The Health and Sports Committee
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Dear Mr Findlay

Recruitment and Retention

Many thanks for your letter dated 20th July 2016 on behalf of the Health and Support Committee seeking a response from NHS Education for Scotland (NES) on issues relating to recruitment and retention, with a focus on remote and rural recruitment.

We note your observations on the data published by Information Services Division (ISD) and that you are seeking to understand how the training and education system is coping and adapting to ensure there are sufficient numbers of graduates to fill medical posts and that they are then retained within the NHS.

1. Context

In addition to our role in medical training, NES plays an increasing role in supporting recruitment and retention within other areas of the NHSScotland workforce. As the national training and education board for NHSScotland we have a key remit in supporting the whole service to deliver on all five strands of the Everyone Matters: 2020 Workforce Vision: Healthy Organisational Culture; Sustainable Workforce; Capable Workforce; Integrated Workforce; and Effective Leadership and Management. The principal role of NES is in the education and training of the NHS Scotland workforce. While we provide significant quantities of information on the workforce-in-training, decisions on the numbers in training (particularly in the so-called controlled subjects of medicine, nursing and dentistry) are for Scottish Ministers on the advice of officials.

2. Medical Workforce Data

The medical workforce is complex, and the time taken to train a doctor is prolonged. Training a general practitioner requires a minimum of 10 years (5 at medical school, 2 in foundation training, and 3 in GP specialty training), and training a hospital consultant can take up to 15 years (typically 8 years in specialty training) – so the state of the trained medical workforce today largely reflects decisions taken over a decade ago.

The selection, recruitment and education of medical undergraduates is under the control of medical schools across the UK. In Scotland, the Scottish Funding Council provides funding to medical schools, while NES
provides funding (in the region of £78m) to NHS Boards to support medical undergraduate education and training in the clinical workplace.

NES is responsible for the selection, recruitment, funding, and quality assurance of doctors in training. During 2016, we supported 5,855 doctors in training across 293 GMC approved training programmes. We provide data on the numbers and progression of doctors in training to the Medical Undergraduate Numbers Group, and to the Scottish Shape of Training Transitions Group, where these data are used to support the development of medical specialty profiles, which in turn support advice to ministers on medical undergraduate intakes, and numbers of places for doctors in training programmes in Scotland.

3. Non-Medical Workforce Data

We provide support for workforce modelling through the provision of timely and accurate data on vocational dental practitioners in post in Scotland for NHS NSS national statistics; support for the Dental Intake Reference Group; an annual pharmacy workforce report, and support for a community pharmacy workforce survey. In addition, we work with Directors of Pharmacy and Scottish Government to undertake pharmacy workforce analysis to support workforce planning as part of Scottish Government Strategy Prescription for Excellence.

We also work with partners to acquire, analyse, and report on a broad range of data in relation to education and training, professional registration, employment, clinical activity and access to healthcare services. Further activities include reporting to support workforce planning for healthcare support workers, and labour market data for a wide range of healthcare professionals and other NHSScotland staff.

4. Non-medical Recruitment and retention

We work in partnership with NHS boards, education institutions and professional and regulatory bodies to deliver education and training for not only for doctors, but also for dentists, pharmacists, nurses, midwives, allied health professionals, psychologists, healthcare scientists, optometrists, healthcare chaplains, healthcare support workers, and management trainees.

We also play an increasing role in promoting the wider range of professions the NHS needs to operate, such as administrative and clerical services, finance, IT, estates and facilities and many others.

4.1 NHS Careers website: www.careers.nhs.scot

In conjunction with Skills Development Scotland we have recently developed a national NHS Careers website which promotes the wide range of careers available in NHSScotland. The site offers information about modern apprenticeships, job profiles, video clips of NHSScotland staff and links to current vacancies.

4.2 Nursing, Midwifery and Allied Health Professionals (NMAHP)

As a key part of our role in the performance management of undergraduate nursing and midwifery programmes in Scotland, we carry out a comprehensive annual analysis of undergraduate nursing and midwifery recruitment, progression and completion data, including individual cohort demographics, variation between institutional performance and evidence of trends across all providers. These detailed outputs directly support workforce planning, commissioning and funding decisions.

4.3 Dental

We managed the process by which, in 2015-16 all students from dental schools in Scotland who wished to undertake training in Scotland secured vocational training places. During the same year, pre-registration dental nurse training was successfully completed by 160 candidates ensuring a supply of fully qualified dental nurses eligible for GDC registration. In addition, we provided post-registration training to over 120 dental nurses to achieve enhanced skills beyond the minimum regulatory requirements.
We support improved retention of the dental workforce through the Keeping in Touch and Return to Work schemes. We also train mentors to provide support for the TRAMS programme (Training Remediation and Mentoring Support) for dentists in difficulty.

4.4 Pharmacy

In 2015-16, we worked with NHS boards and pharmacy professional organisations to recruit and train 170 funded PRPS (Pre-Registration Pharmacy Scheme) trainees. In addition, we delivered a national training and quality management system for the PRPS trainees with a registration exam pass rate of 96%. Within the Scottish Pharmacy Vocational Training Scheme, we provided training and assessment for 120 Scottish hospital pharmacist VTS (vocational training scheme) trainees supported by a network of tutors.

4.5 Psychology

In 2015-16, we commissioned and recruited to programmes for 53 clinical psychology trainees, 21 MSc trainees in psychological therapies in primary care and 17 MSc trainees in applied psychology for children and young people. Doctoral level pre-registration training was successfully completed by 50 clinical psychology trainees, with 19 MSc trainees in psychological therapies in primary care and 15 MSc trainees in applied psychology for children and young people. We also support trainee health psychologists

4.6 Optometry

During 2015-16 we supported a total of 16 optometrists to undertake the MSc in Primary Care Ophthalmology. We also funded the training of 36 pre-registration optometrists on a one-day training course at Glasgow Caledonian University.

5. Supporting Remote and Rural Healthcare

Turning to the issue of supporting remote and rural healthcare, NES has a range of educational initiatives in place to support the rural workforce. In 2014 a collected set of Remote and Rural Actions was produced in response to the 2013 NES Board Paper Supporting Remote and Rural Healthcare. An updated copy of this Action Plan is included as Annex 2.

This paper contained 19 recommendations grouped into five themes:

1. Promoting awareness and understanding
2. Improving recruitment and retention
3. Alignment of education and training with workforce plans
4. Educational leadership to support service redesign and improvement
5. Leadership of a national Technology Enabled Learning programme for Scotland

The Action Plan at Annex 2 provides the detail of how these themes are being taken forward across the health and social care environment, both within NES and with partner organisations and groups.

These recommendations were placed in the NES Board Paper in the context of the WHO’s ‘Global Policy Recommendations on increasing access to health workers in remote and rural areas through improved retention’, which gathered the global evidence and presented it under four sets of recommendations; educational, regulatory, financial incentives, and personal and professional support. You have specifically asked for an updates on where the educational recommendations are being put into practice and we have understood the specific questions in your letter to relate to medical practice.

1 http://www.rrheal.scot.nhs.uk/media/185252/remote%20and%20rural%20healthcare%20updated.pdf
2 http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2010/9789241564014_eng.pdf
5.1 Use targeted admission policies to enrol students with a rural background in education programmes for various health disciplines, in order to increase the likelihood of graduates choosing to practise in rural areas.

- REACH initiatives to widen access, including those from rural areas

5.2 Locate health professional schools, campuses and family medicine residency programmes outside of capitals and other major cities as graduates of these schools and programmes are more likely to work in rural areas.

- Recent Scottish Government announcement that a new graduate medical school will be a joint enterprise between the Universities of Dundee, St Andrews and the Highlands and Islands
- NES’s postgraduate rural-track training options
  - Foundation Programme
  - Rural-track GP Speciality Training
  - GP Rural Fellowships (with recent survey showing that over 70% of graduates are retained in rural Scotland)
  - Fellowships in acute specialties to prepare consultants for work in Rural General Hospitals including Rural Fellowships as highlighted in the Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh’s recent *publication Standards informing Delivery of Care in Rural Surgery*

5.3 Expose undergraduate students of various health disciplines to rural community experiences and clinical rotations as these can have a positive influence on attracting and recruiting health workers to rural areas.

- University of Aberdeen’s undergraduate medical remote and rural programme
- University of Dundee’s implementation of Longitudinal Clinical Clerkships in NHS Highland and NHS Dumfries & Galloway
- Recent Scottish Government announcement that a new graduate medical school will be a joint enterprise between the Universities of Dundee, St Andrews and the Highlands and Islands
- Scottish Government Remote & Rural Educational Development Group with representation from all universities and NES, and the aim to improve access to rural placements for all undergraduates in Scotland

5.4 Revise undergraduate and postgraduate curricula to include rural health topics so as to enhance the competencies of health professionals working in rural areas, and thereby increase their job satisfaction and retention.

- University of Dundee’s implementation of Longitudinal Clinical Clerkships in NHS Highland and NHS Dumfries & Galloway with a focus on rural practice
- Mandated rural attachments for students of both the Universities of Aberdeen and Dundee
- NES’s GP rural fellowships
- Work currently under way to design a ‘credential in rural medicine’ as highlighted by the GMC as a priority for Scottish Government in its consultation on credentialing

5.6 Design continuing education and professional development programmes that meet the needs of rural health workers and that are accessible from where they live and work, so as to support their retention.

---

3 http://www.universities-scotland.ac.uk/bite-size-briefings/widening-access-to-medicine/
5 http://www.scotmt.scot.nhs.uk/foundation.aspx
6 http://www.scotmt.scot.nhs.uk/media/926836/Programme-Descriptor-North-Rural-Track.pdf
8 https://www.rcsed.ac.uk/media/414252/rural-surgery-report-march-2016.pdf
9 http://www.abdn.ac.uk/smmsn/undergraduate/medicine/remote-rural.php
10 https://sites.dev.dundee.ac.uk/discovermeded/2016/07/25/asmegmc-excellent-medical-education-award-win-for-new-longitudinal-clerkship-at-dundee/
• NES’s Clinical Skills Managed Educational Network, including the Mobile Skills Unit\textsuperscript{14}
• NES’s CPD Connect initiative including the Practice-based Small Group Learning programme\textsuperscript{15}
• The ‘Being Here’ initiative (see Annex 2) with its bi-annual ‘Non-bypass Community Hospital Refresher Course’.
• The Scottish Rural Medical Collaborative (see Annex 2), with its objective to improve access to peer support, educational support and professional support

While NES’s prime focus is on education and our main area of impact will be on the educational recommendations listed by the WHO it is worthy of note that there are important actions relating also to the other three sets of recommendations; supporting the development of credentialed ‘Rural Practitioners’ for acute community hospital work (regulatory recommendations), piloting the provision of a £20,000 bursary to recruit GP Specialty Trainees to hard-to-recruit areas (financial incentive recommendations), and supporting the development of educational and professional networks (personal and professional support recommendations).

I hope that this information is of help to your committee. Please do not hesitate to contact me if we can be of further assistance.

Yours sincerely,

Caroline Lamb
Chief Executive

\textsuperscript{14} http://www.csmen.scot.nhs.uk/#page=page-1
\textsuperscript{15} http://www.cpdconnect.nhs.scot/
NES Supporting Remote and Rural Recruitment & Retention
Action Plan Update 2016

Current NES Initiatives

NES has a range of educational initiatives in place to support the rural workforce. In 2014 a collected set of Remote and Rural Actions was produced in response to the 2013 NES Board Paper Supporting Remote and Rural Healthcare 2013.\(^{16}\)

NES Remote & Rural Action Plan

The NES Remote and Rural Action Plan 2014-2015 brought together key remote, rural and Island objectives and programmes of work from across NES to ensure streamlined delivery in the key areas. Work to develop educational resources and support systems that assist the work of the Boards in improving recruitment and retention have continued to build on these key areas in collaboration with education providers and partner agencies. The information provided below gives an overview of recent programmes of work, and examples of resources and reports that have been developed to support improved recruitment and retention of staff and quality of service.

A/ Promoting awareness of remote, rural and Island workforce needs

The Remote and Rural Healthcare Alliance (RRHEAL) within NES, works to develop and promote remote and rural inclusive education solutions. Remote and rural staff require access to high quality education and support that is accessible, affordable and sustainable. Education programmes need to be remote and rural appropriate not only in terms of format but also suited in content to the remote and rural context. RRHEAL works to promote these needs across Scotland with education partners. In this way working to ensure healthcare staff have access to appropriate knowledge support, skills maintenance and development opportunities to support their work as remote and rural practitioners. RRHEAL works to promote remote and rural exemplars of dynamic and innovative education solutions that are transferable across other parts of Scotland and the UK to assist in raising the profile of working in remote and rural areas.

RRHEAL at Distance Quality Assurance Guide

Preventing Falls Resource

Recognition and assessment of the sick child: a skills maintenance tool

Pregnancy Induced Hypertension

Post-partum Haemorrhage (PPH)

\(^{1}http://www.rrheal.scot.nhs.uk/media/185252/remote%20and%20rural%20healthcare%20updated.pdf\)
Supporting improved recruitment and retention of healthcare staff

Northern Peripheries & Arctic “Recruit & Retain Project

RRHEAL were partners within the European Funded *Recruit and Retain* Northern Peripheries Project NPP between 2011 and 2014. The project was designed to identify and pilot test ‘solutions’ to the continuing challenges of recruiting and retaining health professionals in rural areas. The project included partners from Scotland (NHS WI, NHS H, RRHEAL/NES), Sweden, Greenland, Iceland, Ireland, Norway, and Canada. We identified 29 ‘solutions’ covering activities such as advertising, administration, relocation officer roles, marketing of the rural location, changes to how services are delivered, career development support, support for families and partners, and education and training. *Recruit and Retain* finished by documenting the key characteristics of each of the 29 solutions and outlining these within the Business Model. Full details of the Recruit & Retain Products & Services can be found here in the solutions brochure.

RRHEAL and Scottish partners went on to develop *Why Rural brand* and a range of publications promoting Scottish remote and rural working.

*Why Rural Recruitment Booklet*

*Why Rural Guide to Rural Life in the Highlands*

*Why Rural Retention Booklet*

**Making it Work – Recruit & Retain 2015-2018**

*Recruit and Retain* was the beginning of an international process which aims to build capacity in rural organisations and communities to address their workforce challenges. RRHEAL are part of the expanded Scottish Group who have been successful in securing European funding to help implement a further programme of work supporting improved remote and rural recruitment & retention across Scotland and the Northern Peripheries and Arctic areas. Next steps are to implement the Business Model ‘on the ground’ in Scotland and across partner countries. Five of the of partner countries from *Recruit and Retain* agreed to work together on a follow-up project: *Recruit and Retain 2: Making it Work*. The new project will implement the business model to re-design and sustain systemic change in remote and rural workforces across the partnership.


Within Scotland the *Making it Work: Recruit & Retain Project* builds on a number of successful rural recruitment and retention projects and programmes of work.
**Being Here**

NES are partners within the NHS HIGHLAND led the “Being Here Project. It is a major initiative to find different and innovative ways of sustaining health and care services in remote and rural communities. The three-year project was launched in 2013 with funding totalling £1.5 million from the Scottish Government and NHS Highland's brief was to devise and test innovative ways of recruiting and retaining healthcare professionals and particularly GPs.

NHS Highland is also working with other organisations to promote and enhance the image of North Highland and Argyll and Bute as a place to live and work, and is looking at issues such as accommodation, transport and IT connectivity. It recognises that training and career development are important for health-care professionals, and through Being Here NES are working with NHS Highland in implementing a programme of accredited training, workshops and awareness-raising.

Recruit & Retain Project and make use of products, services and the evidence base provided by the previous NPP Recruit & Retain Project.

**The Scottish Rural Medical Collaborative (2016-2018)**

This new project has been successful in securing funding of £505,000 over two years from the Scottish Government to assist Rural Health Boards and partner organisations across Scotland to work collaboratively to address rural practitioner/GP recruitment and retention issues. This programme will build on the outputs from RRHEAL educational networks/programmes, NES and ‘Being Here’ to promote and support working in rural Scotland as the best place to be a rural practitioner/GP today. This programme of work will also link closely with the Making it Work Recruit & Retain Project and make use of products, services and the evidence base provided by the previous NPP Recruit & Retain Project.

**C /Aligning education and training with workforce plans**

**Rural Teams Competency & Education Programme**

RRHEAL are working to support a range of projects aimed at identifying and designing education to support a range of new and expanded roles within rural teams. This work includes development of education support pathways for Rural Advanced Nurse Practitioners, Rural Generic Support Workers and Rural Practitioners working with Paediatrics. This work will continue throughout 2016/2017.

**Rural Generic Support Worker**

RRHEAL led the development of educational mapping and competency frameworks to support
the implementation of the first Rural Generic (Health & Social Care) Support Worker Roles in Scotland. RRHEAL continues to support the Boards in developing these roles by sharing and hosting of RGSW network events.


D/Educational leadership to support service redesign and improvement

The provision of high quality and technology enhanced education opportunities is one of the key methods through which we can ensure the remote, rural and Island workforce can continue to access high quality education and support to deliver improved care.

**Video conferenced Education Networks:**

Using existing and readily available technology RRHEAL have established a range of video conferenced education networks in response to the needs of the remote, rural and island workforce. These are tailored to meet specific priority topic areas and at educational levels relevant to specific workforce groups. They provide accessible, affordable and high quality educational opportunities for our dispersed workforce across Scotland.

**RRHEAL VC Education Network**

Multi professional topics this year have included: *Falls Update Apps for AHPs, Seasonal/Winter Illness focusing on Bronchiolitis and Croup, Stabilisation and Management of the Critically Ill Child Prior to Transfer, and Debriefing Essentials amongst others.*

**RRHEAL VC Education Network Summary Report 2015/2016**

**Rural Practitioner/GP Education Network**

RRHEAL together with Medical Directorate colleagues have piloted a series of four new Rural GP VC Education sessions. These facilitated sessions focused on rural practitioner hot topics such as *Acute Coronary Syndromes, Major Trauma remote and rural response, assessing those at risk of suicide and managing frailty in rural settings.*

**RRHEAL Rural GP VC Education Network: Evaluation of initial education series**
Rural General Hospital Workforce

RRHEAL have established the NES Rural General Hospital (RGH) VC Education Network to support specific education needs across this workforce.

Further VC Education Networks are planned for 2016/2017 these have been streamlined to meet the demands and needs of the following workforce groups.

1/ Rural General /Advanced Nurse Practitioners  
2/Rural Paediatric Workforce

E/ Leadership of the technology enabled workforce learning programmes

Technology Enabled Learning (TEL) for the workforce

RRHEAL have established a number of programmes of work in aimed at supporting the remote and rural Boards development of a technology enabled workforce. This work involves collaboration with a range of education and third sector partners and builds on the evidence base of the NES 2014 TEL Baseline Survey.

Digital Highland 2016

RRHEAL are health partners within this multi-agency Highland project aimed at ensuring people within Highland communities and the workforce providing services to them are supported to make best us of available technologies. RRHEAL are working with partners to implement a range of programmes that support increased use of digital technology across the healthcare workforce in remote areas of Highland. This work builds on the partnership established with Citizensonline who have assisted with providing tutors, hardware and "Digital Champions Programmes" for health and social care staff in Highland.

Highland TEL /Learning & Development Staff 2016

RRHEAL worked with NHS Highland to develop the first Scottish TEL digital technology skills programme for learning and development NHS staff. This RRHEAL funded programme has been developed by UHI and will be delivered across Highland from October 2016.
Highland Care at Home Staff TEL

RRHEAL worked with Citizensonline in the design and delivery of introductory TEL/digital technology awareness and skills sessions for health & social care colleagues who provide care at home. Currently delivering to 2nd cohort.

Western Isles Care at Home Staff and TEL

RRHEAL have supported Western Isles develop a sustainable, accessible model for current Care Home/ Care at Home Workers core education. This has included a useful collaboration with Citizensonline, promoting engagement and application of technology in both the home and workplace.

Further details of RRHEAL programmes of work, open access resources, reports, guides and information specific to the remote, rural and island workforce can be found here on the RRHEAL Platform www.rrheal.scot.nhs.uk