Do you think the current and proposed level of investment in new ferries and port infrastructure is enough to ensure the resilience of the Clyde and Hebrides ferries network in future years?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why do you think this?

This response has been prepared by the Ferry Users Group from Millport, Isle of Cumbrae.
Chair: Kari Welsh:
Prepared by: Angus Campbell:

The investment in both piers and vessels is inadequate

1. The investment in replacement vessels committed to by the Scottish Government in the Dec 2012 Ferries Plan (2013-2022) as per the table below has yet to materialise as none of the medium term or long term plans have even come off the drawing board in the extract from the Ferries Plan as below

Vessel Replacement Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposal</th>
<th>Estimated Timing</th>
<th>Estimated Funding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short-term</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase 2 Hybrid Vessels</td>
<td>Current</td>
<td>£63 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secure new Stornoway-Ullapool vessel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medium-term</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Isle of Cumbrae</td>
<td>To 2016</td>
<td>£45 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Hebridean Isles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long-term</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Isle of Arran</td>
<td>To 2019</td>
<td>£90 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Loch Linnhe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Loch Riddon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace Isle of Mull</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This lack of investment has resulted in
• The age of the fleet continuing to increase.
• This age is resulting in increasing unreliability
• Compounded by a significant increase in demand to travel to the islands encouraged by RET.

These factors are now impacting on the future economic growth of the island communities served by Calmac due to the limited capacity of the antiquated vessels, and the minimal replacement plans.

The value for money for the recent ferries supplied is also of concern as the cost of the technologies (Hybrid) etc has resulted in replacement ferries being significantly above the value of previous vessels e.g.
2007 : MV Loch Shira : 26 cars 250 passengers 54m vessel £6m
2012 : MV Catriona : 23 cars 150 passengers 43m vessel £12.3m
• A smaller carrying capacity for over double the cost !

2. Increased weather extremes, and risk aversion of ferry operators lead to increased disruption during typical Scottish Winters, and there is no targeted investment to improve the weather resilience of ships or ports.

Specifics for Largs to Cumbrae
1. Loch Riddon vessel is aged, and according to the Ferries Plans should be getting replaced in 2019, and is of limited capacity to accommodate modern cars, typically carrying only 50 to 70% of its original design payload, and is now over 30 years old.
   CMAL typically consider a vessel at end of life at 30 years old.
   a. Retrofitting / Refurbishment could give options to increase car deck capacity, but may impact on passenger numbers, which would be detrimental in encouraging foot passengers.

2. To improve resilience to changing weather patterns the exposed Cumbrae Slip has no weather protection, and the wind and sea conditions at this landing point require improved to reduce the frequency of ferry disruption. The weather conditions at Cumbrae slip probably contributes to 70% of weather cancellations

There are a number of opportunities for CMAL to engage with the communities, to consider option to improve this position

**Handling increasing passenger numbers**

Has sufficient investment been made in vessels and port/harbour facilities to handle increased passenger numbers, particularly since the introduction of the Road Equivalent Tariff (RET) fares?

RET is a distance based fares structure, which ties ferry fares to the cost of travelling the equivalent distance by road. The formula for calculating RET fares involves a fixed element and a rate per-mile, based on independent research into the cost of motoring.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why do you think this and do you have any route specific examples to support your view?
To meet the increased traffic generated by RET (vehicles and passengers), vessel and passenger capacity requires to be increased as it is inadequate. The lack of investment to deliver the agreed Ferries Plan from 2012 is a significant contributory factor to address the capacity issues across the network.

There have been, to date, no specific RET investments in the Largs to Cumbrae route associated with RET.

For the Largs to Cumbrae Route, the reduced cost (to visitors (not to Locals!)) has resulted in excessive queues impacting the safe flow of pedestrian travellers and vehicle queues in the streets around the ferry terminals, resulting in commonly >50 cars queuing for >1 hour and queues of passengers (50 to 100) awaiting transport. On some occasions (several times a month over good summer weather) these queues can exceed 100 cars and several hundred passengers.

Specifics for Largs to Cumbrae

1. Traffic Volume Issues
   a. Disruption in Largs due to queuing traffic, causing congestion around the streets (50 -100 cars queued)
   b. Timetable delays for ferries due to being unable to unload cars due to Main St Largs being gridlocked due to through traffic, and lack of priority for traffic lights to enable ferry to be unloaded promptly enough to maintain the timetabled sailings
   c. Safety issues on Cumbrae with 50 -100 cars queued leaving inadequate road space to accommodate
      i. 2 way traffic to and from the ferry, including up to 8 buses per hour
      ii. Large number of walkers and cyclists
      iii. One lane of the B class road blocked by queuing ferry traffic
   d. Parking and Congestion
      i. Large number of vehicles on small island roads
      ii. Parking issues within Millport
      iii. Reduced safety to walkers and cyclists, on the island as the number of vehicles detract from the “safe” island environment
      iv. Reduced spend in the island businesses as a car loaded with supermarket food from Glasgow, will not spend much money in the community
   e. The mix between foot passengers, and people in cars has changed which has reduced foot passengers travelling onto the island, which reduces the visitors who will spend money in the community through bus travel and food and drink purchases

2. Vessel Capacity
   a. Lack of capacity on vessels for vehicles (particularly smaller “Loch Riddon” ferry) which is typically can only be loaded with 8 cars rather than its design capacity of 12 cars (CMAL believes it should carry 10!)

3. Ticketing
   a. Due to the lack of an effective online ticketing system, then all foot passengers and car passengers must purchase tickets from the office in Largs, leading to passenger queuing impacting on promenade / pavements around Largs Pier, and on promenade
      i. It is understood that Calmac are awaiting an approved Scottish Government ticketing system to replace their archaic system.

4. Fares
a. Increased visitors to Cumbrae are welcome, as it is an attractive place to visit, and requires a continuing and increasing economic contribution from tourism which is essential to stem the depopulation of the island.

b. RET has made it more attractive for people to travel to Cumbrae by car rather than public transport, leading to
   i. Excessive vehicle queues as above
   ii. Large number of vehicles on small island roads
   iii. Parking issues within Millport
   iv. Reduced safety to walkers and cyclists, on the island as the number of vehicles detract from the “safe” island environment
   v. Reduced spend in the island businesses as a car loaded with supermarket food from Glasgow, will not spend much money in the community

c. Increased fares for vehicles at peak times may redress some of this balance, however this option may go against the RET structure associated with “single tier” fares, and may penalise island residents.

EU State Aid Rules

What impact could changes to the application of EU state aid and procurement rules have on ferries investment - whether as a result of British exit from the EU or through some other change?

- May give opportunities to improve control of ferry services.
- However should not be used to encourage inefficiency in CalMac or CMAL

Impact on island life

How might island life be affected, particularly access to essential services, if Clyde and Hebrides ferry services are not appropriately funded?

‘Appropriately funded’ in this question means that island communities are provided with the level of ferry service that they require to access day-to-day services and emergency services.

Largs and Cumbrae’s economic prosperity and their attractiveness for visitors to enjoy is associated with the pleasant coastal environment. Both communities rely heavily on day trippers for their peak summer business

- If the terms “appropriately funded” mean minimum / reduced funding, then any reduction in the ferry service from Largs to Cumbrae will impact on the capabilities to carry the necessary visitors to Cumbrae.
  o A reduced service would increase queuing and restrict visitors.
  o It would impact on the economic prosperity
  o Drive away residents who rely on the ferry service to commute
  o This would increase de-population and
  o Threaten the economic wellbeing of the Community
  o May compromise the essence of lifeline services

- If the terms “appropriately funded” mean a suitable level of funding to grow the service to meet the economic aspiration of the community, through
  o increased visitors to the island, who spend money in island businesses to maintain and expand job prospects and grow the island economy
To encourage families to relocate to the island by improving commuting links
To encourage businesses to be established on the island to provide jobs

Validity of Ferries Plan: Inaccuracies and Ineffective Consultation

It should be noted, that particularly with respect to Cumbrae the Ferries Plan is somewhat fundamentally flawed reflecting minimal consultation, so it is far less representative of community expectations that it should have been.

- If Transport Scotland wish to fully implement the wording of the Ferries plan on Cumbrae, then the community would welcome the re-introduction of a ferry service from Largs directly to Millport, and the associated re-development of the pier and landing facilities within the Town.

  o “Cumbrae is served by a single ferry service that links the main settlement at Millport with Largs on the Scottish mainland”

  o The Ferries plan makes no reference to that fact that the current service operates to Cumbrae slip, and assumes a direct connection to Millport, avoiding the need for connecting bus services, or a 3 mile walk!

§ This reflects the degree of diligence and effective consultation that was taken in the assembly of this plan for Cumbrae!

- There is a currently high profile vocal campaign to “Save Millport Pier” and if Transport Scotland want to support the justification to save the pier, by funding pier improvements to provide a full Largs to Millport service as described in the ferries plan then we are sure that North Ayrshire council would be delighted to have additional funding body to support this!

Do you have any concerns about the accessibility of ferries and port/harbour facilities, and, if so, what investment might be needed to address these concerns?

'Accessibility' in this question means that anyone with a disability or mobility issue is able to access Clyde and Hebrides ferries, ports and harbours without difficulties.

The fundamental operation of a ferry loading on a sloped slipway does give challenges with accessibility.

- Additionally a steep slope, on Cumbrae Slip up to the bus stop is a challenge to even fit and healthy people.
  - This slope should be addressed to improve the ease of access from bus to ferry
- Calmac can and do support individuals who ask for assistance on and off the vessel
- For a mobility restricted driver, then ticket purchase can be an issue, as the only way to purchase a ticket is to park your car in the queue, and walk to the ferry office to purchase a ticket. This can be challenging, due to the distances to be walked with the large queues of cars.
Online purchase of ticketing / Smart ticketing may improve this situation, but government procurement processes appear to be continuing to slow its deployment.

Transport spending priorities

What level of priority should the Scottish Government give to funding Clyde and Hebrides ferry services within the overall transport budget, which also covers spending on other transport modes, including trunk roads, rail, aviation, buses, walking and cycling and low carbon vehicles?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Priority</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Priority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Priority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why do you think this?

The investment in replacement vessels committed to by the Scottish Government in the Dec 2012 Ferries Plan (2013-2022) as per the table below has yet to materialise as none of the medium term or long term plans have even come off the drawing board in the extract from the Ferries Plan as below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vessel Replacement Programme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase 2 Hybrid Vessels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secure new Stornoway-Ullapool vessel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Isle of Cumbrae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Hebridean Isles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Isle of Arran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Loch Linnhe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace MV Loch Riddon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replace Isle of Mull</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To 2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This lack of investment has resulted in:
- The age of the fleet continuing to increase.
- This age is resulting in increasing unreliability.
- Compounded by a significant increase in demand to travel to the islands encouraged by RET.

These factors are now impacting on the future economic growth of the island communities served by CalMac due to the limited capacity of the antiquated vessels, and the minimal replacement plans.
The Island Bill has a policy about “improving outcomes for island communities”, and without adequate transport links this can never be achieved.

The lack of investment to deliver the minimum of the Ferries Plan from 2012, and the consequential unreliability of the ferry services on the Calmac CHFS contract over the past couple of years currently

- compromise’s any “positive outcome”

for the West Coast islands served by this contract. The core of these unreliability issues are associated with aged vessels becoming more unreliable by the year, and with no funding for the agreed replacement plans, laid out in the 2012 Ferries Plan, then this unreliability is anticipated to worsen rather than improve. the only 2 vessels on order (Glen Sannox and its sister “802” being constructed at Fergusons yard in Port Glasgow are significantly delayed and don’t address the wider issues of the aging fleet

Largs and Cumbrae’s economic prosperity and their attractiveness for visitors to enjoy is associated with the pleasant coastal environment. Both communities rely heavily on day trippers for their peak summer business

- The ferry service requires to be given a suitable level of funding to grow the service to meet the economic aspiration of the community, through
  - increased visitors to the island, who spend money in island businesses to maintain and expand job prospects and grow the island economy
  - To encourage families to relocate to the island by improving commuting links
  - To encourage businesses to be established on the island to provide jobs

- Cycling and walking are key attractions on Cumbrae, but the large number of cars detracts from the enjoyment. Focus on the ferry facilities to encourage these cycling and walking areas are entirely consistent with improving leisure and health and wellbeing within Scotland.

This response has been prepared by the Ferry Users Group from Millport, Isle of Cumbrae
Chair : Kari Welsh : Prepared by : Angus Campbell:
-----------------------------------
-----------------------------------