Dear Paul

MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT, SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT, BBC AND UK GOVERNMENT

I understand that your committee will be considering the draft Memorandum of Understanding to deliver the Smith Commission proposals around a role for Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament in the process of BBC Charter Renewal. I wanted to take the opportunity to write to you to set out the Scottish Government position to inform your consideration.

I am firmly committed to ensuring that the proposals made by the Smith Commission, to guarantee a formal consultative role for the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament in reviewing and agreeing the BBC Charter, in the same way as it does the UK Parliament, are implemented in full. The commitment outlined in the Smith Agreement is that Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament are to play a role in the governance of the BBC in the same way as for the UK Parliament. This is critical to our success in ensuring that the BBC can deliver for the people of Scotland.

I support the process of agreeing to a Memorandum of Understanding to ensure that the imminent process of Charter Renewal provides both the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament with a solid means of influencing Charter content so that it delivers well for the people of Scotland. I also consider the MoU to be the formal means through which our policy on broadcasting can be progressed once the process of Charter Renewal begins. However, in order for this process to happen effectively, it is critical that the MoU provides absolute clarity and that the Scottish Government and Parliament will be meaningfully engaged at each point in the Charter renewal process. Whilst the present draft presents some detail on how consultation on the terms of reference for the Charter will be agreed, it

Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Europe and External Affairs
Fiona Hyslop MSP

T: 0300 244 4000
E: scottish.ministers@scotland.gsi.gov.uk

Paul Martin MSP
Convener
Public Audit Committee
Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Your ref:
Our ref:
8 June 2015
does not currently provide for a role in determining the content of the Charter, both for this and subsequent charter renewal processes.

Consequently, I am of the view that the current draft MoU does not yet fully deliver the role which the Smith Commission outlined. I will be writing to the Secretary of State for Culture Media and Sport in due course to make specific comments on the draft, and my officials are in discussion with the Department for Culture Media and Sport. I attach for information our current revised wording for the MoU which will be proposed to DCMS.

I welcome consideration of the draft by the Committee and look forward to hearing more on your conclusions in due course.

Yours sincerely

FIONA HYSLOP
Draft Memorandum of Understanding with proposed changes

- SMITH COMMISSION - MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING - BBC - DRAFT OUTLINE

Preamble

Following the referendum on the independence of Scotland on 18 September 2014, and in order to deliver the commitments made by the leaders of the pro-UK parties, Lord Smith of Kelvin was asked to convene cross-party talks and facilitate an inclusive engagement process across Scotland to produce recommendations for further devolution of powers to the Scottish Parliament.

That process led to the Smith Commission Agreement, published on 27 November 2014\(^1\). This made several proposals specific to the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), as set out in paragraph 36 of the Agreement:

There will be a formal consultative role for the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament in the process of reviewing the BBC’s Charter. The BBC will lay its annual report and accounts before the Scottish Parliament and submit reports to, and appear before, committees of the Scottish Parliament in relation to matters relating to Scotland in the same way as it does in the UK Parliament.

The UK Government’s Command paper, ‘Scotland in the United Kingdom: An enduring settlement\(^2\), published in January 2015, set out at paragraphs 5.2.1 – 5.2.3 how paragraph 36 of the Smith Commission Agreement will be enacted by this Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), stating:

5.2.1 Paragraph 36 of the Smith Commission Agreement, which relates to the relationship between the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) and the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament, will be enacted by Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). This MoU, entered into by the UK Government, Scottish Government, Scottish Parliament and the BBC, will fulfil the Agreement’s proposal by setting out commitments that guarantee a full consultative role for the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament in the review of the Royal Charter and the on-going scrutiny of the BBC.

5.2.2 The commitments outlined in the MoU will be:

- A commitment on the UK Government to consult with the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament before recommending that any Royal Charter on the BBC is granted, and detail concerning the terms of engagement throughout the review process;

---

\(^1\) https://www.smith-commission.scot/smith-commission-report/

• A commitment from the BBC to send its annual report and accounts to the Scottish Government and a commitment from the Scottish Government to lay these before the Scottish Parliament;

• A commitment from the BBC to appear before Scottish Parliament committees on matters relating to Scotland; and

• A commitment to enshrine all the above in the next Charter.

5.2.3 Setting this out in an MoU, rather than draft clauses, ensures that the BBC’s integrity and independence is secured by keeping its governance and constitutional arrangements off the statute books. Importantly, delivering this commitment by MoU will ensure that the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament are able to have a consultative role in time for the next Charter Review, which is due to commence after the 2015 General Election; any draft clauses in this respect, setting out a formal role for the Scottish Government, would necessarily come into force too late to guarantee such an involvement. Furthermore, the process, timing and scope of the review of the BBC’s Charter are not set out in statute.

Parties

- The Department for Culture, Media and Sport (The Department)
- The BBC
- The Scottish Government
- The Scottish Parliament

Commitments:

1. Charter Review

The BBC is established by Royal Charter. The Charter sets out how the BBC is constituted, its public purposes, and the respective roles and composition of the BBC Trust and the Executive Board. The current Royal Charter expires at the end of 31 December 2016.

The terms of the formal consultative role for the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament in the process of reviewing the BBC’s Charter shall be as follows, on the same basis as it does in the UK Parliament:

- The Department will consult the Scottish Government on the draft terms of reference for the Charter Review in advance of their publication.

---

3 In this Memorandum of Understanding - “the BBC” means the British Broadcasting Corporation; “the Executive” means the Executive Board of the BBC; and “the Trust” means the BBC Trust; and any reference to “the BBC” (without qualification) includes a reference to both the Trust and the Executive, so far as makes sense in the context.
• The Scottish Government will lay the final terms of reference for the Charter Review before the Scottish Parliament.

• The Department will consult the Scottish Government on the draft Charter through the process of charter drafting

• The Scottish Government will lay the draft Charter and Framework Agreement before the Scottish Parliament, and should the Parliament deem it appropriate, schedule a ‘take note’ debate on the content of the draft Charter and Framework Agreement.

• The Department will consult the Scottish Government before recommending to Her Majesty in Council that the draft Charter is granted.

2. Annual report and accounts

Under Article 45 of the Royal Charter, the BBC is required to prepare an annual report and the audited statement of accounts that complies with the requirements of that article and with any directions given (after consulting the BBC) by the Secretary of State or the Foreign Secretary as to the information to be given in the report about the finance, administration and work of the BBC, and in the statement of accounts. The completed report and audited accounts must be sent to the Secretary of State who must lay them before the UK Parliament; and once that has been done the BBC must publish them.

The BBC will send the completed report and the audited accounts to the Scottish Parliament at the same time they are sent to the Secretary of State. The BBC will lay the completed report and the audited accounts before the Scottish Parliament on the next available sitting day after they have been sent to the Secretary of State.

3. Reports to, and appearing before, the Scottish Parliament

The BBC regularly receives invitations to provide evidence to Committees of the UK Parliament and to those of the Scottish Parliament (both through witnesses and by the production of documentary evidence). The BBC approaches such invitations from committees of the UK Parliament with due regard to its duty to maintain the BBC’s editorial and operational independence.

The BBC will submit reports to, and appear before, committees of the Scottish Parliament in relation to matters relating to Scotland on the same basis as it does in the UK Parliament.

4. Next Charter

Subject to a Royal Charter for the continuation of the BBC being granted, the commitments the process outlined under section 2 above, relating to the BBC

---

*This would ensure parity with the processes in the UK Parliament for the last Charter Review in 2006. See the ‘take note’ debate in the House of Lords, 30 June 2006: [http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/id200506/ldhansrd/vo060616/text/60616-01.htm](http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/id200506/ldhansrd/vo060616/text/60616-01.htm); and the Commons debate on 3 July (see: [http://www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/cm/cmvote/60710v01.htm](http://www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/cm/cmvote/60710v01.htm)).*
contained in the Smith Commission’s proposals will be enshrined in that Charter and in all subsequent charters unless otherwise set in statute elsewhere.

[Signatures etc.]