

T: 0300 244 4000  
E: scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Mr Stephen Kerr  
Convener: Education, Children and Young People  
Committee  
The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
EH99 1SP

24 May 2022

Dear Stephen,

### **Independent Review of Qualifications and Assessment**

I am very pleased to be able to formally confirm to the Committee the appointment of Louise Hayward, Emeritus Professor of Educational Assessment at the University of Glasgow, as Convener of the Independent Review on Qualifications and Assessment. Professor Hayward will provide advice to us on the reform of qualifications and assessment further to the recommendations made in last year's OECD Report and subsequent report by Professor Gordon Stobart.

Professor Hayward will undertake an extensive programme of stakeholder engagement which will commence in earnest imminently and conclude within the first quarter of 2023. Professor Hayward is also committed to taking an inclusive approach and through multiple strands of stakeholder engagement, aims to ensure that everyone who has a stake in the future of qualifications and assessment has an opportunity to feed into the review. In particular, Professor Hayward is keen to ensure that those for whom qualifications matter most, namely young people and their parents and carers, have a central role in the process. She also wishes to ensure that equality issues including race, social class and gender are embedded within the work of the review.

An important early task is to convene an Independent Review Group, bringing together individuals from a range of backgrounds including young people and teachers to discuss a wide variety of issues relating to qualification and assessments. Members of the Independent Review Group will themselves identify individuals from their respective communities to form larger discussion groups, to be known as Collaborative Community Groups. A final version of the Terms of Reference for the Independent Review Group are attached for your information as an annex to this letter and will shortly be published on the Scottish Government's website.

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG  
[www.gov.scot](http://www.gov.scot)

Professor Hayward has also indicated plans for wider engagement with schools and colleges and with the public. These will be developed in partnership with the Independent Review Group over the coming months.

Professor Hayward is due to provide me with an interim report in December 2022 and a final report by March 2023. These dates have been updated in response to feedback from stakeholders following a consultation on the Terms of Reference for the Review. This revised timetable will extend the time available for engagement with stakeholders and will also enable Professor Hayward to take into account emerging findings from the National Discussion on Education, which will be underway in the second half of this year. Professor Hayward has indicated to me that she wishes to work collaboratively with the Committee and has informed me that she will shortly write to you as Convener, to introduce herself and share her plans for communicating with and involving the Committee going forward.

I support Professor Hayward's inclusive and participatory approach and her commitment to ensuring the voices of learners are front and centre in the review. The Scottish Government wants to ensure that the qualifications and examinations system in Scotland enables every young person in Scotland to have their education achievements fairly recognised and I look forward to receiving Professor Hayward's interim report at the end of this year and final report in March 2023.

**SHIRLEY-ANNE SOMERVILLE**

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG  
[www.gov.scot](http://www.gov.scot)

**INVESTORS IN PEOPLE**™  
We invest in people Silver



α

## TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE CONVENER OF THE INDEPENDENT REVIEW GROUP ON QUALIFICATIONS AND ASSESSMENT

### Introduction

1. This document sets out the remit for the Qualifications and Assessment Independent Review Group (IRG), which will be led by Professor Louise Hayward, Professor of Educational Assessment and Innovation at the University of Glasgow (the IRG Convener).

### Background

2. This work stems in part, from the recent OECD reports into Scotland's Curriculum for Excellence (CfE). *Scotland's Curriculum for Excellence - Into the Future* (2021) found that whilst CfE "*continues to be a bold and widely supported initiative, and its design offers the flexibility needed to improve student learning further...the structure, learning practices and assessment approaches in the Senior Phase also need adapting to be consistent with CfE's vision, and to allow for the smooth curriculum experience promised from 3 to 18.*" The subsequent report by Professor Gordon Stobart, *Upper-secondary education student assessment in Scotland: A comparative perspective* (2021) sought to provide insight into the perceived 'misalignment' between curriculum and assessment and to highlight opportunities for reform of assessments in the Senior Phase.
3. In addition to these recent OECD reports, following the cancellation, due to COVID-19, of National 5, Higher and Advanced Higher exams in 2020 and 2021 there has been a renewed public debate in Scotland about assessment, particularly in the Senior Phase. Thus, in October 2021 the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills announced that Professor Louise Hayward of Glasgow University would lead work, consulting on the purpose and principles which should underpin any reform of national qualifications and assessment.
4. This work will take as its starting point, a consideration and analysis of the OECD reports; prior engagement, research and the numerous consultation responses received as part of Professor Ken Muir's work which relate to qualifications and assessment specifically; early engagement by Professor Hayward with colleagues from the Scottish Youth Parliament and Children's Parliament and relevant prior research and surveys of students, teachers and parents & carers on this subject.

### Scope

5. The Convener supported by the IRG and Collaborative Community Groups will provide a report and recommendations to the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, advising on the purpose and principles which should underpin any reform of national qualifications and assessment in the 'Senior Phase'. This will predominately cover S4-6 in school and ages 15-18 out with school, however it is also recognised that there may be implications for some adult learners who study courses which fall within the remit. The focus of this

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG  
www.gov.scot

work will be school and college qualifications accessible in the Senior Phase. The review will not consider or make recommendations on the content of individual courses.

6. It is anticipated that the IRG will explore issues such as:
  - The purposes, uses and relevance of a qualification/awards/exams system, including recognition of learning, accreditation, selection and accountability;
  - The perceived misalignment between curriculum and assessment;
  - Consider the approaches to assessment in vocational and technical subjects and lessons that could be learned from these approaches;
  - Fairness, equity and the impact of different approaches to assessment for qualifications;
  - From ideas to practice – the process of change and learning from our past
  - Wider National and International approaches to the future of assessment and qualifications.
7. The conclusions that the Convener and IRG reach will be made independently of the Scottish Government and all other institutions.
8. The Convener will invite membership to the IRG from individuals who come from a variety of backgrounds and who have a range of skills, expertise and knowledge.

### **Collaborative Community Groups**

9. A key responsibility of IRG members will be to facilitate engagement. Each IRG member will bring together individuals from their community to form a Collaborative Community Group. IRG members will be expected to gather perspectives and views from individuals and groups which reflect the diverse make-up of all of Scotland's communities. They will also be expected to think creatively about how best to engage their respective communities and consequently the operation of individual Collaborative Community Groups is expected to vary. IRG members and Collaborative Community Groups will be supported by the Independent Secretariat within Scottish Government.
10. Evidence and insights gleaned from the Collaborative Community Groups will be brought back to the monthly IRG meetings and will form a fundamental and core part of the overall evidence gathered.

### **Membership of IRG and Collaborative Community Groups**

11. Membership of the IRG and Collaborative Community Groups will ensure that all interested groups with a stake in the future of qualifications have the opportunity to feed into the review. Membership will include, but is not limited to:
  - Those most directly concerned (users, students, parents and carers) ensuring that there are individuals from a diverse range of backgrounds from all of these groups;
  - Those immediately responsible for delivering courses leading to qualifications – teachers, lecturers, school and college leaders and training providers including those representing the Gaelic Medium Education Sector;
  - Those who use these qualifications as young people transition from higher education, further education, employers, and external agencies (e.g. Skills Development Scotland)';

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

- Those responsible for providing such qualifications: e.g. SQA, other awarding bodies and other regulatory bodies (e.g. Qualifications Wales, the NCCA in Ireland);
- Those responsible for local policy in relation to qualifications, e.g., local education authorities and the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland’;
- Researchers in fields essential to the work of the group, e.g., curriculum, qualifications and assessment, equality and social justice, accountability, national and international assessment systems, sustainable change.
- Representation from all parts of the country, in both urban and rural settings.

## Activities

12. The Convener and IRG will undertake the following activities:

- Develop and then collectively agree through a process of co-design a set of overarching principles for assessment. These principles will guide and inform the review process itself;
- Establish Collaborative Community Groups that ensure all interested groups with a stake in the future of qualifications have the opportunity to feed into the review;
- Review relevant existing evidence and research;
- Commission national and international evidence to inform deliberations, as appropriate;
- Consider its work in the wider context of other relevant strategic reports including for example the work conducted by Professor Muir into the replacement of SQA and the reform of Education Scotland and the recommendations of the Scottish Funding Council Review for the Tertiary Sector;
- Work in conjunction with the forthcoming National Discussion on education and ensure relevant findings from the Discussion are taken into account in preparing a final report;
- Consider and take cognisance of the history and development of qualifications and assessment in Scotland to date;
- Produce practical recommendations that are forward looking, have a broad consensus of support and are in alignment with the values of Scottish society;
- Provide advice on the implementation of future change and potential timeframes.

## Outcomes and approach

13. The Independent Review Group will:

- demonstrate through its working practices a commitment to placing learners at the centre;
- work at all times in an open, transparent participative and inclusive way; and seek to embody and promote ways of working that reflect these principles;
- establish Collaborative Community Groups which operate in a non-hierarchical way and facilitate widespread and in-depth meaningful engagement with individuals and groups across Scotland, in particular with those most affected namely learners and parents and carers;
- seek to build consensus and agreement to a shared future vision;

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

- use a range of analytical approaches to generate evidence from policy, practice and research and from that draw evidence based conclusions;
- publish relevant material on the Scottish Government website in a timely manner.

14. The Convener will:

- work at all times in an open, transparent, participative and inclusive way; and seek to embody and promote ways of working that reflect these principles;
- convene a meeting of the IRG on a monthly basis;
- meet the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills regularly during the lifespan of the group to update her on progress;
- ensure IRG members are supported to fulfil their responsibilities as detailed above;
- provide the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills with an interim report and
- Produce a final report which is accessible and user friendly.

## Timescales

15. The Convener will begin this work in Spring 2022 and it will conclude by the end of March 2023.

Action	Timing
First meeting of IRG	May
First meeting of IRG and Collaborative Community Groups	Early June
Engagement	May – November
Interim report	by end of December 2022
Final recommendations	by end of March 2023

## Secretariat support

16. Secretariat support required by the Convener, the IRG and Collaborative Community Groups will be provided through the Education Reform Directorate in Scottish Government. The Secretariat will work independently of the Scottish Government in support of the Review.

## Sponsor arrangements

17. The Curriculum and Qualifications Division in the Education Reform Directorate will be the Convener's sponsor Division within the Scottish Government. The named sponsor for this work will be the Deputy Director for Curriculum and Qualifications, Laura Murdoch.

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG  
www.gov.scot

**INVESTORS IN PEOPLE**  
We invest in people Silver



α