

OFFICIAL REPORT
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 25 June 2025

Session 6



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.parliament.scot or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

Wednesday 25 June 2025

CONTENTS

Col.

BUSINESS MOTION ... 1
Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn]—and agreed to.
PARLIAMENTARY BUREAU MOTION ... 2
Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn]—and agreed to.
Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con) ... 2
The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn) ... 4
PORTFOLIO QUESTION TIME ... 9
CONSTITUTION, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS AND CULTURE, AND PARLIAMENTARY BUSINESS ... 9
Independence (Democratic Infrastructure) ... 9
Births and Deaths Figures ... 10
Ukraine (Medical Supplies) ... 11
Gaza (Humanitarian Aid) ... 13
Rural Museums ... 15
Overseas Aid ... 17
Independence (Discussions with UK Government) ... 18
Gaza (Humanitarian Aid) ... 19
JUSTICE AND HOME AFFAIRS ... 21
Alcohol Monitoring Technology ... 21
Violence Against Women ... 22
Police Dog Zara ... 23
Antisocial Behaviour in Motherwell and Wishaw (Off-road Vehicles) ... 25
Off-road Vehicles (Community Safety) ... 26
Youth Violence Summit ... 26
Supreme Court Judgment (Scottish Prison Service) ... 28
Scottish Crime and Justice Survey ... 30
HISTORICAL POLICIES AFFECTING GYPSY TRAVELLER COMMUNITIES ... 32
Statement—[First Minister.]
The First Minister (John Swinney) ... 32
MEDIUM-TERM FINANCIAL STRATEGY AND FISCAL SUSTAINABILITY DELIVERY PLAN ... 43
Statement—[Shona Robison].
The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison) ... 43
EDUCATION (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3 ... 55
EDUCATION (SCOTLAND) BILL ... 207
Motion moved—[Jenny Gilruth].
The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Jenny Gilruth) ... 207
Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Con) ... 210
Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab) ... 213
Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green) ... 215
Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD) ... 217
Jackie Dunbar (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP) ... 218
Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab) ... 220
Ross Greer ... 222
Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab) ... 223
Roz McCall (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con) ... 225
Jenny Gilruth ... 227
PUBLIC AUTHORITIES (FRAUD, ERROR AND RECOVERY) BILL ... 230
Motion moved—[Shirley-Anne Somerville].
The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice (Shirley-Anne Somerville) ... 230
Collette Stevenson (East Kilbride) (SNP) ... 231
Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con) ... 233
Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab) ... 234
Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green) ... 235
Shirley-Anne Somerville ... 236
ANIMAL WELFARE (IMPORT OF DOGS, CATS AND FERRETS) BILL ... 238

Motion moved—[Jim Fairlie].
The Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity (Jim Fairlie) 238
Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con) 240
Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab) 241
Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP) 243
Jim Fairlie 243
ABSENT VOTING (ELECTIONS IN SCOTLAND AND WALES) BILL 245
Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn].
Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab) 245
The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn) 246
BUSINESS MOTION 248
Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn]—and agreed to.
PARLIAMENTARY BUREAU MOTIONS 250
Motions moved—[Jamie Hepburn].
Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con) 250
The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance) 251
DECISION TIME 253

Scottish Parliament

Wednesday 25 June 2025

[The Deputy Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]

Business Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): Good afternoon. The first item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-18135, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to business. Any member who wishes to speak to the motion should press their request-to-speak button now.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for Wednesday 25 June 2025—

delete

7.40 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business

and insert

9.00 pm	Decision Time—[*Jamie Hepburn*].

Motion agreed to.

Parliamentary Bureau Motion

14:00

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): The next item of business is consideration of Parliamentary Bureau motion S6M-18133, on suspension of standing orders. I ask Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, to move the motion.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that, for the purposes of consideration of the legislative consent memorandum on the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, Rule 9B.3.5 of Standing Orders is suspended.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

14:01

Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con): I oppose the motion to suspend standing orders in relation to the legislative consent memorandum on the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill. I begin by clearly stating that I support the principle of improving animal welfare, and I note that, on the surface, the proposals in the bill appear to support that aim.

In a letter that was received only a few hours ago, the Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity, Jim Fairlie, states:

"The proposals included in this Bill are strongly welcomed by animal welfare organisations ... as well as being supported by all political parties",

and I agree with him. However, right now, we are not here to vote on principles, and I want to raise objections in relation to the opportunity of this place to scrutinise legislation.

In its letter to the minister, the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee made it clear that it has not had the time or capacity to consider the legislative consent memorandum before the motion is due to be debated this afternoon. That is not a procedural inconvenience; it is a fundamental failure of parliamentary scrutiny. The Scottish Parliament is being asked to delegate powers in devolved areas to United Kingdom ministers without sufficient time to consider the implications.

The minister agrees that

"there has not been sufficient time and information for the Committee to review this."

However, I question his view that

"the Scottish Government have brought this to the attention of the Parliament at the earliest opportunity",

given that the Senedd in Wales was given twice as long to consider the same bill. Although we appreciate the minister's response, it does not address the core issue of the limitation on the

Parliament's ability to scrutinise the matter properly.

The bill proposes to give regulation-making powers not only to Scottish ministers but to UK ministers in areas of devolved competence, which raises serious constitutional concerns. Questions on the matter have not been answered. Why is it necessary for UK ministers to have such powers at all? The bill will give the Scottish ministers powers, so it is not clear why UK ministers would need those powers, too.

What criteria should the Scottish Government use to determine whether regulations are to be laid by the Scottish ministers, who are scrutinised here, or by UK ministers, who are scrutinised at Westminster? In his latest letter, which we received this morning, the minister told us that there would be no set criteria and that decisions would be made on individual sets of circumstances, and he spelled out the guiding factors that would influence those decisions.

The minister has said that there may be circumstances where ministers will wish to give consent to UK instruments when policy objectives are aligned, but that is not a sufficient explanation. We need to know what those circumstances are. We need to know what specific criteria will be used to decide when it is appropriate for UK ministers to act in devolved areas, and we need to ensure that the Scottish Parliament is notified and given sufficient time to consider those decisions when they are made. The committee has asked for that information.

We have been told that any UK statutory instruments will be notified to us, but that is a political commitment, and we know that we do not always have time to consider UK SIs following notification.

We have also asked for a breakdown of whether powers in this policy area have been delegated to UK ministers or to Scottish ministers, under their competence. The questions that we have asked are not unreasonable; they are the basic requirements of democratic oversight.

I am speaking not to oppose the policy aims of the bill or the legislative consent memorandum but to defend this Parliament's role. I do not want us to set a precedent whereby important decisions are rushed through without due process. I want to ensure that the Scottish Parliament retains its rightful role in scrutinising legislation that affects the people of Scotland.

Yes, Scottish legislation takes up parliamentary time, but that is the price of proper scrutiny, that is the price of protecting devolution and that is the price of ensuring that this Parliament—not Westminster—decides how devolved powers are exercised.

For those reasons, I cannot support the motion to suspend standing orders, and I urge colleagues to do the same.

14:05

The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn): I recognise any member's right to speak against any motion that has been presented before the Parliament, and I recognise any member's right to vote against a legislative consent motion or against the varying or suspension of standing orders. I recognise the right of any committee to determine not to report on a legislative consent memorandum, but I highlight—this speaks to the point that has just been made by the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee's convener—the role of this Parliament.

I am concerned that, if we did not agree to the motion to suspend standing orders, we would be denying the Parliament the collective opportunity to consider whether to grant legislative consent to the UK Parliament. I do not think that we should deny it that opportunity. Let me be clear that the effect of not suspending standing orders in this instance would be to deny Parliament that opportunity, and it is almost inevitable that the UK Parliament would continue to press ahead with the legislation without our even having had the opportunity to say whether we grant consent.

Finlay Carson: I do not know whether the minister listened to my speech. The issue is not about this particular legislative consent memorandum; it is about the principle of the Government putting forward LCMs for the consideration of the Parliament and not giving sufficient time for the Parliament to undertake its duty to scrutinise those LCMs adequately.

Jamie Hepburn: I have heard the convener very clearly, but I do not know whether he was listening to me.

The fundamental point is that, in opposing the motion, he is seeking to deny the Parliament the opportunity to even consider whether we should grant legislative consent. I am not clear whether the convener realises that that is what he is doing, but that is what he is seeking to do.

I understand, and it is regrettable, that the committee feels that it has not had the time to fully consider the issue. I respectfully say that the matter is not entirely in the gift of the Scottish Government—the bill is being considered by the UK Parliament. The UK Parliament determines its own timescale; that is not determined by the Scottish Government.

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): I think that we are somewhat puzzled that the

Welsh Parliament considered a legislative consent memorandum on the bill some time ago, but we in this Parliament were not given the same notice. The issue is not the content of the LCM; it is very much about the process and giving committees of this Parliament time to consider legislation properly.

Jamie Hepburn: I recognise the importance of doing that and, as far as we can, we will always do that.

On the point that the Senedd may have granted consent, I respectfully say that that is because it is considering the legislation in the Welsh context. We must consider its practical application in the Scottish context. [*Interruption*.] I hear members laughing, but the fundamental responsibility of the Scottish Government, in the first instance, is to give the Parliament the opportunity to consider the matter in the Scottish context.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): How embarrassing.

Jamie Hepburn: I hear that Mr Kerr thinks that that is embarrassing. He is a great proponent of the Parliament having responsibility for considering such matters, but he wants to deny Parliament the opportunity to consider the matter today.

I will speak to the timescale to which we have had to operate. This is about a private member's bill at Westminster. As such, this Parliament's standing orders make it clear that a legislative consent memorandum can be lodged only when a bill has completed the first amending stage, which was the committee stage in the House of Commons on 14 May. The Scottish Government sought to lodge the memorandum as quickly as possible, and it did so on 3 June. The reason for that was precisely what I have just laid out—there had to be a process of engagement to clarify certain areas so that the Government was satisfied in saying to the Parliament that we think that legislative consent should be granted. Should we not have complied with that responsibility? Should we just have breenged in, having not even looked at the matter, and brought it to Parliament without considering it? I do not think that Opposition members would expect us to do that.

I urge Parliament to vote for the motion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that motion S6M-18133, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on suspension of standing orders, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. There will be a short suspension to allow members to access the digital voting system.

14:09

Meeting suspended.

14:16

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to the division on motion S6M-18133, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on suspension of standing orders. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Michael Marra (North East Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. My app did not connect; I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Marra.

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. I am not sure whether my vote was counted; I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whitfield. Your vote has been registered.

The Minister for Higher and Further Education; and Minister for Veterans (Graeme Dey): On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. I am in the same boat. I am not sure whether my vote was counted; I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Dey. Your vote has been recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division on motion S6M-18133, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on suspension of standing orders, is: For 82, Against 29, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that, for the purposes of consideration of the legislative consent memorandum on the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, Rule 9B.3.5 of Standing Orders is suspended.

Portfolio Question Time

Constitution, External Affairs and Culture, and Parliamentary Business

14:18

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): The next item of business is portfolio questions. The first portfolio this afternoon is constitution, external affairs and culture, and parliamentary business.

Independence (Democratic Infrastructure)

1. **Ash Regan (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba):** To ask the Scottish Government, as part of its work to further the case for Scottish independence, what specific actions it is taking to strengthen Scotland's democratic infrastructure, authority and state-building preparations to ensure that the Scottish Parliament could become the legislature of an independent Scotland. (S6O-04834)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): Scotland already has much of the infrastructure and institutions that make it well placed to become an independent state. The Scottish Parliament is a vibrant, dynamic and evolving democratic institution, representing the people of Scotland. We also have recent experience of developing new bodies to serve the people of Scotland, including Social Security Scotland, the Scottish National Investment Bank and Revenue Scotland, among others. We have set out the preparatory steps that we will be taking through the "Building a New Scotland" series. More detail on our vision for an independent Scotland is also set out in the series.

Ash Regan: We have had years of rhetoric, but there is little readiness. A constitutional convention was promised in the 2021 Scottish National Party manifesto. Civil service preparation and Holyrood's authority were set out in "Scotland's Right to Choose: Putting Scotland's Future in Scotland's Hands" in 2019, and the "Building a New Scotland" series began in 2022. Fourteen papers were pledged in that series. I believe that I have set out to the chamber what I have thought of them so far, but the final one still has not appeared. Promises are not preparations and paper is not progress. If this Parliament is to be the foundation of an independent state, not just a slogan factory, will the Government now set out how it will run a convention, as promised, this summer, and publish a serious and credible road map to independence?

Angus Robertson: I am sure, Presiding Officer, that you would wish me to answer the question that has been put in relation to democratic infrastructure. Scotland has a long history of looking beyond its borders to trade, co-operate, learn, innovate and inspire. Our international engagement provides tangible benefits to our people, businesses and institutions. It also forms a key part of our commitment to being a good global citizen by making a positive contribution to addressing global challenges. Our people, businesses, universities and cultural organisations have long benefited from that collaboration and have made significant contributions globally.

Much of that has been captured in the "Building a New Scotland" series, the last of which is still to come, and I commend that to the member for Edinburgh Eastern.

Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Aside from the fact that the people of Scotland voted overwhelmingly for the union in 2014, does the cabinet secretary accept that the current democratic infrastructure in the Scottish Parliament—with timed speeches, pre-scripted answers and debates for which we have little or no responsibility—is stifling public confidence in democracy? How will that be addressed in the next session of Parliament?

Angus Robertson: I listened closely to Mr Stewart's pre-scripted question. I hope that he is re-elected in the next session of Parliament. If that is the case, and if I am fortunate enough to be re-elected, I look forward to listening to questions from him that are not pre-scripted.

There are different customs and practices in different Parliaments. I am not currently reading an answer that has been prepared for me, as everybody can see. I am a strong believer that parliamentarians, whether in government or in opposition, should have the courage of their convictions and be able to make their case without necessarily reading something out at great length. If that is something that other members, including Mr Stewart, would like to start doing, I would look forward to that, too.

Births and Deaths Figures

2. **Elena Whitham (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what assessment it has made of the latest births and deaths figures published by National Records of Scotland. (S6O-04835)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): Scotland's changing demographic composition, which in part is driven by deaths continuing to outweigh births, as shown in NRS statistics, has significant implications for our future economy, communities and public services. The Government remains committed to responding to

that challenge through delivering our population strategy, which is overseen by the ministerial population task force.

With inward migration as the primary driver of our population growth, we continue to make a strong case to the United Kingdom Government for tailored migration solutions such as our rural visa pilot and the Scottish graduate visa to address Scotland's distinct needs and ensure that we maintain and grow our working-age population.

Elena Whitham: With birth rates in Scotland being a reported 3.9 per cent lower than average in the first three months of this year, does the cabinet secretary agree that Scotland continues to grapple with the challenges of a declining birth rate and an ageing population, giving rise to significant workforce troubles and pressures on public services, and specifically increasing demand for health and social care services? Does the cabinet secretary agree that UK immigration policies do not take into account Scotland's unique circumstances and that it is imperative that we have the powers to introduce a Scottish visa system, akin to the systems that work in Canada, which would help Scotland to grow its population?

Angus Robertson: I agree with Elena Whitham that the Canadian experience is instructive. Incidentally, there are similar provisions in Australia. I absolutely agree that we need immigration measures that are tailored to Scotland's distinct needs. If that is possible in those countries, I do not see why it is not possible here.

As a previous chair of the ministerial population task force, I am well aware of Scotland's demographic challenges and their potential impacts on our economy, communities and public services. All our current population growth comes from inward migration. As a result, we have long made the case that Scotland needs bespoke migration solutions that are tailored to our distinct needs to enable us to adequately address those challenges.

Ukraine (Medical Supplies)

3. **Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government for what reason medical supplies were sent to Ukraine with a condition that they be used for civilian purposes only. (S6O-04836)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): The Ukrainian Government specifically requested humanitarian assistance for the healthcare of its citizens and provided a list of requirements, which the Scottish Government looked at in order to source via the national health service.

The medical equipment was transported by the International Committee of the Red Cross, an established humanitarian aid partner, to assist hospitals throughout the war-torn country. The equipment was provided as official development assistance, which cannot be spent on military aid, according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. Scotland, along with the United Kingdom as a whole, adheres to that rule.

The Scottish Government fully supports Ukraine in its defence against Russia's illegal invasion and, alongside the UK Government, has provided direct aid for Ukraine's defence.

Stephen Kerr: Angus Robertson is hiding behind words, as usual. Are cases in which Ukrainian soldiers are injured in defence of their country not humanitarian aid cases? Despite our country's united support for Ukraine, the Scottish National Party Government has managed to tie up vital medical equipment in bureaucracy.

Angus Robertson said that he supports Ukraine, but his Government has imposed conditions that mean that wounded Ukrainian soldiers cannot be treated with Scottish-donated equipment. That is, frankly, a scandal. Will the cabinet secretary take the opportunity to put the record straight? Will he act today to lift the restrictions on the use of that equipment and let our medical aid simply do what it was meant to do: save lives?

Angus Robertson: Stephen Kerr will be well aware of my long-standing support for the provision of military and humanitarian support to Ukraine. Given what he has just said, he might want to reflect on this: I can give him the assurance that the medical supplies that are distributed to Ukrainian hospitals will be used to treat all patients, both civilian and military.

I hope that Mr Kerr understands that we responded to a request by the Ukrainian Government. We received a letter from General Valerii Zaluzhnyi, the Ambassador of Ukraine to the United Kingdom, who, as I am sure Mr Kerr will know, was the commander-in-chief of the Ukrainian armed forces.

He said:

> "The act of generosity and solidarity demonstrated by NHS Scotland in extending a helping hand to Ukraine in its time of need exemplifies the true spirit of humanity and compassion ... The Ukrainian people are deeply grateful for the support and assistance provided by NHS Scotland, knowing that these supplies will make a difference between life and death for many."

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): I appreciate the cabinet secretary's clarification. In future, will he consider working with the UK Government on the transport of such medical supplies so that they are sent with no conditions,

such as those that the minister set out in his response? It is important that we give the Ukrainian authorities as much flexibility as possible to use the medical supplies in the areas where they are needed.

Angus Robertson: That was an entirely sensible contribution from Willie Rennie. He will be aware that funding to the tune of £65 million has already been provided by the Scottish Government as part of the UK's military aid for Ukraine programme, which helps provide state-of-the-art equipment, including sophisticated air defence systems and thousands of pieces of vital kit for Ukrainian service personnel.

Willie Rennie understands the point that some others do not, which is that aid is provided to Ukraine through different routes: direct military aid, humanitarian aid and other routes. Rules are in place, which depend on which organisation transports the aid and under which spending heading it is sent—in this case, it has been sent under overseas development aid. I can give Willie Rennie and others the assurance that we want to ensure that everybody in Ukraine gets the aid—civilian or military—that they require. We will consider such things very closely as a Scottish Government, because we support Ukraine in its fight against the illegal invasion by Russia.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 4 is from Stephanie Callaghan, who joins us remotely.

Gaza (Humanitarian Aid)

4. **Stephanie Callaghan (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government, regarding its provision of funding for humanitarian aid, when it last engaged with the United Kingdom Government in relation to the on-going humanitarian crisis in Gaza. (S6O-04837)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): We receive regular briefings from United Nations agencies, the Disasters Emergency Committee and our humanitarian emergency fund panel members. Most recently, I wrote to the UK Government this week to seek information on UK export licences to Israel, in support of our consistent calls for an end to licensed arms exports to Israel.

The severe humanitarian crisis in Gaza, which is being exacerbated by on-going conflict and a blockade that is restricting aid to Gaza, is devastating. The international community, including the United Kingdom, must act now.

The £1.3 million in humanitarian funding for Gaza and the wider region that the Scottish Government has contributed since the outset of the current conflict has been provided from our own budget. That funding is additional to that which the UK Government has contributed.

Stephanie Callaghan: UN Women's latest analysis reports that more than 28,000 women and girls have been killed by Israeli forces—that is an average of one every hour. A UN commission has documented Israel's use of gender-based sexual and reproductive violence as a strategy of war, including attacks on reproductive healthcare facilities. Does the cabinet secretary share my concern that the UK Government's continued arms exports to Israel, including F-35 components, undermine efforts towards a sustained humanitarian response and de-escalation? Will the Scottish Government reiterate its call for an immediate and unconditional end to those exports, which are being used to commit grave violations against women and girls, as well as all of Gaza's people?

Angus Robertson: Civilians in Gaza are being bombed and left to starve by Israel on a massive scale. The impact on women and girls is horrific, as the UN commission's independent inquiry set out in such harrowing clarity. Women and girls in Gaza cannot by any stretch of the imagination be considered responsible for Hamas's atrocities on 7 October 2023, which also included horrific violence against women and girls, as noted by an earlier report by the commission.

Scottish ministers have consistently called on the UK Government to end all licensed arms exports to Israel. The UK Government's decision to suspend some arms licences was welcome, but it should go further. The UK Government Secretary of State for Business and Trade said:

> "there is a clear risk that military exports to Israel, where used for military operations in Gaza, might be used in serious violations of international humanitarian law".

For that reason alone, all licensed arms exports should stop.

Foysol Choudhury (Lothian) (Lab): Conditions in Gaza are appalling, with 470,000 people facing catastrophic hunger and reports of desperate Gazans being shot while trying to access life-saving aid. Has the cabinet secretary discussed with colleagues what further actions can be taken, within devolved powers, to end the suffering? Will he provide an update on revised guidance for Scottish Enterprise human rights checks?

Angus Robertson: That work is in progress. In answer to Foysol Choudhury's question about on-going discussions on the situation in Gaza, I can confirm that, tomorrow, I am meeting the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East. If UNRWA has specific asks about supplying aid to Gaza, I am sure that members across the chamber will be interested in

learning about them, and I will be happy to share that information with members.

Foysol Choudhury will understand that the response to the situation in Gaza is mostly a reserved function. I wish that that was not the case—I wish that Scotland was able to impose an arms export ban, but we cannot. Therefore, I urge him to use his good offices to ask his colleagues in the UK Labour Government to do the decent thing and end all arms export licences to Israel.

Rural Museums

5. **Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide an update on how it supports rural museums. (S6O-04838)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): The Scottish Government has increased funding for Museums Galleries Scotland from £2.7 million in 2024-25 to £4.27 million in 2025-26. Through that additional funding, not only has a new capital fund been created but MGS's small grants fund will open to non-accredited museums for the first time. A brand-new museums capacity and support programme will also launch shortly. It will provide £4 million of Scottish Government funding to support museums across Scotland as they innovate and test new ways of working that will sustain those vital organisations for years to come.

Tim Eagle: As the former MP for Moray, the cabinet secretary will know that museums in rural areas such as Moray are important amenities for residents and bring visitors to local communities.

Thanks to the hard work of staff, Elgin museum is partially reopening this summer, and plans to reopen the Falconer museum in Forres, which holds an incredible collection of works from a contemporary of Darwin, are moving forward. Like national museums, those facilities are essential to communities and schools. Will the cabinet secretary join me in thanking all those people who are working to support those museums and helping to protect them against rising costs? What greater support can the Scottish Government offer to ensure their long-term future?

Angus Robertson: Tim Eagle is absolutely right. I know both the Elgin museum and the Falconer museum and know them to be excellent—I would highly recommend them to anybody who has not been to visit them. I put on record my appreciation to everybody who is involved in the running of those fine institutions and draw their attention, through Tim Eagle, to the new museums capacity and support programme.

Funding is there. It was voted through in the budget, which Tim Eagle did not vote for—I will perhaps persuade him to vote for next year's budget. However, I am sure that he can pass on the good news that the Scottish Government has delivered that extra aid and that museums will be able to apply for it.

Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP): As the cabinet secretary might be aware, Comann Eachdraidh Uibhist a Tuath, which is one of the many excellent and very active historical societies in my constituency, is working to open a new heritage hub at sgoil Chàirinis. Can the cabinet secretary say anything at present about what further support will be available to community organisations such as local museums and historical societies, particularly in Scotland's Gaelic heartlands, in the light of last week's passing of the Scottish Languages Bill?

Angus Robertson: Although I cannot say anything further at present about specific support related to the Scottish Languages Bill, I can say in relation to sgoil Chàirinis and Comann Eachdraidh Uibhist a Tuath that I am pleased that the Scottish Government's Gaelic team was able to provide important capital funding in 2024-25 for renovation work in the old school. That renovation work at Chàirinis is proceeding, and the Scottish Government's Gaelic team would be happy to consider a further bid in 2025-26. As the member is aware, further significant Scottish Government capital support was provided for the impressive Cnoc Soilleir centre in South Uist, and phase 2 of the building is making good progress.

Carol Mochan (South Scotland) (Lab): I thank the cabinet secretary for his letter in response to my concerns about rural museums and the cost of displaying delicate articles that need environmental protection, such as the tapestries at Dean castle in my South Scotland region. In the light of the cabinet secretary's role and the many contacts that he has in the sector, would he be able to support the possibility of capturing data on the specific reason for the removal of items from public display?

Angus Robertson: In the spirit of my answer to Alexander Stewart's question earlier, I must confess that I am not aware of that area but I would be happy to ask my officials whether there is any such data, and, if there is not, whether it would be possible to compile it and whether that would be commensurate with the challenge that has been identified.

I am happy to be informed about the issue, because I am a strong supporter of our museum network around the country. We want the best displays in all museums, do we not? Therefore, I will take the encouragement from the member and reply to her in due course.

Overseas Aid

6. **Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what restrictions it places on the use of its overseas aid. (S6O-04839)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): The Scottish Government spends official development assistance in line with the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's development assistance committee guidance, as do other OECD members, including the United Kingdom. The OECD specifies that, to be counted as overseas development assistance, such funding cannot be spent on military aid. All grants are made subject to legally binding agreements through the issuance of a model offer letter that contains conditions.

Standard Scottish Government grant conditions will control a range of key issues relevant to the use of grant funding. Those include the purpose for which the grant has been allocated, payment of and reporting on the grant, data protection, termination, default and recovery of the grant, and issues such as safeguarding requirements.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: As my colleague Stephen Kerr highlighted in his question, it was reported in *The Times* earlier this month that the Scottish Government prevented the aid that was sent to Ukraine from being used to treat injured Ukrainian soldiers. Were the same conditions placed on the funding that the Scottish Government provided to the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for use in Gaza? Given the concerns over that organisation that led to the Government suspending aid to UNRWA, can the cabinet secretary assure Parliament that no funding from the Scottish Government was used, or is being used, to treat those fighting for Hamas? Will he seek assurances from UNRWA when he meets it tomorrow on that issue?

Angus Robertson: I am sorry that Mr Halcro Johnston did not have the opportunity to update his question, given the answer that I gave to his colleague, who is sitting right next to him.

I am sure that Mr Halcro Johnston will have heard me say that all humanitarian assistance that is provided to Ukrainian hospital facilities can be used for any patient in the hospital. The notion that what is being talked about is the denial of support—[*Interruption*.] I am sorry, but I wrote down what Mr Halcro Johnston said, which was "not treat Ukrainian soldiers". People who are in receipt of medical treatment in hospitals that are being provided with humanitarian assistance will receive that treatment, regardless of whether they are civilians.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: So, Hamas could be—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Cabinet secretary, please resume your seat.

The question has been asked. The cabinet secretary is addressing the question, and I do not want any sedentary contributions. Please show courtesy and respect to the member who has the floor, who is the cabinet secretary.

Angus Robertson: In answer to—[*Interruption*.]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have made the point that, under our standing orders, we need to show courtesy and respect to the member who has the floor. The member who has the floor is neither of the two gentlemen who are looking at me now—it is the cabinet secretary.

Angus Robertson: I was just about to say that it is remarkable to be heckled before one even says anything.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Cabinet secretary, we are running short of time. Please just get to your answer.

Angus Robertson: Indeed. I am meeting representatives from UNRWA tomorrow, and I will be happy to raise the issues that Mr Halcro Johnston raised in the second part of his question.

Independence (Discussions with UK Government)

7. **Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government, as part of its work to further the case for Scottish independence, what discussions it has had with the United Kingdom Government in relation to the Prime Minister's reported comments that he does not believe that there will be another independence referendum during his Administration and that nobody is raising this with him as their first priority, in light of reports that recent polling shows support for independence at over 50 per cent. (S6O-04840)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): I can confirm that Scottish Government ministers consistently engage with our ministerial counterparts in the UK Government to deliver our policy agenda. The Scottish Government is absolutely clear that it is only through the full powers of an independent Scotland that we will be able to meet many of our core policy aims and deliver on the things that matter most to the people of Scotland. Mr McMillan is right that, in recent months, polling has shown that a clear majority in Scotland are in favour of Scottish independence.

Stuart McMillan: During last year's UK election, Labour promised voters change. However, since coming to power, it has adopted Tory austerity as its own policy, failed to scrap the two-child benefit cap limit, announced plans to remove benefits from disabled people and introduced a jobs tax for employers with the increase in employer national insurance contributions. It is therefore no surprise that 50 per cent of the population want an independence referendum and support independence.

In light of the Prime Minister's reported comments, will the cabinet secretary encourage those who are in favour of independence to write to the Prime Minister to show their support for it? What discussions has the Scottish Government had with the UK Government with regard to setting out the process for Scotland to reclaim its independence?

Angus Robertson: Mr McMillan is absolutely right to point out that, sadly, the UK Labour Government is continuing with significant areas of austerity and now plans to target the disabled, which all the Labour members should be deeply embarrassed about.

On the question of Scotland having a democratic vote about its future, I do not think that any democrat or parliamentarian should be pooh-poohing the right of the people to make a decision about their own country's future. The majority of members of the Scottish Parliament were elected on a mandate that there should be a referendum, and a referendum there should be.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): On the issue of another referendum, we now know that dozens of anonymous pro-independence online accounts calling for another referendum went dark on 12 June after the Israeli air force took out Iranian cyber infrastructure. Does it not concern the Scottish Government that its central policy objective is being actively backed by the terrorist state of Iran as part of its campaign to weaken the United Kingdom?

Angus Robertson: Mr Fraser should be very careful about seeking to smear people in this country who believe that it should be a sovereign state. That position is held by the majority of people elected to the Scottish Parliament, and it is beneath the member to seek to smear a majority in Parliament, notwithstanding our differences on the issue.

Gaza (Humanitarian Aid)

8. **Humza Yousaf:** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide an update on what support it is providing for humanitarian assistance in Gaza. (S6O-04841)

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): Since the onset of the current conflict, the Scottish Government has contributed £1.3 million in humanitarian funding for Gaza and the wider region. That includes £750,000 through the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East in December 2023 and £550,000 for the middle east through the Disasters Emergency Committee, Mercy Corps and the Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund. The latter figure includes the further £300,000 that was announced at the end of April.

Humza Yousaf: I am grateful to the cabinet secretary for that response. Last month, the head of the UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs—OCHA—Tom Fletcher, made an immensely powerful contribution at the UN Security Council. He described Israel's plans for aid distribution as

"a cynical sideshow. A deliberate distraction. A fig leaf for further violence and displacement".

Just this week, his colleague Jonathan Whittall described the situation. He said:

"What we are seeing is carnage. It is weaponized hunger. It is forced displacement. It's a death sentence for people just trying to survive.

It appears to be the erasure of Palestinian life."

Will the cabinet secretary join me, the UN and many others in condemning Israel's deliberate starvation of the people of Gaza, the shameful killing of hundreds of Palestinians who are simply waiting for food, and does he agree that the job of getting aid to starving people in Gaza should be done by UN agencies and trusted non-governmental organisations, not by mercenaries masquerading as humanitarian workers?

Angus Robertson: I agree entirely with Humza Yousaf, and I commend him for his leadership on this issue. The Gaza Humanitarian Foundation is, frankly, a travesty. More than 400 Palestinians have now lost their lives while desperately trying to access the tiny amounts of food that are being distributed. Israel's plan to entrust the distribution of aid in Gaza to private contractors has failed, with millions across the enclave at imminent risk of famine.

The situation is entirely man-made and preventable. Huge quantities of essential humanitarian aid are sitting on the borders, waiting to be delivered by established humanitarian actors with a proven track record of distributing it at scale in an effective, safe and dignified manner through more than 400 distribution points across the Gaza Strip. Those actors, who are best equipped to deliver life-saving aid, are being obstructed from doing their work. Without safe, co-ordinated access, the crisis will only worsen.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes portfolio questions on the constitution, external affairs and culture and parliamentary business. My apologies to the one member I was not able to squeeze in with a supplementary.

Justice and Home Affairs

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next portfolio is justice and home affairs. I remind members that questions 4 and 6 have been grouped. I will take any supplementaries on those questions after the substantive questions have been asked and answered.

I remind members of our very busy agenda this afternoon. My ability to get in supplementaries will be wholly dependent on members being brief with their questions and ministers being brief with their answers.

Alcohol Monitoring Technology

1. **Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide further details of any plans to introduce continuous alcohol monitoring technology for offenders across Scotland. (S6O-04842)

The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance): We continue to develop the electronic monitoring service and are committed to expanding its use. We will continue to investigate the role that alcohol monitoring technology could play within the service. As part of that, we are considering how this technology might be used within our justice system, and its potential benefits.

Liz Smith: The cabinet secretary will know full well that 35 per cent of violent crimes in 2023-24 were carried out under the influence of alcohol. Ministers have had the power to roll out alcohol tags since 2019 but, so far, they have not done so.

In England and Wales, the use of alcohol tags has resulted in more than 97 per cent of offenders staying sober, and the reoffending rates have been cut by 33 per cent. Moreover, Police Scotland, Victim Support Scotland, Community Justice Scotland and the Government's own electronic monitoring working group have all backed the use of the technology. When will the Scottish Government acknowledge the conclusive evidence that the technology works, and when will it finally roll out alcohol tags?

Angela Constance: I very much acknowledge the potential of alcohol monitoring tags, and the member is absolutely correct regarding the statistic that she quoted. The proportion of violent crime involving alcohol has reduced from 63 per cent to 35 per cent.

Nonetheless, I will proceed with the priorities that I have already laid out to the Parliament. In the first instance, I will pursue global positioning system functionality, because that has benefits for managing problematic drinking due to the additional capabilities in relation to monitoring locations, including exclusion zones. However, alcohol monitoring tags absolutely have a role to play.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): Does the cabinet secretary agree that home detention curfews should be used as a tool to reintegrate offenders to their communities, manage the release of individuals from short custodial sentences, and reduce the prison population and reoffending?

Angela Constance: Yes. HDC provides a useful opportunity for suitable prisoners to serve the last period of their custodial sentence in the community under licence conditions, and an electronically monitored curfew is a well-established part of custodial sentences with a high level of successful completion. It can be granted only to prisoners who pass a robust risk assessment and a community assessment.

Violence Against Women

2. **Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what it is doing to tackle violence against women. (S6O-04843)

The Minister for Victims and Community Safety (Siobhian Brown): We are committed to implementing "Equally Safe: Scotland's Strategy for Preventing and Eradicating Violence Against Women and Girls". This includes work to prevent violence from occurring in the first place, build the capacity of support services and strengthen the justice response to victims and perpetrators.

Through our delivering equally safe fund, this year we will invest £21.6 million to support 115 projects from 107 organisations throughout every local authority in Scotland. Their activity covers a range of areas, including tackling domestic abuse, sexual abuse, honour-based violence, intimate image abuse and commercial sexual exploitation.

Rhoda Grant: We are facing an epidemic of violence against women. Recorded crime statistics show that sexual crime, rape and domestic abuse continue to increase unabated. Indeed, the statistics for domestic abuse are the highest ever. All the while, perpetrators of some aspects of violence against women, such as commercial sexual exploitation, face no sanction at all, and yet the Scottish Government has shelved its misogyny bill and appears to be taking no action to protect women from violence. Will the Government now commit to introduce a bill that protects women

against misogyny and back Ash Regan's unbuyable bill in the hope of turning the tide on this abhorrent crime?

Siobhian Brown: I met Ash Regan last week. As I said to the member, I think only a couple of weeks ago, the Scottish Government is not opposed to the intent behind the bill. As with all members' bills, we will give the bill full and careful consideration and take into account the Parliament's scrutiny of it. When I met Ms Regan last week, I raised some of the Scottish Government's concerns. My officials will engage with stakeholders on the bill, and I look forward to the committee evidence sessions.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): Ensuring that Scotland operates a trauma-informed justice system must be a priority to improve the experience of victims. Does the minister agree that establishing a sexual offences court through the Victims, Witnesses, and Justice Reform (Scotland) Bill is crucial in reaching that objective?

Siobhian Brown: I completely agree. Without a stand-alone court that embeds specialist approaches to the management of cases, our efforts to embed a trauma-informed system for victims of sexual violence in the justice system would be at risk. As the member knows, the Criminal Justice Committee has heard from senior members of the judiciary, the Lord Advocate, the Scottish Courts and Tribunals Service, Rape Crisis Scotland and Victim Support Scotland, who all gave the view that the sexual offences court has the potential to be transformative. I suggest that those expert voices are listened to.

Pam Gosal (West Scotland) (Con): Violence can affect women and girls of any age. With youth violence on the rise, we see more and more examples of boys behaving violently towards girls. Earlier this month, I attended a conference that was hosted by Beira's Place in Edinburgh, where speakers spoke about the prevalence of coercive control in teen relationships. However, they also stressed that education is key—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Ask a question.

Pam Gosal: —in identifying disturbing behaviour and patterns. Does the minister agree that domestic abuse education should be provided in schools as standard?

Siobhian Brown: Education is vital. This is the crux of the problem. If we are going to change societal behaviour, it must start with education.

Police Dog Zara

3. **Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions it has had with Police Scotland regarding the decision to euthanise police dog Zara in December last year and the subsequent review by the force. (S6O-04844)

The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance): As the member is aware, operational policing decisions are the responsibility of the chief constable, under the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. However, when I discussed Police Scotland's approach to animal welfare with the chief constable at one of our regular meetings on 27 February, she assured me that the welfare of police animals is of paramount importance, and that decisions that are taken on animal wellbeing and welfare are informed by the advice of veterinary professionals.

I understand that Police Scotland is currently undertaking a review of its processes around decisions on situations of this nature.

Douglas Ross: The circumstances around the decision to put down police dog Zara are bad enough, but the cover-up from the very top of Police Scotland is just as bad. Originally, it defended its decision by saying that the outlook for the dog was so bad that she had to be put down. It refused to issue her notes, but they were uncovered by the Thin Blue Paw Foundation, which has stated that police dog Zara's progress was "great" once she had recovered from surgery. There was then an independent investigation, which was led by the very inspector who took the decision to put the dog down.

Does the cabinet secretary accept that that is completely wrong? Police Scotland has taken the wrong approach to the issue. It should release all the documents relating to the incident and hold a truly independent investigation, and a statement should be made by the chief constable, Jo Farrell, who has so far been silent on the issue.

Angela Constance: Police Scotland has reviewed the decision-making process in and around the case involving police dog Zara, and it has done so in accordance with its policies. I am told that the inspector who carried out the review was not the person who made the decision to euthanise the dog.

I appreciate the member's interest in the matter, given the nature of the work that police dogs do, but I do not think that I can add any further light on the matter. I suggest that he pursues it with the chief constable.

Douglas Ross: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I apologise—I should have declared an interest. My wife is a serving police officer.

Antisocial Behaviour in Motherwell and Wishaw (Off-road Vehicles)

4. **Clare Adamson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what engagement it has had with North Lanarkshire Council on addressing antisocial behaviour involving the use of off-road vehicles in Motherwell and Wishaw. (S6O-04845)

The Minister for Victims and Community Safety (Siobhian Brown): Scottish Government safer communities and transport officials have not received any concerns from North Lanarkshire Council on the issue to date. However, I recognise that members who represent North Lanarkshire are concerned about it.

The Government remains committed to working collaboratively with all local authorities, and it has engaged with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities as part of its work on off-road vehicle misuse. COSLA, along with Police Scotland, is represented on the road safety strategic partnership board. We continue to welcome input from local government in helping to inform the Government's work in that area, which includes supporting a summer safety campaign.

Clare Adamson: I have been engaging with the local police on the issue. Antisocial use of off-road vehicles is a growing problem in Motherwell and Wishaw. There is particular frustration over the seizure and storage process, whereby vehicles are confiscated and people are able to pay a storage fee and reclaim their vehicle within a matter of days, only for it to be reused for antisocial behaviour. The police have expressed their frustration about that.

What scope is there to strengthen regulations so that, for example, a higher fee for storage might be applied that would act as a deterrent, or for the police to have seize-and-destroy powers in cases of repeat antisocial behaviour?

Siobhian Brown: I recognise the issue and understand the concerns that have been raised by the member and her constituents, which have also been raised with us in the working group.

My officials are working closely with Police Scotland, the Association of Vehicle Recovery Operators, Transport Scotland and wider stakeholders to review the statutory charges for vehicle recovery. Although the levies to which the member referred are a separate issue, I will ensure that officials take them into account as part of that work and engage with Police Scotland on how the system is working, to ensure that our communities can be kept safe from the harm that vehicle misuse causes.

Off-road Vehicles (Community Safety)

6. **Bob Doris (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what its position is on whether Police Scotland and other public bodies have appropriate powers to tackle the misuse of off-road vehicles and promote community safety. (S6O-04847)

The Minister for Victims and Community Safety (Siobhian Brown): Police Scotland has advised that the powers under the Road Traffic Act 1988 and the Antisocial Behaviour etc (Scotland) Act 2004 are sufficient to respond to the misuse of off-road vehicles. However, the Government remains committed to doing all that we can to support enforcement and is open to further legislative action.

Ministers have written to the United Kingdom Government seeking to work jointly to improve powers, including on reserved matters of vehicle registration. Work is also under way to review police vehicle seizure and disposal powers, including the retention period, and we are working closely with key stakeholders to understand the current landscape.

Bob Doris: I think that some police officers on the ground might disagree with Police Scotland about whether the powers are sufficient. When Police Scotland confiscates off-road vehicles for inappropriate use, the ease with which owners have them returned is deeply concerning, which I hope that the minister will address, and which Clare Adamson has mentioned previously.

On a more positive note, I thank the minister for agreeing with me that a summer information and safety campaign aimed at promoting the responsible and legal use of off-road vehicles is required. What more details can she provide of any planned initiative for this summer? Will she encourage all users of such vehicles to act in a responsible and legal way and to stay safe?

Siobhian Brown: I can confirm that we will launch two national campaigns this summer to promote responsible and safe off-road vehicle use. The fearless service, which is part of Crimestoppers, has rolled out its be a legend, do it right campaign as part of a broader summer safety campaign that is aimed at young people, and Crimestoppers in Scotland will follow with a public awareness campaign about reporting illegal off-road vehicle use.

I encourage all members to share that material widely. I also pay tribute to Councillor Allan Gow for all his valuable work on the issue.

Youth Violence Summit

5. **David Torrance (Kirkcaldy) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide

details of its engagement with stakeholders on violence prevention during its youth violence summit on 12 June. (S6O-04846)

The Minister for Victims and Community Safety (Siobhian Brown): The cross-party meeting provided an opportunity to hear views on what could be done to address young people being affected by violence and, critically, how to prevent violence from happening in the first place. We heard from those who attended that early intervention, through youth work, safe spaces and whole-family support, is key to tackling and preventing youth violence. Building on that, and on what we know is working, we are considering what more we can do to strengthen support for young people and communities.

David Torrance: The rise of social media has arguably increased the accessibility and volume of violent content consumed by young people online. Does the minister believe that projects such as quit fighting for likes can have a positive impact on young people who might be drawn into violence or, indeed, into filming and sharing violence without understanding the impact of the content?

Siobhian Brown: I totally agree with the member. I have heard directly from young people and their families about how that has impacted them. In addition to experiencing physical assault, the filming and sharing of their attack online causes additional suffering. The quit fighting for likes campaign, which was developed by our violence reduction partner organisations, provides practitioners with resources to have conversations with young people and get them thinking about and discussing the impact of filming and sharing violent incidents.

The initial quit fighting for likes campaign last September attracted an average of 80,000 impressions a day through its four-week run, and 6,000 visitors accessed further information. I encourage everyone working with young people to engage with the quit fighting for likes campaign. The more young people who get the opportunity to think about and discuss this important issue the better.

Sharon Dowey (South Scotland) (Con): Youth violence, crime and antisocial behaviour are all on the increase, as was confirmed by the figures that were released yesterday. At that summit, the First Minister said that we need effective punishment for offences. I continually raise the issue of the under-25 sentencing guideline. The unintended consequences of that is that criminal gangs are exploiting that policy by targeting young people and involving them in crime, knowing that they will face few or no consequences. Does the minister agree that that needs to change, and will she review that form of two-tier sentencing?

Siobhian Brown: First, I have to correct Ms Dowey. There are consequences for children over the age of 12 and those over the age of 18 who commit offences. Significant action, including the potential to restrict or deprive a child's liberty, can be taken. Action is not necessarily always visible to victims because of confidentiality or data protection reasons.

I know that the member has attended some of the youth violence summits that were hosted by the First Minister. We had a group of leading experts there who explained to us all that the evidence shows that it is more about prevention. I hope that Ms Dowey would accept that.

Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab): As the minister said, early intervention is key. Will she outline what further work is being considered to identify potential young offenders and develop early intervention programmes? In particular, will she respond to concerns about the funding of the no knives, better lives campaign, about which I have written to her, as there are concerns that there have been restrictions on funding in recent years?

Siobhian Brown: I am aware that the Scottish Government is funding several initiatives. I will write to Katy Clark about that in detail. However, I want to highlight the proceeds of the crime cashback for communities programme, which specifically targets youth groups across all Scotland and does great work.

Paul O'Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): Cashback for communities does, indeed, do great work and, clearly, youth work is part of the response. However, I have spoken with a number of youth groups in my community, including Johnstone Castle Learning Centre, which is locked out of that funding because its income is under £200,000. Most youth groups that we represent in our communities will not have an income of £200,000. What does the minister suggest that they should do to ensure that their life-saving work continues?

Siobhian Brown: I am aware that applications for funding opened last week. I was not aware of that criterion, but I will write to Paul O'Kane, because I am sure that the Scottish Government supports other funding streams for such groups.

Supreme Court Judgment (Scottish Prison Service)

7. **Annabelle Ewing (Cowdenbeath) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government when the Scottish Prison Service will conclude any work required to ensure that it fully complies with the judgment of the United Kingdom Supreme Court handed down on 16 April 2025 in the case For Women Scotland v the Scottish Ministers. (S6O-04848)

The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance): I regularly meet Teresa Medhurst, the chief executive of the Scottish Prison Service. Like many public services, the Scottish Prison Service is currently reviewing all policies and practices in consideration of the impacts of the Supreme Court judgment. It is working at pace to ensure that any policies or practices that are impacted are brought into line with the outcome of the judgment and the Equality and Human Rights Commission's revised code of practice, when that is published, to ensure compliance with the law.

Annabelle Ewing: The UK Supreme Court judgment of 16 April 2025 had immediate legal effect. Unconscionably, in my view, and notwithstanding that, the Scottish Prison Service has not yet complied with the judgment. What assessment has been made as to the risk and the possible costs of legal challenge? Surely the cabinet secretary will wish to confirm to the Parliament that the default position should be to comply now with the law as it is.

Angela Constance: I say again to the Parliament and to my colleague Annabelle Ewing that the Scottish Government has been crystal clear that we accept the Supreme Court judgment. As a public body, the Scottish Prison Service is required to comply with all relevant legislation including the Equality Act 2010; legislation that relates to the management of people in custody, such as the Prisons (Scotland) Act 1989 and the Prisons and Young Offenders Institutions (Scotland) Rules 2011; and the Human Rights Act 1998. Of course, all legislation, policy and practice should be consistent with the European convention on human rights.

As I have said previously, the Scottish Prison Service is actively considering and engaged with what changes are needed following the judgment, while continuing to work to keep people safe and protect the rights of people living or working in custody.

Pauline McNeill (Glasgow) (Lab): For stabbing a man, Alexandria Stewart, formerly known as Alan Baker, is serving a life sentence in Greenock prison's women's wing. Lawyer Paul Lynch was forced to ask four times for the criminal record of that offender, whose offences disappeared when they changed their name, due to the self-identification policy that has been in existence. Mr Lynch was told by the Crown Office that Stewart had no previous convictions. Only after Paul Lynch sent a link to an online news story about Baker's murder conviction was the error rectified.

The policy has done deep damage. Does the cabinet secretary agree that a full investigation should be conducted to ensure that the impact of the policy is fully rectified so that criminal records are disclosed to the courts and are as accurate as they should have been in the first place?

Angela Constance: With respect, I note that that was the subject of a topical question last week, and I am of the view that I addressed the matter in full at that point. There was an error on the part of Police Scotland, which it acknowledged. It has put on the record, as I did last week, that it has undertaken a course of action to ensure that policies and procedures work as intended.

Scottish Crime and Justice Survey

8. **Clare Haughey (Rutherglen) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to the findings of the latest Scottish crime and justice survey, which included for the first time new questions around crimes of fraud and computer misuse. (S6O-04849)

The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance): The crime survey shows a substantial fall in violent and property crime since 2008-09, despite a 34 per cent increase since 2021-22. Levels also remain similar to the pre-pandemic position.

We welcome the expansion of the survey to include people's experiences of fraud and computer misuse. The first results show that one in 10 adults was the victim of those crimes in 2023-24, although most who lost money were reimbursed. We will continue to work with partners on the serious organised crime task force to raise awareness of the risks that exist and of how criminals try to defraud individuals and organisations.

Clare Haughey: Fraud and computer misuse are estimated to account for more than two fifths of all crimes in the latest year, with almost half of those crimes involving bank and credit card fraud. I hear all too often from constituents about increasingly sophisticated scams that often originate on social media. What steps is the Scottish Government taking to protect the public from those types of crimes?

Angela Constance: The Scottish Government, Police Scotland and the National Cyber Security Centre are working together to help to protect organisations from cybercriminals. They do so by identifying fraudulent websites, preventing phishing emails, blocking phone numbers and, ultimately, bringing those who are responsible to justice. Police Scotland has also established a cyber and fraud specialist division to enhance the response in Scotland, working with United Kingdom law enforcement and partner agencies. It will develop capability through cyber and online training, ensuring that there is support and guidance for officers and staff.

I encourage everyone to report suspicious sites to the NCSC using the reporting tool on its website, and I encourage anyone who believes that they have been a victim of crime to contact Police Scotland.

Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con): In response to the 2019-20 crime and justice survey, the then justice secretary Humza Yousaf crowed that

"adults in Scotland were less likely to experience crime than those in England and Wales."

However, the latest survey shows that Scots are now more likely to be a victim of crime in general and twice as likely to be a victim of violent crime than those in England and Wales. After 18 years in charge, does the Government accept any responsibility for those frightening figures? When, if ever, will there be a whole-system strategy to arrest those rising rates?

Angela Constance: In Scotland and in England and Wales, there have been substantial falls in victimisation rates for violent and property crime since 2008-09. Prior to 2023-24, Scotland had a violent and property crime victimisation rate that was either lower than or similar to that in England and Wales. However, Scotland's crime victimisation rate, including fraud, was 19.9 per cent in 2023-24, which is above the equivalent for England and Wales at 16.1 per cent. Findings from the next survey will be needed to understand whether the higher rate this time is a temporary fluctuation. However, prior to that, we remain fully committed to tackling crime in Scotland, including through the delivery of increased police funding year on year since 2016-17.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): That concludes portfolio questions.

Historical Policies Affecting Gypsy Traveller Communities

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is a statement by John Swinney on historical policies affecting Gypsy Traveller communities. The First Minister will take questions at the end of his statement, so there should be no interventions or interruptions.

15:14

The First Minister (John Swinney): Today, the Scottish Government has published reports that highlight the injustice and prejudice that Gypsy Traveller individuals, families and communities have faced as a result of the historical policies and decisions colloquially known as the tinker experiments. Although those events pre-date this Parliament, it is important to recognise that the impacts of those policies are still felt today. I know that in the public gallery today are members of the communities impacted. I welcome them to the chamber and I applaud their tenacity in pursuing these issues over such a long period of time.

Since its inception, the Parliament has demonstrated its willingness to address uncomfortable and, for some, incredibly painful elements of our national story. My statement today is set in that context.

I invite Parliament to consider that only by confronting those difficult truths from our past are we able to move forward, learning from the mistakes of the past as we work towards a more just and equitable Scotland—a Scotland that truly honours and celebrates the rich culture of Gypsy Travellers.

It falls to the Government to state, without ambiguity, that what happened to Gypsy Traveller communities in Scotland was unacceptable. That starts with formally acknowledging and apologising for the harm caused by those actions. It is clear to the Government that stark prejudice and lack of cultural awareness led to a series of unfair and unjust policies. Those policies resulted in children being removed from families and in families being forced to live in substandard accommodation and degrading conditions. The trauma that that has caused to individuals, families and groups, including those who regard themselves as victims of the tinker experiments, is significant and lasting.

So, as First Minister of Scotland, I want to say directly to Gypsy Traveller communities: the tinker experiments should not have happened. Those policies were wrong, and we recognise how much they are still hurting so many today. More than anything else, I want to say this: on behalf of Scotland, we are sorry.

We have come a long way since the tinker experiments, but there is still much to do. We still see prejudice and ignorance today. Indeed, discrimination towards Gypsy Travellers is often described as

"the last bastion of respectable racism."

It is not.

We must be united in unequivocally condemning all forms of hatred, discrimination and prejudice, particularly those that still cause members of Gypsy Traveller communities in Scotland to feel unsafe, unwelcome or marginalised in their daily lives or in the expression of their identity and way of life.

This statement comes at a particularly important time. Every June, we celebrate Gypsy, Roma and Traveller history month. Through celebration, education and raising awareness, the month plays a vital role in challenging prejudice, amplifying the voices of Gypsy Traveller and Roma communities and reshaping public understanding. The national event organised by the Scottish Government at Dynamic Earth last week highlighted the important work that is being carried out by many of our national and local partners to improve the lives of Gypsy Traveller communities in Scotland. It also celebrated the rich culture and heritage of those communities. I understand that the event was very well attended and very well received, and I warmly encourage members—indeed, anyone—to attend similar events in the future.

We must all play our part in eradicating racism, inequality and injustice, and in building a better, fairer world where every person has the same opportunities and where everyone's individual needs are recognised and met. We can achieve that only by working together in partnership, ensuring that communities are at the heart of our discussions.

That is why a short, initial community consultation was commissioned to engage with members of Gypsy Traveller communities impacted by historical policies. The Minister for Equalities attended one of those sessions in person, and I know that she was deeply moved by the powerful insights and experiences that were shared with such courage.

We recognise that revisiting past trauma is never easy, and we are truly grateful for the generosity and openness shown by members of the community throughout this process. We are also aware that others might still wish to share their stories, and I want to reassure them that the Government is here to listen, whenever and however those individuals feel ready to explain their story.

We have now published a summary of the results of the consultation along with the archival research report, and we are keen to continue the conversation to find the best and most effective way forward.

We also recognise that historical policies have affected individuals and groups differently with direct and indirect impacts. Those effects vary, based on multiple factors, and often carry intergenerational consequences. Understanding that complexity is crucial as we work toward collective progress on the issue.

Improving the lives of our Gypsy Traveller communities is essential if we are to tackle deep-rooted inequalities and deliver a fairer Scotland. The progress that we have made since the events that are outlined in the report is significant. It is a testament to the collaborative work of national and local government, the dedication and tireless efforts of third sector organisations and, most of all, the determination of Gypsy Travellers to ensure better futures for their communities.

Since the publication of our first "Gypsy/Travellers action plan", the Scottish Government has taken specific actions to improve the lives of Gypsy Traveller communities in Scotland in key areas such as accommodation, tackling discrimination and improving representation and access to public services and education. Last year, we published an updated action plan, building on the successes that we have had to date.

At the same time, we recognise that there is still much more work to be done. The experiences that have been shared underline the need for systemic change, greater accountability and, crucially, a shift in attitudes at every level. We must do better.

Recognising the harm that is caused by this prejudice is only the first step; it must be followed by meaningful action. That includes challenging stereotypes, confronting everyday discrimination and committing to long-term efforts that promote understanding, respect and equity for Gypsy Travellers.

We have reached this moment due to the efforts of many people. Individuals in Gypsy Traveller communities have argued with care and tenacity for these injustices to be addressed. Some have not lived long enough to hear the words that I am sharing with the Parliament today. I pay tribute to their commitment to the pursuit of justice.

I also pay tribute to our late colleague and former Minister for Equalities and Older People, Christina McKelvie. She fought tirelessly to address the inequality and injustice that Gypsy Traveller communities faced. I know that this apology today would be the recognition and the long-anticipated justice that she worked so hard to

deliver for so many. I pay tribute to Christina McKelvie, who always listened to those who suffered injustice and acted to address that injustice.

Our hope is that we now have a foundation on which to continue building trust and fostering renewed relationships with all those who have been impacted by historical policies. As we look ahead, the Scottish Government is determined to maintain a strong leadership role in advocating for the rights of Gypsy Traveller individuals and in celebrating the rich history, culture and contribution of these communities.

An apology is not the end of the conversation; it is, I hope, the beginning of a new conversation. We want to continue the dialogue and to work together to keep improving the lives of Gypsy Traveller individuals, families and communities in Scotland—that is the commitment that I make to the communities and to the Parliament today. Our duty is to address the errors of the past and to work for a better future.

The Presiding Officer: The First Minister will now take questions on the issues that were raised in his statement. I intend to allow around 20 minutes for questions, after which we will move on to the next item of business.

Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I thank the First Minister for early sight of the statement.

It is difficult to calculate how many Gypsy Travellers have been forced by historical policies to alter their lives. The impact has been deeply felt by the community. Those who were affected have said that such policies destroyed lives, shattered and separated families and affected generation after generation. Members of the Gypsy Traveller community have been petitioning for an apology from the Government for years, so I welcome the long-overdue apology this afternoon. Researchers have highlighted that it is the responsibility of the Scottish Government, so why has it taken so long for the apology to be given? Is the Scottish Government considering compensation for those affected? If that is the case, when is that anticipated to happen?

The First Minister: I welcome Alexander Stewart's comments on the apology that I have given to the Parliament and to the Gypsy Traveller community. The Government has been working to address the issue, and, in the course of my comments, I made reference to Christina McKelvie's leadership on the issue. Christina engaged faithfully with the Gypsy Traveller community and raised those issues. We have now addressed them after the production of the research report, which I am glad that Alexander Stewart has welcomed.

As I indicated, the Government has offered an apology today. We will engage with the community further as part of encouraging and motivating a dialogue to address the injustices that have been experienced. The Minister for Equalities will take forward that dialogue with the Gypsy Traveller community in the period to come.

Paul O'Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): I thank the First Minister for advance sight of his statement, and I welcome the formal apology that he has made to Scotland's Gypsy and Traveller communities.

The Government is right to acknowledge that, although they occurred before the Parliament was established, the Scottish state and its public institutions should recognise the wrongs that were visited on Gypsy and Traveller communities. The tinker experiment was wrong and should never have happened. It exposed some of our most marginalised communities to cultural injustice, prejudice and failure. Although that occurred many decades ago, it is clear that it has had a lasting effect. On behalf of the Scottish Labour Party, I add our apology to that of the First Minister.

We have heard that it has taken a long time to reach this day. Once again, it is important that we pay tribute to all the individuals in the Gypsy Traveller community who have spoken out and have had to relive injustices in order to get the recognition and the apology that they deserve. It is also important to put on record the work not just of Christina McKelvie, about which I accord myself with the comments of the First Minister, but of all the other organisations in Scotland, particularly the Scottish Human Rights Commission under the stewardship of Professor Angela O'Hagan and others, that continue to work on these issues.

In response to Alexander Stewart, the First Minister acknowledged, once again, that this is the beginning of a conversation and a process, but I do not think that he said in definitive terms whether there will be consideration of a redress scheme. Is he able to say anything further on that? If not, is he able to say why that is and whether he thinks that redress in the form of compensation would be appropriate?

The First Minister: I welcome the comments that Paul O'Kane has put on the record and his acknowledgement of the shared obligation that we have on the matter.

As I indicated in my statement, it is right that those who hold office today act on behalf of the state in relation to failings and errors that happened long before our responsibilities started. I do that unreservedly in the Parliament today. I also associate myself with Paul O'Kane's comments about the contribution of other organisations, such as the Scottish Human Rights

Commission, which have, of course, advanced many of these questions.

Mr O'Kane's question raises the issue of cultural prejudice. We live in a society where we are wrestling with issues of prejudice in different forms and in different shapes, and we must be vigilant—Mr O'Kane knows the degree to which I am concerned about these issues—in confronting the sources of that prejudice. We are acknowledging historical prejudice, but there are versions of prejudice that are still prevalent in our society today.

The Government does not have immediate plans for a redress scheme, but, as I indicated in my response to Alexander Stewart, this will be the start of further dialogue with the community. I am keen to ensure that we follow up the apology with means of supporting the community and individuals within the community to overcome the damage that has been done in the past.

Elena Whitham (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP): Today is a historic moment on the path to reconciliation. I welcome the First Minister's apology and much-needed recognition of the deep harms that were caused by state policies such as the tinker experiment and the associated practice of trafficking Scottish Traveller children overseas. Does the First Minister agree that, beyond acknowledgement, true reconciliation and the healing of intergenerational cultural trauma require on-going community-led investment in support and cultural preservation for Scotland's Gypsy and Traveller communities, which must remain a priority for the Government?

I take this opportunity to thank community members, activists and academics such as Roseanna and Shamus McPhee, Dr Lynne Tammi-Connelly and Davie Donaldson, as well as all the third sector partners who never stopped pushing for justice. Christina McKelvie, Kevin Stewart and I were deeply privileged to work together with members of the community on the first action plan, and today's apology can now be placed at the heart of this work.

The First Minister: I acknowledge the importance that Elena Whitham attaches to the term "reconciliation" and I am glad that she has done so, because that is the route for us to have a process of healing with a community that has been badly damaged. I hope that the steps that the Government has taken today and the fact that I am here offering the apology on behalf of the state to the Gypsy Traveller community indicate the seriousness with which the Government considers the matter and the significance that it attaches to the need for it to be addressed.

In my constituency capacity, I have engaged with a number of the individuals whom Elena Whitham referred to. Roseanna and Shamus McPhee are constituents of mine, so I am directly familiar with the experiences that have been recounted, and I am grateful for their engagement on the question. I am determined to ensure that the approach to reconciliation can be built on the basis of the apology that has been offered today. That is the commitment that the Government offers to Parliament.

Pam Gosal (West Scotland) (Con): Despite Scottish Government action, Scotland's Gypsy Traveller communities are still some of the most marginalised and isolated. Those communities still face significant challenges, particularly in accommodation, with sites across Scotland in need of funding and updates. Just last year, funding for improvements at a site in Dumbarton was delayed despite a desperate need for investment. Such challenges are found across Scotland. What discussions has the Scottish Government had with local authorities to ensure that they have made necessary upgrades?

The First Minister: Work is on-going with local authorities to address the issue that Pam Gosal puts to me. Obviously, many of those issues—indeed, all of them—will be taken forward at a local level, because they involve local planning considerations, and it is right that local authorities are taking the lead in that respect. As part of the process that I am setting out today, the Government will engage with local authorities about how that agenda is taken forward. The best way to address the errors and failings of the past, particularly in relation to questions such as poor accommodation, is to ensure that, in the future, accommodation is better and meets the needs of the communities. That is the objective that the Government brings to Parliament today.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): I welcome the First Minister's statement, and I thank the Minister for Equalities, Kaukab Stewart, for the work and passion that she has put into fulfilling the legacy of our dear colleague Christina McKelvie. I also thank all the organisations and people involved.

Does the First Minister agree that those in the Gypsy Traveller community should be involved at every step of the way in progressing their futures and that their voices must be heard as a priority in light of the terrible injustices that they have historically endured?

The First Minister: It is absolutely vital that the community is involved at every step of the way in that endeavour. The failures of the past happened because people were not listened to and not respected. They must be listened to and respected in the future, and that is what the Government will deliver.

Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab): Two United Nations reports have highlighted the persecution of the Gypsy Traveller community in Scotland and the need for an apology and further action. The First Minister says that the Scottish Government will listen. The community is asking for restitution and reparations. Does the First Minister agree that, where there are human rights abuses, compensation is appropriate?

The First Minister: Those are the issues that we now have to consider. The starting point for the dialogue is the apology that I have made today on behalf of the state. That is not the end of the process; it is the beginning of another part of the process, which we will take forward in dialogue with the community. As I have just explained to Rona Mackay, it will be an engaged process that involves the community at every step of the way.

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): The report describes a forced and systematic initiative to remove Gypsy Traveller children from their families and communities. How will the Scottish Government ensure that Gypsy Traveller community members who were affected by that shameful period in their history are supported in getting closure and coming to terms with the ordeals that they suffered?

The First Minister: Mr McMillan has highlighted some of the archival report's truly disturbing contents. As he will be familiar with, the Government's approach to the whole area of children's policy is, as far as possible and in all circumstances, to act to keep families together when they face any form of challenge or difficulty. Therefore, to read in a report about a policy to essentially force parents and families to separate is deeply uncomfortable and disturbing, hence the importance of the apology that I have given in the Parliament today.

Mr McMillan's question has highlighted one very clear example of the trauma that Gypsy Traveller communities have suffered. As part of on-going work through the various interventions that are set out in the action plan, we must support individuals so that they have the assistance to come to terms with that trauma. Listening to the community, understanding its needs and addressing those needs will lie at the heart of the Government's response.

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): I thank the First Minister for his statement. On behalf of the Scottish Greens, I welcome Gypsy Traveller community members to the Parliament. I am glad that you can be here to witness this. I recognise community members Dr Lynne Tammi-Connolly, Roseanna and Shamus McPhee and Davie Donaldson, whose determination is why we are here today. The apology is important and I hope that it signifies a new direction for how we in Scotland's Parliament engage with, support and treat members of Gypsy Traveller communities across Scotland.

I will continue the conversations that I have been having with the Scottish Government on next steps, because we must discuss reparations and redress. For now, how can we ensure that the Government's apology—it is long overdue, but it is here now—will be the catalyst for other public bodies that had a role in the tinker experiments to properly examine their complicity, apologise to communities and provide to those communities the proper services, from housing and healthcare to education and cultural recognition, that deliver dignity, respect and justice?

The First Minister: I readily acknowledge Maggie Chapman's points about the community's determination and tenacity. We would not be here today had it not been for the community's determination to ensure that those wrongs were addressed. We now need to move on and build on the actions that are already under way through the action plan in order to provide better lives and outcomes for Gypsy Traveller community members. That is what the Government will do.

Maggie Chapman raised the issue of other public institutions. The Government is responsible for some of those institutions, so it should be interpreted that my apology has been given on their behalf. However, I hope that other bodies that are not directly under my control will listen with care to what I have said to the Parliament today and act accordingly. I cannot direct them, but I hope that other bodies will take their lead from my acknowledgment of the importance of addressing the wrong that was inflicted on the Gypsy Traveller community. The process of righting it starts with apologising for the error in the first place.

Kevin Stewart (Aberdeen Central) (SNP): I also welcome today's statement. The First Minister said in it:

"An apology is not the end of the conversation; it is, I hope, the beginning of a new conversation."

I have every faith that his Government will carry on that conversation and listen to the Gypsy Traveller community.

I had the great pleasure of serving with Elena Whitham and Christina McKelvie on the working group that came up with the Gypsy Traveller action plan in co-operation with the community. Christina McKelvie was immense at bringing folk together. What can the Government do to bring folk from the Travelling community and from other communities together to have conversations, to foster understanding, to defeat prejudice and to create friendships?

The First Minister: The route to addressing Mr Stewart's question lies in the approach and legacy of Christina McKelvie, who acted with dignity, empathy and respect when dealing with all communities in our society. As a long-serving colleague of mine, Mr Stewart will know how much we were all influenced and affected by the skills and attributes of Christina McKelvie, who demonstrated how empathy, dignity and respect could be deployed in community relationships in our country. I want to ensure that, through the Government's actions, we learn from that experience and approach so that we succeed in addressing the substantial question that Mr Stewart has put to me.

Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (LD): Although the apology is overdue, it is very welcome, and the Liberal Democrats unreservedly add our voice to it. However, let us not pretend that the rhetoric and narrative about the Gypsy Traveller community from some quarters, particularly from politicians, has always been just or justified, so I hope that the apology is universal across the chamber.

Many of the problems of yesterday are still the problems of today—be it higher suicide rates among the community, lack of educational attainment or lack of access to basic fundamental public services and human rights, such as those relating to health and housing—so there is clearly more to be done. Given the scale of those challenges, will the First Minister commit to a full parliamentary debate in Government time after the summer recess so that we can discuss them?

The First Minister: On the question of a parliamentary debate, Mr Greene will appreciate that commitments of that type are even above the pay grade of the First Minister, but I will ensure that the Minister for Parliamentary Business is well aware of that request, which the Parliamentary Bureau can discuss.

Mr Greene's point is really important. We have to take a human rights-based approach to all these questions. That is the foundation for the respectful treatment of individuals in our society, and it lies at the heart of the Government statement that I have made in the Parliament today. The Parliament has endorsed a human rights-based approach to many aspects of our policies, and that should be reflected in the outlook and perspective of members of Parliament in how we respond to this challenge.

Mr Greene is absolutely right to highlight the fact that there remains a significant prevalence of prejudice in our society. That prejudice will take different forms, but it must all be confronted, because prejudice is unhealthy in our society. I give him my commitment that the Government will confront it on my behalf.

Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP): I warmly welcome the First Minister's recognition of the grievous wrongs that have undoubtedly been done to the Gypsy Traveller community over the decades and the national apology that he has just made. Can he say anything further about the significance of the Scottish Human Rights Commission's on-going spotlight project on the cultural recognition of Scotland's Gypsy Traveller community? When will the findings of that research be published?

The First Minister: The spotlight project has been taken forward by the Scottish Human Rights Commission, which acts independently of the Government. At this stage, I do not have information on publication timescales, but research of that nature is an essential tool in deepening our understanding of the challenges and the lived experiences of Gypsy Traveller communities, so the Government will pay very close attention to the contents of that material when it becomes available to us.

Medium-term Financial Strategy and Fiscal Sustainability Delivery Plan

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is a statement by Shona Robison on the Scottish Government's medium-term financial strategy and fiscal sustainability delivery plan. The cabinet secretary will take questions at the end of her statement, so there should be no interventions or interruptions.

15:45

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): Today, I am publishing two documents that broadly set out how public finances will be managed in the next five years—the Scottish Government's seventh medium-term financial strategy and our first fiscal sustainability delivery plan.

Today, the Scottish Fiscal Commission is also publishing an update to its independent forecasts, which underpin the strategy and delivery plan. I thank Professor Graeme Roy and the Scottish Fiscal Commission for their flexibility in working with us.

With the world facing profound economic uncertainty, this MTFS is being presented in deeply challenging circumstances. Those challenges have been exacerbated by the actions of the United Kingdom Government, whose decisions continue to have serious consequences for the delivery of our public services. For example, the Chancellor of the Exchequer has again failed to provide full funding for the additional costs of employer national insurance contributions, leaving public services in Scotland to face a £400 million shortfall. Furthermore, had the resource funding that is provided to the Scottish Government for day-to-day priorities matched the average increase for UK departments in the UK spending review, we would have £1.1 billion more to spend in the next three years.

Last week, the UK Government set out proposals that will deliver deep cuts to disabled people's support, which will push more people into poverty, with a real-life negative funding impact in Scotland of £440 million by 2029-30, based on the Office for Budget Responsibility's estimates.

Given the situation that is developing in Westminster today, how exactly the UK Government will deliver its intended changes remains to be seen but, for the purposes of today's publications, I will be using the numbers that the Treasury gave us at the UK spring statement. For Scotland, funding from the UK Government for day-to-day spending is only expected to grow by 0.8 per cent in real terms in the next three years, compared with a 1.2 per cent average growth for UK Government departments. Scotland's capital block grant will be 1.1 per cent lower in real terms by the end of the UK spending review period.

Those allocations simply do not reflect the unavoidable realities of the demands that will be placed on public services by the demographic challenges that we face, not least through an ageing population. On capital, construction price inflation, which has been turbocharged by Brexit, continues to drive up prices, while the necessity to maintain and invest in new assets remains.

To ensure that public services are there to meet the needs of the people, we are introducing our reform and savings plans. The UK Government is taking similar action. Indeed, the chancellor has set out the approach to achieving fiscal sustainability for the UK, with all departments to deliver at least 5 per cent savings and efficiencies by 2028-29. Within that, there are reductions in administration budgets of at least 11 per cent by 2028-29 and 16 per cent by 2029-30 in real terms. We require to take similar actions as, without our doing so, the forecast gap between funding and spending in Scotland could reach £2.6 billion for resource and £2.1 billion for capital by the financial year of 2029-30.

Managing the impact of Westminster austerity is all too familiar but, in spite of that, we continue to invest in the people of Scotland by supporting a better paid public sector, delivering high quality public services, and providing welfare support that is not available in other parts of the UK. We have done so while delivering a balanced budget every single year since 2007.

We will reform and reshape our public services, using technology to embrace and drive forward new ways of working. That shift is critical to and underpins the first pillar of our strategic approach, which is to continue to increase value for the public purse, maximising the impact that we achieve through our investment. That is why, alongside the budget in December, I will publish a multiyear Scottish spending review and an infrastructure pipeline that will set out affordable and sustainable investment plans for the years ahead. A framework for that spending review is being published in the MTFS today.

As part of the second pillar, we will deliver efficiencies. That means improving productivity and making the most of every pound of public money that is spent on delivery. We will focus on business improvement to drive down the cost of service delivery, not only in corporate functions but across the whole system—as was set out last week by the Minister for Public Finance—while protecting outcomes. Business improvement will

include the sharing of services and estates across our public bodies and the driving of efficiencies from collaborative procurement across the public sector.

We will set a managed reduction target for the public sector workforce to reduce staffing levels by an average of 0.5 per cent per year until 2030. That will be achieved through reforms to our public services, as has been set out in our public service reform strategy, through natural attrition and recruitment controls. By taking that action, we will protect valuable front-line services and continue to offer a progressive pay policy that recognises that our public sector workforce is our most valuable asset.

We will focus on how to process and deliver benefits with dignity, fairness and respect, while driving important efficiency savings and ensuring that people access the support they are entitled to. We will continue our targeted programme of efficiency and productivity improvement within the national health service. We will seize the opportunities that are presented by the rise of innovation, digital and advances in treatment. We will commit to working with NHS boards and staff, ensuring that the use of core resource is optimised and that best value is secured across NHS Scotland.

As part of the third pillar, we will drive forward service reform to improve the way in which we deliver services. We must integrate support and empower the front line to bring together all the resources that people and families need to thrive. Lastly, we will focus on prevention, investing in the most impactful preventative spend to reduce demand on services in the medium to long-term. In order to improve lives, we will deliver the technical and cultural change that is needed to go further in tackling the root causes of poor outcomes. For example, through the “Best Start, Bright Futures” breakfast club delivery plan, we will continue to drive forward cross-Government action on eradicating child poverty.

Through the actions to maximise value from public spending and drive efficiency and reform that are presented in today’s delivery plan, we expect to generate total cashable savings of £2.6 billion by 2029-30. That equates to 4.4 per cent of the forecasted resource budget for that year. Growing the economy is a top priority for the Government. By boosting business activity, driving wage growth and creating employment opportunities for more people, we can broaden the tax base, alleviate pressure on public finances and generate income tax revenue to support fiscal sustainability in the medium to long term. That is the focus for the second pillar of our strategy.

Our plan for increasing Scotland’s economic activity centres on creating a dynamic and flexible business environment, improving skills provision and supporting people to secure higher paying jobs, creating opportunity for people to enter or take on more or better work, attracting investment, and promoting entrepreneurship in the industries of tomorrow. However, the levers that are available to us to stimulate economic growth are limited. For example, the UK Government’s current approach to immigration harms Scotland by failing to address our demographic and economic needs, thus exacerbating labour supply issues. Despite those constraints, this Government will continue to take action and make the most of Scotland’s strengths and opportunities to boost our long-term economic prospects.

Our overarching economic strategy sets out our vision for a fair, green and growing economy, and we are prioritising the delivery of the actions that are outlined in our programme for Government to deliver growth that will help people to enjoy more prosperous lives now and in the long term, and protect the public services that we all rely on.

The third pillar of our approach focuses on delivering a strategic approach to tax policy decisions. Despite limited tax powers, we have taken bold, necessary action in recent years to ensure that our vital public services are prioritised.

Our decisions on income tax since devolution are helping to protect investment in public services. Scottish income tax is forecast to raise a record £20.5 billion in 2025-26, with the latest SFC forecast showing a positive contribution to the 2025-26 Scottish budget of £616 million, with the total tax net position to be £2.3 billion by 2029-30.

Our delivery plan sets out further the range of actions to improve the operation and performance of the existing tax system. For example, we are implementing new devolved taxes, including the Scottish aggregates tax in 2026 and the building safety levy in 2027, and we continue to work in partnership with local government to ensure that local taxes are fair and sustainable. We will also take forward work on considering future reform to the tax system, including through developing our thinking on longer-term issues such as wealth taxation.

Fiscal sustainability is about more than balancing the books: it is about delivering value, driving reform and making strategic choices that support long-term growth. By focusing on efficient public spending, modernising services, growing our economy and taking a strategic approach to tax, we can build a stronger, fairer Scotland. Meeting the challenges that face our public finances will require a collaborative effort across the public sector and beyond any single parliamentary year.

Our strategy and action plan set out a clear path. I invite my colleagues across the chamber to work with me to deliver them and to ensure that our public finances stay on a sustainable footing.

Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con): The previous medium-term financial strategy was published just over two years ago. Last year's was binned, and this year's was delayed. With the Government slipping out this year's strategy just before the summer recess, we have no time to properly scrutinise the plan. What we do know is that, without radical action on public sector reform, health and labour force trends, Scots face substantially higher taxes or a state that does less.

The projected £5 billion fiscal gap by the end of the decade is not Westminster's fault or responsibility; it is the Scottish National Party's. Today's 0.5 per cent workforce reduction plan lacks ambition and detail. The tax strategy is wrong, and it is bringing in just £616 million this year, which is £1 billion less as a result of the SNP's economic performance gap. There is still no credible plan to generate the growth that is needed to pay for it all.

How can we trust the SNP to deliver additional tax receipts of £2.3 billion by 2029-30 when its existing plans bring in only a quarter of that? How do ministers intend to pay for Scotland's health outcomes? Yesterday's data revealed that things are still getting worse. How does the Government intend to address alarming and rising levels of economic inactivity, which can no longer be ignored, and how will ministers pay for the year-on-year surge in welfare spending, which is £2 billion, as a result of SNP policy? Is it not the case that the delayed SNP document is too little too late to rescue the Scottish economy or our fragile public finances?

Shona Robison: Again we hear hyperbole from Craig Hoy rather than anything about the detail of the plans that I have produced today. [*Interruption*.] Let me take Craig Hoy through a couple of facts. Our funding is determined largely by Westminster, and I set out the impacts that are driving the gap in 2029-30—there are three in particular. One is the cuts to disability benefits, which will impact the Scottish budget by £440 million. The cost of mitigating the UK Government's two-child cap could be offset if the UK Government decided to do that. There is also the impact of employer national insurance contributions, with a gap of £400 million. Then, of course, we have the very low rate of funding growth, which is 0.8 per cent lower than the average for UK funding departments.

Craig Hoy: There were four questions in there, but I have not heard any answers.

The Presiding Officer: Let us hear one another.

Shona Robison: It sounds to me like Craig Hoy wants to defend the Labour Government's spending review instead of defending Scotland's public finances and funding. That is a political decision for Craig Hoy to make. [*Interruption*.]

Let me explain—probably for the fourth or fifth time—a point that Craig Hoy seems to have misunderstood. The Scottish Fiscal Commission has produced an illustrative policy-only income tax net position, but that is not supposed to represent what the income tax policy could raise for the Scottish budget—I have told him that time and again. More importantly, Professor Graeme Roy of the Scottish Fiscal Commission has told Craig Hoy that. Perhaps he needs to start listening a bit more, rather than talking.

Michael Marra (North East Scotland) (Lab): Today is the day when years of gross mismanagement of the public finances by SNP ministers caught up with them, and the price is being paid by ordinary Scots. Let us be crystal clear: by no definition—other than the SNP's—can the budget that it receives be described as representing austerity. Scotland's budget will increase in real terms each and every year of this forecast. There is an additional £9.1 billion for Scottish public services and, by 2029-30, the block grant will be £52 billion. This SNP Government is making cuts because it has spectacularly mismanaged Scotland's budget. SNP ministers have created a structural deficit of a staggering £2.6 billion as a result of the choices that they have made. The SNP's cuts plans set out huge reductions in front-line workers and a 12 per cent funding cut to Scotland's NHS boards.

This comes at a time when, only yesterday, we learned of soaring accident and emergency waiting times and the worst cancer waiting times on record, with SNP ministers admitting that people are dying as a result of the incompetence. Domestic abuse statistics are at record highs and house building rates are plummeting down, down, down. These are cuts to mitigate their incompetence. It has never been clearer that Scotland needs a new direction. This SNP Government has the powers and the money. Is it not right that it is out of ideas, out of excuses and out of time?

Shona Robison: Michael Marra has outdone Craig Hoy's hyperbole as usual. Let me give Michael Marra some facts. First, the Chancellor of the Exchequer is also delivering savings: 5 per cent savings and efficiencies by 2028-29 and an 11 per cent real-terms reduction in administrative budgets by 2028-29, rising to a 16 per cent real-terms reduction by 2029-30. Why is it okay for Michael Marra's Labour UK Government to make

those reductions in corporate costs and back-office costs—[*Interruption*.]

The Presiding Officer: Let us hear one another.

Shona Robison: —but it is not okay for the Scottish Government to make reductions in corporate and admin costs to protect front-line services? Michael Marra needs to explain why it is okay for the Labour UK Government to do that but not okay for the Scottish Government to do that. We will take action on reforms and reduce corporate and back-office costs in order to protect front-line services and welfare spending—something that Michael Marra and his colleagues want to cut. We will protect the priorities of this Government, and we will let Michael Marra defend a UK Government record on disability cuts that is indefensible.

The Presiding Officer: There is a lot of interest in the statement. If we can hear one another, we will be able to include more members.

Paul McLennan (East Lothian) (SNP): East Lothian is one of the fastest-growing areas in Scotland, along with the broader south-east Scotland region. Extensive economic and housing opportunities are possible in the region, as is highlighted in the "Strategic Sites Programme October 2024", which was published by the Edinburgh and south-east Scotland city region deal team. How can the Scottish Government engage with the local authorities in the area in relation to the medium-term financial strategy to maximise opportunities?

Shona Robison: Scotland's regional economies and regional economic partnerships are critical to growing our economy. The strategic sites programme highlights that targeted Government capital and revenue support can help to unlock those strategic sites, which is why we are funding areas such as the Granton waterfront with targeted funding to help to unlock vital investment. We will continue discussions with strategic partners, focusing on emerging business cases such as that for Blindwells, over the next months in order to develop a joint approach to facilitating the progress of these strategic sites.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): In May 2022, the then SNP Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Economy, Kate Forbes, who I do not see in the chamber, pledged that the Scottish Government would reset the public sector, return the size of the workforce to pre-Covid levels and freeze the pay bill. We now know that all three of those promises were broken. The public sector pay bill has ballooned, while the civil service full-time equivalent head count has gone up from 17,700 in 2019 to 27,400, which is a staggering 54 per cent increase. At the rate of reduction of 0.5 per cent a year that has been announced today, how many years will it take to get the public sector workforce back to pre-Covid levels, as promised? I make it 70 years. Does the cabinet secretary agree with my arithmetic?

Shona Robison: Murdo Fraser forgot to mention the growth in the areas of welfare spending in which we have devolved powers, which required the establishment of Social Security Scotland.

What I have set out today is an achievable and deliverable workforce reduction plan that can be implemented in a way that focuses on back-office and corporate costs. The plan will make a sizeable contribution to the overall cost reduction that I have set out in my statement, alongside the other work that Ivan McKee set out in his statement.

We will not do what the Tories have done—put forward unaffordable proposals for £1 billion of tax cuts that they have no way of funding. [*Interruption*.]

The Presiding Officer: Members.

Shona Robison: We will set out our spending review at the end of this year. It is up to the other parties in the Parliament, whether the Tories or Labour, to set out their spending plans. The envelope is the envelope, and it will be very interesting to see whether they would divert from our spending plans and, more importantly, what they would cut from those spending plans. We will wait and see what they bring forward.

The Presiding Officer: It would be very helpful if all front-bench members could set a good example to the rest of the chamber.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): The UK Government's decision to cut disability benefits is completely wrong-headed. It is simply unacceptable to try to balance the books on the backs of some of the most vulnerable people in our society. What assessment has been made of the impact that that decision will have on Scotland's public finances? What steps will the SNP Scottish Government take to protect disabled people from those Westminster cuts?

Shona Robison: The Department for Work and Pensions's own impact assessment highlights that, by 2029-30, 3.2 million families will lose out as a result of those reforms. Ninety-six per cent of those families include a disabled person. The proposed changes will push a further 250,000 people, including 50,000 children, into poverty by 2029-30. The UK Government's disability benefit reforms will reduce the block grant adjustment funding that we can expect to receive for social security benefits in 2029-30 by £440 million.

The Scottish Government will not let disabled people down or cast them aside, and we will not cut Scotland's adult disability payment.

Daniel Johnson (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab): As has already been mentioned, the fiscal sustainability delivery plan sets out that the devolved public sector workforce will fall by 0.5 per cent in each of the next five years. Given that the public sector workforce in Scotland consists of 469,000 people, I make it that that will involve a decrease of 2,300 a year, which will result in a cumulative reduction of 11,700 jobs.

Such stark action is perhaps unsurprising, given that the NHS head count has increased by just one third of that, and the numbers of police, fire, local government and college staff have all gone down over the past five years. Can the cabinet secretary confirm that we are looking at a reduction of more than 11,000 full-time equivalent posts? Will NHS and other front-line services be protected? Are those targets compatible with the policy of no compulsory redundancies?

Shona Robison: Daniel Johnson asks some very important questions. First, because of the scale of the challenge in recent years and across the medium term, the health service will receive a 3.3 per cent real-terms increase in funding. That is important. However, like the health service in England, the NHS in Scotland will require to undertake reform and make efficiencies. In England, about £9 billion will have to be saved by 2028-29, which is about 4.4 per cent of the NHS budget. We are requiring the health service in Scotland to undertake reform, with a particular focus on back-office and corporate costs, in order to protect front-line services.

I have set out that the no compulsory redundancies policy will be maintained as the default position. However, as a last resort, once all steps have been taken in relation to voluntary severance and redeployment, and there is no other route and no jobs for the people involved, compulsory redundancy can be considered, but only at the end of that process. I have been engaging with the unions and the Scottish Trades Union Congress on that, and we believe that the reductions can be made through natural attrition and voluntary severance. Only in that extreme position would compulsory redundancy be enabled, and we do not see that happening in very many cases.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): It is disappointing that the UK Government's central capital allocation for Scotland in four years will be £163 million less than this year. What will that mean for capital investment in our infrastructure?

The statement mentioned a modest 0.5 per cent annual decline in the public sector workforce, as we have already heard. Will that be concentrated in specific departments or across the board, and how will front-line services be protected?

Shona Robison: In response to Kenny Gibson's final question, we will absolutely focus the reductions on back-office and corporate costs. We believe that, through reform, we can make major changes to the way that back-office and corporate functions are delivered in order to protect the front line. We want to be able to deliver our spending plans and the Government's priorities of protecting front-line services, eradicating child poverty, growing the economy and reaching net zero by taking the action that is set out in those plans.

Kenny Gibson also mentioned capital. The capital outlook in the UK spending review is very disappointing. We will return to that through our spending review and the infrastructure investment pipeline that we will set out at the end of the year alongside the 2026-27 budget.

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green): The envelope is not fixed. The cabinet secretary's statement acknowledges that tax policy will have to play a role if we are to avoid damaging cuts to public services. The plan that she has published today commits to ensuring that local taxes are fair and sustainable. Why, then, has the Government continued to oppose Green proposals to revalue council tax, which is the most substantial local tax that exists? Why does the work to replace that broken, outdated and deeply unfair tax seem to have stalled completely?

Shona Robison: We continue to discuss with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, through the joint working group, potential reforms to local taxation. Of course, some reforms have already happened, with the additional fiscal levers that local government now has.

As I have said at committee and in the chamber, it is important to build a political consensus on what any substantial reform to council tax looks like, otherwise it will not get off first base. That remains my position in relation to not only the parties in the chamber but local government and, importantly, the public.

Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (LD): According to today's forecast, the bills for health and social care and devolved social security benefits account for more than half of all Government spend, with both bills rising every year for the next five years to the tune of £150 billion. The Scottish Government claims that economic growth is its top priority, but with one in five Scots economically inactive, surely the public sector reform that we need is the sort that will help

to get people back into work, reduce the welfare bill and make our nation wealthier, healthier and happier. Does the cabinet secretary not accept that today's forecasts instead demonstrate an unsustainable budget that achieves none of that?

Shona Robison: Let me start on a point of agreement, which is that it is important to get people back to work. Our employability schemes and our investment in employability are important ways to do that.

There is also our focus on growing the economy through investment in the Scottish National Investment Bank, investment through Scottish Enterprise and delivery through our enterprise agencies. We also have incredible levels of direct investment into Scotland. There are some underlying strengths in the Scottish economy.

Yes, there is more to do. We look forward to working with Jamie Greene and his colleagues on some of the additional measures that we can take, particularly around employability and what works to get people back into the labour market.

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): As the pressure of Labour austerity and inflation continues to attack funding for our public services, and as the increase in employer national insurance continues to bite, ever more will probably fall to be delivered by the third sector—our charities—yet they, too, fall foul of that employer national insurance hike. Does the cabinet secretary agree that charities should be exempt from that job tax, and that it should be fully funded if they are not exempt?

Shona Robison: I agree with Christine Grahame on that point. The analysis was, I think, that the national insurance increase would cost the third sector more than £80 million—which will, of course, be a cost to the services that that sector provides. We will work with the third sector, in the absence of UK Government movement on exempting it, to look at multiyear funding, for example, because certainty of funding is something that it would greatly welcome.

Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): In the letter that the convener of the Finance and Public Administration Committee wrote to the cabinet secretary on 14 May, it was made abundantly clear that the committee had significant concerns about the very late publication of the MTFS in the last week of term, which delays the scrutiny process for two months. Does she recognise the serious implications of late publication and its effects on scrutiny, forecasting and policy making?

Shona Robison: In my letter to the committee, I recognised that the situation was less than ideal, but it was driven by the fact that we needed to see the numbers in the UK spending review. It is as well that we waited to see those, because, compared with the actuality of the UK spending review, there has been a deterioration on the forecasts that we and the SFC made. That was my whole reason for delaying. I would have thought that it was better to have accurate figures as the number 1 priority.

Michelle Thomson (Falkirk East) (SNP): The cabinet secretary referenced culture change. The permanent secretary gave evidence to the Finance and Public Administration Committee yesterday, during which he confirmed that nearly 50 per cent of all Scottish Government staff are in a management role. That culture must change as part of public sector reforms. Is the cabinet secretary absolutely assured of the complete support of the permanent secretary, as accountable officer, to make that skewed figure into a much more normal distribution?

Shona Robison: The permanent secretary agreed that cultural change is required. I therefore believe that we have the leadership in the organisation to recognise that the spending plans , the outlook that I have set out today and the requirements for reform, including doing things differently and head-count reduction, have to be delivered throughout the organisation, starting at the highest level, from the permanent secretary down. He will be working very closely with the ministerial team, including the First Minister, in delivering that.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes the ministerial statement. There will be a short pause before the next item of business. I apologise to members whose questions I was unable to reach.

Education (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

16:19

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Education (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should refer to the bill as amended at stage 2—that is, SP bill 49A—the revised marshalled list and the groupings of amendments. The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for around five minutes for the first division. The period of voting for the first division will be 45 seconds. Thereafter, I will allow a voting period of one minute for the first division after a debate. Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak button or enter RTS in the chat function as soon as possible after I call the group. Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

Before we get under way, I remind members that the length of time for consideration of amendments this afternoon reflects the timetabling motion that was proposed by the Parliamentary Bureau and agreed to by Parliament yesterday afternoon. The motion is based on the assumption, which was raised with business managers prior to the stage 3 proceedings in the usual way, that contributions from members with a right to speak on each group would last for up to five minutes. The timetabling motion also allows time for other contributions, for the disposal of amendments and for the cabinet secretary to speak and respond to amendments. The timing lines that were agreed in the motion give a guide to allow steady progress through the proceedings, and I encourage members to be mindful of the agreed timetable during this afternoon's proceedings.

That said, given the position that we reached last night, I now exercise my discretion under rule 9.8.4A(c) of standing orders to allow debate on the first group today to continue beyond the next time limit.

After section 30

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 16 is entitled "Involvement of teachers, college staff and others in inspection matters". Amendment 29, in the name of Stephen Kerr, is grouped with amendments 30, 38, 39, 234 to 236, 239, 240, 240A and 81. I point out that, if amendment 43, which was debated in group 12 on independence of the chief inspector, is agreed to, I will be unable to call amendments 239 and 240 due to pre-emption.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): I understand that the Minister for Parliamentary Business is having kittens about how long I take to deliver my speeches, but I point out to the Parliament that, since most of the members in the chamber—

The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn): Will the member take an intervention?

Stephen Kerr: Of course I will. I assume that this will be deducted from my allocated time.

Jamie Hepburn: I just rise to point out that I do not think that it is just me who has that perspective. [*Applause*.]

Stephen Kerr: I am sure that everyone who is watching—I will qualify that: anyone who is watching—will be interested to see how much the Scottish National Party does not want the bill to be scrutinised. The reality is that it should be scrutinised. We have a duty as members of this Parliament to scrutinise the bills that come before us, and that is exactly what I intend to do. Any attempt to curtail or constrain this afternoon's debate will be entirely counterproductive, because it will only feed the growing reputation that this Parliament has for predetermined outcomes and performative scrutiny—[*Laughter*.]

Well, if members think that it is performative to seek to improve—

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am sorry, but I think that our hearts are all sinking at the idea of a repeat performance. I am sure that the member thinks that this is very funny, but is there anything in standing orders that requires him to speak to the amendments in the group rather than making other random points that take up time and try our patience? [*Applause*.]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Harvie. I think that I have made it clear that the chair intends to proceed in accordance with the timetabling motion that was agreed to by all of the Parliament yesterday afternoon. It is for members to speak to amendments, but they may well wish to draw on other points in so doing.

Stephen Kerr: Only Patrick Harvie could take up the time of the Parliament to make a point about me making points that are not relevant to an amendment. That was a ridiculous point of order.

The reality is that every amendment that was brought to the chamber yesterday by members of all the Opposition parties was lodged in good faith. Not one amendment that was spoken to yesterday was designed to wreck the bill. They were all designed to make a poor bill better, to give it substance, to make it matter and to honour the voices of teachers, learners and parents who have

spent years crying out for change. This is the only bill that we have had in the current session of Parliament that has sought to change the education system for the better, and I doubt whether it will do that unless it is seriously amended. We are, in many ways, not making much progress on that.

My amendments in group 16 speak to a single foundational principle—that those who teach, support and lead learning in our schools and colleges must have a central voice in shaping how we inspect and improve our education system. That has been commented on by many teacher leaders, including representatives of the teaching trade unions. Amendments 29 and 81 would establish that the design, structure and practical application of the inspection process must be developed in genuine consultation with the representatives of teachers and college teaching staff. That is not an optional courtesy—it is a necessity.

We have heard time and time again that there has been a profound breakdown in the trust between the profession and those who are charged with inspecting and evaluating it. The Muir report, which put learners at the centre, was clear in its critique of Education Scotland's dual role and its failure to engage meaningfully with the teaching profession. The report was underpinned by the testimony of more than 5,000 voices across Scottish education, and one of its clearest messages was that teachers and practitioners felt unheard. We must take that message seriously.

My amendments in the group are about creating an inspection system that teachers can trust, not by lowering expectations but by really listening to the profession. When we fail to engage with those at the chalk face, we do not just alienate them but also impoverish our understanding of what is really happening in our schools and colleges. These are not meaningless amendments; they mean a great deal to the people who are engaged in teaching.

During the stage 2 proceedings, I raised the issue that top-down models of inspection often miss the local contextual knowledge that classroom teachers and college lecturers possess. That argument is not abstract. It is grounded in the evidence of what went wrong with previous models. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development report made a related point when it criticised the lack of robust feedback mechanisms between policy and practice. There is no point in inspecting a system if the process does not learn from the professionals who deliver it.

Amendments 30, 38, 39 and 236 would go further and provide an annual structured mechanism by which teachers and lecturers could make recommendations on how inspections are conducted. The chief inspector would then be required either to act on those recommendations or to explain in writing why they were not doing that. That would create not only a pathway for practitioner influence, but a safeguard against indifference. If we are serious about building a system that is based on mutual respect and continuous improvement—the Opposition parties in this place are certainly serious about building such a system—the voices of teachers cannot be included as an afterthought. They must be embedded in the very architecture of the inspection. The amendments would ensure just that.

We know from our debates on the bill and the reports that we have all studied that there has been a cultural failure at the heart of Scottish education governance. That failure has been characterised by centralisation, opacity and an unwillingness to hear difficult truths from the profession. My amendments in the group offer us a legislative opportunity to change that. They would promote a culture of collaboration in which inspections are seen not as external judgments imposed from on high but as part of a shared endeavour to raise standards for all learners. Indeed, that collaborative approach is not only fairer, but also more effective. Research consistently shows that systems improve most when those within them feel that they have ownership of the process of reform. A system that is designed with teachers will work better than one that is designed for them.

We must also consider morale. As we have seen in recent surveys by the NASUWT and the Educational Institute of Scotland, Scottish teachers are under enormous pressure. Verbal abuse, physical assault, dwindling support staff and ever-shifting expectations are taking their toll. Amid all of that, the least that we can do is to ensure that inspection is something that is done with teachers and not to them.

We cannot forget our colleagues in the college sector. With the reforms that were proposed by the Withers review and major transformations in post-school learning delivery, college lecturers are facing immense structural and pedagogical—I have a problem saying that word—change. I should have said teaching, should I not? It is vital that the inspection process in further education listens to and reflects the experience of college lecturers as well.

My amendments are not complicated; they are practical. They would set in statute the processes of annual consultation, transparency and reasoned response, and they would make it clear that an inspection must not ignore the views of those whose work it evaluates. Some may say that this is merely procedural, but I argue the opposite: it is cultural and foundational. It is about whether we

will build an education system that is rooted in partnership or in prescription. My amendments in the group answer that question, and I urge all members to support them.

I move amendment 29.

16:30

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): Amendment 234 is a simple amendment. It would clarify that, under section 36(4), the chief inspector will be required to consult only such persons as they consider appropriate, and it would allow them to fulfil the requirement by consulting a reasonable cohort of the groups that are referenced in the section. The amendment would eliminate any potential ambiguity and any suggestion that the chief inspector must, for example, consult a representative of every school in Scotland. We agreed to similar amendments to other sections yesterday, so I hope that the amendment is not particularly controversial.

Amendment 239 would apply the same clarification to the provision that will require ministers to consult. There would be no need in either case to consult a representative of every school unless they believe that that is necessary. On many occasions, they would simply need to consult a sample to get a representative view.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): I support many of the amendments in the group, not least some of the amendments that Stephen Kerr referred to. Teacher input to the inspectorate will be incredibly important. We have seen through various reports and experiences that there has not always been enough teacher input. That causes huge fear among staff who work in schools, particularly among teachers, and it is why the amendments in the group are important.

My amendment 235 would require the chief inspector, when preparing the annual inspection plan, to consult people and organisations that represent those who are most directly affected by inspections—teachers, support staff, school leaders and, where appropriate, learners and parents. By listening at the planning stage, the inspectorate would be able to target its visits, methodologies and follow-up support according to the realities of classrooms and staffrooms, and not simply to a timetable that was set centrally.

My amendment 240, which complements that, would place a similar duty on Scottish ministers. When they draft regulations that may alter how often the inspection plan is reviewed, they should also consult the representatives of those whose work and learning are impacted most closely by inspections. That would ensure that any future adjustment to the frequency is informed by professional experience and by the impact on learners.

Both of my amendments in the group respond directly to evidence that the Education, Children and Young People Committee heard at stage 1 and which was highlighted in the stage 1 report. Teachers, unions and parent groups asked for earlier and clearer engagement in inspection policy. Neither amendment would limit ministerial or inspectorate discretion; they would simply guarantee that decisions are made with and not for the people who deliver and experience education every day.

Consultation at the right time will improve policy, build trust and, ultimately, support better outcomes for young people. I therefore ask members to support amendments 235 and 240.

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Jenny Gilruth): Before I speak to the group 16 amendments, I want to briefly reference the group 15 amendments that were debated last night. I have committed to members to place on the record my intent to engage with the General Teaching Council for Scotland, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities and other appropriate partners on issues relating to the oversight of safeguarding and child protection systems. I already wrote to COSLA about that on 13 June and it is my intention that the education and childcare assurance board will discuss those issues at its meeting in September.

The Government is keen and willing to use our convening power to identify and address with partners, including the GTCS, any remaining information-sharing challenges in relation to child protection. I am open to members' suggestions in this space, and I hope that that provides reassurance to Mr Rennie, Mr Greer, Mr Briggs and others who have an interest in the matter.

I turn now to group 16. I have strong reservations about Mr Kerr's amendments 29 and 30, which seek to require the chief inspector to co-design inspections. Amendment 29 would appear to require each individual inspection to be designed separately. Although every inspection is different and they will be tailored to meet the specific context of the establishment that is being inspected, there still needs to be a degree of consistency in how establishments are inspected. In addition, the amendment's requirements would be extremely resource intensive, and they would put at risk there being a consistent approach that is fair and equitable across inspections.

However, I support using the views of stakeholders to help to inform the overall approach to inspections. Indeed, the bill as currently drafted will enable that by way of consultation with the advisory council and other groups in the

preparation of the inspection plan. However, for individual inspections, I believe that the manner in which that inspection is conducted should be a matter for the chief inspector. We would not want a situation to arise whereby a school is able to avoid inspection of an area of risk or weakness by removing it from the inspection remit through the co-design process.

Mr Kerr's amendment 30 would require the design of inspections to be reviewed every year, in consultation with a considerable number of interested persons, even when all parties are content that the model of inspection is working well. The amendment would further create a presumption that the chief inspector will accept any recommendations that are made by consultees regarding the design of inspections. Even if recommendations were wholly inappropriate for inspections and did not accord with the views of the rest of the consultees, the chief inspector would be required to provide a written response, which would take up their time unduly—time that could be better used to undertake inspections.

Stephen Kerr: How can we change the cultural outlook that the profession most often has on the inspection process? If we do not engage with teachers and there is not a collaborative approach to inspections, how can the culture around them change?

Jenny Gilruth: Mr Kerr and I debated that at length at stage 2. I would argue that the bill has put measures in place to build a collaborative approach. I have spoken about, for example, the consultation process with the advisory council and other groups in the preparation of the inspection plan. My view is that the bill as currently drafted makes provision in that regard. I accept the member's point about culture and the way that teachers in particular experience inspections.

Although I do not agree with Mr Kerr's amendments, there is one exception, which is amendment 236. It would require the chief inspector, when preparing the inspection plan, to consult with such persons who are representative of registered teachers and college teaching staff, as the chief inspector considers appropriate. I am happy to support amendment 236 as I believe that it represents the best way to address Mr Kerr's general concern about this group of amendments, which is to ensure that teachers and college staff are suitably involved in inspection design.

I am also happy to support Mr Greer's amendments 234 and 239, which would refine important consultation duties that were inserted at stage 2.

On amendment 235, I hope to reassure Ms Duncan-Glancy that the section currently provides that the chief inspector must consult with such other persons as they consider appropriate and so would suitably catch those whose interests are not the interests of educational establishments. On that basis, and with the addition of the category of registered teachers and college teaching staff in Mr Kerr's amendment 236, I believe that it is unnecessary to include the additional provision in the bill.

With regards to Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 240, I think that it is important that we make it clear that ministers do not have to consult every person who is considered to be representative of a group. Therefore, with her support, I have lodged amendment 240A to adjust the wording, and I urge members to support both amendments.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Stephen Kerr to wind up, and to press or withdraw amendment 29.

Stephen Kerr: I do not have any further comments to make. I am grateful for what I think is a positive response from the cabinet secretary and that she has taken on board the principles that underpin at least some of my amendments. I press amendment 29.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 29 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. As it is the first division on the bill this afternoon, I will suspend the meeting for around five minutes to allow members to access the digital voting system.

16:38

Meeting suspended.

16:42

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will proceed with the division on amendment 29.

The vote is closed.

Daniel Johnson (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer, my app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make sure that that vote is recorded, Mr Johnson.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)

Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 29 disagreed to.

Amendment 30 not moved.

Section 31—Meaning of "relevant educational establishment" and "excepted establishment"

Amendments 31, 32 and 205 not moved.

16:45

After section 31

Amendment 206 not moved.

Section 33—The advisory function

Amendments 33 and 34 not moved.

After section 33

Amendment 35 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 35 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Roz McCall (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms McCall. I will ensure that that is recorded.

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app was not working, but it seems to be working now. It says that I voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do you want to clarify, Mr McMillan?

Stuart McMillan: Please record that I voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will ensure that that is recorded, Mr McMillan.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 69, Abstentions 21.

Amendment 35 disagreed to.

Amendments 207 and 208 not moved.

Amendment 209 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 209 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 93, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 209 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Amendment 210, in the name of Miles Briggs, was already debated with amendment 204. I call Miles Briggs to move or not move amendment 210.

Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Con): In light of the cabinet secretary's comments, I will not move amendment 210.

Amendment 210 not moved.

Section 33A—Working with others

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 17 is entitled "Chief Inspector: duties when exercising functions". Amendment 211, in the name of Pam Duncan-Glancy, is grouped with amendments 319, 212, 320, 213 to 215, 215A and 216 to 220.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Inspection earns credibility when it reflects the real world of education—its strategic priorities, its diverse learners and the people who teach and support them every day. The amendments in the group would embed those perspectives in the chief inspector's statutory duty.

Amendment 211 would tighten the obligation on the chief inspector, when exercising their inspection functions, to work with other bodies in collaboration, rather than there being parallel effort. That would make findings more coherent and follow-up support more effective.

Amendments 212 and 219 would ensure that the inspectorate paid heed to the national priorities for school education that ministers might set from time to time. That would strike the right balance. The chief inspector would remain operationally independent, but inspection activity would be aligned to agreed national objectives, such as closing the attainment gap and improving participation in science, technology, engineering and mathematics.

Amendments 213 and 220 would require the chief inspector to consider the "needs and interests" of children and young people and of all other learners who "require additional support". That would mirror the inclusive communication duties that members endorsed earlier, and it would guarantee that inspection reports evaluated how well additional support legislation was being put into practice. I imagine that it would be rare for a member not to have an inbox full of correspondence on the need to improve the experiences of young people with additional support needs. Amendments 213 and 220 are incredibly important, because we need the inspector, when inspecting schools and exercising their functions, to "have regard to" those young people and their outcomes.

Amendment 214 would add the lived experience of teachers and trainers to the list of matters that the inspectorate must weigh up, whereas amendment 215 would do the same in relation to support staff who work with learners who require additional help. Again, all our inboxes contain correspondence on the experiences of teachers and support staff. Poor behaviour and violence are on the rise as a consequence of some school environments, so it is important that the inspectorate considers those issues and their impact on staff.

Support staff are particularly important in that regard. They are often a forgotten group among staff who work in schools, but we know from various surveys that have been carried out by the NASUWT and by the GMB—I refer members to my entry in the register of members' interests, which shows that I am a member of the GMB—that support staff experience significant concerning behaviour in schools, so amendment 215 is really important. Those voices are essential. Those staff understand the daily barriers and input, and they can point inspectors to solutions that might already be being tested on the ground. It is not just about addressing concerns; it is about helping to find solutions.

Amendment 216 would instruct the chief inspector to take account of

"the morale and wellbeing of teachers and staff."

That speaks to some of the experiences that I highlighted a moment ago. We know that morale among the teaching workforce and staff in schools is at a difficult level just now. They experience incredibly high workloads—they are having to do more for young people than they have needed to do in the past, and the support needs that young people have now might be different from those that young people had in the past. We also know that the levels of resource, input and support have not necessarily kept pace with the numbers of young people who need support. That has affected the morale and wellbeing of teachers and staff, so it is incredibly important that that is taken into consideration when schools are inspected.

Amendment 217 speaks to a concern that was raised consistently with the committee during

stage 1. However, the concern goes as far back as 2015, when there was a report on the impact of additional bureaucracy and workload for teachers on morale and on the time that staff have to educate and support young people.

Amendment 217 talks to the burden of paperwork and bureaucracy. It would direct the chief inspector to

"challenge unnecessary bureaucracy and offer practical assistance".

That particular language was chosen because it is the exact recommendation of the 2015 report that unnecessary bureaucracy should be challenged and that there should be practical assistance wherever possible. Those things are crucial for overstretched teachers and school staff. That is why I think that the chief inspector should look to include those things in the work that they will be doing.

Scottish Labour is also happy to support amendments 319 and 320, in the name of the cabinet secretary, which will complement other amendments in my name to ensure that the chief inspector acts with regard to the needs of those with additional needs.

The amendments would turn broad aspirations—collaboration, inclusion, professional voice and practical help, young people's voice, additional support for learning—into clear statutory duties, so that the inspector would take those things into consideration when they were carrying out their role. By doing so, they would ensure that inspection is more relevant, humane and useful to the people who rely on it.

I move amendment 211, and invite members to support it and my other amendments in the group.

Jenny Gilruth: I am pleased to be able to support Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 211, alongside my amendment 319, which makes it clear that the chief inspector must work with others

"in every case in which"

they consider it

"appropriate to do so".

I also welcome Ms Duncan-Glancy working with me on her amendments 212 and 219, whereby the chief inspector must have regard to the strategic priorities for education, which are set out in the national improvement framework, when exercising their functions.

I move to Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 213, and amendment 220, which supports it. I have some concerns about the reference to "inclusive communication", as I believe that including that wording would not be helpful in this context. However, I am supportive of the intention behind those amendments. On that basis, I ask members to support my amendment 320 instead, which will require the chief inspector to have regard to the needs and interests of persons with educational support needs when exercising their functions.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Amendment 320, in the name of the cabinet secretary, says that the list of things that the chief inspector should "have regard to" should include

"those with additional support needs".

My amendment 213 says that it should include those young people, too, but that they also should have regard to "inclusive communication". Although my amendment goes further, does the cabinet secretary not agree that, at the very least, those amendments complement each other?

Jenny Gilruth: The issue that I have in relation to the amendment as drafted, particularly in relation to the term "inclusive communication", is the way in which that is interpreted. We want consistency across the bill—I spoke to a similar amendment in a different group on that exact point yesterday. The point that I am making today with regard to amendment 320 is about providing consistency across the bill.

I am also happy to support Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendments 214 and 215, which would require the chief inspector to "have regard to" the experiences of teachers and staff, subject to expanding that provision via my amendment 215A in order to align it with Mr Briggs's amendment 76 and to ensure that amendment 215 also covers those working with college students with support needs. I am grateful to Ms Duncan-Glancy for indicating her support for my amendment 215A.

I have some concerns about Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 216. Although it is, of course, important that

"the morale and wellbeing of ... staff"

is considered appropriately, the amendment could be read as meaning that the chief inspector should not report frankly on a school's challenges, notwithstanding any impact on learners. We should not risk those kinds of unintended consequences and I therefore ask Ms Duncan-Glancy not to move the amendment. If she moves it, I ask members not to support it.

Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 217 would require the chief inspector to challenge bureaucracy as they exercise their functions, which might have some value. However, the amendment would also require the chief inspector, in sweeping terms,

"to offer practical assistance to schools and local authorities."

That would be an additional role for the chief inspector, with unknown scope and resource

implications. It would also risk blurring the lines between inspection and the provision of support, which the removal of the inspection function from Education Scotland seeks to emphasise. I therefore urge Ms Duncan-Glancy not to move the amendment.

With regard to Mr Whitfield's amendment 218, I have every sympathy with his intention of strengthening arrangements for safeguarding and child protection wherever possible. However, I fear that the amendment will not do that. The national guidance for child protection in Scotland sets out the responsibilities of everyone who works with children, young people and their families, including in educational establishments.

As a fellow former teacher, Mr Whitfield is well versed in the principles behind getting it right for every child, which provides a consistent framework and shared language. We would expect the chief inspector to work in line with those well-established practices and with existing guidance and frameworks.

As I pointed out when discussing a previous group, I have taken steps to initiate a discussion with COSLA, the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland, the GTCS and other partners on related matters through the forum of the education and childcare assurance board. However, I am happy to put on the record for Mr Whitfield that I will commit the Government to writing to the chief inspector on a regular basis in order to draw their attention to all the guidance that has been published, which they should have regard to in fulfilling that duty. On that basis, I respectfully ask Mr Whitfield not to move his amendment.

17:00

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): As today is a new day, I again draw attention to the entry in my register of interests regarding payments that I received at the start of this parliamentary session.

In the first instance, I thank the cabinet secretary for her statement and for the interaction that we have had over this challenging area of safeguarding. At the minute, an area exists that is perhaps best described as grey. It is the area where the GTCS interacts—or does not interact—with local authorities that have a responsibility for employing teachers. That grey area has existed for a long while. The purpose behind my amendment was to draw attention to it and to seek a resolution to the problem. Unfortunately, there are a number of recorded instances in which local authorities have not stepped up to the responsibility that the public might expect of them and that responsibility has fallen between those two stools.

I very much welcome the contribution from the cabinet secretary and her putting on the record the Government's intention to write to the chief inspector on a regular basis to draw their attention to the guidance. A list of that guidance might be helpful beyond the chief inspector's purposes, as people would know that they could refer to it instantly when looking for the guidance. On the basis of the cabinet secretary's undertaking, I do not intend to move amendment 218 when the time comes. I thank members across the chamber—in particular, the cabinet secretary and those who have advised her—for their support on this matter.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 211.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I have taken the cabinet secretary's comments on board, and I am pleased that she will support some of our amendments.

On morale and wellbeing, I take the point that an inspector might worry that they may not be able to make a negative comment, but I do not think that it would restrict them from giving constructive feedback. I am pretty sure that, given all their other duties in exercising their function, an inspector would be able to do so in a way that does not bring down morale in the education system. That would be quite important. I do not accept that amendment 216 would curtail their ability to give commentary on the system.

On bureaucracy and the concerns about practical assistance, inspection should be about improvement. If it is not, that goes back to the point about it being something that staff will fear. That also speaks to the point that the cabinet secretary has just made. I am afraid that I do not agree that the concern with amendment 217 would be about assistance to schools and local authorities, because I think that the role of the inspector should be exactly that—to support schools and local authorities to deliver the sort of education that many of them want to deliver.

I will press amendment 211.

Amendment 211 agreed to.

Amendment 319 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Section 34—Duty when exercising functions

Amendment 212 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 212 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 88, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 212 agreed to.

Amendment 320 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 213 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 213 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 54, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 213 disagreed to.

Amendment 214 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 215 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

Amendment 215A moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 215, as amended, agreed to.

Amendment 216 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 216 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 55, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 216 disagreed to.

Amendment 217 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 217 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 217 disagreed to.

Amendment 218 not moved.

Amendment 219 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 220 not moved.

After section 34

Amendment 221 not moved.

Section 35—Advisory Council

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to group 18, which is on the advisory council. Amendment 222, in the name of Pam Duncan-Glancy, is grouped with amendment 223. I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to speak to and move amendment 222 and speak to the other amendment in the group.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: The strength of the advisory council lies in how accurately it mirrors the people and professions that are touched by the inspection regime, and amendment 222 would therefore tighten the duty on the chief inspector, making it clear that council membership must be genuinely representative of those affected by the inspectorate's work: learners, parents, teachers, support staff and system leaders alike.

I am supportive of amendment 223, in the name of my colleague Ross Greer, up to the sentence that refers to including the chief inspector's own staff. We think that that goes a step too far. I will leave my comments there in the interests of time.

I move amendment 222.

Ross Greer: Amendment 223 relates to section 35 of the bill and provides a non-exhaustive list of those with an interest in the chief inspector's functions, and, therefore, the groups that the chief inspector will have to take account of when appointing people to the advisory council. It specifically suggests appointing representatives of students, their parents and carers, teachers and lecturers and the chief inspector's own staff.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Pauline McNeill.

She appears to have managed to press the request-to-speak button without even being in the chamber. [*Laughter*.]

Jenny Gilruth: I was happy to commit at stage 2 to working with Mr Greer on this amendment and to now be in a position to support his amendment 223, which strengthens the provisions in this area.

On Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 222, I do not think that there is a substantial difference between her approach to the requirement on the chief inspector in relation to appointing members to the advisory council and what is in the bill as drafted. However, in the interests of cross-party consensus on the bill, which has been my approach throughout, I am happy to support Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Ms Duncan-Glancy to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 222.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I have no further comments. I wish to press amendment 222.

Amendment 222 agreed to.

Amendment 223 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 223 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

17:15

The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice (Shirley-Anne Somerville): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. I will make sure that that is recorded.

Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I, too, would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 93, Against 22, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 223 agreed to.

Amendment 224 not moved.

After section 35

Amendments 225 to 228 not moved.

Section 36—Inspection plan

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind members that, if amendment 229 is agreed to, I will not be able to call amendment 36, due to a pre-emption.

Amendment 229 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 229 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 93, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 229 disagreed to.

Amendments 36 and 230 not moved.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 19 is on the inspection plan. As we are nearing the agreed time limit, I consider it necessary to exercise my power under rule 9.8.4A(c) of standing orders to allow the debate on the group to continue beyond the time limit in order to avoid the debate being unreasonably curtailed.

Amendment 231, in the name of Pam Duncan-Glancy, is grouped with amendments 232, 233, 37, 237, 238, 41 and 42.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Yesterday, we spoke about the frequency of inspection. The scheduled frequency of an inspection means very little unless those it affects know when it is coming and what it will look at. The two amendments that I have lodged in this grouping add that clarity to the annual plan.

Amendment 231 would require the published inspection plan to set out who will receive advance notice of an inspection and how it will be given, wherever notice is usually appropriate. I have spoken to headteachers and teaching staff who have told me that timely and transparent notice reduces anxiety, allows constructive preparation

and ensures that staff, parents and learners all understand the process and their role within it. Amendment 231 would make that good practice a statutory expectation.

Amendment 233 addresses the substance of an inspection. It instructs the chief inspector to explain in the plan how inspectors will assess an establishment's duty of care to both the learners in its charge and the staff it employs. In practical terms, that means looking at safeguarding, health and safety and wellbeing policies, and confirming that those are not paper exercises but living procedures.

Together, the amendments would strengthen transparency and focus on welfare without adding any new layer of bureaucracy. Building a predictable process and a clear emphasis on duty of care into inspection will build in trust and, ultimately, improve the quality of Scottish education.

I move amendment 231.

Ross Greer: Amendment 232 would require the chief inspector's inspection plan to set out how the inspections will consider the extent to which relevant establishments are securing the rights of children. I hope that that is an uncontroversial suggestion.

Amendment 237 focuses on an area that has turned out to be of significant controversy between me and the cabinet secretary, which is the difference between 60 and 40 days. Amendment 237 would reduce the number of days for which the first inspection plan that is produced by the chief inspector must be laid before Parliament. I amended the bill at stage 2 to require inspection plans to be laid before Parliament for 60 rather than 40 days. This amendment is an attempt at a compromise with the Government, which disagreed with that extension. It seeks to address its concern that the first inspection plan being laid before Parliament for 60 days is too long, given the time period that would come before that 60-day countdown began—that is, the time period between now and then, once the bill is passed and receives royal assent and so on.

I understand the Government's concern about adding 60 days on top of that. However, further inspection plans should not be, and do not need to be, produced in a rush; there should be time for Parliament to consider them. That is a reasonable compromise with those who believe that the inspectorate should be accountable to Parliament rather than the Government. That is not a view that I share, but I think that we can reach a level of accommodation and ensure a substantial role for Parliament in relation to that area.

Martin Whitfield: What is Ross Greer's view as to what Parliament would do if there was disagreement? Further, are we talking about the education committee, or any committee to come that covers education, or Parliament as a whole?

Ross Greer: I did not specify the committee, because committees change with each session of Parliament. In legislation, it is therefore best practice to refer to "Parliament", and it would then be primarily for the Parliamentary Bureau to decide in the first instance.

In practice, however, it is quite obvious to all members that there is always a committee that deals with education specifically or, in this session, education, children and young people. It would be for that committee to decide whether it wished to take evidence and invite submissions from key stakeholders on it, as well as to provide feedback to the chief inspector on what was in the draft. It could work that into its work plan.

I would hope that, like quite a lot of committee work, that would be based on points of consensus. Obviously, it is up to parliamentary committees whether to operate on a majoritarian basis. It would be up to a committee whether to send a letter to the chief inspector that reflected both majority and minority positions within it.

I do not want to dictate to future committees of future sessions of Parliament how to go about it, but I am attempting to give Parliament an adequate period of time in which to express a view. That may be a collective view by consensus, which would be preferable. However, although a consensus view might not be possible, I still think that it would be appropriate for the views of the elected representatives of this country in relation to the plan to be taken into account by the chief inspector.

I see that Mr Whitfield wants to come back in.

Martin Whitfield: The mischievous question that follows is whether, if the plan was laid today, the 40-day limit would be challenging.

Ross Greer: Because of the way in which the provision is drafted, the period would not include recess, which is critical. That issue came up at stage 2. Clearly, 40 literal days, rather than 40 sitting days, would be of no use whatsoever, particularly over the summer recess. I reassure Mr Whitfield that the amendment is future proofed in that regard.

I hope that that is a reasonable point of compromise and that the Government will see the intention with which the amendment was lodged.

Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Everything in the bill should be about raising standards in our schools. With that in mind, most especially post-Covid, given that so many young people missed out on positive educational experiences, it should be about directing our

attention not only to structures that will raise attainment but to those that will reward achievement in our schools. To that end, I believe that we should give inspectors every opportunity to reward schools that have strong extracurricular and enrichment programmes. For me and most other members, that should include outdoor education, which inspectors should have the opportunity to inspect.

Jenny Gilruth: I welcome Pam Duncan-Glancy's amendment 231, on notice of an inspection, which aligns well with the principles of transparency and equity and avoids some of the issues that her similar amendment had in that space at stage 2. As such, therefore, I am happy to support it.

I thank Ross Greer for agreeing to work with me on amendment 232. It is a helpful amendment that will mean there is a strong focus on the implementation of children's rights in the chief inspector's approach to inspection. I will therefore support it.

Pam Duncan-Glancy's amendment 233 echoes similar amendments that were lodged by Katy Clark at stage 2, which were not pressed. I continue to believe that its provisions are not appropriate for the chief inspector and that the provisions that were voted for at stage 2, which emphasise the chief inspector's focus on child protection and safeguarding, will go a long way towards meeting what appears to be the policy objective of the amendment. However, it will be for the chief inspector to decide how to deliver on the new provision.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: [*Made a request to intervene.*]

Jenny Gilruth: If I can make some progress, I will be happy to bring in Pam Duncan-Glancy.

In addition, amendment 233 appears to imply that an assessment of a duty of care must take place in every inspection that involves an educational establishment, including every thematic or focused inspection—for example, on behaviour—as well as those on individual establishments. That would be very challenging for the chief inspector.

I will give way.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I thank the cabinet secretary for giving way and for the comments that she has made. If it is not for the chief inspector to establish whether the establishment is upholding its duty of care, who is it for?

Jenny Gilruth: There are clear requirements in relation to the role of local authorities. We need to be mindful of potentially cutting across the statutory responsibilities of local authorities.

A final point on amendment 233 relates to its potential for cutting across reserved areas of health and safety at work when it comes to duty of care and employees. For those reasons, I strongly urge members not to support amendment 233.

I thank Liz Smith for working with me on amendment 37, which takes the spirit of her successful stage 2 amendment on outdoor education and clarifies its scope. I am very happy to support that amendment.

Although I appreciate Ross Greer's valiant attempt to reduce the laying period for the first inspection plan to 40 days while leaving the rest at 60 days, I have lodged amendments to bring every plan back to 40 days. To Martin Whitfield's point, those 40 days would exclude any recesses or dissolutions of more than four days. Forty days is a much more manageable and proportionate time period for operational purposes, but it is also very much in line with the time periods that are attached to numerous other plans. Indeed, for secondary legislation, it is the time that the committee has for considering statutory instruments. Sixty days is excessive and is not standard practice.

One practical example is that the bill requires the chief inspector to consult the advisory council, ministers, representatives of educational establishments and, under amendment 236, teachers and college staff when preparing a plan, separately to laying it before the Parliament for consultation. Taken together, that might mean that the chief inspector becomes pressed into a shorter period of time to consider the representations that are made following consultation.

I therefore ask Ross Greer not to move his amendments 237 and 238, which, I note, would not exclude recess or dissolution periods from the 40 days of the first plan, and I ask members to vote instead in support of my amendments 41 and 42, to ensure consistency with other reports when it comes to laying periods.

I believe that all committees in the Parliament are under the same significant pressure and generally work to a standard laying period of 40 days. If members would find it helpful, I could list the similar types of documents that are subject to the 40-day laying period. However, that would take some time—and, in the interests of time, I will rest at that.

17:30

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 231.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: In the interests of time, I will simply press the amendment.

Amendment 231 agreed to.

Amendment 232 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 232 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Brian Whittle: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whittle. Your vote will be recorded.

Bill Kidd (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. There was a connection difficulty. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Kidd. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 88, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 232 agreed to.

Amendment 233 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 233 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 233 disagreed to.

Amendment 37 moved—[Liz Smith]—and agreed to.

Amendment 38 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 53, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38 disagreed to.

Amendment 39 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 39 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 39 disagreed to.

Amendment 234 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 234 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Jenny Gilruth: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app failed to connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, cabinet secretary. That will be recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 89, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 234 agreed to.

Amendment 235 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 235 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 235 disagreed to.

Amendment 236 moved—[Stephen Kerr]—and agreed to.

Amendments 237 and 238 not moved.

Amendment 41 moved—[Jenny Gilruth].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 41 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 86, Against 29, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 41 agreed to.

Amendment 42 moved—[Jenny Gilruth].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 42 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab): On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. I am afraid that my app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Baillie. That will be recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 29, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 42 agreed to.

17:45

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Amendment 43, in the name of Stephen Kerr, has already been debated with amendment 11. I remind members that, if amendment 43 is agreed to, I cannot call amendment 239 or amendment 240 due to pre-emption.

Amendment 43 not moved.

Amendment 239 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 239 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 90, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 239 agreed to.

Amendment 240 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

Amendment 240A moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to press or withdraw amendment 240, as amended.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I press amendment 240.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 240, as amended, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 90, Against 22, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 240, as amended, agreed to.

Amendment 44 not moved.

After section 36

Amendment 241 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 241 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

David Torrance (Kirkcaldy) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Torrance. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 69, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 241 disagreed to.

Section 37—Reports on inspections

Amendment 45 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 45 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

David Torrance: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I still cannot connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Torrance. We will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 45 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 20 is on reports of the chief inspector. Amendment 46, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 242, 243, 48, 244, 245, 51, 52 and 246.

Jenny Gilruth: My amendment 46 will adjust section 37(1A), which was introduced at stage 2 by Pam Duncan-Glancy. As we know, there are establishments in Scotland that offer qualifications such as A-levels, and I do not believe that it is the intention to restrict the provision to teaching or training on qualifications Scotland qualifications only. My amendment will therefore ensure that regard will be given to representations that are made by those who represent teachers or college staff without any limitation on where they teach. I believe that that will better capture Ms Duncan-Glancy's intentions on that point.

I am happy to support Mr Greer's amendments in the group. I will leave him to speak to the detail, but the committee discussed very similar amendments at stage 2 and at that time it was agreed that those should be pursued at stage 3 in order to get the wording right, which I believe his amendments now do.

I turn to Mr Kerr's amendments in the group. I note that we discussed the provision in amendment 48 at stage 2. I thought that we had agreed that the right place for information about relevant educational establishments' performance is the report that will be produced on the Scottish education system's performance, which is set out under section 39. I ask Mr Kerr not to move amendment 48, because his amendment 51 is preferred.

I support amendment 51, which will ensure that the report on the Scottish education system's performance will include an overview of the inspection findings that are published in that period. That will mean that information is provided about, for example, the performance of the schools that have been inspected. That also addresses the intention behind amendment 48.

I also ask Mr Kerr not to move amendment 52, which I do not believe to be necessary. Section 39(2) of the bill will allow the chief inspector to determine the "form of each report" on the Scottish education system's performance. We do not need to qualify that, despite the addition of amendment 51, because the rule in section 39(2) is about the report's format and not its content.

I move amendment 46.

Ross Greer: Amendments 242, 244 and 245 would require the chief inspector, where the inspection concerns a single establishment or what they consider to be connected establishments, to give them a copy of the inspection report before it is published, unless the chief inspector considers that there are exceptional circumstances that justify not doing so. Sending copies of inspection reports to establishments before they are published is current practice in the existing inspectorate, but it is not a requirement. We should make it one.

Amendment 242 references single or linked establishments in order to avoid, in the event of a thematic inspection, situations in which the inspector would have to give advance copies to, for example, every school in Scotland—that is not what is intended. The amendment also includes provisions so that the chief inspector may decide not to send a report in advance of publication in exceptional circumstances if they consider that doing so might be detrimental. We can all appreciate that advance notice would not be appropriate for some inspections, such as those that involve welfare concerns or, in a worst-case scenario, those that surface issues that need to be passed to other bodies such as the police. However, under amendment 245, the chief inspector would have to set out in their annual report how many times in a year they had decided, under that exception, not to share copies in advance.

Amendment 243, which is an updated version of an amendment that I lodged at stage 2, would require establishments to "have regard to" inspection reports. Although every establishment might find some benefit in reading every report

that is published—I know that the cabinet secretary does that every Friday when Education Scotland sends them on—a great deal of the advice and guidance in a report will not be applicable to every establishment in Scotland due to their different circumstances. For absolute clarity, amendment 243 builds on the amendment that I lodged at stage 2 such that it applies only to reports that relate to establishments that "managers" are required to have regard to.

Additionally, the annual report on the performance of education in Scotland will capture key reporting points of interest that establishments might find helpful. Amendment 246 makes similar provisions in that regard.

Stephen Kerr: I will speak in favour of my amendments 48, 51 and 52, which are straightforward in form but far reaching in purpose. They are designed to do one thing: to ensure that the chief inspector's reports will be not merely bureaucratic outputs but purposeful and illuminating reports that are worthy of the public trust that is placed in our education system.

Amendment 48, which hangs with amendment 51, would place a clear duty on the chief inspector to include in their annual report an account of how Scottish schools are actually performing. In essence, the provision is about performance and not only process. It is not enough to say that inspections took place or that frameworks were adhered to; parents, teachers, local authorities and those in the Parliament want and deserve to know what the inspections revealed. What is working and what is not? Where is progress being made and where is it not? Without that level of reporting, inspection risks becoming a closed system. It would be a ritual rather than a mechanism for improvement, and I think that we have all agreed that continual improvement is the whole basis of the inspection system.

Amendment 48 seeks to anchor the chief inspector's report in substance by requiring it to present an honest, accessible and evidence-based assessment of performance across the school system in the preceding financial year. It is a necessary correction to what has too often been an overly descriptive, opaque and self-referential reporting process. We must remember that the chief inspector will occupy a privileged position because they will have access to school-level data, trends, thematic reviews and direct evidence of what is happening in classrooms across the country. Such insight must not sit in files; it must be brought to the Parliament publicly, clearly and with a view to continual improvement.

18:00

I am grateful to the cabinet secretary for her support for amendment 51, which builds on the provisions by adding an explicit requirement that the chief inspector's report must contain an overview of what the inspection findings say about the performance of Scottish education as a system—not just as a collection of establishments, but as a coherent whole. Throughout the bill's passage, we have spoken many times about the importance of systems thinking. That is precisely what amendment 51 will introduce. It pushes back against the temptation to treat each inspection report in isolation. Instead, it demands that we join the dots, identify themes and spot recurring issues. If several schools are struggling with the same aspect of the curriculum or if concerns about pupil behaviour or support for learning crop up across different local authority areas, that pattern should be recognised, reported and acted on. Amendment 51 will ensure that those insights are not buried but shared.

Amendment 52 will provide the chief inspector with the independence to include any other information analysis that they see fit to include in their report. That will ensure that the reports are not overly prescriptive and, crucially, it will give the chief inspector agency and independence. I remind members that that approach is rooted in the recommendations of the Muir review and the OECD review of curriculum for excellence. The Muir review called for stronger accountability and clearer structures for evaluating improvement at school level, and the OECD review stated that there is a need for an integrated evaluation and assessment framework, including monitoring of system-level outcomes. The current system fails to provide that. As I said at stage 2, Education Scotland's past reporting has often lacked the candour, breadth and strategic clarity that stakeholders expect. That is not a personal failing of those who produced the reports; it is a structural failing. The bill offers a chance to put that right.

A key part of the structural correction relates to how reports are shared with the Parliament. At stage 2, I argued that there should be a requirement for the chief inspector's national performance reports to be laid before the Parliament at least every two years. My amendments are the necessary companion to that provision. They will ensure that the chief inspector's annual reporting is not superficial but forms a reliable and robust basis for scrutiny by MSPs, the media, local authorities and the public.

That scrutiny must build on timeliness as well as substance. At stage 2, I pressed for inspection reports to be published within a defined timescale—specifically, 12 weeks from the conclusion of an inspection visit. Why? I did that

because the value of reporting lies in its ability to inform action. Delayed or obscure reports do not just frustrate stakeholders but also diminish the power of inspection to drive rapid and meaningful improvement.

The logic behind all my amendments is simple. If we are to take inspection seriously, we must report seriously—not selectively and sporadically, but systemically, insightfully and accountably. The amendments reflect a deeper truth about how public services build trust. Accountability is not about blame; it is about clarity, openness and being willing to look at ourselves as a system—warts and all—and say that we can and must do better. That spirit lies at the heart of my proposals.

I urge members to support my amendments 48, 51 and 52 not as bureaucratic enhancements but as necessary reforms that will build confidence, drive improvement and give every stakeholder in Scottish education the clarity and accountability that they deserve.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary to wind up.

Jenny Gilruth: In the interests of time, I have nothing further to add.

Amendment 46 agreed to.

Amendment 242 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 242 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My phone would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacDonald. Your vote will be recorded.

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not access the app. I am just taking a collective judgment here, and I believe that it is a yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Grahame. That will be recorded.

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, cabinet secretary. That will be recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 24, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 242 agreed to.

Amendment 47 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 47 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their vote now.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Again, I could not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacDonald. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 47 disagreed to.

Amendment 243 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 243 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their vote now.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I still cannot connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacDonald. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 86, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 243 agreed to.

Section 38—Annual report

Amendment 48 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 48 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I still cannot connect. It would be a no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacDonald. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 26, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 48 disagreed to.

Amendment 49 not moved.

Amendment 244 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 244 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I still cannot connect. It would be yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacDonald. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)

McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 90, Against 23, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 244 agreed to.

Amendment 245 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 245 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 24, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 245 agreed to.

Section 39—Report on performance of the Scottish education system

Amendment 50 not moved.

18:15

Amendment 51 moved—[Stephen Kerr]—and agreed to.

Amendment 52 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 52 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

The First Minister (John Swinney): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am afraid that my app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, First Minister. Your vote will be recorded.

Jenny Gilruth: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Similarly, my app does not seem to have connected. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, cabinet secretary. Your vote was, in fact, recorded.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 52 disagreed to.

Amendment 246 moved—[Ross Greer]—and agreed to.

After section 39

Amendment 53 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 53 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 66, Abstentions 22.

Amendment 53 disagreed to.

Section 40—Other reports

Amendment 54 not moved.

Amendment 247 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Section 43—Powers of entry and inspection

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call amendment 55, in the name of Stephen Kerr. Mr Kerr, do you wish to move or not move amendment 55?

Stephen Kerr: If it would be helpful, Presiding Officer, I indicate that I do not intend to move amendment 55 or any of the large number of consecutive amendments in my name in group 12. If you wish to dispose of them en bloc, I would have no objection to that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I suspend the meeting briefly while I consult with the clerks.

18:19

Meeting suspended.

18:21

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I thank Mr Kerr for his clarification.

I put to the Parliament—please bear with me and my voice—that I will call amendments 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72 and 73, all in the name of Stephen Kerr and all previously debated. I invite Stephen Kerr to move amendments 55 to 73 en bloc.

Stephen Kerr: Not moved.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Stephen Kerr has indicated that he will not move amendments 55 to 73. It would be helpful if any member who wishes to move any of those amendments could indicate now.

No member has so indicated. I therefore intend to read out the amendment numbers and confirm that they are not moved. I will do so at a pace that would allow any member to call out, at the relevant

point, that they wish to move the amendment. I confirm for the record that the following amendments, in the name of Stephen Kerr, are not moved.

Amendments 55 and 56 not moved.

Section 46—Necessary improvements: referral to Scottish Ministers

Amendment 57 not moved.

Section 47—Preliminary notice of enforcement action

Amendments 58 to 63 not moved.

Section 48—Enforcement direction

Amendments 64 to 73 not moved.

Section 49—Publication of documents

Amendment 321 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendments 248 and 249 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

After section 50

Amendments 250 and 74 not moved.

Section 54—Interpretation

Amendment 251 not moved.

Amendments 253, 252 and 254 not moved.

Amendment 75 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 76 moved—[Miles Briggs]—and agreed to.

Amendment 255 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendments 77 to 79 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Section 55—Regulation-making powers

Amendment 80 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendments 256 and 257 not moved.

Amendment 81 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 81 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 81 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I advise members that, although we are making good progress, as I am sure that members are pleased to hear, we will shortly reach the next time limit and we have more groups of amendments still to debate. I am therefore minded to accept a motion without notice, under rule 9.8.5A of standing orders, to propose that the time limit be extended by 30 minutes. I invite the cabinet secretary to move the motion.

Jenny Gilruth: I move the motion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am terribly sorry, cabinet secretary, but the Minister for Parliamentary Business is trying to attract my attention. I ask the minister to move the motion.

Jamie Hepburn: I was entirely relaxed, but I will move the motion again.

Motion moved,

That, under Rule 9.8.5A, the time limit be extended by up to 30 minutes.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

Motion agreed to.

18:30

Amendment 258 moved—[Stephen Kerr].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 258 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)

Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 258 disagreed to.

Amendment 259 moved—[Miles Briggs].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 259 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 259 disagreed to.

Amendments 260 to 264 not moved.

Amendment 265 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 265 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)

McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 24, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 265 agreed to.

Schedule 1

Amendment 266 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 266 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 94, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 266 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before we move to the next group, I will suspend for 10 minutes for a comfort break.

18:36

Meeting suspended.

18:47

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): Group 21 is on board members of qualifications Scotland. Amendment 267, in the name of Pam Duncan-Glancy, is grouped with amendments 268 to 271, 82, 272 to 274, 278, 279, 85, 280, 96 and 315 to 317.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Amendments 267 and 273 would place on the board of qualifications Scotland a member with clear knowledge of the skills that business and industry need. Employers told the committee at stage 1 that qualifications must translate directly to the workplace. A director who is steeped in those requirements would keep that connection alive at the top table.

Amendments 268 and 280 would give the board the power to co-opt additional members for fixed periods of time, whenever a particular expertise—such as artificial intelligence, cybersecurity, Gaelic-medium learning or net zero skills, or the subject of another emerging issue at any given time—becomes essential. That co-option flexibility is crucial for a qualifications body that is fleet of foot and adaptable. Having such a flexibility would avoid the problems of a more static board by allowing the co-option of people with relevant expertise at the time of need.

Amendments 270, 272 and 278 seek to make it clear that the registered teachers who sit on the board must be active classroom practitioners with front-line experience, thus keeping strategic choices rooted in day-to-day realities.

On the governance of qualifications Scotland, I offer two alternative mechanisms that would do the same thing, so that the Parliament has a choice. Either would provide a check and balance so that the current leadership could not simply transfer without scrutiny or due process. That is important. It speaks to the point that I made in the debate on the much earlier group, which took place around this time yesterday—members may have to stretch back in their minds to remember this—on the importance of qualifications Scotland being a different organisation from the Scottish Qualifications Authority.

Amendments 315 and 316, in my name, would require all initial board members who are appointed during the transition to stand down

within six months of establishment and seek reappointment through an open, competitive process.

Amendments 315 and 317 offer a lighter touch: each inaugural member would undergo a formal performance appraisal within the same six-month window, with reappointment contingent on a satisfactory report. The leadership of an organisation is key, and leadership of the SQA has been key. There have been changes in that leadership—they were alluded to yesterday—and changes have been made in a positive direction, as I think that members will accept. Nonetheless, if the bill is passed and qualifications Scotland is to be set up, it is important that there is a check and balance in place to ensure that, under the new proposed arrangements, people who were appointed to the SQA and who seek reappointment to qualifications Scotland either reapply or are appraised.

Either route would safeguard accountability, and members can choose the mechanism that they think would command the most confidence. My first preference is for full and open competition, as set out in amendments 315 and 316, because a transparent appointments process is the fastest way to rebuild public trust in the new body. However, if members consider that a formal six-month appraisal is more appropriate, there is an alternative pairing in amendments 315 and 317.

What matters, above all, is that the inaugural board of the organisation is demonstrably appointed—or reappointed—on merit, in the open, so that learners, teachers and employers can see a qualifications authority built on integrity from day 1.

These amendments would give the new qualifications body the breadth of expertise, the agility and the legitimacy that it will need from day 1. I commend the amendments to members, and I move amendment 267.

Martin Whitfield: To build on what Pam Duncan-Glancy has just said about the importance of the qualifications Scotland board, I return to the voice of young people and children. Amendment 269, in my name, would add that

"one or more persons who appear to the Scottish Ministers to have knowledge of the interests of children and young people"

would make up the membership of the board. It is phrased in those terms because it is right that Scottish ministers should take responsibility for nominating people who appear to have the interests of children and young people at heart, not as a throwaway line but because it is important that their voice and their broad experiences appear before, and can influence what happens with, the qualifications Scotland board.

At an earlier stage, we discussed trying to attach that provision to an examination or qualification. After consideration, however, that has not appeared in my amendment in order that we have the broadest pool of young people who can be represented on the board.

At this stage, I will leave it at that.

Jenny Gilruth: I am grateful to Ms Duncan-Glancy and to Mr Whitfield for setting out the purpose of their amendments. I support Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendments 267, 268, 270 to 273, 278 and 280. Those amendments follow on from discussions that we had at stage 2 and would fundamentally strengthen the current provisions for the board of qualifications Scotland.

However, I am not able to support amendments 315 to 317. Amendment 316 has returned from stage 2 and seeks to end the appointments of members who joined from the SQA after just six months. As I set out at stage 2, replacing those members so early in the infancy of the new organisation would mean that it would lose valuable leadership and corporate knowledge and memory.

Given the length of time that it takes to undertake a public appointments round, that process would need to start as soon as the body was established, and would run into qualifications Scotland's first examinations diet—a time when stability is essential. I do not think that that is wise, nor is it in the best interests of Scotland's learners and teachers.

Furthermore, I do not support what I believe to be an alternative to amendment 316 in the form of amendment 317. Amendment 317 would instead mean that those members would be subject to a form of performance appraisal after six months. Again, I do not feel that that is necessary or appropriate, given that those members will have been appointed to the SQA on merit and via the regulated appointments process. I also question whether six months is long enough in which to evaluate the effectiveness of specific board members, at a time when qualifications Scotland will be just beginning its first year of operation.

I stress that all board members of public bodies are already subject to well-established annual performance and appraisal processes, which are set out as a requirement in their terms and conditions. I think that it would be unnecessary and unfair to duplicate those processes for those particular members.

Although I understand the intention behind Mr Whitfield's amendment 269, I cannot support it today. His amendment would see someone with

"knowledge of the interests of children and young people"

appointed to the board, but the current provisions on someone being appointed to the board who has knowledge of the interests of those undertaking qualifications already encompass children and young people by default. Given the extent to which children and young people comprise the cohort that undertakes qualifications, we would expect anyone who is appointed under the existing provision to have knowledge of their interests.

Further, Mr Whitfield's amendment suggests that the person appointed must be a separate board member from the person already provided for in paragraph 3(2)(a) of schedule 1. We discussed at stage 2 the difficulties around having a large minimum board or too many specific criteria, which would then require careful risk management when it comes to public appointments and maintaining a legally compliant board. Members might also want to consider the importance of any public body board having scope within its minimum numbers to include leadership, financial, operational and strategic expertise, alongside representative interests to support it to govern. Therefore, I ask Mr Whitfield not to move amendment 269. However, I point out to Mr Whitfield that Mr Greer's amendment 274 will require us to promote the existing position on the board to younger age groups, and I will support Mr Greer's amendments in the group.

Finally, I turn to my amendments 82 and 96, which are designed to address an identified gap in the bill that could have seen us in a perpetual cycle of appointing new board members. As the bill is drafted, any member who is appointed to fulfil the criterion of being a teacher or college lecturer would no longer meet the criterion should they step down from their teaching or college teaching position. Their appointment terms would require them to step down in such a scenario to leave space for a replacement to be appointed.

Although we all agree that current practising teaching experience for qualifications is important for the board, it is also important that that experience is not lost. Working with Mr Greer on that, I have developed the amendments to allow such teaching members to continue to the end of their appointment term before needing to step down.

Ross Greer: Amendment 274 would require ministers, before they invite applications for board membership to satisfy the criteria in schedule 1, to take steps to encourage applications from children who are 16 or 17—typically, I would not refer to a 16 or 17-year-old as a child, but for legal purposes they are—and from young adults. That has the purpose of encouraging young people to apply to be members of the board, with the ultimate aim of making the board more age diverse by incorporating young people's voices in the membership of qualifications Scotland. One of the key weaknesses of the SQA is that young people's voices are not heard throughout the organisation and certainly have never been heard at board level.

Amendment 279 is consequential. It would just ensure that it is immaterial that any steps that have been taken to fulfil the requirement were taken before the provisions came into force.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I want to pick up on a couple of points that the cabinet secretary made. First, I thank her for her support for some of the amendments in the group.

I do not take the same view as the cabinet secretary on the issue of the current board members of the SQA. The cabinet secretary said that my amendments would terminate the appointment of those members, but they would not do so—if those members demonstrated the skills, ethos, culture and values that are hoped for and wanted in the new qualifications body, either a short appraisal mechanism, which is one of the options, or the full reappointment process would be available. Both options are there. If the cabinet secretary is so confident that the current leadership right now would stand the test of time, at least the amendment on reappraisal would be a compromise.

Absolute integrity and trust in the organisation that is being set up are critical. That is probably one of the most important things that can be done with the bill. We need a mechanism so that the leadership cannot just transfer wholesale without a stop-and-check to consider whether they have the values that we need them to have and whether they have understood what the different body that Parliament might create wants and is. It is just a check and balance—that is it. I am afraid that I will press those amendments.

With that, in the interests of time, I will stop my comments and press amendment 267.

Amendment 267 agreed to.

Amendment 268 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 269 moved—[Martin Whitfield].

19:00

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 269 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 57, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 269 disagreed to.

Amendments 270 and 271 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 82 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendments 272 and 273 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 274 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 274 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 85, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 274 agreed to.

Amendment 83 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 275 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 84 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Amendment 276, in the name of Stephen Kerr, was debated with amendment 98. I remind members that, if amendment 276 is agreed to, I cannot call amendment 277, because of pre-emption.

Amendments 276 and 277 not moved.

Amendment 278 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 278 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Jenny Gilruth: On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 105, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 278 agreed to.

Amendment 279 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 279 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Jackie Dunbar: On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. My app has not refreshed. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I can confirm that your vote has been recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 88, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 279 agreed to.

Amendment 85 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 280 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to group 22, which is entitled "Qualifications Scotland staff: chief examiner and chief executive". Amendment 281, in the name of Ross Greer, is grouped with amendments 283, 86 to 88, 286 and 287.

Ross Greer: I will be quite brief in speaking to my amendments in this group. Quite a lot of their contents were covered when we debated group 2 on accreditation, because of the relationship between the two groups, but I will provide members with a quick recap.

Amendment 281 would require qualifications Scotland to have, as a member of staff, a chief examiner. Through previous amendments, we have already established that there would be a chief accreditation officer as well as a chief executive. Amendment 281 would add a chief examiner to the staff.

Amendment 283 would require the chief examiner

"to be appointed by Qualifications Scotland to undertake such role relating to Qualifications Scotland's functions set out under sections 2 and 3"—

that is, the awarding and quality assurance functions. It would also require the chief examiner's role to include

"responding to ... advice ... provided ... by the Expert Group on Qualifications Standards".

I remind members that, in yesterday's debate, we debated provisions that would see qualifications Scotland have a chief examiner with a line of accountability to the expert group on qualifications standards, and a chief accreditation officer accountable to the accreditation committee. Therefore, through these amendments, we would build in robust governance at both ends of the process.

Amendment 286 provides that the chief examiner should have

"suitable experience of working in the education, training, qualifications or skills development sector."

That requirement might sound relatively broad, but the amendment still makes it clear that the chief examiner should perform as an educator. It addresses what has been one of the structural weaknesses in the organisation up until now. On a number of occasions, the people who have been making the most important decisions about the qualifications system have just not had practical, hands-on experience of delivering education, whether in Scotland or elsewhere.

Amendment 287 is simply consequential to amendment 283.

I move amendment 281.

Stephen Kerr: Amendments 286 to 288, in my name, seek to do something that I think is essential and overdue: to ensure that qualifications Scotland, the successor body to the SQA, is led with the professionalism, integrity and public accountability that Scotland's learners and teachers deserve.

My amendments are all about safeguarding culture. I think that it was the late, great Peter Drucker who coined the phrase

"Culture eats strategy for breakfast."

Therefore, we neglect the importance of strategy at our peril. The brightest and best ideas will fall foul of a bad culture.

My amendments are about embedding leadership that understands education, values transparency and is committed to the highest ethical standards. Let us be in no doubt: one of the most persistent criticisms that was levelled at the SQA was that it had become insular, defensive and opaque. It operated in ways that were often perceived as remote from learners, disconnected from teachers and resistant to scrutiny. The Hayward review, which was commissioned to look at the future of qualifications and assessment in Scotland, identified deep concerns about trust and the need for openness and better engagement with stakeholders.

The Muir review was even more direct. Professor Muir concluded that reform must start with leadership that is credible, grounded in real educational understanding and guided by values, not bureaucracy. He warned of

"a serious gap between the national bodies and the experience of teachers and learners",

and called for those leading public education institutions to demonstrate lived insight and a genuine connection to the classroom. That is what my amendments aim to deliver.

Amendment 86 sets clear and principled eligibility requirements for the appointment of the chief executive of qualifications Scotland. The process should not be about ticking boxes; instead, it should be about ensuring that the person who will wield real influence over our qualifications system will possess actual, relevant experience; that they understand education not

just in theory but in practice; that they have led, and not just administered; and that they know what it means to manage complexity, navigate public trust and act with the probity that public service demands.

Amendment 86 makes it plain that only someone who is fit and proper, and who brings experience in education, qualification regulation or public sector governance, should be appointed. That bar is neither exclusionary nor arbitrary; it is proportionate and necessary.

Amendment 87 articulates the qualities and expectations of that leadership. It is not enough for a chief executive to be qualified; they must also lead by example. They must model the values of openness, accountability and transparency. They must demonstrate a willingness to engage—actively and sincerely—with learners, educators, employers and the wider public. The decisions taken by qualifications Scotland must be visible, justifiable and fair. That should mean publishing data, owning outcomes and creating systems of appeal and complaint that are not only available but respected. Those qualities are not luxuries; they form the bedrock of public confidence.

19:15

Amendment 88 would introduce a fixed, non-renewable term of seven years for the chief executive. This reform is rooted in good governance. A non-renewable term ensures independence, frees the postholder from the temptation—real or perceived—to appease ministers or stakeholders in the hope of reappointment, allows for courageous leadership and avoids the risks of inertia and complacency that can emerge when leadership becomes entrenched.

That model mirrors best practice elsewhere. Senior regulatory roles across the United Kingdom, including His Majesty's Chief Inspector at the Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills in England, are subject to fixed terms for precisely those reasons. I am not proposing something radical; I am proposing that we align with the established norms of public accountability.

That brings me back to the heart of the proposals: culture. I have said this before, and I am afraid that I am going to say it again: in Scottish education, culture is the challenge that underpins every other challenge. My amendments are about setting the tone at the top, because the tone at the top matters. Culture transformation must be led from the top by leaders who are committed to it. No single section in a bill can create or change a culture, but what the Parliament can do today is set the conditions for a transformative culture of empowerment and accountability to be inculcated. We can say that expertise matters, that leadership must be earned, that accountability is not optional and that our national education bodies must serve the public, not themselves.

I urge members across the chamber to support amendments 86 to 88. Let us give qualifications Scotland the leadership that it needs, and let us give Scotland's learners the leadership that they deserve.

Jenny Gilruth: I thank Mr Greer and Mr Kerr for setting out the purposes of their respective amendments in the group.

I support all of Mr Greer's amendments, and I thank him and his office for their helpful engagement on his chief examiner provisions. I do not feel that I need to say more than that.

Mr Kerr's amendments 86 to 88 are the same as amendments that he lodged at stage 2. For the same reasons that I set out back in April, I cannot support them. Amendments 86 and 87 would duplicate existing frameworks for ensuring that those appointed to public office have the necessary skills and experience.

On amendment 88, I do not think that such limiting appointment times for a chief executive would be beneficial, because that would mean that consistent leadership of the body could not be provided. I note that amendment 88 would prevent a chief executive from being reappointed even if their initial term had been far shorter than seven years. Therefore, I urge members to reject Mr Kerr's amendments if they are moved.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Ross Greer to wind up and to press or seek to withdraw amendment 281.

Ross Greer: I have nothing further to add, other than to say that I press amendment 281.

Amendment 281 agreed to.

Amendment 282 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 282 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Gordon MacDonald: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect to the system again, but I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will ensure that that is recorded, Mr MacDonald.

Mark Ruskell (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Please record my vote as yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Ruskell. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 89, Against 23, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 282 agreed to.

Amendment 283 moved—[Ross Greer]—and agreed to.

Amendment 284 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 284 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 92, Against 21, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 284 agreed to.

Amendment 285 moved—[Ross Greer]—and agreed to.

Amendments 86 to 88 not moved.

Amendments 286 and 287 moved—[Ross Greer]—and agreed to.

Amendment 288 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 288 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 65, Against 48, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 288 agreed to.

Amendment 289 not moved.

Amendment 290 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 290 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 290 disagreed to.

Amendments 291 and 292 moved—[Martin Whitfield]—and agreed to.

Amendment 293 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 294 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 294 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 294 disagreed to.

Amendment 295 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 295 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)

Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 92, Against 22, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 295 agreed to.

Amendment 296 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 296 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Shirley-Anne Somerville: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Somerville. I will make sure that that is recorded.

Richard Leonard (Central Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Leonard. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 296 disagreed to.

Amendment 297 moved—[Ross Greer].

19:30

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 297 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 92, Against 22, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 297 agreed to.

Amendment 298 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 298 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 298 disagreed to.

Amendment 299 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy]—and agreed to.

Amendment 300 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 300 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 300 disagreed to.

Amendment 301 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 301 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Brian Whittle: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whittle. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 301 agreed to.

Amendment 302 not moved.

Amendment 303 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 303 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 91, Against 23, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 303 agreed to.

Amendment 304 not moved.

Amendment 305 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 305 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 64, Against 48, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 305 agreed to.

Amendment 306 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 306 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Jamie Hepburn: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hepburn. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 64, Against 48, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 306 agreed to.

Amendments 307 and 308 not moved.

Amendment 309 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 309 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 309 disagreed to.

Amendments 310 and 311 not moved.

After schedule 1

Amendments 312 and 313 not moved.

Schedule 2

Amendments 89 and 90 not moved.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 23 is on the appointment of the chief inspector. Amendment 91, in the name of Stephen Kerr, is

grouped with amendment 92. I call Stephen Kerr to speak to and move amendment 91 and to speak to the other amendment in the group.

Stephen Kerr: The purpose of amendments 91 and 92 is to ensure that the appointment process for this crucial post is robust, transparent and principled. These amendments address a matter that is at the very heart of the legislation. If we are simply seeing a transfer of the SQA to qualifications Scotland, the nature, character and independence of the person who will serve as the chief inspector of education in Scotland become the prime focus of the bill. As it stands, the bill establishes the post but says almost nothing about the qualities, experience or term of office for this critical role. That omission is not simply an oversight but a fundamental weakness in the framework that we are constructing, and it is one that the Parliament must put right. Therefore, I was very grateful to have the positive experience of working with the cabinet secretary and her office to produce amendment 91.

Amendment 91 proposes that the person who is appointed to the role of chief inspector should have suitable teaching experience and should have held a leadership role in an educational establishment. This is not a bureaucratic tick-box exercise but a statement of principle rooted in evidence and experience. I remind the Parliament that the Muir review, which was commissioned by the Scottish Government itself, made that point absolutely crystal clear. The report said that it is essential that those who hold leadership positions in national education bodies have experience of the sectors that they oversee and can demonstrate credibility and understanding when engaging with practitioners. That is from “Putting Learners at the Centre”, and it should not be controversial.

The OECD review, too, underscored the importance of rebuilding trust and credibility between national agencies and front-line practitioners. That report noted that professional trust and systemic reform are interdependent. Practitioners must feel ownership of reforms, which depends on transparency and professional legitimacy within the institutions that lead them.

What we propose in amendment 91 is entirely consistent with best practice across developed education systems. It should be unthinkable to appoint a chief inspector who does not know schools from the inside.

Amendment 92 would complement amendment 91 by establishing a fixed, non-renewable term of seven years for the chief inspector. I have already explained my rationale behind the idea of having a non-renewable fixed term. It is simple: to secure the independence of the office and protect it from political influence, favour seeking or strategic careerism. If the chief inspector is to provide fearless, evidence-based reporting, especially when the evidence is inconvenient for Government, agencies or powerful stakeholders, the office-holder must be protected from any perceived pressure relating to reappointment or tenure. A fixed, non-renewable term would ensure precisely that. It would give the post holder a clear mandate and a secure tenure during which they could lead with independence, clarity and accountability. Seven years is long enough to make a strategic impact, but it is not so long as to risk complacency, inertia or the entrenchment of power.

This is all about creating a structure that enables and protects high-quality public service, that insulates those in high office from pressure and expectation and that signals clearly to the system that challenge is not a threat but a vital condition for improvement.

Taken together, amendments 91 and 92 professionalise and de-politicise the role of chief inspector. They give structure to the appointment process, they give clarity to the expectations of the role and they give confidence to the Parliament, the profession and the public that we are serious about quality, independence and the culture of challenge that real improvement requires.

The chief inspector of education should be one of the most trusted voices in Scottish public life—trusted to tell the truth, trusted to challenge poor practice and trusted to lead by example. These two amendments are not symbolic or tokenistic; they are structural, substantive and strategic. The chief inspector should have the necessary experience, insight and credibility to carry out the role. I urge all members to support these two amendments. Let us get this right not just for the architecture of the bill or any bill, but for the integrity of the system that we are here to improve.

With those words, members will be pleased to know, I have no further comments to make in these proceedings.

I move amendment 91.

Jenny Gilruth: At stage 2, I was pleased to work with Mr Kerr and we were able to agree to work together on criteria that could be applied to the appointment of future chief inspectors. As members of the Education, Children and Young People Committee will recall, my concerns at stage 2 were primarily around accidentally restricting appointees to those with Scottish experience only. I note that amendment 91 addresses that suitability, as it is not tied to teaching or leadership in educational establishments in Scotland. I am therefore happy to support Mr Kerr’s amendment 91 tonight.

However, for reasons that I set out at stage 2, I cannot support amendment 92. I suggest to members that that amendment is unnecessarily prescriptive. The terms of chief executives and, as in this case, other HM chief inspectors for other inspectorates in Scotland are generally governed by appointment contracts and governance frameworks rather than explicit term limits in legislation. I therefore ask members to support amendment 91 and to reject amendment 92.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Stephen Kerr to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 91.

Stephen Kerr: I have no further comments. I press amendment 91.

Amendment 91 agreed to.

Amendments 92, 93, 314, 94 and 95 not moved.

Schedule 3

Amendment 96 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 315 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 315 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

The Minister for Higher and Further Education; and Minister for Veterans (Graeme Dey): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. I will ensure that that is recorded, Mr Dey.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)

Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 315 disagreed to.

Amendment 316 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 316 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 316 disagreed to.

Amendment 317 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 317 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)

Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 317 disagreed to.

Schedule 4

Amendment 97 moved—[Jenny Gilruth]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That ends stage 3 consideration of amendments.

As members will be aware, the Presiding Officer at this point is required under standing orders to decide whether or not, in her view, any provision of the bill relates to a protected subject matter; that is, whether it modifies the electoral system and franchise for Scottish parliamentary elections. In the case of this bill, the Presiding Officer's view is that no provision of the Education (Scotland) Bill relates to a protected subject matter. Therefore, the bill does not require a supermajority to be passed at stage 3.

With that, we move on—

Martin Whitfield: On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer.

I wish to seek your advice. Standing orders rule 9.8.6 discusses the opportunity that the member in charge of the bill has to take part of the bill, amounting to no more than half of the total number of sections of the bill, back to the committee that dealt with it at stage 2 to take a look at, inter alia, changes that were unexpected by that committee. In the submissions that we heard yesterday, two members of the committee pointed out that, particularly with regard to group 2, on accreditation and quality assurance of qualifications, there had been challenges at committee level to understand the meaning of it. In the circumstances, where there was a potential misunderstanding by the committee, are you aware of any approach that has been made by the sponsoring member to refer the matter back to the committee?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you for that point of order and advance notice of it, Mr Whitfield. I can clarify that I am not aware of advance notice of that. It is the responsibility of the cabinet secretary to provide her views on the matter that you raise. As you are aware, under rule 9.8.6:

"At the beginning of the debate on the motion that the Bill be passed, the member in charge of the Bill may by motion propose that such part of the Bill as may be specified in the motion ... be referred back to committee for further Stage 2 consideration."

I hope that that is helpful.

Education (Scotland) Bill

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next item of business is a debate on motion S6M-18059, in the name of Jenny Gilruth, on the Education (Scotland) Bill at stage 3.

I invite members who wish to participate in the debate to press their request-to-speak buttons as soon as possible. I appeal to members who are leaving the chamber to do so quickly and, almost more importantly, quietly.

I call on the cabinet secretary to speak to and to move the motion.

19:57

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Jenny Gilruth): Thank you, Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to address the chamber this evening on the Education (Scotland) Bill, following our lengthy and detailed sessions yesterday and today.

Before I turn to the content of the bill, I thank members for the constructive way in which they have engaged with me as we have sought to improve the bill. That includes around 16 hours of detailed and thoughtful deliberation on amendments with the Education, Children and Young People Committee at stage 2, the many discussions that I have held with members ahead of stage 3, and the open dialogue that I have had with members as we have sought to find common ground. Members have been clear in their desire for change and about the need to rebuild confidence and trust in our public bodies. That has been a key theme of the amendments that we have discussed today and yesterday.

I also thank the wide range of stakeholders from across our education system who have engaged with the committee and with me throughout the bill process. They have been instrumental in informing our deliberations.

Given that the bill provides the scaffolding that supports the wider range of education reforms, it has been vitally important to get its provisions right, and I think that we have arrived at that point today. Through the creation of a new qualifications body and an independent inspectorate, the bill enables a more responsive, trusted and effective national education infrastructure.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): I agree with the cabinet secretary that the bill creates an independent chief inspector of education, but how would she describe the change from the Scottish Qualifications Authority to qualifications Scotland? In truth, is it not the case that the only thing that is really changing is the name?

Jenny Gilruth: I do not accept that critique from Mr Kerr. Indeed, we have spent two days of parliamentary time debating lengthy amendments that have sought to change the type of organisation that we want to have. One of the points that Mr Kerr rightly made at stage 2 and via amendments at stage 3 was about cultural change. That has to happen as a result of the legislation. I believe that many of the amendments—including some that Mr Kerr worked on—will help to create a new and different type of organisation that works with the teaching profession in a different way.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): Will the cabinet secretary give way?

Jenny Gilruth: Do I have time in hand, Presiding Officer?

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): There is not really any time in hand, cabinet secretary.

Jenny Gilruth: I will give way to Ms Duncan-Glancy.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Does the cabinet secretary admit that the new organisation will have the same functions and the same leadership as the SQA?

Jenny Gilruth: I do not accept the member's latter point about leadership. A new chief executive will be appointed, and a new chair of the existing organisation was appointed in late 2023.

I want to come on to talk about, in general terms, the refocusing of Education Scotland, which also has a role to play. I know that Ms Duncan-Glancy was interested in that issue in relation to her amendments that would have set up curriculum Scotland, which I was sympathetic towards. That is why the response to a Government-initiated question that I published on Monday sets out the focus for the next steps on the qualifications journey. The response to the GIQ in relation to Education Scotland that I published in June last year set out a refocused purpose for that organisation, too.

In addition, we have created the centre for teaching excellence at the University of Glasgow, and the totality of our structural reforms will provide a revised and refreshed system that supports continuous improvement and helps to meet learners' needs. Although the bill is rightly focused on reforming public bodies, we cannot lose sight of the people those bodies serve: the children and young people with whom the future success and prosperity of this country rests, and the teachers who work in our schools every day to provide excellent learning experiences.

Scotland's teachers are fundamental to reform. Only with their support will we be able to effect

broader change to improve our curriculum and our qualifications and to raise teaching standards. Ultimately, through the bill and the cultural changes that I mentioned in response to Mr Kerr, we can create a system in which our public bodies collaborate with one another, and with children and young people and their parents, carers and teachers, to drive improvement.

That is why the bill provides for a range of different voices to be heard on the board of qualifications Scotland. As a result of Mr Greer and Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendments, the bill includes enhanced provisions that will ensure that the perspectives of young people, teachers and business have suitable representation in board discussions.

That is why the bill now sets out a list of groups that must be invited to participate in the production of the learner charter and the teacher and practitioner charter, which will provide greater transparency and accountability and the opportunity for greater involvement in decisions that affect education.

That is why, thanks to Mr Kerr's amendment, the legislation provides a cast-iron guarantee that the chief inspector will have suitable teaching and educational leadership experience. It is also why, as a result of amendments lodged by Mr Greer and contributions from Mr Briggs, greater reassurance is provided in the bill that membership of the chief inspector's advisory council will be representative of the needs of those who receive education.

It is fair to say that the committee and I have probably spent more time considering and debating the location and scope of the accreditation function than any other matter. I put on record my thanks to all the staff in the SQA who, as a result of our deliberations, have had to contend with a significant degree of uncertainty and anxiety over a period of time. Members put forward a range of different options at stage 2 that would have removed the accreditation function from the qualifications body. However, none of the alternatives provided a compelling case for change. Therefore, I believe that the compromise position that we have managed to reach through the amendments of Mr Rennie and Mr Greer represents a significant step forward.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: The cabinet secretary mentioned the accreditation staff in the SQA. It is not only as a result of our deliberations, as the cabinet secretary said, that they have had to content with uncertainty. In a letter to the cabinet secretary, the accreditation staff said:

"Accreditation staff have endured over four years of uncertainty, and it is deeply concerning that their future remains unresolved".

How does the cabinet secretary respond to that?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have one minute left, cabinet secretary.

Jenny Gilruth: I have in front of me a letter from Unite the Union that I quoted to Ms Duncan-Glancy during yesterday's proceedings. It said that relocating the accreditation team to another body would not deliver the outcomes that the Education, Children and Young People Committee or Parliament appeared to be seeking. I have to say that the inability of the committee to arrive at a decision on the matter at stage 2 has helped to continue the unease and anxiety that those staff have experienced.

The purpose of the bill is to bring Parliament together around a solution to the challenge that exists in relation to accreditation. I am pleased that we have been able to do that with not just one party in the Parliament but two.

We will now have the statutory review that I mentioned. Importantly, that will go beyond where the function is located to consider in detail the scope of that function. In committee, we debated that matter at length. Of course, within qualifications Scotland there will also be a chief accreditation officer.

Presiding Officer, I am conscious of time.

First and foremost, we need to pass the legislation, to fully realise our shared goal to improve our education system and, as a result, improve outcomes for our children and young people. I urge members to support the Education (Scotland) Bill to make that a reality.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that the Education (Scotland) Bill be passed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: For the avoidance of doubt, I clarify that there is no time in hand and that members should please stick to their allocated and agreed speaking times.

20:05

Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Con): I thank the Parliament's legislation team and, following these late sittings, the wider parliamentary staff, as well as Government officials and colleagues across parties for the constructive engagement that we have had on many elements of the bill. I also make special mention of our researchers, from all parties, because they have put in a power of work in attempting to improve the bill.

During stage 3 amendments yesterday, Pam Duncan-Glancy stated that the bill was a "job half done". I agree. After all, this is the main education bill that has been introduced by the Government during this session of the Parliament.

We should not forget why we are here today. The 2020 exam scandal brought into sharp focus the failings of the SQA and the Scottish National Party ministers at that time. The changes that the bill was meant to take forward to respond to a range of reports and reviews, including the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's review of the curriculum for excellence and Professor Ken Muir's report "Putting Learners at the Centre: Towards a Future Vision for Scottish Education", have not been achieved.

I joined the Education, Children and Young People Committee last October, just in time for the signing off of its stage 1 report on the bill. I am sorry to say that it feels as though the bill has been rushed through the Parliament in the last week of term and that it does not reflect what the cross-party report envisaged.

As my friend and colleague Liz Smith has stated, the bill is now the sixth attempt by the SNP Government to reform education in Scotland. It is clear that SNP ministers' policies and half-baked reforms are not delivering for our young people. The stage 3 process has felt more like the Scottish Government trying not to take forward reform rather than providing a bill that could deliver the full recommendations of the reports of the cross-party committee and Ken Muir.

In addition, the pace at which the bill has moved through the Parliament, landing in the last week of the session, is problematic. Either ministers should have introduced the bill earlier or we should have delayed stage 3 until after the summer recess, so that important discussions—really important discussions—to develop a cross-party consensus could have taken place and the bill could, potentially, have received the confidence of all parties in the chamber, as happened last week in respect of the Deputy First Minister's work on the Scottish Languages Bill.

Scottish Conservatives have, however, engaged positively and lodged a positive and significant set of amendments to try to shape a stronger bill that would deliver the outcomes that we all want. I note Ross Greer's comments in the chamber yesterday in relation to the difficulty of legislating for culture change. I agree. However, the failure to take forward as part of the bill important reforms such as the independence of the chief inspector and child protection reforms will not provide the reset or the independence from ministers that the organisations need.

I fear that the Government has ended up in a weaker place and that the bill has ended up as a weaker response, which is not what we need to truly set up qualifications Scotland as a new organisation with the strong foundations that it needed. The question that we are all asking is: what measures in the bill will restore trust? Will the new organisation have a new culture? The jury is still very much out on whether that will be the case.

Scottish Conservatives were clear on our red lines over what we wanted to see in the bill, especially in relation to a new independent school inspector who would report directly to the Parliament. That has not been achieved. I regret that the bill has not been the opportunity that many of us had hoped for.

I approached the bill in the hope that we could genuinely work to restore confidence in our qualifications authority and the inspectorate. It was hoped that the bill would deliver a meaningful reform for Scotland's education system, which is urgently needed. Instead, it is little more than a rebrand of the SQA.

Splitting the awarding and accreditation functions of the SQA is fundamental to creating a system that works, as the higher history scandal showed, with the SQA not being allowed to continue to mark its own homework. The SQA needed an overhaul, not a cosmetic makeover, and the bill's proposed changes fall way short of what is required to ensure that the organisation can operate effectively and that it is properly accountable.

I believe that we could have built cross-party consensus on the bill if the minister had given us more time, and if the Parliament had had more time.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): On the member's point about it being only a cosmetic change, we are going from a situation in which the SQA has a single chief executive to qualifications Scotland being required to have chief executive, a chief examiner and a chief accreditation officer. The chief examiner would be accountable to an expert group, and the chief accreditation officer would be accountable to an accreditation committee. Does he really think that that is just a cosmetic change, bearing in mind that we have just passed an amendment that legally obliges each of them to act completely independently of each other?

Miles Briggs: Those changes will be improvements to the internal structures, and I hope that they work, which is why we have supported the amendments. However, I do not think that they provide the radical change that students and teachers across the country are looking to the Parliament to deliver. I have been disappointed by the fact that the Parliament has not been bolder and that the Government has been complacent in its work with parties for the bill.

As I have said, the bill at stage 3 is not the education bill that it should be and, therefore, we will not support it at decision time.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I was caught on the hop there.

I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to open on behalf of Scottish Labour.

20:11

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): Scotland's young people are our greatest asset, and it is incumbent on us all to legislate to ensure that the education system delivers the greatest opportunities for each and every one of them. Countless reviews, academics, experts, teachers, pupils and parents have been crying out for reform of the system, not least because, in 2020, the then Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney, oversaw the SQA's downgrading of the poorest students. That was pivotal in aligning the entire sector and country on the need for education reform. However, on a key aspect of that reform, which is to abolish the SQA, rather than voting for reform, the Parliament is being asked to vote for a review. A credible qualifications system cannot be run by a body that sets exams and accredits and regulates itself. That is a fundamental conflict of interest, yet that conflict of interest remains at the heart of the bill.

Scottish Labour offered solutions. We proposed separating accreditation from delivery so that the body that awards qualifications would not judge its own standards. We offered three routes—a single curriculum and regulation body, an independent chief regulator that would be answerable to the Parliament, or a stripped-back inspectorate model that would be free of conflict. All those proposals were rejected.

Jenny Gilruth: I am listening to Ms Duncan-Glancy. Of course, I have read much of the position in Labour's press release, but the Labour Party accepted 40 Government handouts. It seems to me rather incoherent that, on the one hand, Ms Duncan-Glancy was happy to work with the Government on those amendments but, on the other hand, the Labour Party is positioning itself against the bill—which, I put on the record, will abolish the SQA. Is the Labour Party now in favour of maintaining the SQA?

Pam Duncan-Glancy: First, the bill will not abolish the SQA, which is exactly why we will not vote for it. Secondly, we worked with the Government to try to improve the bill because we know that, if it is enacted, it will have a massive impact on children and young people in Scotland. It is our job as parliamentarians and legislators to scrutinise the Government's legislation. The Government may not like the fact that we propose amendments and sometimes win them, but I am afraid that that is just how the Parliament works. We did our best to make the bill one that could be supported, but we cannot support a bill that does not abolish the SQA.

For the fullest consideration, there is much more in the letter from Unite the Union that the cabinet secretary has quoted that the Parliament should hear. As well as saying that accreditation staff have endured over four years of uncertainty—not just during the immediate scrutiny of the bill—the letter says:

"As detailed in our evidence submitted at Stage 1, our members' preference would have been to have an independent Regulatory and Accreditation Body".

It goes on to say that,

"Given that the optimal position of an independent Regulator has been removed from consideration",

its members

"believe that further independence"

has to now be achieved

"with minimal disruption".

The Government's dither and delay has ground down staff and let pupils down. Instead of abolishing the SQA, the bill will allow the current leadership to transfer wholesale. On whether key functions will be properly separated from the qualifications body, Scotland's young people are being told, "Not yet".

We were told that the bill would rebuild confidence in Scottish education, but confidence comes from credibility, and credibility comes from clarity, independent scrutiny and transparency. That is what all the reviews suggested, that is what Professor Muir recommended, that is what the Educational Institute of Scotland told MSPs, and that is what witnesses told the Education, Children and Young People Committee. Incidentally, it is also what the cabinet secretary committed at stage 2 to delivering, but she has not delivered it. After months of scrutiny, all that we have is a review.

We need a qualifications system that is fit for the future—one that respects the efforts of learners, supports the judgment of teachers and earns the trust of employers and universities. We need a curriculum that is broad and inclusive, and we need an inspectorate that can challenge where necessary, but also celebrate excellence. On that point, I am pleased that the Government has delivered on the independence of the inspectorate.

When it comes to reform, this is a job that is unfinished. We should not have needed a review to be put in legislation. That work should have been done in advance—indeed, it should have been done the first time, when John Swinney tried.

However, that work was not done then and the current cabinet secretary has not done the work either. We desperately need a system that is transparent, accountable and, above all, independent—one in which the SQA is abolished and scrutiny is protected. The bill does not do those things and that is why we cannot support it.

Education is the first duty of any nation that calls itself just. That is why we lodged constructive amendments at every stage of the process—some with the Government's support—that were designed to strengthen the bill. Although some of them were accepted, the Government has left reform unfinished with a bill that does not deliver. A review is not a new regulator; a consultation is not a commitment; and action delayed, however well intentioned, is action denied.

Education reform cannot be delivered on foundations that are half built. Therefore, Scottish Labour cannot support the bill. That is not because we do not want reform but because we do, and the bill fails to deliver that. Scotland's young people deserve better than this.

20:17

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): The bill was a long time coming. For me, the cabinet secretary and some others, it has been nine years in the making; for other members who have been here since before 2016, such as Willie Rennie, it has been even longer than that. The case for this reform has been made across many years. Given the amount of effort that has gone into the bill for that length of time, I thank the Government's bill team and the legislation team in the Parliament for the huge amount of work that they have put in to deliver it.

However, the bill did not actually need to happen. There was nothing to prevent the SQA from performing better and there was nothing in the legislation that underpins it that prevented it from doing a better job than it did. The issue is that it simply did not do a better job, and legislative change has been required in a dramatic manner to compel better performance. Indeed, towards the start of the previous session of Parliament—in 2017, I think—the Education and Skills Committee, of which the cabinet secretary and I were members, published a report that proposed significant internal change—primarily cultural change—to the SQA. However, it missed that opportunity. It had the opportunity to change and it did not take it.

In 2020, after the scandal of the alternative certification model, with young people being graded based on their postcode rather than on their abilities, there was no apology from the leadership of the SQA. The Government apologised, but the leadership of the SQA never did. It was more focused on having a credible national data set than on meeting the needs of individual young people and learners and delivering what each of them deserved.

In many ways, it was worse for teachers. The SQA's approach to teachers over years and, indeed, decades has verged on and in some cases surpassed the definition of hostility. I emphasise that I am talking about the senior management team at the SQA and not the whole organisation. There are about 1,000 staff at the SQA—1,000 brilliant, talented and dedicated individuals—and they will make qualifications Scotland a success.

The bill, which was significantly amended through the legislative process, will create an organisation in which staff will have to work with teachers, students and others. They will have to consult extensively before making key decisions, which is something that the SQA not only did not do but often refused to do. Staff will have to co-design the learner charter and the teacher and practitioner charter and set out the principles that will underpin their work. The two committees that will lead on that work will be made up entirely of learners and of teachers and practitioners, and they will link directly to the organisation's board. That link is currently missing between the learner panels that the SQA has convened or outsourced and the current organisation's board.

There is a point of learning from the national qualifications group that was set up during the pandemic, in which young people were included but in an entirely tokenistic and disempowering way. The chief examiner—a role that we have just agreed to create—must be an educator. Again, that has been missing from the system. Too often, key decisions have been made by those who, to be frank, did not understand the impact that they would have in the classroom.

The board will include experts who will have that direct experience. That means having at least five teachers and lecturers on the board rather than the situation that we have seen for the past five years, whereby there is not a single teacher or headteacher, or the situation that we saw at one point when there were three management consultants compared with just one teacher. There will be someone on the board speaking for staff and there will be a duty to recruit young people to the board. We are setting very high expectations of those board members.

At this point, I put on the record my thanks to Shirley Rogers, who has already begun the transformation of the SQA as it stands, leading to the creation of qualifications Scotland. As Miles Briggs said a moment ago, we are trying to legislate for a change in culture, and that is

exceptionally difficult. However, under the leadership of Shirley Rogers, the culture at the top of the SQA is already changing and it is preparing to meet the expectations that we have set out for qualifications Scotland. I certainly welcome that.

This is a huge opportunity for us to move forward with an organisation that is driven by the voices of teachers and students in particular, and the Scottish Greens will be proud to support the bill at decision time.

20:21

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): Earlier today, I was reading a speech by Tavish Scott from 2017, in which he made a passionate case for change, but that case was primarily about the inspectorate, not the SQA. The SQA issue came at a much later stage, during the pandemic, with the examination results scandal. At that point, excitement and passion was generated because there had been frustration, almost from the point at which the inspectorate and the new Education Scotland had been created, as there was a feeling that no public body should be marking its own homework.

That is why there was, at that point, a real cry that the functions should be separated, and later on, the Parliament agreed to that by majority vote. However, it took years for the Government to implement that decision, and we have reached the final conclusion of that process today.

During all that time, those staff have been waiting in limbo. Since that point in 2017, my biggest criticism has been that the inspectorate missed the big issue in Scottish education: the decline in the international performance of our education system. It was once one of the best, and then it slipped down the rankings, but the inspectorate missed that completely.

That is why, in a sense, we need a much-strengthened inspectorate that carries heft in the Scottish education system and can challenge without being intimidated by any part of the public sector. I am afraid that, so far, that has not been the case. Likewise, that applies to Education Scotland, which has now been split from the inspectorate. Those bodies need to be given greater support, because we need them to be strong and to challenge public authorities and schools. They need to appoint senior people, whom we currently do not have in place. That needs to change, and it needs to change quickly.

Finally, with regard to the SQA, the alternative certification model that was used during the pandemic stimulated the desire to abolish that body after many years of trying to get it to change. If we are frank, however, the SQA has changed. We can see the culture change that is being led by Shirley Rogers, who is already making a dramatic impact on the body. However, it still requires a plethora of committees, engagement processes, learners' panels and advisory groups to ensure that the voices of young people, parents and teachers, from across the education system, are built into the SQA.

We now have the charters to ensure that we get the culture right, and we have the important review on accreditation. One of the criticisms that staff have levied at the Education, Children and Young People Committee, and at the Government, is that we agree the form before we agree the function. That is why the review is the right thing to do to decide what we will do with quality assurance and the scope of accreditation. Only then can we decide where to put it. I am afraid that the alternative amendments in stages 2 and 3 were trying to discuss the form before the function. We need to get it right this time and to do it in a professional fashion to ensure that it is indeed right.

My final point is on safeguarding and child protection. I am pleased that the cabinet secretary has laid out a process for ensuring that the concerns that the General Teaching Council for Scotland and others have expressed about the supervision and oversight of the system—not individual inspections—in relation to those two aspects are properly considered.

The bill is a good step in the right direction. Now, we need to let those bodies get on and develop a strong place in Scottish education so that we start to improve in our performance.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Rennie. We move to the open debate, with back-bench speeches of up to four minutes.

20:25

Jackie Dunbar (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP): I am pleased to stand tonight to speak in favour of the Education (Scotland) Bill. As deputy convener of the Education, Children and Young People Committee, I start as others have done by thanking everyone who has contributed to the bill and helped to shape it as it made its way through our Parliament.

After months of scrutiny by the committee, I am looking forward to making the final few changes to the bill with the amendments that were in front of us today. Now we can get on with dotting the i's, crossing the t's, and driving forward with improving our education system.

Although we are looking to improve it, we should not forget that our starting point is that we already have a great education system thanks to the hard work of teachers up and down the country and to

the pupils, too, who I sometimes think do not get enough credit.

I said that the system is great, not perfect. That is because there is always room for improvement, some of which will be directly achieved by the bill and some enabled by it.

The most talked-about change that the bill will deliver is that the Scottish Qualifications Authority will be replaced with a new national qualifications body for Scotland, aptly called qualifications Scotland. Our committee heard a great deal about how the SQA could improve. We heard that our teachers felt that there was a disconnect between the SQA and their profession and that the SQA's work did not seem to take account of the reality in our schools. The stand-out example for me was when qualification requirements were changed during an academic year. That is being changed.

Qualifications Scotland will be a new authority, with new governance arrangements, new people, including a headteacher, and a new ethos. Those changes might be seen as small to start with, but those small changes will add up and I am certain that, over time, they will mean substantial and tangible improvement for our pupils and teachers.

The bill also seeks to create an independent inspectorate to ensure that every child gets the great education to which they are entitled. However, the whole bill—new qualifications authorities and inspectorates, and all the amendments that we have seen as the bill moved through Parliament—is only one step in a journey. The end of that journey is when every single child in Scotland has the best chance to succeed in life and poverty does not hinder their life chances.

The Scottish Government has been clear, time and again, that it will do everything that it can to close the poverty-related attainment gap. That is not only about an education bill and new organisations but also about the investment of billions in our schools estate and £1 billion in the Scottish attainment challenge, expanded free school meals and breakfast clubs, school uniform grants, the game-changing Scottish child payment and, before that, the baby box and best start grants. What a contrast to the United Kingdom Government's continuing to balance its books on the backs of children through their shameful two-child cap—actually, something else for my list is that it is this SNP Scottish Government that is abolishing the two-child cap in Scotland.

We can make no better investment than in our young people—it is an investment in Scotland's future. Today, we can help to build that future by passing the Education (Scotland) Bill and pushing on with improving our education system.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Davy Russell, who is this evening making his first speech in the Parliament.

20:29

Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab): Thank you, Presiding Officer, for giving me the opportunity to make my first speech.

Being elected as the member of the Scottish Parliament for Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse is one of the biggest honours of my life. I will start my speech by paying tribute to my predecessor, Christina McKelvie. While chapping doors during the election campaign, I spoke to many people across our community and, as members might expect, I heard plenty of different views on the various political parties and the characters within them. However, regardless of where I went or who I spoke to, I heard genuine warmth and affection for Christina. She was a passionate MSP and a friend to many across the chamber. She served my community with distinction and will always be fondly remembered. [*Applause*.]

On the campaign trail, I had hundreds of conversations with people across my community, and education was one of the big issues that came up time and again. I heard from parents, teachers and even grandparents who were worried about the state of our schools and who feared that the next generation was being deprived of the opportunities that previous generations had.

Scotland's education system was once the envy of the world. An old friend of mine, Len Murray, a former lawyer who passed away a few years ago, said something during an immortal memory that stuck with me. He said that, in the years

"of the great Scottish Enlightenment … in the ... 18th century … Scotland produced more men of letters, more men of learning and more men of science than did any other nation on earth."

That was as good as it got. Scotland maintained its high standing in the world for education right into this century. However, on the SNP's watch, standards have been plummeting, attainment is declining, violence is rising in our classrooms and kids' backgrounds are holding them back from reaching their potential, because of the SNP's failure to close the attainment gap. Trust in our education system is on the floor after the SQA's shameful attempt to downgrade the results of working-class pupils during the pandemic—a move that was signed off by John Swinney, who is now First Minister.

The SNP needs to give itself a shake and ask itself, where did it all go wrong? On its watch, education has been—and still is—a shambles. The educational bus has no engine, no steering

wheel and an extremely poor driver who has lost his way.

A new direction is desperately needed to deliver the education system that young Scots deserve, but the SNP is just rebranding its failing institutions. We cannot tackle tomorrow's challenges with today's complacency.

A good education is a key driver of efforts to reduce child poverty. The status quo is not good enough, and I cannot sign off on more of the same, so I will vote against the bill. The SNP has wasted an opportunity to do right by Scotland's young people. Building a better future for the next generation is one of the most important missions of any Government. That starts with education, because education is not just about exams; it is about equipping young people with the confidence, curiosity and character to thrive in this world.

I was born in Quarter, which is near Hamilton. I still live there today. I started my career as a roads apprentice in Hamilton before working my way up to director level. Until the by-election, I had the honour of representing His Majesty as a deputy lord lieutenant of Lanarkshire.

My life has been spent serving my community, but throughout my life I did not expect to become a politician. However, I knew that the opportunity to be Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse's voice in the Scottish Parliament would be the best way that I could serve my community again.

Mine is a story not of privilege but of standard education through the two good schools that I went to. Perseverance, hard work and further education—that is the spirit that I bring to the chamber.

As I said on the night that I was elected, the only thing greater than being elected as my community's MSP was the feeling when my grandson was born, which was 10 weeks ago, on the night that I started my political journey. Holding him in my arms reminded me of exactly what is at stake here. It is not just about policy or politics—we can get by without that—but about the kind of Scotland that we want to pass on to our children and grandchildren. I entered the Scottish Parliament not with the answers but with a deep-rooted belief in public service, a commitment to listening and an unshakeable resolve to stand up for the people who sent me here.

To the people of Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse, I thank you for putting your trust in me, and I will work every day to earn it. My promise to you is simple: I will be your voice in the chamber, and I will never stop fighting for a better, fairer and more hopeful future for us all. [*Applause*.]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Russell. We move to closing speeches. I call Ross Greer to close on behalf of the Scottish Greens.

20:36

Ross Greer: I congratulate Davy Russell on making his first speech in the chamber. I find that, nine years in, the novelty and privilege of being in the chamber have certainly not worn off yet.

I start by re-emphasising the point about the robust governance mechanisms that we have put in place around accreditation for qualifications Scotland. Whereas the SQA has, until very recently, had just a chief executive, qualifications Scotland will at all times have a chief executive, a chief examiner and a chief accreditation officer. The chief examiner will be accountable to the expert group on standards, and the chief accreditation officer will be accountable to the accreditation committee. We have just agreed to separate their roles in law and to require them to act independently of each other. That addresses form, but we need to be honest that the Parliament was not yet ready to make a decision on function in terms of the scope of accreditation. However, we have agreed a clear process for that going forward, and I think that we have struck the right balance.

The claim that what we have agreed to today does not meet the demands that have been set out by teachers and young people in particular rings a bit hollow. Teachers and young people have not been talking to us about the specifics of where the accreditation function sits; the most common piece of feedback that we received from those who are directly involved in the system was a desire for a change of personnel at the top of the organisation, and that is what we already have, with a new chair, a new chief executive and a new leadership culture that is being developed as a result.

I want to talk about the next steps. Now that we have addressed the questions of structure, we need to move on to how to reform our qualifications and inspection systems. Scotland's exam system is still stuck in the Victorian era. We still have a high-stakes, end-of-term exam model that is largely unchanged from when it was set up about 150 years ago. There are problems with that for a whole range of reasons. It is abysmal for young people with additional support needs in particular. It is not appropriate that, when it comes to exams, the one-stop solution for young people with additional needs is to simply get more time in the exam hall. For the young people who struggle most with that format, having to sit in the exam hall for even longer than everybody else is not a solution and often makes things worse.

We now have alternative data sets. Once we resolved the issues in 2020, we had a comparison between what happens when teachers use their professional judgment to issue grades for their young people and what happens through the exam system. That poses a question for us: were teachers really overrewarding working-class young people in particular, or do we have an exam system that penalises those young people compared with their colleagues from more middle-class backgrounds?

We have an opportunity to balance the system with more continuous assessment, which is a much more accurate reflection of young people's knowledge and abilities. The proposals that Professor Hayward set out provide an opportunity to do that. They are bold, but they are exactly what we need. We have a 21st century curriculum in Scotland, and it deserves a 21st century qualifications system to match up with it. That is how we can meet the expectations that the OECD review, in particular, has put on us.

I ask the chief inspector to be bold, too. It would be honest to say that our current inspection system is not driving improvement. Inspectors often have a similar experience of life to that of the King, because everywhere that they go smells of wet paint. I propose that we move to a system of peer review. That could be done in different ways—we could have teachers who take a week or two out of school each year to take part in a peer review exercise with teachers from another school and another authority area, and we could have three or four-year secondments as career progression opportunities. That would mean that those who conducted inspections always had direct, recent experience of being in a classroom.

I finish by congratulating, in particular, the young people who got us to this point—those in the Scottish Youth Parliament and those elsewhere who demanded change and forced us to deliver it. The bill provides major change. It delivers what young people and teachers have demanded. Tonight's vote will be one of the most significant ones in this parliamentary session. The SQA's abolition will get the headlines, but what is much more important is the far stronger organisation that we are putting in its place—one that will put the voices of young people and teachers at its heart from the start.

20:40

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): I want to go back to human rights. Articles 28 and 29 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child give our young people the right to an education and indicate what that education should cover. In a sense, I am following on from the previous speech by talking about what our young people are feeling and what they are experiencing. I note, with the greatest respect to the youngest and the oldest members of the Parliament, that the reality is that the school experiences that children and young people are having at the moment are so different from the school experiences that we had. Likening our experience to theirs does them a disservice.

The debate allows me the opportunity to mention a report by the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland called "This is our lives, it matters a lot." A lot of the quotes in it relate specifically to the challenges that examination poses. The commissioner's concluding assessment states:

> "The pressure, anxiety, and stress that exams are placing on children and young people is not only reducing their ability to access their right to education ... but also affecting their right to the highest attainable standard of health ... This has been long recognised, including during the National Conversation on Education in 2023."

I raise those points because of where we are. We are discussing the Education (Scotland) Bill, which provided the one opportunity during this parliamentary session to make a difference. It could have made a difference to the children who are coming to the end of their first year at school, to the children who are looking at this summer holiday as the step before they start school, to those who are transitioning to high school and to those who are transitioning from the end of their broad general education and moving into whatever assessment formula we decide to throw at them in a few years. However, there are also many children who are finishing education tomorrow or on Friday. What will they look back on? When they have their own children, will they look back at the difference that the bill made to their lives?

This is where I have a challenge with the procedures that we have undertaken during the bill's passage. I thank the cabinet secretary for a lot of the discussion that there has been, but I humbly offer some advice: there is a difference between cross-party support that results in enough votes to get amendments agreed to and cross-chamber support, which is what Scotland wants and is clamouring for.

I raise those two points because the proposed Promise bill will be coming this way. I hope that every member in the chamber learns lessons about how the Parliament can work with the Government in relation to the way in which amendments are dealt with, the way in which assurances are given and the way in which all that can play out, as we have seen over the past two days of stage 3.

I take the opportunity to thank the cabinet secretary in relation to the amendments regarding child safety. I thank her for our discussions before

stage 3 regarding the challenge that exists between our local authorities and the independent organisation that judges and monitors teachers, because we need to get that right.

I recognise that time is short, but it would be wrong for me to conclude without complimenting my newest colleague on a phenomenal first speech. He painted us something that I will leave as a challenge for everyone in the chamber: the concept of an education bus. Is the bill a simple repaint job when we had the opportunity to rebuild a vehicle that could take our children and young people into the future? Has there just been a change of steering wheel when what we needed was a navigator who knew where they wanted to go, knew why they wanted to go there and, perhaps most importantly, could take not just the Parliament but the rest of Scotland with them?

20:45

Roz McCall (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I might be the third person in line to do so, but I would like to extend my congratulations to Davy Russell and welcome him to the Parliament and the chamber. I also thank him for expressing the sentiments that he mentioned in his speech. I am three years into being an elected member, but I still feel a sense of excitement about the fact that I am here in this place.

I turn to my speech. Presiding Officer,

"reform is not in itself a panacea. Cultural change in both Government and our agencies will be essential if we are to build a new qualifications system that carries the credence that children, parents and the teaching profession will expect."—[*Official Report*, 18 December 2024; c 24.]

Those are not my words—I am quoting the cabinet secretary—but I cannot disagree at all with their content or the sentiment that they express. However, here we are. Will the bill that we have just debated truly deliver a cultural change in both the Government and our education agencies? I think not. We could have been debating a bill that made a monumental change to our education system and truly embraced the concept of change that we all agreed was needed. However, unfortunately, much of its promise has been watered down and, in my opinion, it will result in little more than a rebranding of the already failing SQA.

In 2022, Professor Muir's report recommended separating the SQA's accreditation and regulation functions from its role as an awarding body. The report recommended that accreditation be transferred to a new national education agency, which would also take on responsibility for the curriculum and the professional support roles that are currently held by Education Scotland.

I totally agreed with the response that Miles Briggs gave to the intervention on his speech, because what we are looking at is simply an internal restructure. We were looking for radical cultural change—that is what we wanted to see from the bill—but, instead, the agency's functions have not been separated in that way. Splitting the awarding and accreditation functions of the SQA is fundamental to creating a system that will work. As the scandal surrounding last year's higher history exam showed, the SQA should not be marking its own homework. The truth is that it should have a complete overhaul—not just a cosmetic makeover and a name change.

The proposed changes fall far short of what was needed to ensure that the organisation operates effectively and is properly accountable. At every stage of the bill process, amendments were lodged with the aim of ensuring that the bill would offer not only reform but much more. At stages 2 and 3, Conservative members tried to amend the bill so that the cultural change that the cabinet secretary admitted was essential would come to pass. It is therefore extremely disappointing that the opportunity to enhance the bill—and, ultimately, to enhance our education offering in Scotland—has not been taken. I was incredibly disappointed that some of the amendments and the contributions, especially in yesterday's proceedings—

Jenny Gilruth: Will the member take an intervention?

Roz McCall: I will.

Jenny Gilruth: I am listening to Ms McCall express her disappointment, but I am also looking at the totality of amendments, both from her party and from Scottish Labour, that the Government supported. Does she not think it somewhat incoherent that, having worked with the Government on those amendments, both Labour and the Conservatives are now positioning themselves against the legislation?

Roz McCall: I appreciate what the cabinet secretary is saying, but what I am seeing is—I will use a phrase that my colleagues have just mentioned—low-hanging fruit. The amendments that were accepted were the amendments—[*Interruption*.] I am sorry, but does the cabinet secretary want to intervene again?

Jenny Gilruth: No.

Roz McCall: Thank you very much.

The disappointment that I want to highlight is down to some of the behaviour that was on display yesterday. Some of the amendments that were spoken to, and some of the contributions that were made, were met with what, in my opinion, were arrogance and contempt. I believe that that shows

disrespect to the Parliament and does a disservice to the people who we represent. Members might have differing opinions, but every one of our contributions is equally valuable.

It is our job to be a voice for the people who we represent. The fact that the majority in the Parliament might disagree with the substantive points that are made in debates does not diminish those points or the need for them to be made. It is our moral duty to fully push the debate, and if members in the chamber think that Opposition voices should be silenced, curtailed or belittled, they will push this institution towards dictatorship and away from democracy.

As I mentioned, the Scottish Conservatives will not support the half-hearted attempt at reform that the bill represents. As has been the case with so many bills brought forward by this SNP Government, we are debating a bill that is an acceptable move in the right direction, rather than making the necessary legislative changes to make tangible moves to improve outcomes for the people of Scotland. That is not what this Parliament was set up to do, and the public will not thank us for it. They deserve better.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary, Jenny Gilruth, to close the debate on behalf of the Scottish Government.

20:50

Jenny Gilruth: I want to start by paying tribute to Scotland's young people, our teachers, parents and carers. This bill is for them. That is why we are legislating tonight.

Jackie Dunbar rightly spoke about the strengths in Scotland's education system. She said that we already have a great education system in Scotland. It is not perfect—I accept that—but we have a strong education system in Scotland, and I want to pay tribute, on the record, to those who work in our schools every single day to deliver that education to our young people.

Once again, I thank all members for their contributions to the debate. I am also very grateful for what has been, in the main, a constructive approach from all Opposition parties, with members having engaged with my office and officials over recent months. We have seen a slight deterioration in the past 24 hours—

Miles Briggs: I have spoken to all Opposition parties about this. Would the cabinet secretary acknowledge that the bill has been rushed? We have had to sit two evenings in a row to rush the bill through before recess. In hindsight, would it not have been better to delay stage 3 until after the summer recess? She might then have attracted cross-party support for the major reform that she is putting forward, which, it is clear, not every party is willing to support.

Jenny Gilruth: I have to say that there is some incoherence on that point. I was told that I was not going fast enough on education reform, and I was criticised by the Conservatives and the Labour Party for delaying reform. I did delay reform—by a year—for good reason, which I will come to discuss. The Opposition cannot have it both ways. There has been extensive engagement—

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

Jenny Gilruth: I say to Ms Duncan-Glancy that I would like to make some progress.

Our qualifications system is the reason why we are here today, and getting the reform of our national qualifications body right matters. Ross Greer was quite right to remind the chamber of the recommendations from the Education and Skills Committee in the previous session of Parliament, of which we were both members. Had the SQA listened to the recommendations in the committee's report at the time, we might not be here today.

Similarly, Mr Rennie was right to talk about Tavish Scott's impassioned interest in separating out the inspectorate function from Education Scotland, and he was consistent in that argument. If—when—the bill passes this evening, I am sure that he will be pleased.

I want to put on the record my sincere thanks to the members of my bill team for their diligent work and the support that they have given me throughout the past few months. They are hiding at the back of the chamber, but I will embarrass them by naming them. I thank Clare Hicks, Lisa Bird, Sean Stronach, Jaxon Parish, Nico McKenzie-Juetten, Judith Brown, Laura Barrie, Findlay Glynn, Tracy Manning, Shirley Anderson, Maria Crespo, Jack Buckley and Mark Byrne. [*Applause*.] I also thank Shirley Rogers, the chair of the SQA, for all the work that she has undertaken to change the SQA in advance of the legislation, and I pay tribute to our special adviser, Erin McKee, who has been at the forefront of negotiations with the Opposition parties.

When I was first appointed Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills in March 2023, I was told of the radical appetite for reform and the need to work differently—and to get it done tomorrow. With cautiousness and trepidation, I returned to the Royal high school, 5 miles from where we are today, and met with my former colleagues. In the staffroom that I once knew well, I sat and listened to our teachers. It was apparent then that there was a disconnect between some of the loudest voices that were advancing the case for radical reform and those at the chalk face, who were

calling for pragmatism and asking for patience. Those discussions were pivotal in my decision to delay the introduction of the bill by a year to ensure that we really engaged with the needs of Scotland's teachers.

Building in that time to listen has changed the way that the new qualifications body will work, with the creation of the schools unit already under way, led by former headteacher Sarah Brown. It has also changed the way in which curriculum reform is being delivered, with classroom teachers leading the national reforms across every curriculum area.

In my opening remarks, I mentioned several important amendments that I worked on with Opposition members. I wish to highlight the contribution that Liz Smith made in ensuring that the chief inspector recognises the important role that outdoor education plays in our system.

The bill focuses on our public bodies. It does not change how our schools are run, nor does it change how education is delivered, but it does improve the support that our public bodies can give our teachers, directly involving them in decision making, for example. It also ensures that young people's voices are at the heart of the organisation and gives independence to the chief inspector to provide challenge and support.

The Education (Scotland) Bill provides Scottish education with an enormous opportunity. MSPs can vote tonight to abolish the Scottish Qualifications Authority; they can vote to establish qualifications Scotland—a new organisation that is designed with teachers, parents, carers and young people at its heart; and they can vote for legislation to drive the reform that is needed in Scotland's schools. I hope that all parties take the opportunity to do so, and I commend the Education (Scotland) Bill to Parliament.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes the debate on the Education (Scotland) Bill at stage 3.

Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): The next item of business is a debate on motion S6M-18079, in the name of Shirley-Anne Somerville, on the legislative consent motion for the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill, which is United Kingdom legislation.

20:56

The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice (Shirley-Anne Somerville): I am pleased to come to the chamber today to debate this LCM. As I recently noted to the Social Justice and Social Security Committee, I have a responsibility to ensure that legislation impacting on the devolved social security system is fully compatible with our principles and ethos. I am also mindful of the practical implications of any legislative changes and how they might impact on the safe and secure transition of benefits. I have scrutinised the bill and the ramifications carefully, and have engaged with the UK Government. I now recommend consent in a number of areas.

On entry, search and seizure, the provisions will allow the Department for Work and Pensions to apply to a sheriff for a warrant to enter premises and to search for and seize items when investigating serious cases of fraud. Currently, the DWP requires the police to undertake that action on its behalf. I am content that nothing in those provisions runs contrary to the ethos and principles underpinning our devolved social security system.

Regarding the provisions on data gathering, the UK Government has broadly mirrored the approach that was pioneered in our devolved social security system, and because of that, and because the provisions in the bill contain similar safeguards and exemptions in respect of third sector organisations, I am content to recommend consent.

On eligibility verification measures, the provisions in the bill will allow the DWP to require organisations such as banks and financial institutions to provide data to establish an individual's entitlement to benefits and to identify incorrect payments. It will be of reassurance to the Parliament today, I hope, to know that the UK Government has confirmed in writing that there is no intention to include devolved benefits within the scope of that measure, now or in the future.

On changes to administrative penalties, there is no equivalent to administrative penalties within the devolved system, so I am therefore content to recommend consent.

Overpayment recovery is an important aspect of the bill. Although the provisions on that were referred to in the memorandum accompanying the motion, the Scottish Government did not take a position on consent. That was to allow for due consideration of the impact of those provisions on Scottish clients and for on-going discussions with the UK Government.

I fully recognise the duty of Governments to ensure that overpayments are recovered, wherever it is reasonable to do so, but that cannot be at the expense of our values and ethos. As I confirmed to the Social Justice and Social Security Committee, I have concluded that it would not be appropriate to recommend consent for the overpayment recovery provisions. Those provisions allow for the direct recovery from bank accounts with no need for a court order and for the potential suspension of driving licences. No such provisions exist within the devolved system, and I do not consider them compatible with the ethos of fairness, dignity and respect. I have confirmed that position in writing to UK ministers, who have confirmed that they will seek to amend the bill such that devolved benefits are removed from the scope of those provisions.

The Scottish Government did not see the full provisions of the bill until it was introduced on 22 January 2025, which meant that normal timeframes for lodging this legislative consent memorandum could not be met. As a result, and due to the on-going engagement that is still required to understand where the bill and its numerous amendments will impact on Scotland, I confirm that there will be a requirement to lodge a supplementary LCM for the bill in due course. I will, at that time, be happy to provide a fuller update on the overpayment recovery provisions as part of that supplementary LCM.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that clauses 72, 73, 74, 75, 77 to 81, 83 to 87 and 98, and schedules 3-4 of the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error And Recovery) Bill 2025, introduced in the House of Commons on 22 January 2025, so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): I call Collette Stevenson on behalf of the Social Justice and Social Security Committee.

21:00

Collette Stevenson (East Kilbride) (SNP): I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to the debate on behalf of the Social Justice and Social Security Committee.

According to the UK Government, the overarching policy objective of the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill is to safeguard the public purse against fraud and error. The bill seeks to help the UK Government to address losses due to fraud and error occurring outside the tax and benefit systems. It will also introduce new powers to help the Department for Work and Pensions to address fraud and error in the social security system and to recover overpayment debt.

The LCM sets out the aspects of the bill that apply to the devolved benefits that are delivered under agency agreement with the DWP. The Scottish Government has established agency agreements to enable the DWP to continue to administer benefits on the Scottish Government's behalf until Social Security Scotland's equivalent benefits have been created and until those in receipt of benefits administered by the DWP have been transferred to Social Security Scotland.

The Scottish Government expects to complete the transfer of benefits by the end of this year, except for two benefits—the severe disablement allowance and the industrial injuries disablement benefits. The committee welcomed confirmation from the Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice that the transfer of cases for devolved benefits would be completed prior to the provisions of the UK bill coming into force.

The Scottish Government is asking Parliament to consent only to the relevant provisions that are included in the LCM. Clauses 88 to 95 and schedule 5 relate to overpayment, debt recovery and enforcement. The Scottish Government is not seeking legislative consent for those provisions.

The bill contains provisions in relation to the eligibility verification measure. If consent was granted, those provisions would allow the DWP to request large data sets from organisations such as banks in order to identify those in receipt of benefits who do not meet the relevant eligibility criteria. The cabinet secretary confirmed that there is no intention from either the Scottish ministers or the UK Government to add devolved benefits to the scope of those powers.

The bill also contains provisions in relation to overpayment recovery. If consent was granted, those provisions would provide the DWP with new options for enforcing recovery of overpayments when other routes of recovery have failed. That would include recovering direct from an individual bank account. Individuals could also be disqualified from driving for a period of up to two years if they have an outstanding overpayment and all other recovery attempts have failed.

The cabinet secretary told the committee that the UK Government had confirmed its intention to

amend the bill to exempt Scottish devolved benefits from the scope of the new overpayment recovery powers. It would be helpful to know when those amendments might be expected. It would also be helpful if the cabinet secretary was able to confirm whether the Scottish Government intends to lodge a supplementary LCM and, if so, the provisions that that would relate to.

Following the evidence that was received, the Social Justice and Social Security Committee was content to recommend to the Parliament that consent be given for the relevant provisions that are covered by LCM-S6-55.

21:04

Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Every penny of public money lost to fraud or error is a penny taken from the Scottish taxpayer and, in turn, from school, hospitals and other services that we rely on. The Government has a responsibility to ensure that every penny that is raised is used effectively. That is why the Scottish Conservatives support the legislative consent motion before Parliament today.

Fraud in the public sector undermines public trust. Such financial loss corrodes the public's confidence in the payment system. It weakens the social contract when people pay their taxes but see the system failing. Fraudsters exploiting the system puts at risk the support for genuine, vulnerable individuals. That is why we welcome the action to modernise and strengthen the toolkit to fight fraud. The measures that are outlined in the bill will ensure that there will be a fair system, including for benefit recipients.

We recognise that a number of the clauses falls within the competence of this Parliament, particularly in relation to benefits that are delivered under the agency agreements.

We also support the provisions that are being supported by the Scottish Government and the DWP to ensure that the way in which benefits are administered on behalf of the Scottish ministers might also be a tool to tackle fraud, and we support looking at what is happening across the rest of the United Kingdom in that regard.

The eligibility verification measures will allow the Government to ask commonsense, practical questions and simplify the criteria. The powers that are outlined are significant. At the same time, what is proposed is not overburdensome, and the DWP will have access in order to provide support. We believe that a reasonable balance will be struck to ensure that relevant organisations are involved.

The provisions on recovery and asset seizure in the bill are also very positive. Law enforcement agencies must be able to recover fraudulently obtained funds and seize high-value items that are bought with stolen money. It is simply wrong that individuals who defraud are allowed to purchase, for example, luxury items, simply because they have spent the money quickly. If we are to deter such actions, there must be consequences. The measures give law enforcement agencies legal powers to ensure that they can take swift and effective action. To be clear, strong safeguards and independent oversight mechanisms accompany the introduction of those powers. That is fair and that is right for Scotland.

The provisions will ensure that the Scottish Government and the UK Government will retain powers. We hope that any issues can be resolved. We also look forward to the DWP working with Social Security Scotland, which will focus on any disruption that might take place.

The bill will support honest, hard-working individuals. It will also ensure that, when errors happen—many errors happen across the system—those are sorted. The Scottish Conservatives want to ensure that every penny supports front-line workers.

The bill strikes the right balance between fairness and firmness. It will ensure that the Parliament has the powers to deal with these matters. Let us send a clear message that we are on the side of the taxpayer by supporting the bill.

21:07

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): It is a pleasure to contribute to the short debate on the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill and the accompanying legislative consent motion.

I thank the cabinet secretary for the clearly articulated explanation of the position with regard to the LCM, and the fact that a supplementary LCM may well be required when other areas are identified and settled on.

To draw on Alexander Stewart's contribution, it is right to remember that the intention behind the bill is to prevent and deter fraud and error. The aim is also to facilitate the recovery of funds where, through fraud and error, money has been lost from—as Alexander Stewart so rightly put it—the taxpayer. The bill is also about a focus on the DWP. On top of that, the bill will establish the public sector fraud authority, which will deal with such matters going forward.

In respect of today's LCM, I thank both the committees in this Parliament that have worked on it, and the Scottish Government for the work that it has put into discussing with the UK Government the outstanding matters. In many ways, they can be simplified, but that does not detract from the

importance of the fact that those benefits that are awarded in Scotland through devolved powers will be exempt from the recovery described in the bill. The UK Government has confirmed and amended the bill, and it has also given undertakings to ensure that those are not covered.

To the embarrassment, I hope, of Alexander Stewart, I will echo his final words on the matter. Let us send a clear message that those who are entitled to benefits are entitled to them, and that those who through fraud and, on occasions, error, receive funds should seek to return those funds. However, I note that, because of the difference in approach that we have here in Scotland, those benefits under Social Security Scotland are specifically excluded by the bill.

21:09

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): The Scottish Greens cannot agree to this LCM this evening. Part 2 of the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill

"assumes that all recipients of benefits have criminal tendencies and must therefore be denied financial privacy."—[*Official Report*, *House of Lords*, 15 May 2025; c 2372.]

Those are not my words, but the words of Labour's Lord Sikka, speaking in the House of Lords about the bill just last month. The Scottish Greens reject the bill's assumption outright and so cannot support the LCM. In addition, we cannot agree to any legislation that gives snooping rights to banks and other companies in the way that is enabled by the bill, even if not all those powers would be explicitly allowed in Scotland.

No court order would be needed for that unrestrained surveillance and individuals would not be told that they were being surveilled. There would be no right of appeal by those who were affected, and it is not clear what information would actually be identified by the surveillance or how fraud would be determined on the basis of that information. Because individuals would not even know that the surveillance was happening, they would have no chance to provide any explanation of their situation.

What if the algorithm that is used to identify that information makes a mistake? The Post Office scandal has surely taught us that computer systems are not infallible. Even a 1 per cent error rate could result in more than 1,000 people losing universal credit. How would they be compensated? How would they challenge that, given the widespread and on-going issues with lack of access to legal aid?

While the legislation initially allows for snooping on recipients of universal credit, recipients of pension credit and others, it is likely to be extended to recipients of other benefits, even if they are not specifically devolved and under the control of Social Security Scotland.

All of that is to tackle fraud, which we know accounts for only around a couple of per cent of annual welfare spending. Powers to snoop on all claimants on the basis of that tiny rate cannot be justified. The DWP already has powers to compel information holders to share data on individuals who are suspected of fraud, so, like Lord Sikka, I question whether the powers in the bill are necessary.

In short, the bill removes financial privacy from the poor, the old, the sick and the disabled. It is discriminatory. It turns on its head our normal presumption that people are innocent until proven guilty, and it makes a mockery of our equality and human rights laws. As such, we in the Greens cannot support this LCM this evening.

The Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary to wind up the debate.

21:12

Shirley-Anne Somerville: I thank the committee for its deliberations when we initially discussed the matter some weeks ago, and I thank the members who have taken part in the debate.

Several members have pointed out that the bill is about the prevention and deterrence of fraud and error, and that is a very important part of any social security system. Maggie Chapman is quite right to point out that only a very, very small minority of people abuse the social security system, and we must always appreciate and understand that context.

However, it is important that, for those who abuse, or even think about abusing, the system that we hold most dear, we take a zero-tolerance approach to fraud, as long as we ensure that, in taking that approach, the system has dignity, fairness and respect at its heart. We can do both—we can have a system with dignity, fairness and respect, but we must also ensure that we tackle fraud and error as we do so.

I appreciate the remarks that members have made about specific technical aspects of the powers under the bill. It is important to point out how those will be used—or indeed, for some of them, not used—in Scotland and I appreciate the UK Government's continued discussions in that regard. Those discussions have been difficult and complex, given the fact that the Scottish Government did not see the full provisions before the bill was introduced. That makes it challenging for this Government and this Parliament to be able

to discuss and debate the issues, in particular where they are of such a technical nature.

Collette Stevenson, the convener of the Social Justice and Social Security Committee, pointed out that the Government will require to lodge a supplementary LCM for the bill. In response to the other points that she made, I say that we expect amendments relating to overpayment recovery to be made at the report stage in the House of Lords, but we do not have a public date for that yet. I will ensure that the committee is kept up to date with any information that we have, and I thank members for their time this evening.

Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is a debate on motion S6M-18077, in the name of Jim Fairlie, on the legislative consent motion for the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, which is United Kingdom legislation.

21:15

The Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity (Jim Fairlie): Despite the lateness of the evening, I am pleased to be leading for the Scottish Government in this discussion of a positive legislative consent memorandum that will give effect in Scotland to the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill.

It is regrettable that the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee feels that it has not had the time to fully consider the LCM relating to the bill. I emphasise that the Scottish Government has no role in the timetabling of UK bills. We recognise the concerns of the committee members in relation to their workloads and their ability to scrutinise legislative instruments as well as to undertake the other aspects of their roles. We understand that, just as ministers require detailed preparation, co-ordination and time to consider legislative instruments in order to ensure that high-quality contributions are made to parliamentary committees, committee members require the same in order to ensure that they can properly scrutinise items.

At every step, the Government acted promptly and constructively. No meeting was cancelled, no deadline was missed and no information was withheld. In the interests of time, I am happy for members to reach out to me in writing, and I can provide timelines and copies of the letters relating to the bill that I sent to the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee and the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, as well as correspondence with Baroness Hayman in which we obtained clarification and assurances from the UK Government on some of the proposals in the bill.

The Rural Affairs and Islands Committee has raised the fact that the Welsh Government lodged its LCM on 21 May. However, as is my responsibility, before confirming support for the bill's extension to Scotland, I considered it necessary to obtain clarification and assurances from the UK Government regarding some of its proposals, in order to protect this Parliament's right to scrutinise any legislation that is put before the chamber. That took time. I wrote to the UK Government on 28 March but did not receive a

response until 13 May, a situation over which I had no control. However, from my point of view, it was essential that I got that response in order to protect the rights of this Parliament. It is my view that the Scottish Government has given as much notice as possible to the Scottish Parliament.

The bill will make provision for, and in connection with, the restricting of the importation and non-commercial movement of dogs, cats and ferrets from third countries, on the grounds of animal welfare. Puppies are frequently imported when they are underage and unvaccinated, with fraudulent paperwork, and they are then transported and sold to unsuspecting buyers in Great Britain by dealers who are illegally posing as home breeders. The measures in the bill have been strongly called for by many of the main animal welfare organisations, and the Scottish Government supports their introduction.

Let me be clear that, if the Scottish Parliament does not grant legislative consent to the bill, it is highly likely that Scotland will inadvertently enable routes for increased puppy smuggling. That is why the Scottish Government supports the bill and believes that granting legislative consent is the right decision at this time.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): I appreciate that it is late, so I will not take up a lot of time. The minister will be aware that I have done a lot of work over the years on the issue of puppies coming through the port of Cairnryan. Will the legislative consent motion help to address that issue? We have been trying to take action on it for many years.

Jim Fairlie: I will come to that issue as I go through my comments.

In the interests of pragmatism, the Scottish Government is working with other UK Administrations to improve the welfare of animals in this area. The changes that are proposed in the bill address matters around animal welfare that are of significant public concern and are within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and require primary legislation in order to be given effect. Those are areas where consistent changes to the legislation in all Administrations of the United Kingdom at the same time will be beneficial.

Given the freedom of movement of dogs, cats and ferrets within Great Britain, effecting the bill in Scotland will aid the enforcement of import requirements by avoiding attempts to circumvent controls in one country by utilising points of entry in another. The bill provides an opportunity to have consistent control over such imports and to assist enforcement agencies to ensure that such unnecessary movements can no longer take place.

However, the Scottish Government fully recognises that, for the measures in the bill to be successful, they must be introduced consistently across Great Britain. Consistent legislative measures across GB will also greatly assist when it comes to the interpretation and enforcement of new controls. A co-ordinated GB-wide approach in tackling the issues that are covered by the bill is widely supported and welcomed by many key stakeholders.

The bill was amended in committee, including in relation to provisions that were contained in the Animal Welfare (Kept Animals) Bill, to which legislative consent was given by the Scottish Parliament in January 2022, but which the UK Government did not proceed with.

I am strongly of the view that allowing the UK Parliament to legislate for all GB Administrations in this area is the most timely, efficient and effective way to achieve the important changes that are proposed.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provisions of the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, introduced in the House of Commons on 16 October 2024, so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

21:21

Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con): The Covid pandemic highlighted an already well-known issue relating to the legal import of dogs, cats and ferrets into the UK. During the pandemic, such imports rose by nearly 60 per cent as demand for puppies rose considerably. More noticeably, the pandemic highlighted the fact that the problem that exists with legal entry routes for animals such as dogs and cats brings with it a significant risk to welfare.

As I understand it, a single individual can import five puppies or kittens non-commercially into the UK. In theory, that would enable five individuals in a single vehicle to import 25 puppies or kittens with minimal border checks. The RSPCA and Cats Protection have both highlighted that such non-commercial imports have been a significant concern for years and have served as a major route for the entry of illegal puppies and kittens into Great Britain.

The bill will crack down on puppy and kitten smuggling by closing loopholes that have been exploited by unscrupulous commercial traders. It will ban the import of puppies and kittens under six months, as well as the import of dogs and cats that are mutilated or heavily pregnant. It will also address the current abuse of non-commercial

rules that compromises animal welfare and biosecurity by making it more difficult and less profitable for traders to fraudulently import animals for sale under the guise of owners who are travelling with their own pets.

The Scottish Conservatives welcome the bill and the closing of those loopholes, and we strongly support the motion. However, I impress on the minister the concerns that were raised earlier by my colleague Finlay Carson, which the minister has just touched on. The truncated period that has been provided to the Parliament for consideration of the LCM has had an impact on parliamentary scrutiny.

Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD): I think that Tim Eagle is about to come on to the point of principle that Finlay Carson raised earlier today. There should have been more time for the bill to be scrutinised by the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, of which Finlay Carson is the convener. Although I have no concerns about the bill, which originated from my Liberal Democrat MP colleague Danny Chambers, and notwithstanding what the minister has just said, does Tim Eagle agree that, in the future, committees must be given more time to fulfil their role in effectively scrutinising legislation?

Tim Eagle: I absolutely agree with Beatrice Wishart. I want to be careful, because my colleague Finlay Carson made a good point on the issue earlier. The bill is a really important piece of legislation and I hope that the whole Parliament can get behind it. However, as I said, the truncated period that the Scottish National Party Government has given the Parliament to consider the LCM has had an effect on parliamentary scrutiny. Regardless of whether we agree with the content of the bill, it is only right and fair that the processes for which this building was built are allowed the time that they need. It is a scar on what is a good LCM that, in this instance, that has not occurred.

21:24

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): The UK Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill proposes to make puppy and kitten smuggling more difficult by banning the import of puppies and kittens under six months, and it seeks to improve animal welfare by banning the import of cats and dogs that have been mutilated or that are heavily pregnant.

It will also close loopholes and make it more difficult for illegal traders who pose as pet owners travelling with their animals to import animals. We have all heard stories of people being duped into buying pets that have been illegally imported. Those animals are seldom in good health, have not been inoculated and have often been removed from their mothers when they were too young. When a breed is sought after, those animals can be really expensive to buy, making it a lucrative trade for criminals. Sadly, there is even more cost for buyers and more vet fees for sick animals. In the worst-case scenario, those pets might die because their illness cannot be treated.

The Cats Protection briefing told us that 4 per cent of all cats that were purchased in a one-year period were bought from abroad, which possibly reflects the increase in demand for specific breeds. Although 4 per cent does not seem very much, it equates to 65,000 cats.

In this Parliament, members' bills are looking at dog sales and dog theft, indicating that the trade in dogs is problematic and attractive to criminals. All those bills are worthy, but, if we are being honest, the issue needs a more comprehensive approach than that piecemeal one. The Government should consider consolidating legislation to ensure that the law can deal with the illegal trade of pets. However, the UK bill will make it more difficult to illegally import animals and make the trade less lucrative, which is a positive outcome. That will help to improve animal welfare and protect buyers from purchasing animals that have not been bred properly and might have been subject to cruelty and neglect.

Although the LCM is to be welcomed, there are concerns about the process surrounding it and the lack of time that we have had to deal with it, which has meant that the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee was not able to scrutinise the legislation. The Scottish Government, rather than providing an explanation of why that was or offering reassurance that it would ensure that it did not happen again, has become defensive and dismissive. Doubling down on that tonight is really not helpful.

Jim Fairlie: I refute the fact that the Government has become defensive. I say to the member that what we are doing is laying out the facts as they happened for us as well as for the committee.

Rhoda Grant: I do not believe that the facts that have been laid out explain why the LCM came so late to our committee. If we are to carry out our role as parliamentarians, we must scrutinise all legislation, no matter how well meaning. We need to find a better way of processing this type of legislation, to allow the Parliament to carry out that role properly. I hope that the Scottish Government will now take on board the committee's concerns and take steps to deal with the matter, to ensure that it never happens again.

That does not alter the fact that the legislation provides the opportunity to improve animal welfare

and discourage the illegal trade in animals. I therefore urge the Parliament to support it.

21:27

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): Presiding Officer, I declare an interest as convener of the cross-party group on animal welfare and thank you for allowing me this short contribution.

I speak in support of the LCM, which flows from a UK private member's bill setting out, inter alia, to crack down on the illegal puppy trade. Serious organised crime is often at the root of that cruel trade of smuggling animals from disreputable sources, including puppy factory farms, because, as well as misery for the animal, there are big bucks to be made—thousands of pounds for a puppy. In passing, I also welcome the extension of the legislation to kittens.

The UK private member's bill echoes my attempts, in my recent Welfare of Dogs (Scotland) Act 2025, to at least put a dent in this dreadful trafficking. The UK bill also sets out, as some have said, to end the mutilation of these companion animals by cropping ears and docking tails, which is done—and painfully at that—to fit in with fashion. I am sure that we all find those actions abhorrent.

I hope that the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs will now take the opportunity to accelerate the establishment of a UK-wide microchipping database of dogs—an issue that I have long pursued—which would provide traceability and be another significant component in ending this miserable trade.

I again thank the Presiding Officer and urge members to support the LCM.

21:29

Jim Fairlie: Improving the lives of Scotland's animals is something that I am strongly committed to, and I have been pleased that, over the past few years, this Government has been able to deliver or support many groundbreaking and innovative improvements in that area.

As for the timings, regardless of the speeches that were made by Tim Eagle and Rhoda Grant, the Scottish Government has not missed a single deadline but was subjected to delays in the UK Government's process.

Many of us have been appalled by the conditions in which too many dogs, cats and ferrets have been brought into the country by unscrupulous actors. The health and welfare of those animals is often shockingly poor. They are usually purchased by well-intentioned donors who then find themselves caring for sick animals and saddled with high vet bills or, worse, incurably ill pets who have to be euthanised, causing much distress. As the Parliament knows, I have been just as susceptible to the entreaty of a family who fell in love with an animal that came from a suspect background, and I know all too well the upset that arose when that pet had to be put down.

These issues have been a concern for welfare groups and the Government for some time. However, it has always been clear that GB-wide action was needed to avoid the backdoor entry of sick and mutilated animals into the country. The Government had indicated support for the bill on the two previous occasions that it was proposed in the UK Parliament, and we were extremely disappointed that it failed due to upheaval in the UK Government at that time. We are therefore pleased that the bill has been introduced again and we strongly urge members to support it and to allow a UK-wide approach to tackling this horrendous trade, which perpetuates an industry of poor-welfare companion animals.

Legislative consent processes such as this show what we can achieve when Parliaments and Governments work together on a cause of common concern and interest for, and to the benefit of, Scotland's people, communities and, in this case, animals. I reiterate that the bill respects devolved competence. However, if we were in an independent country, we would not need this LCM.

I urge members to back the motion and grant legislative consent to the relevant clauses in the bill.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes the debate on the legislative consent motion for the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, which is UK legislation.

Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is consideration of legislative consent motion S6M-18078, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on the Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill, which is United Kingdom legislation.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provisions of the Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill, introduced in the House of Commons on 16 October 2024, relating to local government elections (clause 1), elections to the Scottish Parliament (clause 2) and commencement and transitional provision (clause 4), so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

21:32

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): I give my apologies to those who are in the chamber and those who are watching, who I will detain for slightly longer before decision time because of the Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill. If they are up to date, members will have the report from the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee regarding this private member's bill, which is passing through the House of Commons and into the House of Lords and is guided by Tracy Gilbert MP, in which we recommend agreement to this LCM.

However, I will ensure that everything is above board and as transparent as we want and seek it to be here in Scotland. Although the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee did not produce a report, it did have some questions on this matter. The convener wrote to the Scottish Government today posing two questions on how decisions would be made regarding which authority will exercise power and how the Scottish Government intends to facilitate scrutiny by the Scottish Parliament on the policy position in the relevant regulations.

I compliment the Government and, in particular, the Minister for Parliamentary Business and the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government for being able to respond today to those two outstanding matters and confirming the Scottish Government's position on them, which in no way alters the SPPA Committee's view that consent should be given to the LCM.

21:34

The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn): I thank Martin Whitfield for giving me the opportunity to speak a little more—I will not speak for long—about the legislative consent motion. I should say that it was the Government's preference for there to be a section 30 order to transfer responsibility to this Parliament to legislate on the matter. That was the approach that I and the Government would have preferred but, unfortunately, the UK Government would not agree, which is regrettable.

I am genuinely grateful to Tracy Gilbert MP for taking the bill forward. It is important that we make it as straightforward as possible for voters in Scotland to be able to apply for a postal or proxy vote. This bill, should it pass through the UK Parliament, will achieve that.

I thank Martin Whitfield and the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee for the report that has been laid before the Parliament. I am sure that everyone has read it as assiduously as I have. The committee has considered the matter at pace. I am grateful for that.

Mr Whitfield made the point that, this morning, the Government received a copy of a letter from the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, which asked a couple of questions. As Mr Whitfield mentioned, I responded to that letter today. I would have been very happy to go to the committee to speak to the matter, but it wrote to me and I responded today.

I will place on record some of the points that were raised by the committee, and how I responded. First, the committee asked how it will be decided which Government will exercise the delegated powers that are set out in the bill. I say to the Parliament that the Scottish Government intends to make the regulations under the power in the bill. Those will be subject to agreement by the UK Government, but they will be laid in the Scottish Parliament in the usual way.

The committee also asked how scrutiny by the Scottish Parliament of the policy position of those regulations will be ensured when the power is exercised by a minister of the Crown. The Scottish Government intends to exercise those powers to implement online applications for absent voting in devolved Scottish elections, and we would expect any future changes by a minister to be the subject of engagement and agreement. The Scottish ministers would seek to ensure that the Scottish Parliament had the opportunity to assess any changes in good time. We recognise the importance of parliamentary scrutiny, and we will make sure that that is possible in this case.

With that, I urge the Parliament to agree to the motion in my name.

The Presiding Officer: The question on the motion will be put at decision time.

Business Motion

21:36

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-18100, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a business programme.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business—

Tuesday 2 September 2025	
2.00 pm	Time for Reflection
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Topical Questions (if selected)
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Committee Announcements
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business
Wednesday 3 September 2025	
2.00 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.00 pm	Portfolio Questions: Deputy First Minister Responsibilities, Economy and Gaelic; Finance and Local Government
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Approval of SSIs (if required)
5.00 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business
Thursday 4 September 2025	
11.40 am	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
11.40 am	General Questions
12.00 pm	First Minister's Questions
followed by	Members' Business
2.30 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.30 pm	Portfolio Questions: Climate Action and Energy, and Transport
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time
Tuesday 9 September 2025	

2.00 pm	Time for Reflection
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Topical Questions (if selected)
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Committee Announcements
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business
Wednesday 10 September 2025	
2.00 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.00 pm	Portfolio Questions: Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands; Health and Social Care
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Approval of SSIs (if required)
5.00 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business
Thursday 11 September 2025	
11.40 am	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
11.40 am	General Questions
12.00 pm	First Minister's Questions
followed by	Members' Business
2.30 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.30 pm	Portfolio Questions: Social Justice and Housing
followed by	Scottish Government Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time

(b) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 1 September 2025, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

Motion agreed to.

Parliamentary Bureau Motions

21:36

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is consideration of Parliamentary Bureau motion S6M-18101, on approval of a Scottish statutory instrument. I ask Jamie Hepburn to move the motion on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that the Home Detention Curfew (Amendment of Specified Time Periods) (Scotland) Order 2025 [draft] be approved.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

21:37

Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con): This SSI makes a small but far-reaching change to the home detention curfew regime, in which, subject to licence conditions, eligible prisoners are released from custody into the community.

At the moment, a prisoner can get HDC once they have served a quarter of their sentence. The SSI reduces that to a mere 15 per cent. A prisoner who is sentenced to two years in prison would therefore now be eligible for HDC after just three and a half months.

We all know that, due to a lack of any overarching strategy and an inability to build capacity, our prisons are running way over capacity. However, absent any such strategy, the Scottish National Party knee-jerks its response: last summer, and again earlier this year, the SNP opened the gates and let hundreds of prisoners out early. Despite that, by February 2025, prison numbers exceeded the pre-summer-release figure by almost 100, not least because more than one in 10 of the original cohort was back behind bars within weeks.

The SNP tried putting more people on community service, yet almost 30,000 such orders have been breached in the past decade or so. Roughly 8,000 of those involved got the jail for their breach, thus adding to the numbers.

Then the SNP changed the law such that short-term prisoners would automatically be released after serving just 40 per cent of their sentence, despite evidence showing that too little time in prison can prejudice proper rehabilitation—yet the prison population remains stubbornly high.

Clearly, this SSI is just the latest knee-jerk attempt to reduce the prison population. As was the case with the other measures, we have been given no evidence that it will either aid rehabilitation or, ultimately, reduce the prison population. Crucially, there is no consideration of

the victims of crime. Indeed, the Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs told the Criminal Justice Committee that no specific research has been undertaken on the impact that the SSI might have on victims.

Last month, I raised the case of violent thug Andrew Brown, who, just one year into a four-year sentence for repeatedly subjecting Demi Hannaway to appalling mental and physical abuse, even when she was pregnant, will get home leave. That is under the current rules. If colleagues vote to approve the SSI today, they are voting to allow criminals such as Brown to be eligible for HDC after seven months. The mere thought disgusts me, and any other MSP who feels the same must vote against the SSI tonight.

21:40

The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance): I will confine my remarks tightly and strictly to the substance of the statutory instrument that is before us tonight.

I thank the Parliament clerks and Criminal Justice Committee members for accommodating the scrutiny of this SSI with only the minimum period of 40 days. I trust that Parliament will support the proposals, which will allow completion of the SSI process before recess. That will ensure that the Scottish Prison Service, justice social work and partners have increased time to prepare for the proposed changes that will come into force on 20 October.

The planned changes are a programme for Government commitment for 2024-25 that contribute to the efforts to effectively balance the use of custody and community alternatives while supporting a sustainable prison population. Home detention curfew is a well-established part of our justice system that provides a structured and managed transition for individuals being released back into the community. Indeed, the legislation that home detention curfew is located in is the Prisoners and Criminal Proceedings (Scotland) Act 1993, which was introduced by a former Tory Government—I appreciate that that was in 1993, when I was at my work as a social worker and Mr Kerr was perhaps still at school.

The evidence shows that managed reintegration is far more effective than unplanned releases. It is also important to put on the record that release on home detention curfew is underpinned by individualised risk assessment and includes clear licence conditions, including a curfew and electronic monitoring. There is no automatic right to home detention curfew. Decisions on HDC release are made by the SPS following careful consideration of each case, including evidence provided by justice social work and Police Scotland. I reassure members that the SSI does not alter any of the aspects of risk assessment in the HDC process. It does not alter any of the statutory exclusions in any shape or form.

Liam Kerr: In the cabinet secretary's own words, no research has been done on the impact of the change on victims. Last summer, only 2 per cent of victims were told about the early release. Given those facts, surely the right thing to do today is to take the plans back to the drawing board, do the research and carry out a proper consultation so that we can understand the impact on victims.

The Presiding Officer: Please conclude, cabinet secretary.

Angela Constance: In conclusion, there are decades of research that support what works with the reintegration of offenders when they return to their community.

As I shared with the Criminal Justice Committee when I gave evidence to it, the recall rate is low, at 7 per cent, and any registered victim on the victim notification scheme will be informed if someone is to be released on home detention curfew. It is the case that all individuals will continue to be fully assessed. The SSI proposes changes to two out of the range of statutory criteria that must be met. This realignment of policy is in response to the previous changes that the Parliament made to the release of short-term prisoners. I encourage members to support the SSI.

The Presiding Officer: The question on the motion will be put at decision time.

The next item of business is consideration of Parliamentary Bureau motion S6M-18102, on the designation of a lead committee. I ask Jamie Hepburn to move the motion on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that the Education, Children and Young People Committee be designated as the lead committee in consideration of the Children (Care, Care Experience and Services Planning) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

The Presiding Officer: The question on the motion will be put at decision time.

Decision Time

21:45

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): There are six questions to be put as a result of today's business. The first question is, that motion S6M-18059, in the name of Jenny Gilruth, on the Education (Scotland) Bill at stage 3, be agreed to.

As this is a motion to pass the bill, the question must be decided by division. I would be grateful if members refreshed their screens at this point. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Carol Mochan (South Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I do not think that my app connected. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Mochan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on motion S6M-18059, in the name of Jenny Gilruth, on the Education (Scotland) Bill at stage 3, is: For 69, Against 47, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the Education (Scotland) Bill be passed.

The Presiding Officer: The next question is, that motion S6M-18079, in the name of Shirley-Anne Somerville, on a legislative consent motion on the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill, which is United Kingdom legislation, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on motion S6M-18079, in the name of Shirley-Anne Somerville, on a legislative consent motion on the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error and Recovery) Bill, which is UK legislation, is: For 109, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that clauses 72, 73, 74, 75, 77 to 81, 83 to 87 and 98, and schedules 3-4 of the Public Authorities (Fraud, Error And Recovery) Bill 2025, introduced in the House of Commons on 22 January 2025, so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The Presiding Officer: The next question is, that motion S6M-18077, in the name of Jim Fairlie, on a legislative consent motion on the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, which is UK legislation, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provisions of the Animal Welfare (Import of Dogs, Cats and Ferrets) Bill, introduced in the House of Commons on 16 October 2024, so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The Presiding Officer: The next question is, that motion S6M-18078, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on a legislative consent motion on the Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill, which is UK legislation, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provisions of the Absent Voting (Elections in Scotland and Wales) Bill, introduced in the House of Commons on 16 October 2024, relating to local government elections (clause 1), elections to the Scottish Parliament (clause 2) and commencement and transitional provision (clause 4), so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament and alter the executive competence of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The Presiding Officer: The next question is, that motion S6M-18101, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on approval of a Scottish statutory instrument, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Rona Mackay]
Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on motion S6M-18101, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on approval of a Scottish statutory instrument, is: For 90, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the Home Detention Curfew (Amendment of Specified Time Periods) (Scotland) Order 2025 [draft] be approved.

The Presiding Officer: The final question is, that motion S6M-18102, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on the designation of a lead committee, be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the Education, Children and Young People Committee be designated as the lead committee in consideration of the Children (Care, Care Experience and Services Planning) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes decision time.

Meeting closed at 21:52.

This is the final edition of the *Official Report* for this meeting. It is part of the Scottish Parliament *Official Report* archive and has been sent for legal deposit.

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers
is available here:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000
Textphone: 0800 092 7100
Email: sp.info@parliament.scot



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba