

**BRIEF NOTES OF MEETING**

**“Scotland has a Historic Strategy – so what next?”**

**At Scottish Parliament, Committee Room 4 on Tuesday 29 April 2014 @ 5.30pm**

Our Ref: EM R10 Historic Strategy Mtg Minutes 2014-04-29

**PRESENT**

Nick Allan	RICS Scotland
Tina Avery	Tina Avery Architect
Neil Baxter	RIAS
Petra Bieberbach	Planning Aid Scotland
Kate Byrne	
Jocelyn Cunliffe	Gray, Marshall & Associates
Michael Davis	
Christopher Dingwall	
Linda Fabiani MSP	Scottish Parliament
Lesley Ferguson	RCAHMS
Will Garrett	City of Edinburgh Council
Dr Simon Gilmour	Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
Bruce Hare	Duddingston House Properties
Susan Hothersall	Glasgow Archaeological Society
Rebecca Hughes	Landscape Institute Scotland
Helena Huws	Scottish Canals
Catharine Kidd	Heritage Consultant
John Lawson	City of Edinburgh Council & Algae Scotland
Euan Leitch	Built Environment Forum Scotland
Dr Gavin Macgregor	Northlight Heritage
Mona MacLeod	Scottish Federation of Housing Associations
Eleanor McAllister	Historic Scotland's Advisory Committee
Andrew McConnell	
John McKinney	NFRC
Sarah McKinnon	Strathclyde Buildings Preservation Trust
Craig McLaren	RTPI
Hamish Neilson	Landscape Institute for Scotland
Deirdre Nicholls	Duddingston House Properties
Olwyn Owen	Historic Scotland
Bill Pagan	Built Environment Forum Scotland
Dermot Patterson	LDN Architects
John Pelan	Built Environment Forum Scotland
Dr John Raven	Historic Scotland
Peter Riddoch	Peter Riddoch Architects
Jo Robertson	Built Environment Forum Scotland

Emma Rose	LDN Architects
Dr Jeff Sanders	Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
Adam Wilkinson	Edinburgh World Heritage
Marion Williams	Cockburn Association
Roisin Willmott	RTPI Wales & Northern Ireland
Jonathan Wordsworth	Archaeology Scotland
Luke Wormald	The Scottish Government
Donna Stewart	The Scottish Government
Carol Stobie	Planning Aid for Scotland
Jonathan Gotelee	Jonathan Gotelee Architect
Carol Primrose	
Nikola Miller	RTPI Scotland
Jim MacDonald	A&DS
Mike Mackenzie, MSP	Scottish Parliament
Drew Smith, MSP	Scottish Parliament

## **APOLOGIES**

Keith Anderson	Port of Leith HA
Keith Baker	GCU
Jim Chapman	
Iain Fraser MSP	Scottish Parliament
Gordon Gray	Hackland & Dore Architects Ltd
Jack Hugh	RIAS
Keith Irving	Living Streets
John Knight	
Pat Lally	RIAS
Ingval Maxwell	
Ann Packard	RSA
Dennis Rodwell	Dennis Rodwell Architect
Alistair Scott	Scottish Civic Trust
Craig Stirrat	Fife Housing Association
Jean Urquhart, MSP	Scottish Parliament

## **1.0 WELCOME**

Linda welcomed all present to the meeting.

## **2.0 UPDATE FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

Eugene provided an update on progress with topics from previous meetings

### **A Landscape Charter for Scotland – September 2013**

Based on the discussion at the meeting Linda sent a letter to Fiona Hyslop, Cabinet Secretary for Culture and External Affairs highlighting four specific aspects for consideration and we have recently

received a reply for Paul Wheelhouse MSP Minister for Environment and Climate Change which has been passed to the Landscape institute for consideration.

### **Are Scotland's Places the best places in the world to grow up as a young person? – February 2014**

The young people from Forfar were very inspired by the evening in the parliament and with the help of Space Unlimited they ran a Crowdfunding Campaign and have raised £4,500 to run an exhibition on their project.

### **A Design Model for Rural Tourism and Economy – February 2013**

A Scottish Scenic Routes Initiative was launched by Richard Lohead MSP Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and the Environment in June 2013. Three winning designs have been selected for Inverglas, Falls of Falloch and Loch Lubnaig Beag.

A second design competition is currently underway for 4 more locations Banavie, Laggan; Glenshee and Corgarff

## **3.0 GOING UP OR COMING DOWN?**

Presentation by Dr Simon Gilmour, Director of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Dr Simon Gilmour, Director of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, Vice Chair of the BEFS and convener of its Historic Environment Working Group and Visiting Honorary Fellow at University Campus Suffolk School of Business, Leadership and Enterprise. Educated in Edinburgh University as an archaeologist, Simon has a wide range of experience from building houses to running the national aerial photography survey programme for the RCAHMS.

**Presentation Summary:** The Strategy is vested as a truly collaborative venture, and one that we all own. While it is, for example, potentially evident where the Society aligns with the Strategy, it may be that there are less easily identifiable areas where it can contribute. This is one area where the governance structure could aid individuals and organisations, helping to suggest actions that might otherwise have been overlooked, and thus having a real impact on the organisation. Clarity and transparency of Strategy governance will be required to achieve this though – already there are questions as to accountability and responsibility – if it is everyone's Strategy who is ultimately accountable?

## **4.0 PLACE NOT HERITAGE**

Presentation by Adam Wilkinson, Director of Edinburgh World Heritage

Adam Wilkinson, director of Edinburgh World Heritage since 2008, spent the previous seven years leading heritage campaign charity SAVE Britain's Heritage, which focused on enabling communities in articulating the value of their special places in a way which would be listened to within the political and planning systems, while engaging them in the hunt for productive new uses for their old buildings. Prior to this he did a stint at UNESCO in Paris. He has a particular weakness for late classical and early Byzantine architecture, as well as the early Islamic architecture of the Persian Empire.

**Presentation Summary:** Heritage has long been considered the realm of the dilettante, with experts in history and architecture defining what should and should not be protected. Yet while definitions and our understanding of heritage have moved on, the way we look after our places has yet to find ways to help the rest of us articulate what is to be treasured about our place and communities, and means of protecting it.

## **5.0 FOCUS, COLLABORATION AND JUSTIFICATION**

Presentation by Eleanor McAllister, Non-Executive Member of Historic Scotland's Advisory Committee and Transition Advisory Board

Eleanor McAllister OBE was until its recent completion, the project sponsor for the new campus building at Glasgow School of Art. She has had extensive experience of regeneration initiatives, and was the Chief Executive of Clydebank Re-built Ltd until 2012. She is currently a member of the National Heritage Lottery Scotland Committee and a member of both the Historic Scotland Advisory Committee and the Transition Advisory Board which is assisting in the merger of Historic Scotland and RCAHMS. Eleanor is a former member of Historic Environment Advisory Council for Scotland (HEACS).

**Presentation Summary:** The creation of the Historic Environment Strategy is a triumph in itself, coming, as it does, from a sector which historically has never been able to define what the Historic Environment is, never mind develop a strategy which will protect it, value it, celebrate it, exploit it and encourage its civic ownership. Are we now ready to work together to really deliver what we have all promised in the strategy?

## **6.0 THE EVERY HOUR YOU'RE AWAKE JOB .....**

Presentation by Sarah MacKinnon, Chief Executive, Strathclyde Buildings Preservation Trust

Sarah MacKinnon is a Chartered Building Surveyor and spent a total of 10 years in Local Authorities in the South East of England working in Building Control, Private Housing Standards and Conservation and Regeneration, culminating in a role as Conservation and Projects Surveyor at Gravesham Borough Council. Sarah came to Scotland in 2003 and took up the post of Estates Surveyor and latterly Estates Development Manager, with the National Museums of Scotland before taking up the post of Chief Executive, with Strathclyde Building Preservation Trust in 2005.

**Presentation Summary:** The Historic Environment Strategy is a stirring call to arms and it is incumbent on those of us in the business to answer that call. So how can the Strategy contribute to the delivery of community led building conservation?

## **7.0 Discussion**

Neil Baxter (RIAS) raised concern for the historic environment that is without a community, a point shared by Sarah MacKinnon particularly over vernacular buildings. Adam Wilkinson pointed out that even within settlements it can take years to work with partners to even start a project.

Jocelyn Cunliffe (Gray, Marshall & Associates) raised concern for the future of ecclesiastical heritage and disagreed with Eleanor McAllister's view that conservation had come a long way in the past 40 yrs

and said there was more money available through Scottish Enterprise etc to save threatened buildings in the late 70s early 80s. Eleanor McAllister agreed that funding was a challenge.

Simon Gilmour asked of sites were to be prioritised and things were going to be lost, is the framework right? The Strategy allows the sector to interrogate these questions.

Dave Sutton (Institute of Historic Building Consultants) pointed out the loss of expertise from local government as reported by the IHBC.

Michael Davis accepted that public buy in to heritage was necessary but rigour must be maintained in the Statutory List and in scrutinising 'bottom up views'. Adam Wilkinson responded that the sector should address the question of why we are conserving/preserving, ask what the community values are and suggested that Local Lists may be a way forward using local history societies. Sarah MacKinnon was clear that listing is subjective and it tends to favour polite architecture rather than the vernacular. Simon Gilmour re-emphasised the point that local government must have access to expert advice.

John McKinney (National Federation of Roofing Contractors) asked how we educate homeowners on good repair for traditional buildings.

Jonathan Gotelee emphasised the need for the sector to stop talking to itself but to talk to others of the benefits/importance of the historic environment.

Jonathan Wordsworth (Archaeology Scotland) stated that the value comes from people and the point of preserving places was for people.

Rebecca Hughes (Landscape Institute) feels there's a lack of specific reference to cultural landscapes and these connect people with place.

Eleanor McAllister: The Sector must continue to lobby and advocate on behalf of the historic environment.

Simon Gilmour: The Strategy may require some organisations to do something new. The processes around the implementation of the Historic Environment Strategy must be transparent and accessible.

Sarah Mackinnon: Maintenance of traditional buildings is important and requires education and fiscal assistance.

Adam Wilkinson: Once value is tied down move beyond the object.

## **8.0 KEY POINTS**

The following Key points were identified based on the presentations and discussion at the meeting:-

Governance of the Historic Environment Strategy must be transparent and accessible to all.

Communities and their values must be taken into account in the historic environment.

Historic Environment Strategy needs to be seen to be adopted by wider Scottish Government, beyond the Culture & Heritage Directorate.

Collaboration is imperative with the Scottish Government and local government enabling and supporting communities.

Building maintenance is the basis for good conservation and owners need education and fiscal support.

Access to professional expertise for the public and local government important.

Historic sites without direct communities should not be lost.

## **9.0 Close of Meeting**

Linda thanked Built Environment Forum Scotland and in particular Euan Leitch for assisting with the organisation of this event She thanked the speakers for their excellent succinct presentations.