ENVIRONMENT, CLIMATE CHANGE AND LAND REFORM COMMITTEE

AGENDA

4th Meeting, 2018 (Session 5)

Tuesday 30 January 2018

The Committee will meet at 9.45 am in the Robert Burns Room (CR1).

1. Decision on taking business in private: The Committee will decide whether to take items 4 and 5 in private.

2. Inquiry into the environmental impacts of salmon farming: The Committee will take evidence from—

   Dr Adam Hughes, Senior Lecturer in Sustainable Aquaculture, Professor Nick Owens, Director, Professor Paul Tett, Reader in Coastal Ecosystems and Scientific Lead, and Dr Lindsay Vare, Project Manager, Scottish Association for Marine Science;

   Professor Eric Verspoor, Director, Rivers and Lochs Institute, University of the Highlands and Islands.

3. Draft climate change plan (RPP3): The Committee will take evidence from—

   Chris Stark, Director of Energy and Climate Change, Clare Hamilton, Deputy Director, Head of Decarbonisation, and Michael King, Senior Economist, Head of Energy and Climate Change Unit, Scottish Government.

4. Draft climate change plan (RPP3): The Committee will consider evidence heard earlier in the meeting.

5. Environmental implications for Scotland of the UK leaving the EU: The Committee will consider draft correspondence to the Scottish Government.

6. Inquiry into the environmental impacts of salmon farming (in private): The Committee will consider evidence heard earlier in the meeting.
The papers for this meeting are as follows—

**Agenda item 2**

Inquiry into the environmental impacts of salmon farming cover note  
PRIVATE PAPER  

**Agenda Item 3**

Draft Climate Change Plan (RPP3) cover note  
PRIVATE PAPER  

**Agenda Item 5**

PRIVATE PAPER
Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee

4th Meeting, 2018 (Session 5)

Tuesday 30 January 2018

Inquiry into the environmental impacts of salmon farming

Background

1. The Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform (ECCLR) Committee has agreed to undertake an inquiry into the environmental impact of salmon farming in Scotland.

2. The ECCLR Committee agreed its approach to the inquiry into the environmental impacts of salmon farming on 19 December 2017. The Committee subsequently confirmed the timescale for the inquiry on 23 January 2018. The ECCLR Committee will report to the REC Committee in advance of its wider inquiry on aquaculture in Scotland.

3. The ECCLR Committee’s focus is the report commissioned by SPICe and undertaken by SAMS Research Services Ltd (SRSL). This report contains a review of literature on the environmental impacts of salmon farming in Scotland, the scale of the impacts and approaches to mitigating the impacts. This provides an update of the Scottish Government commissioned report: Review and synthesis of the environmental impacts of aquaculture, published in 2002.

4. The SRSL report was published on Thursday 25 January and includes the terms of reference for the research commission. The purpose of the research report is to inform the Committee’s consideration and assist it in reaching its own views.

Evidence sessions

5. The Committee has agreed to hear from SRSL on 30 January.

6. The Committee has agreed to invite the following stakeholders to give evidence on 6 February:

Panel 1:
- Scottish Salmon Producers’ Organisation (SSPO)
- Individual producer – Loch Duart
- Community organisation – Friends of the Sound of Jura
- SE Link

Panel 2:
- Scottish Environment Protection Agency
- Marine Scotland Licencing Operations Team (MS-LOT)
- Marine Scotland Science Fish Health Inspectorate (MSS-FHI)
- Highland Council (to be confirmed)
## Timetable

The Committee has agreed the following timetable for consideration of this research in order to report to the REC Committee ahead of its wider inquiry:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25 January 2018</td>
<td>Launch of inquiry including publication of research and call for evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 January 2018</td>
<td>Evidence from the SRSL (available on Facebook Live)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 February 2018</td>
<td>Evidence from Stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 February 2018</td>
<td>Consideration of draft report to the REC Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W/C 5 March 2018</td>
<td>Report to the REC Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Clerks**  
*Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee.*
Introduction

1. On 19 January 2017, the Scottish Government published the draft Climate Change Plan.

2. This draft Plan was considered by four Committees of the Scottish Parliament.

3. During its consideration of the draft Plan, the Committee received commitments from the Scottish Government and Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform for further engagement with the Committee on the completion of the final Plan, including on the monitoring and evaluation frameworks.

4. The Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee published its report on 10 March 2017 and made several recommendations about areas it believed should be revised in the final version of the draft Plan.

5. It was announced that the final version of the Plan would be published in February 2018 and the Committee pursued further engagement on the completion of this in correspondence to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform at several points throughout 2017.

6. In December 2017, the Committee wrote to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform seeking further information on the development of the plan and the monitoring framework and inviting her to give evidence to the Committee on 30 January 2018 on the completion of a final Plan. The Scottish Government responded to the Committee’s letter and agreed that Chris Stark, Director of Energy and Climate Change would represent the Scottish Government at the meeting of 30 January 2018.

Background

Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009

7. The Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 (the Act) was passed by the Scottish Parliament in June 2009. This provides a statutory framework to reduce emissions of greenhouse gases in Scotland by setting the following targets:

- Interim target of 42% reduction (from 1990 levels) by 2020\(^1\) with the power for this target to be varied based on expert advice

---

\(^1\) On 25 May 2016, the First Minister confirmed legislation will be introduced to increase this target to reflect ambitions developed at the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change 21st session of the Conference of the Parties (COP21) in October 2015. The Cabinet Secretary for
8. To help ensure the delivery of these targets, the Act also requires the Scottish Ministers to set annual targets for Scottish emissions from 2010 to 2050.

9. Under section 35 of the Act, a statutory report on proposals and policies is required, setting out how the Scottish Government proposes to meet its climate change targets. A draft version of this report must be laid in the Scottish Parliament for consideration and the Parliament has 60 days within which to complete this review.

10. Before laying the final report before Parliament, Scottish Ministers are required to have regard to:

   - any representations on the draft report made to them;
   - any resolution relating to the draft report passed by the Parliament; and
   - any report relating to the draft report published by any Parliamentary Committee.

11. The final Climate Change Plan must be accompanied by a statement to identify the changes (if any) that have been made in response to such representations, resolutions or reports and the reasons for those changes.

**Draft Climate Change Plan (RPP3)**

12. The third report on policies and proposals (the draft Climate Change Plan (RPP3)) was published on 19 January 2017 and considered by the following Committees:

   - **Economy, Jobs and Fair Work Committee**
   - **Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee**
   - **Local Government and Communities Committee**
   - **Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee**

13. All four Committees published reports on the draft Plan in March 2017 and a debate was held in the Chamber of the Scottish Parliament on these reports on 16 March 2017.

**Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee report on the Draft Climate Change Plan (RPP3)**

14. The Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee considered the following aspects of the draft Climate Change Plan:

---

Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform has written to the Committee on Climate Change seeking renewed advice on the 2020 interim target.
- Overview;
- Development of RPP3;
- Climate change governance, (including monitoring and evaluation);
- Water;
- Public sector;
- Resource use (waste);
- Land use (including peatlands and land use by the public sector); and
- Behaviour change.

15. It published its report on the draft Climate Change Plan on 10 March 2017. This contained detailed recommendations for the Scottish Government, several of which are summarised below:

- The Committee proposed further engagement with stakeholders and further advice from the Committee on Climate Change (CCC). It made several recommendations as to how stakeholders could be involved in the development of the final Plan and future iterations.

- Consultation on the Scottish Government’s draft Energy Strategy took place at the same time as consideration of the Plan and the Committee recommended the final Plan state explicitly how the final Energy Strategy (which was published on 20 December 2017) contributed and interacted with the final Plan. It also suggested the Plan should state how all relevant Scottish Government strategies would take account of the Plan.

- The Committee recommended that emission reductions expected of each sector across the economy should be “equally challenging” and that the carbon envelopes for agriculture and transport should be revised to show “greater ambition”.

- The inconsistent approach to development of the carbon envelopes was of concern to the Committee. It also noted the TIMES Model, the model used to create the carbon envelopes, did not take account of the wider benefits to be achieved from a particular course of action and that the draft Plan was unclear on the abatement potential of policies. The Committee recommended a formal, consistent and transparent approach to this be taken in finalising the Plan.

- The Committee considered “it is unclear in the draft Plan whether assumptions such as the development and implementation of carbon capture and storage are supported by alternatives should the assumptions which have been made prove to be unfounded. The final Plan should set out an alternative “Plan B”.”
The Committee called for the consistent inclusion of information on how behaviour change had been accounted for in the development of policies and proposals, with particular regard to transport and modal shift.

The draft Plan included many references to developing technologies which would support the delivery of the goals in the Plan, but was not specific on how the infrastructure or markets required to achieve those technologies were being planned for or supported. The Committee called for this to be rectified in the final Plan.

The Committee made specific recommendations on how the summary monitoring reports on progress towards the goals in the Climate Change Plan. The Committee sought a commitment from the Scottish Government that “it will have the opportunity to review the draft monitoring framework prior to the publication of the final Climate Change Plan”.

The Committee recommended the final Plan include further detail on how further development of a circular economy would impact on the policies and proposals in the Plan on waste.

The Committee recommended the commitment to make soil testing compulsory for improved land should be reinstated in the final Plan.

The Committee recommended further guidance and assistance across the public sector was required to support strong climate leadership.

The Committee recommended the final Plan included policies and proposals on blue carbon.

The Committee outlined its intention to review the final Plan when published and sought a commitment from the Scottish Government that the final Plan would be updated to reflect any changes emanating from the proposed Climate Change Bill.

Meeting

16. At this meeting, the Committee will hear from the following Scottish Government officials:

- Chris Stark, Director of Energy and Climate Change;
- Clare Hamilton (Deputy Director - Head of Decarbonisation); and
- Michael King, Senior Economist - Head of Energy and Climate Change Unit.

Clerks/SPICE Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee
Annexe A

Timeline of events following the publication of the Committee’s report on 10 March 2017

10 March 2017 The Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee published its report on the draft Climate Change Plan.

16 March 2017 A debate was held in the Scottish Parliament on the reports of all four committees.

29 March 2017 The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform on the publication of the final climate change plan, noting it looked forward to “continued engagement in development of this important strategy and anticipates the update on the timing of publication will also provide an opportunity to hear how stakeholders have been further involved in the development of the final Plan”.

24 April 2017 The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform responded to the Committee stating an update would be provided to Parliament in June 2017 once the 2015 Scottish Greenhouse Gas Emissions statistics had been published.

13 June 2017 The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform made a statement to Parliament on the Greenhouse Gas Inventory 2015.

27 June 2017 The Committee took evidence from the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform on her portfolio at the end of the parliamentary year and took the opportunity to ask about the climate change plan and proposed bill. No further work had been undertaken on the Committee’s recommendations of further TIMES Model runs with adjustments relating to carbon capture and storage and active travel at that time. The Cabinet Secretary also stated: “We will be back in touch with you to discuss how best to engage Parliament and parliamentary committees in that monitoring process.”

21 August 2017 Chris Stark, Director of Energy and Climate Change wrote to the Committee seeking its views on the recommendations from each Committee on the extension of the period available for parliamentary scrutiny of the reports on policies and proposals in the context of the consultation on the proposed Climate Change Bill.
5 September 2017  The Scottish Government published its Programme for Government 2017-18 which contained commitments on a new Climate Change Bill, creation of Low Emissions Zones, waste and the circular economy, investment in active travel, and targets for a shift to electric vehicles.


29 September 2017  The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform following the Scottish Parliament’s summer recess to again emphasise its interest in engagement on the development of the final Plan, particularly the monitoring and evaluation framework. The Committee sought updates on various recommendations it made in its report.

12 October 2017  The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform wrote to the Committee on Climate Change on its 2017 Progress Report.

31 October 2017  The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform made a statement to Parliament on the Greenhouse Gas Emissions (Annual Target 2015)

7 November 2017  The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform responded to the Committee’s September correspondence highlighting internal work to develop the monitoring and evaluation framework for the final Plan and engagement with the Committee on Climate Change. The letter also noted the final Plan would be published in February 2018.

14 December 2017  The Scottish Government’s draft Budget 2018-19 was published.

20 December 2017  The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform requesting details of how the Committee would be involved in the development of the areas of the final Plan in which it had been invited to engage and to invite the Cabinet Secretary to come give evidence to the Committee. The Scottish Government’s Energy Strategy was also published.

23 January 2018  The Scottish Government responded to the Committee’s letter and agreed that Chris Stark, Director of Energy and Climate Change would represent the Scottish Government at the meeting of 30 January 2018.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30 January 2018</td>
<td>The Committee will take evidence from Chris Stark ahead of the publication of the final Climate Change Plan in February 2018.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>