

Cross Party Group on Human Trafficking

8th March 2017

Committee Room 4

Draft Minutes

Attendance List

Anti-Slavery Commissioner

Kevin Hyland OBE

Tatiana Jardan

Scottish Government

Anncris Robert

Nicolas Duffy

Anna Donald

Philippa Brosnan

Alexandra Devoy

Carolyn Younie

Belinda McEwan

Police Scotland

DCI Stuart Houston

MSP

Ash Denham (Chair)

Ruth McGuire

Mairi Evans

Claire Haughey

Kate Forbes

Andy Bevan IJM

Lorna Ferguson (IJM)

Nicola Weir (Thortons LLP)

Mirren Kelly (COSLA)

Catriona McSween

Jane Stewart (Edinburgh City Council)

Kathy Betteridge (Salvation Army)

Mahlea Babjack (Tiny Hands International)

Megan Farr (Children and Young People's

Commissioner Scotland)

Carol Roxburgh (Soroptimist International)

Sheila Murie (Glasgow City Council)

Paul Rigby (University of Stirling)

Wendy Henderson (City of Edinburgh Council)

Jim Laird (Inverclyde HSCP)

Gordon Macdonald (Care)

Nadia Maloney (Unchained)

Apologies

Kirsty Thomson

Pam Cairns

Alexa Anderson

Margaret Mowat

Rebecca Wallace

Janice Wilson (Soroptimist International
Scotland North)

Ann Henderson

Moria McKinnon (GMSCP)

Hazel Watson

Agenda

1. Welcome and Introduction
2. Adopt minutes of meeting of 26th October 2016.
3. Anti-Slavery Commissioner
 - Kevin Hyland OBE
4. Scottish Government Officials (Human Trafficking & Care and Protection Officials)
 - Anncris Roberts
 - Nicholas Duffy
 - Philippa Brosnan
 - Alexandra Devoy
 - Carolyn Younie
 - Belinda McEwan
5. Police Scotland Assistant Chief Constable (Crime)
 - DCI Stuart Houston
6. AOB
 - Suggested item: Impact of Brexit - potential implications for trafficking.
7. Close

1. Introduction

- Ash Denham MSP Welcomed Kevin Hyland OBE and Tatiana Jordan
- Introduction round the room.

2. Minutes of 26th of October 2016 were not adopted in the meeting but have been adopted via email and published on the Scottish Parliament Cross Party Group Website.

3. Kevin Hyland OBE

- Recognised and acknowledged the work in Scotland and the UK
- Sustainable Development Goal 8.7 – Eradicating Human Trafficking around the world, including the UK.
- Thanked Scottish input in the Scottish Government Strategy, stated good model of consultation
- What is Modern Slavery
 - o Looking at the act and Legislation around the UK
 - o UK seen as world leading in legislation
 - o We've given evidence to Australia.
- Role of the Act: Look at 5 key areas:

1. Victim Identification and care

- 80% of the migrants from Nigeria have been exploited
- \$150 billion industry
- International Community has spent less than \$41 billion
- Not a fair fight
- Thanked the stakeholders for consultation on the NRM
 - o Not fit for purpose
 - o 45 days not sufficient
 - o Danger of being lost in the system
- E.g. Vietnam
 - o Regulate routes/locations but the intelligence just sits there
 - o Nothing is being done
 - o 60% of those in the UK are men and boys however no plan.
 - o No NCA plan

- I want to see a coordinated NCA plan.
- Frank field carrying out a review.

2. Law enforcement and justice

- 1346 NRMS 884 recorded as a crime (2015/2016)
- 154 NRM only 4 recorded as crime
- Recorded somewhere else and doesn't come back
- Difference has reduced this year
- Needs to be treated as a crime.
- We need to make decisions that protect vulnerable people.
- Lancashire – conviction with no victim testimony.

3. Partnership

- E.g. Homeless sector
- Those homeless who had been referred NRM
- Homeless people trafficked of the streets.

4. Private sector

- Coming earing above the £36m threshold are obliged to have a supply policy – Modern Slavery Act 2015
- We are changing corporate culture
- E.g. Phones Mirah (India). We are connected we need to change the culture.
- Domestically still part of it as bad labour standards.
- Questioned whether it is achievable to expect companies to manage this?
 - Yes, no one would defend it's against the law. You wouldn't say the same about rape or other crimes. Only bad labour practice which is accepted.
- Nail Bars and brothels are hidden areas. Supermarket businesses engaged in private sector.

5. International Collaboration

- Gender imbalance, for example gender issues in Nigeria. 90 million for Nigeria. The PM has stated it is the greatest Human rights issue of our time.
- Rule of Law, how do we make a difference?

- International response at the UN Security Council on issue of trafficking in peace keeping response.

Question and Answer

Kate Forbes: What can we do closer to home?

Answer:

- Get translators from country of origin to avoid translation errors (Vietnamese). If enter support agencies – costs?
- Better support regarding intelligence gathering and information sharing.
- Scotland, Northern Ireland and Wales separate border policing.
- Want to work on keeping UK issue but how to connect Scotland with more International research.
- Cabinet Secretary meeting Vietnam
- Police Scotland have done interesting projects in Romania.

Kate Forbes: Does the public know? Visible v Invisible?

Question: In Rural consistencies how do you get the population involved?

Answer:

- Celebrity Ambassadors, voices people will listen to, e.g. Royal Family.
- RNLI examples: RNLI have rescued people at sea who are victims.
- Faith Groups: Moderator of Church of Scotland and other faith groups or reality discussion point in congregations
- Estimate number would go up if more known, pockets of understanding.
- Address political will and culture practices of everyone wants a bargain.
- UN sustainable development goal duty, how is the UN going to hold to account. Day to Day trading private sector accountability.
- Media, women trafficked Albania, still in denial – mindset whereby vulnerability still in police response. Open nail bar or brother or car wash operate for years – statutory responses - and understanding of what is there – been made far too complicated.
- Need to talk about it as a crime in the same way as abuse.
- Public will become interested if clear on what is happening and need to respond.
- Met with some companies to look to supply chain and gather what is required by way or procurement, criminals will find a way around it.
- Supply chains extend to the other side of the world, process and checking robust systems are there.

Gordon Macdonald: Asked what is being done in relation to personal media and communications.

Answer:

- Yes, we do a lot of media in BBC and ITV.
- Sometimes it doesn't resonate with people.
- Need to change strategy responses as well as cultural.

Question: Constraints on inequality of poverty, i.e. some people can't afford the NHS ethical choice.

Answer:

- Need to look at business models
- Structures and controls are important

Paul Rigby: Understanding is relatively high but the problem is how the media portray. The Reality is a bit more complex. The reality of what people are experiencing is now what we understand.

Answer:

- Hull University – the Wilberforce institute suggest that only 8% knew what to look out for.
- Most were aware of slavery globally (e.g. SE Asia or Latin America) but not in the UK.

Jim Laird: The UK is not leading anyone, low prosecution rates, issue of compensation. Request to former Lord Advocate to issue guidance to sheriffs.

Answer:

- Criminals take advantage of weak enforcement of laws
- 216 convictions across the UK
- Police Scotland are stepping forwards, 4 joint investigations internationally
- You need to cut it at both ends
- Sheriff and judge training is being discussed with the cabinet secretary.

Question: Is there a role for the public in providing Care?

Answer:

- Training is need
- It needs to be part of a bigger picture of care.
- Faith community are key in safe repatriation, for example Nigerian cases.
- The public need to see rule of law issue
- The public need to know the reality

Jim Laird: How can we expect victims to come forward?

Answer:

- This ties in with the failure of the NRM.

Nicola Weir: NRM Process is good in theory but not in practice. It's not victim centric.

Answer:

- What does NRM Bring?
- Working for support of children.
- Decision made in Leeds for Decision where there has been no contact and there is no appeal.
- Wholescale review of NRM. Need to change bit by bit.
- It's easier in Scotland – 2 organisations for adult provision of care
- The domestic abuse pathway is clear – why can't the NRM do likewise

Mahlea Babjack – Trafficking routes, can this be shared with the public?

Answer:

- This is accessible.

Question: “Looked after children” associated risks. How to tell general public what it should look for and would you incorporate organisational awareness.

Answer:

- This needs to be looked at
- No one looks at root causes
- We need to make some there is awareness of the reality of the issue
- Simple advice and next steps.

Wendy Henderson: General awareness raising needs to be targeted

Answer:

- NHs – 3 short videos growing out the different jobs and sectors - want to do the same for Scotland.
- Emergency services – fire and police – now working with local government and police.
- Responsibility, skills to protect and safeguards.

Question: Soroptimist – We're doing awareness raising examples.

Answer:

- The power of the Soroptimist.
- Consumer campaigns
- Looking at private sector, know your brand. Every mobile phone contract will say something about it.

Jim Laird: Unaccompanied minors and the vulnerability of children generally.

- The anti-slavery Commissioner cited A21 campaign's work around child friendly spaces.

Gordon MacDonald: Involved in Calais and far more strategic. What worries me is traffickers will find and respond to issue.

Answer:

- What are the issues
- Historical draws
- Addressing organised crime
- Need to address issues at the source

MSP: Political direction and International Development

Answer:

- Still at 0.7%
- US has moved back
- We need to do something upstream

SG Input

- Working on implementations of act and slow down activities key weapons in terms of working action.
- Strategy
- Cab Sec £200,000 awareness raising campaign in September 2017
- Abolish Human Trafficking Awareness Campaign:
 - o 3 actions:
 - ID Victims
 - ID Perpetrators
 - Address conditions
- Media Campaigns and knowing the signs.
- Strategy published by end of May and then implementation
- Implementation of the Act

Gordon Macdonald: Support the victims for over 45 days

Answer:

- Considering extending to 90 days
- Grant to Tara (333K) and Migrant Help (460K)

Andy Bevan:

- Question about awareness raising campaign.
- Slavery terminology

Answer:

- o No chains etc

- Strategy Oversight Group – Senior
- Strategy Implementation Group – Officer led
- Sub groups for each of the action areas & children are going to be established.
- Expertise from this sector and faith community grounds

Wendy Henderson: How do we respond to demand on the back of the publicity campaign

Gordon Macdonald: Longer term care in the community

Answer:

- Some of this exists already
- SG intention is to facilitate this during and beyond 90 days.

Police Scotland

- Unit sits within public protection
- Victim Centric approach
- We draw on organised crime.
- Based at Gartcosh – The Scottish Crime Campus
- S38 chief constable duty to notify
- Awareness raising
- National soap opera
- Get a current message

Collaboration

- Joint investigation teams
- Europol and Eurojust
- Recording of Crimes
- Who recorded NRM
- How Police Scotland were recording crime. Single Act will help
- Police Scotland taking forward SG strategy

Gordon Macdonald: Impact of Brexit?

Answer: We will see.

Nadia Maloney: Use of language in a recent case.

Answer:

- Poor use of words.
- They were vulnerable adults.

Gordon MacDonald: Media Training

Answer

- Media Training available.

Close

NB Actions: No actions from meeting other than to arrange next meeting.