

Cross Party Group on Malawi

Wednesday November 15th 2017
Scottish Parliament, Committee Room 4

MINUTES

Co-Conveners: Clare Haughey, MSP

Scottish Government Malawi Development Programme

Attendees

1. Clare Haughey – MSP
2. Patrick Harvie - MSP
3. Stuart McMillan – MSP
4. Mark Ruskell – MSP
5. Alexander Stewart – MSP
6. Anthony Andrew
7. Fidelma Beagan – First Aid Africa
8. Charlie Bevan – Tearfund
9. Jennifer Bond – University of Dundee
10. Chris Bunn – University of Glasgow
11. John Burton – LUV+
12. Mia Crampin – University of Glasgow
13. Andrew Cubie – SMP Member
14. Heather Cubie – University of Edinburgh
15. Halla Edwards-Muthu – Rt Hon Lord McConnell of Glenscorrodale
16. Jackie Farr – SMP
17. Lore Gallastegi – The Open University in Scotland
18. Bob Garrow – RS Garrow
19. Gwen Gordon – NHS Tayside
20. Maureen Gowans – SMP Member
21. Beatrice Grant
22. Cindy Gray – University of Glasgow
23. Nigel Harper – LUV+
24. Rev Jack Holt – Church of Scotland
25. Sandra Holt – Church of Scotland
26. David Hope-Jones – SMP
27. Charles Howie – Malawi Fruits
28. Anne Jackson
29. Elyse Kirkham – Toilet Twinning
30. Barry Klaassen – NHS Tayside
31. Lorna McDonald – Tearfund
32. Carol McGregor – SMP Member
33. Mike McKirdy – Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow
34. Angus McLeod – EMMS International
35. Chloe McSherry – University of Dundee
36. Emily Mnyayi – SMP
37. Mary Morrison – EMMS International
38. Ian Nicol – Scottish Government
39. Grace O’Donovan – SMP
40. Olukayode Oki – University of Dundee
41. Madeline Osborn
42. Lucinda Rivers – UNICEF UK
43. Mary Robertson – EMMS International
44. Cat Rawlinson Watkins – EMMS International
45. Ellie Frances Scott-Gray – University of Dundee
46. Georgia Strachan – The Turing Trust
47. Claire Tynte-Irvine – Scottish Government
48. James Wells – EMMS International
49. Peter West – Hon. Consul of Malawi
50. Iain Wilson
51. Kathy Wright – SMP
52. Robert Wright – Edinburgh Napier University
53. Adah Younger

Apologies

Liam McArthur – MSP

Jane Salmonson – The Alliance

Amy Menzies – Christian Aid

Helen Mein – SMP Member

Graeme Reid – Scottish Government

1. Welcome, apologies and minutes of the last meeting

The CPG on Malawi Co-Convenor Clare Haughey MSP welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Apologies were noted (see list above).

Minutes were approved from the previous CPG meeting in September, proposed by Nigel Harper and seconded by Charlie Bevan.

2. Presentation: Global Citizenship: Scotland's International Development Strategy

Ian Nicol and Claire Tynte-Irvine, Scottish Government

Ian Nicol welcomed attendees and began the presentation with an introduction to the context, general vision, and strategy of the Scottish Government in the Malawi Development Programme, as part of Scotland's International Development Strategy. The vision emphasised how the UN Global Goals are fed into Scottish Government priorities, and how these shape the Malawi Development Programme to push thinking 'beyond aid'. The MDP is a tool in delivering this vision, however, Ian noted that it is not the only one.

Ian stated that the Scottish Government priorities are as follows:

- To encourage new historic relationships
- To empower partner countries
- To engage the people of Scotland
- To enhance global citizenship

The Scottish Government investment into the International Development Fund is done through three funding streams: development assistance (c75% initially), capacity strengthening (c20% initially), and investment (c5% initially). Ian explained that these funding streams work together by utilising Scottish expertise, and collaborating with partner countries, civil society, and other donors. Development assistance will include funding models for Malawi, Zambia and Rwanda, Small Grants funding and match funding. It will also seek to enhance global citizenship by supporting civil society in Scotland, ie. Development Education Centres (DECS) and volunteering support for Scotland's young people.

Capacity strengthening will be targeted at harnessing Scottish expertise, ie. capacity building and strengthening partnerships through institutional links (Police Scotland work in Malawi or Blantyre-Blantyre project with Liverpool Welcome Trust, University of Glasgow and College of Medicine), and through skills sharing through professional volunteering (NHS).

Investment aims are directed to move beyond aid and build sustainable economic growth domestically, in line with wider government policies in Malawi, Zambia and Rwanda. A recent investment initiative for Malawi saw the Scottish Government obtain £1million in match funding from private individuals. Ian noted that the International Development Fund spend (for development assistance, capacity strengthening or investment) **must** be to implement the Scottish Government vision, ie. tackling poverty and inequality and contributing to sustainable development.

Changes have also been made to the application process itself from previous funding rounds. It is now a **two-stage application process**, beginning with a concept note summarising why the project is needed and what it seeks to achieve. Successful organisations will then be invited to complete a full application in the second stage. Maximum funding available has increased to £300k per annum, and the maximum project lifespan has increased to 4.5 years. Capital expenditure has increased to 20% of the project budget, while Scottish administrative costs have been capped at 10% of the budget. Another addition is that current or ongoing projects can now apply for continuation.

Projects will only be funded for work set by the Government of Malawi priorities in the following areas: **health, education, civic governance, sustainable economic development and renewable energy.**

The priorities for each strand are as follows:

Health:

- Human resources for health system strengthening
- Universal coverage of essential health services
- Addressing conventional and traditional determinants of health in Malawi
- Quality Assurance and Quality Improvement of Essential Health Services

Civic Governance

- Capacity building for the new Parliament, ie. Committee work
- Institutional capacity building for the Malawi Prison Service (including Young Offender services)
- Support towards the fight against Corruption
- Support organisations advocating for good governance and human rights
- Support organisations advocating for gender equality
- Support for free Paralegal services

Education (General)

- Teacher training (including special needs, especially teacher training for working with students with Learning Difficulties)
- Internal efficiency of the Primarily (sic) school structure
- Decentralisation of education management
- School infrastructure (new classrooms, teacher's houses and latrines)
- Provision of teaching and learning materials
- Inclusive education
- Curriculum strengthening at all levels

- Bursaries to support vulnerable students (particularly Secondary school)
- Up-scaling of school feeding programme (particularly Primary school)
- Upgrading of Community Day Secondary Schools
- Introduction of more double shift schools

Education (Higher)

- Access to higher education
- Training of higher education staff
- Curriculum strengthening in Technical, Entrepreneurial and Vocational Education and Training (“TEVET”) institutions
- Cost recovery mechanisms and finance mobilisation in public universities
- Public Private Partnerships
- Support for capacity to strengthen procurement, financial management, planning, budgeting and monitoring and evaluation systems

Sustainable Economic Development

- Agricultural Development & Value Addition (including irrigation elements)
- Tourism
- Energy (renewable energy) (especially alternative sources of power from Solar)
- Environment and natural resources management
- Finance and investment promotion

Key dates for the funding round are as follows:

3rd November 2017: Applications Open

29th November 2017: Official Information Day

3rd November - 26th January 2018: Concept Note Stage

March 2018: Concept Note Decisions

2nd April – 11th May 2018: Full Application Stage

July 2018: Application Decisions

1st October 2018: Projects Commence

The presentation can be downloaded [here](#).

Questions from guests were welcomed and were directed specifically to Ian and Claire, though it was noted that the CPG was **not** the official Information Day which is held on the 29th November by the Corra Foundation and the Scottish Government, and that –as civil servants- they could not respond to questions about policy.

Representing the Government of Malawi, Peter West, Malawi Hon. Consul to Scotland, expressed concern at the seeming reduction in the total scale of the Malawi Development Programme. Ian answered that when other modalities of Scottish Government funding were included, it came to the £3m minimum previously stated by government. Peter West asked whether if Scottish Government would consider funding more than the £2.5m a year stated in this latest call, if there were sufficient quality applications. Claire Tynte-Irvine said it should not be considered a cut to the Scottish Government’s work with Malawi.

Lorna McDonald from Tearfund asked whether the Scottish Government would discourage projects based on using solar energy, as they are now encouraging projects who use alternatives to solar. Ian noted that the Scottish Government would not discourage solar-based projects, however it should be recognised that solar is not the only solution. Lorna also asked what the involvement of Malawi strand leaders in the application would be. Ian answered that the strand leaders would be involved, although in the last funding round, the strand leaders were flown to Scotland to deliberate in person. This would not be the case this time, however something similar will take place to allow them to have as much involvement.

Heather Cubie of the University of Edinburgh asked for further clarification on the continuation of projects – whether they would only be ones funded by the Scottish Government previously, or whether they could be ones who have showed success but received funding elsewhere. Ian and Claire responded that both would be eligible.

3. Presentation: EMMS International

James Wells and Cat Rawlinson Watkins

James and Cat introduced the previously funded EMMS International project which has helped 160,000 people in Malawi. While their focus is on healthcare, their principles are similarly based on the Scotland Malawi Partnership's agreed Partnership Principles and their priorities are to leverage expertise through dignified partnership, and to move beyond aid while working alongside Scottish Government priorities. In 2016, the Scottish Government provided EMMS International with £50,000 to help manage the state of disaster following the food crisis in Malawi at the time. EMMS International then received a further £30,000 from the Climate Justice Fund for the project. They worked to manage the food shortage and crop destruction, and supported Mulanje Hospital and Nkhoma Hospital. In the North, they provided materials to support long-term solutions to food shortages. James and Cat also specifically thanked the Scotland Malawi Partnership for their help in brokering relationships and solutions through their membership.

4. Presentation: First Aid Africa

Fidelma Beagan

First Aid Africa is a recipient of small grant funding for their work in developing a First Aid syllabus in order to meet the demand of a lack of resources in Malawi on First Aid. Their work supports the next generation of international development workers, especially in training and development. They are also pursuing an 'Ethical Uber' project in Tanzania, which helps to train taxi drivers and motorists how to deliver First Aid when it is needed.

Presentations were followed by a Q&A

Cat Rawlinson-Watkins was asked how EMMS International train their staff. Cat explained that they work directly with staff in Ekwendeni Mission Hospital in Mzuzu, Malawi to implement training for healthcare professionals and community workers. All training is guided by the African Palliative Care Standards.

Charlie Bevan of Tearfund asked all presenters whether they could give one piece of advice for those interested in putting in an application. Fidelma Beagan noted that First Aid Africa had not submitted an application through Malawi Development Programme, and could not answer the question. James and Cat stated that 1) good partnerships, 2) good principles, and 3) having buy-in with the Malawian Government were all key aspects to their project's success.

Fidelma Beagan was asked what the incentive for taxi drivers was when implementing an 'Ethical Uber' in Tanzania. She explained that motorists and taxi drivers generally have a low social status and are 'looked down upon' for having a high statistical chance of being involved in road accidents, so that having the ability to save lives can act as an additional incentive when it boosts their status caché. Fidelma added that in her experience the principle of *Ubuntu*, the sense of collective togetherness, also acts as its own incentive.

5. Dr. Alasdair Allan

Minister for International Development and Europe

Dr. Alasdair Allan paid tribute to the partnerships and links between Scotland and Malawi, and emphasised that the Scottish Government is always looking for new opportunities for the Scottish Government to engage with organisations and the Malawian community in order to learn from experience and continue to strengthen existing relationships. He spoke of the important work done by Humza Yousef MSP and Lord Jack McConnell in the early years of the Scotland-Malawi Cooperation Agreement. Dr Allan also paid tribute to this Cross Party Group and support from the Scotland Malawi Partnership.

This was followed by an open Q&A, where Dr. Allan, and Claire and Ian of the Scottish Government, answered questions. They were asked:

Q: What is the Scottish Government's attitude to corruption in Malawi?

They noted that the Scottish Government does not fund governments, but rather funds the strengthening of civil society. This capacity and freedom of the press were recognised as key. There are rigorous auditing processes on both sides of the partnership.

Q: There are many projects across Scotland that could apply and support Malawi – if more applied and were all eligible could they fund more than the stated maximum total?

The grant round is run on a competitive basis. Organisations must meet the criteria. It is not possible to fund everything but those thinking of applying were encouraged to do so and do their best. It was noted the Scottish Government is not the only source of funding.

Q: Do you envisage a decrease in either the Malawi Development Programme or the total Scottish Government allocation to Malawi in the next three years compared with the past three years?

It depends on the number and quality of applications, however the Scottish Government will meet the minimum commitment of £3 million a year to Malawi.

Q: Is there an estimated amount for each strand?

No, funding is not corralled by strand, it is just down to the projects.

Q: How do you ensure that you can fund sustainability without funding governments?

Capacity is built through people, skills and networks, not by directly funding governments. This is also supported by the civil society organisations in Scotland who engage, and this model is a good one to work by.

Q: One of the Global Goals relates to rare tropical diseases; would this fit into the priorities?

It is not specifically listed but would depend on the case made in the application.

Q: In the Scotland Malawi Partnership's strand meetings, they used an interactive WhatsApp discussion to receive input directly from panels of experts in Malawi. The clear outcomes from this were that finance and human resources are the main issues. Malawi is struggling to fund its own healthcare and the people to sustain the system. Can we lobby other big global institutions to pay the salaries of the staff?

The Scottish Government funding is small at a global scale. However the Scottish Government can do more to use their power to convene to lobby organisations to achieve these goals. However, the onus shouldn't rest on the Scottish Government alone – Scotland as a whole should lobby together.

Q: What is the Scottish Government's attitude to working with private companies? It is acknowledged that this is fraught with political and ethical issues.

There is no ideological issue. Projects funded should be non-profit but that does not mean that working alongside private companies with philanthropic ideals to achieve mutual goals is impossible. There are ways to do this and not cause ethical issues. A project supporting women with fistula was highlighted as a successful model for bringing life-changing health interventions but building in economic independence through a renewables project. This involved joint funding with a commercial partner.

Q: Where is the border between development assistance and capacity strengthening?

Capacity underpins everything. You must show evidence that you are thinking about capacity building within every aspect of the project, ie. new procedures, and building the capacity of medical staff.

6. Any Other Business

Clare Haughey concluded the presentations and Q&A, and introduced any other business to the CPG. It was noted that the Scotland Malawi Partnership has hosted three strand meetings to reflect the Malawi Development Programme priorities thus far (health, civic governance, and sustainable economic development), and would hold the last two this week (education, and renewable energy). All the details from these meetings are shared on the SMP website for those who attended, who could not attend, or who are interested in reading the outcomes from each event.

Attendees were also reminded that the official **Information Day** for this funding round would be held on 29th November 2017 in Edinburgh by the Corra Foundation, and that details of when and where would be announced shortly.

The next CPG will be co-hosted by the International Development Group on 6th February 2018. The next Malawi CPG will be held on 7th March 2018.

Clare Haughey thanked the Minister, those who presented, and everyone for attending. She welcomed everyone to stay and network over Malawian Gin & Tonics.