EDUCATION AND SKILLS COMMITTEE

AGENDA

18th Meeting, 2018 (Session 5)

Wednesday 13 June 2018

The Committee will meet at 10.10 am in the Robert Burns Room (CR1).

1. **Decision to take items in private**: The Committee will decide whether to take agenda item 4 in private. The Committee will also decide whether to take any future considerations of its draft report on its inquiry into the Attainment and Achievement of School Aged Children Experiencing Poverty in private.

2. **Inquiry into Young People's Pathways**: The Committee will hear evidence from—

   Sir Ian Wood; and

   Jennifer Craw, Chief Executive, Opportunity North East.

3. **Review of evidence (in private)**: The Committee will consider the evidence it heard earlier.

4. **Inquiry into Attainment and Achievement of School Aged Children Experiencing Poverty**: The Committee will consider a draft report.

Roz Thomson
Clerk to the Education and Skills Committee
Room T3.40
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
Tel: 85222
Email: Roz.Thomson@parliament.scot
The papers for this meeting are as follows—

**Agenda item 2**

SPICE briefing  
Submissions paper

**Agenda item 4**

Draft report (private paper)
Wednesday 13 June 2018

Education and Skills Committee

Young People’s Pathways:
Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce

INTRODUCTION

This is the second formal Committee session of the short inquiry into young people’s pathways. The inquiry aims to scrutinize implementation of the first two recommendations laid out in the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce final report:

Senior Phase Vocational Pathways

Recommendation 1: Pathways should start in the Senior Phase which leads to delivery of industry recognised vocational qualifications alongside academic qualifications. Those pathways should be developed and delivered in partnerships with colleges and, where necessary, other training providers. Their delivery should be explicitly measured and published alongside other school performance indicators.

Preparing Young People for the World of Work

Recommendation 2: A focus on preparing all young people for employment should form a core element of the implementation of Curriculum for Excellence with appropriate resource dedicated to achieve this. In particular, local authorities, Skills Development Scotland and employer representative organisations should work together to develop a more comprehensive standard of careers guidance which would reflect the involvement of employers and their role and input.

At this meeting, the Committee will hear from Sir Ian Wood. The primary purpose of this is to reflect on the work of the Commission, the intentions behind its recommendations and any broad comments Sir Ian may have on the implementation so far based on his role on the DYW Advisory Board. On the 20th June the Committee will hold its last session on its inquiry, hearing from Education Scotland, Skills Development Scotland and then the Minister for Employability and Training.
BACKGROUND

Sir Ian was Chair of the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce (“the Commission”). Since then he has remained involved as a member of the Developing the Young Workforce (DYW) National Advisory Group. The National Advisory Group was established by the Scottish Government to provide strategic leadership over DYW activity; its role has been to promote the vision for DYW and perform the role of critical friend throughout the life of the DYW programme (2014 to 2021).

Education Working for All!

The Scottish Government established the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce in January 2013 to consider how to develop a high quality intermediate vocational education and training system and to achieve better connectivity between education and the world of work.

The membership of the Commission – chaired by Sir Ian - is provided at Annexe A.

The Commission published its interim report in September 2013. This focused on good practice identified in the first eight months of the Commission’s life, and with this an initial list of 12 recommendations were produced. The good practice examples focused on:

- Employability in schools
- Senior phase vocational education
- Industry focused college activity
- Modern Apprenticeship access and progression pathways
- Support for young people at risk of disengaging from education

In the interim report, the Commission suggested that that there should be significant enhancements to vocational education in schools through partnerships with colleges. In addition, collaboration / partnership work between education and employers was a key component of the parallel activity at that time to regionalise colleges in Scotland. And finally, the Commission stressed the importance on developing quality apprenticeships to allow young people to access higher skilled employment opportunities (responding to changes in labour market demand).

The final report: Education Working for All! was published in June 2014 (“the Wood report”), turning the initial 12 recommendations from the interim report into 39 recommendations (listed at Annexe B).

Framing the final report was concern about high levels of youth unemployment in Scotland in 2013. With more than 50 per cent of school leavers not going on to university, the Wood report was concerned about the paths open to the potentially large number of young people that may wish to pursue another path after school. For example, the report noted that:
• Less than 30 per cent of Scottish businesses have any contact with education;
• only 27 per cent of employers were offering work experience placements;
• 29 percent of employers recruiting direct from education; and
• 13 per cent of employers hosted Modern Apprenticeships

The Commission set itself the task to make recommendations that would take Scotland toward producing better qualified, work ready and motivated young people with skills relevant to modern employment opportunities, both as employees and entrepreneurs of the future. It also noted the need for more employers to recruit more young people.

The interim report looked at good practice options for engaging the 50% of young people who don’t take an academic pathway from school and / or who leave school without Highers. It also looked at the preparedness of young people for successful employment.

The final report built on this by looking at the role played by business and industry both to enhance the quality of education and to improve information on careers and the workplace, and by identifying ways that more young people could be employed straight out of school education. As Sir Ian said in his foreword to the final report:

“This is not part of the corporate social responsibility agenda. It is very much in business and industry’s self-interest to maximise the skills and talents of an incredibly important resource - their future staff and workforce.”

The final report also set out comments and recommendations on equalities in education and in the employment of young people.

In December 2014, the Scottish Government published its response to the Wood report. This set out the governments’ commitment to improving youth employment through reforms to both the education and skills systems in Scotland. The Youth Employment Strategy: Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce (DYW) included an overarching youth employment strategy alongside specific activities that would be taken forward to meet the recommendations in the Wood report.

The Scottish Government response accepted the Wood Commission recommendations while setting out its own approach to taking these forward through a seven year programme of work – running from 2014 to 2021. This involved milestones / activity framed around five themes:

• Schools – work-relevant learning from 3-18 years
• Colleges – a valued and valuable choice
• Apprenticeships – access to work based learning for all young people
• Employers – investment in the young workforce
• Equalities – developing the talents of all our young people
While the five themes are broadly in line with the Wood recommendations, the read across is not directly comparable.

For example, recommendations 1 and 2 from the Wood report are both part of the whole body of work (along with recommendations 3, 16, 26, 27, 28, 33, 37) focused on schools. For information, the schools milestones are again provided at Annexe D. Alongside this are the 11 key performance indicators (KPIs), which the Scottish Government has established as the specific measures being tracked and reported on over the seven years of DYW activity. All 11 KPIs are listed at Annexe C for ease of reference.

**Theme 1: Vocational pathways and parity of esteem**

In his foreword to the interim report, Sir Ian notes the importance of bringing vocational education into line with the high status given to higher education:

“To ensure there is no misunderstanding, we believe Scotland has deservedly an acclaimed higher education sector. This is good news, but not within our remit. What our report is clearly saying is that we must now place the same focus on significantly enhancing our vocational education to achieve the same acclaimed status.”

At the Committee meeting on 6 June, witnesses highlighted a range of activity being pursued to meet the DYW commitments in relation to vocational pathways, the progress that is being made with rolling out activity and the extent of positive partnership working and innovative practice taking place across Scotland. This is substantiated in a number of the written submissions received by the Committee.

There are arguably three elements to achieving parity of esteem for different post-school options:

- firstly the development of the vocational pathways at a sufficient standard and quantity;
- secondly an awareness of them and other options available other than university; and
- thirdly a culture shift involving parents, young people and schools amongst others to hold these options in equal esteem.

On the third element, there appears in some of the evidence received to be a disconnect between the perceptions of service providers, including schools, and the experiences of young people. The Scottish Guidance Association states in its submission that:

“We were very surprised by the suggestion that schools are putting undue pressure on pupils to apply for university. All the teachers at our meeting agreed that they take an individualised approach, as do their colleagues, and a sustained positive destination that suits the pupil is what is sought.”
The Scottish Government’s work on the Learner Journey included some qualitative research produced by YoungScot and SQW on the experiences of young people. One of the key findings was:

* Overcoming bias of choices – young people are aware of biases surrounding different post-school routes. University is positioned as the ‘gold standard’ for those who achieve well academically, with alternative options and routes rarely considered or discussed with this cohort. Vocational pathways, including apprenticeships and other types of training, were perceived as being a lesser option. Young people said that they would like to be given impartial information on all available pathways in order to make informed choices.

A woman during the Young Women Lead focus group suggested that university was prioritised by her school: “She heard of adult learning by word of mouth and is now undertaking it. She suggested her school wants 95% of people to go to university so that the school's positive destination statistics will make it an appealing school to attend.”

There are a number of similar comments in the SPICe survey Annexe C, where young people were asked why one particular option was highlighted to them over others. For example: “I feel my school was more concerned with how good they look on paper than helping signpost students into different directions. University was presented as the next natural progression and did not give a great deal of support, if any, to students seeking employment, apprenticeships or college places.”

This disconnect between the perception of service providers, such as school staff and students could be for a number of reasons including: the challenge of time to provide tailored one to one advice to each individual in schools being one (the SSTA evidence highlights the caseloads of guidance teachers); and the lack of experience of some teachers of routes other than traditional routes that they took (see Official Report of evidence on 6 June).

Witnesses at Committee on 6 June also acknowledged that there could be a perception among school pupils that disproportionate attention is given at school to gaining entry to university. For example, the UCAS application process can be time consuming so can seem to take up a lot of time and attention at certain points in the school year.

It’s also worth noting that university is a well understood option that parents, young people and teachers all understand. And while DYW activity includes efforts to broaden awareness of other options, with some level of success in doing so, an event organised by COSLA confirms the message from the above cited research with parents that there are important stakeholders (notably parents) who are not yet familiar with the growing and complex range of options on offer, or their value in terms of future employment opportunities.

The Committee may consider the extent to which the experiences of young people as the key ‘service user’ in relation to DYW are taken account in its governance structures. The National Parents Forum for Scotland and the Chief Executive of the Scottish Youth Parliament sit on the Advisory Board. Parents and young people are not represented at programme board level.
Agenda Item 2

The Committee may wish to discuss:

- the extent that the Commission engaged with young people on their experiences, including the perceived gap between the status of university versus other options; and

- the extent young people are involved in the governance of DYW to ensure that their perspective on progress is taken into account.

Theme 2: Careers Advice and Support

As noted above, it is clear that some post-school options continue to be held in higher regard than others. At the Committee meeting on 6 June, witnesses talked about the positive contribution being made by careers advisors and others to support young people and inform them about the range of options open to them. They specifically referred to the improvements offered through mechanisms like My World of Work and “The Marketplace” (the network that facilitates engagement between employers and schools).

It is well understood that the information, advice and guidance that young people receive about post-school options is vital to inform their post-school decision making. For example, the 15-24 Learner Journey Review (Stage 1 report) highlighted that its engagement with young people, business and partners needs a greater focus on “advice and system coherence” with greater personalisation of information, advice and support to make it “easier for young people to understand their learning and career choices at the earliest stage and providing long term person-centred support for the young people who need this most”.

However, at present it seems\(^1\) that the perception is that support and advice about post-school options can be experienced and understood by young people as inconsistent, with young people all having very different experiences of the advice and support received.

This message about consistency was seen in the Education Scotland report: \textbf{Review of the implementation of the Career Education Standard (3-18), the Work Placement Standard and Guidance on School/Employer Partnerships} (May 2017), which noted considerable variation in the progress made by schools in using the career education and work placement standards and guidance, and incorporating these into the curriculum and learning and teaching approaches. It also noted that the offer of work-based learning pathways in schools varies significantly, including how well teaching and pastoral staff promote different opportunities (e.g. college programmes, Foundation Apprenticeships and Modern Apprenticeships) to parents and young people.

The focus group held with Young Women Lead included a range of different experiences and comments and one woman suggested: ““we talk about schools speaking to pupils but in reality it is individuals speaking to individuals so there is a big inconsistency”. There was

\(^1\) This was one of the observations from the young women from Young Women Lead that took part in the focus group with Committee members on 31 May 2018.
support in the group and agreement that the variation of experience of young people was largely down to the personality of the school staff."

**Targeted Support**

The most recent DYW progress report noted that a particular challenge now lies with embedding the changes that needed within the curriculum and ensuring that equalities issues are considered as part of the developments being taken forward.

Added to that, the 15-24 Learner Journey Review notes that while DYW is in place to enhance and deliver a richer, blended vocational learning experience in schools, more is needed to ensure the needs of the statutory leavers’ cohort and those likely to be disengaged, so as to maximise the value they receive from the learning and skills system between S3 and S5. This reflected the evidence from SDS that those who leave school on the statutory date tend to have poorer outcomes than post statutory leavers.

The qualitative research with young people (by SQW and YoungScot) to inform the 15-24 Learner Journey Review highlighted a perception among some of the younger workshop participants that careers advisers targeted those who did not know what they wanted to do after school, or who were at risk of leaving school with nothing to go to.

This view is confirmed by Dr Pete Robertson in his written submission, which notes that the level of guidance / pupil support at Scottish schools has reduced post-McCrone “leaving staffing resources for support for career choices competing with the pressing demand for pastoral care”. He goes on to say:

“Those pupils without clearly flagged problems navigate choices with minimal individual support. Targeting policies seek to pro-actively combat social disadvantage, but the ‘undecided’ can flounder as a result."

My World of Work is the main mechanism for delivery of careers advice. As an online / digital mechanism it offers various online tools to support career decisions or planning. It is a useful for reaching a wide cohort of people quickly and relatively efficiently (offering a pragmatic response to resource limits). Witnesses at the Committee meeting on 6 June responded to any concerns of digital exclusion by pointing out that anyone with a smart phone and access to wifi can gain access to the tools on offer through My World of Work.

**The Committee may wish to discuss:**

- the findings of the Commission in relation to the consistency of the provision of careers advice and support
- the particular challenges, that the Commission was aware of in developing its findings, of engaging more disadvantaged young people (including equality groups and those at risk of disengaging from education early) in decision-making about careers
Theme 3: Pace of Change

With DYW is now in its fourth year (and over half way through its life) there are a range of different measures that offer the opportunity to reflect on progress / the pace of change to date.

As last week’s papers noted, there are four key performance indicators (KPIs) that the Scottish Government is reporting on annually that link with the focus of this inquiry. Progress against these has been mixed in the first three years. Information on each is summarised below, while a fuller picture of the data on all 11 KPIs can be found in the most recent Scottish Government DYW progress report (details at pages 37 – 46).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KPI 3 - Increase the percentage of school leavers attaining vocational qualifications at SCQF level 5 and above by 2021.</th>
<th>Progress made – from 7.3% to 10.7% between 2013-14 and 2015-16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KPI 6 - Increase the percentage of employers recruiting young people directly from education to 35 per cent by 2018.</td>
<td>No change - figure remained 32% between 2014 and 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPI 10 - Increase the employment rate for young disabled people to the population average by 2021.</td>
<td>Progress fluctuating - the employment rate for young disabled people increased from 35.2% in January–December 2014 to 40.8% for the same period in 2015. It decreased to 35.6% during the same period in 2016.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPI 11 - Increase positive destinations for looked after children by 4 percentage points per annum resulting in parity by 2021.</td>
<td>Not met - the number of looked after children in positive destinations was 71.2% in 2015/16; a total increase of 1.9 percentage points since the baseline figures were recorded in 2012-13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On Foundation Apprenticeships (FA) there has been mixed messages in recent years, with different figures both on what has been achieved at different points in time and on the targets that have been set. Currently, it seems clear that the target is 5,000 places by 2019-2020. Finally, college outcome agreements for academic year 2017-18 make reference to DYW priorities around the expansion of Senior Phase pathways with a target to achieve over 7,000 by 2019-2020. In terms of progress to date, figures from the SFC indicate that:

- The number of SCQF level 5 vocational courses offered at school continued to increase between 2014-15 and 2015-16 with an increase in uptake in the Senior Phase – from 2,169 enrolments in academic year 2014-15 to 3,014 in 2015-16.
- Overall, the percentage of school leavers attaining vocational qualifications at SCQF 5 or above rose from 7.3% in 2013-14 to 10.7% in 2015-16, with increases in 28 of 32 local authorities. During this period, the percentage of school leavers attaining vocational qualifications increased at all SCQF levels from 2% to 6%.
- In academic year 2017-18, the SFC forecast further increases in recruitment with over 3,500 school pupils expected to take part in SCQF level 5 and above college courses in that academic year.

2 Sourced from the 2016-17 DYW progress report
The above figures suggest that, on current trends, it is very unlikely that the target of 7,000 pupils taking part in vocational learning by 2019-2020 will be achieved.

While the recommendations were recognised as “ambitious and challenging”, they were based on emerging good practice so the view was they could be “implemented without significant additional funding over a fairly short period of time.”

A number of submissions have suggested additional resources are required at school level to assist the implementation of DYW. In relation to careers advice SSTA suggested additional teachers were required. Scottish Chambers of Commerce stated “Protected time for teachers to engage with DYW / employability initiatives was identified as a challenge across many regions”. Louise Moir, a Headteacher, states in relation to vocational pathways “The challenges that remain in terms of ensuring these pathways add value to a young person’s pathway are not complex. There is the challenge of ensuring that the provision is as cost-effective as possible. Here clarity is required going forwards as to where this funding is going to come from…”

Members may wish to discuss:

- whether the Commission envisaged, based on the extent good practice was emerging when it reported, that the recommendations were achievable by 2021 (the target set by the Government)

- whether there are particular actions that could perhaps be taken to increase the level of progress in a number of areas

Theme 4: Industry engagement

Building better relationships between industry / business and schools / colleges was recognised in the Commission’s interim report as critical to ensure young people were prepared for employment and better informed about career options. This was one of the themes to be pursued in the second phase of the Commission’s work.

A priority for the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce was drawing out the key role of business and industry “both to enhance the quality of the education experience and provide better knowledge of careers and the workplace, as well as offering more young people employment straight out of education”.

A number of submissions highlighted to the Committee the need for a shared understanding between employers and schools. Louise Moir, a Headteacher, states: “The challenge that exists is getting a shared understanding about what is required from both perspectives e.g what works for a company when presenting to their work colleagues is not necessarily going to work with a group of S2 or S3 pupils…Getting this right requires a commitment from education and industry to provide resources that guide and signpost people not only in relation to the specific knowledge and understanding required but also in terms of the skills required to engage young people in this.”
In response to the Commission report, along with the national DYW structures laid out at Annexe E, there are now 21 employer-led DYW Regional Groups covering the whole of Scotland. The intention in establishing these regional groups was to:

“...ensure that all of Scotland’s young people are fully and fairly supported into employment by bridging the gap between education and employers. The groups aim to: encourage and support employers to engage directly with schools and colleges; and challenge and support employers to recruit more young people into their workforce.”

The 2016-17 DYW progress report noted that in 2017-18 the focus was to be on “ensuring there are meaningful and productive school-employer partnerships operating in all secondary schools.”

The same progress report also noted the development of the online digital platform “Marketplace”. Marketplace is intended to offer a mechanism for improving and strengthening employer and education engagement. The progress report stated that over 300 employers have registered with Marketplace since its launch to offer opportunities to schools across Scotland. Marketplace offers a digital meeting place for businesses and education to engage in planned activity and allow businesses to be more involved in the school curriculum and school experience.

At the time the progress report was published, Marketplace was being used by 7 of the 21 Regional Groups – Edinburgh, East and Mid Lothian, Glasgow, North East, Ayrshire, Forth Valley, West Lothian and Dundee and Angus, with plans to extend this to more groups over the next year. During evidence the Scottish Chambers of Commerce suggested the Marketplace was not notably user friendly for employers, suggesting it was challenging to use it effectively if an organisation did not have a very specific aim that it wanted to achieve. Its written submission suggests that “In some areas, particularly rural regions, some concerns were raised around greater reliance on My World of Work over local knowledge / engagement.”

The progress report also notes that colleges have prioritised establishing links with DYW Regional Groups to further develop and enhance employer engagement with colleges. In the previous year (2015-16), considerable progress was said to have been made in understanding the extent of college engagement with employers, industry groups and DYW boards. This is in line with the intent of college regionalisation, which was driven by a commitment at regional level to better align colleges with the needs of both students and employers.

While this shows significant activity in the area of business / industry engagement, an event hosted by COSLA in June 2017 to explore progress on DYW raised a number of concerns about business engagement in DYW. One message was that business engagement can be particularly challenging as businesses do not necessarily understand the role they are being asked to play in relation to DYW. The participants in the COSLA event noted that there are different issues that face different parts of the Scotland in relation to business
engagement. For example, there are different businesses and industries operating in different parts of Scotland. This leads to different opportunities across the country.

The event also noted that the profile of businesses in some areas makes it challenging for education to engage. For example, in rural areas most of the businesses are very small so would struggle to provide apprenticeship opportunities. This chimes with findings from the Education Scotland report (May 2017), which noted that in rural areas in particular there are often not enough placement opportunities available to allow young people to gain access to work experience while at school.

Findings from the COSLA event reflected that there has been increased employer engagement and more meaningful work experience with the development of DYW. In addition, the launch of the ‘Marketplace’ has been positive with a useful direction being provided by some of the DYW Regional Groups with pockets of good practice around the country. However, participants noted that the Regional Groups do not have a particularly high profile, with the exception of in only two or three regions of Scotland.

Participants noted that the work and priorities of Regional Groups seem to be different from what local authorities need them to do. There was thought to be too much focus on schools and education, with little attention given to youth unemployment or wider employability and links with employability partnerships. In addition, there are difficulties in engaging SMEs and micro businesses with the DYW agenda.

**Members may wish to explore:**

- his reflections on employer / industry partnership levels during the Commission’s work with both education providers and directly with young people, and the progress made since 2014
- thoughts on challenges that can limit employer engagement with DYW activity (e.g. engaging micro businesses in this activity)
- the profile of Regional Groups and progress towards increasing their impact

**Theme 5: Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce Advisory Group**

Given the scale of DYW activity and the length of time the programme has been running, a range of governance and delivery arrangements have been established – the top levels of which are laid out at [Annexe E](#). Governance of the programme includes evaluation and monitoring of progress over the seven years of DYW activity.

Apart from the annual progress reports, there are no publicly available reports on the work being done by those involved in the different structures set out an Annexe E. For example, there are no publicly available minutes from the Programme Board or from the National Advisory Group (assuming it meets regularly).
In October 2015, Sir Ian Wood made the following statement regarding the initial response to the Commission’s final report and the Scottish Government’s role in implementing its recommendations:

“I’ve been struck by the broad range of organisations and private sector leaders who want to be involved in driving implementation of our report. From large multinationals to SMEs and microbusinesses, from energy companies, hoteliers and creative and digital industry, there’s a common theme here. Employers get what we’re about. They see the economic imperative of shaping their future workforce, of making a strong pitch to young people that their industry has a job for them that’s challenging and rewarding.

The role of the Government, as I see it, is to provide the infrastructure and strengthen the connections between employers and education and training, making it not just desirable for industry to inform learning, but unusual for learning not to have been formed with industry in mind. Through the Developing the Young Workforce Regional Groups and Investors in Young People, connections are already being made which will offer support to employers looking to recruit and develop young people.”

In May 2018, the 15-24 Learner Journey Review (the Review) was published. Its focus goes beyond DYW to also consider how the college curriculum is linked to universities and employers. Much of the indicative dates around the Review activity are towards the end of DYW. The suggestion then is that the Review will build on the momentum created by DYW. As noted in last week’s briefing, the Review recommendations are additional to DYW recommendations as opposed to replacing them.

At the Committee meeting on 6 June, Terry Lanagan from ADES pointed to the alignment of the 15-24 Learner Journey Review with the DYW priorities, with significant support among policy and practice leads for the intent behind the Review.

The Committee may wish to discuss:

- the specific role of the National Advisory Group is playing in oversight / governance of DYW activity including acting as a ‘critical friend’
- whether there have been any initial discussions as to how governance of DYW and the implementation of Learner Journey Review recommendations will interact

Suzi Macpherson & Alison O’Connor
SPICe Research
8 June 2018

Note: Committee briefing papers are provided by SPICe for the use of Scottish Parliament committees and clerking staff. They provide focused information or respond to specific questions or areas of interest to committees and are not intended to offer comprehensive coverage of a subject area.
ANNEXE A: COMMISSION FOR DEVELOPING SCOTLAND’S YOUNG WORKFORCE – MEMBERSHIP

Sir Ian Wood – Chair
Linda McKay – Vice Chair
Sue Bruce
Michael Davis
Sylvia Halkerston
Lord Willie Haughey
Grahame Smith
Robin Parker
Christine Pollock
ANNEXE B: WOOD COMMISSION RECOMMENDATIONS

SCHOOLS

Recommendation 1: Pathways should start in the senior phase which lead to the delivery of industry recognised vocational qualifications alongside academic qualifications. These pathways should be developed and delivered in partnership with colleges and, where necessary, other training providers. Their delivery should be explicitly measured and published alongside other school performance indicators.

Recommendation 2: A focus on preparing all young people for employment should form a core element of the implementation of Curriculum for Excellence with appropriate resource dedicated to achieve this. In particular local authorities, Skills Development Scotland and employer representative organisations should work together to develop a more comprehensive standard for careers guidance which would reflect the involvement of employers and their role and input.

Recommendation 3: A modern standard should be established for the acceptable content and quality of work experience, and guidelines should be made available to employers. This should be developed by Education Scotland in partnership with employer bodies and Skills Development Scotland. This should involve input from young people. Work experience should feature in the Senior Phase Benchmarking Tool and in Education Scotland school inspections.

COLLEGES

Recommendation 4: Colleges’ key role in the development of Scotland’s young workforce should be recognised and managed through Regional Outcome Agreements.

Recommendation 5: The new regional colleges should have a primary focus on employment outcomes and supporting local economic development. This should be underpinned by meaningful and wide ranging partnerships with industry and should be at the forefront of Regional Outcome Agreements and their measurement.

SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES WORKING IN PARTNERSHIP

Recommendation 6: A commitment to supporting the development of Scotland’s young workforce through the enhancement of vocational education pathways should feature prominently in the National Performance Framework, Community Plans and College Regional Outcome Agreements.

MODERN APPRENTICESHIPS

Recommendation 7: Modern Apprenticeships should be aligned with the skills required to support economic growth.

Recommendation 8: Development of Modern Apprenticeship access processes and progression pathways should be prioritised.

Recommendation 9: An industry-led quality improvement regime should be introduced to oversee the development and promotion of Modern Apprenticeships.
Recommendation 10: If employers can be encouraged to offer significantly more good quality apprenticeships, the Scottish Government should consider a carefully managed expansion of the annual number of Modern Apprenticeship starts.

QUALITY ASSURANCE

Recommendation 11: Employability must be a key focus within Education Scotland’s work to support and quality assure the delivery of education. To support this, Education Scotland must work more closely with business organisations and their members to ensure that their work is underpinned by an understanding of industry’s needs and expectations.

SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, ENGINEERING AND MATHS

Recommendation 12: A focus on STEM should sit at the heart of the development of Scotland’s Young Workforce.

MORE CHOICES, MORE CHANCES

Recommendation 13: Support for young people at risk of disengaging from education and for those who have already done so should focus on early intervention and wide ranging, sustained support. This should relate to labour market demand and should be focused on helping young people engage on the labour market relevant pathways that we have highlighted.

INVolVEMENT OF EMPLOYERS

Recommendation 14: The Scottish Government should support the creation of regional industry-led Invest in Youth groups across Scotland to provide leadership and a single point of contact and support to facilitate engagement between employers and education.

Recommendation 15: Businesses across Scotland should be encouraged and supported to enter into 3-5 year partnerships with secondary schools. Every secondary school in Scotland and its feeder primaries should be supported by at least one business in a long-term partnership.

Recommendation 16: Scotland’s leading industry sector groups and companies should be encouraged to work with the Scottish College for Educational Leadership to develop a programme to provide emerging school staff leaders with a wide ranging understanding of industry and careers.

Recommendation 17: Employers and national industry sector groups should form partnerships with regional colleges to ensure course content is industry relevant and full advantage is taken of work based learning and employment opportunities.

Recommendation 18: In the development of future industry Skills Investment Plans and Regional Skills Assessments, and in the updating of existing plans, there should be a specific focus on youth employment and the development of vocational pathways starting in the senior phase.

Recommendation 19: A nationally defined Invest in Youth Accolade should be developed to recognise industry’s engagement in the development and employment of Scotland’s young workforce.
Recommendation 20: A small business Modern Apprenticeship recruitment incentive package should be developed to equip and support smaller and micro businesses to recruit and train more young people.

Recommendation 21: Voluntary levy schemes to recruit and train young people in skills shortage areas should be encouraged. Groups of employers should be supported to work in collaboration, with the Scottish Government providing co-funding.

Recommendation 22: Procurement and supply chain policies in both the public and private sectors should be applied to encourage more employers to support the development of Scotland’s young workforce.

Recommendation 23: Public sector employers should be encouraged by the Scottish Government and local authorities to be exemplars in a national Invest In Youth Policy and this should be explicitly reflected in their published corporate plans.

Recommendation 24: Growth businesses and Inward Investment companies in receipt of public funding should be encouraged and supported to employ young people.

Recommendation 25: Financial recruitment incentives should be re-examined and carefully targeted to achieve the most benefit in providing sustainable employment for young people.

ADVANCING EQUALITIES

Recommendation 26: Scotland should embed equality education across Curriculum for Excellence

Recommendation 27: Promotion and communication of career options should actively target equalities groups to promote diverse participation across gender, Black & Minority Ethnic groups, young people with disabilities and care leavers. The promotion of Modern Apprenticeship opportunities should be to the fore of this activity.

Recommendation 28: Senior phase vocational pathways should be designed to encourage more gender balance across occupations.

Recommendation 29: The Scottish Funding Council and colleges should develop an action plan to address gender disparities within college education. This should be underpinned by realistic but stretching improvement targets. The Scottish Funding Council should report on this annually.

Recommendation 30: Skills Development Scotland should develop an action plan to address gender disparities within Modern Apprenticeships. This should be underpinned by realistic but stretching improvement targets. SDS should report on this annually.

Recommendation 31: A targeted campaign to promote the full range of Modern Apprenticeships to young people and parents from the BME community should be developed and launched to present the benefits of work based learning as a respected career option and alternative to university.

Recommendation 32: SDS should set a realistic but stretching improvement target to increase the number of young people from BME groups starting Modern Apprenticeships. Progress against this should be reported on annually.
Recommendation 33: Career advice and work experience for young disabled people who are still at school should be prioritised and tailored to help them realise their potential and focus positively on what they can do to achieve their career aspirations.

Recommendation 34: Funding levels to colleges and MA training providers should be reviewed and adjusted to reflect the cost of providing additional support to young disabled people, and age restrictions should be relaxed for those whose transition may take longer.

Recommendation 35: Within Modern Apprenticeships, SDS should set a realistic but stretching improvement target to increase the number of young disabled people. Progress against this should be reported on annually.

Recommendation 36: Employers who want to employ a young disabled person should be encouraged and supported to do so.

Recommendation 37: Educational and employment transition planning for young people in care should start early with sustained support from public and third sector bodies and employers available throughout their journey toward and into employment as is deemed necessary.

Recommendation 38: Across vocational education and training, age restrictions should be relaxed for those care leavers whose transition takes longer.

Recommendation 39: In partnership with the third sector, the Scottish Government should consider developing a programme which offers supported employment opportunities lasting up to a year for care leavers.
## ANNEXE C: DYW KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

### Overarching Target
To reduce the level of youth unemployment (excluding those in full-time education) by 40 per cent by 2021.

### KPI 1
Be one of the top five performing countries in the EU for youth unemployment by reducing the relative ratio of youth unemployment to 25-64 unemployment to the level of the fifth best country in the EU by 2021.

### KPI 2
Be one of the top five performing countries in the EU for youth unemployment by reducing the youth unemployment rate to match the fifth best country in the EU by 2021.

### KPI 3
Increase the percentage of school leavers attaining vocational qualifications* at SCQF level 5 and above by 2021.
*Vocational qualifications: for the purposes of base lining, we are interpreting this as National Certificates, Higher National Qualifications, Scottish Vocational Qualifications, National Progression Awards, and Skills for Work at SCQF Level 5 and above but recognise that this should evolve to fully reflect vocational qualifications valued by employers. We will consult further with stakeholders on this.

### KPI 4
Increase the percentage of young college students moving into employment or higher level study by 2021.

### KPI 5
The number of Modern Apprentices at level 3 and above to be increased. The target is for 20,000 out of a total of 30,000 MA starts to be at this level by 2021, i.e. two-thirds.

### KPI 6
Increase the percentage of employers recruiting young people directly from education to 35 per cent by 2018.

### KPI 7
To reduce to 60 per cent the percentage of MA frameworks where the gender balance is 75:25 or worse by 2021.

### KPI 8
Increase by 5 percentage points the minority gender share in each of the 10 largest and most imbalanced super-classes* by 2021. (*super-classes are subject groups in colleges.)

### KPI 9
Increase the number of MA starts from minority ethnic communities to equal the population share by 2021

### KPI 10
Increase the employment rate for young disabled people to the population average by 2021

### KPI 11
Increase positive destinations for looked after children by 4 percentage point per annum resulting in parity by 2021
### ANNEXE D: RELEVANT DYW MILESTONES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DYW milestones related to schools</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
<th>2015/16</th>
<th>2016/17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The aims of the Developing the Young Workforce (DYW) programme embedded within the Curriculum for Excellence Implementation Plan and monitored through the Curriculum for Excellence Management Board and Implementation Group;</td>
<td>An increase in uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;</td>
<td>An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;</td>
<td>An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications and engagement work undertaken to develop understanding of routes into work amongst parents, teachers and practitioners, and young people;</td>
<td>An increase in the quality and number of strategic partnerships between local authorities, schools, and colleges, to widen the offer to young people in the senior phase;</td>
<td>DYW programme reflected in college outcome agreements and curriculum planning;</td>
<td>Evaluation of the initial foundation apprenticeship pathfinders completed and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An initial evaluation of the starting point in terms of what secondary schools are already offering by way of vocational qualifications established;</td>
<td>DYW programme reflected in local authority strategic plans; Mechanism to influence community plans is established;</td>
<td>DYW programme reflected in local authority strategic plans; Mechanism to influence community plans is established;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate measures of success for schools in relation to the DYW programme developed;</td>
<td>Guidance and support developed by Education Scotland and Skills Development Scotland for teachers and practitioners to support young people in S3 to learn about finding, applying and getting a job;</td>
<td>Guidance and support developed by Education Scotland and Skills Development Scotland for teachers and practitioners to support young people in S3 to learn about finding, applying and getting a job;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From inception the Insight online benchmarking tool reflects a wide range of awards, including a range of vocational qualifications, undertaken in schools or through school college partnerships where these awards meet the criteria for inclusion.</td>
<td>Relaunch My World of Work website with a greater learner focus linked to career pathways;</td>
<td>Relaunch My World of Work website with a greater learner focus linked to career pathways;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Scotland integrating DYW in inspection advice to schools; Scottish Funding Council early adopter activity on school/college partnerships undertaken in 7 college regions;</td>
<td>Guidance and support developed by Education Scotland and Skills Development Scotland for teachers and practitioners on the world of work aimed at ages 3-18;</td>
<td>A new standard for work experience in place in schools;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundation apprenticeship engineering pathfinder projects undertaken in Fife and West Lothian.</td>
<td>Lessons from Scottish Funding Council early adopter activity regions disseminated widely;</td>
<td>Lessons from Scottish Funding Council early adopter activity regions disseminated widely;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Scaling up of the foundation apprenticeship pathfinders to other local authorities;</td>
<td>Scaling up of the foundation apprenticeship pathfinders to other local authorities;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engagement with young people, teachers and practitioners, parents and employers to actively promote the range of options available;</td>
<td>Engagement with young people, teachers and practitioners, parents and employers to actively promote the range of options available;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expansion of wide range of qualifications included in Insight tool;</td>
<td>Expansion of wide range of qualifications included in Insight tool;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A quality assurance review for the careers service as part of a continuous improvement regime is in place Agreed standard for careers guidance for all young people including those who require additional help and support is in place;</td>
<td>A quality assurance review for the careers service as part of a continuous improvement regime is in place Agreed standard for careers guidance for all young people including those who require additional help and support is in place;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education Scotland publish an aspect review of My World of World;</td>
<td>Education Scotland publish an aspect review of My World of World;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The establishment of Regional Invest in Young People Groups working in partnership with local authority education teams across Scotland.</td>
<td>The establishment of Regional Invest in Young People Groups working in partnership with local authority education teams across Scotland.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;</td>
<td>An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of the initial foundation apprenticeship pathfinders completed and</td>
<td>Evaluation of the initial foundation apprenticeship pathfinders completed and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
evidence used to inform the development of an agreed model; Employability and enterprise professional standards in development; Education Scotland further develops its capacity to evaluate in relation to employability and employment;  
- A new focus on work experience and the quality of careers guidance as part of secondary school inspection programme.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017/18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;  
- Further expansion of foundation apprenticeship across Scotland and covering other sectors;  
- Delivery of mentoring support for young people in care as part of the Invest in Young People accolade |
| 2018/19  |  
- An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;  
- Pilot activity on foundation and advanced apprenticeships and equalities being rolled out across the country;  
- All secondary schools will have active partnerships with regional colleges. |
| 2019/20  |  
- An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase. |
| 2020/21  |  
- An increase in the uptake of vocational qualifications available to those in the senior phase;  
- Expanded provision fully embedded within Curriculum for Excellence, tested by Education Scotland, and valued by young people, their parents and teachers and practitioners as evidenced by uptake and outcomes. |
ANNEXE E: DYW STRUCTURES

Roles and Responsibilities

Programme Board

Provides coordination, support and scrutiny

The Board holds change themes to account for progress against plans, and will test that interactions between the change themes are fully exploited.

Programme Team

Accountability, Planning, Coordination, Performance

(Michael Cross – Director: Jon Gray – Programme Manager: Danielle Hennessy – Programme Team Leader)

National Advisory Group

Formal expression of the guiding coalition. Political and senior stakeholder leadership. Promotes the vision. Critical friend, intelligence gathering and focus for key messages.

Communication Strategy

Targeted stakeholder engagement

Wider public awareness campaign

Change Theme 1: Schools
A school curriculum that is industry focussed and influenced
Lead: Graeme Logan (School Years Directorate, Education Scotland)

Change Theme 2: School-College
Clearer vocational pathways, starting in the senior phase which lead to industry recognised qualifications
Lead: Alan Johnston (Learning Directorate)

Change Theme 3: College
A college system fully focussed on employability and responding to industry's skills needs at the regional and national levels
Lead: Melanie Weldon (Employability, Skills & Lifelong Learning Directorate)

Change Theme 4: Apprenticeships
Apprenticeship opportunities for young people to achieve qualifications up to and including degree level while in work
Lead: Rona Sweeney (Employability, Skills & Lifelong Learning Directorate)

Change Theme 5: Employers
A network of employer hubs supporting partnerships with schools, wider range of apprenticeships and investment in young people
Lead: Hugh McAloon (Employability Skills & Lifelong Learning Directorate)

Cross-cutting issue

Equality
(Led by Scottish Government)
Programme Board

Andrew Scott, Director, Employability, Skills and Lifelong Learning in the Scottish Government, will act as Senior Responsible Officer leading the DYW implementation programme, and chairing a programme board to which lead officials will be accountable for progress.

Membership

Andrew Scott - Chair (Scottish Government, Director of Employability, Skills and Lifelong Learning)
Linda McKay (ex-Principal, Forth Valley College; Wood Commissioner)
Christine Pollock (ex-Director of Education North Lanarkshire, Wood Commissioner)
Sylvia Halkerston (Former HR Director, Macphie of Glenbervie; Scottish Funding Council/Skills Development Scotland Joint Skills Committee; Wood Commissioner)
Fiona Robertson (Scottish Government, Director of Learning)
Mhairi Harrington (Principal, West Lothian College)
Terry Lanagan (Director of Education West Dunbartonshire, Curriculum for Excellence Management Board)
Carol Henry (HR Director, Arnold Clark)
Paul McKelvie OBE (Board member Skills Development Scotland and Scottish Funding Council)
Ken Milroy (Regional College Chair, Aberdeen & Aberdeenshire)
Mike Callaghan (CoSLA)

The National Advisory Group

The National Advisory Group is designed to provide formal expression of the guiding coalition that supports the DYW programme: through its members it will be able to promote the associated vision to stakeholders across Scotland.

Membership

Cabinet Secretary for Fair Work, Skills and Training; and Councillor Douglas Chapman, CoSLA (joint retained chair)
Sir Ian Wood
Brian Johnstone (Regional College Chair, Dumfries & Galloway)
John Fyffe (President, Association of Directors of Education in Scotland)
Iain Ellis (Chair, National Parents' Forum Scotland)
Larry Flanagan (EIS General Secretary)
Grahame Smith (STUC General Secretary, Wood Commissioner)
Hamira Khan (Chief Executive, Scottish Youth Parliament)
Polly Purvis (Executive Director ScotlandIS: trade body for ICT industry in Scotland)
Morna Simpson (founder of Girl Geek Scotland, Managing Director of FlockEdu)
Annag Maclean (Headteacher, Castlebay High)
Elma Murray (SOLACE representative)
National Invest in Young People Group

The National Invest in Young People Group provides expert guidance from industry, local government, the college and trade unions to oversee the establishment of a network of regional employer-led groups, a key recommendation of the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce. The National Group is chaired by Rob Woodward.

Membership

Rob Woodward (CE, STV) - Chair
Sue Bruce (CE, City of Edinburgh Council; Wood Commissioner)
Grahame Smith (STUC General Secretary; Skills Development Scotland and Scottish Enterprise Board; Wood Commissioner)
Sylvia Halkerston (Former HR Director, Macphie of Glenbervie; Scottish Funding Council/Skills Development Scotland Joint Skills Committee; Wood Commissioner)
Liz Cameron (CE, Scottish Chambers of Commerce)
Colin Borland (Head of External Affairs Scotland, Federation of Small Businesses)
John Stewart (Director of HR, Scottish and Southern Energy)
Heather Dunk (Principal, Ayrshire College)
Graeme Waddell (Skills Development Scotland Board, ex. Rolls Royce, Chair of Energen Biogas)
Submissions

1. The Committee has received three additional submissions since papers for the last meeting were issued to Members. The submissions are reproduced as annexes to this paper and are listed below:

- Louise Moir, Headteacher, Mackie Academy (Annexe A)
- Scottish Guidance Association (Annexe B)
- Foster Care Associates Scotland (Annexe C)
Senior Phase Vocational Pathways

**Recommendation 1:** Pathways should start in the senior phase which leads to the delivery of industry recognised vocational qualifications alongside academic qualifications. These pathways should be developed and delivered in partnership with colleges and, where necessary, other training providers. Their delivery should be explicitly measured and published alongside other school performance indicators.

Any school that is working towards young people being prepared for their chosen pathway will recognise that it is no longer feasible for schools alone to offer appropriate qualifications. At our school we have working partnerships with both North East Scotland College (NESCol) and Dundee and Angus College in different ways. Both provide provision in school for practical courses such as Construction and Skills for Work Engineering Skills. The latter is being provided for the first time this year with teaching being provided by the FE sector to pupils not only from Mackie Academy but also from our neighbouring two secondary schools. This was a requirement made from NESCol and whilst some may view this as limiting what it makes schools do is look at their curriculum provision collaboratively to engage as many young people as possible. Alongside this we have a large number of young people throughout the Senior Phase that combine study here at school with college provision. This means that they will leave school with a suite of qualifications, some academic and some vocational. The development of the Foundation Apprenticeship programme to reflect the needs of the North East of Scotland is ever expanding and we are just about to engage with SDS to look at in-house provision in a sector such as Food which links with one of our flagship partners, Macphies of Glenberview, as well as working collaboratively with our secondary partners at Portlethen and Mearns Academies.

The challenges that remain in terms of ensuring that these pathways add value to a young person’s pathway are not complex. There is the challenge of ensuring that the provision is as cost-effective as possible. Here clarity is required going forwards as to where this funding is going to come from – are schools going to be control over this within already limited budgets or are local authorities going to continue to commit budget to this agenda? Here in the north-east the issue of travel to centres of provision continues to provide barriers despite organisations doing their best to overcome them. I believe this is a role that SDS need to look into further, is how we strengthen understanding between the education and industry sectors about “how things work” and where collaboration is required how this can be made most effective for all. We all recognise that people’ resources are finite and therefore what is put in place must be of benefit to all. Finally, and perhaps outside of the scope of this inquiry, is developing a level of understanding amongst pupils and parents about how a mixed menu of qualifications is no less an achievement than someone who attains five Higher qualifications at A grade. It is about what is going to enable a young person to be successful once they leave school.

**Preparing Young People For The World Of Work**

**Recommendation 2:** A focus on preparing all young people for employment should form a core element of the implementation of Curriculum for Excellence with
appropriate resource dedicated to achieve this. In particular local authorities, Skills Development Scotland and employer representative organisations should work together to develop a more comprehensive standard for careers guidance which would reflect the involvement of employers and their role and input.

The implementation of the Careers and Education Guidance Standard has definitely influenced practice in schools and the direction of travel. What schools now need is time to embed this and develop effective practice that can be shared by all. Given that the majority of careers guidance was provided through the scope of PSE time in school it has become essential for school to broaden their provision to support this with expertise from outside the school. Mackie Academy has an extensive three day Senior Phase induction programme, that takes place in June each year, for all pupils in S4, S5 and S6 engaging nearly 70 local employers, organisations and agencies providing a comprehensive approach to careers education that pupils “buy into” so personalise their experience. Alongside this our partners at SDS this year supported an event with our S1 and S2 pupils to look at gender stereotyping in the workplace to open up our youngest pupils to the different opportunities out there if they are not limited by preconceived ideas. This has been fully evaluated by SDS and is now linked to a piece of research to be carried out by ourselves, SDS and Aberdeen University on this topic and how it influences course choices in the Senior Phase.

The challenge that exists for schools and employers is getting a shared understanding about what is required from both perspectives e.g. what works for a company when presenting to their work colleagues is not necessarily going to work with a group of S2 or S3 pupils. Likewise, are those individuals in schools who are delivering guidance through programmes such as PSE as “au fait” with the ever changing picture of CEG to ensure that what they are sharing with pupils is adding value to their learning experience? Getting this right requires a commitment from education and industry to provide resources that guide and signpost people not only in relation to the specific knowledge and understanding required but also in terms of the skills required to engage young people in this.
Submission from the Scottish Guidance Association

The Committee members of the Scottish Guidance Association raised the following points at their meeting on 2nd June 2018.

- Will there be government funding for the mentioned new vocational qualifications?
- National Guidance will be necessary in order for a consistent approach to be provided across the country, authorities and providers. Strategic leadership within authorities is necessary in order to provide the basis for this approach but is often lacking.
- Improvements in communication between colleges and schools require to be implemented.
- Will the Foundation Apprenticeships provide UCAS points, and is there evidence that they will be considered as equivalent to the Highers which a pupil would otherwise have gained?
- We would welcome an opportunity for sharing best practice e.g. we are aware of the approach taken by Lochgelly High School.
- DYW remit is a huge undertaking in practice – there is a need for a consistent approach within schools regarding this. For example, some schools have new posts for DYW, and in others, it appears to be added on to existing remits.
- National frameworks are needed to implement the suggested strategies - the continual push of new strategies is currently having a demoralising effect on staff who are unable to keep pace due to increasing demands of the role.

SPiCe Survey

- It was felt that the questions could be seen as unclear for pupils - too direct perhaps due to schools embedding DYW within the PSE and whole school curricula - pupils often unclear that what they have done fits under certain criteria, despite completing the work.
- We were very surprised by the suggestion that schools are putting undue pressure on pupils to apply for university. All the teachers at our meeting agreed that they take an individualised approach, as do all their colleagues, and a sustained positive destination that suits the pupil is what is sought. By contrast, there has often been a concern regarding pressure from parents, for pupils to go to university. We would be interested to know why the pupils are under this impression.
- There was discussion regarding the focus on UCAS in PSE lessons. It was agreed by our members, that this could depend on whether the survey covered pupils' experiences in S4 or S6. For example, there is very little discussion of UCAS in S4, as pupils are not in a position to be making an application (though
qualifications required for certain courses/professions would be covered). By contrast, there is a high proportion of pupils who intend to apply to university in S6, and a very specific process, with clear deadlines, and so it would be understandable that pupils feel the emphasis is disproportionate. A number of pupils also apply to college, but as the application process is not so rigorous, and does not involve the teacher so directly, then this in not highlighted to the same extent. In addition, the college application process will have been covered in S4 and S5. It would be difficult to promote applications for jobs and apprenticeships in the same structured way, as there is not one body managing the situation, and jobs become available throughout the year.

- Work experience – there is currently an inequitable approach, both within schools and across authorities, due to timetable, remits, support from work experience units within authorities and availability of placements.

- Throughout the survey it is unclear what options were given to pupils when answering. Eg Pupils asked about support during transition periods - were they asked what support was given by ‘teachers’ or ‘Guidance teachers’ as this would be expected to give significantly different results.
ANNEXE C

Submission from Foster Care Associates (FCA) Scotland

Learner Journey: Education, Training and Work survey

In response to the Learner Journey: Education, Training and Work survey findings, Foster Care Associates (FCA) Scotland have the following considerations:

As a proportion of all school leavers, the largest single group go to University and this perhaps creates the perception that this is the preferred or optimal destination. Figures from the publication Initial Destinations of Senior Phase School Leavers No. 2: 2018 Edition published 27th February 2018 reports that “the percentage signing up for university last year was 40.7%, up from 37.8% six years ago. A total of 26.8% opted for a college course - up 0.1% on 2011/12. However, the percentage of school leavers going into training has steadily fallen from 4.5% in 2011 to 2.4% in 2016.”

This is markedly different to the experience of Looked-After Young People for whom – though the proportion going on to positive destinations is certainly improving - there may be an expectation bias which means they will normally be signposted towards other destinations.

Destinations of Senior Phase School Leavers are channelled by exam results and as research indicates, there is a strong correlation between attendance and attainment.

Attendance - In the school year ending 2017 our young people continued a 6 year trend of exceeding 97% attendance across the Primary and Secondary sector.

![Attendance Chart]

Attainment – In 2017, 100% of our school leavers achieved a qualification at SCQF Level 4 or better and 80% achieved a qualification at level 5 or better. This is against a national average of 77% and 40% respectively for looked after young people in Scotland.
Destinations – We track our school leavers journeys into education, employment or training in the year following their exit from school. 94% of FCA Scotland young people leaving school in June 2016 remained in a positive destination one year later. Currently 100% of our school leavers from 2017 are in a positive destination. This is a mixture of college, training or employment with more than 50% of our School Leavers in college placements.

Foster Carers
Anecdotally our foster carers and Education service at FCA Scotland experience high levels of engagement by individual schools in response to the further and higher educational needs of our ‘Looked After’ Young People.

It is worthy of note that more than 98% of children and young people placed with FCA Scotland have been in placement for more than 3 years, with 50% of our young people in Permanent or Long-term family placements which will also influence our foster carers experience of the Learner Journey. The significance of permanence for young people is underpinned by the main findings from the Scottish Government official statistics publication Education Outcomes for Looked After Children 2015/16 published June 2017 that:

- Looked After Children with the most positive Education outcomes are those:
  - In foster care rather than in other care settings.
  - With fewer care placements in the year.
  - Who have been looked after for the whole year, rather than just part of it.

More broadly in response to the report findings our observations include:

- Colleges tend to be catchment based so less ‘recruiting' than Universities.
- Universities may do more outreach/presentations in schools etc. to attract students.
Agenda Item 2

- Students tend to over-reach when requesting information on possible destinations.
- We would query whether Training providers make themselves available/ are they invited to schools to present an alternative path for young people.
- Corporate Parents have a responsibility to promote individualised plans for School Leavers that is ambitious whilst considers the range of alternatives available for the young person.
- Relationships with foster carers, social workers and key 'advocates' are essential to support young people in making decisions in relation to positive destinations and sustaining this destination.
- Wrap around support to young people once they have transitioned out of school results in the best outcomes for sustaining positive destinations.
- Overall NEET levels in Scotland continue to fall.
- The role of Skills Development Scotland is key; Looked After and Accommodated Young People now get 5 points of contact in the senior phase per year. This is where the most individualised/ targeted support should happen.
- It would be beneficial to our young people if Skills Development Scotland were aware of and engaging with foster carers as the young person’s key role model on a consistent basis throughout Scotland.

FCA Scotland hopes that this evidence is helpful in informing the Committee’s inquiry with particular regard to looked-after young people. We would be happy to provide references and research evidence in relation to these points if it would be of interest. FCA Scotland would also welcome the opportunity to work with the Committee and/or other partners to develop and conduct a survey of Looked After Young People and/or their Foster Carers in relation to the subject of the inquiry.