



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

PUBLIC AUDIT AND POST-LEGISLATIVE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

MINUTES

11th Meeting, 2016 (Session 5)

Thursday 1 December 2016

Present:

Colin Beattie	James Kelly (Committee Substitute)
Jenny Marra (Convener)	Gail Ross
Liz Smith (Committee Substitute)	Ross Thomson

Apologies were received from Liam Kerr (Deputy Convener), Monica Lennon, Alex Neil.

The meeting opened at 9.00 am.

1. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to take items 4 and 5 in private.
2. **Section 23 report - Audit of higher education in Scottish universities:** The Committee took evidence on the Auditor General for Scotland's report entitled "Audit of higher education in Scottish universities" from—

Paul Johnston, Director-General Learning & Justice, and Stephen White, Strategic Policy Lead (HE Funding, Governance and Student Support), Scottish Government;

Dr John Kemp, Interim Chief Executive, Scottish Funding Council;

Alastair Sim, Director, Universities Scotland.

3. **The National Fraud Initiative in Scotland:** The Committee took evidence on the Audit Scotland report entitled "The National Fraud Initiative in Scotland" from—

Russell Frith, Assistant Auditor General, and Owen Smith, Senior Manager, Audit Scotland.

4. **Section 23 report - Audit of higher education in Scottish universities (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence received at agenda item 2 and took further evidence from—

Caroline Gardner, Auditor General for Scotland;

Antony Clark, Assistant Director, and Kirsty Whyte, Audit Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to invite the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills to provide oral evidence on the report and on the AGS report entitled "Scotland's Colleges 2016".

5. **The National Fraud Initiative in Scotland (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence received at agenda item 3 and took further evidence from—

Russell Frith, Assistant Auditor General, and Owen Smith, Senior Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to write to various organisations to follow up issues raised in the report and to undertake Post-legislative Scrutiny on the relevant provisions of The Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Act 2010.

6. **Work programme (in private):** The Committee considered its work programme. And agreed to take oral evidence from Transport Scotland on issues raised in the Maintaining Scotland's Roads audit and to write to the Scottish Government on issues raised in the Superfast Broadband audit.

The Committee also agreed to invite suggestions on post-legislative scrutiny.

The meeting closed at 11.31 am.

Terry Shevlin
Clerk to the Public Audit and Post-legislative Scrutiny Committee
Room T3.60
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
Tel: 0131 348 5390
Email: papls.committee@parliament.scot