



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

PUBLIC AUDIT AND POST-LEGISLATIVE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

MINUTES

20th Meeting, 2019 (Session 5)

Thursday 19 September 2019

Present:

Colin Beattie	Bill Bowman
Willie Coffey	Liam Kerr (Deputy Convener)
Jenny Marra (Convener)	Alex Neil
Anas Sarwar	

Also present: Edward Mountain

The meeting opened at 9.00 am.

1. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to take items 4 and 5 in private.
2. **Post-legislative Scrutiny - Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002:** The Committee took evidence in a roundtable format from—

Claire Cairns, Network Coordinator, Coalition of Carers;

Severin Carrell, Scotland Editor, The Guardian;

Dr Craig Dalzell, Head of Policy and Research, Common Weal;

Rob Edwards, Director and co-founder, The Ferret;

Carole Ewart, Convener, Campaign for Freedom of Information;

Stephen Lowe, Policy Officer, UNISON Scotland;

Nick McGowan-Lowe, Organiser Scottish Office, National Union of Journalists;

Bailey-Lee Robb, MSYP and Trustee, Scottish Youth Parliament.

3. **Section 22 report - The 2018/19 audit of Highlands and Islands Enterprise: Cairngorm mountain and funicular railway:** The Committee took evidence from—

Caroline Gardner, Auditor General for Scotland;

Gordon Smail, Audit Director, and Maggie Bruce, Senior Audit Manager, Audit Scotland.

4. **Section 22 report - The 2018/19 audit of Highlands and Islands Enterprise: Cairngorm mountain and funicular railway (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence heard at agenda item 3 and took further evidence from—

Caroline Gardner, Auditor General for Scotland;

Gordon Smail, Audit Director, and Maggie Bruce, Senior Audit Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to await the Auditor General for Scotland's section 23 report on this subject before considering its next steps.

5. **Post-legislative Scrutiny- Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (in private):** The Committee considered the key themes arising from the evidence heard at agenda item 2.

The meeting closed at 11.29 am.

Lucy Scharbert
Clerk to the Public Audit and Post-legislative Scrutiny Committee
Room T3.60
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
Tel: 0131 348 5390
Email: papls.committee@parliament.scot