

# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 1, No. 83, Session 6

Meeting of the Parliament

### Wednesday 23 February 2022

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

**1. Portfolio Questions:** Questions on Justice and Veterans, and then Finance and the Economy were answered by Cabinet Secretaries, Ministers, and the Solicitor General.

2. Preventing the Collapse of NHS Dentistry in Scotland: Sandesh Gulhane moved S6M-03281—That the Parliament notes with concern that almost half of people in Scotland have been unable to see an NHS dentist for the last two years; further notes the Scottish Government's proposed withdrawal of emergency funding provided to dental practices on 1 April 2022; believes that this funding should be maintained for the upcoming financial year in recognition of the considerable efforts still required to restore services and reduce the significant backlog of patients seeking dental treatment, particularly while maintaining enhanced infection control measures; recognises the importance of regular dental check-ups for people of all ages, both for good dental hygiene and in the detection of some forms of oral cancer; acknowledges the concerns expressed by many in the profession that the current settlement risks making NHS dentistry financially unviable; calls on the Scottish Government to come forward with a plan for ensuring the long-term sustainability of NHS dentistry, including a complete overhaul of the current fee structure to more accurately reflect modern dentistry; further calls on the Scottish Government to increase the dental tariffs provided by government to NHS dentists by a third as an interim measure to sustain NHS dental services, and ensure that all people in Scotland are able to access a dental check-up in 2022 and every year as clinically required thereafter, and calls for the development of a more holistic service that NHS patients deserve, in place of the current conveyor belt system.

The Minister for Public Health, Women's Health and Sport (Maree Todd) moved amendment S6M-03281.2—

As an amendment to motion S6M-03281 in the name of Sandesh Gulhane (Preventing the Collapse of NHS Dentistry in Scotland), leave out from "with concern" to end and insert "the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on all aspects of healthcare, not least on the delivery of dental services due to the volume of aerosol generating procedures, and the impact that this has had on patients seeking appointments during this period; acknowledges that the challenges posed by the pandemic, including the backlog of care, are not unique to Scotland; notes the substantial pandemic-related investment in dentistry of the last two years that includes £5 million for ventilation improvements, £7.5 million for new dental drills, £35 million for additional PPE, and £50 million of financial support to dental practices; recognises that investment in NHS dentistry is increasing to a record high level with a 9% increase in the budget for dental services in 2022-23, including extending the reach of the Childsmile programme in high-street practices to young people up to 17 years of age: welcomes that the Scottish Government is providing dentists with an additional £20 million from February 2022 to give them new and additional incentives to see more patients, and that discussions continue with the British Dental Association on further reforms to support recovery: believes that NHS dentistry, like all NHS services, should be free at the point of need and supports the removal of all NHS dental charges to patients by the end of this parliamentary session, and further supports the Scottish Government's Oral Health Improvement Plan, which underpins that the frequency of dental checks should be shaped by clinical evidence and an individual patient's oral health risk assessment, with those at the highest risk being seen more frequently."

Jackie Baillie moved amendment S6M-03281.1—

As an amendment to motion S6M-03281 in the name of Sandesh Gulhane (Preventing the Collapse of NHS Dentistry in Scotland), insert at end "; is concerned by the growing inequality in access to NHS dental care, with recent statistics showing that thousands of people in the most deprived areas have not seen a dentist in over two years; believes that immediate action is needed by the Scottish Government to avoid a two-tier dental system, and urges the Scottish Government to take urgent action to ensure that everyone, irrespective of background or circumstances, has access to first-class NHS dental treatment."

After debate, the amendment S6M-03281.2 was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 70, Against 56, Abstentions 0). The amendment S6M-03281.1 was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 56, Against 70, Abstentions 0).

The motion, as amended, was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 69, Against 57, Abstentions 0).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved— That the Parliament notes the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on all aspects of healthcare, not least on the delivery of dental services due to the volume of aerosol generating procedures, and the impact that this has had on patients seeking appointments during this period; acknowledges that the challenges posed by the pandemic, including the backlog of care, are not unique to Scotland; notes the substantial pandemic-related investment in dentistry of the last two years that includes £5 million for ventilation improvements. £7.5 million for new dental drills, £35 million for additional PPE, and £50 million of financial support to dental practices; recognises that investment in NHS dentistry is increasing to a record high level with a 9% increase in the budget for dental services in 2022-23, including extending the reach of the Childsmile programme in high-street practices to young people up to 17 years of age; welcomes that the Scottish Government is providing dentists with an additional £20 million from February 2022 to give them new and additional incentives to see more patients, and that discussions continue with the British Dental Association on further reforms to support recovery; believes that NHS dentistry, like all NHS services, should be free at the point of need and supports the removal of all NHS dental charges to patients by the end of this parliamentary session, and further supports the Scottish Government's Oral Health Improvement Plan, which underpins that the frequency of dental checks should be shaped by clinical evidence and an individual patient's oral health risk assessment, with those at the highest risk being seen more frequently.

**3.** Workplace Parking Tax: Graham Simpson moved S6M-03279—That the Parliament condemns taxing drivers through the introduction of the Workplace Parking Levy, and believes that the focus of the Scottish Government should be on supporting the roll-out of electric vehicles and the infrastructure to support them and on making public transport more efficient and affordable, not on using taxes to force families in Scotland into giving up their cars.

The Minister for Transport (Jenny Gilruth) moved amendment S6M-03279.2—

As an amendment to motion S6M-03279 in the name of Graham Simpson (Workplace Parking Tax), leave out from "condemns" to end and insert "notes that the Transport (Scotland) Act 2019 gives local authorities the discretionary power to implement a workplace parking licensing scheme within the context of their local transport strategy and, if a scheme is proposed, requires local authorities to undertake consultation and impact assessments on their local proposals; welcomes that COSLA and local leaders of political parties positively greeted these new powers being provided to local authorities at the time of the Act in 2019; acknowledges that local authorities in England and Wales have had these powers for over a decade, with Nottingham City Council so far making use of them, and other authorities, including Oxford and Leicester, now also considering their use, and recognises that, as well as supporting a reduction in congestion and meeting climate change goals, workplace parking schemes will raise revenue to invest in local transport priorities, including public transport and active travel, and align with other recent Scottish Government initiatives such as free bus travel for under-22s, record investment in active travel, investment in electric vehicle infrastructure and the target to reduce car kilometres by 20% by 2030."

Neil Bibby moved amendment S6M-03279.1—

As an amendment to motion S6M-03279 in the name of Graham Simpson (Workplace Parking Tax), leave out from ", not on using taxes" to end and insert "; believes that the Workplace Parking Levy will unfairly penalise working people who have no option but to drive to work due to the chronic failure of the Scottish Government to improve public transport; regrets the Scottish Government's decision to reject calls for a freeze on rail fares this vear: considers that the Scottish Government's decision to pursue policies that increase costs faced by workers during a cost of living crisis is irresponsible; notes objections to the Workplace Parking Levy from trade unions and the business community, and considers that the Scottish Government should make positive interventions to tackle transport emissions, reduce car dependency and drive modal shift by making public transport more affordable, safe and accessible, restoring ScotRail services to pre-pandemic levels, supporting municipal ownership and control of local bus services, developing safe cycling routes, and rolling out integrated ticketing across the public transport network."

After debate, the amendment S6M-03279.2 was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 70, Against 56, Abstentions 0). As a result, amendment S6M-03279.1 was pre-empted.

The motion, as amended, was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 71, Against 55, Abstentions 0).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved— That the Parliament notes that the Transport (Scotland) Act 2019 gives local authorities the discretionary power to implement a workplace parking licensing scheme within the context of their local transport strategy and, if a scheme is proposed, requires local authorities to undertake consultation and impact assessments on their local proposals; welcomes that COSLA and local leaders of political parties positively greeted these new powers being provided to local authorities at the time of the Act in 2019; acknowledges that local authorities in England and Wales have had these powers for over a decade, with Nottingham City Council so far making use of them, and other authorities, including Oxford and Leicester, now also considering their use, and recognises that, as well as supporting a reduction in congestion and meeting climate change goals, workplace parking schemes will raise revenue to invest in local transport priorities, including public transport and active travel, and align with other recent Scottish Government initiatives such as free bus travel for under-22s, record investment in active travel, investment in electric vehicle infrastructure and the target to reduce car kilometres by 20% by 2030.

**4. Revision to Business Programme:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03334—That the Parliament agrees to the following revision to the programme of business for Thursday 24 February 2022—

delete

*followed by* Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee Debate: COP26 - Outcomes and Implications for Scotland's Climate Change Policies

and insert

followed by Scottish Government Debate: Solidarity with Ukraine

The motion was agreed to.

**5. Business Programme:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03301—That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business-

Tuesday 1 March 2022

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Ministerial Statement: Update on Scotland's Climate Assembly

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: A Scottish Approach to the Mental Health and Wellbeing of Our Veterans in Each Community

followed by Committee Announcements

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 2 March 2022

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Covid Recovery and Parliamentary Business; Net Zero, Energy and Transport

*followed by* Constitution, Europe, External Affairs and Culture Committee Debate: Internal Market Inquiry

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: Local Government Finance (Scotland) Order 2022 [draft] *followed by* Scottish Government Debate: UK Shared Prosperity Fund - What This Means for Scotland

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Approval of SSIs (if required)

5.40 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Thursday 3 March 2022

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

followed by Members' Business

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Rural Affairs and Islands

*followed by* Ministerial Statement: The Introduction of the Gender Recognition Reform (Scotland) Bill

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: The Value of Public Service Broadcasting to Scotland

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

Tuesday 8 March 2022

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Scottish Government Business

followed by Committee Announcements

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 9 March 2022

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Health and Social Care; Social Justice, Housing and Local Government

followed by Scottish Labour Party Business

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Approval of SSIs (if required)

5.10 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Thursday 10 March 2022

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

followed by Members' Business

2.15 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.15 pm Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body Questions

followed by Portfolio Questions: Constitution, External Affairs and Culture

*followed by* Ministerial Statement: Scottish Government Response to Report by Independent Advisory on Education Reform

followed by Scottish Government Business

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

(b) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 28 February 2022, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.

The motion was agreed to.

6. **Stage 1 Timetable:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03308—That the Parliament agrees that consideration of the Coronavirus (Recovery and Reform) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1 be completed by 12 May 2022.

The motion was agreed to.

**7. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03303—That the Parliament agrees that the Deposit and Return Scheme for Scotland Amendment Regulations 2022 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 68, Against 56, Abstentions 1).

**8. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03302—That the Parliament agrees that the Climate Change (Nitrogen Balance Sheet) (Scotland) Regulations 2022 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**9. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03304—That the Parliament agrees that the Greenhouse Gas Emissions Trading Scheme (Amendment) Order 2022 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**10. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03305—That the Parliament agrees that the Maximum Number of Judges (Scotland) Order 2022 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**11. Committee Meeting Times:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03306—That the Parliament agrees that, under Rule 12.3.3B of Standing Orders, the Finance and Public Administration Committee be given permission to meet at the same time as a

meeting of the Parliament between 1.30 pm and 3.45 pm on Thursday 24 February 2022.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**12. Designation of Lead Committee:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-03307—That the Parliament agrees that the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee be designated as the lead committee in consideration of the Scottish Local Government Elections (Candidacy Rights of Foreign Nationals) Bill at stage 1.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**13. Decision Time:** The Parliament took decisions on items 2, 3, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 and 12, as noted above.

14. Celebrating LGBT History Month: The Parliament debated S6M-02984 in the name of Karen Adam-That the Parliament recognises that February is LGBT History Month; notes that this year's theme is Blurring Borders: A World in Motion, which invites people to think beyond borders and to ask each other what Scotland's place is within the global movement towards equality; highlights what it sees as the vital and continued efforts of Four Pillars, which is a charity that strives to maintain a sense of community for LGBT+ people across the north east of Scotland by supporting four aspects it considers are vital to wellbeing, which are mental, emotional, physical and sexual health; understands that LGBT History Month is coordinated by LGBT Youth Scotland, a national charity aimed at promoting health and wellbeing among LGBTI young people aged 13 to 25 across the country, hosting in-person and online events in partnership with, among others, Leap Sports Scotland, the National Library of Scotland and the National Lottery Heritage Fund Scotland; wishes all involved every success in their endeavours, and notes the call for everyone to support the campaign and raise awareness of the part that everyone can play in making Scotland a fairer, just and more equal society for all who live here.

**15. Motion without Notice:** Karen Adam moved without notice that, under Rule 8.14.3, the debate be extended by up to 30 minutes. The motion was agreed to.

The meeting closed at 6.48 pm.

David McGill Clerk of the Parliament 23 February 2022

#### Appendix (Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)

#### Subordinate Legislation

#### **Affirmative Instruments**

The following instruments were laid before the Parliament on 23 February 2022 and are subject to the affirmative procedure—

- Local Government Finance (Scotland) Order 2022 [draft] laid under paragraph 2(3) of schedule 12 of the Local Government Finance Act 1992
- Coronavirus (Scotland) Acts (Amendment of Expiry Dates) Regulations 2022 [draft] laid under section 12(5) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) Act 2020 and section 9(5) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) (No. 2) Act 2020

#### **Negative Instruments**

The following instrument was laid before the Parliament on 23 February 2022 and is subject to the negative procedure—

Coronavirus (Scotland) Acts (Early Expiry of Provisions) Regulations 2022 (SSI 2022/64)

laid under section 13(3) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) Act 2020 and section 10(4) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) (No. 2) Act 2020

#### **New Documents**

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 23 February 2022 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

Proposed extension of the Coronavirus (Scotland) Act 2020 and the Coronavirus (Scotland) (No.2) Act 2020: Statement of Reasons SG/2022/19 laid under section 12(6) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) Act 2020 and section 9(6) of the Coronavirus (Scotland) (No.2) Act 2020

The Sea Fish Industry Authority (Seafish) Annual Report & Accounts 2020/21 SG/2022/31 laid under Section 11(8) of the Fisheries Act 1981

The Local Government Finance (Scotland) Order 2022 – Report by the Scottish Ministers SG/2022/33 laid under paragraph 2(3) of schedule 12 of the Local Government Finance Act 1992

Published by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact Public Information on: Telephone: 0131 348 5000 or 0800 092 7500 Email: sp.info@parliament.scot Live chat on parliament.scot You can write to us in any language or contact us using the Text Relay service or in British Sign Language through contactScotland-BSL.

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website -<u>www.parliament.scot</u> or by contacting Public Information.