population. That needs to be fully understood and reported on. My amendment seeks to do just that.

The Government will probably bring out the tired lines that, “Energy infrastructure is reserved,” or, “There's nothing we can do.” However, protecting our countryside is devolved, planning is devolved and protecting our communities is devolved. Let us start to understand better the damage that is being caused, so that we can make informed decisions.

14:45

**Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab):** Like colleagues, I reflect that we will be here for some time. I have lodged my amendments 65, 67, 68 and 69, in this group, to ensure that the Scottish Government will follow through on the original aims of the bill and meet the targets that have been set out. I thank Scottish Environment LINK and the Marine Conservation Society for their continued support in crafting and engaging on those amendments.

Many of Scotland's protected sites, particularly marine protected areas, remain in unfavourable condition. Without an explicit target in relation to them, there is a risk that their restoration will be overshadowed by broader or more achievable biodiversity gains elsewhere. I want to enable the Parliament to come back and focus on that issue again.

It has been argued that targets relating to protected sites could be set under the existing target topics of habitat condition or extent, but there is no requirement that protected areas will be prioritised, and no timescale is provided for setting such a target. That is why I lodged amendment 65.

My other amendments in the group would ensure that there are no delays in those targets being met. Scotland has committed to halting nature loss by 2030. Without a deadline, there is no guarantee that targets will be introduced in time to influence early delivery of that commitment. Without explicit timelines in legislation, we need to know what the Scottish Government will do to ensure timely implementation of the bill.

I argue that those are not huge asks of my colleagues. They will make improvement of protected sites a clear statutory priority, increase transparency and accountability, align the bill with

Scotland's European Union-derived and international nature commitments, and strengthen protection for MPAs across environmental legislation.

I say to the cabinet secretary and her colleagues that the engagement of stakeholders has been incredibly strong, even between stage 2 and today's debate. I hope that the Scottish Government will reflect and act on this matter constructively, and that is why I ask my colleagues for their support on these amendments. This issue needs to be centre stage.

**Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green):** The Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill is absolutely essential for Scotland. Yesterday, I was talking to a climate scientist who told me that, when we consider the relative weighting of climate and nature, nature must be two thirds when it comes to action. He said that we know what we need to do on climate, so it is nature that we must prioritise.

I have brought back just two amendments at stage 3, knowing that this will be a busy debate. One is in this grouping, and I will take a little time to talk about it now. The other is in a much later grouping, and I am grateful for the Scottish Government's work on it.

Amendment 66 is one of several that have been lodged by Opposition MSPs across the chamber that highlight the Government's repeated delays and non-delivery of measures to improve our beleaguered inshore ecosystems and inshore economies alike. The Scottish Government's track record on managing our inshore waters is close to non-existent, and both our marine environment and our fishing industry—especially the low-impact sector—are suffering as a result. The ink had barely dried on stage 2 when the cabinet secretary announced the cancellation of the long-delayed consultation on inshore MPAs and priority marine feature measures during this parliamentary session. That means that, realistically, a new consultation will not materialise any time before 2027, which adds another two years of further degradation to what is already a decade-long delay in implementation.

Those are delays that our inshore waters cannot afford and that break repeated promises by the Government. On 11 November 2020, cabinet secretary Mairi Gougeon stated:

“Over the next 18 months, we will take forward fisheries management measures for a number of inshore MPAs and for 11 priority marine features outside MPAs.”—[*Official Report*, 11 November 2020; c 14.]

On 22 December 2022, minister Màiri McAllan stated:

“By 2024, we will complete the management measures for those MPAs, and we will work on the priority marine

features that are most at risk from bottom trawling.”—[*Official Report*, 22 December 2022; c 88.]

On 29 June 2023, cabinet secretary Màiri McAllan backtracked and stated:

“Inshore MPAs and priority marine features also require fisheries management measures. However, the complexity of the inshore area and the number of sites have meant that progress has been slower than was hoped—therefore, consultation on inshore measures will take place in 2024.”—[*Official Report*, 29 June 2023; c 32.]

Now, even that promise has been broken. The problem is broader than that cancelled consultation. Scotland currently has an array of environmental legislation, typically including duties on the Scottish ministers to produce strategies and plans that they could produce without the need for legislation.

In the marine space, it feels as though those strategies and plans are either at cross-purposes or siloed from one another, leading to each one being used as an excuse for inaction in the others. We might hear, for example, “Spatial management can't be considered here; that's for the inshore fisheries management improvement programme to look at,” even though the marine directorate has already told my committee that it would not consider it. We might hear, “That's a matter for the national marine plan 2,” or, “That's for the implementation of the future catching policy,” and so on.

A series of powerless and underfunded consultative bodies are being used as a smokescreen, from regional inshore fisheries groups to the inshore fisheries management and conservation groups. Those are all covers for the policy position, which is never said explicitly by ministers, that measures to protect our most precious marine environments or to support low-impact fishing will almost always be rejected if it means closing a square kilometre of sea to dredging and trawling.

The following illustrate this Government's record: the inshore MPA and PMF consultation—delayed. The national marine plan 2—delayed. The inshore fisheries management improvement programme—delayed. The fisheries management plans—delayed. The biodiversity strategy—not delivered. The planned marine and coastal restoration plan—delayed. The Government cannot claim that the bill is a success story, given this backdrop of policy inaction and failures.

The bill makes no mention whatsoever of the marine environment. My impression is that, because 37 per cent of Scotland's seas are designated for protection, the Government sees the job as done. No matter what proportion it is, that 37 per cent is protected only on paper. It is not good enough just to set targets; it is action that we desperately need for the inshore. So far, this

Government is failing our seas, and the Parliament's job now is to turn that around.

**Mark Ruskell (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green):** I thank Ariane Burgess for highlighting a major gap in the bill. I will speak to amendment 27. The intention of my stage 2 amendment on target-setting statements was to ensure that the Parliament was given reassurance about the approach that ministers would take to meet the targets. However, I have discussed with the cabinet secretary the challenges around providing exact costings for biodiversity action before plans to meet targets have been fully developed.

There are difficulties in setting out the full costs of the approach as my amendment detailed, so I am proposing to replace that with a requirement that ministers set out how the approach to meeting targets is to be funded. It is important to set out the broad investment opportunities for both public and private investment to deliver nature restoration. The wording in the amendment will ensure that there is scrutiny of the Government's approach to funding the activities required to meet targets, but at an appropriate level of detail.

**Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests—I own part of a family farm in Moray. I should also declare that I have been managing the environment on that farm and the local river that runs through it for 45 years. It was some 50 years ago that I first embarked on deer management, and I look forward to going back to that in April, when this session of Parliament is dissolved.

I will speak to amendments 24 to 26, which have been lodged by John Mason. They are interesting amendments, and I have some sympathy with amendment 24. It concerns the control of feral species, which are defined as animals

"in a wild state ... after escape from captivity or domestication."

That is important, as it is something that, to my mind, we have not done properly in Scotland for some time. If we had done that, we would perhaps not now have the fallow deer and many of the other types of deer that are starting to move up from the Borders, nor would we have species such as the ruddy duck—or rather, we would have them, but we would be able to control them.

However, I am concerned about the amendment's use of the term "feral species", because the definition is quite wide ranging. Mr Mason may not have intended to bring in some of the animals that the term could cover. For example, it could be argued that "feral species" would include cats that have been released into the countryside, which could become feral and

could therefore be part of a management plan. That might or might not be a good thing. In the case of the Scottish wildcats that are being reintroduced across the Cairngorms, the control of feral cats would be important, but in other areas it might not be.

Amendments 25 and 26 relate specifically to the sheep on St Kilda. I think that Mr Mason, by lodging the amendments, has done this country a service by making sure that the owners are aware that the Parliament is considering the problems with the sheep on St Kilda in a sensible way. They need to be controlled, as lack of control and management will result in all sorts of problems such as increased suffering, disease and starvation. That is completely unacceptable, and it would be unacceptable if they were on a farm on the mainland.

I personally would not seek to press amendments 25 and 26 to a vote, because I think that the point has already been made. Nonetheless, I will be interested to hear the Government's response to amendment 24, because I think that the control of "feral species", and preventing them from multiplying with or challenging our wild species, is important.

**Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab):** I will speak briefly on amendment 66. Scottish Labour supports the amendment's aims, but we are concerned about setting an arbitrary target that would not take into account local circumstances. We have always argued for a local management approach, in which the seas are managed in the local interest, in the way that works best for the community.

We recognise that there are fishing boats that work further from home and that we need to enable them to fish in order to have fish for our markets, but we need to ensure that the seas are managed properly. Fishers already face challenges from other marine uses such as renewable energy, interconnectors and the like, so I do not think that setting an arbitrary target would work. We need to ensure that we manage the seas properly and that we do not leave that to happenstance, which is not helpful, but instead set a plan that would mean that everyone knows where they can fish and that works best for the environment.

**Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP):** I rise to speak on amendments 24 to 26, in the name of John Mason, who made a persuasive argument regarding the St Kilda sheep in particular. However, I also note Edward Mountain's comments, which are significant.

John Mason and I would argue that the St Kilda sheep should be considered not as wild but as

feral, given that their ancestors were a domestic flock. However, I note that the National Trust for Scotland, which is the responsible body and owns the animals, has noted that there is an issue with their welfare. I also note that the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission is now paying attention to that particular issue. In those circumstances—and there may be other failings in the amendments—it might be premature to import them into this particular bill. I note that John Mason may, subject to what is said in reply, consider them to be probing amendments, but I thank him for bringing the issue to the attention of the chamber, and I hope that we make progress on it.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Climate Action and Energy (Gillian Martin):** I will speak to amendment 22, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, and amendment 23, in the name of Lorna Slater. I listened to members' views at stage 2, and I am pleased that we have been able to work together to make these changes to our public sector biodiversity duty and the purpose of the targets. I am grateful to Beatrice Wishart and Lorna Slater for their constructive engagement on those matters. For that reason, I am happy to support amendments 22 and 23 as a means of strengthening the provisions in the bill.

15:00

Amendment 22 seeks to place an obligation on our public bodies to take into account the biodiversity targets when they are fulfilling their public sector biodiversity duty. I again make it clear that it is the responsibility of the Scottish ministers to ensure that the targets are met. Amendment 23 seeks to make it clear that a purpose of the targets must be to provide a means of supporting and measuring progress on implementing the Convention on Biological Diversity. For those reasons, I encourage members to support amendments 22 and 23.

On amendments 24 to 26, 46, 47 and 63 to 66, proposed new section 2C of the Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004 sets out three target topics under which the Scottish ministers must set statutory targets. Those topics have been recommended by our expert programme advisory group on the basis of careful scientific consideration, which I believe is of the utmost importance on such matters.

I again reassure members that, when we set the biodiversity targets by regulations, they will be specific, measurable targets. The appropriate place for that level of detail is in secondary legislation that is properly informed by expert scientific advice.

I also point out that, if any of the proposals for additional target topics or targets were to be

included in the bill, that would mean not only deviating from the science, but that careful consideration would need to be given to how they fitted in with the existing proposed suite of targets and how they could be appropriately measured. That would take a significant period of time, which would mean that ministers would be delayed in their ability to set targets, given the requirement in proposed new section 2C(2)(a) of the 2004 act, under which ministers must set at least one target in respect of each topic. That is not a position that we want to be in, and I know that stakeholders are rightly concerned about that. Given that we are in a nature emergency, none of us wants there to be any delays in taking forward this important work.

John Mason's amendments 24 to 26 deal with a very specific matter in relation to the management of feral species—specifically, St Kilda sheep. I understand Mr Mason's concerns about that matter, and I assure him that the Scottish Government is taking the issue very seriously. I understand that Mr Fairlie, in his capacity as agriculture minister, has been engaging directly on the matter. It is not appropriate for Scotland-wide biodiversity targets to be used as a vehicle for tackling such a specific matter; that is not the way to deal with the issue. The National Trust for Scotland, which is the owner of St Kilda, is undertaking a full review of concerns that there is suffering among the sheep on St Kilda. The NTS is hoping to inspect the sheep in the next few weeks as part of that review.

**John Mason:** The cabinet secretary says that the Scottish Government is taking the matter seriously. Could she not go a little further than that and say that the status quo is not acceptable?

**Gillian Martin:** The National Trust for Scotland is the owner of St Kilda, so it is reviewing the issue. I said that the NTS is hoping to inspect the sheep in the next few weeks as part of the review. I imagine that that review will come up with an analysis of the condition of the sheep. I am not going to speak on behalf of the National Trust for Scotland. Indeed, the Government is not carrying out a review, so I cannot give any assessment of the condition of the sheep. As Tim Eagle pointed out, it is right that we wait for the outcome of that review. The NTS will be inspecting the sheep over the next few weeks.

**Edward Mountain:** Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

**Gillian Martin:** I will take Mr Mountain's intervention in a second.

In addition, the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission, which is an independent panel of experts that provides advice to the Scottish Government, is convening a short-life working group to consider the issue of the sheep, and we

will carefully consider any recommendations that it makes in the next three to four months.

**Edward Mountain:** In the hope of helping the cabinet secretary, I will say that if the sheep were on a farm such as mine and they were inspected and found to be in poor health, dying of starvation or suffering illness, the first thing that would happen is that there would be an inspection by the department, which would raise action against me. In order to allow Mr Mason not to move his amendments, could the cabinet secretary indicate to him that she will ensure that the department takes an interest in the issue and ensures that there is no suffering?

**Gillian Martin:** I believe that I have already said that. The Scottish Animal Welfare Commission, which I mentioned, is convening a short-life working group, and the Government will carefully consider any recommendations that it makes in the next three to four months. I do not know whether Mr Mountain heard me say that just before I invited him to intervene.

On that basis, I believe that it would be better to wait until the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission has reported before deciding what steps to take. I know that Mr Fairlie will take its recommendations seriously.

Therefore, I ask Mr Mason not to move amendments 24 to 26, as I assure him that the Scottish Government will give full consideration to any recommendations that the Scottish Animal Welfare Commission makes.

I come to amendments 46 and 47, which were lodged by Ms Villalba. Those amendments are unnecessary. As I have previously set out, and as is detailed in the policy memorandum,

“Habitat condition and extent includes the quality and/or extent of habitat types of importance to Scotland, including protected habitats.”

I reiterate that the target topics in the bill have been carefully selected through a robust science-led approach and on the basis of advice from the biodiversity programme advisory group and NatureScot. The target topics that are included in the bill are wide and overarching enough to allow a variety of targets to be set under each topic. Therefore, there is no need to add specific habitat types, because they are already covered in the legislation.

**Mercedes Villalba:** The cabinet secretary said that the amendments are not necessary because their provisions are already covered in the bill. Condition and extent are covered as a target topic, but they are covered together. The bill refers to “condition or extent”, not condition and extent. That suggests that, when targets are set for a habitat, it will be either the condition or the extent that will be assessed. With my amendments, I aim

to separate out those two distinct features of a habitat.

I think that it is the cabinet secretary’s intention to have targets for a habitat’s condition and its extent. That would ensure that we would avoid the example that I outlined when I spoke to my amendments, whereby there could be a habitat that improves in condition and declines in extent but still technically meets the target.

**Gillian Martin:** I apologise if my quote from the policy memorandum was not clear. I will say it again:

“Habitat condition and extent includes the quality and/or extent of habitat types”.

That is fairly encompassing.

Tim Eagle’s amendment 63 on targets for food production—

**Mercedes Villalba:** Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

**Gillian Martin:** I have moved on to amendment 63.

As I stated clearly during stage 2 when we considered an almost identical amendment, which was not agreed to by the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, food production and nature restoration

“are inextricably linked and co-exist.”—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 19 November 2025; c 37.]

I was crystal clear that the Scottish Government has no policy of reducing livestock numbers. In stark contrast to other parts of the United Kingdom, we provide a range of support to our livestock producers.

In relation to amendment 64, the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee debated and rejected that exact amendment wording at stage 2, so I am not convinced that repeating the amendment today is the best use of anyone’s time. I reiterate the statement that I made at stage 2, which was that Mr Lumsden’s amendment

“falls outside the scope of statutory biodiversity targets for the purposes of conservation.”—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 19 November 2025; c 48.]

I hope that members will reject the amendment, as they did at stage 2.

**Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** If the cabinet secretary feels that amendments should be rejected at stage 3 when they were rejected at stage 2, could the same argument not apply when the Government is defeated at stage 2 and then lodges amendments at stage 3 to overrule the committee’s decision?

**Gillian Martin:** My comments are not about the process; they are to remind members that Mr Lumsden’s amendment falls outside the scope of

statutory biodiversity targets and was defeated at stage 2. I recommend that it be defeated again at stage 3.

Amendment 65, in the name of Sarah Boyack, seeks to add something to the bill that is already there, so it is not necessary. The first target topic is

“the condition or extent of any habitat”.

That topic already encompasses the condition, extent and quality of any habitat, including in protected areas. More importantly, the topic takes into account habitats outside of those protected areas.

I come to amendment 66, in the name of Ariane Burgess. I am unclear why Ms Burgess lodged amendment 66, given that it is essentially a repeat of amendments that were not agreed to at stage 2. I have already noted the impracticalities of including niche and highly specific targets in the bill. I do not believe that the addition of yet further detail is appropriate. I also note the significant economic disruption that such an amendment would cause to Scotland’s fishing fleet without proper analysis and an evidence base. I cannot support the inclusion of such a sweeping requirement that singles out one sector in this way.

I urge members not to move amendments 24, 25, 26, 46, 47, 63, 64, 65 and 66.

**Ariane Burgess:** I hear the cabinet secretary’s point that similar forms of my amendment 66 were lodged at stage 2. However, I lodged amendment 66 because I believe that we in this Parliament must take on board the urgent and desperate situation in our inshore waters. There is nothing about that in a piece of legislation that is called the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill. We have signed up to restoring and protecting 30 per cent of Scotland’s land and seas by 2030, yet we are not doing anything in the marine space.

I take the cabinet secretary’s point that many other measures are in place, but the Parliament needs a serious commitment on what we are doing to protect our inshore waters, to manage them on an ecosystem basis, to safeguard the good environmental status of our seabeds and to ensure that small-scale artisanal fishers, such as creelers and scallop hand divers, are protected. It is well known that, in small spaces such as Lamlash Bay, the spillover effect is incredible.

We absolutely need to get on board with the need for action. I lodged amendment 66 because we are in a state of emergency. As a Parliament, we must get into the ambulance and do something about it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing):** I encourage members to make their

interventions a wee bit briefer than that, otherwise we will be here until the early hours of the morning.

**Gillian Martin:** I understand Ms Burgess’s passion on the issue and her view that there is a need for action. However, not every inshore fisheries area is the same as Lamlash Bay. That is a great example of a no-take zone, and it would be nice to see other areas opt to do that, too, but introducing fisheries management measures in MPAs and PMFs is still a Government priority.

Amendment 67, in the name of Sarah Boyack, would require target regulations to be laid within 12 months of royal assent. It would not be practicably possible to carry out meaningful consultation and adequately reflect on the outcomes of that consultation and draft regulations within that timescale, especially considering the upcoming election period.

I assure members of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, the chamber and stakeholders that it remains the Government’s intention to introduce nature targets as soon as practicably possible. However, amendment 67 would result in the creation of rushed targets rather than carefully considered targets that are informed by meaningful consultation. For that reason, I encourage members not to support amendment 67.

I appreciate the intentions behind amendments 68 and 69, which were also lodged by Sarah Boyack, which attempt to mirror the approach that is taken in the climate change legislation. They are intended to create a mechanism similar to climate change catch-up reports. I must be clear that, as drafted, the amendments would not achieve the intended effect.

We have deliberately taken a different approach to biodiversity targets, because of the inherent differences between the two subjects. There is no single apex target for biodiversity. The actions that are required to achieve biodiversity targets will often be cumulative and complex. It is not feasible to think that, if we identify a target that will not be met, we could take action within 12 months that would have the effect of changing our biodiversity to such an extent that the target would be back on track—in most cases, it would take an awful lot longer than that. As I said, biodiversity is complex and multifaceted and recovery takes time. It also takes a lot more time to measure outcomes than is possible with emissions reduction.

The same approach that is set out in the climate change legislation simply will not work. However, that does not mean that there is no accountability under the target provisions, which will achieve the same effect as is intended through amendments 68 and 69. There are sufficient safeguards and

comprehensive accountability mechanisms in the target provisions in proposed new sections 2CA, 2D(4) and 2E of the 2004 act, which are intended to hold ministers to account by requiring them to report on progress in meeting targets. That will not be improved or strengthened by amendments 68 and 69. Therefore, I ask members to oppose them.

15:15

I am grateful to Mark Ruskell for his willingness to work with me on amendment 27, which I encourage members to support.

I support amendment 70, and I am grateful for Mercedes Villalba's engagement on the issue. I reiterate that I do not envisage that any changes will be required when it comes to nominating ESS to undertake the role of the independent review body, but I appreciate the concerns that were raised with me. As such, the amendment is intended to act as a safeguard to ensure that the crucial independent review body function can be carried out only by an independent public body.

**Mercedes Villalba:** I am grateful for the cabinet secretary's support for my amendment 70.

To take her back to amendments 46 and 47, she referred to the policy memorandum as a basis for rejecting those amendments. However, the bill clearly says that one of the topics is

"the condition or extent of any habitat",

not the condition and extent, as the cabinet secretary said. On that basis, will she reconsider her position on my amendments 46 and 47?

**Gillian Martin:** I will not reconsider it, because I believe that the stated intention of the wording in the bill is already comprehensive, so it is not an issue that needs to be resolved.

That is me finished.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Beatrice Wishart to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 22.

**Beatrice Wishart:** I have nothing further to say. I press amendment 22.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 22 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

As this is the first division of stage 3, I suspend the meeting for around five minutes to allow members to access the digital voting system.

15:17

*Meeting suspended.*

15:23

*On resuming—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We will proceed with the division on amendment 22. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**The Minister for Drugs and Alcohol Policy and Sport (Maree Todd):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect to the voting system. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Todd. Your vote will be recorded.

**Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Ind):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was not able to connect to the voting system. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Balfour. Your vote will be recorded.

**Sharon Dowe (South Scotland) (Con):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Dowe. Your vote will be recorded.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 69, Against 43, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 22 agreed to.*

*Amendment 23 moved—[Lorna Slater].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 23 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Edward Mountain:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My device would not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Mountain. Your vote will be recorded.

**Sarah Boyack:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I have just checked and it did work, but it asked me twice to vote.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I believe that your vote was recorded, Ms Boyack.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)

Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)

Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 85, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 23 agreed to.*

*Amendment 63 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 63 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 44, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 63 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 46 moved—[Mercedes Villalba].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 46 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 46 disagreed to.*

15:30

*Amendment 47 moved—[Mercedes Villalba].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 47 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Jenny Gilruth):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Gilruth. Your vote will be recorded.

**For**

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 47 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 24 not moved.*

*Amendment 64 moved—[Douglas Lumsden].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 64 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and

Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 64 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 65 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 65 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

## For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

## Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 65 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 66 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 66 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)

Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Abstentions

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 7, Against 92, Abstentions 13.

*Amendment 66 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 67 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 67 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**Jenny Gilruth:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Gilruth. Your vote will be recorded.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)

Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 67 disagreed to.*

*Amendments 25 and 26 not moved.*

*Amendment 27 moved—[Mark Ruskell]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 68 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 68 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)

Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)

Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 48, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 68 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 69 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 69 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)

Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 69 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 70 moved—[Mercedes Villalba].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 70 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)

McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 85, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 70 agreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We come to group 2, on the meaning of public authority et cetera in the Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004.

Amendment 29, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 35 to 39.

**Gillian Martin:** The amendments in this group are technical amendments, the purpose of which is to provide additional clarification to a provision in section 34 of the bill as introduced. Section 34 replaced the definition of a

“public body or office holder”

in section 58 of the Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004 with a provision to the effect that the 2004 act does not apply to the exercise of functions by public bodies and office holders other than in areas of devolved competence and

“in or as regards Scotland”.

The purpose of section 34 was to be clear about the extent of the definition, because the definition of a

“public body or office holder”

in the 2004 act was non-exhaustive and we were concerned that that could lead to possible confusion as to who has duties under that act.

My amendments 29, 35 and 39 further refine that definition to provide greater clarity as to what constitutes a

“public body or office holder”

by clarifying the extent of the functions of such bodies or office-holders under the 2004 act. That has been done in response to feedback about the potential unintended consequences of how the provisions would interact with part 2 of the 2004 act and with the protection of sites of special scientific interest. My intention is for the level of protection currently afforded to SSSIs to be unchanged by this bill, and my amendments will ensure that that is achieved. Section 34, as amended by the amendments in group 2, simply sets that out explicitly, for the purpose of making the 2004 act easier to read by laypeople and by the bodies and office holders upon whom

functions are imposed under the terms of the 2004 act.

I move amendment 29.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** No other members have pressed their request-to-speak buttons.

**Gillian Martin:** I have nothing further to add.

*Amendment 29 agreed to.*

### **Section 1B—Environmental protection requirement**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 3 is on habitats regulations and the environmental protection requirement. Amendment 30, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 31, 31A, 31B and 44.

15:45

**Gillian Martin:** I will speak to my amendments 30 and 44, which are minor technical amendments, before turning to the rest of the amendments in the group.

Amendment 30 will remove a redundant provision from the bill. Part 1B of the bill was agreed to at stage 2, and the intention was for the provision in that part to apply to part 2. However, as the entirety of part 2 was removed at stage 2, that provision now has no practical effect and is therefore unnecessary.

Amendment 44 will update the bill’s long title by omitting the reference to a power to modify environmental impact assessments and habitats regulations, as that power was removed from the bill by amendment at stage 2. For those reasons, I ask members to support amendments 30 and 44.

I understand and appreciate the intentions behind Mark Ruskell’s amendment 31 and Rhoda Grant’s amendments 31A and 31B. I know that they are well meaning and that the intention is simply to seek to ensure that our protected areas are delivering for biodiversity. Regrettably, however, the obligation that the amendments would impose on policy officials in the Scottish Government would be significant and administratively burdensome.

Amendment 31 would require guidance to be published on both the interpretation and implementation of the habitats regulations. Those regulations are far reaching as they cover a wide range of subject matters over and above our protected sites, and a large volume of guidance has already been produced by a range of bodies. Amendment 31 would require the Government to produce new guidance on every aspect of the habitats regulations and, in doing so, to review all the existing guidance. My concern is that that

significant undertaking would risk diverting resources away from tackling the things that we know will deliver the biggest benefits for nature in order to produce guidance in areas where it was not needed. I am sure that that is not the intention behind the amendments, but I have said many times during the passage of the bill that I want the Government to focus on delivery and not to needlessly divert resources from that.

Amendment 31B would require the establishment of an independent working group to provide advice to ministers on guidance. Although I cannot support amendments 31, 31A and 31B, given their very wide scope, I welcome the suggestion that a working group be established to provide ministers with advice on how we can make our protected sites more effective. I also agree that it would be helpful to consult on any new guidance, to ensure that we obtain the views of a wide range of organisations and individuals who are involved with our protected sites.

I am grateful to Mark Ruskell and Rhoda Grant, as well as stakeholders such as Scottish Environment LINK and the Woodland Trust, for their constructive engagement on those issues in advance of today's stage 3 proceedings and for their willingness to work with the Government on a solution in the light of the concerns that were raised. If Mark Ruskell and Rhoda Grant are willing to not move their amendments, I will commit to establishing a short-life working group in 2026, which will be formed of independent experts with appropriate ecological expertise. The group will consider where we need new guidance on the habitats regulations and will provide advice to ministers on where that guidance will help us to achieve our biodiversity ambitions. Once that advice is received, I will consult on it to ensure that everyone with an interest has the opportunity to comment.

I move amendment 30.

**Mark Ruskell:** A majority of the committee agreed that there were problems with part 2 of the bill as introduced. It would have given ministers extensive powers to rewrite environmental protections, including the habitats regulations, and there was a lack of clarity from the Government about why such extensive powers were needed. The committee was given few clear examples of how the new powers would be used or what problems they would solve. Members were asked to put a lot of trust not only in this Government but in all future Governments that the powers would be used wisely. As a result, a majority of members voted to remove part 2 from the bill, and I think that that was the right outcome.

However, it is clear from the months of evidence that the committee heard and from discussions with environmental stakeholders before and after

stage 2 that there is a lack of clarity on some of the guidance on the implementation of the habitats regulations. The first guidance came into effect in the 1990s. Times have changed and environmental priorities have evolved, and the Government, its agencies and the huge range of land managers increasingly want to take forward broader nature restoration projects. With the existing habs regs being based on the protection of specific species, there have been some instances where those different aims have conflicted. Questions have been raised about how much flexibility exists under the current habitats regulations to allow for restoration, such as tree planting on river banks, to take place on sites that might be protected for species such as the wild salmon.

The intention behind amendment 31 was to require the Government to review the existing regulations guidance with the new environmental goals in mind, to establish what degree of flexibility exists within the guidance without taking the original approach of opening up the entire habitats regulations to broad changes at ministerial discretion. It would be a nutcracker to crack a nut, rather than a sledgehammer. I welcome the comments from the Cabinet Secretary for Climate Action and Energy, particularly on the setting up of a working group to look in detail at that issue specifically. That is very welcome, as is the timeframe that she has just outlined for that work. On that basis, I am content to not move amendment 31.

Amendment 31A would extend the timescale for review from one year to two years. On amendment 31B, I would not be opposed to the creation of an independent working group, but I would be concerned if there was not a more wide-ranging public consultation, which I think is needed. There was not a full consensus on part 2, particularly among environmental non-governmental organisations, and we would want there to be much more unity on what would be appropriate to change the guidance on the habs regs as we go forward. However, I do not intend to move amendment 31, and I am content with the commitments that the cabinet secretary has made with regard to moving the issue on.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Rhoda Grant joins us remotely.

**Rhoda Grant:** I will speak to my amendments 31A and 31B. As we have heard, some NGOs—such as the Woodland Trust Scotland—were concerned at the loss of part 2 of the bill. Although we realise that that part was not perfect, there was an intention to provide much-needed flexibility in protected site designation to enable nature recovery. When part 2 was removed, because other NGOs were concerned about its being far

too broad, the Woodland Trust sought to work with MSPs to develop a much more targeted set of powers to enable nature recovery or habitat restoration. However, we could not reach agreement with the NGOs, so I looked at strengthening Mark Ruskell's amendment instead.

We would want guidance to be comprehensive, detailed and impartial and to be based on the findings of an independent working group of experts. I think that that is what the cabinet secretary has agreed to do. We very much welcome that and hope to work with the cabinet secretary to make sure that that happens and that it fulfils the desires of all the NGOs, because flexibility is provided in some areas but not in others, so it would be good to have renewed guidance that provides the comfort that everybody needs but also makes restoring nature the priority.

**Edward Mountain:** I welcome the comments that have been made by the cabinet secretary and the work that has been put in by Mark Ruskell and Rhoda Grant.

The cabinet secretary has said that she will reconvene a group later in 2026. Amendment 31B includes the wording

"Ministers may appoint such persons as they consider to have an interest in the habitats regulations".

I think that most people would prefer it if the minister would agree to appoint people who do have an interest in the habitats regulations, not just the ones whom ministers choose. I would be grateful if the cabinet secretary could say that that is what will happen.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call the cabinet secretary to wind up.

**Gillian Martin:** I really do not have any comments to make.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 30 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Hoy. Your vote will be recorded.

**Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Russell. Your vote will be recorded.

## For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)

Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

#### Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division on amendment 30, in the name of Gillian Martin, is: For 86, Against 21, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 30 agreed to.*

#### After section 1B

*Amendment 31 not moved.*

#### Section 5—Aims of National Parks

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 4 is on national parks. Amendment 48, in the name of Emma Harper, is grouped with amendments 71 to 73, 32 and 74 to 77.

**Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP):** I will speak just to my amendment 48 in this group, because I do not want to delay proceedings by addressing other amendments.

Amendment 48 will amend the national park aims by introducing

“encouraging sustainable and regenerative agriculture”

to those aims. I believe that it is vital that we do everything that we can to promote and support sustainable and regenerative practices in our national parks. In particular, I recognise the important role that traditional farming systems have played in shaping and maintaining our landscapes. They are essential for managing those special places sustainably while supporting food production and enabling rural communities and businesses to thrive.

During the consultation on establishing a national park in Galloway, concerns were raised by some farmers, including dairy farmers, about how a national park would impact their businesses. Amendment 48 will demonstrate that we understand that sustainable and regenerative agriculture is really important to have among our aims and that farming is an integral part of our national parks. The amendment is about recognising those facts and signalling that integrated land use in national parks needs farming and farmers. We have already seen good examples of that understanding in the establishment of the Cairngorms future farming initiative and the resilient farm network initiative in Loch Lomond and the Trossachs national park. For those reasons, I ask members to support amendment 48.

I move amendment 48.

**Tim Eagle:** I have just one amendment—amendment 71—in this group.

An immediate concern of mine at stage 2 was that we were looking to change the aims of national parks, but we had never really done a formal review of them, which I felt we were lacking. Having said that, I thank the cabinet secretary for working with me on amendment 71, which will add “economic growth” to the aims for national parks. It was vital for me that the importance of economic growth to local populations was stated clearly in the bill. National parks are not only places of outstanding national beauty and heritage; they are also home to communities and businesses that rely on them for their livelihoods. I am keen to show that we support those communities. For that reason, I encourage members to support amendment 71.

**Sarah Boyack:** I have five amendments in the group. I feel strongly that they should be agreed to, because they will give us our chance to improve and strengthen our national parks for the long term.

It is appropriate that we are debating amendments in this group today. I am proud to have been the cabinet secretary to introduce the legislation on the establishment of our first two national parks, in the first session of the Parliament. Things have moved on since then,

and it is important that we take the opportunities presented by the bill to bring legislation on the parks up to speed. My amendment 72 would amend the national park aims to ensure that sustainable development, community prosperity, health and wellbeing, and the provision of housing for people who live and work in our national parks are all recognised as being part of those aims.

16:00

It is essential that national park authorities and other public bodies support the vibrant communities at the heart of our national parks, because the parks are not only areas of outstanding beauty but areas where people work and build their lives. At present, the national parks legislation does not specifically require ministers to seek expert advice on the rationale for national park designations before formally proposing a new national park. Many of us would have loved to see a third national park being introduced in Scotland, but lessons need to be learned.

I thank the cabinet secretary and her staff for their support in drafting my proposed amendments 73, 74 and 75, which I think will strengthen the legislation. Amendment 73 attempts to introduce a new requirement for ministers to seek advice from those whom they consider to have expertise relevant to the national park aims before making a national park proposal.

That would be good, because it would strengthen the proposals that a future Government could make. It would ensure that expert advice on the management needs of an area and how national park designation could help to address those needs was provided to ministers and would have to be considered before deciding whether to propose a new national park. It would also ensure that people had clear information about the rationale for establishing a national park, and it would help to inform people about what designation would mean in practice for local communities, businesses and the natural environment.

Currently, there is no definition of “cultural development” in the national parks legislation, so it is important that we address that, given that cultural development is now referenced in the national park aims. My amendments 74 and 75 attempt to do that by giving us a clear definition of cultural development, ensuring that

“the arts, tangible and intangible cultural heritage, creative industries, and activities which reflect”

the fantastic diversity and distinctiveness of an area that is being designated, and its communities, are all encompassed in the definition. The definition that is proposed in my

amendment also takes into account Scotland’s culture strategy and related policy statements.

Lastly, I am pushing the provisions of amendment 77 again. I raised them at stage 2. I think that clearer and simpler language about the duty to implement the park plans would underline the primacy of those park plans, which are developed through engagement with the public and with ministerial sign-off. That strengthened duty would help to ensure that the work of the public sector is more strategically aligned.

Taken together, the changes that I am proposing will embed sustainability, community benefit, cultural recognition and accountability at the heart of Scotland’s national parks, creating a more robust, transparent and socially grounded framework for their future management and designation, learning lessons from the two decades since we started discussing national parks and actually having them in Scotland.

**Mark Ruskell:** Section 3 of the National Parks (Scotland) Act 2000 currently sets out that ministers may require NatureScot or any other public body with relevant expertise to consider and report on a national park proposal. I believe, however, that ministers should have the flexibility to be able to appoint either an independent person or organisation or a public body as the reporter in that process, depending on what is considered most appropriate in the circumstances. My amendment 32 modifies the national parks legislation to provide that flexibility.

I will briefly address Sarah Boyack’s amendment 77. I believe that it is right that public bodies actively implement those national park plans. The amendment that she has lodged is very similar to amendments that I lodged at stage 2, and I hope that it can be reflected in the legislation.

**Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green):** My amendment 76, supported by Jackie Baillie, comes out of the experience of the save Loch Lomond campaign. Given the length of time of today’s proceedings, I am not going to recount the whole decade-long saga that has led us to this point, but I want to talk about what happened in September 2024, because that is when the board of Loch Lomond and the Trossachs National Park Authority made its decision on the Flamingo Land application. It made the decision at the end of a very long day, which had included a site visit in which local residents and any other interested parties were welcome to take part, and at the end of a public hearing in which not only residents and elected representatives such as ourselves but experts such as the Woodland Trust were able to make representations to the national park board so that it could make a decision in full possession of the facts.

The board, with those facts, unanimously rejected Flamingo Land's mega resort application. Flamingo Land appealed the decision, which it had every right to do. However, a Scottish Government official then made the decision to grant that appeal—that decision has since been reversed—having heard from absolutely no one in the local community; having spoken to none of the expert stakeholders; and, so far as I am aware, having not even engaged with the national park's own planning officers. That resulted in what I believe was a fundamental misunderstanding of the expert conclusions that the park itself had come to.

That is what has brought me to lodge my amendment 76. It is a simple amendment: it requires only that any major or national development within a national park's boundaries that goes to an appeal must be subject to a public hearing. It would not require a full public inquiry, although the option is there if necessary, but it would, at a minimum, require that any major or national development should be subject to a public hearing at the appeal stage before a decision is made.

It relates only to large significant developments. A public hearing would not be needed every time that someone in Luss wants a conservatory and the national park knocks them back—it is just for developments on the scale of Flamingo Land. Communities deserve the opportunity to have their say, and officials and ministers should have the opportunity to hear from experts, whether they are experts on the basis of living locally or experts on the subject matter under discussion.

The amendment would make a simple change and would not tie anyone's hands in relation to the outcome: an appeal could be rejected or granted. It would simply ensure that the voices of key stakeholders are heard, because officials are not infallible and it is important to hear from those who have direct knowledge of the application at hand. It also recognises that our national parks are special and we should apply slightly higher standards for major national developments in the parks in comparison with the standards that we would apply elsewhere.

I do not need to tell members of the scale of the national campaign to save Loch Lomond, which is now far beyond just a community campaign. However, one of the effects of the decade during which we have had to endure that particular application is that it has brought much more scrutiny to the level of protection that our national parks are afforded—or, to be more accurate, very often not afforded.

This is not just a movement to stop Flamingo Land—we need to prevent that kind of saga from ever happening again. Amendment 76 alone would not do that, but it is an important measure to

ensure that communities and experts are never again completely shut out of appeal processes on developments of such significance.

**Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab):** I will speak specifically to amendment 76, in the name of Ross Greer, on planning in national parks. I completely agree with the amendment and commend it to members in the chamber.

Members will be aware of the significant planning application for Flamingo Land in Balloch, which is the gateway to Loch Lomond and the Trossachs national park. Ross Greer started a petition—I commend him for doing so—that attracted thousands of signatures opposing the application. I did a local door-to-door survey of some 6,000 households and more than 60 per cent opposed the development, but all, whether they agreed or disagreed, wanted to see improvements to roads and the quality of jobs and the economic impact being maximised.

In considering the application from Flamingo Land, the national park paid due regard to planning policy, to the views of statutory consultees such as the Scottish Environment Protection Agency and to the concerns of the local community. In contrast to what we are seeing now, the national park board held public hearings and made a site visit; it considered expert planning advice from its own staff, many of whom live in the national park; and it decided unanimously to reject Flamingo Land.

Given that background, it is astonishing that a single reporter decided that we should support the proposal. Ministers, under pressure in advance of a vote in the Parliament, called it in, and I welcome that. However, the application went back in front of the same reporter, and my understanding is that the report is now with the Minister for Public Finance. At no stage, from when the reporter first considered the appeal to now, has a public hearing been held—not one. Yet there are lots of public hearings about all manner of planning appeals on proposals of far less strategic significance. To be frank, I find that appalling and a denial of democracy.

It is important that community concerns are heard and considered. We created national parks to protect and conserve some of our most beautiful scenery and environment. It is right, therefore, that when significant application decisions are appealed, there is a public hearing as part of the determination process.

I urge members to support amendment 76.

**Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind):** I will speak briefly to advise caution in respect of Emma Harper's amendment 48, although it is very well intentioned. I do so on the basis of having, since the inception of national parks, lived in and

represented people who live in a national park area.

Mr Eagle is entirely right that there should be—and should have been—an independent review of how the existing parks work before any movement to establish new ones. The whole process to find a new park was a complete waste of money and an utter shambles, and I predicted from the outset that the people of Galloway would wisely reject it.

People talk about the national parks as though they are an untrammelled good—like motherhood and apple pie. That is not how many people in, for example, Strathspey consider their relations with national park authorities. Although regenerative farming sounds like a good idea, if the national parks are given powers to control farming, people who work for them—who are unfamiliar with farming and may not have expertise or even experience of it—will be placed in a position of power over farmers. We have already seen the establishment of Cairngorms Crofters and Farmers Community as a result of the conflict about the way in which the reintroduction of beavers was phased in. Members might be interested to know that, in an opinion survey in an Aviemore community forum, when asked, “Do you think the national park is performing well?”, 444 people said no and 10 people—3 per cent—said yes.

Members who might be disinclined to believe everything that I say—for reasons that have always escaped me, of course—should take tent. If someone proposes a national park for their area, they should be afraid—very afraid.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands (Mairi Gougeon):** All the elements that are outlined in Emma Harper’s amendment 48, Tim Eagle’s amendment 71 and Sarah Boyack’s amendment 72 are important to ensure that we have thriving communities in our national parks, so I am happy to support them and I encourage all members to do the same.

Sarah Boyack’s amendment 73 would introduce a requirement for ministers to seek expert advice before making a proposal for a new national park. For the reasons that the member set out, I am happy to support that amendment.

Mark Ruskell’s amendment 32 would modify the national parks legislation by allowing ministers to appoint either a public body or an independent person or organisation with expertise

“relevant to the National Park aims ... to consider and report on a National Park proposal.”

I was pleased to have further discussions on this amendment with Mark Ruskell after stage 2, and I am happy to support it.

I am also happy to support Sarah Boyack’s amendments 74 and 75, which would insert a clear definition of “cultural development” into the National Parks (Scotland) Act 2000.

I am delighted to support the vast majority of Sarah Boyack’s amendments in this group, especially since views on this grouping and the legislation seem to be coming full circle for her.

However, on amendment 77, which we discussed further after stage 2, I recognise that the position is the same as for the previous amendment. As I said at committee, I believe that the language that we have used in the bill provides the right balance between the requirement to implement actions within national park plans and other duties and considerations that public bodies may have. Unfortunately, I cannot accept that amendment and I ask members not to support it.

Ross Greer’s amendment 76 would, ultimately, undermine the established principle of taking a proportionate approach to the appeals process and would, effectively, create a two-tier system whereby the procedural requirements for planning appeals in national parks are different to those for appeals elsewhere in Scotland.

Some parts of the process have already been outlined. It is currently for the reporter to determine the most appropriate approach to obtaining the evidence that they need and who they need it from. A hearing is used to take evidence from specified interested parties rather than being open to all.

16:15

**Sarah Boyack:** I welcome the cabinet secretary’s constructive approach. I take it that she does not want to accept the actual wording of my amendment 77. However, is there a way in which the Scottish Government could support our park authorities to try to ensure that we get strategic alignment and a stronger focus on implementing the park plans? Even if you do not want that principle in the bill, would you accept the background principles?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur):** Always speak through the chair.

**Mairi Gougeon:** Absolutely. When it comes to amendment 77, it is ultimately about trying to get the balance of language right. That was part of the discussion that we had prior to introducing the measure in the bill, as well as during stage 2. I know that, as things stand, there is an awful lot of engagement between the national park and other public authorities, particularly in developing the park plans. I would expect them to work together to further the objectives that they have, collectively as bodies, agreed to. That point also came

through in the evidence that the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee heard.

I appreciate where Sarah Boyack is coming from with the principles of amendment 77, and I think that Mark Ruskell lodged similar amendments at stage 2. However, the balance that we have achieved regarding the language that is used in the bill is right.

I am sorry for that interruption; I will try to jump back into discussing amendment 76. That amendment would mean that a public hearing would be required for all appeals that relate to major or national planning applications, including those that might have limited bearing on the overall aims of the national park. That would ultimately increase the timescales and costs that are associated with the planning appeal process for all parties involved, regardless of the specific circumstances of a case. Given that a reporter's decision is based on submitted evidence, it is not clear how holding a public hearing for every planning appeal would assist the objectives of a proportionate and efficient planning process.

**Ross Greer:** The cabinet secretary says that the Government's objections are primarily based on an understanding that comes from two points. First, the Government understands the amendment to be disproportionate. However, its provisions would apply only to major national developments in the national parks, of which there are only a handful. Secondly, the Government understands that the amendment would create a two-tier system. However, what is the point of designating an area as a national park if we do not hold that area to a slightly higher standard when it comes to development decisions that are made within its boundaries?

**Mairi Gougeon:** In such cases, we should deal with planning appeals in a similar way across the piece. Rather than inserting an amendment to this section of the bill, we should deal with planning appeals through planning legislation and ensure that we have a consistent approach.

**Jackie Baillie:** The problem is that there is not a consistent approach, because there are planning applications on appeal with lesser strategic significance that have public hearings.

**Mairi Gougeon:** If amendment 76 were to be agreed to today, we would treat all planning appeals in the same way when they should depend on the specific circumstances of each case. That is why the reporting process is so important. The amendment could have a disproportionate impact on the whole process. Because of what I have outlined—the risk of a two-tier system, the potential for delays, the bureaucracy and the increased costs that would come as a result, all without necessarily improving

any of the decision-making processes—I cannot support the amendment. If it is moved, I ask members not to support it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Emma Harper to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 48.

**Emma Harper:** It is clear that colleagues have worked with the cabinet secretary, as did I, to lodge amendments—that is, my amendment 48 and amendments 71 to 74—to the aims of national parks and to the advice before making proposals for a national park.

The original legislation on national parks is two decades old. I acknowledge Mr Ewing's views, and I witnessed concerns and questions during the consultation process on the potential new national park in Galloway. I support the aim of helping our food producers, because food production is the primary reason for farming. However, we need to recognise that “sustainable and regenerative” requirements should be added to the aims of national parks in this part of the bill.

Do I need to move my amendment, Presiding Officer?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You need to press it.

**Emma Harper:** I press amendment 48.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 48 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Gibson. I will make sure that that is recorded.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 84, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 48 agreed to.*

*Amendment 71 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 71 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)

Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 86, Against 23, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 71 agreed to.*

*Amendment 72 moved—[Sarah Boyack]—and agreed to.*

#### After section 5A

*Amendment 73 moved—[Sarah Boyack]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 32 moved—[Mark Ruskell].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 32 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)

Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 84, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 32 agreed to.*

#### Section 6—Definition of biodiversity

*Amendments 74 and 75 moved—[Sarah Boyack]—and agreed to.*

#### After section 6

*Amendment 76 moved—[Ross Greer].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 76 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 52, Against 58, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 76 disagreed to.*

#### Section 7—Duty to facilitate implementation of National Park Plans

*Amendment 77 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 77 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**James Dornan (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. In the previous vote, my phone froze and I never had the chance to vote no. It does not matter, anyway.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for that clarification, Mr Dornan.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)

Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 77 disagreed to.*

### **Section 10—Aims and purposes of deer management**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 5 is on management and control of deer. Amendment 1, in the name of Edward Mountain, is grouped with amendments 2 to 7, 78, 8, 79, 9 to 11, 80, 12, 81 to 88, 13 to 15, 89, 49, 50, 90, 51, 91, 92, 52, 53, 93, 16 to 19, 94 to 96 and 99 to 105. I draw members' attention to the procedural notes on amendments in the group.

**Edward Mountain:** I thank the Presiding Officer for indicating that there is some latitude in timings.

Having been involved in deer management across Scotland, and looking at deer management today, I am convinced that the only part of Scotland where we are at least partially on top of deer management is the uplands. As far as low ground and woodland management is concerned, deer remain significantly out of control. Therefore, deer management is important.

Amendment 1 defines deer that are native to Scotland. To say only "deer native to Scotland" suggests that whoever drafted the bill has no idea what deer in Scotland are. I have therefore laid out clearly that

"fallow, red and roe deer",

which have been in Scotland for more than 100 years, are the deer that are native to Scotland. I suggest that it is hard to disagree with amendment 1, unless you just want to keep the term open, which would show that you do not know what deer in Scotland are.

Amendment 2, which is an adjustment to my stage 2 amendments, would place a responsibility on ministers

"to ensure employment in the field of deer management".

If we do not have deer managers, we will have no deer management. Therefore, it would be the wrong approach to focus only on deer management and ignore those who work in it.

16:30

Amendment 4 would oblige ministers to prevent conflicts between the public and those involved in deer management. That just seems good, sensible practice.

Amendment 3 would place a duty on ministers to ensure that deer management was carried out in a “humane” way. It is a simple amendment, and I cannot see why anyone would disagree with it.

Amendments 5 to 7 would ensure that Scottish Natural Heritage was represented on all deer management groups and that a representative of SNH must attend meetings of the panel involved in local deer management. That is sensible, given that SNH will have to enforce control if it is not happy with something that is going on in deer management. I have been involved in deer management groups for many years, so I know that SNH’s attendance at meetings of those groups significantly helps members of the group to work together and prevents SNH from making recommendations out of the blue, without having knowledge of what has been going on.

Amendment 78 relates to the reintroduction of close seasons for male deer. I have campaigned on this issue, and I note that Lorna Slater acknowledged that I have done a significant amount of work on it. I call amendment 78 the Bambi amendment. Members who have not heard of Bambi have missed a great novel by Felix Salten in which a young male deer is brought up by other animals in the forest after his mother is killed out of season. That is not a real story. In the forest, if females are killed out of season but the calves are not killed, those calves are left to starve.

The Scottish Government has said that, from the moment a male deer is born to the moment it dies, it can be shot. To me, that is inhumane. From the moment its mother delivers it on to the ground, somebody can kill it. I have never thought that that is right.

I find it interesting that organisations have suggested that MSPs vote against amendment 78 because it is for individuals to decide whether that is cruel. I can tell members, based on more than 50 years of experiencing and practising deer management, that it is cruel to shoot a calf the moment it is born or within days of being born. That puts significant pressure on the mother and, if male deer are being chased around the woods while trying to recover from the rut or in difficult conditions, as happens the whole time at the moment, those deer are put under pressure, too. In woodlands across Scotland, I have seen dead male deer lying in the fence lines in the spring because they have been prevented from getting to their feeding grounds. I do not feel comfortable about that, and many people who work in the countryside feel uncomfortable about it. Therefore, I ask members to consider whether that is humane and whether they can put up with the fact that the actions that are being taken do not necessarily

control male deer—in many cases, the deer are killed not by the bullet but by starvation.

Amendment 8 would remove the requirement for SNH to articulate the circumstances in which it would intervene in the management of deer. I have lodged the amendment because, as I said earlier, I think that SNH needs to be involved in deer management groups. If its representatives were part of the groups, those circumstances would already have been articulated.

Amendment 9 would remove the provision that SNH may review the code of practice on deer management at any time. Members who have been involved in the code of practice since it was first introduced—I admit to being one of those members—know that the code cannot just be changed overnight to suit requirements. We need to give some time for the code to bed in and to see whether it is working. Only then can it be adjusted.

This might upset some people, but I have never found NatureScot or SNH to be the arbiter of good taste in deer management. The arbiters of good taste are those people who are involved, who have blood on their hands and dirt under their fingernails from managing deer, not necessarily people in offices. Amendments 10 and 11 would oblige SNH to consult those who have an interest in deer management when carrying out a review of the code of practice, and to publish details of that consultation. Surely that makes sense. Surely someone who is not doing it but is reading about it in a book will want to speak to those people who are actually doing it.

Amendment 80 ties in with amendments 8 and 9 and would reduce the review period for the code of practice from 10 years to five years. That would mean that, rather than a review just being done on an arbitrary basis, the time that the code of practice would be allowed to stand before a review should be carried out would be reduced.

Amendment 12 seeks to delete section 12 on the proposed changes to the code of practice. That will make sense if the other amendments are passed.

Amendment 81 would allow SNH to intervene to prevent damage caused by deer only after it has considered other measures to protect public safety. I say that for a simple reason. I remember being involved in a survey that was being conducted along some of the roads in the Highlands because SNH was saying that the number of deer along the edge of those roads was far too high. Well, it was too high, but why was it too high? It was because the grass along the verges was covered in minerals, such as salt, which attracted the deer, and there was no proper fencing. The effect on public safety was not the result of the deer being there. We knew that the

deer were there, but we also knew that people were driving far too fast along those roads and ignoring the signs that the Scottish Government had instructed Transport Scotland to put up across the Highlands to say that there would be deer on the roadside.

Amendment 83 would regulate the grounds for NatureScot to intervene in the management and control of deer. The amendment is designed to alleviate some of the uncertainty that is inherent in the new grounds for intervention. It clarifies that the intervention will be permissible only when there is a material reduction in the effectiveness of work or projects as a result of deer impacts or a lack of deer management. It is very easy for someone to go into the countryside and say, "That damage up there is due to deer" when they have no idea whether it is due to deer. Are there sheep on the hill? Are there hares on the hill? What other herbivores are there? There could be cattle tracking backwards and forwards as much as sheep and as much as deer. I do not think that we can say that damage is a consequence of deer just by looking at it.

Amendment 88 would increase the deadlines for the submission of deer management plans from three to six months, which reflects the minimum standard that is required to create a deer management plan. That is based on evidence provided to me by Scottish Land & Estates and the Association of Deer Management Groups. For those who say that that is ridiculous, the current legislation says 12 months. The Government wants to reduce the deadline to three months, but that is far too tight—it takes six months. Having written a deer management plan for the Strathconon deer management group with Professor Rory Putman, I can tell members that it took me nearly two years to get everyone, including some of the private and public bodies, to work together.

**Jim Fairlie:** We have rehearsed this issue. I stated clearly at stage 2 that it is a requirement only when NatureScot is not getting any response from the people on the land who are deliberately trying to delay the process. They do not need to do it within three months. We have debated that already. Does the member accept that?

**Edward Mountain:** What I will accept is that, if Scottish Natural Heritage or NatureScot—whichever name is the most fashionable at the moment—attended the deer management groups and took part in drawing up deer management plans, it would not be an issue. Therefore, my amendment is entirely correct.

Amendment 13 would oblige SNH to consult the holders of any relevant shooting or sporting rights when approving a deer management plan with modifications. The owner of shooting rights is not

necessarily just the landowner. It could be the tenant farmer or a completely different person. To ignore those people in the process is totally wrong and will probably result in legal challenge, because it is a land right.

Amendments 14 and 15 are alternatives. Amendment 14 removes SNH's power to decide who the relevant owners and occupiers are in relation to land pertaining to a deer management plan. Amendment 15 rewords the relevant subsection to change

"that SNH considers to have"

to

"that has",

which I think is important, as it ensures that SNH has to get on with it.

Amendments 91 and 92 relate to the consideration of objections by experts in relation to deer control schemes. Those amendments would ensure that ministers consult SNH and others with relevant interests before appointing experts.

Amendments 16 to 19 oblige ministers to establish an independent panel with experience in practical deer management and public audit to scrutinise the recovery of SNH costs from the owner or occupier of land under a control scheme. Where a dispute remains, the parties can then refer the issue to arbitration under the Arbitration (Scotland) Act 2010. Why did I propose that change? I did so because it was not long ago that NatureScot spent nearly £40,000 flying people out in the hills on helicopters to shoot deer in inaccessible places. They ended up shooting the female deer and leaving the calves to die and suffer on the hill. If the minister does not believe me, I am sure that he can check with SNH to see the figures. It was clear to me that, if you kill only 5 per cent of calves with their parents when the calving percentage is 25 per cent, there is 20 per cent left.

Amendment 94 removes the provision that was inserted in the bill whereby SNH may take action where deer damage the natural environment. As the bill stands, SNH is able to use emergency powers at that point, even when it has other powers that are adequate to deal with that situation. Amendment 95 ensures that, where alternative powers exist, SNH uses those non-emergency powers first. That seems to make sense.

Amendment 96 ties in with an earlier amendment about managing deer, and not just in relation to harm to humans. That is a perception, and it is perhaps the actions of those humans that cause them harm, rather than the deer doing it of their own volition.

Amendment 99 reverses the bill's shortening of the notice period that must be given to the landowner prior to entering their land to investigate deer. The bill attempts to adjust the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996 so that the period is reduced from 14 days to five working days. Amendment 99 would ensure that the landowner had due warning before SNH did that. Amendment 101 clarifies that the person authorised by SNH to enter the land must enter it only at a reasonable time, as previously agreed by the owner or occupier. Amendment 100 clarifies that the person authorised by SNH to enter the land must be qualified in practical deer management.

**Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP):** On that last point, would the member not acknowledge that tenants are already bound by various pieces of legislation and good practice when it comes to safety matters anyway? I do not know whether he is raising a safety concern about tenants specifically.

**Edward Mountain:** It is not tenants that I am concerned about here; it is people going in and acting on behalf of SNH. I want to ensure that all the sides talk together, because the only way in which deer management will work effectively is if all sides work together.

Amendment 102 obliges SNH to share with the landholder any information that has been recorded under SNH's investigatory powers in an accessible format and within three months. That seems fairly reasonable. Amendment 103 obliges SNH to share the information with the landowner before SNH takes any further action regarding deer control. It cannot just go in and not provide the evidence for doing so.

Amendment 104 obliges SNH to compensate the landowner for any damage caused to the land by any agent entering under SNH's investigatory power. In fact, that ties in with one of the amendments that were made to the Land Reform (Scotland) Bill, whereby people exercising sporting rights had to compensate the tenant or the landowner if they caused damage.

Amendment 105 is a wording change in the section that is being inserted into the 1996 act headed "Power to require information and documents" to ensure that it is acted on only when the documents are relevant to SNH's exercise of its function.

16:45

I am disappointed that the Scottish Wildlife Trust is advising members that they should vote against many of my amendments in this group. That is because, as I said earlier, I do not believe that the people in the trust have ever got blood on their hands or dirt under their fingernails, or enacted

policies by drawing up deer management plans to ensure the management of deer. It is easy to sit in an office and tell people on the ground how to do things better; I believe, and always have believed, that the people on the ground with experience know better about that.

In passing, I note that RSPB Scotland, too, is asking members to vote against some of my amendments in the group. However, the RSPB is a protection organisation for bird species and not necessarily for other animals.

I will leave it at that and perhaps come in again at the end with some closing remarks.

I move amendment 1.

**Tim Eagle:** I thank the minister for quite a lot of discussion of my amendments. I have brought back some amendments that were previously lodged at stage 2. I have lodged them again because I have had a lot of contact with the deer sector, which has raised some concerns. I want to set out again what the concerns are, although this is pretty much only for the record, because I do not think that the amendments will be agreed to.

My amendment 79 would make it clear that the code of practice on deer management will set out the circumstances in which NatureScot "may" intervene in the management or control of deer, instead of the circumstances in which it must intervene. The amendment reflects concerns that have been expressed to me by Scottish Land & Estates that the present wording will act as an impediment to NatureScot and will potentially force its hand to take action in line with the circumstances for intervention that are due to be set out in the deer management code of practice.

The concern is that the wording "will intervene" will leave NatureScot with little room for manoeuvre. If the code says it, NatureScot will have to do it. It is likely that NatureScot will become exposed to direct lobbying and potential litigation, particularly from pressure groups, as well as from landholdings that consider that their neighbours are not doing enough to manage deer. That, in turn, will undermine the voluntary principle that underpins collaborative deer management.

My amendment 79 seeks to clarify that the code should set out the circumstances in which NatureScot "may" intervene. That would afford it discretion to decide whether intervention is appropriate relative to the circumstances. For clarity, the amendment seeks to replace "will" with "may".

In its stage 1 report, the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee recognised the concerns of the deer management sector about the lack of detail on how the new grounds for intervention will be used. It is critical that the Scottish Government

does not erode the trust and consensus that has been built up carefully with the deer management sector in recent years. Therefore, I urge members to back my amendment 79.

I turn to my amendment 82. The Scottish Government has been clear about the importance of voluntary and collaborative deer management when it comes to delivering positive outcomes for people, jobs and nature. I could not agree more with that sentiment, which is why I am concerned about the new ground for NatureScot to intervene in deer management under the auspices of nature restoration, which will be created by section 13 of the bill.

Several stakeholders, including Scottish Land & Estates and the Association of Deer Management Groups, have highlighted to me the potential for the new ground to generate conflict between landholdings. That is because the new ground for intervention will permit taking regulatory action “in relation to” an area of land, instead of “on” an area of land. That means, hypothetically, that intervention could be levelled against one landholding to deliver works, projects or natural processes on another landholding. That has the potential to drive a wedge through collaboration at the landscape scale and might even result in some landholdings lobbying NatureScot to intervene on their neighbours. I raise that as a genuine concern that has been expressed to me by the deer sector. It serves nobody’s interests, least of all the Scottish Government’s, to incite division and conflict among deer managers. I hope that members will be inclined to support my amendment 82.

The effect of my amendment 84 would be to remove the phrase “otherwise improves” in relation to the “natural heritage or environment” in the new ground for intervention. It is difficult to see what that phrase will usefully add, given that the preceding terms—“preserves, protects, restores, enhances”—are comprehensive and cover the full range of meaningful improvements that could be delivered for the natural heritage or environment. If ministers could set out, perhaps with reference to a case study, why the terms “preserves, protects, restores, enhances” are insufficient on their own, I am sure that that would address the concerns of the deer sector.

Beyond that, I simply point out to members that the subjectivity that is inherent in the new grounds for intervention has generated, and continues to generate, significant concern among deer managers.

The application of the new ground for intervention for nature restoration, in proposed new section 6ZB of the 1996 act, requires a connection to

“a relevant target, strategy or plan relating to the environment, climate change or biodiversity”.

Deer managers have expressed concerns to me about the all-encompassing nature of those targets, strategies or plans. My amendments 85 and 86 therefore seek to ensure that those targets, strategies and plans relate primarily to deer management. I do not consider that that would in any way tie the hands of either the Scottish Government or of NatureScot. Given that those powers relate to deer management, it is logical that the overarching targets, strategies and plans should also relate to deer.

Finally, my amendments 87, 89 and 90 are designed to provide reassurance for deer managers about the uncertainty and subjectivity inherent in the new grounds for intervention. Members will be aware that the code of practice for deer management will be used to set out the circumstances in which the new grounds will be used. That code is in the process of being updated, with input from the deer sector, so we do not yet have any detail about exactly how the new grounds will be applied. Given the central function of the code in steering where and how intervention will be used, amendment 87 seeks to underscore that NatureScot will be obliged to act

“in accordance with any requirements set out in the code”

when considering deer management plans, control agreements and control schemes and would, ultimately, help deer managers to understand where and how any intervention under the new grounds will be used.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Rhoda Grant to speak to amendment 49 and other amendments in the group.

**Rhoda Grant:** I will speak to amendments 49 and 50 in my name.

Amendment 49 concerns section 7 orders, which are deer management orders that are put in place when there is a problem with deer control. My amendment would ensure that SNH would publish reviews of those orders, providing transparency on the progress and impact of any orders that are put in place.

Amendment 50 would allow people who are detrimentally impacted by deer numbers to ask SNH to act to mitigate the situation. Constituents have come to me with concerns about deer numbers after trying to speak to the owners of the estate that they live on, only to be told that the problem lies with a neighbouring estate—and to see the buck being passed. Amendment 50 would allow those who are impacted to ask SNH to investigate so that it can then take action, should it find that there is an issue.

I am grateful to the minister for his assistance with those amendments following stage 2, and I hope that they will provide the assistance that those who are impacted require.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Beatrice Wishart to speak to amendment 51 and other amendments in the group.

**Beatrice Wishart:** It was remiss of me not to thank the cabinet secretary and her officials for their engagement on my previous amendments, so I do so now, while also thanking the minister and his officials for their time and assistance with the amendments that I am about to speak to.

Amendments 51, 52 and 53 are rooted in ensuring that local communities and neighbouring land managers are properly considered when deer control schemes are proposed. Amendment 51 recognises that control schemes can have real impact beyond the land that is directly subject to requirements, and particularly on neighbouring holdings, local deer management arrangements and rural communities whose economies and environments are closely connected. That amendment would ensure that those owners and occupiers who are, or are likely to be, significantly affected by the proposed control scheme are notified and are able to lodge objections, if they so wish. At the same time, amendments 52 and 53 would strike an important balance by making clear that only those owners and occupiers upon whom a control scheme imposes a requirement may appeal to the Scottish Land Court. Those indirectly affected can be heard, but the process would remain proportionate and focused.

Taken together, the amendments would strengthen local engagement, protect community interests and ensure that control schemes operate fairly and effectively. I ask members to support my amendments 51, 52 and 53.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Mark Ruskell to speak to amendment 93 and other amendments in the group.

**Mark Ruskell:** Amendment 93 was originally lodged by Emma Roddick at stage 2. In my experience, Emma Roddick is right about most things and I think that she is right about that particular amendment, because we do need to take action where deer are damaging our protected sites. We know that large deer populations have been identified by NatureScot as one of the main reasons why those critical sites are often in an unfavourable condition. The public investment that goes into internationally protected habitats such as the flow country or Scotland's rainforest is completely undermined by critical damage caused by deer.

In evidence to the committee, NatureScot indicated that it plans to use the new powers in the

bill to add proposed new sections 6ZA and 6ZB to the 1996 act, but that it would use those powers only once or twice a year. I am struggling to get my head around that, because that feels completely inadequate for the scale of nature restoration that is required, particularly for sites that are hugely degraded.

Amendment 93 is designed to specify the situations in which NatureScot must act to control high deer numbers because we cannot wait. The amendment is tightly drawn to cover habitats of national and international importance as well as peatlands, due to their critical role in storing climate emissions. In instances where those habitats are being damaged by deer, NatureScot must use its powers under sections 7 and 8 of the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996 to intervene to save those sites from further destruction and decay. Existing procedure on appeal provisions in the 1997 act will also apply in those situations, so no additional appeals process is required.

I hope that the cabinet secretary will respond, because sites are degrading and we need to take action now.

**Jim Fairlie:** I beg the Parliament's forgiveness, as this is going to be quite a long response.

Edward Mountain's amendment 1 relates to the aims and purpose of deer management. It seeks to redefine one of the aims from furthering

"the conservation of deer native to Scotland"

to furthering the conservation of

"fallow, red and roe deer".

The deer working group report set out that four species of wild deer occur in Scotland—the two species of native wild deer, which are red and roe, and the two non-native species, which are fallow and sika. While we recognise that fallow deer are now naturalised in Scotland, they are not a species that is native to Scotland. The amendment is unnecessary and confusing because it would include fallow deer in the list of deer that are native to Scotland. I therefore ask Edward Mountain not to press his amendment. If he presses it, I ask members to oppose it.

I support the aim that Mr Mountain looks to achieve with amendment 2, but I cannot support it, as I set out at stage 2. We have many excellent deer managers up and down Scotland and I want to ensure that they know, as I do, that we will always need skilled people on the ground to manage our deer population. Amendment 2 would require NatureScot to consider the protection and promotion of deer management employment in carrying out any of its deer functions. That is impractical. For that reason and for the reasons that were set out at stage 2, the amendment is unnecessary and I ask members not to support it.

Edward Mountain's amendment 3 seeks to amend the aims and purposes of the 1996 act to make it explicit that NatureScot must ensure that deer are controlled humanely as well as effectively when it exercises its functions under that act. Consideration of deer welfare is already embedded in the existing best practice guidance in Scotland and in NatureScot's code of practice. Amendment 3 therefore reinforces our existing policy, and it is for that reason that I will support it.

Although Edward Mountain's amendment 4 is well intentioned, as it seeks

"to prevent conflict between the public and"

those who are undertaking deer management, it would introduce significant challenges that would risk undermining effective management. In practice, it would create complex engagement requirements that could delay decision making, particularly where the public disagreed with or had concerns about proposed deer management. We all know that deer management can be an emotive subject, and there are many views on the best way to manage deer in different areas.

I also do not think that Edward Mountain has considered the potential implications in peri-urban areas, where some members of the public who rarely see deer may not understand the impact that they have on the environment if their population is left unchecked, and they may not actually care. For those reasons, I ask him not to move amendment 4. If he moves it, I ask members not to support it.

Edward Mountain's amendments 5, 6 and 7 relate to the composition of deer management panels. An amendment that will be made by the bill will allow NatureScot to sit on a panel as a member. Mr Mountain's amendment 5 would make it a requirement that it did so, and his amendment 6 would make it an obligation that the NatureScot member of the panel was always in attendance at any meeting of the panel. We can foresee that there may be circumstances in which it would be beneficial for a relevant expert from NatureScot to sit on a panel, but it is not our intention that such an expert will sit on every panel. That decision reflects the discussions that we had with stakeholders during the drafting of the bill.

Amendment 7 is not necessary, as not all panels will relate to the management of deer in local areas. For example, a previous panel related to the transfer of deer functions from the Red Deer Commission to NatureScot. Our intention with the changes to be made to the 1996 act has always been to retain flexibility on the make-up of the panels, but amendments 5, 6 and 7 would undermine that. For those reasons, I urge members not to vote for them.

17:00

Amendment 78 attempts to reinstate the close season for male deer. I have lost count of the number of times that Mr Mountain has attempted to overturn the decision of the Parliament on close seasons of deer. His attempt at stage 2 was debated and opposed at that time. I therefore recommend that members oppose it again.

I turn to Edward Mountain's amendment 8 and Tim Eagle's amendment 79. I cannot support Mr Mountain's amendment, as I think that there is a benefit in requiring NatureScot to set out in the code of practice details of how and where it intends to intervene in deer management. However, I have listened to the concerns that have been raised by stakeholders and the committee during proceedings at stages 1 and 2. Although the use of "will" instead of "may" was intended to provide some security to stakeholders, it has raised concerns about lack of flexibility, so I am content to support the change proposed by Mr Eagle. I ask Mr Mountain not to move his amendment 8 and instead to support his colleague's amendment 79, and I ask members to support amendment 79.

I cannot support Mr Mountain's amendments 9 and 80. At present, NatureScot must review compliance with the code of practice every three years. The deer working group was clear that that requirement was too burdensome, so we consulted on proposals to amend the review period and brought forward changes that will require NatureScot to review compliance in three circumstances: first, when requested to do so by ministers; secondly, if substantive changes have been made to the code; and thirdly, at a bare minimum, no later than 10 years after the code was laid before the Parliament. NatureScot will also be able to carry out a review at any other point if it feels that that is appropriate. I set out very clearly at stage 2, but will do so again now, that it is my expectation that 10 years will not become the norm for compliance reviews. For those reasons, I ask Mr Mountain not to move amendments 9 and 80. If he does, I ask members to vote against them.

I am pleased to support Edward Mountain's amendments 10 and 11. I would expect NatureScot to undertake such consultation work as part of a review of compliance, but I am happy to support such a requirement in legislation. I hope that that gives some reassurance to those in the land management sector that a key priority for the Government is to ensure that the changes that the bill makes are workable for them. I therefore ask members to support amendments 10 and 11.

Given what I have just said about Edward Mountain's amendments 8, 9 and 80 and Tim Eagle's amendment 79, I hope that Mr Mountain

will understand why I cannot support amendment 12. It would undo all the changes that we have made to secure flexibility on the code of practice and review of compliance with it. The changes that we are asking for are sensible and are being made in good faith. I therefore ask Mr Mountain not to move amendment 12. If he moves it, I ask the chamber to oppose it.

On amendment 81, I admit that I was a bit surprised at Mr Mountain's lodging an amendment that would require NatureScot to consider whether speed limits were a better alternative to requiring deer management to reduce public safety risks. I seem to recall fairly strong opposition from the Conservative Party to a previous proposal on speed limits.

The protection of public safety is a circumstance in which I do not want to put up barriers to the ability of NatureScot to take action to control deer. Amendment 81 would require NatureScot to be satisfied that no alternative measure would be effective. However, I do not think that that would be reasonable or practical, given that the primary concern must be to ensure public safety. I therefore cannot support amendment 81.

I turn to amendment 82, in the name of Tim Eagle. As I set out at stage 2 in relation to an amendment that sought to achieve the same thing, although it appears to be technical, changing "in relation to" to "on" would narrow the scope of intervention powers. The current wording allows NatureScot to act where deer activity or management decisions are causing or are likely to cause damage to an area of land, even indirectly. Limiting that to damage "on" the land could create unintended consequences, making it harder to address cumulative or cross-boundary impacts.

Deer do not respect property boundaries, and our legislation should reflect that reality. For example, deer could be on a particular area of land but wander on to roads, causing road traffic accidents. That would be a public safety issue that would not be "on" that particular area of land, but rather "in relation to" it. For those reasons, I believe that the existing wording provides the flexibility that is needed to protect the public interest and the environment, and I encourage members to oppose amendment 82.

In regard to amendment 83, in the name of Edward Mountain, a similar amendment was lodged at stage 2 but was not agreed to. As I set out at stage 2 in relation to that amendment, amendment 83 would risk weakening the effectiveness of the bill's restoration objectives. For that reason, I urge members to reject amendment 83.

Amendments 84 to 87, in the name of Tim Eagle, all seek to limit the scope and effectiveness

of NatureScot's intervention powers. Amendment 84 would change the wording relating to environmental improvements in an attempt to narrow the scope of the nature restoration ground for intervention and, in doing so, would potentially exclude certain projects.

Amendments 85 and 86 would unnecessarily narrow how we consider deer management. Deer impacts do not sit in isolation but directly affect biodiversity, woodland recovery, climate objectives and sustainable land use. By limiting the relevant targets to ones that are set out in deer-specific legislation only, amendment 85 would risk creating policy silos and undermining our ability to manage deer in a way that supports wider national environmental goals. Managing deer impacts is central to delivering those wider environmental, biodiversity and land-use objectives, and those priorities are often set out in strategies that are led by environmental and natural heritage bodies. Amendment 86 would exclude those plans and would risk the siloing of deer management.

Amendment 87 would simply reinstate the status quo that the bill seeks to reform in line with the deer working group's recommendations and would undermine efforts to strengthen the use of timely and effective action in the wider public interest. There is already a general requirement for NatureScot to have "regard to the code" in exercising its functions under the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996. The changes in amendment 87 might seem technical, but they would reduce flexibility, weaken accountability and, ultimately, make it harder to deliver effective, joined-up land management across Scotland. The original wording is clear and comprehensive. For those reasons, I urge members to reject amendments 84 to 87.

The issue that is addressed in amendment 88, in the name of Edward Mountain, was also fully debated at stage 2. The bill's provision of a minimum three-month time frame is just that—a minimum. The change made by the bill simply gives NatureScot greater flexibility to act sooner where responsibilities have not been met, as I said in my earlier intervention. For that reason, I do not support the amendment, as it would reduce that important flexibility. I urge members to reject amendment 88.

Taken together, amendments 13 to 15, in Edward Mountain's name, would complicate the process for putting in place effective and, in many areas, much-needed deer management plans.

Amendment 13 would require NatureScot to consult holders of shooting or sporting rights even when they have no direct responsibility for land management, which would add unnecessary delay. Amendment 14 would remove the clear definition of "relevant owners and occupiers",

creating uncertainty and increasing the risk of dispute. Amendment 15 would go further, by removing NatureScot's discretion to determine who has "sufficient interest ... or control", replacing professional judgment with a rigid test that would invite challenge.

Collectively, the three amendments would increase bureaucracy, reduce flexibility and make timely intervention in the public interest harder to achieve. I ask members to reject amendments 13 to 15.

Amendments 89 and 90, in the name of Tim Eagle, would do the same to control agreements and schemes as amendment 87 would to deer management plans. Amendments 89 and 90 would simply reinstate the status quo that the bill seeks to reform in line with the deer working group's recommendations, undermining efforts to strengthen timely and effective action in the wider public interest.

I discussed the issue in a meeting with Tim Eagle recently. There is already a general requirement for NatureScot to have "regard to the code" in exercising its functions under the 1996 act. For the same reason that I gave in opposing amendment 87, I ask Mr Eagle not to move amendments 89 and 90, and if he does, I ask members to oppose them.

Amendment 49, in the name of Rhoda Grant, will refine a stage 2 amendment. It will require NatureScot to publish the outcomes of reviews of control agreements, which will help to maintain public confidence and make clear whether agreed measures are being delivered. It will also encourage compliance and support learning by making evidence about what works publicly available. That is a proportionate step that will align deer management with wider principles of openness in environmental governance. For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 49. I thank Ms Grant for her willingness to work with me to improve amendments 49 and 50, following the stage 2 proceedings.

Amendment 50, which sets out the process by which someone can request an intervention from NatureScot in response to damage being caused by deer, would provide clarity and assurance for those suffering from damage by deer that they do not have the right or responsibility to manage on how to access support from NatureScot.

In later groups, we will come to amendments that relate to the statutory rights of occupiers. However, I have taken on board the concerns raised by stakeholders about friction between landowners, sporting tenants and occupiers, especially when there are long-standing deer management issues or differing priorities. Amendment 50 can go a long way towards

addressing some of those concerns, so I ask members to support it.

I turn to amendments 51, 52 and 53, in the name of Beatrice Wishart. I thank Ms Wishart for not pressing her amendment at stage 2 and instead returning with slightly updated amendments, which I will gladly support.

The amendments will require NatureScot to notify not only the owner or occupier of land on which a control scheme applies, but others who are likely to be significantly affected by the scheme. The amendments would also mean that those who are likely to be significantly affected have the right to object to a scheme. I have listened to concerns that were raised about the potential impact of a control scheme on local communities and local economies and how balance will be achieved when these powers are used. That touches on some of the issues that were raised by Mr Mountain and Mr Eagle earlier.

I think that the amendments would be effective in ensuring that local communities are notified and are able to feed back on compulsory deer management. The amendments would not give those wider groups of people the right to appeal to the Scottish Land Court, given that a scheme needs to be confirmed by Scottish ministers where it comes into effect, which will require any objections to be considered. It is considered only appropriate to give the right of appeal to the owners or occupiers on whom a control scheme, or a variation of a control scheme, is imposed. Such a right of appeal is no different from the existing appeal rights under the 1996 act, and it is a recognition of the seriousness of that undertaking. I therefore ask members to support amendments 51 to 53.

Amendments 91 and 92, in the name of Edward Mountain, are the same as amendments that were originally lodged by Ms Wishart at stage 2 and debated then. As I set out at stage 2—I believe that this is why the amendments were not pressed by Ms Wishart—in practice, the amendments would not have a meaningful impact on those required to be consulted by NatureScot. For that reason, I urge members to oppose amendments 91 and 92.

I turn to amendment 93, in the name of Mark Ruskell. I appreciate Mr Ruskell's intention, but I cannot support the amendment. I have said this before and I will say it again: it is vital that we balance the need to reduce deer populations with the needs of our rural communities; we have to get that balance right. I have been clear throughout the process that we have to find ways of working effectively and collaboratively to meet our deer management aims. That means bringing the sector with us. Unfortunately, I do not think that amendment 93 would achieve that.

Furthermore, the amendment would include a significant amount of land and well over 1,000 holdings. The resources that would be required by NatureScot to enter into control agreements in all those places would mean that it would have to down tools on almost all of its other deer management work and swathes of its wildlife management work. I do not think that that is what Mr Ruskell is aiming for here, but I cannot support the amendment.

**Mark Ruskell:** I hope that the minister acknowledges that the amendment is focused on protected sites. What is the point of a protected site if those who are charged with protecting those sites—such as NatureScot—cannot get in there and ensure that the destruction ends? This is a natural environment bill, and surely we should be following through on nature protection.

On the wider issue of deer management, there are welcome reforms throughout the bill, but on the issue of protected sites, I am disappointed. I would like to hear more from the minister about the priority of ensuring that our last remaining habitats do not just disappear because they were at the bottom of the in-tray.

**Jim Fairlie:** I am not quite sure that I accept the way in which Mr Ruskell has put that. I am genuinely grateful to him for the meetings that we have had to discuss his proposals, but our national deer management plan will build on the direction of travel that we have already set out and our aims to increase the annual deer cull by 25 per cent. It will also include how we will ensure that venison is an integral part of achieving that. We will come to the amendments relating to the national deer management plan in due course, but we have to approach deer management in Scotland with a focus on the priorities.

**Emma Roddick (Highlands and Islands) (SNP):** As Mark Ruskell kindly mentioned earlier, I worked with the John Muir Trust and Scottish Environment LINK's deer group on a stage 2 amendment that sought to achieve the same thing, and the minister committed to working with me to find a way forward. However, he has since said that agreeing to such an amendment would put an obligation on NatureScot to address those protected areas, which are estimated at more than 250,000 hectares across Scotland.

If Government officials recognise the scale of the risk, surely we want to write law that enshrines protection for those areas. As Mark Ruskell says, I would welcome a more detailed explanation from the minister as to why the Scottish Government is unable to support that effort.

17:15

**Jim Fairlie:** I have already stated that, through the bill, we are bringing forward a national deer management plan and introducing new powers to take action where deer are preventing nature restoration and enhancement. Outwith the legislation, we are working hard to trial incentive schemes, which will be used to inform our decisions on the form of support that would best achieve our deer management aims.

Amendment 93 would risk undermining the collaborative work that has been put into getting deer management where it is today, which I intend to continue.

Amendments 16 to 19, in the name of Edward Mountain, relate to cost recovery for control schemes that are put in place by NatureScot. Amendments 16 and 17 are not necessary, as the bill as currently drafted will already achieve the aims of those proposed drafting modifications.

Amendments 18 and 19 would introduce a complex and disproportionate challenge process for the recovery of very modest sums. Creating independent panels followed by potential arbitration, while still retaining the mechanism of appeal to the Scottish Land Court, would undermine finality and risk legal confusion, in particular given that arbitration is intended to be binding. The cost of establishing and operating those processes would likely exceed the expenses being disputed, while the suspension of recovery action would encourage delay.

Taken together, amendments 16 to 19 would add bureaucracy, reduce regulatory efficiency and weaken NatureScot's ability to recover costs proportionately and effectively. There is already a robust appeal mechanism in place through the Scottish Land Court. For those reasons, I urge members to reject the amendments.

Amendments 94 and 95, in the name of Edward Mountain, seek to reverse necessary changes that the bill makes in respect of emergency powers under section 10 of the 1996 act. Amendment 94 would strip out the bill's prudent expansion of those emergency powers to cover damage to "the natural heritage" and "environment". That would mean that section 10 of the 1996 act would be out of line with the rest of that act, and it would undermine rapid intervention precisely where it is increasingly required to protect peatland restoration, new woodland and sensitive habitats. The expanded measures are short, targeted powers that are already used proportionately to address immediate harm, and they are supported by the deer working group's recommendations.

Amendment 95 would remove from the bill the simple, sensible safeguard that authorised

persons must be “fit”, cutting across the wider drive for competence and high standards.

The changes that I have set out are necessary and balanced and are in the public interest. For those reasons, I urge members to reject amendments 94 and 95.

Amendment 96, in the name of Edward Mountain, seeks to remove section 20 of the bill. Section 20 introduces a tightly drawn and sensible defence where a person acts “to prevent or stop” an imminent risk of harm to human safety from deer. It applies only where the risk is immediate, the action is reasonable and proportionate and the incident is reported to the police. Removing that provision would mean that someone could still commit an offence even when acting responsibly to protect life. That would be neither practical nor proportionate, and it would retain an unnecessary offence in the law. The safeguard introduced in section 20 is carefully balanced and firmly in the public interest, and it should remain in the bill. I therefore ask members to reject amendment 96.

Amendment 99 seeks to undo the changes that the bill makes with regard to NatureScot’s notice period when entering on to land to exercise its functions. The bill reduces the minimum notice period that NatureScot must give to five working days. That was a recommendation from the deer working group, which recognised that the current period of 14 calendar days was unreasonably long in some circumstances, especially where NatureScot needs to take action to address damage quickly.

The change was fully consulted on. It is important to note, however, that the notice period is simply a minimum and that if NatureScot issued the notice and the relevant owners or occupiers were in touch to make other arrangements, NatureScot would consider alternative requests so long as the request was made in good faith. I ask members, therefore, to oppose amendment 99.

Amendments 100 and 101 relate to the proposed new subsection (2ZA) to be inserted in section 15 of the 1996 act, which provides NatureScot with the power to authorise a person to enter land owned or occupied by another for specified deer management purposes. Mr Mountain’s amendment 100 would require that person to be

“qualified in practical deer management”

as well as, under the bill’s proposed new wording in the 1996 act, being “authorised in writing by” NatureScot.

However, Mr Mountain does not define what is meant by “qualified in practical deer management”. That would leave the provision open to interpretation, creating uncertainty over its

meaning and application and thereby making it not fit for the intended purpose, particularly in relation to powers of entry, where clarity as to lawful exercise is especially important.

Amendment 101 would remove from NatureScot the power to enable an authorised person to enter on to the owner or occupier’s land for the reasons set out in section 15(3) of the 1996 act unless “previously agreed with” them. That would effectively transfer control of the power from NatureScot to the landowner or occupier, which would undermine its very purpose. In practice, it would risk delaying or preventing necessary deer management actions. For those reasons that I ask Mr Mountain not to move amendments 100 and 101. If he moves them, I ask members to oppose them.

Amendments 102 to 104, in the name of Edward Mountain, would insert new provisions in section 15 of the 1996 act. Amendment 102 strikes the right balance between transparency and effective regulation. It would ensure that landowners receive timely, accessible information about deer counts and impacts gathered on their land, which would support collaboration and informed management.

However, I cannot support amendments 103 and 104, because they would unduly constrain NatureScot by preventing further action until the information has been shared, removing the necessary flexibility and risking delay where multiple or urgent interventions were required. Amendment 104 would impose an unnecessary and disproportionate statutory compensation requirement for lawful entry, despite no evidence of harm arising from existing powers. Amendments 103 and 104 go beyond what is reasonable and would weaken NatureScot’s ability to carry out its functions.

I therefore support amendment 102, but I urge members to oppose amendments 103 and 104.

Amendment 105, in Edward Mountain’s name, seeks to require NatureScot to be absolutely confident that the information or documents that it is requesting are relevant to its functions. Although the amendment is well intentioned, in some cases, NatureScot may not be able to determine whether the information or documents required are relevant to a specific function until it has sight of them. With the bill, our aim has always been not only to retain flexibility, particularly in relation to voluntary agreements, but to ensure that NatureScot has the appropriate powers to allow it to exercise its functions. Amendment 105 would take away an element of that discretion, which is necessary to ensure that NatureScot can obtain the information that it needs.

For those reasons, I ask Mr Mountain not to move amendment 105. If he moves it, I ask members to oppose it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Edward Mountain to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 1.

**Edward Mountain:** I am sure that everyone in the chamber will be pleased to know that I am not going to speak to every amendment in the group. I could do so, but I am not going to; I will just pick out the key amendments that I would like to speak to.

At the outset, I will say that what I have tried to do in these amendments is bring a certain amount of clarity to those who are going to be involved in deer management, from somebody who has, I hope, done enough of it to see the pitfalls on both sides.

As far as amendment 1 is concerned, I am sorry, but we should be in a position where non-native animals in Scotland, particularly those such as sika, are controlled and removed where possible. I am not sure that they will ever be removed. That is why I am saying that deer management plans are required for native species, which I consider—

**Jim Fairlie:** Will the member take an intervention on that point?

**Edward Mountain:** I will, in a minute.

I consider fallow deer, which have been here for more than 100 years, to be native. We could argue about that over a drink later, but I am happy to give way now.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Very briefly, minister.

**Jim Fairlie:** If it gives the member confidence, sika deer are very much in the sights of NatureScot. We are well aware of the issues that sika deer cause, and distinct actions have been taken to ensure that we tackle that problem.

**Edward Mountain:** The distinct actions that deer managers have always undertaken when it comes to sika deer are to shoot on sight, so that we can get rid of them.

The fact that the minister is not going to support amendment 2 suggests that this Government is not interested in jobs in the countryside. However, I am pleased that the minister will accept amendments 3, 10, 11 and 102.

With regard to amendments 5 to 7, I do not understand what the issue is with getting NatureScot representatives to attend deer management group meetings for each deer management group in Scotland. There are about two meetings a year. I am not sure what else they

do in their offices all day—maybe they sit in Great Glen house pontificating things into the future.

**Jim Fairlie:** Will the member take an intervention?

**Edward Mountain:** I will in a minute.

In my time, I have attended a huge number of deer management meetings. When SNH representatives are present, those deer management groups work a lot better. When they do not bother to turn up, they are missed.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Minister, briefly.

**Jim Fairlie:** During this whole debate, I have tried really hard to get us to a place where there is a consensus about deer management in Scotland and we are working together across the chamber, as has been demonstrated throughout this group of amendments. Those kinds of comments about the organisation that is there to help us to do so are uncalled for and unfounded. Therefore, I ask the member to retract them.

**Edward Mountain:** I will not withdraw the comments. I stand by them entirely, because they are my impression from what I have seen in my time in deer management.

I am sorry that amendment 78 has fallen on deaf ears. For those members who cannot remember, the amendment is about the killing of male deer. Let me be clear: it is a biological fact that it is female deer that produce calves, and it is female deer that will hunt out the male deer. They will travel for miles to find a male deer to mate with. It is not the male deer that will do that; they will hold territory. Therefore, to kill just the males is not the way to keep the population down.

**Jim Fairlie:** Will the member take an intervention?

**Edward Mountain:** I will if I have time, Presiding Officer.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There is limited time. If you want to take the intervention, you can, but I will not be able to give you all the time back.

**Edward Mountain:** If I will not get my time back, then I will not argue about a matter of fact.

The minister will be delighted to know that I have listened to his entreaties and I will not move amendment 12.

In relation to amendment 93, deer always appear to be the problem. However, in vast parts of Scotland in which there is damage to the environment, especially in upland areas, it is not always deer that are the problem. As I said earlier, the problem is often sheep.

I am conscious that we do not have unlimited time, but I will turn to a couple of other

amendments. Amendments 16 to 19 would have a modest cost. The minister talked about bureaucracy, but the bill will produce a huge amount of bureaucracy.

As far as amendment 99 is concerned, we should keep the power at 14 days. I cannot even get a response from the Government to a letter in 14 days, so I do not understand how SNH feels that it will be able to decide and do something in five days.

I have listened to the arguments in favour of Rhoda Grant's amendment 50. However, I find the amendment to be very wide ranging. It would mean that anyone could make a comment on the state of a hill. Such comments could be vexatious and might even carry no grounds. Therefore, the amendment would increase the very bureaucracy that the minister is trying to avoid.

On that note, I will sit down so that we can get to the voting. I press amendment 1.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 1 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Paul Sweeney (Glasgow) (Lab):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Sweeney. I will make sure that that is recorded.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 43, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 1 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 2 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 2 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 43, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 2 disagreed to.*

17:30

*Amendment 3 moved—[Edward Mountain]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 4 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 4 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 4 disagreed to.*

**Section 11—Scottish Natural Heritage representation on advisory panels**

*Amendment 5 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 5 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My device would not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Constance. I will make sure that that vote is recorded.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 5 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 6 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 6 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Jackie Baillie:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I tried to connect, but, unfortunately, I was unable to do so. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Baillie. I will make sure that that is recorded.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 6 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 7 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 7 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 7 disagreed to.*

**After section 11**

*Amendment 78 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 78 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**Abstentions**

Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 81, Abstentions 1.

*Amendment 78 disagreed to.*

**Section 12—Code of practice on deer management**

*Amendment 8 not moved.*

*Amendment 79 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 79 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 84, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 79 agreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call amendment 9, in the name of Edward Mountain. I remind members that, if amendment 9 is agreed to, I will not be able to call amendments 10, 11 and 80, due to pre-emption.

*Amendment 9 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 9 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)

Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McAllan, Mairi (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0

*Amendment 9 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10 moved—[Edward Mountain]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 11 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 11 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 103, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 11 agreed to.*

*Amendment 80 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 80 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 80 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 12 not moved.*

### Section 13—Grounds for intervention

*Amendment 81 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 81 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)

Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 81 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 82 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 82 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Craig Hoy:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I apologise—my app has frozen. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Hoy. I will ensure that that is recorded.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 82 disagreed to.*

17:45

*Amendment 83 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 83 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 83 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 84 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 84 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

## For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

## Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 84 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 85 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 85 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)

Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 85 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 86 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 86 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 86 disagreed to.*

### Section 14—Deer management plans

*Amendment 87 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 87 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 87 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 88 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 88 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 88 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 13 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 13 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)

Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 13 disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call amendment 14, in the name of Edward Mountain. I remind members that, if amendment 14 is agreed to, I will not be able to call amendment 15, due to pre-emption.

*Amendment 14 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 14 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 23, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 14 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 15 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 15 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)

Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 15 disagreed to.*

### Section 15—Control agreements

*Amendment 89 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 89 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 89 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 49 moved—[Rhoda Grant]—and agreed to.*

### After section 15

*Amendment 50 moved—[Rhoda Grant].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 50 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)

Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 84, Against 24, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 50 agreed to.*

#### Section 16—Control schemes

*Amendment 90 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 90 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 90 disagreed to.*

18:00

*Amendment 51 moved—[Beatrice Wishart]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 91 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 91 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 91 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 92 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 92 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 92 disagreed to.*

*Amendments 52 and 53 moved—[Beatrice Wishart]—and agreed to.*

#### After section 16

*Amendment 93 moved—[Mark Ruskell].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 93 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 93 disagreed to.*

## Section 17—Recovery of costs and expenses

*Amendment 16 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 16 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**George Adam (Paisley) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The app was goosed again, so I was unable to vote. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Adam. I will make sure that that is recorded.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 16 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 17 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 17 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 17 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 18 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 18 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)

Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Haicro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Ind)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 18 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 19 not moved.*

### **Section 19—Measures to prevent damage by deer**

*Amendment 94 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 94 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)

Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)

McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Abstentions

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 83, Abstentions 1.

*Amendment 94 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 95 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 95 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)

Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 95 disagreed to.*

### **Section 20—Action to prevent or stop harm to persons**

*Amendment 96 not moved.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** At this stage, I will suspend proceedings until 6.30 pm. I encourage members to be back in the chamber shortly ahead of 6.30, so that we can make a prompt start.

18:10

*Meeting suspended.*

18:31

*On resuming—*

### **After section 20**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing):** We resume consideration of amendments. Group 6 is on reporting and planning in relation to deer. Amendment 20, in the name of the minister, is grouped with amendments 20A to 20E, 33, 98, 59 and 136 to 140.

**Jim Fairlie:** [*Inaudible.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Minister, will you please put your card in and start again from the beginning?

**Jim Fairlie:** My apologies.

My amendment 20 seeks to address the issues that were raised by members and stakeholders during stage 2 proceedings. I thank Mark Ruskell, Rhoda Grant and Rachael Hamilton, all of whom I met earlier this month to discuss those concerns, and I am grateful for their willingness to work

collaboratively on the amendment. I have also taken into account and into consideration my conversations with Tim Eagle following his stage 2 amendments in relation to financial support for deer management.

We all share the ambition of having venison recognised as one of our key national assets. It is a vital component in addressing rising deer populations. Amendment 20 will introduce a relatively straightforward plan that will require the Scottish ministers to set out their deer management priorities, how we will support people to deliver those through specific measures and actions, and how we can maximise the opportunities that venison can bring. For those reasons, I urge members to support the amendment, which seeks to introduce a national deer management and venison plan.

I recognise the intention behind amendments 20A and 20B, in the name of Mark Ruskell, but I cannot support them. Amendment 20A would require ministers to set national density targets and annual cull quotas. That would risk imposing a one-size-fits-all approach that does not reflect the very real regional variation in deer impacts, species and land use and that cuts across our commitment not to treat deer as a pest species—because deer are not a pest but an asset to Scotland. The Government's approach is instead targeted and evidence led. We have already set out our broad ambition to increase deer culls by around 25 per cent, focusing effort where deer pose the greatest environmental risk.

Amendment 20B seeks to lock in delivery and funding arrangements for those national targets, before the underpinning data is robust and before we know what intervention is appropriate in different places. For those reasons, I urge members to vote against amendments 20A and 20B.

Likewise, I recognise the intention behind amendments 20C and 20D; however, I do not believe that those amendments are necessary. I agree that access to venison-processing facilities and community larders is important. That is why

“the venison industry, key venison facilities and venison supply chains”

are already included in the national deer management and venison plan. However, providing the level of detail that is in amendments 20C and 20D is not appropriate and is repetitive, given that venison is already included. For those reasons, I urge members to vote against amendments 20C and 20D.

Amendment 20E is not strictly necessary, but I appreciate Mark Ruskell's aims and will be happy to support it. Amendment 20 requires ministers to consult NatureScot, those undertaking deer

management, the venison industry and anyone else that ministers consider appropriate. That allows full discretion to consult environmental nature restoration bodies where relevant. However, I know that the member is keen to ensure that the national deer management plan is centred around the environmental impact of deer populations and our priorities in tackling those. We would, of course, consult those environmental and nature conservation organisations with an interest in the national deer management plan as part of the on-going process, so I see no reason not to set that out here. For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 20E.

Amendment 33, in the name of Emma Harper, is a helpful and constructive addition to the national deer management and venison plan. It recognises that deer management in Scotland is about far more than red deer on open hill range. It makes clear that, when preparing or reviewing the national deer management and venison plan, ministers may take into account the very different circumstances in which deer are managed, the challenges and the costs involved, the species and the numbers of deer present, and the need to balance environmental, social, economic and welfare considerations. The amendment will strengthen the national plan by reflecting real-world complexity across both Highland and Lowland Scotland, and I encourage members to support it.

Amendment 98, in the name of Mark Ruskell, seeks to establish a national deer management programme, but it goes significantly further than the approach that the Government supports. Although we agree on the importance of having a national plan, amendment 98 would hardwire into legislation detailed population estimates, geographically broken down cull targets and delivery requirements that do not reflect the regional variation and complexity of deer management across Scotland. Amendment 98 risks imposing a one-size-fits-all model, whereas amendment 20 provides a more balanced, flexible and deliverable framework. For those reasons, I ask the member not to move amendment 98, but if he does, I urge members to vote against it.

I appreciate the intention behind amendment 59, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, and I thank Ms Wishart for highlighting the importance of transparency in deer management, because we share that goal. However, introducing a statutory duty to deliver a national dashboard within five years risks a significant resource burden and it might not resolve the current data gaps. We are already strengthening the evidence base through NatureScot's new deer app, improvements to cull returns via the fit and competent register and trial dashboards at NatureScot and Forestry and Land Scotland. Our focus is on getting the data right first

and then presenting it well. On that basis, I ask the member not to move the amendment.

I understand the intention behind amendment 136, in the name of Tim Eagle, and the desire to see early reassurance that the changes made by the bill are working as intended. However, reducing the review period from 10 years to five years is not appropriate, because the objectives that we are seeking to assess, such as restoring the natural heritage, achieving the aims of deer management and improving deer welfare, are long-term outcomes that cannot be fully evidenced within five years. It is also important that we have at least one national deer management plan in place and progressing before undertaking a meaningful review. A 10-year timescale provides a more realistic and robust basis for assessing both effectiveness and any unintended consequences. For those reasons, I ask the member not to move amendment 136, and, if he does, I will vote against it.

Amendment 137, also in the name of Tim Eagle, would require the review of the changes to deer legislation to report on every modification made by the bill to the 1996 act that has not been used during the review period. However, the bill makes changes across much of the 1996 act, and it is not clear what the term "used" means in this context. The amendment as drafted risks turning the review exercise into a lengthy and technical inventory, rather than a focused assessment of whether the changes are delivering better environmental outcomes, effective deer management and improved deer welfare.

Although the wording of the amendment means that it cannot be accepted, I think that I understand what Mr Eagle is trying to get at. I reassure him that the review will include any provisions that have not been commenced and why that is the case, or indeed any that are in force but have not been relied on. For the reasons that I have set out, I ask the member not to move the amendment and, if he does, I will ask members to vote against it.

On amendments 138 and 139, in the name of Edward Mountain, I understand that the desire behind them is to ensure that a wide range of voices are heard when the effectiveness of the changes to deer legislation is reviewed. However, I do not believe that it is helpful to prescribe consultation so tightly in legislation. As the bill is drafted, ministers "must consult" NatureScot and anyone else whom they "consider appropriate". That already provides the flexibility to engage with those who have practical experience of deer management or those who have a wider interest where that will add value. Making those groups mandatory consultees would, in practice, require a broad public consultation and significantly reduce

flexibility. It is better to retain the discretion so that the consultation can be proportionate and targeted. For those reasons, I urge members to vote against amendments 138 and 139.

Amendment 140, in the name of Tim Eagle, would make explicit that, when a report on the effectiveness of changes that were made by the bill is laid before Parliament, a copy must be sent to the relevant lead committee. In practice, that already happens whenever a report is laid before Parliament, so the amendment does not materially change the current arrangements. However, it would clarify the process in the bill, so I am happy to support amendment 140 and I urge members to do the same.

I move amendment 20.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Mark Ruskell to move amendment 20A and to speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Mark Ruskell:** I moved an amendment at stage 2 to establish a national deer management programme. The aim of that was to set clear expectations on deer management targets for landowners and to provide strategic direction at a national level. I did not just pull that out of my head—it was a key recommendation of the independent deer working group’s report, which was accepted by the Government in 2021, and in fact, the Government stated in a programme for government that it wanted to deliver that. Therefore, I am a little surprised that the minister is saying that it is a one-size-fits-all approach and is not appropriate and that that is really not where we are going. That feels like quite a subtle change in policy and direction for the Government and it begs the question where the independent deer management working group report now sits with the Government. Is the Government continuing to work through those recommendations? Is it adopting recommendation 97, which has already appeared in a programme for government?

The purpose of having a national deer management programme is, in effect, to lower deer numbers, to ensure that the population is managed at a level where public health—particularly with regard to road safety and to Lyme disease—is under control and to make sure that impacts on nature restoration are minimised. That approach has a very strong public health and ecological basis. I have brought that back as amendment 98, acting in the spirit of the independent deer working group’s report by reflecting its specific proposal and asking members to vote on it.

Notwithstanding that, I appreciate the openness that the minister has shown between stage 2 and stage 3. We have had a discussion about the importance of seeing venison and deer as a

resource and the need to give greater support to the venison sector. Of course we would like to see venison in more public canteens and local shops and making a contribution there.

However, a balance needs to be struck between the aims of having greater oversight of deer management for the purpose of advancing nature restoration and ensuring that there is a growing market for venison. I am still a little confused about where the minister’s priorities sit in that respect. There needs to be parity. Deer management is essentially about an ecological decision that needs to be taken to restore nature and to deal with public health issues. It cannot be dependent on the vagaries of a food supply chain market, which is often dominated by supermarkets. I am not clear whether we are in the same territory as the debates that we have had in the chamber on organic food, where there has been a reluctance to increase the scale of the organic sector if it does not meet market demand. I am wary of relying on market demand for venison to drive what should be ecological decisions about protecting and restoring nature.

**Jim Fairlie:** I think that the member is mischaracterising what the deer management plan that is set out in the bill will do. It is set out that there will be targets and that NatureScot will have the powers to set them. We are adding to that that we will use venison as a product to be savoured by Scotland rather than seeing deer as a problem. We have to get that balance right. I think that our amendment 20 does that, while the member’s amendment 20A is far too prescriptive.

**Mark Ruskell:** If that is the case—I accept that that is a useful clarification—I do not understand why the minister is not supporting amendments 20A and 20B. Amendment 20A would add in the need for population estimates for deer and cull targets, and 20B would ensure that the minister sets out how NatureScot will be funded to meet the requirements of population estimates and cull targets.

Putting deer management on the basis that the independent deer working group requested will require provisions that are much more explicit than those that have been laid out in the bill and in the minister’s amendment 20. That is why, as well as providing the option of amendment 98, which is a lot clearer, I also provided the option of amending the minister’s amendment to make it crystal clear what we are talking about.

18:45

**Jim Fairlie:** I hope that the member understands that we are making sure that we have a balance. The member will agree that we cannot do deer management without deer managers on

the ground who know that they are doing. The proposals that I am putting forward in my amendment will ensure that the deer management community knows that it is being supported and that we have the ability to use venison in our food markets. That is alongside the legislative requirements for people to reduce deer numbers.

**Mark Ruskell:** I understand where the minister is coming from. However, to an extent, the provisions will rework the recommendations of the independent deer working group. Those voices were there in the process and the working group came to its conclusions after a long process. It feels as though the policy is evolving, but I am not 100 per cent sure which way it is going.

**Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con):** Will Mark Ruskell take an intervention?

**Mark Ruskell:** I will make a bit of progress.

I welcome the minister's support for amendment 20E, although he also said that it is not necessary to involve the environmental and nature restoration sectors. Why not? We will do that anyway. Nevertheless, I welcome his support for the amendment.

The Parliament has a choice to make. Amendment 98 is clear; its provisions are what the Government signed up to and what was in the programme for government. If policy is evolving in a slightly different direction to be more about working with the market for venison, we should at least put the population estimates into the plan, ensure that NatureScot has a properly funded role to do what the independent working group wanted it to do and ensure that important voices for environment and nature restoration are consulted. Those are the purposes of my amendment to the minister's amendment and of my amendment 98.

I move amendment 20A.

**Tim Eagle:** The minister and I do not always agree on everything but we have had some good discussions about part 4 of the bill. He is right to talk about the value of venison to Scotland, rather than seeing it as something negative. I commend that, because that is exactly the direction that we want to go in.

That said, I have lodged a few amendments that I thought would help the bill, and I am grateful for the minister's comments in his opening speech. My amendments 20C and 20D would amend the minister's amendment 20 to establish a deer management and venison plan. Such a plan is a good thing, but my amendments would require it to include, or for ministers to consider,

"the introduction of a pilot for community larders and wider processing infrastructure for the purpose of increasing production capacity for venison."

I welcome the minister's amendment to establish the plan, but I question whether more needs to be done to deal with the need for more processing support. That is a point that I have heard directly from people on the ground.

I want deer managers to be able to maintain and expand their levels of venison production. Venison is a nutritious food source, which Scotland could have in abundance. It is also potentially a growing market. However, production activity has often been privately funded and, unfortunately, loss making. NatureScot has already begun several pilots to incentivise schemes but more needs to be done.

My amendments 20C and 20D would respond to direct calls from those who deal with venison to have incentive schemes and for wider roll-out to be considered as part of the plan. Not only could that result in venison being more widely supplied but it could aid the Government in achieving its objectives regarding food and deer.

I turn to amendments 136, 137 and 140. As currently drafted, the bill sets out that ministers will be required to review the effectiveness of parts of part 4 within 10 years of section 33A coming into force. My amendment 136 seeks to reduce that timescale to be within five years to ensure a speedier review and increased consultation with those who will be implementing the legislation.

My amendment 137 would further amend the ministers' reporting requirements in part 4. It would require the report to

"include information on whether any provision of the 1996 Act as modified by this Part has not been used".

My final amendment in the group, amendment 140—which I am pleased that the minister supports—would require the report to be sent to the appropriate Scottish Parliament committee to increase scrutiny and accountability.

**Emma Harper:** As I set out during stage 2 proceedings, I am keen that we recognise the wide and complex range of circumstances in which deer exist and are managed in Scotland. It is also important to recognise—and I know that the minister does—that there are more than just red deer in Scotland. Roe deer numbers, for example, are increasing in Scotland, including in urban and peri-urban areas.

I welcome the contact from and engagement with one of the South Scotland deer managers, David Quarrell, as well as other local deer managers. David highlighted to me the local challenges of managing deer in urban and peri-urban areas. Different approaches, for example, in relation to habitats and species, need to be considered when creating a national deer management plan. I thank the minister for his

comments and for meeting me to discuss my wishes for the amendment.

Management solutions must be flexible and locally driven rather than part of a one-size-fits-all national plan. Many deer managers are volunteers or recreational shooters who can and do contribute significantly to control efforts. As the minister mentioned, there are different approaches in the Highlands and the Lowlands to deer management.

It has been raised with me that the requirement for equipment and other associated costs to be self-funded may be a barrier to engagement in lowland deer management, and also for young people who may wish to enter deer management. I am pleased that the minister has lodged amendment 20 to create a national deer management plan that seeks to address those concerns. My amendment 33 is intended to complement that amendment and to set out the kinds of information that I am keen to see included in that national plan, and I urge members to support it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Beatrice Wishart to speak to amendment 59 and other amendments in the group.

**Beatrice Wishart:** Amendment 59 seeks to establish a single deer management dashboard for the whole of Scotland as a means to record, collate and publish data relating to deer management in Scotland, set out in an open and transparent way. I thank Scottish Environment LINK for its engagement on the issue.

The amendment would require that there is a means to bring together data on deer and deer management to be shared widely with land managers, and it would create a unified process of data management and presentation. It is important that data is the basis for informing and delivering sustainable deer management. In other similar European countries, such data is readily available to wildlife management practitioners.

Members will recall that we discussed the matter at stage 2 and heard from the minister about the pilot of the NatureScot app, in which data on deer management can be recorded. The app is a welcome step, but it is still under development. I thank the minister for meeting me to discuss that further following stage 2, and I note that he is still not minded to support amendment 59 today, but I appreciate that he has put on the record the Scottish Government's commitment to getting the data right first. I hope that in future there will be deer data management recording systems with publicly accessible data sets in the interests of transparency.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Edward Mountain to speak to amendment 138 and other amendments in the group.

**Edward Mountain:** I will keep my comments in this group to my amendments 138 and 139. There seem to be a lot of plans for plans and reviews of plans to create the plans, which will then need review. For me, it seems overcomplicated, and I was surprised to be accused of bureaucracy by the minister in the discussion on the last group of amendments. There is a huge mountain here.

My amendments 138 and 139 are very simple. Amendment 138 would ensure that ministers consult those with practical experience in deer management when they prepare a review of the modifications to the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996. Amendment 139 would oblige ministers to consult those with an interest in deer management when they conduct the same review. It is about involving the people who know what they are talking about and have experience of doing it. It is simple really, which is why I will move the amendments.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call minister Jim Fairlie to wind up on amendment 20.

**Jim Fairlie:** The bill will bring into effect the deer working group recommendation that requires us to produce a deer management plan. We are working to gather better data on deer, and I expect that any plan to tackle the data gaps will come out of that. I ask members to accept the amendments that I have put forward and the other ones that I have mentioned.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Mark Ruskell to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 20A.

**Mark Ruskell:** I have nothing further to add. I press amendment 20A.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**The Minister for Public Health and Women's Health (Jenni Minto):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect and I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Minto. Your vote will be recorded.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)

Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 80, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20A disagreed to.*

*Amendment 20B moved—[Mark Ruskell].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)

Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20B disagreed to.*

*Amendment 20C moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20C be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 51, Against 56, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20C disagreed to.*

*Amendment 20D moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20D be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 49, Against 55, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20D disagreed to.*

*Amendment 20E moved—[Mark Ruskell].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20E be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members: No.**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

### Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 78, Against 28, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20E agreed to.*

19:00

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call the minister to press or withdraw amendment 20, as amended.

**Jim Fairlie:** I press.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20, as amended, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)

Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

#### Abstentions

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 105, Against 1, Abstentions 1.

*Amendment 20, as amended, agreed to.*

*Amendment 33 moved—[Emma Harper].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 33 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)

Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 100, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 33 agreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 7 is on venison. Amendment 97, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 132 to 135.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Amendment 97 is about ensuring that deer management is considered in the round and that venison is properly recognised as part of the solution. During stage 2, alongside colleagues from across the chamber, I raised concerns about the need for a clearer focus on venison. I welcome the collaborative work that has taken place since then, leading to venison being included in the national deer management and venison plan under Jim Fairlie's amendment 20, which has just been agreed to.

Amendment 97 would strengthen that approach by requiring consideration of

"what barriers ... exist ... to the effective operation of venison processing facilities"

and to consult people with expertise in the venison industry. That will be essential if we are serious about supporting the sector, increasing capacity and getting more high-quality Scottish venison into our supply chains. I am particularly keen to see more venison being served in public settings, and the amendment would help to move us in that direction. For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 97.

I turn to amendments 133 and 134. I note that, at stage 2, I was keen to see stand-alone amendments on venison. I know that the sector is keen to see the work that was done at stage 2

being replicated at stage 3, so I hope that colleagues from across the chamber will support those stand-alone amendments. I thank Richard Playfair, Richard Cooke, Ross Ewing, Peter Clark, Deirdre Stewart, Linzi Seivwright, Nic MacLeod, Alan McDonnell and other members of the deer management groups. I also thank Lauren Houstoun of Glenkilrie Larder. I know that she has been making amazing proposals and promoting venison, and that Jim Fairlie will be aware of her work.

Amendment 133 would address processing issues and would require ministers to introduce a venison action plan that would set out how deer larders, butchery facilities and distributors can be best utilised to maximise the amount of venison that is available for human consumption.

Amendment 134 would address the lack of use of this particular protein in the public sector and would require the Scottish ministers to introduce a venison action plan that sets out what action they will take to ensure that public bodies regularly offer venison as a meal. It also includes an onus on ministers to take action to remove barriers to the demand and supply of venison. As I highlighted at stage 2, venison is a very good source of micronutrients and high in protein and it can be sourced locally. However, currently there is no requirement for public bodies to use venison, and uptake across local authorities and health boards is minimal. Only one local authority in Scotland serves venison in schools, and no health board offers it to patients.

Amendments 133 and 134 build on my similar amendments at stage 2, and, following stakeholder suggestions, include how the proposed venison action plans would be designed and enforced, which could be done by experts.

Amendment 135 is slightly unique. The amendment is designed to encourage the recovery and donation of surplus venison meat. It would require ministers to consider how much venison is utilised for human consumption and how much is destroyed. It would establish a fund to create incentives for surplus venison meat to be donated, and it would create a group to make recommendations as to what the incentives should be and to raise awareness of the availability of donated venison meat.

Amendment 135 has been developed from research that I did on an Italian law—the Gadda law—which is framed around affordable, healthy eating and has helped to reduce food waste across Italy. I drafted the amendment following a recent visit to Italy, where I found that venison was on pretty much every single menu that was offered in every single restaurant and cafe, which means that Italy is obviously utilising its meat very well.

Scotland is supposed to be on its way to becoming a good food nation, yet the situation with food insecurity has not improved. The Scottish Government's latest health survey showed that around 8 per cent of adults were worried about running out of food due to a lack of money. The Trussell Trust found that 1 million people face food insecurity, and we continue to see near-record levels of hunger and hardship in our communities, despite 1 million tonnes of food and drink being wasted in Scotland in 2021.

The donation of venison to food banks and to people in need in Scotland and the UK is not a novel idea. For example, last year, the Country Food Trust worked with deerstalkers to cull 884 deer in Sussex, which provided around 170,000 meals for 69 food banks. Projects have also been established—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am terribly sorry to interrupt, Ms Hamilton. Could you resume your seat for just a second?

**Rachael Hamilton:** Yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will just say that there is quite a lot of background noise in the chamber, and it is difficult for all members who are keen to listen to the debate to actually hear what is being said.

Please resume, Ms Hamilton.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer—I am about to conclude. There are similar projects to the one that I described—for example, in the Cairngorms national park.

My amendment 135 aims to ensure that we make the most of venison, which is a very healthy and nutritious product. I will not say much about amendment 132, in the name of Edward Mountain, as I will leave him to explain it.

I move amendment 97.

**Edward Mountain:** First, I take members back to the reason for the passing of the 1996 act. Some members might remember that, at that time, there were quite high levels of poaching across Scotland—in fact, there were numerous occurrences of vehicles stopping on the edge of the A9 and deer were shot there, hauled off and sold.

One of the protections that were put in place to prevent poaching was a requirement for a licence to deal in venison, and that is why I have lodged amendment 138. I want to understand the Government's position on that.

If we get to a stage—as I hope that we will—where we have a deer population that is manageable and sustainable, the high levels of culls that will have been needed to achieve that would no longer be required. That will make

venison more attractive and will, therefore, probably increase the likelihood of poaching. The requirements for a licence to deal in venison and for records to be kept by venison dealers will, therefore, be really important. At present, when someone takes deer to a venison dealer, they have to prove where it was shot, and say that it was fit and healthy when it was shot and there was nothing abnormal about its behaviour.

Under the bill, all those requirements are being withdrawn, which I find quite odd. That is why I have lodged amendment 132: to probe the matter and see whether I can get an explanation from the minister as to why he feels that none of that is necessary. Those of us who are involved in deer management feel that it will be a loss.

Turning to the amendments from my colleague Rachael Hamilton, I totally agree with what she is trying to achieve regarding venison. Venison is a great nutritious meal and we should be eating a lot more of it, especially if we are having to kill a lot more of it.

I remind members that, just prior to Christmas, we got to a stage at which venison dealers were no longer prepared to take deer in because they could not sell them—there was just too much there. A lot of the big venison dealers currently have so much venison in cold stores that they are not sure what to do with it. We could be using and eating it, and that is why I support Rachael Hamilton's amendments.

I will make just two more points in this group. First, I note that Rachael Hamilton's amendment 135 is about ensuring that venison is not dumped—I think that she used a similar expression. I agree. I find it totally unacceptable that people shoot deer and dump them on the hill, making no effort to recover them. That is a disgrace, and it should not happen in Scotland unless there is an environmental reason for doing it. Saying that it might be too difficult to extract it is not a good reason.

Secondly, when the venison plan is drawn up, I hope that the Scottish Government will consider how Forestry and Land Scotland larders, which have been built at huge expense to the taxpayer, can be made available to people whom the Government is asking to cull deer on its behalf, if they do not have larder facilities.

I will leave it at that, and wait to hear the minister's response.

19:15

**Jim Fairlie:** With regard to amendment 97, it is absolutely critical that we look at deer management as a whole, as Rachael Hamilton said. We are creating plans, and that is why, in

collaboration with Rachael Hamilton, Rhoda Grant and Mark Ruskell, who raised the issue at stage 2, we have included venison in the national deer management and venison plan that I proposed through amendment 20.

Amendment 97 would require us to consider

“what barriers ... exist in relation to the effective operation of venison processing facilities”

and to consult relevant people. As I set out during the stage 2 debate, I want to see a shift in the way that we talk about deer management. I want to focus instead on venison product that we can harvest, and I am keen to increase the amount of venison that is making its way on to the menus in our public spaces. The national deer management and venison plan, along with amendment 97, will help us to achieve that aim. For those reasons, I urge members to support amendment 97.

On amendment 132, I fundamentally disagree with Mr Mountain’s intentions to prevent repeal of the requirement for licensing of venison dealers in the bill. Time and again in Parliament, we have heard how important it is to raise the profile of venison and to increase consumption of it. That was also debated at stage 2 of the bill. The licence acts as a barrier to those goals, so it is entirely suitable for venison to follow the same protocols that there are for other wild game. I want to increase its availability while maintaining high food standards. In addition, Food Standards Scotland has confirmed that traceability of wild venison can be maintained through existing food safety and hygiene legislation, which applies to all meat and wild game. Ultimately, the licence for dealers is no longer fit for purpose, and it is for those reasons that I urge members to oppose amendment 132.

Finally, on amendments 133 and 134, which seek to make better use of venison by requiring the Scottish ministers to prepare venison action plans, I am a bit saddened that Ms Hamilton has lodged them, given the multiple constructive conversations that we have had since stage 2 in an effort to reach agreement on these venison amendments. As I have just stated, when we create the action plans, it is critical that we look at deer management as a whole. I fully agree with the sentiment of maximising the benefits of venison, but I believe that that can be achieved through our national deer management and venison plan, as introduced in my amendment 20. Creating stand-alone plans that focus solely on venison risks overlooking the wider objectives and the need for integrated solutions.

With regard to amendment 135, we are implementing various strands of work on venison, including looking at how we can learn from the Wild Jura Venison project, through which products are being distributed in schools. There are some

fundamental flaws with the proposal. Amendment 135 would also require ministers to introduce a fund to incentivise the donation of venison. If someone is being paid to donate, I am not sure that that counts as a donation.

I want to see a flourishing venison market, and I am taking steps forward to ensure that I support that. I therefore ask Ms Hamilton not to move amendments 133 to 135. If they are moved, I strongly urge members to oppose them.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Rachael Hamilton to wind up, and to press or withdraw amendment 97.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I will not say too many words, because I am going to press amendment 97 and move all the other amendments.

I thank Jim Fairlie for his collaborative working. I know that the Government made a strong effort to get closer to the sector with regard to the venison action plan, which was important.

I brought the amendments on a stand-alone venison action plan back at stage 3, because the sector and the deer management groups were quite nervous about the venison action plan being rolled in with other measures. I think that this is a good compromise, because I do not believe that the Government will go any further, as Jim Fairlie has stated. I recognise that the groups that have done all the work to establish the deer management plan are the ones that really wanted to have a stand-alone venison action plan, and I have already shared that with the minister. I will move the amendments because I want to make the point. I do not want people in the sector to feel as though I have not listened to them or that I have left them behind. I wanted to bring them along with us over the years.

I am disappointed, however, that Mr Fairlie does not like my Gadda law proposal. The Italians do it very well, and I would recommend that Jim Fairlie visit Italy: he can go to the Alps and get some venison. They do it really well. The model works there, and the Government has backed it. The Italians ensure that they use the surplus and the waste. We have a long way to go here. It is something that even Mark Ruskell could back.

*Amendment 97 agreed to.*

*Amendment 98 moved—[Mark Ruskell].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 98 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 22, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 98 disagreed to.*

**Section 21—Power to enter on land**

*Amendment 99 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 99 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)

Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 99 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 100 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 100 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)

Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 100 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 101 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 101 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 101 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 102 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 102 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 86, Against 23, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 102 agreed to.*

*Amendment 103 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 103 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 103 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 104 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 104 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

## For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

## Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 104 disagreed to.*

### **Section 22—Power to require information and documents**

*Amendment 105 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

19:30

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 105 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)

Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 105 disagreed to.*

### **Section 24—Authorisation for taking or killing deer during close seasons**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 8 is on authorisations. Amendment 106, in the name of Edward Mountain, is grouped with amendments 107 to 126, 54, 55, 127 to 129, 56 to 58, 130 and 131.

**Edward Mountain:** I have a mere 26 amendments in this group to speak to. I call amendment 106 the reverse Bambi amendment. Amendments 106 and 107 would change the law with regard to lactating female deer and calves. Calves should not be shot and taken from their mother unless the intention is to shoot the mother as well. It is unfair to leave the mother in a situation in which she is still lactating and subject to mastitis if the calf has been shot.

Amendment 108 would deal with the issue of shooting deer with shotguns. I do not know whether the minister has ever done that, and I do not know how many people in this Parliament have shot deer with shotguns. I have done it, but it is not something that I would generally do, and I

have never been comfortable doing it, because shooting deer with a shotgun requires loads of very heavy cartridges and a minimum of SSG, which is a shot size.

If we are to extend the use of shotguns—I can see that there may be an argument for that, but I am very nervous about it—there should be very strict controls in place. If you are going to shoot deer with a shotgun, you should do it very close to you. The load size should not be below 36g, and there is no evidence that steel shot is suitable for shooting deer. I also do not feel that shooting a red deer with a shotgun is humane unless you use a solid slug, which the minister agrees that deer management plans should require.

Amendment 110 would remove the requirement for mandatory training, given that there is no evidence that mandatory training would lead to an increased level of competence. Through self-regulation, the sector has maintained a very high standard of training for many years. It is concerning that policy and legislation have been drafted under the guise of safeguarding deer welfare without a clear case for mandatory training having been provided. The deer working group speculated that wounding rates might be between 6 and 17 per cent without providing any verified data. In fact, Forestry and Land Scotland, which shoots deer on our behalf, has no record of how many shots are taken to kill its deer and how many misses or woundings there are. Perhaps such information should be collected before mandatory training is allowed to go ahead.

Amendments 111 and 112 would exempt from mandatory training those who have continuously possessed a firearms certificate since 1975 and those who were born before the end of 1975, respectively. The average age of a deerstalker at the moment is around 58 or 59, which means that those would, in effect, be grandfather rights and would stop us getting into a situation in which young people, who may have become qualified by reading the law and understanding books, test people who have been shooting deer for perhaps 30 or 40 years and deciding whether they are competent. To me, that is hugely demeaning of the incredibly hard work that those people have put in. Amendment 113, which relates to that, would exempt from mandatory training those who could provide a reference to prove that they are fit and competent, by which I mean that they have shot deer for some time.

Amendments 114 to 120 would oblige ministers to consult various parties when making supplementary provisions pertaining to the register of those who are considered fit and competent to shoot deer and to mandatory training. There are very serious concerns about firearms licensing and the fit and competent register under the bill,

especially about the implications for those who travel to Scotland from the rest of the UK. The Home Office has already noted that the bill would require amendments to its firearms licensing guide. My amendments therefore seek to provide for consultation with various UK-wide stakeholders to ensure that new legislation relating to mandatory training and the fit and competent register would be brought to the attention of those granting firearms licences outside Scotland to those who take land in Scotland. That makes sense.

Amendments 121, 122 and 123 would oblige ministers to properly consult on mandatory training. Consultation with and assessment of those who carry out deer management should be undertaken, including an assessment of funding, resources and capacity, and demand for training. Consideration should also be given to wounding rates, second shot placement and other welfare factors, as well as the financial impact on deer practitioners. I believe that a statement should be laid before Parliament affirming that the necessary conditions have been met for mandatory training to be introduced, and that it should not be introduced if those conditions cannot be met.

Amendment 124 would oblige ministers to consult those with

“an interest in the regulations on the recognition of international qualifications for deer management”

and how those would fit with the enforcement of the fit and competent register. The Government says much about keeping pace with Europe. In Europe, they have tests, such as one in Germany called the Jagdschein, that are carried out annually and could be brought to this country. If someone has proved that they are fit and competent to shoot deer in Germany, we should surely consider that they are fit and competent to do that in this country.

Amendment 125 would oblige ministers to

“publish a statement setting out ... the scientific evidence relied upon in support of the proposed regulations”,

along with an assessment of the required training and its availability, the required resources and the impact on deer welfare.

Amendment 126 would oblige ministers to create a fund to meet some of the costs of deer management practices and the costs that people would face due to the introduction of mandatory training. That would help them along the route.

Amendments 127, 128 and 129 would remedy the bill’s current undermining of basic safety aspects with respect to the introduction of concurrent sporting rights. Amendments 127 and 129 would oblige the occupier of a holding to gain agreement from the owner of the sporting rights of

that land prior to taking deer in order to prevent damage. Amendment 128 would remove the ability that the bill gives SNH to decree that anyone is fit and competent to take deer, which I believe creates a huge conflict of interest with the bill’s other provisions regarding the fit and competent register.

Amendment 130 would remove section 31A—“Right of occupier or grazings committee to prevent damage by deer”—in order to ensure that everyone talks to one another.

I turn finally to amendment 131, which seeks to remove section 32, on the liability for taking or killing stray farmed deer. Once a farmed deer has got out of its enclosure, it is feral. I do not believe that any member would suggest that it was possible to catch it again and put it back into its enclosure. Once it has got out, it joins the wild population. I have seen that happen in Speyside—farmed deer that escaped from a deer park in Moray have now spread across the lower Spey catchment. The only way to know whether they are farmed deer—the old, original ones that escaped, of which there are very few left—is if they have a tag in their ear.

Trying to identify such deer is more difficult than you would think. Indeed, trying to identify a farmed deer with a yellow tag using a thermal imager at night just ain’t possible. Section 32 makes a mockery of what we are trying to do. Once farmed deer are out and have joined the wild population, they are feral and need to be controlled.

I will leave my comments at that.

I move amendment 106.

**Jim Fairlie:** I will speak to my amendments 54 to 58 before turning to Mr Mountain’s amendments in the group.

My amendments seek to do two things. First, they seek to provide reassurance that I have listened to the concerns that have been raised at stage 2 about the potential safety risks of expanding the land on which occupiers can kill deer in order to prevent damage. Secondly, they seek to address the concerns about relationships between owners and occupiers.

Amendment 56 will enable us to set out, via secondary legislation, further steps that must be taken before rights under new section 26 of the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996 can be exercised. I listened carefully to what was said during the stage 2 debate and the solutions that were proposed about notification. I do not think that, at this stage, a solution to the safety concerns can be found in notification, but I am committed to finding a solution that works and, importantly, one that enables tenants to take action in a timely way when deer are a problem. It is my intention that,

before the proposed changes that will be made by replacing section 26 are brought into effect, I will consult with those affected—occupiers, landowners and sporting tenants—on options to address those safety concerns.

As I have set out previously, NatureScot is already working on updates to the deer code. Amendment 56 will enable us to set out in that code further guidance on section 26 rights. It is my intention that the updated code will cover that and will address some of the other issues that were raised at stage 2 around the relationship between occupiers and owners or sporting tenants generally.

The key aim is to find a way for us to work together and to enable occupiers to tackle damage that is occurring without the process becoming unnecessarily burdensome. I have also supported Ms Grant's amendment in the earlier group that will enable occupiers, among others, to seek NatureScot intervention where damage is being caused by deer.

I urge members across the chamber to support my amendments.

I turn to amendments 106 and 107, in the name of Edward Mountain. I appreciate that there are a wide range of views on the best ways to manage deer in Scotland, and I understand that there are legitimate concerns about deer welfare. Mr Mountain's amendments are well intentioned, but I do not think that it is appropriate for what is proposed to be placed in primary legislation. It is already best practice, and therefore a requirement of a NatureScot authorisation, to cull a calf first. If, for any reason, a calf is orphaned, it is a requirement that it is then culled.

It is intended that compliance with that kind of restriction would be a requirement in order to be considered competent to shoot deer under the new register. Perhaps Mr Mountain would agree that that would be a fitting use of a register.

For those reasons, I am asking the member not to press amendments 106 and 107. If he does so, I would ask members to oppose them.

Amendment 108 seeks to remove red deer from the species of a deer that could be shot with a shotgun, where authorised by NatureScot. Shotguns are currently permitted for the shooting of all species of deer in Scotland, as long as they meet the specifications that are set out in the Deer (Firearms etc) (Scotland) Order 1985.

The bill regulates the use of shotguns, meaning that shotguns can be used only to shoot deer under authorisation from NatureScot. One of the benefits of that is that we will gain a better understanding of who is using shotguns to shoot deer and in what circumstances. I gave

consideration to banning the use of shotguns to shoot deer outright, but, on balance, I think that this authorisation process is the best one at this stage.

Mr Mountain's amendment 108 would unnecessarily constrain the flexibility of the authorisation regime. We will keep the matter under review, though, and NatureScot will continue to consider the circumstances in which it is appropriate for a shotgun to be used.

19:45

**Edward Mountain:** My point with regard to amendment 108 is to remove red deer, because I just think that they are too big to shoot with a shotgun. It is what I would have described when I was a soldier as an act of war. It would be like taking on a tank with a rifle—it is just not physically possible.

Amendment 109 gives SNH the ability to signify that a certain type of ammunition—not steel shot—can be used, provided that it uses 36g of powder. I do not think that that restrains anyone—it just gives them good guidelines. Does the minister agree?

**Jim Fairlie:** I have already stated the position on authorisations for a shotgun, and that is the position that we are at. However, I said in my opening remarks that that is something that can potentially be looked at in guidance.

I would also point out that there are exemptions in the 1996 act for the prevention of suffering and protection of public safety. For example—and this is an example that Mr Mountain used in a previous debate—if a deer is hit by a car and injured, and a farmer with a shotgun shoots it to end its suffering, that would not require authorisation. That is an important point to make.

Amendment 109 also relates to the use of shotguns and seeks to insert a new specification for ammunition used with authorised shotguns. I have already set out that we will define shotguns in relation to this part of the bill via secondary legislation. Indeed, it is important to remember that ammunition weights and specifications for shooting deer are generally set out in the Deer (Firearms etc) (Scotland) Order 1985. I understand that there might be concerns about steel alternatives, but we can, and do, update the firearms order as appropriate. It was most recently updated in 2023, and agreed to by Parliament. The most important point is that that legislation was consulted on and evidence based; unfortunately, Mr Mountain's amendment is not.

As for amendment 110, the proposal was debated at stage 2 and is, quite frankly, ludicrous. If it were to be agreed to, it would mean that we

would be prevented from even requiring a baseline level of competence in deerstalkers in Scotland. I know that we have many highly skilled stalkers right across the country, and this legislation is not about undermining them; if anything, I want to recognise that skill further. I have set out that we will consult the sector on the proposals to bring the register into effect, and we will consider all the aspects of transitional arrangements, including the duration of any transition period, to ensure that the register works. However, I do not think that it is tenable to stand in the chamber and raise issues of deer welfare and public safety while, at the same time, opposing a baseline level of competence. For those reasons, I urge members to strongly oppose amendment 110.

I will address amendments 111 to 124 quickly, and I will not be entering into a debate on each of them individually. As I have set out many times, the detail of the fit and competent register will be set out in secondary legislation, and we will consult widely and fully on it. Mr Mountain's amendments include automatic competence for people over the age of 50 or anyone else who has held a firearm for more than 50 years. They might have held a firearm certificate for shooting birds and never shot a deer in their life. In fact, I have held a shotgun licence—a rifle licence—for many years and have never shot a deer. Just because I have held a licence, that does not make me a fit and competent person to shoot deer.

At present, I think that references are subjective and offer no consistent assurance of competence. They also do not guarantee knowledge of current best practice, welfare standards or safety requirements. I will look at all the issues that Mr Mountain has raised as part of the consultation process, including access to training, appropriate training levels, arrangements for international stalkers and international training standards. I will also look at cross-border stalkers, funding for training schemes, transitional arrangements, the appropriate transition periods, and more.

There is no question but that the register is necessary, but I am absolutely committed to bringing it forward in a way that is not burdensome to deer managers and which brings benefits for us all. Therefore, I strongly urge members to oppose amendments 111 to 124.

With regard to amendment 125, which seeks to require a statement to be made that sets out the justification for our proposals to bring in mandatory training, the member should be aware that regulations under section 17A of the 1996 act will require to be accompanied by a policy memorandum, which will set out the policy rationale, the evidence base and the justification for the proposals, and it will be subject to full parliamentary scrutiny. Therefore, requiring a

statement in advance of any change is unnecessary.

On amendment 126, although supporting access to training is important, it is not necessary to legislate for it. Consulting deer managers on what they need to access training is far preferable to legislating for it now without evidence.

Amendments 127 and 129 would, in effect, make defunct the rights that are afforded to occupiers under new sections 26 and 26ZA of the 1996 act. The purpose behind those sections is to enable occupiers to address damage in cases in which they do not ordinarily have the right to do so. If they had permission from the holder of the sporting rights to shoot the deer, they would have the right to do so and new section 26 would not be necessary. The rights that are afforded are about addressing damage quickly and addressing it when agreement cannot be reached. We will set out further in guidance how occupiers, owners and holders of sporting rights should work together. However, Edward Mountain's amendments are unworkable.

Amendment 128 would remove the provision that allows occupiers to authorise individuals who are approved by NatureScot as fit and competent to take or kill deer. It is fair that an occupier may not be able to shoot the deer themselves in the circumstances that are set out in new section 26, and they may wish to have someone else carry out the deer management on their behalf. In those circumstances, they can authorise someone who is approved by NatureScot as fit and competent to do so. That is not a general right to harvest deer. I urge members to oppose amendment 128.

Amendment 130 seeks to completely remove the changes that we propose to make by replacing section 26 of the 1996 act. That would completely undermine the aims and objectives of the bill. We have debated the issue at stage 2. Section 26ZA will empower occupiers of agricultural land or woodland and grazings committees to act swiftly to prevent injury to livestock or damage that is caused by deer to not only crops and woodland but the natural heritage and environment. I will not justify that any further, and I ask members to oppose amendment 130.

Amendment 131 seeks to remove section 32 from the bill, so that changes to the 1996 act that relate to liability for taking or killing stray farmed deer would not be made. In particular, section 32 introduces an offence of failing to report the taking or killing of stray farmed deer and institutes a defence to civil liability for taking or killing such deer. Our changes via the bill will mean that if someone shoots a deer because it is causing damage, for example, and is able, after the fact, to identify it as a stray farmed deer, they must report the shooting to the police within five working days,

or they will be committing an offence. If they report the killing of the stray farmed deer, no offence will have taken place. Further, it will be a defence for the person to show that they did not know and could not reasonably have known that the deer was a stray farmed deer. Where a person complies with the requirement to report any such killing, they will also have a defence in any civil proceedings that are brought against them. That is all that section 32 is aiming to do, and it was a recommendation of the deer working group. I therefore urge members to oppose amendment 131.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur):** I call Edward Mountain to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 106.

**Edward Mountain:** I will keep it short, because I do not suppose that there is any point in debating with somebody who has decried my amendments as “ludicrous” and “unworkable”. They have been submitted because they are not ludicrous and because I think that they are worth while debating in the chamber.

I will make a couple of points. My experience is that people use firearms to shoot deer and other mammals. To shoot birds, they use not firearms but, mainly, shotguns, which may be why there is some confusion in the minister’s mind over the difference between the two when it comes to killing deer, and shot sizes.

I note another issue when it comes to notification about farmed deer. It is a pity that the Government is so keen on ensuring that that happens. I will take the minister back to 2018, I think, when Forestry and Land Scotland went through a purge of killing 222 sheep. I have found no record of its notifying the owners of those sheep. However, what is good for sheep is one thing and what is good for farmed deer is another. I will leave it there, because I do not think that I will win this debate or that it will be properly engaged with.

I press amendment 106.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 106 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)

Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 39, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 106 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 107 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 107 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)

Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)

Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 40, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 107 disagreed to.*

### **Section 27—Offence of shooting deer with a shotgun**

*Amendment 108 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 108 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 108 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 109 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 109 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 109 disagreed to.*

20:00

**Section 28—Register of authorised persons***Amendment 110 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 110 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)

Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 110 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 111 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 111 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**Edward Mountain:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My machine did not seem to want to connect. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will ensure that that is recorded, Mr Mountain.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysof (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 23, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 111 disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Amendment 112 has already been debated with amendment 106. I call Edward Mountain to move or not move the amendment.

**Edward Mountain:** Presiding Officer, I am going to move all of my amendments from 112 to 126. Would it help the Parliament if I moved them en bloc, or would that not be possible? Sorry—I am trying to be helpful, not divisive.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I appreciate the intention. I will take advice and confirm.

Okay—let us give it a go.

*Amendments 112 to 126 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Does any member object to a single question being put on those amendments?

**Martin Whitfield:** I object in relation to amendment 113 only.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Okay, we will take the next two amendments individually, and then we will vote on the others en bloc.

The question is, that amendment 112 be agreed to. Are we all agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 112 disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 113 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Nicola Sturgeon (Glasgow Southside) (SNP):** On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Sturgeon. I will ensure that that is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)

Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 41, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 113 disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendments 114 to 126 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Douglas Lumsden:** On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted yes.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)

Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendments 114 to 126 disagreed to.*

#### **Section 31A—Right of occupier or grazings committee to prevent damage by deer**

*Amendment 54 moved—[Jim Fairlie].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 54 be agreed to. Are we agreed? *[Interruption.]* I think that I heard a “no”. If anybody is saying “no”, can they say it loudly?

The question is, that amendment 54 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members indicated agreement.**

*Amendment 54 agreed to.*

*Amendment 55 moved—[Jim Fairlie]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 127 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 127 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)

Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 80, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 127 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 128 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 128 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)

MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 128 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 129 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 129 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 129 disagreed to.*

*Amendments 56 to 58 moved—[Jim Fairlie]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 130 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 130 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 130 disagreed to.*

### Section 32—Liability for taking or killing stray farmed deer

*Amendment 131 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

20:15

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 131 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 131 disagreed to.*

**After section 32**

*Amendment 59 not moved.*

**Section 33—Removal of requirements related to licensing to deal in venison**

*Amendment 132 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 132 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 24, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 132 disagreed to.*

### After section 33

*Amendment 133 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 133 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 133 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 134 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 134 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 134 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 135 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 135 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members: No.**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 50, Against 56, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 135 disagreed to.*

### **Section 33A—Review of modifications to the Deer (Scotland) Act 1996**

*Amendments 136 and 137 not moved.*

*Amendment 138 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 138 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### **For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### **Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 138 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 139 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 139 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 139 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 140 moved—[Tim Eagle].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 140 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Ind)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 100, Against 9, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 140 agreed to.*

#### Section 33B—Building regulations: integral swift nest box

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 9 is on the introduction, management and protection of native and non-native species. Amendment 141, in the name of Mark Ruskell, is grouped with amendments 61, 159, 164 to 166, 168, 171, 177 to 185 and 45.

**Mark Ruskell:** I am absolutely delighted to speak to amendment 141, which would finally deliver swift bricks on new buildings in Scotland.

The bill does some very big things for nature, including putting nature targets into law for the first time, but it would be a wasted opportunity if we did not use the bill to also make the simple changes that can help nature to recover.

Swifts are incredible: they visit our communities every summer and they treat us to their amazing aerial displays. It is a joyful moment each year when they return from Africa, but that joy is tinged with sadness because the species is in serious decline. We have lost nearly two thirds of our swifts since the year 2000. The reasons are varied—climate change and loss of insect diet are serious factors, but perhaps the biggest reason that swifts cannot thrive in healthy numbers is simply that they have lost so many nesting sites in our buildings. Modern building standards have brought benefits, but the system that is improving our homes has unintentionally squeezed out the space for swifts and many other small birds, and they are suffering.

A swift nest brick, which costs around £30, is such a simple solution to give nature a home. However, despite there being an agreed British standard for swift bricks, they are still not required in new builds. If amendment 141 is passed tonight, it would ensure that swift bricks are mandated in new builds in Scotland, which would be the first country in the UK to achieve that.

I lodged and moved an amendment on mandating swift bricks at stage 2, and I am very grateful for the cross-party support that I had to get that marker—finally—into the bill. As a result, section 33B places a duty on Scottish ministers to make regulations requiring

“the installation of an average of one ... swift box per”

building. However, following discussion with the cabinet secretary, I appreciate more fully the procedural concerns that were raised in the stage 2 debate, and I have worked with her on amendment 141.

I want to get this right, even if it takes a little longer for new building standards to be delivered. Amendment 141 would replace section 33B to address those concerns, ensuring that provisions are introduced in such a way that the statutory duties in the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 are fulfilled and that sufficient time is provided to enable the outcomes of statutory processes to inform, and be fully incorporated into, regulations and the technical guidance that accompanies them. The amendment provides assurance that action will be taken by the Scottish Government in a way that is suited to the purpose, role and conventions of the building standards system, while delivering the intent of the amendment that I lodged at stage 2, which was supported by members in the Parliament.

I look forward to hearing more from the cabinet secretary about the Government’s commitment to the action for swifts. In particular, I would like to hear confirmation that future consultations will focus on an average minimum of one brick per building and on the need for boxes that follow British standard guidelines.

Lastly, I thank all the campaigners across these islands who are working on swift conservation. In particular, I thank Hannah Bourne-Taylor, who is in the public gallery tonight. She has inspired thousands of people, including me, to take up the fight to save our swifts. I hope that we can get this amendment over the line at Holyrood tonight, set an important example for the rest of the UK and give swifts a home for good.

I move amendment 141.

20:30

**Mercedes Villalba:** I start by discussing some of the other amendments in this group that are of particular note.

Scottish Labour will support Mark Ruskell’s amendment 141. Swift nest boxes are vital in order to restore swift populations, so I thank Mark Ruskell for championing the issue and the very many constituents who have contacted us about the amendment.

I also want to highlight Scottish Labour's support for Beatrice Wishart's amendment 159. I raised similar amendments at stage 2 because urgent action is needed to tackle invasive non-native species, and I am pleased to see the matter brought back at stage 3.

My amendment 61 seeks to end exemptions granted by ministerial order to the introduction of invasive and non-native species in the Wildlife and Natural Environment (Scotland) Act 2011 when such exemptions are made solely for commercial or economic reasons. I have brought back the amendment, following my amendments 54, 55, 56 and 12 at stage 2, which sought to address and shine a light on the extent of environmental damage that is caused by invasive non-native species. In particular, my amendment 56 sought to address exemptions granted

"solely for economic or commercial purposes".

I did not move that amendment at stage 2 because the cabinet secretary said that she was prepared to work with me on redrafting it for stage 3. Ms Martin said:

"If she considers not moving amendments 12, 54, 55 and 56, we can work on them ahead of stage 3."—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 19 November 2025; c 84.]

Unfortunately, despite meeting the cabinet secretary ahead of stage 3 and raising that specific issue with her, work in this particular area did not occur. I have therefore reworked amendment 56 and brought it back today through amendment 61.

At stage 2, the cabinet secretary raised concerns about the impact that the amendment could have on plantations of Sitka spruce. However, let us be clear: that would be the case only if the plantations provided no environmental value whatsoever, which is something that we simply cannot afford. We need the plantations to have a net positive impact by, for example, sequestering more carbon than is released from peatlands damaged by conifer seed rain. That would be a reasonable intervention for the Government to make. It is reasonable to require those in our forestry sector to do more than just make money. They are custodians of our land and must justify the use of invasive and non-native species beyond profit margins, because if they do not, it is our land, our air, our water, our environment and our health that will pay the price.

If the cabinet secretary cannot support amendment 61, it suggests that the Scottish Government is prepared to put private commercial profit above everything else—including our natural environment—rather than at least attempt to balance it against our other concerns. I ask her to consider the amendment carefully and to be clear

that the bill cannot be used to greenwash destructive business practices.

**Beatrice Wishart:** Amendment 159 developed from my amendments at stage 2 on invasive non-native species, which were in turn developed from discussions that I had with the RSPB, which I thank for its expertise and assistance. At stage 2, the cabinet secretary made arguments against those amendments, which amendment 159 seeks to address, and I thank the cabinet secretary for meeting me to discuss the issue. Although I realise that she still might not be in favour of the amendment, I would like to set out the background to how the issue has come about.

Amendment 159 would give a statutory footing to the invasive non-native species action plan for Scotland and make it a condition of that plan that it tackles three of the most pressing specific invasive non-native species—or INNS—issues that Scotland faces: land access for controlling highly mobile INNS; invasive seeding non-native conifers; and better regulation of non-native game bird releases. Scotland's delicate island ecosystems are especially vulnerable to INNS.

The Orkney Native Wildlife Project, which tackles stoats, is showing great promise when it comes to wildlife benefits, but it faces a significant barrier to access for surveillance and control. To bring down stoat numbers permanently, the project must be able to reach all the animals. Legal advice to NatureScot confirms the inappropriateness of current legislation—the use of species control orders—in this situation. At stage 2, the cabinet secretary said that before a change in access legislation could be made, wider consultation would be required. My amendment 159 seeks to ensure that such consultation is undertaken as quickly as possible by making the change a key element of a national INNS plan that has statutory footing.

In Scotland, the invasion of non-native conifers from plantations into sensitive habitats is a significant and growing INNS pressure. Sitka spruce is the fastest-spreading plant species in the country. NatureScot analysis estimates that more than 30 per cent of Scotland's peatlands are at risk of colonisation. Native woodlands are suffering seeding conifer invasion, and the cost of removing those conifers is already affecting conservation funding. A national INNS plan would signal the development and implementation of a co-ordinated national programme to manage that problem.

The release of non-native game birds for hunting in Scotland, particularly when released in high densities, can threaten native species, damage habitats and risk disease transfer to wildlife. Wildlife in Shetland has been among the most severely affected by highly pathogenic avian

influenza, or HPAI, in the whole of Europe. Red-legged partridges were released for the first time in Shetland last year, and an environmental information request to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs showed that no red-legged partridges were placed on the poultry register, which is a key mechanism for controlling HPAI in Shetland.

That is one example of a wider issue. Between autumn 2022 and autumn 2023, more than 31,000 non-native game birds either died of HPAI or were slaughtered at seven infected game-rearing premises across Scotland. All those infected birds had open access to Scotland's natural environment, putting native species at risk. Since then, there have been multiple HPAI mass-mortality events involving non-native game birds, including more than 500 pheasants found dead in Scotland's natural environment in August 2024, with the standard sample all testing HPAI positive. That event was in the Borders, 40 miles from the Parliament.

Importantly, amendment 159 does not seek to ban game bird releases. Instead, it seeks to utilise an INNS action plan to investigate and build safeguards for instances when environmental damage or disease transfer from game bird release is likely.

The environmental impacts of invasive species have increased sharply over the past century, and they continue to establish and spread. INNS costs in Scotland are estimated at £500 million per year. The amendment seeks to ensure the sustained commitment that the intensifying INNS challenge in Scotland demands. If the cabinet secretary is not minded to support amendment 159, I ask her to confirm the Scottish Government's commitment to addressing issues created by INNS and what work it is doing on the three issues that are raised in my amendment.

**Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD):** Amendments 164 and 165 are alternative amendments that include the same core provision. They would amend section 16 of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 to include specific reference to

“the purpose of falconry to kill or take mountain hares”

during a specified season

“beginning with 1 October and ending with the last day of February”.

The purpose of the changes is to offer legal certainty to those who have been granted licences to take mountain hares for the purpose of falconry that they are not committing an offence and that their activities, when in accordance with the terms of their licence, are not prohibited.

Amendment 164 includes a

“For the avoidance of doubt”

subsection, which could give even greater confidence to falconers. However, in response to concerns that that might introduce uncertainty into the bill, given that other provisions do not have that wording, I have lodged amendment 165 as an alternative option that does not include that subsection.

Barry Blyther has been a tenacious campaigner on this issue. Members will recall that, at stage 3 of the Animals and Wildlife (Penalties, Protections and Powers) (Scotland) Bill in 2020, the Parliament passed an amendment to give greater protection to mountain hares. The intention was sound: to curtail large-scale culls of the species. However, it had a major impact on Barry and many other falconers.

We are talking about a small number of people who care for their birds of prey by allowing them to exercise their natural behaviour. Under the current law, falconers fear being on the wrong side of the law. Barry has campaigned extensively for almost five years to rectify the oversight of the legislation process, including through petition PE1859, which gained almost 10,000 signatures.

Barry has two golden eagles, both of which are captive bred. They are aged 21 and 27. They have appeared in hundreds of hours of television and film, from “Winterwatch” to “Hostile Planet”. They have hunted hares with Chris Packham—can a conservation activity be better represented than by an eagle flying to the fist after a hunt for Chris Packham? The 2020 act effectively grounded both eagles; my amendments seek to change that.

I am grateful to Murdo Fraser for lodging an amendment on this issue at stage 2, which the Government rejected on the basis that it was too broad and covered species beyond mountain hares. My amendments respond to that criticism by limiting the provision to this single species. At Barry's suggestion, I have also included a specified season in the amendments. In his years of experience, he has seen a change in the breeding season and wants to limit the licence period to make sure that it is in line with those changes.

Under the current arrangements, Barry has been granted a limited licence to take up to 50 mountain hares per season by the method of falconry for the purposes of science, research, education and photography. The limited change that is proposed in my amendment would provide clarity and certainty by adding falconry itself as a purpose.

Let us put that proposal in context. Since 2021, as a result of legislative change by this Parliament, NatureScot has issued 116 licences for the killing of almost 5,000 mountain hares. My amendments

would increase that number by a tiny fraction but would give golden eagles and others the freedom that nature intended.

**John Mason:** I lodged amendment 166 concerning ptarmigan on the suggestion of the RSPB.

The ptarmigan, or *Lagopus muta*, is an iconic upland species that has undergone a severe long-term decline in its breeding population of more than 80 per cent since the 1960s, according to game bag data. That resulted in it getting red status on the birds of conservation concern list in 2021. That population reduction correlates with the loss of range that was identified in the “Bird Atlas 2007-11”, which has largely been driven by climate change, an erosion of the cold montane habitat that the species requires, and overgrazing.

Despite its red listing and the acknowledged pressures that it is under, the species remains on the quarry list and is permitted to be hunted in the open season from 12 August to 10 December. The impact of hunting on the species is currently unknown because bag returns are not required to be submitted to the relevant authority. However, for a species that is under such existing pressures, the precautionary principle should surely be applied. The species should be removed from schedule 2 to the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 until such a time that hunting can be shown not to have a detrimental impact on the population.

Given the severity of the population decline, the sensitivity of the ptarmigan to environmental change and the principle that wildlife management should be grounded in conservation necessity rather than historical sporting tradition, removing the species from the quarry list is an essential and proportionate action. Doing that during the recognised biodiversity crisis would help to safeguard Scotland’s fragile montane system and ensure that management practices reflect modern ecological realities.

**Tim Eagle:** My amendment 168 seeks to establish a wildlife co-existence fund. That would be a compensation fund for farmers and landowners who have been “negatively impacted” by the reintroduction of beavers and the expansion of sea eagles. As I argued at stage 2, the return of beavers has brought acknowledged ecological benefits, but in many areas it has also created some problems. At the same time, the expanding population of white-tailed sea eagles has had a severe impact on livestock, with lambs being taken each year and crofters facing emotional and financial hardship.

I acknowledge that the Scottish Government already has a compensation scheme in place for sea eagles. However, from what I have heard from crofters, particularly in the Western Isles and the

west coast of Scotland, the Government is not doing enough. As I understand it, the Scottish Government has still not committed funding for this year, which has made it difficult for farmers to plan ahead of the lambing season. Farmers are effectively being asked to plan blind. I ask the Parliament to support amendment 168 as an opportunity to help and support our land managers.

20:45

I turn to amendment 141, in the name of Mark Ruskell. Mark Ruskell has done some incredible work pulling everybody together behind this idea. I have a lot of nest boxes at home, and I have made insect hotels with the kids. Those are all easy things we can do. I would not suggest that we put all of those things into legislation, but there is a clear requirement for us to look at swift bricks, which is a cheap alternative.

Mark Ruskell has mentioned Hannah Bourne-Taylor already, and she is still up in the public gallery. I have never seen a champion work so hard—I think that she has come all the way from London today just to see this moment. I hope that we can all get behind the amendment today. It is not an easy task, and I half expected to see Gordon MacDonald dancing down the aisles, as he is the species champion, but I do not think that he is in the room. I hope that he is away doing that just now.

I commend amendment 141 and Mark Ruskell for his work, and I hope that we can get it passed today.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I now call Rachael Hamilton to speak to amendment 171 and other amendments in the group.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I will move swiftly on.

**Members:** Oh!

**Rachael Hamilton:** My first amendment in the group relates to the protection of red squirrels and calls for a review every two years to assess the impact and effectiveness of current efforts to protect red squirrels. The review would also include organisations that are in receipt of public funding.

As I highlighted at stage 2, the population of grey squirrels, which is listed as one of the 100 worst invasive non-native species by the International Union for Conservation of Nature, is approaching 3 million, and the red squirrel population has fallen to around 287,000, with 75 per cent of that reduction being found in Scotland.

Throughout the passage of the bill, I have been working with the Central Borders Red Squirrel

Network, which aims to stop the decline of the red squirrel population across the Borders. Its members do that on a voluntary basis. At stage 2, I lodged amendments that would require a review of the squirrel pox virus, establish a red squirrel awareness campaign, and separate the invasive grey squirrel from plants in non-native species specification.

The minister spoke against those amendments and described them as bureaucratic. The minister went on to say that Scotland already invests heavily in red squirrel conservation and pointed to more than £1 million of funding from the nature restoration fund. While I welcome the work that is already on-going, those of my constituents who are part of the Central Borders Red Squirrel Network do not feel supported by the organisations and projects that are in receipt of Government funding.

I have been told that the saving Scotland's red squirrels project, which received support from the nature restoration fund, formally withdrew its support from the Borders in 2023-24 and made the only full-time grey squirrel control officer in the Borders redundant. The burden of protecting red squirrels in the Borders is therefore falling completely on the tireless work of volunteers. That is why my amendments seek to assess the impact and effectiveness of the Government's current efforts to protect red squirrels.

I turn to amendments 178 to 185. Before addressing my next set of amendments on grouse licensing, I want to take the opportunity to set out to the minister and members why I am seeking to amend the licensing scheme for grouse moors. Members are likely to be aware from my involvement in the scrutiny of the Wildlife Management and Muirburn (Scotland) Act 2024 that grouse shooting is an extremely important land use in my constituency, delivering multiple socioeconomic and environmental benefits in the most rural of areas.

I am fortunate to have regular opportunities to engage with landowners, land agents, gamekeepers and shepherds who play an active role in the management of these iconic moorland habitats all year round. It is from that engagement that I know of the concerns and unease surrounding amendments that were made to the licensing scheme for grouse moors at stage 2 of this bill.

I know from discussions with the Scottish Government that the sector has engaged with representatives on the issue, namely and notably BASC and SLE. I welcome that engagement and thank the minister for his willingness to engage. However, I understand that ministers have decided not to lodge amendments to address

those concerns, which is why I am seeking to do so with my amendments.

I remain slightly confused after a meeting and some engagement that I had with the minister on Thursday. There were time constraints and the minister had not had time to consider the amendments in good faith, because of other commitments, but I very much hope that members will consider the amendments in good faith and recognise that they are intended to improve the workability and effectiveness of the licensing scheme.

The amendments will, I hope, ensure the future sustainability of a sector that I know at first hand does a great deal to tackle biodiversity loss, mitigate the impacts of climate change and sustain rural communities.

First, on amendments 178 and 181, my concerns centre on section 16AA(4)(c) of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 and the change in language from "specify" to "describe" in that paragraph as a result of a stage 2 amendment from Mr Fairlie. By simply describing the land to which the licence should relate, the applicant's ability to properly define the licence area is weakened.

It is important to remember that those applying for the licence to kill or take grouse will likely have the most intimate understanding of the land that is used and managed for the purposes of killing or taking grouse. The wording that I am suggesting in amendments 178 and 181, which is to "specify" the area to which the licence is to relate, would establish the practical assumption that the applicant's defined area would be a better starting point. The current wording in the bill, which is to

"describe the area of land to which the applicant proposes the licence should relate",

casts doubt on that principle and makes the scope of the licence dependent largely on NatureScot's approval.

The effects of replacing "describe" with "specify" become more apparent when combined with proposed section 16AA(5A) of the 1981 act, as inserted by another stage 2 amendment from Mr Fairlie. That grants NatureScot the power to propose a different area and refuse an application if an agreement is not reached about the area of land that is to be licensed. My amendments do not seek to remove that power but to reflect, through more precise language, the fact that an applicant will better understand what land is used for and can thus specify with certainty and accuracy the land that should constitute the licence area. That should be the logical starting point for future discussion, and I hope that the minister and members see why such a change is important.

Amendments 179, 180 and 182 are technical amendments designed to ensure that NatureScot's functions are transparent and clear. Amendment 179 seeks to ensure that NatureScot will propose a different licence area only if it

“considers it reasonable and appropriate to do so”,

thereby underscoring the importance of NatureScot having good reason to make an alternative proposal.

Amendment 180 simply seeks to clarify that a proposal relating to a different licence area must be given to the applicant, while amendment 182 seeks to ensure that NatureScot provides supporting reasons with any proposals concerning a different licence area. That will ensure that an applicant fully understands the reasons for an alternative licence area being proposed. I hope that the minister and members will agree that those are logical amendments that are designed to ensure that there is clarity around NatureScot's powers relating and relative to the licence area.

My final amendments in this group—amendments 183 to 185—relate to the sector's most significant concerns. The minister's stage 2 amendments to this bill have eroded safeguards that were previously provided for in the Wildlife Management and Muirburn (Scotland) Act 2024. In the worst-case scenario, the actions of an employee acting entirely of their own volition on land many miles away from the grouse moor and in contravention of explicitly expressed contractual obligations could give rise to the suspension or revocation of a licence. It is important to remember that suspension or revocation of a licence would almost certainly result in job losses, both direct and indirect, and impact on spending in the rural economy. It would also result in a cessation of moorland management, which we know delivers for biodiversity.

The minister's stage 2 amendments effectively impose a form of strict liability on landowners for the actions of employees involved in the managing of land. It is conceivable that such a wide definition would bring in anyone with a tenuous link to managing that land, including contractors over whom the licence holder might not have control. It would mean that the actions of an unconnected third party over whom the licence holder had no direct control on the grouse moor with regard to fulfilling a contract could result in the loss of a grouse licence.

Briefly—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Very briefly.

**Rachael Hamilton:** —even the committing of a relevant offence by a seasonal employee, such as a beater or an agricultural tenant, who might be in dispute with the landlord—

**Jim Fairlie:** Will the member take an intervention?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The member is just about to conclude.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Such an offence could, under the terms of the minister's stage 2 amendments, see a licence suspended or revoked. That is unfair and unworkable.

I will leave it there, because I know that I have taken enough time and I am getting looks. Finally, though, amendment 185 is a technical amendment that seeks to clarify that only offences that directly support or benefit grouse shooting can elicit a licensing sanction.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Jamie Halcro Johnston to speak to amendment 177 and other amendments in the group.

**Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests: I am a partner in a farming business and a member of NFU Scotland and SLE.

Amendment 177, in my name, recognises that successful conservation brings management responsibilities. In parts of Scotland, particularly in the island and remote areas that I represent, goose populations are causing significant damage to agricultural land and especially to grazing land used for livestock and have been doing so for some time. Farmers and land managers are already expected to deal with that under existing wildlife law but, in practice, controlling goose numbers is time consuming, costly and often controversial, with the burden falling almost entirely on individual businesses. That causes a great deal of frustration, particularly for farmers in my area, where they see resources being spent on the stoat eradication scheme but not so much being spent to deal with their issues with geese.

Amendment 177 would not change the protected status of geese and would not weaken licensing. It would simply give ministers the power to support and fund co-ordinated goose management, treating that as a public good activity instead of leaving individual farmers to bear the cost alone. That would be a proportionate and practical response to an unintended pressure and I urge members to support the amendment.

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):** I call the cabinet secretary, Gillian Martin, to speak to amendment 45 and other amendments in the group.

**Gillian Martin:** I will begin by talking about amendment 141, in the name of Mark Ruskell. I fully support his intention to help address the decline in swift numbers and I am pleased to be able to support that amendment. It was good to

hear that so many people have been convinced of the need to do that. We had a slight disagreement about some technical issues at stage 2 and I am glad that we have been able to iron those out. That iconic species was once a common sight across Scotland, particularly in our urban areas, but, as Mark Ruskell mentioned, swifts are now under threat and have declined by more than 60 per cent since 1995, which has led to them being on the red list of birds about which there is a conservation concern.

I welcome the suggestions of practical ways in which we can help to protect that important species and improve our biodiversity. As I said, we were not able to support the introduction of section 33B at stage 2, due to some procedural and technical concerns, but Mark Ruskell and I have collaborated since December to address those issues and amend section 33B, meaning that the provision is now better aligned with the purpose, role and established conventions of the building standards system in Scotland.

Today's amendment will provide assurance that the Scottish Government will take forward action and will consult on future measures to introduce a requirement

“for the installation of swift nest boxes”

in new buildings, with reference to best practice guidance, including British standard 42021:2022, where it is reasonably practical and appropriate to do so. That represents a more suitable approach to regulation. We fully support amendment 141 and I encourage all members to do so.

Amendment 45 is a minor and technical amendment that adds the words

“to make certain other miscellaneous provisions relating to environmental matters”

to the long title of the bill, reflecting new topics that were added to the bill by amendments at stage 2. I hope that all members will support that.

Amendment 61, from Mercedes Villalba, aims to remove the ability to exempt non-native species from the invasive species offences listed in section 14 of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 where the sole purpose of the order is for “economic or commercial” reasons.

I agree that we should seek to ensure that, where we allow non-native species to be utilised in Scotland, there should be multiple benefits to that rather than only one. It is for that reason that I believe that amendment 61 is not required. I understand that the amendment primarily targets non-native tree species, but those non-native tree species already provide multiple benefits beyond their importance as a timber crop. It is not true to say that only the economic worth as a timber product is important, and I reject that claim. Their

abilities to quickly sequester carbon and to reduce erosion and flooding are just a few of the other benefits that could be used to justify their exemption. It is therefore my view that amendment 61 is redundant.

I also think that it is a bit of a shame that Ms Villalba has claimed that I did not work with her on that issue. I highlight that both I and Ms Gougeon worked with Ms Villalba on her amendment 40, which will be debated later in group 18 and will allow better regulation of the spread of invasive species in a forestry context.

21:00

**Mercedes Villalba:** The cabinet secretary seems to be mixing herself up with her colleague. She is absolutely right to say that I met Ms Gougeon to discuss amendments to part 4 that I lodged at stage 2. I worked with her on them, and I have brought my proposal back at stage 3 in the form of amendment 40. However, Ms Martin is a completely distinct individual—[*Laughter*]—who, as I said, made it clear that she would be willing to meet me specifically on my stage 2 amendment 56, which I have brought back at stage 3 in the form of amendment 61.

I take on board what Ms Martin says about disputing a claim, but the amendment is not about a claim. Its aim is to ensure exactly what she said—that exemptions for invasive non-native species will not be made solely for economic or commercial reasons. That is what the amendment is about. It does not say that that is happening; it is about making sure that it does not happen. If the minister supports that principle, and given what she said at stage 2, I do not understand why she avoided meeting me on that issue with a view to lodging an amendment at stage 3.

**Gillian Martin:** I assure the chamber that I am not having an identity crisis. [*Laughter*.] I am flattered that I have been mixed up, even in my own head, with Ms Gougeon, who is substantially younger than me.

I ask that Ms Villalba does not move her amendment 61. I reject her characterisation of the meeting. I was in the same room and we were having the same discussion. We are the same team and we were able to come up with amendment 40 in the group. Ms Gougeon will speak to that. As members can see, there are three ministers sitting on the Government front bench and we are all working together.

Beatrice Wishart's amendment 159 would place a requirement on ministers to produce a statutory invasive non-native species action plan. However, we are already in the middle of developing an invasive non-native species plan—I will just say

INNS from now on, in order to save time—and we have worked closely with stakeholders on that.

As I made clear when the matter was discussed at committee, I am committed to delivering effective action to address INNS in collaboration with stakeholders. I do not consider that it is necessary to put everything in primary legislation, because doing so would create an unnecessary additional administrative burden without delivering any meaningful additional benefits. Crucially, it would also risk delaying publication of the INNS plan and losing much of the momentum that we have built around that work. In addition, given that there will be an election in May, it would not be practical to draft a plan that would cover all the elements that would be required by the amendment, to undertake a full public consultation and respond to it, and to publish the plan within the 12-month period that is specified.

I mentioned previously that Environmental Standards Scotland is investigating a number of aspects relating to INNS, which include some of the things that amendment 159 proposes that a plan should cover. I am keen to see the outcomes of that work before deciding on the next steps. I believe that that is a prudent approach. I do not want to directly cut across that important work. I had a good discussion about that with Beatrice Wishart a couple of weeks ago.

I am very conscious of the strength of feeling on invasive non-native species. I welcome the engagement that I have had and I am committed to taking the necessary action, but not before we have heard the views and seen the results from ESS, which is carrying out that wide-ranging review on the issue. It is taking evidence from delivery bodies and stakeholders. Once we have the outcome of those investigations, we will be informed about what is needed. I am happy to give a commitment that I will review the recommendations from the ESS work on INNS and work with stakeholders on the INNS action plan as timeously as possible.

Given everything that I have set out, I cannot support amendment 159. I hope that she understands that the Government is doing that work on the issue and that we want it to be as well informed as possible.

Presiding Officer, I will hand over to Mr Fairlie to respond to the rest of the amendments in the group.

**Jim Fairlie:** I start with Willie Rennie's amendments 164 and 165, which would allow falconers to hunt mountain hare but only under licence granted by NatureScot and outside the breeding season. That issue has been subject to extensive scrutiny over a number of years, including detailed consideration by the Citizen

Participation and Public Petitions Committee, alongside sustained engagement with the stakeholders who are involved, as Willie Rennie outlined clearly.

I fully recognise the strength of feeling on both sides of the debate. The decision that was taken in 2020 to protect mountain hares from indiscriminate culling was necessary and it remains important. Amendment 165 seeks to provide for hunting only under tightly controlled licensing issued by NatureScot and the number of mountain hare likely to be taken under any such licence would be limited and insignificant. On that basis, I am content to support amendment 165, and I encourage members to do the same. However, the additional provision that is contained in amendment 164 is unnecessary and I ask the member not to move the amendment.

John Mason's amendment 166 seeks to remove ptarmigan from schedule 2 to the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981, which would have the effect of ending the open season and prohibiting them from being hunted except under licence. I recognise the member's concerns regarding ptarmigan, as he has written to me a number of times, and the declines in their population. However, we are working jointly with other UK Administrations on a comprehensive consultation that is examining all the schedule 2 species where population pressures are of concern. We are on track to publish the consultation alongside our proposed approach in March, enabling stakeholders to submit their views and ensuring that the implications of any changes to schedule 2 are fully and properly considered before implementation.

I hope that that reassures the member that the matter is being actively taken forward just now. I therefore ask him not to move the amendment. Should he do so, I ask members not to support it.

On amendment 168, in the name of Tim Eagle, the Scottish Government already provides targeted and effective support for land managers who are affected by species introductions through well-established mechanisms, including the sea eagle management scheme and the beaver mitigation scheme, which are both delivered by NatureScot. The schemes provide practical assistance and financial support where the impacts are evident. Crucially, the existing arrangements address real and identifiable impacts without creating blanket statutory entitlement, while allowing NatureScot the flexibility to respond quickly, proportionately and on a case-by-case basis. I therefore ask the member not to move the amendment. Should he do so, I ask members not to support it.

I will turn to amendment 171 in the name of Rachael Hamilton. The current red squirrel

conservation strategies are evidence led and adaptive. Introducing a statutory review would create unnecessary costs and divert limited resources away from practical conservation work. I am sure that none of us would want to see that. The focus should therefore be on strengthening and delivering the existing programmes rather than imposing redundant statutory obligations. For those reasons, I urge members to oppose amendment 171. Indeed, I ask Rachael Hamilton not to move it.

On amendment 177, in the name of Jamie Halcro Johnston, I absolutely recognise the concerns that have been raised about goose populations causing damage. However, comprehensive goose management schemes are already in place, covering highly protected species and those whose numbers require control. I am, of course, very happy to meet the member to hear any further suggested improvements to the schemes.

I also note that I meet stakeholders regularly, including NFU Scotland, through the strategic wildlife and land management forum, which I established to discuss the tensions, and to identify practical solutions, between land management objectives and the management of certain wildlife species.

In addition, the Scottish Government already invests significant public funding in goose management, with around £1 million allocated annually to support those schemes.

Primary legislation is therefore not required to achieve the objectives of amendment 177, because effective mechanisms are already operating through the existing goose management arrangements. Introducing the amendment would reduce operational flexibility and increase bureaucracy, binding management to rigid legislative requirements rather than allowing schemes to adapt pragmatically to changing conditions on the ground. I ask the member not to move amendment 177.

Amendments 178 to 185 propose a series of changes to legislation governing the grouse shooting licensing scheme. Amendments 179, 180 and 182 seek to prescribe procedural requirements that are already implicit in NatureScot's role as a public authority and would add in wording that is not strictly necessary. However, including what is proposed in legislation might provide additional clarity to applicants, so I am happy to support the amendments, and I encourage members to support them, too.

Amendments 178 and 181 would risk reopening vulnerabilities that the Government explicitly closed through the stage 2 amendment that was

introduced to remove the potential loopholes and to strengthen the enforceability of the scheme.

Amendments 183, 184 and 185 would narrow the circumstances in which a grouse shooting licence could be suspended or revoked by the licensing authority. In doing so, those amendments would undermine the Government's stage 2 amendment by reintroducing the gaps that could be exploited to avoid accountability. Those changes risk weakening the scheme's effectiveness by narrowing the circumstances in which a licence may be suspended or revoked. It is recognised that some landowners are concerned about highly exceptional or edge-case scenarios. However, those concerns do not reflect how the scheme will operate in practice. NatureScot already exercises discretion, considering factors such as intent, foreseeability, the adequacy of management systems and proportionality, before taking any licensing action.

In relation to the suspension of grouse licences, NatureScot still has discretion over whether to suspend or revoke such a licence, even if it is satisfied that a relevant offence has been committed. That enables NatureScot to assess cases on their merits. For those reasons, I encourage members to oppose amendments 178, 181 and 183 to 185.

**Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con):** I rise to speak in support of amendments 164 and 165, in the name of Willie Rennie. I am delighted to hear the minister saying that he will now encourage support for amendment 165. As Willie Rennie pointed out, I raised the issue at stage 2, and I accept that the amendment that I lodged at stage 2 was deemed by the Government to be worded too broadly. However, Willie Rennie has lodged a more tightly worded amendment at this stage, which I hope the Parliament will support.

It all dates back to the Animals and Wildlife (Penalties, Protections and Powers) (Scotland) Bill, when you, Presiding Officer, lodged an amendment at stage 3 to protect mountain hares. That was done, if you will forgive me for saying so, at short notice, and there was not enough time for that amendment to be properly consulted on, or to allow the question of unintended consequences to be properly considered. Had that amendment been given such consideration, one unintended consequence that would have been explored and exposed was the impact on falconers, of whom we have very few in Scotland. That impact was illustrated by my constituent, Barry Blyther of Elite Falconry in Fife. He took the issue all the way through the Citizen Participation and Public Petitions Committee, as Willie Rennie referenced. The committee very much supported Mr Blyther's petition. Indeed, members might recall a photo call in the garden, when my colleague Jackson

Carlaw, the convener of the committee, had to be photographed several inches away from a very large and aggressive-looking golden eagle called Stanley. The look of sheer terror on the face of Jackson Carlaw was well worth viewing. Fortunately, he survived the experience—as did Stanley the golden eagle.

Stanley was a very sad golden eagle, however, as he was not able to fly over the moorlands of Scotland because of the risk that he might swoop down and pick up a mountain hare, which would have led, potentially, to his keeper being charged with a criminal offence.

If amendment 165 is agreed to, the minister will make Stanley a very happy golden eagle. I encourage members to join me, the minister and Willie Rennie in making Stanley happy by voting for amendment 165.

**Christine Grahame:** Calling it Stanley didnae make it any easier for the bird.

Anyway, on amendment 171, I am generally not supportive in principle of embedding mandatory reporting in primary legislation. That could be a matter for committees and MSPs to pursue through parliamentary questions and, in this instance, with NatureScot. However, Rachael Hamilton raises some very important points. I am interested in the distribution and efficacy of funding, too. In the main, the references in respect of funding are to the saving Scotland's red squirrels project, but the group in my part of the Borders—not the central Borders—is called the Red Squirrel Forum for South Scotland, which is in much the same position as Rachael Hamilton's group, in that it is composed mainly of volunteers. The forum comprises 17 groups, but I am not sure whether they operate within the ambit of the SSRS. The questions that my Borders colleague raises are reflected in the questions that have been raised with me.

It might interest members—heaven knows if it will, at this late time of night—that 1,000 red squirrels were spotted last year just in Tweeddale, so they are not just in the Highlands.

I am very interested in the relationship and the funding arrangements between SSRS and the various little organisations of volunteers, and in how that funding is tracked to see how effective it is. I do not think that the Government or legislation has a place in that; I think that it is a matter for NatureScot, which disburses quite a bit of the funding, to audit and track the money and see where it is going. I cannot support amendment 171, but I very much support the sentiments within it.

21:15

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Mark Ruskell to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 141.

**Mark Ruskell:** I am tempted to wind up, Presiding Officer, but, given the hour, I will move straight to the question. I press amendment 141.

*Amendment 141 agreed to.*

### Before section 33C

**The Presiding Officer:** Group 10 is on marine planning and fishing. Amendment 142, in the name of Sarah Boyack, is grouped with amendments 34, 21, 143 to 147, 160 and 170.

**Sarah Boyack:** [*Inaudible.*] Apologies, I have been in the chamber for some time but forgot to put the card back in.

I have five amendments in the group. Given our timings tonight, I will focus on my amendments, although I strongly support Maurice Golden's amendment 21, to which he will speak later on.

I thank the Marine Conservation Society, the Sustainable Inshore Fisheries Trust and the Scottish Creel Fishermen's Federation, which have been incredibly helpful in pulling together my amendment 142 and getting it in front of members. Amendment 142 seeks to amend the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010 to require the national marine plan—or, as the case may be, a regional marine plan—to contribute to the delivery of any relevant nature recovery targets to be set following the passage of the bill. It would ensure that the future national marine plan included policies that actively drove the recovery of marine biodiversity.

There is an on-going debate about the role and shape of marine planning, which was discussed during stage 2. Amendment 142 is an important opportunity to explicitly link the national marine plan with nature recovery targets. That would help to embed nature recovery as a core objective of marine planning.

My amendment 143 seeks to update the definition of "marine environmental purposes" in section 2A of the Inshore Fishing (Scotland) Act 1984. It follows on from amendment 328 that was agreed to at stage 2, which added wording on climate adaptation to the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010. I was very pleased that the Government was able to support that amendment and I hope that it can take a constructive and positive approach to my amendment 143.

Currently, the definition in the 1984 act speaks about

"conserving ... the natural beauty ... of marine or coastal areas ... or ... conserving flora or fauna which are dependent on ... a marine or coastal environment."

However, given our understanding now of the role that the marine environment can play in tackling climate change—for example, through carbon absorption—the definition needs to be updated. That is what amendment 143 would do in relation to the existing powers in respect of three key issues: mitigation of climate change, adaptation to climate change and the support of ecosystem recovery. Amendment 143 would update those powers and bring them to the discussion that we now need to have.

There are issues that we need to focus on, including, as I will talk about, just how much more we need to do. Amendments 144 and 145 were crafted using the real-world experience of the Sustainable Inshore Fisheries Trust and the Scottish Creel Fishermen's Federation. I have lodged those amendments again because I want to ensure that the Scottish Government has real plans to make such changes. If those amendments are agreed to, they would make Scotland a true leader. At the very least, I want to get the issues properly on the record.

Amendment 145 would give ministers the powers to bring in low-impact fishing priority areas, in line with the Scottish ministers' commitment to supporting a just transition to a more sustainable industry. I have worked closely with the Scottish Creel Fishermen's Federation on that amendment. It is truly a modest proposal. It would require any such areas to be subject to extensive consultation, and could be done only to help to meet any targets that are set under the bill, to fulfil the national marine plan or to help to achieve ministers' legal duty to deliver good environmental status.

Amendment 144 would give ministers the power to protect the parts of our sea lochs that are most important as marine carbon stores. Those lochs make a significant contribution to Scotland's climate mitigation efforts, burying more carbon than the whole of the North Sea and storing more per hectare than peatland. I was genuinely shocked when I saw those statistics, so let us hope that it focuses minds.

Amendment 146 provides for the delivery of a Scottish marine strategy. I had a constructive conversation with the cabinet secretary, who is now back in the room, and I spoke with a series of stakeholders after the meeting that I had with her and her officials. Stakeholders do not agree that we should rely on the UK Marine Strategy Regulations 2010. I want to flag the sheer frustration that came across in the meetings that I had following that discussion.

That frustration was well set out in the Open Seas joint briefing, which I hope all members have had time to read:

“Inshore Marine Protected Areas / Priority Marine Features consultation - delayed  
National Marine Plan 2 - delayed  
Inshore Fisheries Management Improvement Programme - delayed  
21 Fisheries Management Plans - delayed  
Biodiversity Strategy - not delivered  
Proposed fisheries management bill - never introduced  
Penalties review - launch date unclear  
Good Environmental Status for Scottish Seas - targets missed in 2020 and 2024”.

There is a lot of frustration in the sector. I wanted to mention that in the chamber today, because we need to try to work together.

The UK has yet to fully develop a marine strategy. Scotland is responsible for more than half of the UK's seas, so we have a responsibility to maintain good conditions. A strategy would require action. Having looked into the issue in depth, I believe that the current auditing mechanisms of the Office for Environmental Protection in England and Northern Ireland and Environmental Standards Scotland do not fully replace the previous auditing by the European Commission. A strategy requires appropriate indicators and monitoring to detect trends in those indicators. Three components of marine ecosystems need monitoring: mobile animals, including fish and seabirds; the biotic communities of the seabed; and the plankton and water column. In my view, the current monitoring in Scottish waters is both inadequate and underfunded, especially given the great extent of the Scottish inshore zone to the west of Scotland.

I hope that colleagues will consider supporting my amendments. If they do not, I hope that having got these issues on the agenda tonight and having put forward the big concerns that key stakeholders have put to us all, the Scottish Government will respond by being constructive, will listen and will act on those views from stakeholders.

As ever, my preference is for all my amendments to be accepted, but we know that that does not always happen. The issue is on the record so let us get moving, because there is much that we can do, even in respect of job creation. There are many opportunities here—let us not miss them.

I move amendment 142.

**Emma Harper:** Amendment 34 relates to the conservation of populations of wild salmon, which, as I have previously noted, are at a crisis point across their native range and are now considered to be an endangered species. I thank Dr Alan Wells of Fisheries Management Scotland for his education, his support and his advice on the amendments that I presented at stage 2, and I thank the cabinet secretary and her officials for their support and assistance ahead of my amendments at stage 3.

The motivation behind amendment 34 is to increase financial penalties for the most serious offences against salmon on summary conviction either to the statutory maximum of £10,000 or to £40,000 for the most damaging activities, which would bring offences in line with other wildlife crime and enable certain financial penalties to be issued on a per-fish basis. The amendment would also allow penalties to be determined on a per-fish basis when an offence results in the taking and/or harming of more than one fish.

As I noted at stage 2, the most recent wildlife crime statistics show that fish poaching is the most common category of wildlife crime, but it has the lowest level of fines on average. Fines by category range from £349 for fish poaching to £2,813 for offences against badgers. The amendment would not introduce new offences; it focuses on financial penalties for activities that result in the harming of wild salmon and their habitat.

At stage 2, I agreed to withdraw my original amendment on the issue to take time to discuss with the cabinet secretary the effect that such an amendment would have across all rivers in Scotland. As we heard at stage 2, offences against salmon sit across a number of pieces of legislation covering the River Tweed, the River Esk in the Borders and the rest of Scotland respectively. Amendment 34 relates to the Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003, which covers all rivers in Scotland except the River Tweed and the upper River Esk.

It is vital that we take the opportunity to amend the 2003 act now, while the Scottish Government addresses the situation with the Tweed and the Esk, which requires working with the UK Government to align penalties across all rivers in Scotland in order to avoid disparities. I have discussed those matters with the cabinet secretary—I thank her for meeting me—and she has made a commitment that the Scottish Government will work with the UK Government to request the necessary amendments to other relevant legislation. We also discussed a couple of technical issues with the withdrawn amendment, which have now been resolved. The commencement provisions in the bill allow for amendment 34 to be brought into force once arrangements have been made for the River Tweed and the River Esk, in order to avoid disparities among Scotland's rivers.

I know that the Government is working with partners, under the Scottish wild salmon strategy, to ensure the protection and recovery of this iconic species, and that is welcome. Amendment 34's uplifting of financial penalties for salmon poaching offences and offences related to salmon conservation would bolster work that is being done

in that crucial area and reflect the conservation importance of wild salmon.

I ask members to support amendment 34.

**Maurice Golden (North East Scotland) (Con):**

I thank Sarah Boyack for her support of my amendment 21, as well as Mairi Gougeon and Gillian Martin for their constructive engagement, not just on this amendment but on the bill more generally.

Scottish fisheries are vital to our local communities and our economy. Ensuring that they are appropriately regulated and that, in turn, regulations are complied with, underpins sustainable harvesting of stocks and helps to secure the health of the marine environment for generations to come.

Fisheries penalties are a key part of the overarching fisheries management and enforcement approach, and they must be effective in order to properly drive compliance. Undertaking a review of fisheries penalties would be sensible and timely, and it would help to ensure that we have the best approach in place.

Acknowledging that such a review would be complex and require engagement with industry and others, amendment 21 proposes a two-year timescale, which would start from when the relevant section of the act was commenced. My amendment also provides the Scottish Government with relevant powers to propose and enact changes arising from the review.

I ask members to support amendment 21.

**Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con):**

Amendment 147 is one that I have brought back at stage 3, because it deserves further consideration by Parliament.

I will provide some background. For well over 30 years, this country has been well served by skilled crew who have operated aircraft to patrol our marine environment. A decision was taken by the marine directorate and the Scottish Government, almost certainly on financial grounds, to no longer use aircraft and to move instead to using drones that are launched from three ageing vessels to do the same job. It is my view that they simply cannot do that job, and I would like the aircraft to be brought back into service.

However, that is not what my amendment 147 seeks to do. It would be a step too far to put that in primary legislation, in line with the argument that we heard Christine Grahame make in relation to the previous group of amendments. All that I am seeking to do is to get from the Scottish Government a review of its decision.

At stage 2, the cabinet secretary suggested that there are on-going reviews and on-going

discussion and consultation on such issues. However, if that was the case, I would not have been contacted by many people who have operated these aircraft in the past—including some who did so until very recently—who are deeply unhappy about the decision that was taken and about the loss of capability that we, as a country, have suffered.

21:30

**Mairi Gougeon:** I appreciate Douglas Ross giving way, and I hope that he will appreciate that clarity is important. He mentioned that we are, instead, relying on three vessels and drone technology. That is not the case, as I outlined at committee. We still have the same capabilities as we previously had, at a fraction of the cost, and it is important that we get that on the record.

**Douglas Ross:** I whole-heartedly, but with respect, disagree with that. If we had the same capability, we would not have the issue that I am about to articulate.

As I said, the aircraft, with highly skilled, committed and dedicated crew, were very agile and quick to respond. They could get out over the water in minutes or hours and could be capturing images in order to take enforcement action. Crucially, a major part of their role was to act as a deterrent, because people on vessels knew that those aircraft could be up in the air very quickly, on top of them, doing that surveillance.

The replacement three vessels and the drones that can fly off them can sometimes be hundreds of miles away—not just hours but days away. One of the submissions that I received said that if someone is trawling in a closed box, they can find out where the enforcement vessels are, and they will know that they can get in and out of that box before there can be any surveillance done, any evidence captured and, therefore, any enforcement action taken. That is a loss of capability, so I am sorry, but I disagree with the cabinet secretary on that point.

In amendment 147, my proposed new subsection (2)(d) addresses “the gaps in capacity” that the decision to move from the aircraft to the vessels has delivered. I think that there is a clear gap in capacity.

In proposed new subsection (2)(e), my amendment seeks to have a review of

“the impact that this decision will have for the control and protection of Scotland’s waters.”

At stage 2, there was support from the Labour Party for my similar amendment. The Green Party members abstained; they were not opposed, because, at the same time as we were considering my amendment, Ross Greer had lodged

amendments looking for tougher enforcement and punishments. Those amendments were credible but, if we do not have an organisation and a group to do the surveillance, gather the evidence and—crucially—act as a deterrent, and if we cannot catch the culprits, those penalties will mean nothing.

Part of the review to which I would like the cabinet secretary and the Government to agree would involve looking at how much evidence has been collected prior to the decision to ground the two aircraft and post that decision. Are we getting the same quality and quantity of evidence from the vessels as we got from the aircraft?

I presume that, in the Government’s view, the answer is yes, because the cabinet secretary told me in an intervention just a minute ago that there has been no loss of capability. I believe that there has been a loss of capability, but if the review is allowed—if the Government accepts that a review can happen—we will know. The Government will be able to provide the evidence that it has that there has been no loss of capability in gathering effective evidence.

What about the quality of the evidence? Is the cabinet secretary aware of incidents that could have been surveilled and captured by the aircraft that have been missed by the vessels? Prior to the decision by the marine directorate and the Scottish Government to ground the aircraft, how many convictions did we have, and how many have there been post that decision? Are we convicting the same numbers, more or fewer?

That is really all that I am asking—for the Government to back up its case. I understand that the decision was probably—in fact, almost certainly—made on financial grounds, but we have to look at the impact of such decisions.

As I mentioned at committee, the decision was taken with almost no consultation. The fact that, some time later, people in the Highlands who have been closely involved in this work for many years are still seeking answers from their Government about the decision shows that it could have been handled differently and—I believe—much better.

However, that is in the past, and we cannot change the decision now. I hope that the Government will learn from it in the future and that, if a similar decision on the same scale were to be taken again, the Government would consult and engage fully with those affected and with those who have the specialist information that we should be trying to hold on to.

In the Highlands, there is no doubt that we have lost as a result of the situation, and that is not only because the aircraft are not being used. I believe that they are still sitting at Inverness airport and have not yet been purchased—they have a very

high price tag, which no one has paid so far. We have also lost Highlands-based individuals with great skill and knowledge, who have had to move away because there are no alternative roles in the area. Not only have we lost an asset; we have lost people, too.

I do not understand the Government's opposition to amendment 147. I am not calling for the Government to reverse the decision; I am simply calling for it to justify the decision, which a review would do. If the Government is happy with the choice that it has made—if it is happy that there has been no loss in capability, that we have not lost evidence and that we have not seen a reduction in convictions or enforcement of deserved punishments for those who infringe our marine laws—it should have no worries at all about undertaking a review and supporting the amendment. Let us remember that the aircraft provided protection for the fifth-largest exclusive economic zone in the world. The protection work that was previously done by two aircraft is now done by three vessels. In my view, it is not being done as well as it could or should be.

Let us have the facts in order to make an informed choice going forward. Let us back a review, as called for in amendment 147, and then the Government can justify its decision or accept—as I think that it probably would in the cold light of day—that it made the wrong call and that we should perhaps reinstate the aircraft with the skilled crew to ensure that we can protect our marine environment, as we had all envisaged.

**Edward Mountain:** I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests in that, as I said at the beginning of the debate, I have an interest in a wild salmon fishery.

In this group I have one amendment that relates to wild salmon. Amendment 160 would oblige ministers to

“prepare and publish a report on the progress that has been made”

regarding

“the Scottish wild salmon strategy”.

The strategy that the cabinet secretary has set out represents a step forward in that regard, and I welcome its introduction. However, my amendment would ask the cabinet secretary to produce a report within 12 months of the bill gaining royal assent and for

“each subsequent period of 12 months.”

That is logical because it would allow the sector to respond to the issues that have been found, and it would also allow the cabinet secretary to justify the strategy, which sometimes comes under fire from other fishing interests.

I totally support Douglas Ross's amendment 147. The issue that we sometimes miss is the unpredictability of major fishing incidents. The response is predictable if it is known where the enforcement assets are. If it is not known where the assets are, and how quickly they can get to an incident, that is a real deterrent.

Maurice Golden's amendment 21 would also represent a step forward.

I slightly question Emma Harper's amendment 34. I want to make it clear that I have not killed a wild salmon for years, and have no intention of doing so, but accidents sometimes happen. I see that the cabinet secretary is laughing—she might feel that that is because I am not a good enough fisherman to catch wild salmon, which might be true, but I stress that I have not killed one. They are caught in the gills, which causes them to bleed and they then die. The issue with Ms Harper's amendment 34 is that a person fishing could not take a dead fish away; they would have to put it back in the water and leave it there, which seems odd to me. I am not happy enough to support the amendment, but, when she sums up, I would be grateful to hear what she thinks should happen in a situation where a dead fish cannot be taken away and just has to be put in the water to rot, because such an approach seems strange.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I thank Edward Mountain for keeping me awake this evening with his graphic descriptions.

Amendment 170 would establish a general marine code of conduct that focuses on a number of important issues. The amendment was developed after recent discussions with the fabulous Berwickshire Marine Reserve, which aims to protect habitats and species between Eyemouth and St Abbs and to ensure that all marine users are responsible in their activities.

Amendment 170 was born from the fact that, at stage 2, my amendments to ensure that we protect tourists and visitors from seagull activities that cause health and safety issues were not agreed to; the Government did not support them. I hope that NatureScot will come up with a solution to that, following its recent meeting with the community.

There still needs to be a discussion on improving and tackling common coastal issues, such as safety around water, awareness of fishing activity, wildlife on beach environments and interference with that wildlife, feeding seagulls, and discouraging rubbish and litter. That is what Berwickshire Marine Reserve does, and it has a general marine code of conduct. At the moment, the code is voluntary, but the charity is working on the educational aspect through making a statement with its code. I hope that the

Government considers the state of the coastal and marine environment to be serious enough to put such a provision in the bill.

**Mairi Gougeon:** Amendment 142, in the name of Sarah Boyack, would duplicate existing requirements under the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010 and would introduce specificity to delivery mechanisms for targets, which is not envisaged under the bill that is before us. It would also have different implications for the inshore and offshore regimes. The amendment is unnecessary, because the updated national marine plan 2 is already being designed to address the global climate and nature crises by delivering the sustainable management of our shared marine space. In addition, the intent is covered by amendment 22. Future marine plans will consider the contribution from planning to biodiversity targets under the Natural Environment (Scotland) Bill and nature recovery under existing requirements in the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010 without the introduction of the amendment.

I agree with Emma Harper on amendment 34, for the reasons that she set out, and I ask members to support it. The legislation on salmon poaching offences includes a number of pieces of legislation, covering the River Tweed, the River Esk and the rest of Scotland, respectively. Although amendment 34 applies only to the Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003, it is vital that we make those changes to the 2003 act now and get the provisions on the books while we have the opportunity. We then need to work with the UK Government to consider the alignment of the legislation covering the River Tweed and the upper River Esk to ensure that there is no disparity of penalties for offences in relation to wild salmon in different rivers in Scotland. Consideration will be given to the commencement of the provisions in the light of any wider arrangements to be made for the Tweed and the upper Esk.

I was pleased to work with Maurice Golden on amendment 21, because it is important for us to understand whether penalties are effective and where improvements can be made. The subject is complex, which means that we need engagement with the fishing industry as well as other stakeholders. Therefore, an appropriate timescale is needed to ensure that the review is robust and delivers meaningful outputs. The review will support the delivery of commitments that have already been made in the Scottish Government's 10-year fisheries management strategy. For those reasons, I am happy to support amendment 21.

Amendment 143, in the name of Sarah Boyack, would modify powers in the Inshore Fishing (Scotland) Act 1984 to include climate change as a purpose for restricting fishing activity. I

appreciate Sarah Boyack's arguments about why she wanted to bring back some of her stage 2 amendments and put them on the record again, but this provision is unnecessary because we already have a variety of powers to manage fishing activity in inshore waters, as well as existing requirements to act in a way that mitigates and adapts to climate change in the exercise of our functions. That is why I do not support amendment 143.

I completely understand and back the principles behind amendment 170, in the name of Rachael Hamilton. However, it is another unnecessary amendment, because many of the provisions that are outlined in the proposed code of conduct are already covered extensively via existing guidance. In particular, the Scottish outdoor access code sets out guidance covering almost all the elements of the proposed code, including for our beaches and the foreshore.

Guidance in the code is also supplemented by issue-based guidance, which is produced by NatureScot in collaboration with other stakeholders. It has also been approved by the national access forum and published online. To add to that, the Scottish marine wildlife watching code provides recommendations, advice and information on watching and encountering marine wildlife when using Scotland's coasts and seas.

Existing wider publications or information via the Scottish Government website also set out what the member is trying to achieve in areas that are not covered by the outdoor access code or the marine wildlife watching code. For those reasons, and ultimately to avoid unnecessary duplication and what could be a waste of public money and resources, I encourage members not to support amendment 170.

21:45

I turn to amendment 160, in the name of Edward Mountain, I welcome that he has highlighted the importance of addressing the pressures that wild Atlantic salmon face. However, what he is proposing already exists in large part, and the approach set out in the amendment would risk cutting across our international reporting obligations through the North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organization.

The wild salmon strategy delivery group, which Edward Mountain touched on, already reports annually on the progress of the implementation plan, and its remit explicitly allows for flexibility in light of new evidence and other policy developments, which ensures that the programme of work can be adjusted as necessary, which is what Mr Mountain's amendment is rightly concerned about.

We also undertake an evidence-based annual assessment of salmon stocks to inform management of national and international fisheries. All of that then informs our reporting to NASCO on pressures and actions to address the issues that we face with wild salmon. Given the urgency of the situation, we have to guard against the risk of creating new burdens that will not translate into effective delivery or, worse still, that could undermine existing delivery, including, for example, the delivery of the poaching amendments in the group that we have also discussed. Ultimately, that is why I am unable to support amendment 160.

All the remaining amendments in the group—amendments 144 to 147—were discussed at stage 2. I will not rehearse the arguments and will not support those amendments, for the same reasons as I outlined at stage 2.

**Douglas Ross:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am sorry to have to do this, but—

**Members:** No, you are not.

**Douglas Ross:** Well, I am. The cabinet secretary deliberately left amendments that she does not wish to discuss until the end. I sought to intervene, and I know that it is up to the cabinet secretary whether she accepts interventions. When questions are put to the Government to respond to in winding up and which might determine how members vote on specific amendments, how can we get that information from the Government if it refuses to engage in a proper debate on the individual amendments?

**The Presiding Officer:** I know that Mr Ross will be aware that the content of members' contributions in the chamber is not generally a matter for the chair but, as always, I consider that members should treat one another with courtesy and respect at all times.

I call Sarah Boyack to wind up and indicate whether she wishes to press or withdraw amendment 142.

**Sarah Boyack:** It has been good to listen to the debate this evening. I know that we are all now very tired because we have been going for some time, but it is important to get members' concerns on the record.

Emma Harper made a powerful justification for amending the 2003 act to deliver action on salmon poaching and stressed the importance of creating offences in order to protect salmon and freshwater fish. Maurice Golden highlighted the importance of reporting on the effectiveness of penalties in ensuring compliance with the Aquaculture and Fisheries (Scotland) Act 2013, and other members highlighted the benefits of their amendments.

Given the time, I will make a speedy comment about the response from the cabinet secretary, and I would be delighted if she intervened on me. She said that my amendments are not necessary because what they seek to implement is already happening. However, on amendment 146, I would like to know the timescale for the Scottish Government's contribution to the UK marine strategy, how there will be consultation and how the frustration of stakeholders, which I have reflected, will be listened to. They are not briefing us just for the sake of it. *[Interruption.]*

Ms Harper, do you want to intervene on an issue?

**Emma Harper:** Yes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Always speak through the chair.

**Emma Harper:** The member mentioned my amendments about salmon. If a salmon is accidentally killed by someone who is fishing for salmon, any investigator would have to reasonably suspect that that had been done with the purpose of doing so illegally. My point is that reasonable measures can be taken to assess whether it was accidental.

**Sarah Boyack:** As the member knows, if we pass the amendment this evening, it would be for someone who was investigating the case to look at the requirements.

What really struck me was the other issues that are identified as offences. There is a

"prohibition against using explosive and other noxious substances for the destruction or taking of fish".

Those are serious issues, and I am glad that the member has raised them today.

My final point is about amendment 146. The cabinet secretary did not give us a timetable for input from the Scottish Government to the UK marine strategy. In the absence of clarity, could the Scottish Government not just get on with that, given that we are dealing with half of the UK's marine area? Marine biodiversity and support for our fishing communities are so important, and we need to get those right.

If my amendments do not pass today, I hope that they are, at the very least, on the record. The cabinet secretary and the Scottish Government will have to start listening to, and acting on, comments from key stakeholders.

**The Presiding Officer:** Ms Boyack, please confirm whether you intend to press or withdraw amendment 142.

**Sarah Boyack:** I will press it.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 142 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 20, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 142 disagreed to.*

**After section 33C**

*Amendment 34 moved—[Emma Harper]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 21 moved—[Maurice Golden]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 143 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 143 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)

Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 143 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 144 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 144 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)

Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 21, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 144 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 145 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 145 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)  
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)

Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)

Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the  
 division is: For 21, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 145 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 146 moved—[Sarah Boyack].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that  
 amendment 146 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)

FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 21, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 146 disagreed to.*

22:00

*Amendment 147 moved—[Douglas Ross].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 147 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Ind)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)

Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)  
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

*Meeting closed at 22:01.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 38, Against 71, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 147 disagreed to.*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will conclude our business for today at that point. We will resume tomorrow with group 11.

This is the final edition of the *Official Report* for this meeting. It is part of the Scottish Parliament *Official Report* archive and has been sent for legal deposit.

---

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

---

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot)

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers  
is available here:

[www.parliament.scot/documents](http://www.parliament.scot/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000

Textphone: 0800 092 7100

Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)

---



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba