



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

**PUBLIC AUDIT AND POST-LEGISLATIVE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES**

**10th Meeting, 2016 (Session 5)**

**Thursday 24 November 2016**

Present:

Colin Beattie  
Monica Lennon  
Alex Neil  
Ross Thomson

Liam Kerr  
Jenny Marra (Convener)  
Gail Ross

The meeting opened at 9.00 am.

1. **Declaration of interests:** Ross Thomson declared that he is a councillor in Aberdeen City Council.
2. **Choice of Deputy Convener:** The Committee chose Liam Kerr as its Deputy Convener.
3. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee agreed to take items 7, 8 and 9 in private.
4. **Major Capital Projects:** The Committee took evidence on the Scottish Government's Major Capital Projects progress update from—

Alyson Stafford, Director-General Finance, Andrew Watson, Deputy Director for Financial Strategy, and Christine McLaughlin, Director of Health Finance, Scottish Government;

Peter Reekie, Deputy Chief Executive and Director of Investments, Scottish Futures Trust;

Mike Baxter, Director for Finance and Analytical Services, Transport Scotland.

5. **Maintaining Scotland's roads: A follow-up report:** The Committee took evidence on the joint Accounts Commission and Auditor General for Scotland report entitled "Maintaining Scotland's roads: A follow-up report" from—

Fraser McKinlay, Director of Performance Audit and Best Value, Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, Graeme Greenhill, Senior Manager, and Shelagh Stewart, Audit Manager, Audit Scotland.

6. **Section 23 report - Superfast broadband for Scotland: A progress update:** The Committee took evidence on the Auditor General for Scotland's report entitled "Superfast broadband for Scotland: A progress update" from—

Fraser McKinlay, Director of Performance Audit and Best Value, Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, and Graeme Greenhill, Senior Manager, Audit Scotland.

7. **Major Capital Projects (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence received at agenda item 4 and took further evidence from—

Fraser McKinlay, Director of Performance Audit and Best Value, Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, and Graeme Greenhill, Senior Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to defer to a later meeting its consideration of whether to take further action on this item.

8. **Maintaining Scotland's roads: A follow-up report (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence received at agenda item 5 and took further evidence from—

Fraser McKinlay, Director of Performance Audit and Best Value, Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, Graeme Greenhill, Senior Manager, and Shelagh Stewart, Audit Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to defer to a later meeting its consideration of whether to take further action on this item.

9. **Section 23 report - Superfast broadband for Scotland: A progress update (in private):** The Committee considered the evidence received at agenda item 6 and took further evidence from—

Fraser McKinlay, Director of Performance Audit and Best Value, Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, and Graeme Greenhill, Senior Manager, Audit Scotland.

The Committee agreed to defer to a later meeting its consideration of whether to take further action on this item.

10. **Work programme (in private):** The Committee agreed to defer this item to a later meeting.

The meeting closed at 11.33 am.

Terry Shevlin  
Clerk to the Public Audit and Post-legislative Scrutiny Committee  
Room T3.60  
The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
Tel: 0131 348 5390  
Email: [papls.committee@parliament.scot](mailto:papls.committee@parliament.scot)