



# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 4, No. 24, Session 5

Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 10 September 2019

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

- 1. Time for Reflection:** Mr Ameer Versace, Strategic Engagements Director, Scottish Ahlul Bayt Society, led Time for Reflection.
- 2. Topical Questions:** Questions were answered by Cabinet Secretaries.
- 3. Ministerial Statement:** The Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy (Fergus Ewing) made a statement and answered questions on Creating a Sustainable Future for Crofting.
- 4. The Impact of the UK Government's Planned Immigration Policy and Mobility Restrictions on Scotland's University and Scientific Research Sectors:** The Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science (Richard Lochhead) moved S5M-18767—That the Parliament notes that the UK Government's proposed immigration policies will be deeply damaging to Scotland's further education, higher education and research sectors; joins with Scottish institutions and the Russell Group in raising serious concerns about the impact of the three-year European Temporary Leave to Remain policy, which was announced in September 2019, if the UK leaves the EU without a deal, which discriminates against Scottish institutions and students in Scotland studying for four-year degrees; welcomes the huge contribution that international staff and students make to Scotland's universities, colleges and research institutions, as well as the country's economy and communities; notes the success of the Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland scheme, which benefited more than 8,000 graduates between 2005 and 2008; further notes the consensus across parties and with sector bodies such as Universities Scotland and Colleges Scotland on the

benefits of a flexible post-study work route for Scotland, and calls on the UK Government to urgently amend its proposed policies to ensure that they respect Scotland's unique education system and its population needs, including by extending leave to remain to a minimum of four years and reintroducing a two-year post-study work visa for students at universities and colleges in Scotland.

Oliver Mundell moved amendment S5M-18767.1—

As an amendment to motion S5M-18767 in the name of Richard Lochhead (The Impact of the UK Government's Planned Immigration Policy and Mobility Restrictions of Scotland's University and Scientific Research Sectors), leave out from "that the UK Government's" to end and insert "the UK Government's proposed immigration policies and joins with Scottish further education, higher education and research institutions and the Russell Group in raising serious concerns about the impact of the three-year European Temporary Leave to Remain policy, which was announced in September 2019, if the UK leaves the EU without a deal, which presents challenges for Scottish institutions and students in Scotland studying for four-year degrees; welcomes the huge contribution that international staff and students make to Scotland's universities, colleges and research institutions, as well as the country's economy and communities; notes the success of the Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland scheme, which benefited more than 8,000 graduates between 2005 and 2008; further notes the consensus across parties and with sector bodies such as Universities Scotland and Colleges Scotland on the benefits of a flexible post-study work route for Scotland; calls on the UK Government to review its proposed policies to ensure they work well for Scotland's unique education system and its population needs, including by extending leave to remain to a minimum of four years and reintroducing a two-year post-study work visa for students at universities and colleges in Scotland; recognises that leaving the EU with a negotiated deal will help bring much needed certainty, and calls on all parties to support the UK Government's efforts to do so."

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 29, Against 85, Abstentions 0).

The motion was then agreed to ((DT) by division: For 84, Against 1, Abstentions 29).

**5. Election of Member to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body:** Ruth Davidson was nominated as the candidate for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

The Parliament voted to elect Ruth Davidson for appointment to the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body (For 112, Against 0, Abstentions 0).

**6. Committee Membership:** Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau moved S5M-18799—That the Parliament agrees that—

Donald Cameron be appointed to replace Jamie Greene as a member of the Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Affairs Committee;

Mike Rumbles be appointed as a member of the Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Affairs Committee;

Jeremy Balfour be appointed to replace Alison Harris as a member of the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee;

Rachael Hamilton be appointed to replace John Scott as a member of the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee;

Alison Harris be appointed to replace Oliver Mundell as a member of the Education and Skills Committee;

Daniel Johnson be appointed to replace Johann Lamont as a member of the Education and Skills Committee;

Beatrice Wishart be appointed as a member of the Education and Skills Committee;

Alex Rowley be appointed to replace James Kelly as a member of the Finance and Constitution Committee;

James Kelly be appointed to replace Daniel Johnson as a member of the Justice Committee;

Sarah Boyack be appointed to replace Alex Rowley as a member of the Local Government and Communities Committee;

Maurice Corry be appointed to replace Rachael Hamilton as a member of the Public Petitions Committee; and

Neil Findlay be appointed to replace Elaine Smith as a member of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**7. Substitution on Committees:** Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau moved S5M-18800— That the Parliament agrees that—

Oliver Mundell be appointed to replace Alison Harris as the Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party substitute on the Education and Skills Committee;

Jamie Greene be appointed to replace Alison Harris as the Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party substitute on the Equalities and Human Rights Committee;

Peter Chapman be appointed to replace Maurice Corry as the Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party substitute on the Public Petitions Committee;

Rhoda Grant be appointed to replace Pauline McNeill as the Scottish Labour Party substitute on the Economy, Energy and Fair Work Committee;

Elaine Smith be appointed to replace Rhoda Grant as the Scottish Labour Party substitute on the Equalities and Human Rights Committee;

Rhoda Grant be appointed to replace Elaine Smith as the Scottish Labour Party substitute on the Finance and Constitution Committee;

Monica Lennon be appointed to replace Anas Sarwar as the Scottish Labour Party substitute on the Health and Sport Committee; and

Anas Sarwar be appointed to replace Rhoda Grant as the Scottish Labour Party substitute on the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**8. Decision Time:** The Parliament took decisions on items 4, 6 and 7 as noted above.

**9. Bullying and Harassment in the NHS:** The Parliament debated S5M-17240 in the name of Edward Mountain—That the Parliament, in light of John Sturrock QC's report into allegations of bullying and harassment at NHS Highland, commends the courage of all those who have spoken out in this regard and also those who do so throughout NHS Scotland, and notes calls on the Scottish Government to protect and support all those who speak out against bullying and harassment and to ensure that the whistleblowing process is robust and easily accessible.

The meeting closed at 5.38 pm.

**P E Grice**  
Clerk of the Parliament  
10 September 2019

**Appendix**  
**(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)**

**Instruments/documents laid for consultation**

The following instruments/documents were laid before the Parliament on 10 September 2019 for consultation—

Proposed Draft Regulations – Deposit and Return Scheme for Scotland Regulations 2020 (SSI 2019/164)  
laid under section 97(2)(a) of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 for the purposes of the representation period required by section 97(3) of that Act

Deposit and Return Scheme for Scotland Regulations 2020 – Accompanying Statement ((SSI 2019/165)  
laid under section 97(2)(b) of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009

**Other Documents**

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 5 September 2019 and is not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Registers of Scotland - Annual Report and Accounts 2018-19 SG/2019/146** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 10 September 2019 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**The Deposit and Return Scheme for Scotland Regulations 2020 – Accompanying Statement SG/2019/165** laid under section 97(2)(b) of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009

**Proposed Draft Regulations – The Deposit and Return Scheme for Scotland Regulations 2020 SG/2019/164** laid under section 97(2)(a) of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 for the purposes of the representation period required by section 97(3) of that Act.

---

---

Published by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

---

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.parliament.scot/documents](http://www.parliament.scot/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000 or 0800 092 7500

Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)

Live chat on [parliament.scot](http://parliament.scot)

You can write to us in any language or contact us  
using the Text Relay service or in British Sign  
Language through [contactScotland-BSL](http://contactScotland-BSL).

---

---

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website -  
[www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by contacting Public Information.