European and External Relations Committee

Connecting Scotland: how Scottish organisations engage internationally
# Contents

**Background to the inquiry** 1

**Conclusions and Recommendations** 1

- Universities and colleges 2
- Local authorities 3
- International development 4
- Third sector and civil society 6
- Culture and sport 6
- General conclusions 8

**Summary of Evidence** 9

- Universities 9
  - Background to international activities of Scottish universities 9
  - Barriers to international engagement 16
- Colleges 19
  - Coordinating the approach to international activities 19
  - EU funding 19
  - Networks for international working 19
  - Barriers to international activities 20
  - Reduction in international students 22
  - Post-Study Work Visas 22
  - Collaboration 24
  - Strategy for colleges sector 24
- Local authorities 26
  - Business, trade and investment 27
  - Culture 28
  - Influencing European policy 29
  - Access to European funding 31
  - International networking 34
  - Twinning links 35
  - School activities 35
  - Barriers to international engagement 36
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International Development in the third sector</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale and scope of international development in the third sector</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networks and collaboration</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scottish Government’s International Development Policy and Fund</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global citizenship education</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnership not charity</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy coherence</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better use of the diaspora</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third sector and civil society</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human rights</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third sector and civil society</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Sport</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range of international engagement</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networks and partnerships</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration in international engagement</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding and budgets</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging internationalisation</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building an international reputation</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Government approach on cultural diplomacy</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Government response to issues raised across sectors</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating an international culture at home</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU funding</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-study work visas</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better coordination and collaboration</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexe A</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extracts from the minutes of the European and External Relations Committee and associated written and supplementary evidence</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexe B</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of other written evidence</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexe C</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fact finding visits and events</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
European and External Relations Committee

The remit of the European and External Relations Committee is to consider and report on-

a. proposals for European Union legislation;

b. the implementation of European Communities and European Union legislation;

c. any European Communities or European Union issue;

d. the development and implementation of the Scottish Administration’s links with countries and territories outside Scotland, the European Union (and its institutions) and other international organisations; and

e. co-ordination of the international activities of the Scottish Administration.

www.scottish.parliament.uk/european

@ europe@scottish.parliament.uk

0131 348 5234

Follow the European and External Relations Committee @SP_European
## Committee Membership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Convener</th>
<th>Deputy Convener</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Christina McKelvie</td>
<td>Hanzala Malik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish National Party</td>
<td>Scottish Labour</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Roderick Campbell</th>
<th>Willie Coffey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scottish National Party</td>
<td>Scottish National Party</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adam Ingram</th>
<th>Jamie McGrigor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scottish National Party</td>
<td>Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anne McTaggart</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Labour</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*European and External Relations Committee*

*Connecting Scotland: how Scottish organisations engage internationally, 5th Report, 2015 (Session 4)*
Background to the inquiry

1. This report concludes the second strand of the European and External Relations Committee’s inquiry into Connecting Scotland: how Scotland can engage most effectively in a globalising world. The second strand of the inquiry considered how Scottish organisations engage internationally.

2. The three main aims of this inquiry were to—
   - map international activities carried out by Scottish organisations,
   - understand how these activities contribute to international engagement, and
   - understand how these activities provide opportunities for learning and exchange.

3. Given the wealth of evidence received and collected on the engagement activities of Scottish organisations, this report focuses on the key recommendations and conclusions that emerged from this strand of the Connecting Scotland inquiry. A full summary of the evidence can be found following this report.

4. The Committee issued a call for evidence inviting stakeholders to respond to questions based on the three main inquiry aims. It also considered these issues in a series of oral evidence sessions and informal evidence gathering events and visits. The Committee would like to thank all of those who submitted written evidence, provided oral evidence or hosted a visit for this inquiry; their contributions have been extremely valuable for the Committee.

5. The Committee was extremely impressed both by the scale and the range of the engagement of Scottish organisations internationally. It believes that Scottish organisations currently make a significant contribution to the Scottish Government’s internationalisation agenda in terms of promoting capability at home through a better understanding of the international environment, and supporting the development of relationships and partnerships outside Scotland. However, the Committee also considers that there is potential to augment this contribution by improved support, greater collaboration and more networking. The following section includes a number of conclusions and recommendations in relation to how Scottish organisations can further promote internationalisation and how that can be supported by the Scottish Government.

Conclusions and Recommendations

6. The inquiry considered the international engagement of organisations in a number of key sectors in Scotland, including universities and colleges; local authorities; the third sector and civil society; and culture and sport. The conclusions and recommendations in relation to these sectors are set out below.
Universities and colleges

7. The Committee considered that the growth in the international engagement of Scottish universities and colleges particularly merits attention. Not only are higher education institutions a key sector of the Scottish economy, but their international activity has makes a major contribution to the Scottish economy. Universities Scotland estimated that the international activity of Scottish universities alone contributed £1.3 billion to the Scottish economy in 2012-13.

8. The growth in the universities and college sector was evident in a number of areas. Firstly, Scottish universities and colleges have been very successful in attracting international students to Scotland to study, although the UK government’s withdrawal of the post-study work visa had had a dramatic impact on the number of students electing to study in the UK. Over 28,500 international students and another 17,000 from Europe are currently studying in Scotland’s 19 higher education institutions from over 180 countries and regions across Asia, Africa, North America, South America, Europe, and Australia. In addition to increasing the revenue of universities and colleges, the numbers of international students coming to Scotland has contributed to the development of more diverse and multicultural environments in Scottish campuses. It has also helped nurture enduring connections between these students and the universities and colleges that they attend, and promoted professional and social relationships.

9. Secondly, Scottish students have benefited from greater opportunities to study abroad, particularly under the auspices of the European Union’s Erasmus scheme. The Committee learned that opportunities to study abroad helped students to improve their language skills, as well as providing them with the confidence to participate in international environments. However, the number of students from Scottish universities travelling abroad to study was far outweighed by those coming to Scotland to study. To address this, some Scottish universities had developed objectives relating to promoting student mobility. For example, the University of the West of Scotland had an objective to ensure that 80% of its students should have an international experience by 2020. The Scottish Government has also set up an Outward Mobility Fund, although universities indicated that this would provide greater support if it had a longer-term funding period than currently.

10. Thirdly, Scottish universities and colleges have initiated a large number of projects overseas, including the establishment of overseas presences and the delivery of programmes at other institutions abroad. For example, Universities Scotland stated that “several institutions including Heriot-Watt University (Dubai and Malaysia), Queen Margaret University Edinburgh, Glasgow Caledonian University (New York) and the Glasgow School of Art (Singapore) have overseas satellite campuses with several others delivering significant levels of provision via a partner organisation including Edinburgh Napier in Hong Kong for over 20 years.”
11. Finally, the Committee heard examples of research partnerships with Scottish universities working with international partners working all over the world in a wide range of fields. Scotland secured £123.5 million of international research funding in 2013-14. In addition, Scottish universities help to secure inward investment in Scotland, with companies such as Daktari, Toshiba Medical, Samsung and GlaxoSmithKline citing Scottish universities as a determining factor in choosing to locate in Scotland.

12. In relation to collaboration on international engagement, the Committee heard evidence from Universities Scotland and the British Council Scotland on a very positive example of collaboration between their organisations and the Scottish Funding Council, Scotland’s enterprise agencies, the Scottish Government and the Royal Society of Scotland in order to promote Scottish universities and research internationally. The Committee believes that collaborative approaches such as this one provide a model for how groups of organisations can work effectively together to achieve greater impact than they would by working bilaterally.

13. The Committee considers that there is considerable potential to build further on the international engagement activities of universities and colleges in Scotland, and encourages the Scottish Government to continue to consider ways that it and its agencies can support the international engagement of universities and colleges. It is further convinced that there are manifold benefits that would derive from expansion of international activity, including significant economic, social and cultural benefits. In that context, the Committee calls on the Scottish Government—

- to consider the comments set out in the summary of evidence about public investment in research (especially funding streams such as the EU programme Horizon 2020) and support for higher education institutions more generally;
- to continue to argue the case for the reintroduction of the post-work study visa as the lack of opportunities to remain in the UK following graduation make it far more difficult to attract international students;
- to increase funding to support the outward mobility of students; and
- to support networks and collaboration that promote international engagement further.

Local authorities

14. The wide range of international activities engaged in by local authorities is described in detail in the summary of evidence attached to this report. Local authorities work not only individually but also collectively under the auspices of COSLA, or through regional collaborations, on European or international engagement. Local authorities work to promote international engagement in a
number of area, including business, trade and investment; culture; twinning; school activities such as language or cultural exchanges. Through these activities, local authorities had established long-standing relationships abroad. Local authorities are also very active at the EU level, with many delivering or participating in EU projects and networks.

15. Local authorities also felt the pressure of resource constraints in relation to their international relations activities. Some expressed an awareness of scepticism of the value of such activities when budgets were stretched. In this context, Highlands and Islands Council indicated that, “proactive support from the Scottish Government would assist in getting the message over that it is actually beneficial for Councils to co-operate and work at on the international stage as long as it is in line with Council objectives and Government strategies and delivers benefits.”

16. The City of Edinburgh Council considered that greater recognition and collaboration with local authorities in the international strategy of the Scottish Government would enhance the delivery of that strategy. The City of Edinburgh Council observed that, “Greater recognition by the Scottish Government, Scottish Development International and Visit Scotland of the contribution which the major cities / local authorities working with their global partners can add – or bring as a lead player with certain geographies – would significantly enhance the delivery of Scotland’s Economic Strategy and Scotland’s International Framework.” Similarly, COSLA stated that, “What might be being missed out on a little is how we make sense of the work of individual local authorities, and local authorities collectively, as it integrates with the broader Scottish work that is carried out by other agencies.”

17. The Committee considers that the range of international activities engaged in by local authorities provides significant opportunities at the local level for people living in Scotland to engage internationally. The Committee also notes that some local authorities are finding it more difficult to continue international engagement activities in the context of shrinking resources. However, the Committee is convinced of the positive opportunities that result from this international engagement, and calls on the Scottish Government to increase its collaboration with local authorities under the auspices of its International Framework with a view to promoting and coordinating international engagement.

International development

18. The Committee recognises the longstanding and very successful commitment of third sector organisations in Scotland to international development. The figures provided to the Committee by the Network for International Development Organisations based in Scotland (NIDOS) testified to the scale of the international development sector in Scotland. NIDOS has a network of 115 member organisations working in at least 142 countries on education and health projects, but also in areas such as gender, agriculture, arts and culture, trade and
sustainable development. In addition, the Scottish Malawi Partnership – a sister organisation of NIDOS – is a coalition of 683 member organisations building partnerships between Scotland and Malawi. The International Development Education Association of Scotland also supports global education work in schools and communities across Scotland.

19. The Scottish Government’s International Development Fund provides grants to projects that are delivered by international development organisations, including under its Small Grants Programmes. There was a recognition that the Scottish Government funding had enabled international development work by Scottish organisations and had supported smaller and medium-sized NGOs in their work. However, a number of international development organisations made suggestions as to how this funding could further promote international development and how the Scottish Government could support the sector more generally.

20. The Committee invites the Scottish Government to consider the following proposals calling for—

- more opportunities to share learning and best practice with the development community, the Scottish Government, donors and other organisations working internationally;
- a streamlining of the application process for major grant applications, with greater flexibility and an increased focus on outcomes in the distribution of projects;
- more innovative and uniquely Scottish projects to be supported;
- longer-term funding to enable demonstration of impact and to facilitate projects which require a longer investment, for example some education projects;
- more effective use of diaspora communities in Scotland to support international development in their countries of origin; and
- the extension of the policy coherence approach in Scottish Government policy areas to ensure that they were coherent with international development objectives; and
- In addition, the Committee recognises the value of the work undertaken by the Centre for Sustainable International Development at the University of Aberdeen, and calls on the Scottish Government to consider the Centres recommendations in relation to the development of a code of conduct for all Scottish agencies working in international development based on the “to do no harm” principle, to support a small number of partner countries with sustainable long-term programmes, and to provide support for Sustainable Development Research and Policy Hubs in key thematic areas where Scotland has a comparative advantage.
Third sector and civil society

21. Third sector and civil society organisations provided evidence to the Committee on Scotland’s role in promoting human rights on an international level, as well as about the engagement of the third sector and civil society in international activities overall. The Committee recognises the range of this engagement and the way in which it contributes to the reputation of Scotland on the international state.

22. It invites the Scottish Government to consider the specific proposal made by Amnesty International Scotland that the Scottish Government should create an international human rights strategy.

23. The Committee heard evidence from civil society organisations testifying to the way in which international cooperation and partnership could bring benefits to organisations and individuals in Scotland, as well as enhancing Scotland’s reputation abroad. A number of third sector organisations in Scotland are active on the EU level. For example, Poverty Alliance is an active member of the European Anti-Poverty Alliance and the Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations participates in the European Network of National Civil Society Organisations. Both of these organisations provided examples of the way in which this cooperation had supported their own organisations work, promoted a sense of solidarity and provided great opportunities to influence European Union policy-making through a collective approach.

24. The Committee recognises that engagement in EU or international networks can provide opportunities for Scottish third sector and civil society organisations to influence the development of policy in these arenas. It therefore calls on the Scottish Government to consider how support can be provided to organisations to encourage a discrete Scottish participation in EU and international networks.

Culture and sport

25. The Committee took evidence on how Scottish cultural and sport organisations use ‘cultural diplomacy’, that is engage in activities that promote an exchange of ideas, values, traditions and other aspects of culture or identity in order to strengthen and promote international cooperation.

26. The Committee heard from a range of cultural and creative bodies about their international work. This included Creative Scotland which told the committee about how it supports the arts, screen and creative industries internationally in order for Scotland to be “a distinctive nation connected to the world”. VisitScotland explained to the Committee how it “helps to position Scotland on the world stage” by bringing in sectors such as arts and crafts, food and drink, cultural activities, sports events and activities, and retail into its work.

27. The British Council argued that cultural diplomacy activities can assist with developing trade and business links by “broadening people’s horizons and
connecting Scots to other countries and cultures” thereby boosting Scotland’s economic prosperity. It also highlighted how it aimed to promote “the best of Scottish culture and learning to the rest of the world by bringing foreign academics, students, policymakers and artists to Scotland and taking counterparts abroad.”

28. EventScotland highlighted a number of key international events that had been held in Scotland and explained how they provided “a significant opportunity to create a narrative about a country internationally” and “allow a country to showcase its assets and project a desired image globally.”

29. The Scottish Government’s International Touring Fund supports the international touring activity of Scotland’s five National Performing Companies. National Theatre of Scotland explained that this had “been a fantastic help to us in achieving the profile that we have.” Other individual performing arts companies provided the Committee with examples of their international engagement either through touring or by participating in joint projects with theatre or dance companies, or with musicians in other countries.

30. The Committee believes that the opportunities for those in the creative sector to showcase their work and perform abroad plays an important role in promoting Scotland through cultural diplomacy. However, it was clear that all of these bodies were dependent on grants to be able to achieve travel, tour or engage in joint projects with international partners. For this reason, more provision of support to organisations to help secure EU or other forms of funding could be valuable.

31. The Committee also believes that Scottish Government funding for performing arts companies has been successful in promoting Scotland internationally and considers that funding for touring is extremely valuable. The Committee wishes to highlight one particular concern raised by Creative Scotland in relation to Scotland’s digital infrastructure. Creative Scotland explained that this was still not strong enough and widespread enough for creative organisations to work collaboratively on digital platforms. The Committee considers that it is regrettable that the creative sector should be let down by infrastructure.

32. Sporting organisations also provided the Committee with examples of international engagement in sport at the professional, amateur and school level which provide intercultural opportunities. sportscotland described Scotland’s sporting international links and its membership of international sports bodies for hockey, athletics and golf. Student Sport Scotland explained that there were a number of international student networks in which Scottish organisations participated. It told the Committee that Scottish sporting institutions “have a long and varied history” of undertaking international expeditions and trips at team and club level, and also of hosting visiting teams and delegations.
33. The Committee welcomes the degree of international engagement that already exists in relation to sport, but notes sportscotland’s comments that “when it comes to grass roots sports development, that which takes place in schools and education, clubs and communities, the picture is less clear about what the appropriate role is for Scotland in international relationships which tends to be more opportunistic and ad hoc”. The Committee considers that participation in sporting events at all levels internationally provides a valuable opportunity for intercultural learning and the opportunity to promote Scotland in the world.

General conclusions

34. Throughout the Connecting Scotland inquiry, the Committee has heard from different sectors that encouraging an international outlook, particularly among Scotland’s young people, is key to increasing international engagement. The Committee recognises that internationalisation has been included as a priority in Scotland’s Economic Strategy, Scotland’s International Framework and Scotland’s International Policy Statement. While this inquiry has provided many positive examples of international engagement, it has also shown that in a time of constrained budgets, it is difficult for many organisations to commit the resources or to prioritise the promotion of international engagement. Nevertheless, the Committee is convinced that to the promotion of internationalisation is an important long-term investment, bringing economic, social and cultural rewards and providing Scotland with an opportunity to transmit its identity on an international stage.

35. The Committee has previously conducted an inquiry into foreign language learning in primary schools and made a series of recommendations relating to the promotion of language learning. This inquiry has reinforced the Committee’s view that language learning, school exchanges, teacher exchanges and opportunities for Scottish students to study abroad play a crucial part in promoting internationalisation among the people of Scotland. The Committee therefore believes that it is crucial that all of these opportunities should continue to be developed in order that Scottish people feel empowered to engage in international environments.

36. A key message that emerged from this inquiry related to the value of collaboration within and between sectors in promoting international engagement. The Connected Scotland initiative has been highlighted as a successful model of collaboration in this report, with the recommendation that the Scottish Government and its agencies should consider how they can further promote collaboration, networks and support to a range of organisations that could benefit from engaging internationally. The Committee believes that this will help provide an impetus to international engagement across Scotland.
Summary of Evidence

Universities

Background to international activities of Scottish universities

37. The scale of the international activities engaged in by Scottish universities emerged from the evidence collected by the Committee. The University of Edinburgh told the Committee that the university sector is the third biggest in Scotland economically,¹ and similarly Universities Scotland said that universities’ international activity could be measured in terms of international export, worth £1.3 billion in 2012-13 to the Scottish economy.²

38. The universities providing evidence to the Committee described the many benefits of internationalisation for their sector, both economic and otherwise. For example, Heriot-Watt University stated that it had identified “significant benefits” including —

- The creation of a diverse, multi-cultural environment on campus;
- Enhanced opportunities for international collaboration in teaching and research;
- Opportunities for students to acquire the graduate attributes which prepare students for entry to global workplace and are proven to be valued by employers;
- Enhancement of the student experience, with opportunities for international mobility.³

39. Additionally, Heriot-Watt University set out how the activities of a Scottish university could create benefits for its overseas partners—

The contribution of internationalisation extends into the wider economy, benefiting Scotland and the UK, but also the overseas locations where Heriot-Watt University is a significant organisation and employer. As an example, Heriot-Watt University Malaysia has been recognised by the Malaysian Government as an economic development project, with a special project status and related targets and support to help the University as its operation develops.⁴
International strategy

40. Scotland’s universities have developed international strategies to advance and focus their international activities. For instance, the University of Glasgow described how it had developed its international strategy—

In 2010 a focused and ambitious international strategy was developed, concentrating on growing our international student body and our global research partnerships as well as re-thinking the curriculum and how we provide an excellent student experience.\(^5\)

41. Similarly, the University of the West of Scotland told the Committee that its Global Reach Enabling Plan aims to ensure that 80% of students should have an international experience by 2020. It aims to do this by—

- Developing UWS as a global brand
- Internationalising the student body, staff and University culture
- Internationalising the student experience
- Developing strong strategic partnerships.\(^6\)

International student recruitment

42. Statistics testify to the attraction of Scotland as a location for international students. Over 28,500 international students and another 17,000 from Europe are currently studying in Scotland’s 19 higher education institutions from over 180 countries and regions across Asia, Africa, North America, South America, Europe, and Australia.\(^7\)

43. International students provide important revenue for Scottish universities (the sector told the Committee this equated to £377 million in fees). In the example of Heriot-Watt University, around 40% of total annual revenue comes from overseas activities.\(^8\) The University of Glasgow wrote that its international students, which currently number almost 4,300, “directly contributed around £60M in 2014/15, and using the BIS multiplier of 1.78, their overall worth to the Scottish economy is around £167M.”\(^9\)

44. Universities also described the non-economic benefits of international student recruitment such as the social and cultural benefits, and the global perspective deriving from learning in community of international students. In addition, after graduation, international students create a global alumni to build Scotland’s “soft power”.\(^10\)

45. The University of Glasgow described the benefits of having an international student community in Scotland—
These international students are important in many different ways, most importantly adding cultural diversity to the learning and teaching environment across the campus. These students also help to foster research links with other world leading Universities and with international businesses and organisations after graduation, a crucial objective for a research intensive University such as Glasgow. 📚

Transnational education (TNE) and overseas campuses

**46.** Transnational Education (TNE) refers to the provision of education qualifications from institutions in one country (in this case, Scotland) to students in another country. It is currently worth £13.7 million in Scotland. A number of Scottish Higher Educational Institutes (HEI) institutions have overseas campuses. China is the most popular site followed by India. Malaysia, Singapore and the USA are also common locations for Scottish derived TNE.

**47.** Universities Scotland cited some of the benefits of TNE, explaining that it “satisfies the demand that growing economies have for world-class higher education and builds opportunities for mobility, developing joint programmes and research partnership links”. 😊 In this context, the University of the West of Scotland described the importance of building “a global brand, which will attract students to undertake our degrees and professional development opportunities across the globe.” 🌍

**48.** The Committee visited Glasgow School of Art (GSA) in June 2015 on a fact-finding case study visit to hear from the Singaporean students and GSA staff involved in GSA’s TNE overseas campus in Singapore, which is run in collaboration with the Singapore Institute of Technology. In this GSA case study, the curriculum is identical to that run by GSA, but importantly allows for a cultural context. Seven full time, permanent members of GSA teaching staff are based in Singapore, and other GSA staff visit periodically. The Singaporean students spend three weeks in Scotland at GSA as part of their course in their third year. Programme delivery is in collaboration with both GSA campuses - teaching material and projects are shared, and staff travel to both campuses to deliver programme content and share good practice within studio-based teaching.

**49.** As well as overseas campuses, Scottish HEIs are delivering an increasing number of TNE programmes through online learning, mostly for post-graduate qualifications, and also through Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs) (such as the University of Aberdeen’s MOOC on sustainable development described later in this report), which make higher education freely available globally to large numbers of students. 😊

Student mobility

**50.** HEIs said that international activities led to greater mobility of students in terms of students at Scottish HEIs undertaking study abroad. Universities Scotland said that the range of student exchange schemes and scholarships was hard to
quantify, but included the Scottish Government’s Saltire Scholarship Scheme and the Outward Mobility Fund, and the EU funded programmes Erasmus/Erasmus+ within Europe.\textsuperscript{15}

51. As an example of student mobility, the University of the West of Scotland’s (UWS) participation in these scheme includes 100 partnerships across Europe for Erasmus+. In 2014/15, UWS has grown its outward bound mobility by 23% on the previous year, with approximately 50 UWS students benefitting from funding from the Scottish Government Outward Mobility Fund. UWS were successful in obtaining three match funding grants in 2014/15, and the groups of participating students will be visiting Slovenia, France/Spain and Germany.\textsuperscript{16}

Research partnerships

52. Universities emphasised the global nature of their research work, and the increased ability to conduct research as a result of internationalisation. Universities Scotland said that Scotland universities had a high rating globally for research performance, and a good success rate at competing for international funding (for example, Scotland obtained £123.5 million of international research funding in 2013-14).\textsuperscript{17}

53. The Committee heard of numerous examples of Scottish universities working with international partners in many fields including medicine, aquaculture and climate change. For example, the University of Dundee told the Committee of its Drug Discovery Unit, a biotech company within the University which focussed on the world’s most neglected diseases including malaria, with the clinical development of anti-malarial therapy. International investment makes up 30% of the funding. The Unit is collaborating with institutes in the Bangalore Biocluster in India on translation of basic research on new therapies to address microbial resistance, which includes joint drug discovery programmes and shared information and tools.

54. The University of Dundee pointed out that international research collaborations at Scottish universities brought a number of benefits to the Scottish economy and society. Collaborations could be between individual researchers, or between institutions, or between institutions and other organisations such as businesses or public-private partnerships. Research and development innovation could be exploited to develop new products and services. Businesses can gain competitive advantage through collaborating with universities on research and research-based activities. Good quality research attracts international investment from global research-intensive companies which creates more jobs in Scotland. The value of public monies invested in research was increased by additional funding from the pharmaceutical industry.\textsuperscript{18}

55. Universities Scotland explained the way in which universities engaging in international activities acted as a “magnet for inward investment”. The universities drew investors into Scotland and made a hub of research, innovation and skilled graduates, leading to universities and business working together around certain
industries. Universities Scotland said that universities were working with Scottish Development International and others to develop this approach.\footnote{19}

International development

56. Universities Scotland said that, “Universities see themselves as part of an international community and feel their responsibilities to that community very strongly.” The Committee heard of a range of examples to illustrate the ways in which universities engaged with the international community through international development projects, including teaching, research and knowledge exchange. Stirling University’s researchers are applying their expertise in aquaculture to developing countries in Africa and Asia. The University of Strathclyde supports the MUKTI Project in India which provides free prosthetic and orthotic services and is organised, funds-raised and run by staff and students from the university’s biomedical engineering department.\footnote{20}

57. Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) includes 13 universities among its membership, and the SMP stated that nearly every Scottish university has at least one link to Malawi.\footnote{21} For example, the University of Glasgow has nine different Malawi projects, including Students Volunteer Abroad which supports students to volunteer in Malawi, working with local communities on sustainable projects for the relief of poverty.\footnote{22}

58. The University of Aberdeen is home to the Centre for Sustainable International Development, established in 2010. It described its international development engagement thus—

\begin{quote}The University of Aberdeen has been playing a significant part in supporting the international development agenda. Through partnerships with Universities in the global South, Scotland and elsewhere, with business and civil society, we contribute to research, innovation, capacity building, policy formation and evaluation in international development.\footnote{23}\end{quote}

59. The Centre describes itself as the only centre in Scotland to focus on sustainable international development, and runs an annual undergraduate interdisciplinary course in this subject. The Centre has recently launched a MOOC, \textit{Africa: Sustainable Development for All?}, which aligns with key elements of the global development agenda known as the Sustainable Development Goals.

60. The Centre has conducted a mapping exercise of the international development activities that take place in Scottish Higher Educational Institutions. The outcome of the exercise contained several recommendations to the Scottish Government. This included the recommendation that Scotland’s research base should be strengthened through further support/funding for Sustainable Development Research and Policy Hubs in key thematic areas where Scotland has a comparative advantage. These key thematic areas included: climate justice, global health, equity, social inclusion and social justice.
61. Other recommendations to the Scottish Government were to “develop a code of conduct for all Scottish agencies … working in international development based on the principle of “To do no harm” with demonstrated capacity building and for sustainability”, and to “support a small number of partner countries with sustainable long-term programmes for greater impact and not spread support too thinly”.

62. The Centre said that although partnerships already exist between HEIs, “one of the key challenges in sustainable development is lack of coherence between interventions and policy”. It suggested that sustainable development work in Scotland could be improved by creating a stronger mechanism for partnership working—

One solution is the proposed Sustainable Development Research and Policy Hubs, but these are suggested along thematic lines…Consideration should therefore be given for a mechanism to bring all Scottish HEIs working in international development together (virtually), in a Scottish Sustainable Development Institute. This would permit more cross-disciplinary learning and build our capacity for research and learning so we are better able to compete on a level playing field with other UK-based international development institutes such as, the Institute for Development Studies (IDS) and the Overseas Development Institute (ODI). Such an institute should also include key players from business, the private sector and civil society so that there is capacity to respond in a meaningful manner to the broad-based post-2015 development agenda. The principles of justice, equity and social inclusion could be embedded in the Institute to reflect Scotland’s commitment to eradicate poverty and promote fairer and more just societies.

Connected Scotland and other collaborative partnerships

63. A number of universities told the Committee that collaborative partnerships helped them to pool resources more effectively. One of the main examples that the Committee heard about was Connected Scotland, which is a collaborative venture between partner organisations that have joined forces to better promote Scotland’s universities globally. The partners are Universities Scotland, the British Council Scotland, Scottish Funding Council, Scotland’s enterprise agencies, the Scottish Government and the Royal Society of Scotland. Universities Scotland cited an example of a Connected Scotland scoping mission to Indonesia in 2013 which had brought increased links between that country and Scottish universities.

64. The University of Glasgow referred to various collaborations between Scottish universities such as the Scottish Universities International Group (SUIG), which is responsible for coordinating aspects of Scottish universities international work and the North American Recruitment Group—
Other collaborative bodies such as the North American Recruitment Group (NARG) have led the way in innovative recruitment activities for Scotland across North America, so much so that other regions of the UK have mimicked this collaborative approach in recent years, i.e. Welsh HEIs, the Northern Consortium and a group of London institutions.28

Scottish universities also described their use of overseas offices which furthered their collaborative networks amongst other benefits. For example, Heriot-Watt University has an office in China with three staff who help manage partner relationships and recruitment to the Heriot-Watt campuses.29

Several universities recognised that Connected Scotland has helped to align the activities of key stakeholders groups, but said that there was still room for improvement. Heriot-Watt University said that further collaboration with public agencies and the Scottish Government would assist Scottish HEIs in their work, suggesting specifically—

Ministerial endorsement of major projects/developments within the context of the Government’s International Development Framework.

A coordinated approach across the agencies that operate in the international sphere. ... This would help avoid duplication and help ensure cohesion of messages and activities.30

Regarding a coordinated approach between universities and other sectors, the University of Stirling said that “SDI have been extremely useful in this regard and have provided excellent on the ground assistance in market with the scoping out of new international opportunities. Assistance with funding has also been provided in some instances.” However, that university said that it would find it helpful to have a coordinated approach, specifically “a list of planned upcoming visits, inward missions and broader Scotland-wide initiatives/activities so that institutions could plan ahead of time if and how best to engage”.31

The University of the West of Scotland (UWS) stated that collaboration between Scottish universities could be improved by greater cooperation between the Scottish institutions internationally, specifically with a “stronger, better funded over-arching body such as Universities Scotland with a wider remit (along the lines of DAAD … ) would be of benefit to all.”32

The German Academic Exchange Service or in German, Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst (DAAD) model referred to by UWS above, describes its activities as supporting—

“Over 100,000 German and international students and researchers around the globe each year – making it the world’s largest funding organisation of its kind. We also promote internationalisation efforts at German universities, help
developing countries build their own systems of higher education, and support German Studies and German language programmes abroad.\textsuperscript{33}

70. UWS said whilst certain of the services provided by DAAD are replicated by various organisations in the UK, the German model had additional benefits such being an internationally recognised brand, acting as an one stop shop, and acting as a draw for both public and private funding.

71. Universities Scotland said that long term investment was needed in collaborative endeavours in order to be effective internationally. This applies to institutions themselves, and to the organisations and agencies that support them.

Other international activities

72. Other examples given by Universities Scotland of international activities in its sector include country specific Institutes (like the Confucius Institutes across Scotland in Edinburgh, Strathclyde, Aberdeen, Glasgow and Heriot-Watt University), and subject specific centres like SCILT (Scotland's National Centre for Languages), which promotes and supports the delivery of high quality language learning.\textsuperscript{34}

Barriers to international engagement

73. Universities identified a number of barriers to their sector’s contribution to international engagement, namely funding, low numbers of Scottish students going abroad, and immigration policy.

Funding

74. Cuts to funds are a major issue, both in public investment and via EU funding. Universities Scotland argued that—

\textsuperscript{35} Ensuring that universities remain competitively funded on an international level is essential. Institutions would like to be making strategic investments now that would safeguard their international competitiveness long into the future. Public investment is essential to this and the reality is this is under constant pressure. Recurrent grants for higher education research are decreasing in cash terms, grants for teaching have decreased in real terms and the capital budget has fallen by more than 75 per cent since 2009/10.\textsuperscript{36}

75. The University of Dundee said that cuts in public funding for research meant Scotland lagged behind its competitors, and put a limit on the number of PhDs that could be offered, despite PhD students driving the research pipeline.\textsuperscript{36} Universities told the Committee that £14 million was cut last year which universities perceived as a self-defeating cut as every £1 of funding generated by Scottish universities generates another £2 in competitive research grants.\textsuperscript{37}

76. The University of Dundee stated that total public expenditure on research and development is currently 0.6% of GDP; comparatively the US and French
governments both spend 0.9% of GDP on R&D. The UK is currently producing over 10% of global scientific output with only 1% of the global population, despite spending less on science per capita than most of its competitors.  

77. The European Commission’s new European Fund for Strategic Investments (EFSI) is reallocating funds from the Horizon 2020 programme for research and development. Universities Scotland expressed its concerns that the EFSI reallocation would reduce Scotland’s share of the Horizon 2020 funds (which were worth £636 million to Scotland during the previous programme period of 2007-13).

78. Since its discussions with the universities sector, the Committee notes that the EFSI reallocation from Horizon 2020 has been reduced by €153m (£108.8m) from €317.9m (£226.2m) to €164.9m (£117.3m), meaning the reduction in Horizon 2020 funds is not likely to be as large as initially thought. Additionally, the Committee notes that three of the five Horizon 2020 budget lines will not be reduced at all, specifically: ‘Strengthening frontier research in the European Research Council’, ‘Marie Sklodowska-Curie actions’ and ‘Spreading excellence and widening participation’.

Low numbers of students going abroad

79. Universities highlighted that take up of opportunities for studying abroad amongst Scottish students was low compared with the inward numbers of international students coming to Scotland. Cost and language were cited as the two most likely reasons for this.

80. Additionally, Universities Scotland suggested that the rate was even lower for Scottish students from disadvantaged backgrounds. Universities Scotland recognised the Scottish Government’s efforts to remedy this, but explained that the year-to-year nature of funding created difficulties—

"The Outward Mobility Fund supported by the Scottish Government has a widening access dimension to it which is welcome. However, the instability of the year-to-year nature of the fund makes it difficult for institutions to engage with strategically and is limiting its effectiveness. Commitment to the relatively low level of funding for a minimum of three/five years would allow institutions to invest time, energy and long-term funding into projects that would have a chance of delivering benefit for students."

81. The University of the West of Scotland asked for “increased funding to support outward bound mobility”, alluding to its success in applying for funds from the Scottish Government Outward mobility fund, particularly for those students who “would not have benefitted from such an experience during their studies, due to economic, linguistic and other barriers.”

82. Universities Scotland told the Committee that it were aware of these issues and had strategies to tackle these problems. Heriot-Watt University said that it was establishing ‘The Heriot-Watt Global Student Programme’, due to be launched in
September 2015, which is designed to facilitate and encourage greater mobility across the University's campuses as well as with exchange partners in Europe and beyond. Additionally it had conducted research to highlight the benefits of mobility—

Research has highlighted the benefits to graduates who have acquired a global outlook and some international experience when they move into their careers. The International Unit report: “Gone International: Mobile students and their outcomes” sets out the findings of their research based on a cohort study of 2012/13 graduates. The key findings, comparing mobile and non-mobile students’ outcomes, show that, six months after graduating:

- A lower proportion of graduates who were mobile were unemployed.
- A higher proportion of graduates who were mobile were working abroad, if in employment.
- On average, graduates who were mobile earned more across 11 out of 17 subject area.
- Graduates who were mobile earned more if they remained in the UK to work.
- Graduates who were mobile were earning more in 40 out of 67 subjects.\(^{41}\)

Post-study work visa

83. Another major barrier to international engagement was changes to immigration policy resulting in an end to the post-study work visa. The post study work visa allowed international students to remain in the UK for two years after graduating from a UK university. Scottish universities told the Committee of the damaging impact of the abolition of the post-study work visa.

84. For example, Heriot-Watt University said—

A key issue for success is ensuring that Scotland is seen as a welcoming destination for overseas students and staff, that we are outward looking and international. Other countries adopt positive immigration policies which welcome talented people and support internationalisation across higher education in terms of staff and student mobility. The recent call to reinstate post study work visas in Scotland is most welcome, recognising that international students benefit Scotland’s economy, society and culture.\(^{42}\)

85. Universities Scotland suggested that there should be a change to immigration policy to—

… allow the re-introduction of post-study work arrangements that allowed Scottish universities to make a competitive offer on par with those in Australia, Canada and New Zealand would give Scotland the potential to grow international student numbers at a rate faster than the current plateau.
This is well documented by the Scottish Parliament and there is cross-party support for the Smith Commission’s recommendation for the reintroduction of a post-study work route for Scotland. However it is worth noting again because of the current policy’s damaging impact on our institutions. However if this is achieved (whether at a UK or Scottish level) a change would help the sector to improve our growth in international student recruitment.  

**Colleges**

**Coordinating the approach to international activities**

86. Like the university sector, many colleges have created a staff post and/ or a strategy to co-ordinate their international activities. For example, Forth Valley College has recently appointed an International Development Manager to lead their new international office and manage the college’s international activities and delivery of a newly developed international strategy. Its new strategy focuses on Business Engagement, Strategic Partnerships, Student Recruitment and Staff and Student Mobility. Dundee and Angus College has an International Manager coordinating their activities, and an international and European strategy “with more than 21 European projects that span Erasmus+, Interreg and mobility projects’’ as well as participating on the Scottish Government’s Saltire Scholarship Scheme.

**EU funding**

87. Several colleges highlighted their participation in various EU funding programmes. Some had found it a difficult process such as West Lothian College which said that it had applied for the Erasmus and Leonardo EU funding programmes to give its students the opportunity of a programme or work experience in other countries, but had found it “time consuming and costly in staff hours”. Other EU funding utilised by Scottish colleges included Horizon 2020 and Erasmus +.

**Networks for international working**

88. The colleges sector has two main network organisations, the West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership (WoSCoP) and Colleges Scotland, both of which aim to assist colleges with their international activities. For example, WoSCoP works at a strategic level to work with other network organisations internationally to “identify and foster opportunities for collaborative activities in order to develop bids for European and transnational funding”, and provides a Scottish perspective in international forums. At an operational level, WoSCoP helps college staff to develop international engagement and funding, and provides advice.

89. WoSCoP said that the international activities of Scottish colleges were very varied and included—

… providing international students with articulation pathways to the second and third year of university degree programmes and beyond, working with international employers and educational institutions in other countries to
introduce new occupational training programmes and qualifications, organising and implementing transnational academic and vocational mobility opportunities for students and staff in member colleges and other Scotland-based organisations, developing innovative language learning applications, collaborating with transnational partners to develop learning in entrepreneurship and support business incubation and participating in relevant European and international networks.  

90. WoSCoP identified that a key reason for international activities in colleges was economic, namely generating income “to meet the gap in funding that exists between the annual operating costs of colleges and the funding received from Scottish Government via the Scottish Funding Council”.  

91. WoSCoP also identified educational reasons for these activities including—

- working collaboratively with partners in other countries to exchange effective practice in teaching, learning and assessment; developing new and joint curricular offers; enriching staff development and other CPD opportunities; cooperating on action research to foster innovation and knowledge transfer; exploring novel approaches to widening access and improving student retention; enhancing students’ employability, through work placements in other countries; exploring new approaches to building learners’ capacities in literacy, numeracy, digital, foreign language and other key competences; improving school-college-industry partnerships through exchanging relevant experiences and practice; and developing new skills for new jobs.  

92. Several colleges highlighted their experiences of working with international partners to deliver educational programmes. Perth College UHI (the University of the Highlands and Islands) said that it was important for it to “build up a portfolio of international partners to enhance the international reputation of Perth College and UHI, increase the diversity of our student population and increase our income from this activity.” This college utilised the partnerships to develop different delivery of teaching such as a dual degree between Perth College UHI and Henan Institute of Engineering in China.  

Barriers to international activities

93. One major issue facing colleges when carrying out international activities was the fluctuation in the global economy or political change within other countries. West Lothian College said that working with international partners could be “beneficial but unpredictable”, giving the specific example of working with an organisation in Egypt which they “could not follow through …due to civil unrest on Cairo”.  

94. Another issue facing Scottish colleges was how to explain what a Scottish college was globally. WoScoP explained that using an Erasmus charter had helped to translate—
One problem is that, although everyone knows what a school is and what a university is, there is no global equivalent of what a college is here. In WOSCOP, we have tried to tackle that by ensuring that every one of our colleges has an Erasmus charter for higher education, because everyone in the world knows what that is and it gets a college through the door.\(^{53}\)

95. WoSCoP and Colleges Scotland highlighted that college reform and regionalisation had led to differences in funding structure for colleges regarding their international activates. Colleges Scotland explained the main changes—

These significant changes brought several areas of complexity as well greater accountability to the Scottish Government. Today, colleges now have to consider carefully what international activity, including recruiting overseas students is part of their delivery plan. Any commercial income streams received are considered in addition to the grant funding received from the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) and a college would need to spend this income in the same year, otherwise the college would need to sterilise the cash and would not be able to use it or move the monies into an arms length foundation.\(^{54}\)

96. Perth College UHI said that the restricted timeframe of one year for use of commercial income had caused problems, and meant they could not use it for longer term investment—

… colleges have been reclassified by the Office for National Statistics and we are now regarded as arm’s-length bodies of central Government.

That means that we act like chickens without heads and try to get rid of the money quickly in order not to lose it. The alternative … is that we can sterilise the cash … which includes international fees, by transferring it to arm’s-length foundations and bringing it back out again. The complications that are arising are hampering our ambition.

It is not that we disagree with the classification; it is that we disagree with the fixes that have been put in place by the Government … there is no joined-up thinking about how we can usefully reinvest that money in our college premises for the benefit of all our students, which is why we were trying to generate income in the first place.\(^{55}\)

97. West Lothian College also highlighted the short-term nature of current funding arrangements saying that it was “very difficult to plan beyond an 18-month or two-year cycle” and that it “almost everything that we are doing is being supported by short-term funding applications, Erasmus being our largest funder”.\(^{56}\)
Reduction in international students

98. Colleges Scotland said that “Over the years, the number of EU/European students has fallen significantly. As colleges have reduced their student recruitment activity outside Scotland, this likely accounts for a portion of that fall.”

99. For example, West Lothian College has decided to not actively recruit students from overseas due to the demands on resources—

   We have concluded that this type of activity would only be cost effective if taken forward on a large scale and within a specialist area of activity.

100. As an alternative, that College considers applications from international students on an individual basis, and thus deals with small numbers.

101. Perth College UHI said that an obstacle to recruiting international students has been “getting the Chinese students to the right level of English to come to study in the UK” which they were resolving by working with international partners—

   All of our partners now recognise the criticality of this and are putting significant effort in the early years of their programmes to teaching English. This will be of benefit to all of their students whether they come to the UHI or not in the future.

102. The reduction in numbers of non-UK students attending Scottish colleges from 2009 onwards is shown in the table below provided by Colleges Scotland.

Table 1: No of Non UK Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Type</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>% Change between 09/10 – 13/14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>2223</td>
<td>951</td>
<td>760</td>
<td>682</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>-75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>-81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>2414</td>
<td>2388</td>
<td>1879</td>
<td>1837</td>
<td>1850</td>
<td>-23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: SFC Infact database*

Post-Study Work Visas

103. In relation to the higher education/colleges sector, the Scottish college sector told the Committee that removal of the post-study visas by the UK government is a major issue, and had been a further factor in the reduction of international students coming to Scotland. Colleges Scotland said—

   The abolition of post-study work visas by the UK government in 2012 has been an issue of concern to Scotland’s 26 colleges. These visas allowed graduates to work or set up businesses in the UK for 24 months, which retained skilled and educated graduates as part of the labour force. The post-study work visa...
encouraged international students to come to Scotland as the ability to stay, and work, is an important factor when choosing a place to study.\textsuperscript{60}

104. For example, Perth College UHI said that it had built a productive partnership with Andhra Pradesh in India leading to more than 200 students a year studying its aircraft engineering degree. Under this partnership, the Indian students would work for two years after their degree, “contributing to the Scottish economy as well as undertaking further learning to get an European Aviation Safety Agency part 66 licence, which would license them to work as engineers back in India”.

105. However this arrangement was damaged by the abolition of the visa—

However, we then became subject to changes under .... post-study work visas... because we were then only receiving the same for an international Indian student as we were for a home student, there was no premium for us.

All of a sudden, however, in July one year, the UKVI—I think that it was then the UKBA—said that it wanted an additional £3,000 deposit from Indian families. In other words, the families had not only to vouch for their children being able to pay their fees and to afford to live in Scotland for the years that they were studying but to put in a £3,000 bond. It was a step too far, and those who were in the pipeline dropped out.\textsuperscript{61}

106. As a result, the college said that it will not have any progressing or new international students in 2016-17.

107. Similarly, Forth Valley College said that the visa issue had become a barrier to the college’s international student recruitment, leading to a reactive rather than an proactive, investment approach to their recruitment—

If we speak to any international partner abroad, their first question will be whether we have highly trusted sponsor status and whether we are able to help it with the visa requirements. If the answer is no straight away, it will move on, regardless of the proposition.

That clearly indicates for us that there is a real barrier from UKVI and in the requirements and the onus that are put on colleges to ensure that the applications that they take forward will be ticked off at the Home Office. We have no real control over that. That is why we will remain reactive with our international applications and not invest heavy funds into going abroad and trying to recruit international students ... that is to the detriment of the college sector as a whole. The benefits of the international dimension for any college or institution far outweigh any negatives in the Home Office.\textsuperscript{62}

108. Forth Valley College had developed a strategy to minimise these risks by working with oil, gas and engineering companies to sponsor the students rather than go to the open market for student recruitment.\textsuperscript{63}
109. As in the university sector, the college sector was unanimous that a mechanism to allow students to stay in Scotland after study to work should be introduced. Colleges Scotland called for the re-introduction of the visa—

Colleges Scotland believes that students should be excluded from UK objectives on reducing net migration and that the post-study work visa should be reintroduced. This would encourage more talented people from around the world to further their education in Scotland, enhance our global standing and support economic growth.  

Collaboration

110. The college sector told the Committee that although there was collaboration in the education sector and also between their sector and other sectors, it could be improved.

111. Edinburgh College said that regionalisation of colleges had made it easier for universities to collaborate with colleges. They gave the example of its college forming partnerships with Heriot-Watt University, where it is working with a university in Panama to deliver teacher training, and another partnership with Edinburgh Napier University, where the college are providing courses in English to Saudi-sponsored students so that they can then progress to engineering courses.

112. Edinburgh College told the Committee that there were various forums for collaboration for colleges, schools and universities to collaborate such as the International Directors Forum “which brings together heads of international functions at colleges and universities and involves the British Council and SDI”.

113. Forth Valley College said that there should be better collaboration between college sector and other sectors as was happening in the university sector—

On the initial question whether we could be doing more, I am a great believer in collaboration, but I am not seeing it happening in the college sector. If it does happen, it happens very quietly; we do not seem to shout about it. Meanwhile, our higher education counterparts have the connected Scotland brand, which provides a great opportunity to market the sector to the international student recruitment market. It would be great if there were something similar for the college sector. It might be on the agenda, but I have not heard anything about it.

Strategy for colleges sector

114. The need for greater collaboration was one of the factors causing the college sector to debate whether there was a sufficiently effective strategy for their international activities. There was a difference of views in the college sector regarding such a strategy.
115. Colleges Scotland said that a ‘Framework for the Future of Internationalisation’ for the college sector which guides colleges’ internationalisation had been published in 2014—

"The framework was founded on a number of key principles to which colleges were asked to subscribe to by the Scottish Government, and which sets a standard for the college sector as a whole." 68

116. Perth College UHI said that the restructuring in the college sector had delayed having a strategy, but that it was being taken forward now by Colleges Scotland. 69 In contrast, WoSCoP said that as a result of college regionalisation, colleges were now of “sufficient scale and capacity to be credible players on a European and international plane”, but the sector was limited by “no overarching European or international engagement strategy for the college sector” (beyond that offered by WoSCoP).

117. WoSCoP said that the lack of a strategy meant that “colleges, frequently, do not enjoy the level of policy support that other sectors – for example, health, enterprise, transport and universities – do in pursuing European and international activities”. WoSCoP said this lack of support also meant that colleges did not receive “direct investment of specific funding or other resources to support their international aspirations”.

118. Consequently WoSCoP said that there should be a “coherent and adequately resourced strategy that is informed by and serves national and regional aspirations and needs” 70

"We need a strategy that is driven by the Scottish Government and which helps us articulate a vision of where we want to go, and we should set targets in terms of not only numbers but the quality of things that we would like to do and, perhaps, the countries with which we want to engage. Such a strategy would need to be resourced. There are good examples in Sweden, Finland and Northern Ireland that show that a fairly modest investment can start to make quite significant differences." 71

119. New Lanarkshire College agreed that there was a “lack of a clear and focused approach at a strategic level ... The approach needs to be far more strategically aligned to benefit the sector by working collaboratively”. 72

120. WoSCoP suggested that the Scottish Government should consider the example of Northern Ireland to encourage better and more sustained European and international engagement by colleges in Scotland, citing the policy and financial support that the Department for Employment and Learning in Northern Ireland (DELNI) provides to help its six regional colleges improve their European and international presence and impact—

"WoSCoP ... believes that the recent surge in the Northern Ireland college sector’s impact on a number of EU funding programmes – it is now the best
performer across the sectors in all four UK jurisdictions – has a lot to do with this arrangement.  

121. New Lanarkshire College also advocated the Northern Irish experience as a more strategic approach—

The Northern Irish model of collaborative working shows that those working there understand the smart exploitation of funding and of European activities and programmes that can reap sustainable benefits and can naturally lead on to commercial opportunities for students. Some of the evidence submitted appears to show that here the starting point for internationalisation is international student recruitment and commercial activities, with a sporadic focus on chasing grant money.

122. Commenting on these points, the Scottish Government said—

The sector has undergone very substantial change over the last few years and the priority now is for colleges to embed structural and other reforms. That said, it is for institutions, individually and/or in collaboration with others, to determine their engagement in international markets. Colleges that are internationally active, or who are considering international opportunities, have full access to Scottish Development International export services and products, including strategic development support and wider advice from the Scottish Funding Council. As part of their regular engagement with the colleges the Scottish Government, the Scottish Funding Council, SDI and Colleges Scotland maintain an overview of international activities.

123. The Scottish Government also said that it had “encouraged the colleges to think more collectively about what they do internationally”, and “with the new regionalisation, rather than work individually, colleges might find it easier to work more strategically in that regard”. In addition, the Scottish Government said that it planned to work with the sector more via officials, and also the Scottish Government’s Brussels office “to see what we can do on engagement in the real opportunities that exist particularly in the vocational area now that programmes such as Erasmus have been opened out to that area and to see how colleges can take that forward”.

Local authorities

124. The Committee heard that there was a very wide range of international activities amongst local authorities and their representative bodies such as COSLA, the Highlands and Islands European Partnership (HIEP), the West of Scotland European Forum (WOSEF), the East of Scotland European Consortia (ESEC) and the South of Scotland Alliance (SoSA).

125. Local authorities described how they were working with partners in Scotland, their area and also abroad. A diversity of approaches is taken, depending on factors
such as resources and type of activity. Some authorities such as Glasgow City Council and the City of Edinburgh Council (CEC) have a designated member of staff to focus and coordinate international activities. Typically authorities have a specific framework or strategy to focus and coordinate their international objectives with the Scottish Government. The East of Scotland European Consortium (ESEC) said that—

A lot of local authorities have their own European strategies or international frameworks, which incorporate the Scottish Government’s broader economic strategies and European objectives. A European Union strategy such as Europe 2020, which is about smart, sustainable and inclusive growth, is very much aligned with what the Scottish Government and local authorities are aiming to achieve.  

126. For example, CEC described how it developed its links with China by working with the Scottish Government in the context of the Scottish Government’s China Plan, creating a Memorandum of Understanding between the cities of Edinburgh and Shenzhen at Ministerial level. CEC also arranged a secondment from the Shenzhen government “to secure early and thorough understanding of each other’s creative and tech sectors” paving the way for to an incubation base for small and medium-sized enterprises in Shenzhen. CEC said—

That is a good example of working over a long period, from a very early stage, to develop relations at the governmental level and at the local authority level. Bringing those together can result in a very powerful influence for getting things delivered on the ground.

We will also offer Shenzhen companies the same opportunity in Edinburgh. It is the first time that we have done that, and the initiative has been well supported.

127. The Committee heard evidence from local authorities about the specific benefits of having an international focus or engaging in international activities, which are discussed in more detail below.

Business, trade and investment

128. Authorities highlighted business, trade and investment as one direct benefit of having an international focus. For example, Angus Council said that —

For Angus and Scotland, international engagement is a key component to secure our common future. Jobs, prosperity and quality of life will all be enhanced by collective efforts to engage with the wider world.

129. Aberdeen City Council highlighted the importance that its economic development services gave to developing business, trade and investment support for SMEs to trade internationally and increase their turnover from exports. This included—
130. The economic development service at Aberdeen City Council provides support in a number of different ways including hosting inward business delegations (24 delegations were hosted in 2014) and organising overseas trade missions (7 missions to 5 countries were held in 2014). Other areas of support provided by Aberdeen City Council include promoting the strengths and capabilities of Aberdeen’s businesses, and facilitating direct business to business introductions and links.83

131. Several authorities said that they had a partnership approach with other organisations in their area to attract international business. For example, Glasgow City Council (GCC) said—

For the past two years, we have had a business investment manager who looks solely at inward investment in the city, and they have a small team as well. A lot of Glasgow’s success in attracting conferences, for example, is down to the partnership approach.84

132. Several local authorities utilise membership of partnership organisations to assist them to attract international business and trade. Angus Council said that it is a member of the Scottish Enterprise Tayside Regional Advisory Board, and highlighted that the Tayside International Conference was held in December 2014, which launched a three year internationalisation plan to support businesses in Tayside to become competitive in the international market.85

133. Similarly, Highlands and Islands Council is a member of the Scottish Cities Alliance, which is a collaborative body consisting of Scotland’s seven cities and the Scottish Government, hosted by the Scottish Council for Development & Industry (SCDI) to encourage growth and to attract inward investment from international investment and developer markets.86

Culture

134. As one of Scotland’s largest cities and the location for many cultural festivals, CEC described many examples of cultural activities with an international angle that took place in Edinburgh. CEC highlighted the UNESCO Creative Cities network that it had founded, and its partnership with the Edinburgh UNESCO City of Literature Trust to develop the UNESCO Creative Cities network which includes 11 designated cities. Other cities are bidding to join the growing network such as Barcelona, Baghdad and Kampala, with Edinburgh coordinating as a hub. The network has allowed Edinburgh to develop cultural projects with the other city members, most recently a showcase of Krakow writers at the Edinburgh International Book Festival in August 2014 and a showcase of Edinburgh writers in Krakow in October 2014. CEC described the benefits of this network—
This work positions Edinburgh as an innovative, world leading literary capital, promoting our literary excellence to the world, supporting literary tourism for the capital, and providing opportunities for organisations and individuals in Edinburgh.87

135. In another example, CEC described its work with a range of partners including consulates and arts bodies to develop a mutually beneficial relationship with Florence. Florence and Edinburgh recently celebrated the 50th year of this relationship with a range of events across the two cities. CEC described the contribution that a particular event on an Italian war poet made to both cities—

The project highlighted the value of transnational relationships and the opportunity for learning and sharing in the difficult subject of war. The project also emphasised the importance of language and the expression of self alongside the value of literature and cultural heritage—a strategic interest for both historic cities. The project additionally drew on both cities’ strengths as members of the UNESCO Creative Cities network. 88

136. Other local authorities described a range of cultural projects undertaken with international cooperation and/or funding, and the contribution this brought to their area. Argyll and Bute Council said—

Film in Argyll and Bute is part of the Scottish Film Locations Network, which is a partnership with the Scottish Film Commission. Through this we have links to the European Film Commission and work internationally to promote Argyll and Bute to, and answer screen enquiries from, Europe and wider. This often leads to productions from Europe and wider, using Argyll and Bute as a location.89

137. ESEC described the high profile, cultural relationship between the Perthshire town of Dull and the town of Boring in Oregon, who were later joined by the farming community of Bland in New South Wales. These relatively small communities have attracted widespread national media coverage of their three countries by creatively forming a “League of Extraordinary Communities” as a means of forging cultural connections, encouraging travel and promoting all three geographic areas—

The difference in population means that they cannot be officially twinned, nevertheless cultural connections...are strong. After forging the link in 2012, the governor of Oregon officially declared 9 August as Boring and Dull Day across the entire state and they celebrate it annually, including by holding a party with a Scottish twist.90

Influencing European policy

138. Scotland has a number of organisations which represent the interests of Scottish local authorities, and can assist local authorities to influence European policy.
COSLA represents local authorities throughout Scotland, and HIEP, WOSEF, ESEC and SoSA represent specific geographic areas.

139. WOSEF said that COSLA took the lead in such representation—

Given the growing impact of EU policies and legislation on local authority operations, a need to influence EU decision making at source has been identified. Much of this has been carried out on behalf of Scottish local authorities as a whole via COSLA.\(^{91}\)

**COSLA**

140. COSLA stated that it is “the representative voice of Scottish Local Authorities at a Scottish, UK and international level”, and that it aims to ensure that Scottish local authorities are not disproportionately or specifically affected by decisions made at EU level.\(^{92}\)

141. COSLA nominates and supports the local authority councillors who represent Scotland on EU bodies at a regional level, such as the Committee of the Regions, and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe. COSLA is the Scottish member of the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR), the European level umbrella body for local authorities, and chairs the CEMR Expert Group on Territorial Cohesion and Local Development bringing together experts on Structural Funds and rural development across the EU.

142. COSLA also works on further engagement opportunities at an EU level, including through the Scottish Locally-Engaged European Representatives (SLEER) Group to which all councillors who have an EU role or mandate are invited to attend.

143. For direct influence on EU policy, COSLA has a Brussels based office to focus on EU policy development, acting as a hub between member councils and the Scottish and UK Governments, and allowing it to network at an EU level. COSLA also communicates with its local government associations in other countries.

144. COSLA is the official Scottish coordinator for town twinning and of the EU Covenant of Mayors. It also facilitates visits of officer and delegations to Brussels as well as facilitating delegations visits to Scotland, which—

… allow us to draw useful ideas for policy development – indeed we drew heavily from the suggestions from our peers to formulate submissions to the Commission on Strengthening Local Democracy in Scotland, the Smith Commission and the new Commission on Local Finances.\(^{93}\)

**Other representative bodies**

145. Four organisations represent four geographical areas of Scotland, west, east, south and the Highland and Islands. ESEC represent eight authorities and 46% of Scotland’s population. WOSEF represents 12 authorities together with a number
of other regional organisations such as Strathclyde Partnership for Transport. SOSA comprises two authorities and Scottish Enterprise. HIEP comprises eight authorities, Highlands & Islands Enterprise (HIE) and the University of the Highlands and Islands (UHI).

146. These organisations aim to identify and influence European policy that affect Scotland, maximise EU funding opportunities, promote joint working amongst local authorities and networks at Scottish, UK and EU levels, and to raise the profile of their areas. HIEP has an office in Brussels in Scotland House to maximise the benefits of the EU to its region.

147. However, WOSEF said that in practice it “has very limited capacity to engage in European activity”\(^{94}\), and that it could “cover only European issues, not wider international issues”\(^{95}\) —

In practice the Forum’s current workplan, adopted in 2010, has focussed almost exclusively on the 2014-20 Structural Fund Programmes (including however the relevant transnational and interregional structural I, fund programmes) and the review of the European Commission’s Regional Aid Guidelines.\(^{96}\)

Access to European funding

148. The Committee heard that EU funds were of great importance to authorities, and varied in type dependent on the needs of their area, and included the LEADER Rural Development Programme, the European Regional Development Fund, the INTERREG (European Territorial Cooperation) IVC programmes, the European Social Fund, and transnational EU funding.

149. Witnesses to the Committee said that accessing European competitive funding could be difficult, but that it was hoped that the new Scottish EU funding portal developed by Scotland Europa in partnership with local government partners would help. ESEC said—

Accessing European funding is difficult, as there are approximately 40 different programmes, all of which have different eligibility requirements, budget structures et cetera. Recently, Scotland Europa, along with WOSEF, ESEC and the Scottish Government, developed an EU funding portal, which will act as a one-stop shop with information on all the different funding programmes. It will also include a database of all the previous projects—approximately 4,000—that have been funded by Europe, with details of the different sectors and partners.\(^{97}\)

150. A number of authorities and representative organisations told the Committee of the especial importance of EU funding to rural areas. Several authorities described their successful collaborative projects with other countries in the LEADER\(^{98}\) Rural Development Programme, such as Aberdeenshire Council’s activities with Finland on rural community projects.\(^{99}\)
151. The Outer Hebrides LEADER Local Action Group is a public-private partnership which manages and administers the local LEADER programme on behalf of the Outer Hebridean community. The Group described the contribution that LEADER made to Scotland by developing the rural economy—

... the LEADER approach builds social and economic capital and is also about the added value that flows from the bottom-up and partnership approach with better identification of local needs and local solutions, more engagement on the part of local stakeholders and greater scope for innovation. A key feature of this is the cooperation element of the programme.

... by way of illustration in the 2007-2013 Programme the Outer Hebrides LEADER LAG supported one project with Ceolas (a local cultural, heritage and arts organisation) who have strong links with the islands diaspora and they were investigating similar Oral Song Traditions in Finland and Brittany against the Gaelic traditions in Uist and therefore heritage and language were the main components of this co-operation. 100

152. The Outer Hebrides LEADER Local Action Group said that the Scottish Government had committed more resources to local actions groups like itself by employing dedicated personnel to assist with developing projects, and covering 10% of the costs when designing and developing projects.

153. Angus Council was lead partner of a three year European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) project, Rural Tourism Business Support, supporting SMEs across the east of Scotland in the key sectors of golf, food and drink, outdoor tourism and heritage, and is a partner in the ERDF funded East Coast Renewables project. Under this project Angus Council organised a learning journey to the world Sustainable Energy Days Conference in Wels, Austria for a number of companies. 101

154. In a more urban example, Dundee City Council participated in a INTERREG IVC project led by Dundee and Angus College, encouraged by the potential to support economic sustainability in the creative industries sector—

The InCompass Project sought to develop policy solutions to support the self-sustainability of creative incubator units and enable them to develop and share innovative methods to move away from a general dependence on public funding. The partnership consisted of 14 partners in 11 countries across Europe and in undertaking a range of study visits and workshops the city was able to develop a new action plan to support the creative industries sector. 102

155. From the year 2000 to the present, additional funding accessed through the European Social Fund (ESF) has assisted 580 unemployed people in the Falkirk Council area, who are the most disadvantaged in the labour market, to access employment and training support. A further 180 young people will be supported
into employment through targeted interventions and gain a vocational qualification.\textsuperscript{103}

Transnational EU Funding

156. Some EU funding programmes are set up on a transnational basis, creating partnerships between Scotland and other countries in the EU. WOSEF said it had publicised these opportunities to its member authorities, and described how several authorities had benefited in the Sail West Project under the Cross Border programme as about 2.5% of the Structural Funds budget was allocated to “European Territorial Cooperation” (INTERREG Programmes)—

\begin{quote}
... This involved North and South Ayrshire Councils together with Argyll and Bute Council (plus Highland and Dumfries and Galloway Councils from other parts of the eligible area in Scotland). The ultimate goal of the project is to create a marine leisure centre of excellence in the coastal zone that will help to rejuvenate local communities through the provision of new employment opportunities.\textsuperscript{104}
\end{quote}

157. SOSA described other European cooperative programmes which had encouraged economic development in its area—

\begin{quote}
CREATE (Connecting Rural Enterprise for A Transnational Economy) is an innovative new project joining a group of like-minded organisations spanning public sector authorities, private sector representative groups, and business development agencies. The six partner organisations are from France, the UK, Ireland and Belgium, who share a joint vision of encouraging economic development.
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
CREATE looks to overcome the barriers to growth and competitiveness experienced by SMEs in predominantly rural areas. These barriers include geographic isolation, lack of infrastructure, lack of scale, poor joint working opportunities and critically, lack of ICT expertise. Faster broadband and advanced ICT have the potential to overcome these barriers and transform the productivity of rural SMEs.\textsuperscript{105}
\end{quote}

158. WOSEF highlighted the role of the Scottish Network on European Territorial Cooperation on transnational funding, an informal grouping chaired by the Scottish Government with participation from a number of agencies including Scotland Europa as well as local government.\textsuperscript{106}

159. Smaller authorities found it harder to participate in all the EU opportunities, such as members of SOSA, which said they were limited by resource to participate in transnational funds, but were seeking assistance from Scotland Europa.\textsuperscript{107}

160. WOSEF highlighted the significant time and effort required to make a successful bid for transnational funding, and the potentially low odds of success, stating that—
… success rates vary. In some of the Interreg programmes … in the period 2007 to 2013, the success rate was as low as 10 to 15 per cent. That is the reality of a lot of the competitive EU programmes out there.

Things will not happen just by having a portal. To get the benefits of a worthwhile project requires a significant investment of time, given that the competition for funds in many EU programmes is intense.\textsuperscript{108}

161. CEC said a successful transnational bid needed partnership working between “the experts from the service delivery areas and the EU funding experts to combine forces” and innovation—

The key thing here is innovation. The biggest challenge is for a local authority to have the capacity for innovation to ensure that the bids that we spend a year or more working on are as competitive as they can be.\textsuperscript{109}

International networking

162. As well as being represented by COSLA and other bodies, individual authorities are members of various international networks. Some local authorities are members of international networks with the aim of influencing policy and mutual learning, and dealing with specific issues or types of authority. For example, WOSEF highlighted that—

Argyll and Bute Council is involved in an international network of European regions, the CPMR (Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions), which work together to ensure their common interest and unique geographies are taken into account by the EU institutions and national governments. The policies include regional policy, competition policy and state aids, transportation and fisheries.\textsuperscript{110}

163. Similarly, Highland and Islands Council is a member of the Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions (CPMR); as well as Euromontana; and the North Sea Commission (NSC). This allows it to actively lobby on specific areas of interest which include physical and digital accessibility, energy and climate change.\textsuperscript{111}

164. Both GCC and CEC are members of the European network for large cities, EUROCITIES. CEC said that this “enables matches between city strategies and helps maximise funding potential for projects”.\textsuperscript{112} GCC said it had “secured major international recognition for the City … through its leading positions in EOROCITIES Forums”, and has led the EUROCITIES Key Working Group on economic migration.\textsuperscript{113}

165. Fifteen local authorities are members of the Scotland Malawi Partnership, developing links and international development projects in Malawi such as GCC, who has also developed links with South Africa. GCC has also worked in Sri Lanka with the Hikkaduwa Area Relief Fund which included funding reinstatement
of the local fishing fleet; school refurbishment; tourism development; and an arts-based reconstruction programme.\textsuperscript{114}

**Twinning links**

166. Many authorities provided details of twinning links with international partners. The Twinning Movement started in Europe after the Second World War to increase mutual understanding, respect and tolerance amongst different cultures.

167. Several Scottish areas have twinning links from the war era, such as Dundee City Council’s link with Orléans in France, which originated from a proposal after D-Day that Scottish towns and cities should ‘adopt’ newly liberated French towns and cities. That Council described the benefits of twinning as a “fostering of friendship and understanding” and to “encourage visits by individuals and groups between the cities, developing personal contacts thus broadening understanding of cultural, educational, recreational and commercial activities between the cities”. Since 1946, Dundonians and Orléans citizens have exchanged thousands of visits. The towns will celebrate the 70th anniversary in 2016.\textsuperscript{115}

168. Aberdeen City Council has an International Twinning Budget, which is grant money of up to £7,000 per application to help support Aberdeen City groups or organisations in twin city projects and exchanges.\textsuperscript{116} Fife Council described its Twinning Forum, where the Chairs of the twinning associations convened to present their activities, projects and ideas to their counterparts—

\begin{quote}
This was a great medium to generate ideas and to share information about twinning, for example on new activities, funding or fundraising ideas. The forum met every two months and was eventually replaced by email correspondence to circulate information faster and more frequently, and to save on travel costs and time.\textsuperscript{117}
\end{quote}

169. CEC explained that although its international outlook had been managed historically through arrangements such as twin and partner cities, “the focus today is on effective relationship management, and partnerships and resource sharing for the development and delivery of projects”. Benefits of this approach included supporting flight route development / connectivity, sustaining and delivering investment and profile in economic and cultural spheres, profiling the city and publicising, reaching out for good practice internationally. CEC said that this modern approach was due to limited resource, and that it maximised it resources by joining with others stating that, “Local authorities have limited resources to participate in international activities and thus rely on in-kind staff time, the support of other organisations and EU and other funding opportunities where available”.\textsuperscript{118}

**School activities**

170. Many authorities had other international partnership schemes in their schools, such as Aberdeen City Council’s school partnerships with Clermont-Ferrand, France which led to collaboration on an interactive music exchange project.
Aberdeen has a dedicated Twinning and International Partnerships Officer who works with local schools and the Council’s Education Department to increase the awareness of international cultures and languages, as well as to foster new and existing international links. The Officer also uses twinning to assist with both the ‘Global Citizenship’ strand of the Curriculum for Excellence, and the Scottish Government’s ambitions for increased language learning in schools.  

171. WOSEF described the school activities of its area saying that its authorities had received financial support through various EU funding programmes such as the Lifelong Learning Programme and the Comenius Initiative in 2007-13, and the ERASMUS+ programme in the 2014-20 period which—

- enhance the quality and reinforce the European dimension of school education, in particular by encouraging transnational cooperation between schools and contributing to improved professional development of staff directly involved in the school education sector, and to promote the learning of languages and intercultural awareness.  

172. ESEC explained the benefits of programmes such as ERASMUS—

- ... exchanges such as Erasmus are a great opportunity to introduce young people at an early age to the European Union and the benefits that it can bring. If we explain what the European Union does and its benefits to young people at that age, it will set them up to have less of the ingrained Euroscepticism that some older people might have.  

173. GCC and CEC told the Committee that they endeavoured to attract those from a less privileged background to take part in international school activities, describing the benefits for participants as “huge” and “life changing”—

- Of course, the high flyers get involved, but we try hard to attract people who have perhaps never been abroad or who would never in a million years think that it is something for them. It is a lot of work to get them ready for a visit, but the benefits are huge. There are obvious benefits such as self-esteem and confidence building. We have seen massive changes in people’s outcomes, particularly among young people from seriously deprived backgrounds. For us, the educational exchanges are a really important part of the twin city programme.  

**Barriers to international engagement**

174. Local authorities outlined a number of barriers to international engagement. WOSEF said that—

- Despite the very real benefits from all the activity types ... there are a number of constraints that limit the capacity of local authorities in the West of Scotland to engage in European and International work.
175. WOSEF identified three main barriers to international engagement: capacity issues, the peripheral location of Scotland in Europe (which meant it took longer and cost more to take part in activities in Scotland compared to other European locations), and negative press and public scepticism.

176. The issue of capacity included both financial and human resource limitations such as in the example given by WOSEF above of the difficulties and the low odds of success in applying for transnational funding.\(^{124}\)

177. Highlands and Islands Council also stated that “budget reductions have reduced this ability to undertake this activity”\(^{125}\), and East Lothian Council said—

> In the current financial climate it can be difficult not just to finance programmes of activity but also to commit resources to organising their development in the first place. In addition, there is limited scope to return study visits, despite enthusiastic invitations, which tends to deprive the relationship of reciprocity.\(^{126}\)

178. The Highlands and Islands Council suggested that messages of support from the Scottish Government would help to dispel negative scepticism of international projects—

> There is a view that working in Europe is difficult, and the dissemination of good practice and benefits of working on the European and wider international stages would be beneficial. The pro-active support from the Scottish Government would assist get the message over that it is actually beneficial for Councils to co-operate and work at on the international stage as long as it is in line with Council objectives and Government strategies and delivers benefits.\(^{127}\)

179. CEC also highlighted that greater recognition and inclusion of local authorities in the international plans of the Scottish Government and its agencies would enhance those plans—

> The advantage that a city / local authority has in terms of international relationship management is that the Council is focused on the delivery of practical projects at ‘on the ground’ level and the pooling of goodwill and resources both locally and by the global partner for the long term or for fixed periods of activity. Greater recognition by the Scottish Government, Scottish Development International and Visit Scotland of the contribution which the major cities / local authorities working with their global partners can add – or bring as a lead player with certain geographies – would significantly enhance the delivery of Scotland’s Economic Strategy and Scotland’s International Framework. Consideration should be given to the role of cities / local authorities in helping to drive and facilitate shared and more specific international ambitions by properly resourcing a number of key initiatives.\(^{128}\)

180. COSLA shared this view, saying that it had “communities of practice” on a “knowledge hub” website to share information on a local authority level, but less of this approach when it came to sharing on a wider platform—
What might be being missed out on a little is how we make sense of the work of individual local authorities, and local authorities collectively, as it integrates with the broader Scottish work that is carried out by other agencies.  

181. COSLA also suggested that Scotland could consider practice elsewhere in Europe where local authority associations are formally involved in governmental EU strategies, such as Scandinavia and the Netherlands.

182. East Lothian Council pointed out that language could be another barrier—

- It is noticeable how well many of our visitors (from different countries) speak English, and we do not have the same level of skill in the various different languages of our international partners.

183. Similarly, GCC and CEC stated that more language learning in schools could assist young Scots participating in international activities. GCC said—

- Some of the cultural exchange is missing when our young people do not have the language. Young people always find something in common to communicate with one other, so they always manage to get on but, if our young people are going to another city, we try hard to get them a very basic grounding in the language, even if it is just to say, “Hello,” “How are you?” “My name is,” and so on. It would make a big difference if we could encourage more language learning in schools.

International Development in the third sector

Scale and scope of international development in the third sector

184. The evidence given to the Committee by those working in international development in the third sector showed that there was great diversity in both types of work and the size of organisations in Scotland. The sector has an umbrella body, NIDOS (the Network for International Development Organisations based in Scotland), which has a network of 115 member organisations working in at least 142 countries in many different areas of work. Education and health are the biggest areas of work among NIDOS’ members, but many organisations also work on other areas such as gender, agriculture, arts and culture, trade and sustainable development. NIDOS said that the three key areas that their members work on were on projects abroad: research, policy and advocacy work and global education.

185. NIDOS explained that there was great diversity in the types and sizes of NIDOS member organisations, and highlighted that “The vast majority of our full members—non-governmental organisations—are small, with a turnover of under £100,000 per year.”

186. NIDOS said that their members in Scotland employ over 300 staff, are supported by over 3,000 volunteers and tens of thousands of financial supporters and
donors, and that members headquartered in Scotland raise over £43 million per year for international development work.

Networks and collaboration

187. In addition to NIDOS as the main network, three NIDOS members are sister networks of organisations which work in international development and global justice work from Scotland, namely—

- Scotland Malawi Partnership— a coalition of 683 Scottish member organisations across different sectors focusing on building partnership between Scotland and Malawi with.
- Scottish Fair Trade Forum— a network that is building Scottish engagement in fair trade and helped Scotland secure Fair Trade Nation status.
- International Development Education Association of Scotland (IDEAS) - a network of agencies involved in global education work in schools and communities in Scotland.

188. Several organisations (such as the Aim Hai Trust, a small trust with no paid staff working on supporting education in Tanzania) said that they valued their sector’s networks such as NIDOS as support and for the advice, support and training it could provide on international development.\textsuperscript{134}

Collaboration

189. Christian Aid Scotland said that Scotland had a good record of being able to work across sectors in networks, citing the example of a presentation at an UN Climate Summit where an NGO, the business sector and the relevant government minister collaborated to advocate greater ambition on reducing carbon emissions.\textsuperscript{135}

190. However, several organisations suggested that networks and communications could be improved across different sectors. Link Community Development International said—

\begin{quote}
... we suggest and desire more opportunities to share learning and best practice with the development community, Government, and other donors, including amongst the Scottish and wider UK public, policy makers and other practitioners.\textsuperscript{136}
\end{quote}

191. Malawi Fruits said—

\begin{quote}
While NGOs are well networked and good at speaking to each other, this feels less true of universities who tend to do their own thing. It would seem sensible to work more closely together and funders can have a say in this by facilitating joint funding arrangements perhaps.
\end{quote}
For example, a number of NGOs are, like us, working in the agriculture sector. There are good educational establishments in Scotland who have much to offer in terms of climate smart thinking, access to soil testing, etc but dialogue is very difficult. This seems a missed opportunity.\textsuperscript{137}

Private sector support

192. Several organisations highlighted the importance of specifically including the private sector in networks and as partners to support development. For example, Challenges Worldwide works with the private sector by connecting business students and entrepreneurs from the UK and overseas to work with SMEs in Africa through the International Citizen Service’s Entrepreneur Programme—

We identify and recruit skilled professionals who have worked at a senior level in industry and place them to support local businesses in low and middle-income countries. We match the needs of our clients with skilled and experienced volunteers to ensure they receive the support and results they need. Our associates have skills in business planning, financial management, marketing and organisational development to meet the needs of high-potential fledgling businesses.

Our expert associates will normally spend around 3 months providing specific support on projects to generate income, employment and sustainable economic growth. The support can range from developing a business plan for a small food production company that is looking for loan equity, to recruiting a senior management team for a large social enterprise.\textsuperscript{138}

193. Malawi Fruits also emphasised the importance of its links with the private sector—

One of the strengths of Malawi Fruits is the flexibility to allow us to work with private companies both in Scotland and in Malawi. This mixing together of charitable donations, government funding and private enterprise presents some challenges and yet will be an increasing trend over the next decade. It is something that we will all have to adjust to and may require policy change.\textsuperscript{139}

194. The SMP suggested that more should be done to engage with the private sector to allow them to contribute to the development agenda—

Malawi has a $600million trade deficit because it imports more than it exports. Aid and charity alone will not solve this problem.

We look to build values-led, pro-poor business, trade, investment and tourism links between Scotland and Malawi. If each of the 94,000 Scots with links to Malawi bought Malawian fair trade coffee, for example, or encouraged their friends to visit Malawian on holiday, we would unleash a strong economic force which could have a transformative impact in Malawi.\textsuperscript{140}
The Scottish Government’s International Development Policy and Fund

195. The Scottish Government’s International Development Policy “articulates the vision of Scotland’s place in the world as a good global citizen”, and “seeks to build upon both the historical and contemporary relationships that exist between Scotland and the developing world”.141

196. The Scottish Government’s £9 million International Development Fund is focussed on seven countries in Africa and South Asia. The Small Grants Funding Round has been set up to provide funding to smaller NGOs for projects in seven priority countries.

197. NIDOS highlighted that its members “are a key and significant group for delivery of the Scottish Government’s grants programmes”, being the recipients of a sizeable majority of the money in most categories. Individual organisations told the Committee of the benefits of receiving these grants.

198. For example, the Balmore Trust Group, a development and fair trade organisation, has received two major grants to both develop rice farming and other agriculture, and to provide bursaries for orphans for secondary schools in Malawi. They said that the success rate of applying for grants from other UK level organisations such as the Big Lottery was less than 5% successful, and so most of their work had been enabled by the Scottish Government grant.

199. The Balmore Trust Group suggested that there should be an extension of the Scottish Government small grants scheme, and an increase in the Scottish Government’s major grants programme to enable it to develop the significant unrealised potential in small and medium sized Scottish NGOs and third sector organisations. They also recommended—

   a more interactive application process for the major grant applications which can avoid unnecessary work and frustration; in particular it would be helpful to have a pre-application discussion to understand the extent to which the focus of any application would be likely to be in line with IDD’s thrust and so to be “in with a chance” before engaging on time-intensive but speculative application development.

   … closer communication between IDD and project holders to provide a smoother process of project modification and development during and after their execution.142

200. Challenges Worldwide (an organisation that supports business in lower income countries to grow market systems which offer inclusive and fair economic opportunities for poor people) suggested that the current funding model for the grants programme “does not seem to be able to support innovation being delivered by a Scottish agency”, saying—
The structure of the projects being supported is reminiscent of the type of work that was once supported by foundations in the 1980s and 1990s, rather than that which would now be considered innovative by a bi-lateral agency.\textsuperscript{143}

201. Challenges Worldwide suggested that for organisations such as their own would find it “beneficial if the Scottish Government would support this limited number of organisations to offer something innovative and uniquely Scottish to the international arena”—

This would require a fundamental change in approach away from the current set up which appears to support projects presented by outreach arms of UK wide organisations which cannot get support for those projects from other sources.\textsuperscript{144}

202. It suggested that a better approach for larger organisations would be the use of a strategic support instrument such as Programme Partnership Agreements, saying that—

There is such a small number of these organisations in our country, that the cost of this support would not need to be substantially greater than the current spending pattern of the Scottish Government in international development. The difference would be that Scottish tax payer money would be being invested in support of Scottish organisations to deliver sustainable and strategic work alongside similar agencies from other countries who benefit from this type of support from their own governments. The administrative burden of this type of support is substantially less than the current competition based funding round model (i.e. there would be no ongoing requirement for external bid management and probably no need for outsourced monitoring and evaluation either) and it would enable the focused, strategic development of a small portfolio of uniquely Scottish, innovative agencies.\textsuperscript{145}

203. The Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund (SCIAF) noted that the Scottish Government had more recently responded to humanitarian or emergency situations by providing funding to the Disasters Emergency Committee or UN appeals. SCIAF questioned the “value of donating relatively small sums to relatively large multilateral programmes such as those led by the UN”, and also noted that “several Scottish-headquartered NGOs with capacity to respond, including SCIAF, are not currently members of the DEC”.\textsuperscript{146}

204. A small diaspora organisation, Kenyan Women in Scotland Association (KWISA), said that small, volunteer run organisations such as theirs did not have “the necessary infrastructure to attract grants from funders in a sector dominated by international NGOs, academic institutions and government departments”—

The new approach which favours enterprise and business for development is a good idea for removing dependence on aid but without a level playing field and there is danger that small organisations such as KWISA will be left behind again.\textsuperscript{147}
205. The Scottish Government said that the Scottish Government’s International Development Small Grants Programme is “designed to help smaller Scottish based organisations (with turnover of under £150,000) develop their scale, scope and long term ambitions”. The Small Grants Programme provides funding for Scottish-based international development organisations working in the Scottish Government’s seven priority countries: Malawi, Rwanda, Tanzania, Zambia, Pakistan, Bangladesh and the Indian States of Bihar, Madhya Pradesh and Orissa.\(^\text{148}\)

206. Link Community Development International asked for more flexibility and increased focus on outcomes in the way funds were distributed—

> … we recommend donors be open to more flexibility in regards to core funding amounts (overhead and organisational investment) to fund operational costs, infrastructure investments, and salaries. Most NGOs underestimate and underreport the amount of overhead required to successfully manage and administer grants due to imposed limits set by funding agencies, and many times the indirect allowances that grants do fund don’t cover the costs of administering the grants themselves…We recommend the conversation shift from strict overhead allowances to focussing on mutually agreed outcomes and their dissemination, and a clear communication about what costs are required to fulfil those outcomes most effectively and efficiently.\(^\text{149}\)

207. The Scottish Government said that it was assisting the sector by recognising “the valuable role played by networking organisations such as the Network of International Development Organisations in Scotland (NIDOS) and the Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP)”, and has increased funding for both networks in the 2014-17 period—

> This Scottish Government support to NIDOS and SMP enables them in turn to support civil society organisations engage internationally, and in particular to apply for funding both in respect of Malawi and more widely other developing countries.\(^\text{150}\)

Scottish Government’s current funding cycle

208. Some third sector organisations argued that the Scottish Government’s current three year funding did not facilitate long term working in their programmes as effectively as possible. For example, Link Community Development International explained the difficulties of providing a meaningful impact using the current three year funding cycle (in the context of providing children’s’ education which runs in a longer cycle)—

> For our programmes to make more substantial input, we suggest longer term funding to enable demonstration of impact—three years is too short.

> We really need to follow the child throughout the system, although that would mean a seven-year funding cycle, and it would be impossible to find funding that
would ever cover a seven-year cycle. That makes it very difficult. Measuring impact in education means looking at exam results, because that is what everyone understands. However, a long cycle of funding is required to demonstrate that.\hfill 151

209. Similarly NIDOS said—

\vspace{1.5em}

\begin{itemize}
  \item longer-term security allows us to focus on delivery, relationships and partnerships, and on monitoring and evaluation in the longer term.
  \item a lot of time is wasted to an extent in fundraising, so it would be more effective for an organisation to focus with one fund over a longer period of time.
\end{itemize}\hfill 152

**Global citizenship education**

210. The third sector told the Committee that global citizenship education is a way of creating active global Scottish citizens as it combines education for citizenship, international education and sustainable development education.

211. Several organisations told the Committee about their global citizenship education work to raise awareness of global issues with schools and communities across Scotland. As part of this inquiry, the Committee enjoyed the opportunity of learning more about global citizenship education by inviting pupils from Balgreen Primary School to give a session to the Committee, with Committee members in the role of the students.

212. The Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) explained how the development of links between Scottish and Malawian schools raised awareness in Scotland—

\vspace{1.5em}

\begin{itemize}
  \item Such links, and a focus on good global citizenship, are an integral part of the Curriculum for Excellence, with Education Scotland extolling the many benefits of such links and making clear their expectations for all schools in Scotland to follow this lead. Indeed, Education Scotland now has its own formal partnership with Malawi: a cooperation agreement sharing learning, experience and support for school inspection services.\hfill 153
\end{itemize}

213. The International Development Education Association of Scotland (IDEAS) which is a network of organisations and individuals involved in Development Education and Education for Global Citizenship across Scotland. IDEAS described the structure of this education in Scotland in universities, teacher training and youth and adult work, saying that their aim was “capacity building”—

\vspace{1.5em}

\begin{itemize}
  \item An important part of our network is the six development education centres—the DECs—which are regional centres across Scotland that offer local support. They are currently in receipt of Scottish Government funding for two years, in the form of a contribution to core funding.\hfill 154
\end{itemize}
214. IDEAS described the DECS as “crucial” co-ordinating centres that allowed them to deliver education via local authorities, and to give schools and teachers a local access point. Oxfam emphasised the importance of making funding more secure for global citizenship education to ensure citizen input into international policy making saying—

“It is therefore essential that global citizenship education is properly funded in Scotland to ensure future generations can continue to hold politicians and decision makers to account. It encourages children and young people to explore, develop and express their own values and opinions, whilst listening to and respecting those of others … However, whilst progress has been made in recent years to boost funding for this crucial work, funding remains insecure. If we want to ensure Scotland has informed and critically aware citizens we must invest in this key area.”

**Partnership not charity**

215. Several organisations proposed to the Committee that in order for Scotland to continue to implement a successful international policy, the work must be structured and considered as a two way partnership between Scotland and its donor countries and not as charitable work. For example, the Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) explained the distinction—

“We see a key distinction: activity which solely defines itself as “charity” can risk being seen as a one-way philanthropic relationship, with donors on one side and recipients at the other. By contrast, we see a “partnership” as an active two-way relationship, where both sides contribute and both sides benefit.”

216. SMP has developed 11 ‘Partnership Principles’ to hold itself to account after consultation with both Malawian and Scottish people, which include ‘planning and implementing together’ and ‘respect, trust and mutual understanding’.

217. SCIAF supported the emphasis on a partnership approach saying that it sees its work as “…a relationship of mutual enrichment, sustained by shared goals, values and resources, which reinforces achievement of positive change in people’s lives.”

218. Mary’s Meals also addressed the issue of partnership stating that both community ownership and alignment with the host government’s priorities are important contributors to ensuring its programmes are successful.
Policy coherence

219. NIDOS and other organisations strongly recommended in evidence to the Committee that the Scottish Government should take a policy coherence for development (PCD) approach to its policies.

220. In both the context of the global debate on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) framework and the emerging post-2015 Sustainable Development Goals, NIDOS has worked with its members to produce the report, Scotland’s Place in Building a Just World. The report recommended a policy coherence for international development approach for Scotland. Based largely on European models, this is the concept that all government departments and policies should act coherently to comply with, and contribute to, the goal of equitable and sustainable global development. For example, Oxfam said—

We ... need to examine and adopt a policy coherent approach to enhance our contribution to sustainable and just global development. In short, we must ensure Scotland does not ‘not give with one hand and take with the other’.159

221. Additionally NIDOS commissioned research to look at approaches to PCD in other European countries, and identified key factors and findings that made an effective PCD approach.160 They found that Belgium, Denmark, Finland, Luxembourg, the Netherlands and Sweden already implement policy coherence.

222. SCIAF suggested that a policy coherence approach must be at the heart of Scotland’s role as a global citizen, and that economic gain should not be the only focus —

In pursuing increased and ‘sustainable economic growth’, SCIAF believes it is vital that the Scottish Government sufficiently addresses any potential negative impact this may have on its international development, climate justice and human rights obligations. A policy coherence approach should mean the Government considers the impact of all its policies through a development lens, including those it makes as an economic actor. It is also important that the Government adopts a clear definition of ‘sustainable economic growth’, recognising that infinite growth is not possible and that prosperity of society and wellbeing of individuals cannot be measured purely in monetary terms.161

223. Similarly, the Scotland Malawi Partnership suggested that the Scottish Government’s international strategy focussed too much on the economic benefits of internationalism at the risk of losing the other qualities that Scotland could offer to the world—

... the fundamental basis and justification—the driver—for Scotland’s internationalism seem to be domestic economic gain. We are selling Scotland short if that is the case. If that is all that we believe internationalism is about, that flies in the face of a proud 200-year history of Scotland engaging
internationally for reasons of global citizenship, social justice, solidarity, support and mutual benefit and understanding.

I understand that economic drivers are important but, if that is the justification, that is a weakness and we will lose sight of what our country is doing that is different from what every other country in the world is doing. If we lose that, we will have just another international strategy much like every other one in the world.\textsuperscript{162}

224. SMP suggested that civil society should be more at the heart of the strategy—

\begin{quote}
We should celebrate and put at the strategy’s centre how people add value and what role volunteerism and social justice have in it. That is essential for the Parliament and for the Government.\textsuperscript{163}
\end{quote}

225. The Scottish Government said that it had already committed to the policy coherence for development approach, which was championed by the Minister for Europe and International Development—

\begin{quote}
We also support the view that being a global leader in international development is not necessarily just about the size in absolute monetary terms, but the impact that you can make across your Government policy.\textsuperscript{164}
\end{quote}

226. The Scottish Government gave examples of this approach across various policy areas such as education and water management. For example, on climate justice, its International Development team is working with International Low Carbon Energy colleagues on both the Scottish Government’s Climate Justice Fund and its work on the UN’s Sustainable Energy for All initiative.

227. NIDOS recognised that the Scottish Government had introduced coherent policies in some areas such as in climate change legislation, but they would like to see that approach rolled out further. They suggested a way of achieving that—

\begin{quote}
One way of trying to achieve more policy coherence is to set up some sort of review lens or process whereby other parts of Government can look at their policies and assess them in terms of the impact that they might have internationally—the same as with an environmental impact assessment, a gender review or any other kind of lens. We have been calling for that, and saying that it would be useful for the Scottish Government to set up a structural process to examine some of its other policies in the light of international development outcomes.\textsuperscript{165}
\end{quote}

228. For example, NIDOS said that in Belgium, federal departments review all new legislation against twenty-one development factors, such as gender, to ensure all national policies are coherent with international policies. The Belgium sub-states have a significant portion of the overall Belgium budget for international development.
229. NIDOS said that its research had demonstrated that for policy coherence to be successful it must achieve the following objectives—

- It must have a clear definition and be embedded across all policy areas.
- It must sit outwith the international development programme to ensure that other departments understood its importance.
- Thematic focus areas can help to implement change more effectively.
- Good reporting and transparency systems are important.
- It is important that civil society and other partners are involved.\textsuperscript{166}

Better use of the diaspora

230. The evidence from Kenyan Women in Scotland Association (KWISA) highlighted a particular value in working with nationals from developing countries who are resident in Scotland. KWISA highlighted its work campaigning against Female Genital Mutilation, and also the importance of remittances sent by Kenyans in Scotland back to Kenya—

\begin{quote}
... the diaspora community that sends money back home to support families and friends for food, school fees, hospital bills and accommodation ... Remittances have an immediate and direct impact on development because the money goes directly to the people who need assistance most. Remitting money does not involve complicated grant applications processes or ever-changing themes, criteria and seasons. In addition it is not tied to political conditions, control or preferences.\textsuperscript{167}
\end{quote}

231. Linked to this, KWISA wrote that organisations in Scotland could make better use of diaspora communities in a number of ways such as, “by treating them as equal partners ... see them as ‘expatriates not migrants’”, by creating “space for trading or bartering of skills” between diaspora communities and those organisations who might wish to use their expertise, and by recognising the contribution that families and friends of people from diaspora communities in Scotland make to the tourist economy.\textsuperscript{168}

Third sector and civil society

Human rights

232. The Committee heard from third sector and civil society organisations about Scotland’s role in promoting human rights on an international level, as well as about the engagement of the third sector and civil society in international activities overall.
How Scotland engages with human rights

233. The Scottish Government established the International Human Rights Advisory Panel in 2013, to inform its international engagement.

234. The Scottish Human Rights Commission (SHRC) is Scotland’s National Human Rights Institution (NHRI). The Commission “acts as a bridge between the international human rights framework and the domestic legal framework, linking Scotland to significant international activity through the international network of NHRIIs, as well as to the United Nations and regional human rights bodies such as the Council of Europe, the European Union, and the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe.”

235. For example, the SHRC has observer status at the Council of Europe’s Steering Committee on Human Rights, and “has been active in trying to ensure that European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) is reformed in a way that is consistent with the protection of human rights.” The SHRC also works with the Council of Europe’s Commissioner of Human Rights, for example, by supporting the Commissioner’s “promotion of the Scottish model across Europe, including in countries such as Ukraine.”

236. The SHRC also chairs the European Network of over 40 NHRIIs and is deputy chair of the International Coordinating Council of over 100 NHRIIs, forming a bridge between Scotland and the international human rights community.

237. In addition to SHRC, Amnesty International Scotland (AIS) is also very active in the field of human rights. It gave evidence to the Committee about its campaigning and global awareness work on human rights in Scotland with Scottish people and other organisations—

“Our campaigns mobilise people across the world to take action in a number of ways. Whether that is a letter of solidarity to a prisoner of conscience, an email to a US Governor asking them not to execute a prisoner on death row, signing a petition by text to pardon a young woman jailed in El Salvador because of a miscarriage, attending a protest in support of freedom of expression or generally spreading the word about our campaigns on social media, collectively we can make a difference. Amnesty International Scotland highlights all of this international work throughout our networks in Scotland, and engages a Scottish audience in these campaigns.”

238. AIS also explained how its collaboration with other organisations in Scotland helped support its international work—

“As well as engaging the general public in our global campaigns, we also work with organisations such as charities, trade unions, faith organisations and the media to highlight our campaigns. In Scotland, Amnesty works with a range of partners on different campaigns. We worked with Oxfam Scotland on the campaign for an Arms Trade Treaty, and we work with SCIAF, the Scottish...
Human Rights Commission, and others to influence the Scottish Government’s international agenda.¹⁷⁴

Scottish international human rights strategy

239. AIS suggested during both strands one and two of this inquiry that the Scottish Government could bring all the human rights work being carried out in Scotland together more effectively by creating a dedicated international human rights strategy. AIS explained that the value of such a strategy would be to—

… embed and formalise the work of the Scottish Government in this area, and ensure a more strategic, coherent and transparent approach across government to promoting human rights issues internationally. However, such a strategy would also have the potential to effectively coordinate and highlight the impact of the work being done by a wide range of organisations beyond government, from public bodies to the third sector. If that were to be achieved, Scotland could make an important contribution to improving human rights internationally.

An international human rights strategy would provide an explicit statement of Scotland’s values and approach to the promotion of human rights. It would demonstrate real commitment to being a good global citizen — a document that can be taken around the world to promote Scotland’s values and help progress human rights elsewhere. It would also be a document that could be used by organisations across Scotland to coordinate and progress human rights work.¹⁷⁵

Third sector and civil society

Benefits of working internationally

240. Third sector and civil society organisations told the Committee of the importance of working internationally on research. For example, the Royal Society of Edinburgh (RSE) stated that it aimed to be “recognised for developing productive international research links and partnerships that benefit the people of Scotland and enhance the country’s reputation globally.” It further explained that—

The main basis of our work is the exchange of researchers and research through the 21 memoranda of understanding that we have with sister academies around the world. Eleven of them are in Europe, so Europe remains an important place for our work.¹⁷⁶

241. The RSE’s International Strategy for 2013-2015 sets out a number of strategic priorities including the identification of priority countries to engage with (which are China, Brazil and Malaysia), a commitment to using its members’ international connections and developing international links by means of activities such as exchanges of researchers. The RSE’s strategic priorities are supported by a number of actions. For example, RSE said that it has “very strong relations with China”, and “memoranda of understanding with the four main learned societies: the Chinese Academy of Sciences, the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences …
the Chinese Academy of Engineering and the National Natural Science Foundation of China”. 177

242. Cancer Research UK said that it “has an established tradition of funding international research” as there are “clear benefits in sharing expertise and knowledge across different disciplines”—

“

We fund studies across Europe and worldwide and use research to try to understand differences in cancer rates and mortality across Europe and worldwide. International collaboration in research is vital.

Collaboration between funders and across borders is becoming increasingly necessary for all forms of research. Research into rare cancer in particular benefit from international collaboration as the patient population in individual countries are not sufficient to meet recruitment targets of clinical trials. 178

Membership of European networks

243. Scottish umbrella organisations in the third sector told the Committee of the benefits of being in European networks, and explained their differing levels of influence at an international level.

244. RSE said that it was a member of ALLEA, the all European academies network, giving it an ability to communicate with other academies throughout Europe on the content and quality of Scottish research.

245. The Poverty Alliance said that its “primary international engagement is at the European level”, via the European Anti-Poverty Network (EAPN). 180 The Alliance said that this European level of engagement was beneficial in three main ways. Firstly it allowed a wider range of influence on European policy (for instance, EAPN was particularly active during development of the Lisbon Strategy (2000-2010). Secondly it allowed the Alliance to learn from other countries’ experience (for example, the Alliance has given presentations in Spain, Norway, Germany, Ireland and Italy on its experience of developing the Living Wage campaign in Scotland). Thirdly, it gave the Alliance a “sense of solidarity” with its European allies to address poverty across Europe. The Alliance also facilitates the involvement of people with direct experience of poverty into these levels of engagement, allowing Scottish voices of individuals to be heard in Europe. 181

246. Similarly the Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO) said that working with international networks helped it to “strengthen civil society organisations and build participative democratic structures”. SCVO is a member of several international networks for third sector organisations including the European Network of National Civil Society Associations (ENNA), and CIVICUS which brings together civil society organisations from across the globe. On ENNA, the SCVO said—
The network provides a forum where civil society organisations can share their challenges and experiences as well as serving as an intermediary with the private sector, public authorities, and the media. This infrastructure helps disseminate and share good practice arising, showcase their work on behalf of civil society organisations within countries and provides a common policy platform on issues affecting the sector at European level. The network represents civil society at EU level and provides a focus for influencing the European Parliament and policy around European Structural and Investment Funds.\textsuperscript{182}

Engaging and influencing internationally

247. The third sector said that they had mixed results when endeavouring to influence European policy through these networks. SCVO said that it also used other bodies that were available such as the European Economic and Social Committee (a consultative body of the European Union enabling civil society organisations from the Member States to express their views at European level), but the latter had its limitations—

\textit{...the EESC—is perhaps not empowered enough to hold the Commission to account or to work on reform. Furthermore, there is a deficit between that representation role and the sector in Scotland. We are going ... to try and reform the EESC so that it is more accountable to the sector and we have a more mutual process.}\textsuperscript{183}

248. The Poverty Alliance argued that, on an European level, “The only way that organisations and networks such the Poverty Alliance can be influential is through working with others”—

\textit{...we work with 31 networks across Europe now, and that goes beyond the boundaries of the EU. It is only by working with those other networks through our organisation that is based in Brussels—it is absolutely crucial; there is no doubt about that—that we can have influence. In the past, the EAPN has been extremely influential. Whole elements of the Lisbon strategy were the result of lobbying by the EAPN in particular, but the wider social platform in Brussels has also made a real difference.}\textsuperscript{184}

249. Both SCVO and Poverty Alliance had had direct contact with the European Commission, and told the Committee about their experiences in trying to influence policy making. SCVO said—

\textit{We are beginning to work out how to influence people within the Commission, but we have some way to go before we have the capacity to work with the European Parliament better and to understand how things work there.}\textsuperscript{185}
250. The Poverty Alliance said—

In the past few years, as we have moved to the Europe 2020 strategy, we have had less of an influence over how the strategies have developed, but the important thing for us is still to be there and still to be discussing, particularly with the new Presidents of the European Commission and the European Parliament. The EAPN has been fortunate to have had meetings with the Cabinets of both of them...In that way, we can have a direct influence on how some of the discussions are going.  

251. Third sector and civil society umbrella bodies explained that although they had international networks, it was more difficult to encourage individual organisations to build collaborations internationally when domestic concerns naturally took precedence.

252. The Poverty Alliance said that “engagement at the European policy level appears to be relatively weak” amongst organisations that are concerned about addressing poverty and social exclusion in Scotland, perhaps due to sphere of influence—

Whilst there are areas where there are significant implications for social policy, for example in relation to employment, direct policy development on key issues such as social security, minimum wages, taxation, etc, remains principally the concern of Member States, particularly those outside the Eurozone. Given this constraint, it is perhaps understandable that some organisations do not place a great deal of importance in engaging at the European level.

253. The Alliance outline other reasons for lack of participation such as limited resources and a need for better coordination and collaboration between key stakeholders and the organisations. It suggested that Scottish organisations could improve their practice by working together more effectively on shared agendas at the European level—

The Poverty Alliance is currently leading on the re-development of the EAPN network in the UK and it is hoped that the end result of this will be opportunities for better joint working across the sector in relation to the European social inclusion agenda.

254. The Alliance said that this joint approach was already happening in some cases, (for example, Children in Scotland and Homeless Action Scotland regularly update and involve their members in the European dimensions of their work) but there is a need to improve in this area.

255. SCVO also said that it could be “difficult to engage and work at that [an European] level”, and suggested that the third sector and Scotland’s international engagement could be improved through the development of an agency to help coordinate and support the international work of Scotland’s third sector organisations, and to strengthen participative democracy—
Although there is good work taking place across the third sector in engaging internationally, much of it is not as connected up or as well supported as it could be. Scotland would benefit from a more formal agency to help bring this work together and develop new and better links with civil society organisations as well as international agencies.

Helping to expand these connections and build international links is vital for sharing knowledge and promoting Scotland. Similar benefits could be achieved for the third sector in Scotland by a small investment that would help facilitate connections between third sector organisations in Scotland and international agencies, businesses and civil society organisations.  

Culture and Sport

256. The Committee took evidence on how Scottish organisations use ‘cultural diplomacy’. The Institute for Cultural Diplomacy defines cultural diplomacy as “a course of actions, which are based on and utilize the exchange of ideas, values, traditions and other aspects of culture or identity, whether to strengthen relationships, enhance socio-cultural cooperation or promote national interests”.

Range of international engagement

257. The Committee heard about the different types of and benefits of cultural diplomacy from a range of arts and sports sectors organisations.

258. Creative Scotland provided multiple examples of how it facilitates international engagement work in the fields of music, dance, the performing arts, the creative industries and screen and media. For example, it provides funding to organisations and individuals who are working across the arts, screen and creative industries to allow them to work internationally, such as the funding to support the Scottish Dance Theatre’s tour of India and China.

259. Creative Scotland said that one of its five strategic ambitions specifically relates to how it supports the arts, screen and creative industries internationally, stating that it wants Scotland to be “a distinctive nation connected to the world”. This means working through funding, advocacy, influence and development to support work across the arts, screen and creative industries.

260. VisitScotland said that a strong visitor economy “helps to position Scotland on the world stage whilst the economic impact of the visitor spend spreads out from the traditional component parts of the tourism industry into other sectors such as arts and crafts, food and drink, cultural activities, sports events and activities, retail, and finally into the Scottish Government’s core priority industries which are central to the economic growth strategy”. According to VisitScotland, the annual direct and indirect contribution of the visitor economy to Scotland is £11.6 billion and supporting more than 292,000 jobs.
British Council Scotland (BCS) said that cultural diplomacy activities can assist with developing trade and business links because by “broadening people’s horizons and connecting Scots to other countries and cultures, we help boost Scotland’s economic prosperity and security”. BCS highlighted a survey that it commissioned from the Scottish Council for Development and Industry (‘Scotland’s Future Workforce: keeping pace in the global skills race?’) which indicated that “businesses cannot find the ‘global’ or transferable skills they need in the labour pool when recruiting new staff in Scotland, and this affects their competitiveness in international markets”.  

261. VisitScotland told the Committee that its international engagement includes marketing Scotland as a destination to all parts of the world. It does this in a number of ways including through engagement with events coming to Scotland, international marketing of Scotland, seeking to develop Scotland’s international connectivity and seeking to develop international recognition of Scotland.

262. VisitScotland also outlined its international engagement role in relation to supporting events, describing itself as —

“… a key player in maximising the benefits from the Commonwealth Games, and the lead public agency in the highly successful delivery of the 2014 Ryder Cup and the development, design and delivery of Homecoming Scotland 2014.”

263. EventScotland is part of VisitScotland’s Events Directorate. One of the main programmes of support is for international events which have an international impact by bringing visitors from outside Scotland and/or by achieving media coverage outside Scotland. Around 30 supported events take place each year. EventScotland described the positive outcomes that derive from these events—

Events provide a significant opportunity to create a narrative about a country internationally as they receive coverage and attract attention. They allow a country to showcase its assets and project a desired image globally.

264. BCS works in the arts and education, developing internationalisation across these areas. It said that its purpose was “promoting the best of Scottish culture and learning to the rest of the world by bringing foreign academics, students, policymakers and artists to Scotland and taking counterparts abroad”. BCS described the educational aspects of this work to demonstrate the benefits—

…we have enabled thousands of young people from Scotland to study and work abroad, helped schools and higher education institutions to create partnerships with other countries, and supported the professional development of teachers and academics at home and abroad. We have also brought the brightest students from other countries to study, teach and work in Scotland, helping to broaden the cultural horizons of our young people.
265. Scottish Dance Theatre (SDT) has developed an international strategy with the following cultural and economic priorities—

\[ \text{Develop a holistic, longer-term programme of activity that enables the company to engage in deeper and more meaningful relations with carefully selected overseas artists, companies, and producers, to reach new audiences, and to diversify sources of income.} \]

Networks and partnerships

266. Several organisations told the Committee that being a member of international networks was very beneficial in representing Scotland globally. VisitScotland outlined its partnership role (as part of ‘Team Scotland’ working with Transport Scotland, the Scottish Government and Scottish Enterprise) in supporting the development of Scotland’s international connectivity. It specifically referred to new air routes to Chicago, New York, Toronto, Halifax, Doha and Abu Dhabi and told the Committee that this initiative—

\[ \text{Demonstrates the confidence Scotland is generating among our transport partners, while also ensuring that there will be the capacity to meet heightened demand from international visitors to Scotland.} \]

267. VisitScotland described its links with partner organisations around the world—

\[ \text{Over the past 10 years VisitScotland has been working with partners across Europe and further afield, sharing knowledge and expertise primarily, although not exclusively, in relation to our quality assurance schemes.} \]

\[ \text{It is also a positive message for our own tourism industry that Scotland is held in such high regard by so many other countries, ranging from Norway and Sweden to Queensland, Australia. This position was underscored recently with the signing of an MOU with the tourism authority in Nova Scotia at the end of May 2015. The agreement with Nova Scotia focuses on information sharing, quality and major events.} \]

268. Creative Scotland said that its membership of European and global networks, such as the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies and the International Society for the Performing Arts, were important to achieving its international strategic aims.

269. EventScotland said that it attends the annual sportaccord convention (a forum where future international sporting events are discussed). EventScotland’s attendance allows it to “present Scotland as ‘the Perfect Stage for Events’ to an international audience” which is “vital in building trust and relationships which is a key factor in the awarding of future sports events”.

270. sportscotland described Scotland’s sporting international links and membership of international sports bodies for hockey, athletics and golf. In all these sports,
sportscotland outlined Scotland's links with UK sporting bodies and where appropriate internationally. For instance as a result of Scotland’s hockey teams playing at European and world level, Scottish Hockey has a direct relationship with the Fédération International de Hockey and the European Hockey Federation. According to sportscotland these links largely involve high performance sport “where the competition process requires clear rules of engagement and where the governance is sport-specific, involving international governing bodies as well as national and home country”.

271. Scottish Student Sport (SSS) highlighted the international student sport networks of which Scottish higher education institutions are members. These included the European Universities Sports Association (EUSA), the European Network of Academic Sport Services (ENAS) and the Fédération Internationale du Sport Universitaire (FISU). SSS explained the value of its membership of FISU—

> The wider opportunities made possible by the existence of FISU are difficult to quantify, but they certainly include making it easy for National Student Sport Federations to link to one-another. During the past three years SSS has hosted inward study visits of delegations from China, Jamaica, South Africa and Sweden – allowing for information exchange and mutual learning.

272. SSS said that Scottish sporting institutions “have a long and varied history” of undertaking international expeditions and trips at team and club level, and also of hosting visiting teams and delegations. Additionally SSS said that “a number of colleges and universities have their own projects and partnerships in place that use sport as a vehicle for international education and development”—

> As one example the University of St Andrews is engaged in the UK Sport IDEALS Project, which annually takes groups of students to Zambia to deliver sports coaching whilst supporting community work in underdeveloped areas. As well as promoting sport the sessions are used to put essential health messages across to the children on prevalent issues such as HIV/AIDS, malaria and sanitation.

273. However, notwithstanding all the successful international sporting connections in Scotland, sportscotland said that “when it comes to grass roots sports development, that which takes place in schools and education, clubs and communities, the picture is less clear about what the appropriate role is for Scotland in international relationships which tends to be more opportunistic and ad hoc”. sportscotland said that there are opportunities (such via EU funding programmes like ERASMUS+, or through international associations such as the International Council for School Sport), but that Scotland could “take a more strategic and coordinated approach to its international representation and delivery in the area of grass roots sport”.
Collaboration in international engagement

274. It was clear from the evidence received that in the field of cultural diplomacy there is a great deal of collaboration between organisations. Scottish Government agencies and BCS provided information about their collaborations, such as BCS working with Creative Scotland to optimise international connections and relationships on cultural events. Similarly VisitScotland and EventScotland told the Committee that it worked closely with the Scottish Government and its other agencies to deliver benefits such as new air links.208

275. In 2013, BCS commissioned a “Strategic Analysis of the Scottish Higher Education Sector’s Distinctive Assets”. This analysis identified the distinctive assets of Scotland’s higher education system to allow the BCS to more effectively promote the sector internationally. BCS said—

By encouraging transnational connections between academic systems through a dynamic exchange of knowledge, ideas and information, we contribute to building trust and understanding between Scotland and other nations.209

276. The report has helped to underpin the formation of ‘Connected Scotland’, a consortium previously highlighted in this report which aims to position Scotland’s higher education sector in priority markets. BCS said that the development of Connected Scotland has led to overseas fact-finding visits to Brazil and China to promote Scotland’s universities and identify collaborative research links.


The report has enabled us to identify the common beliefs that we share with our partners in Scotland: an ethos of collaboration, a strong desire to engage internationally, a willingness to link with business and commercial partners, and a collective approach to position Scotland as an international partner of choice. As the report demonstrates, British Council endeavours, by using its unique global network and professional expertise across sectors, to secure Scotland’s role as a globally connected nation.210

International collaboration

278. As an example of collaboration with international partners, the EventScotland Team has a memorandum of understanding to allow it to collaborate with the New Zealand Governments Major Events Team as well as less formal information exchanges with Victorian Major Events in Australia and Sport Event Denmark.211 However EventScotland said that there were fewer channels for establishing and maintaining such international links in culture, as opposed to those available in the sports and business sector, and suggested that this could be improved by creating such channels from a Scottish perspective—
An example would be something that has happened around the Edinburgh festivals before—an international summit of culture ministers. We need to look at how we can create such channels. I know that some of that has happened previously, and we have done it in relation to individual genres, but the process is less structured and more organic.  

279. Additionally the cultural sector told the Committee that it would benefit from greater co-ordination. SSS suggested creating better mechanisms for “bringing sport, culture and education together so that we can collaborate to best effect.” Creative Scotland endorsed these comments saying that “there could be better co-ordination and better shared access to knowledge and networks than we are currently initiating. Perhaps it is up to us, as national agencies, to take the lead in generating closer working.”  

Funding and budgets  

280. Creative Scotland provided details of the different funding programmes that it runs to provide support for organisations and individuals working across the arts, screen and creative industries to undertake international activity. It dedicates approximately £2 million a year to its international engagement activities. Creative Scotland told the Committee that 80% of the organisations they regularly fund undertake international work and that the funding supports a range of projects such as—

...a major company touring internationally; a band attending an overseas festival; a writer conducting research overseas; an artist exhibiting their work outside Scotland; or an Artistic Director speaking at an international conference.  

EU funding  

281. Creative Scotland provides advice and support on opportunities to access the EU Creative Europe funding programme via the Creative Europe Desk UK-Scotland. The Scottish Government said that it “is currently assessing where it can supplement and add value to these existing support mechanisms to encourage increased uptake of Creative Europe by Scottish organisations and reduce the barriers to accessing the fund that they might experience”.  

282. British Council Scotland and sportsscotland provided examples of programmes that they run which are funded by the European Union, for example the ERASMUS+ Programme and the Connecting Classrooms Programme. SDT said that it had participated in an EU funded dance project called RepNet “which linked together a series of repertory dance companies throughout Europe with the explicit aims of exchanging ideas about practice and understanding future potential”.  

283. The National Theatre of Scotland (NTS) said that it had had less success with EU funds due the complexity of the funding application—
There used to be a scheme called the kaleidoscope fund that was probably the most complicated funding stream ever. An application took months and it was necessary to have three partners from three different countries. It almost felt as if the complexity was there to put people off applying, and it did stop people applying. There is a different scheme now, which is a little simpler, but it is still very complicated. We engaged with it once with a company from Germany and one from Canada and we were not successful, but we will continue to look at it.220

284. Creative Scotland acknowledged that accessing EU funds could be difficult, and that collective resource was needed to support organisations like NTS in the process, saying, “Perhaps we need to do some workshops and training to help people to be able to make applications that might be successful, so that we can punch through a bit more powerfully”—

We need to think about how we can use our collective resource in the most effective way to support the efforts of organisations whose focus should be on making great work. We need to think collectively about how to draw in European resource in a better way than we do currently.221

Scottish Government’s International Touring Fund

285. The Scottish Government’s International Touring Fund supports the international touring activity of Scotland’s five National Performing Companies. NTS said that the fund had “been a fantastic help to us in achieving the profile that we have.”222 NTS also said that it endeavours to make their international tours self-supporting, and that it had been raising money itself in the USA through a theatre board—

… we have in the USA what is called a 501(c)(3) board—National Theatre of Scotland America Inc—which means that we can raise sponsorship and accept fees without tax in the USA. Initially, we did that as a functionary thing to help us to get there and so that our fees were not penalised. As we have done more and more work … we have built up a network of key supporters in the USA.

We are starting slowly but we are building it up, and I think that it will be a key aspect of future international work for us.223

Funding barriers

286. BCS said that funding levels were an issue, as its grant from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office accounted for only 20% of their funds, with the rest earned through activities such as teaching English or running exams.224 Similarly, Creative Scotland said that as a significant proportion of its funding comes from the national lottery, it was constrained in what international activities it could be used it for, given that it must benefit the people of Scotland, saying—

We do not have a lot of spare resource to be able to support the development that could happen for Scotland internationally.225
287. NTS also said that the logistics of touring with a large company and requiring a large number of plane flights and hotel rooms could be a barrier to performing internationally.226

288. BCS said that visas could create a financial barrier, as visas could be refused if cultural companies did not have the financial means to support themselves.227

Encouraging internationalisation

289. Throughout the Connecting Scotland inquiry, the Committee has heard from different sectors that encouraging an international outlook among Scotland’s young people is key to increasing international engagement in Scotland.

290. BCS provided details of the programmes that it runs which can help to instil an international outlook in Scotland’s young people—

"The Erasmus+, IAESTE and Language Assistants programmes promote outward and inward student mobility and hence the development of individuals’ skill sets; including cultural awareness and confidence in foreign languages."

"The Connecting Classrooms programme provides Scottish schools with funding and advice in order to build relationships with schools around the world, by supporting teacher study visits, professional development and online school linkages. Connecting Classrooms provides pupils with knowledge and insight into the cultures of other countries as well as awareness of issues such as their rights and responsibilities as global citizens, the skills needed to work in a global economy, and the means of building a fairer, more sustainable world."

291. However, BCS said that the numbers of those participating in Connecting Classrooms had decreased “so we have to do more work to get schools to take the international agenda seriously”.229

292. Creative Scotland said that another barrier to encouraging internationalisation in arts and creative industries was the adequacy of the infrastructure for digital working—

"A lot of arts organisations and creative industries companies are now exploiting digital in a meaningful way by opening up to international opportunities and markets. However, the infrastructure in Scotland is still not strong enough to accommodate that, particularly given the large file sizes for film or music and the fact that it is common practice now for creative people in many different parts of the world to work together on a digital platform and collaborate."

Building an international reputation

293. Witnesses told the Committee that there were a number of elements that were required for Scotland to build a successful international reputation.
294. EventScotland said that one of its key aims was “getting a profile and coverage. Once we have fantastic events in Scotland, we need to ensure that they are projected internationally, whether through television coverage or online, and that we put out the right message around them that fits with what we want to say about Scotland.”

295. Evidence given to the Committee demonstrated that cultural organisations needed to commit significant resources and time to building successful and meaningful international reputations. NTS said building familiarity with international audiences by repeat visits helped create a good international reputation—

One-off visits tend not to have the same impact because every time feels like the first time whereas, if we go back, even if not to the same places, people have heard that we were in Washington, Chicago or Sydney last year.

296. SDT said that “Profound international engagement takes time at every stage of the process, including planning and the commitment of resource. It also takes time in the delivery, so that we are not just shipping in our best shows and then shipping them out again.”

297. Cultural organisations told the Committee that political or cultural barriers were a “real issue” when organising international tours, and that sometimes changes had to be made to work in order to maintain good relations. SDT said that whilst on tour in China, all their work had to pass through a censorship process, and so the work is sometimes presented differently from a Scottish performance—

One work that we toured, “Winter, Again”, used fake blood quite repeatedly. Nearly all of that had to be cut from the piece for it to be allowed to be presented in China. Another work that we had started to discuss touring with the promoter, a piece called “Yama”, was ruled out completely, for reasons that we have never fully understood. Sometimes, the reasons for the censorship can be clearly understood, but less so other times.

298. Similarly, NTS said that the Chinese authorities had censored David Greig’s play for young people, “The Monster in the Hall”, as one of the characters in the show is gay, and “the authorities in China had a real issue with our presenting that to a young audience.”

Scottish Government approach on cultural diplomacy

299. The Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Europe and External Affairs said the Scottish Government “takes a multi-faceted approach to supporting ... cultural diplomacy”, using its overseas offices—

Gathered information on upcoming cultural events abroad, or projects with an international dimension, is used to help shape Ministerial programmes and activity overseas. I also encourage partner organisations, such as SDI and VisitScotland to use this information to support Scotland’s national performing
companies and collections whilst they are overseas. For example, our Scottish Affairs Office in Washington invited key political and business figures to National Theatre of Scotland’s performance of ‘Dunsinane’, to build and deepen diplomatic and business relations between the USA and Scotland.236

300. Additionally, the Scottish Government has signed a cultural Memorandum of Understanding with China and a cultural Statement of Intent with France to underpin engagement by Scottish cultural organisations, saying that—

> The level of engagement and activity with China and Scotland’s Cultural sector has seen a significance increase in collaboration, educational outreach, knowledge exchange and networking since it was signed in 2011.237

301. The Committee asked the Scottish Government how it measured the effectiveness of Scotland’s cultural diplomacy engagement. The Scottish Government said that “The Scottish Government’s National Performance Framework underpins the delivery of our strategic purpose and supports an outcomes-based approach to performance … This includes the indicator ‘Improve Scotland’s Reputation’ which is assessed through the Anholt GfK-Roper Nation Brands Index.238

Scottish Government response to issues raised across sectors

302. During this inquiry, several issues were raised by more than one sector. This section incorporates the Scottish Government’s response to those issues.

Creating an international culture at home

303. A number of organisations across several sectors highlighted the importance of developing an international culture in Scotland, to both encourage Scotland’s international engagement and allow for Scots to take advantage of international opportunities.

304. The Scottish Government said that it had embedded internationalisation as a priority into its key strategic documents: Scotland’s Economic Strategy, Scotland’s International Framework and Scotland’s International Policy Statement develop this further. The Scottish Government said that these documents, “demonstrates the importance of internationalisation in delivering this Government’s key purpose of sustainable economic growth, with opportunities for all to flourish”.239

305. The Scottish Government also highlighted the work it was doing to embed internationalism into various policies on growing Scotland’s international trade and investment, stating that although Scotland’s international exports have increased by 40% in the last six years, more than 80% of businesses in Scotland don’t export at all. It was therefore introducing a new Strategy document to address the deficit—

> An International Trade and Investment Strategy will be published later this year which will set out how the Government will work with businesses, the wider
public sector and the third sector, as well as with other partners and institutions, in Scotland and internationally. This is an important area of policy development and one that will place our trade and investment goals, and the practical policies and activities to deliver them, within the context of a broader approach to international policy and internationalising Scottish business.\textsuperscript{240}

306. The Scottish Government also highlighted its Edinburgh Festivals Expo fund, managed through Creative Scotland, which aims to promote internationalisation in the culture sector.

**Funding**

307. The Committee heard evidence from several sectors about the need for longer term funding commitments from the Scottish Government. Witnesses suggested longer term funding would allow better planning and more long term support and consistency in their international engagement work.

308. In relation to funding, the Scottish Government explained that it was restricted by the necessity of working within the three year period of the UK Spending Review—

\begin{itemize}
  \item While there is some scope within this to provide longer term support, clearly any commitments which go beyond the end of a Spending Review period either can only be indicative and subject to future spending rounds, or they restrict the ability of the Scottish Government to respond to reductions in budget. The more that is committed beyond known budgeting periods, the less flexibility the Scottish Government has in those future years. Such commitments are made in terms of capital projects, particularly where a project runs beyond a 3-year period or begins towards the end of a Spending Review period.\textsuperscript{241}
\end{itemize}

309. However, the Scottish Government said that it “may be able consider support on a project by project basis”. International development officials had recently investigated the length of grant funding periods, including undertaking an international comparators exercise, “where they found that the Scottish Government funding practice for our International Development Fund was generally aligned with other European countries funding of civil society NGOs in that regard\textsuperscript{242}—

\begin{itemize}
  \item Finland had three year agreements with NGOs; Ireland had three year agreements; the Netherlands had four year agreements; Norway had programmes for up to five years; Sweden had longer agreements, but with three years of funding within that; and the UK Government’s PPA arrangements were three-five year strategic agreements. It is an issue that we will continue to keep under review, however, and one that I can reassure the Committee that we will give further consideration to for the future, to ensure that we follow – and even lead - best practice in this regard.\textsuperscript{243}
\end{itemize}
EU funding

310. The issue of accessing European funding was also raised by witnesses, specifically in the areas of academia, the third sector, civil society and local authorities. It was clear from the evidence provided that Scottish organisations invest a great deal of financial and human resources in seeking European funding, the odds of success were often low, and that more support could be provided to organisations.

311. The Scottish Government highlighted the new online EU Funding Portal which aimed to “facilitate the application process and achieve a higher success rate.” Witnesses told the Committee that they hoped the Portal would improve matters.

Post-study work visas

312. The issue of removal of the post-study visas by the UK government was raised as a major concern by both the universities and colleges sectors.

313. The Scottish Government said that it has met with the UK Government at a Ministerial level on the matter, but that "the Home Secretary made it clear at that meeting that the UK Government has no plans to reintroduce post-study work visas".

314. As a next step, the Scottish Government said that a cross-party group (which included representatives of stakeholders with education, student and business interests and all major political parties in Scotland) had been established on the post-study work visa issue.

Better coordination and collaboration

315. Throughout the inquiry, the Committee has heard from different sectors about the need for better coordination and collaboration (both within sectors and across sectors) in their international engagement activities. Additionally several sectors said that they would find a more joined up approach with the Scottish Government and its agencies to be helpful.

316. In its evidence to the Committee, the Scottish Government outlined four ways in which it supports coordination to provide a unified international engagement approach in Scotland as follows.

- The Scottish Government’s document Scotland's International Framework “sets out shared objectives, which will be used in the design of operational plans by Government, Scottish agencies and public bodies. These objectives, and the policy statement that accompanied the Framework, will support our priorities for specific countries, regions and sectors and seek to embed internationalisation in everything we do. In line with the Framework’s objectives we undertake a wide range of activity to coordinate and support international engagement within and across sectors in Scotland”.
The Scottish Government has “committed to supporting international collaboration by establishing One Scotland partnerships and piloting Innovation and Investment Hubs at key global locations. These will promote and develop greater coordination and collaborative working, investment, innovation and knowledge exchange”.

The Scottish Government is a member of the partnership consortium Connected Scotland to allow them to work with key partners on international engagement activities such as transnational education, collaborative research and knowledge exchange, and international student recruitment and mobility.

The Scottish Government takes “a One Scotland Partnership approach to planning ministerial visits overseas. This is done through the establishment of a cross government and agency project planning team who identify appropriate opportunities across a range of areas including government, trade & investment, culture, education and tourism”.

1 Report of fact-finding visit to Scottish universities by the Committee, 30 April 2015.
2 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
3 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
4 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
5 University of Glasgow. Written submission.
6 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
7 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
8 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
9 University of Glasgow. Written submission.
10 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
11 University of Glasgow. Written submission.
12 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
13 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
14 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
15 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
16 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
17 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
18 Report of fact-finding visit to Scottish universities by the Committee, 30 April 2015.
19 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
20 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
21 Scotland Malawi Partnership. Written submission.
22 Scotland Malawi Partnership. Written submission.
23 University of Aberdeen. Written submission.
24 University of Aberdeen. Written submission.
25 University of Aberdeen. Written submission.
26 University of Aberdeen. Written submission.
27 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
28 University of Glasgow. Written submission.
29 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
30 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
31 University of Stirling. Written submission.
32 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
34 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
35 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
36 Report of fact-finding visit to Scottish universities by the Committee, 30 April 2015.
37 Report of fact-finding visit to Scottish universities by the Committee, 30 April 2015.
European and External Relations Committee

Connecting Scotland: how Scottish organisations engage internationally, 5th Report, 2015 (Session 4)

38 Report of fact-finding visit to Scottish universities by the Committee, 30 April 2015.
39 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
40 University of the West of Scotland. Written submission.
41 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
42 Heriot-Watt University. Written submission.
43 Universities Scotland. Written submission.
44 Forth Valley College. Written submission.
45 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
46 West Lothian College. Written submission.
47 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
48 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
49 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
50 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
51 Perth College UHI. Written submission.
52 West Lothian College. Written submission.
54 Colleges Scotland. Written submission.
57 Colleges Scotland. Written submission.
58 West Lothian College. Written submission.
59 Perth College UHI. Written submission.
60 Colleges Scotland. Written submission.
64 Colleges Scotland. Written submission.
68 Colleges Scotland. Written submission.
70 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
73 West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership. Written submission.
75 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
78 East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.
79 City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.
80 City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.
81 Aberdeen City Council. Written submission.
82 Aberdeen City Council. Written submission.
83 Glasgow City Council. Written submission.
84 Angus Council. Written submission.
85 Highlands and Islands Council. Written submission.
86 City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.
87 City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.
88 Argyll and Bute Council. Written submission.
89 East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.
90 West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.
91 COSLA. Written submission.
92 COSLA. Written submission.
93 West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.
West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.


LEADER is a French acronym, standing for ‘Liaison Entre Actions de Développement de l'Économie Rurale’, meaning ‘Links between the rural economy and development actions’.

East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.

Outer Hebrides LEADER Local Action Group. Written submission.

Angus Council. Written submission.

Dundee City Council. Written submission.

East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.

West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.

South of Scotland Alliance. Written submission.

West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.

South of Scotland Alliance. Written submission.


West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.

Highlands and Islands Council. Written submission.

City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.

Glasgow City Council. Written submission.

Glasgow City Council. Written submission.

East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.

Aberdeen City Council. Written submission.

East of Scotland European Consortium. Written submission.

City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.

Aberdeen City Council. Written submission.

West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.


West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.

West of Scotland European Forum. Written submission.

Highlands and Islands Council. Written submission.

East Lothian Council. Written submission.

Highlands and Islands Council. Written submission.

City of Edinburgh Council. Written submission.


East Lothian Council. Written submission.


Transcript of Network for International Development Organisations based in Scotland (NIDOS) and NIDOS members’ presentation to the European and External Relations Committee, 21 May 2015.

Aim Hai Trust. Written submission.

Link Community Development International. Written submission.

Malawi Fruits. Written submission.

Malawi Fruits. Written submission.

Scottish Malawi Partnership. Written submission.

Scottish Government. International Development Policy

Balmore Trust Group. Written submission.

Challenges Worldwide. Written submission.

Challenges Worldwide. Written submission.

Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund (SCIAF). Written submission.

Kenyan Women in Scotland Association. Written submission.

Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.

Link Community Development International. Written submission.

Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
151 Link Community Development International. Written submission and transcript of NIDOS and NIDOS members' presentation to the European and External Relations Committee, 21 May 2015.
152 Transcript of NIDOS and NIDOS members' presentation to the European and External Relations Committee, 21 May 2015.
153 Scottish Malawi Partnership. Written submission.
154 International Development Education Association of Scotland (IDEAS). Written submission.
155 Oxfam. Written submission.
156 Scottish Malawi Partnership. Written submission.
157 Scottish Malawi Partnership. Written submission.
158 Mary’s Meals. Written submission.
159 Oxfam. Written submission.
160 NIDOS. Written submission.
161 SCIAF. Written submission.
164 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
165 Transcript of NIDOS and NIDOS members' presentation to the European and External Relations Committee, 21 May 2015.
166 Transcript of NIDOS and NIDOS members' presentation to the European and External Relations Committee, 21 May 2015.
167 Kenyan Women in Scotland Association. Written submission.
168 Kenyan Women in Scotland Association. Written submission.
170 SHRC. Written submission.
171 SHRC. Written submission.
172 SHRC. Written submission.
173 Amnesty International Scotland. Written submission.
174 Amnesty International Scotland. Written submission.
175 Amnesty International Scotland. Written submission.
176 Royal Society of Edinburgh (RSE). Written submission.
178 Cancer Research UK. Written submission.
179 Royal Society of Edinburgh (RSE). Written submission.
180 EAPN was established in 1990 and is one of the key social European Organisations. It has grown to have member networks in 31 counties (including some outside the EU) and 18 European Organisations. EAPN is funded by the European Commission and lobbies and campaigns on a wide range of issues related to poverty and social exclusion in Europe.
181 Poverty Alliance. Written submission.
182 Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO). Written submission.
187 Poverty Alliance. Written submission.
188 Poverty Alliance. Written submission.
189 Poverty Alliance. Written submission.
191 Poverty Alliance. Written submission.
193 Creative Scotland. Written submission.
194 Visit Scotland. Written submission.
195 British Council Scotland. Written submission.
196 Visit Scotland. Written submission.
197 EventScotland. Written submission.
198 British Council Scotland. Written submission.
199 Scottish Dance Theatre. Written submission.
200 Visit Scotland. Written submission.
European and External Relations Committee
Connecting Scotland: how Scottish organisations engage internationally, 5th Report, 2015 (Session 4)

201 Visit Scotland. Written submission.
202 Creative Scotland. Written submission.
203 EventScotland. Written submission.
204 sportscotland. Written submission.
205 Scottish Student Sport. Written submission.
206 Scottish Student Sport. Written submission.
207 sportscotland. Written submission.
208 Visit Scotland and EventScotland. Written submissions.
209 British Council Scotland. Written submission.
210 British Council Scotland. Written submission.
211 EventScotland. Written submission.
214 Creative Scotland. Written submission.
215 Creative Scotland. Written submission.
216 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
217 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
218 British Council Scotland. sportscotland. Written submissions.
219 European and External Relations Committee. Official Report, 11 June 2015, Col. 27.
222 European and External Relations Committee. Official Report, 11 June 2015, Col. 3.
228 European and External Relations Committee. Official Report, 11 June 2015, Col. 27.
238 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
239 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
240 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
241 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
242 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
243 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
244 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
245 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
246 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
248 Scottish Government. Supplementary written submission.
Annexe A

Extracts from the minutes of the European and External Relations Committee and associated written and supplementary evidence

8th Meeting, 2015 (Session 4), Thursday 14 May 2015

Connecting Scotland: The Committee took evidence, in a round-table discussion, from—
Elaine Ballantyne, Head of External Relations and Investor Support Economic Development, the City of Edinburgh Council;
Anil Gupta, Chief Officer - Communities, Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA);
Malcolm Leitch, European Officer, West of Scotland European Forum (WOSEF);
Joanne Scobie, EU Officer Policy and Partnerships, East of Scotland European Consortium (ESEC);
Gillian Walsh, International Officer, Glasgow City Council.

The City of Edinburgh Council
COSLA
East of Scotland European Consortium (ESEC)
Glasgow City Council, Lord Provost’s and International Office
Highlands and Islands Council
South of Scotland Alliance (SoSA)
West of Scotland European Forum (WOSEF)

9th Meeting, 2015 (Session 4), Thursday 28 May 2015

Connecting Scotland: The Committee took evidence, in a round-table discussion, from—
Gordon Adam, Director of Development and Communications, Royal Society of Edinburgh;
Bruce Adamson, Legal Officer, Scottish Human Rights Commission;
Alison Cairns, Head of Development, Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO);
Andrew Campbell, International Development Manager, Forth Valley College;
Anne Cant, International Manager, Dundee and Angus College;
Dugald Craig, Acting Chief Executive, West of Scotland Colleges' Partnership (WOSCOP);
Julie Hepburn, Advocacy and Education, Amnesty International;
David Hope-Jones, Principal Officer, Scotland Malawi Partnership;
George Hotchkiss, Assistant Principal Curriculum and Innovation, West Lothian College;
Peter Kelly, Director, Poverty Alliance;
Margaret Munckton, Principal and Chief Executive, Perth College;
Shona Pettigrew, Head of External Funding and International Business Development, New College Lanarkshire;
Emma Meredith, International Director, Edinburgh College.

Written evidence
- Amnesty International
- Edinburgh College
- Forth Valley College
- Perth College (UHI) University of the Highlands and Islands
- Poverty Alliance
- Royal Society of Edinburgh
- Scotland Malawi Partnership
- Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO)
- Scottish Human Rights Commission (SHRC)
- West Lothian College
- West of Scotland Colleges’ Partnership (WoSCoP)

11th Meeting, 2015 (Session 4), Thursday 11 June 2015
Connecting Scotland: The Committee took evidence, in a round-table discussion, from—
Mary Allison, Head of Strategic Planning, sportscotland;
Dr Lloyd Anderson, Director, British Council Scotland;
Janet Archer, Chief Executive Officer, Creative Scotland;
Stew Fowlie, Chief Operating Officer, Scottish Student Sport;
Neil Murray, Executive Producer, National Theatre of Scotland;
Liam Sinclair, Joint Executive Producer, Scottish Dance Theatre;
Stuart Turner, Head of EventScotland.

Written evidence
- Creative Scotland
- EventScotland
- Scottish Dance Theatre
- Scottish Student Sport
- sportscotland
- VisitScotland
12th Meeting, 2014 (Session 4), Thursday 25 June 2015

UK’s future relationship with the EU and Connecting Scotland: The Committee took evidence from—
Fiona Hyslop, Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Europe and External Affairs;
Colin Imrie, Deputy Director, Head of European Relations, Scottish Government.

Written evidence

Supplementary written evidence from Fiona Hyslop, Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Europe and External Affairs, 27 August 2015
Annexe B

List of other written evidence

- Aberdeen City Council
- Aim Hai Trust
- Angus Council
- Argyll and Bute Council
- Balmore Trust
- British Council Scotland
- Cancer Research UK
- Challenges Worldwide
- Children in Scotland
- Christian Aid Scotland
- Dunira Strategy
- East Lothian Council
- Glasgow City Council Education Services
- Heriot-Watt University
- Kenyan Women in Scotland Association (KWISA)
- Link Community Development International
- Malawi Fruits
- Mamie Martin Fund
- Mary's Meals
- Network for International Development Organisations (NIDOS)
- North Ayrshire Council
- Outer Hebrides LEADER Local Action Group
- Oxfam Scotland
- Project Trust
- Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund (SCIAF)
- Scottish Fair Trade
- South Asia Voluntary Enterprise (SAVE-UK)
- University of Aberdeen
- University of Glasgow
- University of Stirling
- University of the West of Scotland (UWS)
- Universities Scotland
Annexe C

Fact finding visits and events

- Universities visit, 30 April 2015
- International Development event, 21 May 2015
- Glasgow School of Art visit, 8 June 2015