Tuesday 9 August 2016

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT

Communities

Alison Johnstone (Lothian) (Scottish Green Party): To ask the Scottish Government, in light of the devolution of some social security benefits, what analysis it is carrying out or plans on the (a) operation and (b) impact on claimants of the system of mandatory reconsideration of appeals.

(S5W-1392)

Jeane Freeman: Scottish Government officials are assessing the available evidence, including the Social Security Advisory Committee’s July 2016 report, to understand whether the recent decline in the number of social security appeals in Scotland that followed the introduction of mandatory reconsideration is attributable to improved decision making and early resolution of disputes, or is a result of changes in claimant behaviour.

Our approach will be further informed by the current consultation on social security in Scotland, where we are seeking input from people who have experienced the mandatory reconsideration process to ensure that the system of appeals for devolved benefits is transparent and accessible.

Enterprise and Environment

Fulton MacGregor (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Scottish National Party): To ask the Scottish Government what support it is providing to the renewable energy sector and how this support benefits the economy.

(S5W-1407)

Paul Wheelhouse: The Scottish Government strongly supports the development of the renewable energy sector and decarbonisation of our electrical generation and wider energy sector. In order to facilitate its development, the Scottish Government provides a range of support for the renewable energy sector, including funding to support renewable energy projects and technology development; a planning policy which strikes a careful balance between utilising Scotland's significant renewable energy resources whilst protecting our finest scenic landscapes, natural heritage and residential amenity; and a well-developed structure of partnership with the Scottish agencies, the private sector and academia, which has helped shape our renewable energy policies.

Scottish Government makes available a range of impartial advice and financial support for communities, rural businesses, and non-profit distributing organisations across Scotland who wish to generate their own renewable energy and benefit from commercial operations. This information is available through the Scottish Government's Community and Renewable Energy Scheme (CARES). Further information is available on the Local Energy Scotland website at http://www.localenergyscotland.org/.

We also fund the Energy Saving Trust to provide energy advice and support to businesses and consumers. For example, working with partners including Resource Efficient Scotland, support for businesses is available to allow them to participate effectively in the supply chain for energy efficiency measures and installations and to help businesses attain accreditation with registered bodies to allow them to access funds available via Scottish and UK Government support schemes.

The Energy Saving Trust's network of local area advice centres across Scotland offers free, impartial advice relevant to consumers in their geographical areas. Specialist advisors can visit consumers at home, and provide advice on relevant renewable technologies which are available and appropriate and in most cases can provide details of several potential installers, with a focus on local businesses. Further information on support available from the Energy Saving Trust is available at http://www.energysavingtrust.org.uk/Scotland.

Our delivery partners for these programmes have a key role to play in promoting renewable and low carbon energy opportunities at both national and local level, including through their websites, local events, and annual conferences.

The renewable energy sector makes a significant contribution to the Scottish economy. Figures from the Office for National Statistics (ONS) show that in 2014, more than 21,000 people were employed directly in the low carbon and renewable energy economy in Scotland and this, through
multiplier effects will have supported thousands FTE jobs in the form of indicant and induced employment throughout Scotland. Further information is available on the ONS website at


Figures published by the UK Government in April 2014 show that since 2010 the renewable energy industry has announced around £14.2 billion of investment in Scotland and this has supported many jobs in the supply chain and wider economy. Further information is available on the UK Government website at


Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government, further to the First Minister stating on 2 June 2016 (Official Report, c.13) that “the Scottish Parliament would have the opportunity to scrutinise” any contracts involving projects agreed with China Railway No.3 Engineering Group, whether it anticipates that this opportunity would occur before or after the contract was signed.

(S5W-1408)

John Swinney: The Memorandum of Understanding between the Scottish Government, China Railway No.3 Engineering Group (CR3) and SinoFortone is focused on developing a working relationship to explore possible investment in Scotland.

If and where such investment involves CR3, SinoFortone and third parties then any contract would be a matter for those parties.

The Scottish Government has not identified any specific projects for potential investment.

(S5W-1409)

John Swinney: The Scottish Government is aware that since 21 March 2016 representatives of China Railway No. 3 and SinoFortone have had conversations with a number of third parties about possible investment opportunities. The Scottish Government has had no role in those conversations.

(S5W-1410)

John Swinney: As indicated in the answer to question S5W-00024, as the Memorandum of Understanding does not involve any legal, contractual or funding obligations or commitments on behalf of the Scottish Government, full due diligence was not undertaken.

(S5W-1411)
John Swinney: There have been no discussions between the First Minister or other Ministers and China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group or SinoFortone since 5 May 2016.

At his request, Scottish Government officials participated in a short teleconference with the Chair of the Asia Scotland Institute, Roddy Gow, and Sir Richard Heygate of SinoFortone on 30 June. SinoFortone highlighted their conversations with third parties about potential investment opportunities. No other issues were discussed and a minute of the teleconference was not taken.

Officials met with the Chair of the Asia Scotland Institute on 29 July. The Memorandum of Understanding was discussed along with a range of issues relating to Scotland’s relationship with Asia. A note of the meeting has been placed in SPICe (Bib No. 58117).

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government what assessment it has made of the activities of China Railway No.3 Engineering Group since it became aware of allegations of human rights abuses and the risk of gross corruption; what this assessment involved; whether (a) ministers or (b) officials have discussed these allegations with (i) the Norwegian Government Pension Fund Global or (ii) Amnesty International; what the assessment concluded, and whether it now considers that it would be appropriate to agree investment with this company.

(S5W-1412)

John Swinney: The memorandum of understanding between the Scottish Government, China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group and SinoFortone is focused on developing a relationship to explore possible investment in Scotland. It signals that Scotland is open for business and investment in line with the guiding principles of the Scottish Government's 'Working with China' Strategy. This Strategy has four guiding principles that underpin all of Scotland’s dealings with China and against which success will be measured. One of those principles is Respect for Human Rights and the Rule of Law - supporting China’s process of modernisation and internal reform and the need to balance the demands of economic development with social justice. Scotland is justly proud of its reputation for ethical business practices, and knows that human rights and the rule of law are key to long-term economic success and social stability. We will continue to share our experiences and values in our dealings with China.

China Railway No.3 Engineering Group is one of 46 subsidiaries of the China Railway Group. The allegations of human rights abuses made in the June 2013 Amnesty International report were against the Congo International Mining Corporation (CIMCO), a subsidiary of China Railway Group, and relate to activity by CIMCO and CRG in August 2011 and April 2012. The allegations of gross corruption in the December 2014 report by the Council on Ethics for the Norwegian Government Pension Fund Global relate to the China Railway Group. There is no reference to China Railway No.3 Engineering Group in the report.

Scottish Government officials have considered publicly available information regarding the actions taken by the Chinese Government to tackle corruption; key sources of information on corruption and human rights abuses; and other publicly available information, including company databases, on the activities of China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group.

Following this consideration, the Scottish Government notes that:

(i) The UK Government’s May 2016 advice to businesses on key risks they may face when operating in China states that:

“China is currently listed as a country of concern in the FCO’s annual Human Rights and Democracy Report… Since coming to power in China, President Xi Jinping has launched a wide-ranging anti-corruption drive. China has enacted extensive anti-bribery legislation”.

(ii) The World Bank specifies firms and individuals who are ineligible to be awarded a World Bank-financed contract for set periods because they have been sanctioned under the Bank’s fraud and corruption policy either as a result of specific examination by the bank or because other development banks (Asian Development Bank, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, Inter-American Development Bank, and African Development Bank) have sanctioned them. China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group is not ineligible for World Bank financed contracts.
(iii) Publicly available information, including the websites and associated reports of the Business and Human Rights Resource Centre, Human Rights Watch, and Transparency International, provides no evident reference to allegations of corruption or human rights abuses by China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group.

The Scottish Government welcomes and values Amnesty International’s role and expertise in promoting and protecting human rights. Officials considered Amnesty International’s June 2013 report, ‘Profits and Loss: Mining and Human Rights in Katanga, Democratic Republic of Congo” which was sent to the Scottish Government by Amnesty International on 19 May. The First Minister replied to Amnesty International on 12 June. A copy of that letter has been placed in SPICe (Bib No. 58118).

There have been no discussions between Ministers and the Norwegian Government Pension Fund. E-mail correspondence between Scottish Government officials and Norges Bank Investment Management (NBIM), the Bank now responsible for managing the Investment Fund, and the Norwegian Ministry of Finance confirms the findings of the Council on Ethics’ December 2014 report and that at the start of 2015 changes were made to the role of the Ethics Council and to how and by whom the Investment Fund is managed.

**Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats):** To ask the Scottish Government, further to the answer to question S5W-00019 by Keith Brown on 31 May 2016, whether it will answer the question that was asked regarding whether (a) China Railway No.3 Engineering Group or (b) SinoFortone (i) has previously or (ii) will in future receive privileged access to information not already publicly available and, if so, what access.

(S5W-1413)

**John Swinney:** Neither company has had access to privileged Scottish Government information. Any information provided by other parties which SinoFortone and/or China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group have had discussion with is a matter for them.

China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group and SinoFortone will receive the same access to information as any potential significant investor in Scotland. Some of that information is available publicly. Other information is provided to help and encourage investors to invest in Scotland to create jobs and economic growth.

**Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it has reconsidered its decision not to suspend the memorandum of understanding with China Railway No.3 Engineering Group and SinoFortone that was signed on 21 March 2016.

(S5W-1414)

**John Swinney:** I refer the member to the answer to question S5W-01412 on 9 August 2016, on what assessment it made of the activities of China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group. All answers to written Parliamentary Questions are available on the Parliament’s website, the search facility for which can be found at [http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx](http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx)

**Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats):** To ask the Scottish Government, further to the answer to question S5W-00024 by Keith Brown on 31 May 2016, whether it has now undertaken full due diligence as a precaution or whether this will only occur once legal, contractual or funding obligations or commitments on its behalf are agreed.

(S5W-1415)

**John Swinney:** I refer the member to the answer to question S5W-01412 on 9 August 2016, on what assessment the Scottish Government made of the activities of China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group. All answers to written Parliamentary Questions are available on the Parliament’s website, the search facility for which can be found at [http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx](http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx)
**Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (Scottish Liberal Democrats):** To ask the Scottish Government, further to the answer to question S5W-00028 by Keith Brown on 31 May 2016, whether it will provide the answer to the question that was asked.

(S5W-1416)

**John Swinney:** Written information provided was included in the material released by the Scottish Government on 31 May 2016 and which was placed in SPICe (Bib No. 57958). The broad activities of China Railway No. 3 Engineering Group and SinoFortone were discussed with officials.

**Health and Social Care**

**Alison Johnstone (Lothian) (Scottish Green Party):** To ask the Scottish Government for what conditions omeprazole is prescribed by the NHS.

(S5W-1436)

**Shona Robison:** Omeprazole is a drug prescribed for reducing stomach acid in the treatment of gastric and duodenal ulcers, dyspepsia and gastro-oesophageal reflux disease. In addition, omeprazole is increasingly recommended to prevent the side-effects from treatments for patients with arthritis and chronic pain.

Increases in prescribing volumes are consistent with those attributable to an aging population with more complex medical needs. The National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) have recently recommended prescribing omeprazole for patients receiving treatment for arthritis who may require gastro-protection, leading to further increases.

The number of people prescribed omeprazole in each year since 2010-11 is set out in the following table:-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>Number of Patients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
<td>564,743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
<td>624,569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>657,270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>677,520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>707,464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>724,424</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The figures include only those patients for whom a Community Health Index (CHI) number has been captured from the patient’s prescription form. CHI capture rate on prescriptions, while improving, is currently less than 100%. There will, therefore, be a degree of discrepancy between actual patient numbers and prescription items dispensed, more so in the earlier years.

The Scottish Government has not undertaken any projections for the next five years.

**Alison Johnstone (Lothian) (Scottish Green Party):** To ask the Scottish Government what information it has on the reasons for the reported increase in the prescribing of omeprazole.

(S5W-1437)

**Shona Robison:** I refer the member to the answer to question S5W-01436 on 9 August 2016. All answers to Parliamentary Questions are available on the Parliament’s website, the search facility for which can be found at http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx.

**Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Scottish Labour):** To ask the Scottish Government how many people have been prescribed omeprazole in each year since 2010 and at what cost, and what projections it has made for each of the next five years.

(S5W-1446)

**Shona Robison:** I refer the member to the answer to question S5W-01436 on 9 August 2016. All answers to Parliamentary Questions are available on the Parliament’s website, the search facility for which can be found at http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx.
Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Scottish Labour): To ask the Scottish Government how many asthma nurses have been employed each year since 2010, broken down by NHS board.

(S5W-1447)

Shona Robison: It is not possible to centrally quantify the number or contribution of nurses across Scotland that are involved in the provision of care to asthma patients.

Asthma care services are delivered in a variety of settings in both primary and secondary care, and nurses involved in the delivery of those services may be directly employed either by NHSScotland or by general practices.

Furthermore, nurses can be involved in delivering specialist care either wholly or as part of their role. Whilst some GP practices employ a dedicated asthma nurse, in others this function is covered by the practice nurse. In a hospital setting, patients may be seen by an asthma nurse or a specialist respiratory nurse.

Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Scottish Labour): To ask the Scottish Government what recent action it has taken to assess the affordability of feminine hygiene products and the cost of periods to women and girls; whether it considers feminine hygiene to be a health issue; what action it is taking to tackle the stigma around periods, and whether it plans to introduce free access to feminine hygiene products.

(S5W-1459)

Shona Robison: The Scottish Government has done no specific work to assess the costs of periods to women and girls. However there are undoubtedly genuine costs for women and girls associated with feminine hygiene and over an entire lifetime these could be significant.

Feminine hygiene is not a health issue. Menstruation is normal. Where it becomes abnormal – excessive or infrequent – and potentially does become a health issue, treatments exist to help with this.

While there is undoubtedly embarrassment and taboo about periods, we are not aware of any research evidence identifying particular stigma in relation to periods in Scotland.

The Government currently has no plans to introduce free access to feminine hygiene products. However, we have invested in a range of other services to support people on low income or facing an acute income crisis. This includes the £33 million a year Scottish Welfare Fund which provides a safety net for vulnerable people on low incomes; investment in a range of advice services specifically designed to maximise income, support the transition on to new benefits, support lone parents and tackle unmet debt and financial capability; and our £1 million a year Fair Food Fund which will support community projects that help people access affordable food and develop skills, confidence and social networks.

We are aware that food banks in Scotland will often provide sanitary products, usually as part of a broader offer of other personal hygiene products such as nappies or soap.

Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party): To ask the Scottish Government what training it provides to (a) members of and (b) advisers to its health steering groups regarding avoiding a conflict-of-interest between their roles and issues affecting NHS boards that they might be associated with.

(S5W-1491)


The Code highlights the importance of avoiding conflicts of interest and focusses on the key principles of public life for members of public bodies. All members of an NHS board have a responsibility to ensure that they are familiar with, and that their actions comply with, the provisions of the Code of Conduct.
In addition to the requirements of the Code, all health board members undertake induction training, which includes highlighting their responsibilities around the issue of conflicts of interest. An easy to read booklet on the important aspects of induction for health board members, including conflicts of interest, was published by the Scottish Government in August 2015 and is available to view at http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0048/00487869.pdf. NHS Boards will also make other opportunities available to both new and existing members to further understand their role in providing good governance through the provision of additional local training and development.

The provisions for dealing with alleged breaches of the Code of Conduct is set out in Part 2 of the Ethical Standards in Public Life etc. (Scotland) Act 2000. This also sets out the sanctions that shall be applied if the Standards Commission finds that there has been a breach of the Code.

**Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to the report that Information Services Division (ISD) assisted NHS Dumfries and Galloway in responding to a freedom of information (FOI) request, and what action it will take to ensure that ISD acts wholly independently of NHS boards that supply it with statistics and does not intervene when FOI requests are made to NHS boards.

(S5W-1492)

**Shona Robison:** Our expectation is that Freedom of Information (FoI) is fully complied with by all NHS Boards. We also recognise that the Information Services Division's (ISD) role as producers of official and national statistics means that, on occasion, it is appropriate for Health Boards and ISD to discuss FoI requests. National Services Scotland (within which ISD sits) and NHS Dumfries and Galloway, like other public bodies, are responsible for implementing the FoI Act and the Commissioner is responsible for enforcing and promoting FoI. The Scottish Information Commissioner's finding is a matter for NHS Dumfries and Galloway to respond to. The Scottish Government recognises the importance of transparency for all public bodies and, as such, expects all NHS Boards to fully comply with the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002.

**Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats):** To ask the Scottish Government what plans it has to improve the transfer of information regarding head injuries between A&E units and (a) police custody units and (b) prisons.

(S5W-1494)

**Shona Robison:** When any patient attends A&E their electronic patient record in the hospital will be updated and upon discharge will receive a discharge letter outlining the treatment received. This will be the case for those transferring to police custody units and prisons and allow receiving staff to take appropriate action if necessary.

**Anas Sarwar (Glasgow) (Scottish Labour):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide a list of all NHS (a) targets and (b) treatment guarantees.

(S5W-1543)

**Shona Robison:** Local Delivery Plans (LDP) form the performance contract between the Scottish Government and NHS Boards. LDP standards are priorities that are reviewed and agreed between the Scottish Government and NHS Boards each year. The current standards are available at http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Health/Quality-Improvement-Performance/NHS-Performance-Targets

**Anas Sarwar (Glasgow) (Scottish Labour):** To ask the Scottish Government how many of the new posts announced by the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport on 7 June 2016 (Official Report, c. 2) will (a) represent additional staff and (b) be reallocation from existing positions.

(S5W-1544)

**Shona Robison:** The Scottish Government has committed to increasing the number of training places for Doctors, Nurses and Midwives and Paramedics across the NHS in Scotland. This includes
an extra 50 places which have been allocated to Scottish medical schools for new entrants from 2016 onwards which will result in an additional 250 medical trainees created by 2020-21.

100 new GP training places will be advertised in a further recruitment round opening at the end of July. This will take the total number of GP training posts advertised across Scotland in 2016 to 439, an increase of 134 on 2015, and beyond the First Minister’s commitment to increase the numbers to 400. Trainees will start in these posts in February 2017.

The Scottish Government has committed to providing an extra 1,000 new Nursing and Midwifery training places in addition to the commitment to train 500 additional Advanced Nurse Practitioners. A proportion of these Advanced Nurse Practitioners will be existing staff along with new posts. The numbers will be confirmed when NHS Boards undertake service and training needs analysis.

In addition, the Scottish Ambulance Service (SAS) will train 1,000 new paramedics over the next five years, enhancing the clinical skill mix of staff and introducing new ways of working to better meet the needs of patients in all communities. As part of the “Towards 2020: Taking Care to the Patient” strategy, the Scottish Government has invested £5m in SAS for 2016-17. This investment will allow these new paramedics to be recruited from the current cohort of ambulance technicians, supported by the recruitment and training of 200 new technicians to backfill those posts.

**Anas Sarwar (Glasgow) (Scottish Labour):** To ask the Scottish Government what engagement it has had with the Royal College of General Practitioners on the new GP contract.

**Shona Robison:** The Scottish Government has ensured opportunities for engagement, particularly as part of a wider debate on the future of general practice, and are grateful for the contribution that the Royal College General Practitioners has already made and look forward to continuing to engage with them, as well as with other stakeholders who share our common desire to further improve the quality of primary care services for the benefit of patients.

The profession's representative body for contract negotiations is the Scottish General Practitioners Committee of the British Medical Association, however there is a shared commitment around the future vision for the delivery of primary care services, and the Scottish Government fully recognises the important contribution of all key stakeholders in taking this agenda forward.

**Donald Cameron (Highlands and Islands) (Scottish Conservative and Unionists Party):** To ask the Scottish Government what its position is on the NHS Centre for Integrative Care.

**Shona Robison:** The Centre for Integrative Care (CIC) is a facility run by NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde which offers a range of treatments and therapies. NHS Boards in Scotland retain the option of referring people to the CIC for treatment.

**Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party):** To ask the Scottish Government what its position is on reports that GP practices in Edinburgh, including Parkgrove & East Craigs Medical Practice and Southside Surgery, are unable to recruit the GPs they require.

**Shona Robison:** In Scotland we are transforming primary care, supported by £85 million of extra investment to put in place long-term, sustainable change within GP services that can better meet changing needs and demands.

We have also pledged to increase GP training places for medical students from 300 to 400 a year and are expanding schemes to encourage trained GPs to return to practice in the NHS. We are working closely with the British Medical Association (BMA) and the Royal College of GPs to reduce workload, including our pioneering agreement to abolish the bureaucratic system of GP payments, and work towards a new Scottish GP contract from 2017. A £20 million package to support GPs will also help ease pressures on workload in the short term, and contribute to putting general practice on a more long-term sustainable footing.
Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party): To ask the Scottish Government what action it is taking to support GP practices that are unable to recruit sufficient numbers of GPs.

(S5W-1581)

Shona Robison: The number of GPs in Scotland has increased by 7% under this Government, and we want to go further to boost GP numbers as part of a building a strong, multi-disciplinary Community Health Service. In Scotland we are transforming primary care, supported by £85 million of extra investment to put in place long-term, sustainable change within GP services that can better meet changing needs and demands. As part of this, over £2 million is being invested in work to explore with key stakeholders the issues surrounding GP recruitment and retention.

We have pledged to increase GP training places for medical students from 300 to 400 a year and are expanding schemes to encourage trained GPs to return to practice in the NHS. We are working closely with the British Medical Association (BMA) and the Royal College of GPs to reduce workload, including our pioneering agreement to abolish the bureaucratic system of GP payments, and work towards a brand new Scottish GP contract from 2017. A £20 million package to support GPs will also help ease pressures on workload in the short term, and contribute to putting general practice on a more long-term sustainable footing.

Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party): To ask the Scottish Government how many vacant GP positions there are, broken down by NHS board area.

(S5W-1583)

Shona Robison: Numbers of vacancies for GP posts are not held centrally as this is a matter for individual independent GP contractors as employers. However, as part of the move towards better quality, more regular, and more consistent information, a workforce survey was published on 14 June 2016.

One in five (22%) responding GP practices reported current GP vacancies at 31 August 2015. This is an increase from 9% of practices reporting current vacancies in 2013. In 2015, half of the vacancies reported had been vacant for over 6 months.

In Scotland we are transforming primary care, supported by £85 million of extra investment to put in place long-term, sustainable change within GP services that can better meet changing needs and demands.

We have also pledged to increase GP training places for medical students from 300 to 400 a year and are expanding schemes to encourage trained GPs to return to practice in the NHS. We are working closely with the British Medical Association (BMA) and the Royal College of GPs to reduce workload, including our pioneering agreement to abolish the bureaucratic system of GP payments, and work towards a new Scottish GP contract from 2017. A £20 million package to support GPs will also help ease pressures on workload in the short term, and contribute to putting general practice on a more long-term sustainable footing.

Alison Johnstone (Lothian) (Scottish Green Party): To ask the Scottish Government, further to the answer to question S4W-28989 by Shona Robison on 5 January 2016, whether the equality impact assessment has carried out on the proposal and, if so, when the results will be published.

(S5W-1588)

Shona Robison: Yes. An Equality Impact Assessment of the cleft surgery review has been carried out. It will be published on the NHS National Services Scotland, National Services Division, website (www.nsd.scot.nhs.uk) in early August 2016.
Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Scottish Conservatives and Unionist Party): To ask the Scottish Government what its position is on providing cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR) training to all public sector employees.

(S5W-1670)

Shona Robison: The Scottish Government recognises the importance of early bystander cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR) as part of the ‘chain of survival’ to improve outcomes from Out of Hospital Cardiac Arrest (OHCA). The Minister for Public Health launched “Out of Hospital Cardiac Arrest: A strategy for Scotland” in March 2015, which is available at: http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2015/03/7484

The Scottish Government is working with a range of partners to provide training and support for CPR for communities across Scotland. Our ‘Save a Life for Scotland’ (SALFS) initiative provides the public with the opportunity to find out where they can take part in CPR training in their local area. CPR training opportunities have been supported by SALFS partners in various locations including schools, NHS and community premises. Further information can be found at: http://savealife.scot

We published research earlier this year to provide baseline data on CPR training, which highlights that most people are trained through their employment. We are using the survey findings to roll out activity aimed at encouraging bystander CPR.

Learning and Justice

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government on what statutory basis Police Scotland has collected a reported 852,507,524 number plate records and whether this process was debated by the Parliament.

Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016 (S5W-1348)

Michael Matheson: There is no specific statutory power for the collection of number plate records by Police Scotland. However, Police Scotland is required to comply with all relevant legislation in the collection, use and retention of data.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats) To ask the Scottish Government whether Police Scotland (a) has consulted or (b) will consult the Information Commissioner’s Office on its automatic number plate recognition retention policies and what the reasons are for its position on this matter.

Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016 (S5W-1349)

Michael Matheson: The information requested is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government whether, as reported in The Ferret on 7 July 2016, officials told Police Scotland “We do not want you to provide us with detailed answers to all of the questions Ms McInnes asks” and, if so, for what reason and what action it will take.

Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016 (S5W-1350)

Michael Matheson: A number of the Parliamentary Questions asked by the former MSP Alison McInnes in March 2016 sought information on the governance and regulation of policing activity whilst others sought detailed information on the delivery of operational policing activity. Responsibility for the delivery of operational policing activity lies with Police Scotland with oversight of the Scottish Police Authority and the Scottish Government’s approach to requesting information reflected this position.
Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government what bodies have access to information collected by Police Scotland via the automatic number plate recognition system.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**

**Michael Matheson:** The information requested is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you. Information from Automatic Number Plate Recognition technology must be used and retained in compliance with relevant legislation including the Data Protection Act 1998, the Human Rights Act 1998, the Criminal Procedure (Scotland) Act 1995, and the Regulation of Investigatory Powers (Scotland) Act 2000.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government when information held by Police Scotland’s automatic number plate recognition system dating back longer than two years will be deleted.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**

**Michael Matheson:** This is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government whether senior Police Scotland officers were aware in 2013 of the legal requirement to delete all automatic number plate recognition data over two years old; whether they did so, and what the reason is for their position on this matter.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**

**Michael Matheson:** The information requested is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government whether the Police Scotland automatic number plate recognition standard operating procedure document published in March 2015 made reference to the amount of archive data held.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**

**Michael Matheson:** The information requested is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government whether it will introduce specific legislation to improve the management of automatic number plate recognition data held by Police Scotland.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**

**Michael Matheson:** The Scottish Government keeps these matters under review but has no current plans to introduce legislation relating to Automatic Number Plate Recognition.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government who has been appointed to Police Scotland’s short-life working group to tackle automatic number plate recognition issues, as reported in The Ferret on 7 July 2016; when it will meet, and what will be discussed.

**Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016**
Michael Matheson: The information requested is a matter for the Chief Constable of Police Scotland, with the oversight of the Scottish Police Authority. I have alerted the Chief Constable to your question and I have asked him to write to you.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government what steps it will take to inform and engage the public regarding the use of armed police and what its response is to the suggestion made on Radio Scotland on 12 July 2016 that "we have got to have an informed debate" regarding the operation of armed officers.

Holding answer issued: 9 August 2016 (S5W-1402)

Michael Matheson: The Scottish Government's position on armed policing was made clear in my statement to Parliament on 16 June 2016. That statement followed a Police Scotland briefing for opposition justice spokespersons to explain the basis for the uplift in armed police officer numbers.

Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (Scottish Liberal Democrats): To ask the Scottish Government what assessment it has made of the extent to which brain injuries should be taken into account as a mitigating factor in sentencing.

(S5W-1423)

Michael Matheson: Sentencing in any given case is a matter for the court. They will take into account the full facts and circumstances of a case before deciding upon an appropriate sentence. This includes any relevant injuries or conditions affecting the offender.

The Scottish Government has not undertaken any specific assessment in terms of the extent to which brain injuries should be taken into account when sentencing.

Alex Rowley (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Scottish Labour): To ask the Scottish Government, in light of the finding of the Independent Advisor on Poverty and Inequality's report, Shifting the Curve, that some services perceive themselves as "race blind" and "unlikely to deliver a high quality service", whether it will introduce anti-poverty initiatives that are focused on minority ethnic communities.

(S5W-1453)

Angela Constance: The Scottish Government has committed to consider measures to tackle poverty across all ethnicities, reflecting our approach to social justice and our response to the report from the Independent Adviser on Poverty and Inequality.

In the Race Equality Framework, we committed to filling evidence gaps on how and to what extent people from minority ethnic groups are accessing the benefits they are entitled to and to ensuring that all relevant policy and programme areas – such as benefits take-up policy and access to advice services (including financial advice) - are fully impact-assessed for equality, as is our legal duty.

Our starting point is that services must be accessible and work for all. However, in some instances, there may be a need for targeted action that focuses specifically on minority ethnic communities. For example, we are aware that people from minority ethnic groups may be under-represented as applicants of the Scottish Welfare Fund: we are therefore looking to work with relevant organisations and to target publicity for these communities, so as to improve their access to the fund across Scotland. We will continue to look for opportunities to support people from minority ethnic groups, particularly those on low incomes, in all our work going forward.

Strategy and Operations

Alex Rowley (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Scottish Labour): To ask the Scottish Government, in light of the finding in the Equal Opportunities committee report in session four, Removing Barriers: race, ethnicity and employment, (SP paper 890), that "initiatives such as 'unconscious bias' training are not the solution and can serve to mask underlying negative attitudes towards people from an ethnic minority background", whether it continues to provide such training for (a) ministers, (b) its officials and (c) its directorates.

(S5W-1455)
Derek Mackay: The Scottish Government offers “unconscious bias” training for all its staff. This is part of comprehensive range of measures implemented to help us provide a fair and inclusive workplace and complement our fair and open approach to resourcing.

Ash Denham (Edinburgh Eastern) (Scottish National Party): To ask the Scottish Government when the Registrar General will publish his annual report for 2015.

(S5W-1837)

Fiona Hyslop: Scotland’s Population 2015: the Registrar General’s Annual Review of Demographic Trends’ will be published at 9:30am on 10 August 2016. The Report contains information about births, deaths and marriages during the year, together with other demographic information. A copy of the report will be available in the Scottish Parliament Reference Centre, or from the Registrar General’s website at www.nrscotland.gov.uk, from 9:30am on 10 August 2016.

Transport Scotland

Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party): To ask the Scottish Government how much money it has provided to (a) each airport and (b) support air travel in each of the last five years, and what information it has on how this has been used.

(S5W-1387)

Humza Yousaf: a) Table 1 outlines the funding that the Scottish Government has provided to airports in the last five years. Funding for Aberdeen, Edinburgh and Glasgow airports is to support business development. The bulk of funding to Glasgow Prestwick Airport is in the form of loans at a commercial rate of interest to meet the airport’s operational costs following the Scottish Government’s acquisition of the airport on 22 November 2013. We expect all loan funding, including interest, will be repaid. Remaining funding was provided to assist in business development. Funding provided to Highlands and Islands Airports Ltd (HIAL) is to meet its operating costs and to fund its capital investment programme.

| Table 1: Scottish Government funding to airports 2011-12 to 2015-16 |
|------------------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| Airport                | 2011-12 (£)    | 2012-13 (£)     | 2013-14 (£)     | 2014-15 (£)     | 2015-16 (£)     |
| Aberdeen               | 5,000          | 500             |                 |                 |                 |
| Edinburgh              |                | 7,368           |                 |                 |                 |
| Glasgow                | 10,448         | 15,107          | 26,220          |                 |                 |
| Glasgow Prestwick      | 20,481         | 2,925           | 4,500,000       | 6,300,000       | 10,005,500     |
| Highlands and Islands  | 26,714,000     | 22,333,000      | 21,788,074      | 34,093,946      | 38,434,150     |

b) Table 2 outlines the funding that the Scottish Government has provided to support air travel in the last five years. The Scottish Government used the bulk of this funding to operate the Air Discount Scheme and fund the Glasgow to Campbeltown, Tiree and Barra air services. Those areas also account for the majority of the increase in spend over the period. Destination marketing campaigns drive demand for travel to Scotland which in turn supports airlines serving those destinations. Part of that activity involves funding partnership marketing campaigns in which airlines choose to participate. As part of our efforts to improve Scotland’s air connectivity, the Scottish Government also funds research and promotional work to encourage more direct air services to Scotland. Funding of the marketing campaigns and research work is also included within the amounts shown in Table 2.

| Table 2: Scottish Government funding to support air travel 2011-12 to 2015-16 |
|------------------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| Year                   | 2011-12 (£)    | 2012-13 (£)     | 2013-14 (£)     | 2014-15 (£)     | 2015-16 (£)     |
| Funding Provided        | 7,433,000      | 7,978,000       | 9,520,000       | 10,119,000      | 11,177,000     |

Figures in both Tables 1 and 2 include cash funding provided by Transport Scotland, VisitScotland, Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise.
Fulton MacGregor (Coatbridge and Chryston) (Scottish National Party) To ask the Scottish Government what progress has been made on the implementation of a smart card system for public transport similar to the Oyster card.

(S5W-1406)

Humza Yousaf: The Scottish Government remains committed to its vision that all journeys on Scotland’s bus, rail, ferry, subway and tram can be made using a single type of smart ticketing, the saltirecard system. Good progress is being made to deliver this vision, summarised by mode below.

Rail - The entire ScotRail network is now Smart enabled to be part of the saltirecard system. We have made sure that the new franchise contract requires smart tickets to be made available across the network for all types of ticket by 2019. ScotRail is delivering a significant programme to make this possible. For example, saltirecard smart season tickets are available on all routes and by April 2019, ScotRail has committed to achieving a 60% uptake for all ScotRail passenger journeys using Smart ticketing.

Subway - Smart tickets are already in use on the Glasgow Subway, and it will be possible to use the same smartcards on both the Subway and ScotRail.

Ferries - We have already completed successful user trials. The recently awarded Clyde and Hebrides ferry contract requires saltirecard smart tickets to be available for foot passengers.

Bus – More than 1.3 million smart concessionary travel saltirecards have been issued which can be used across bus operators across Scotland. 35% of bus journeys undertaken already use the smart saltirecard through the Scottish Government’s concessionary travel schemes.

Building on this investment, the major Scottish bus operators have agreed to work to deliver the vision of compatible smart ticketing across all modes in Scotland with a programme that dovetails with ScotRail’s plans. These developments will see the launch of interoperable, bus-to-bus, saltirecard smart ticketing across Scotland’s largest cities starting with Aberdeen and Dundee this summer, with Glasgow and Edinburgh to follow. The major Scottish bus operators are also committed to work in collaboration with other modes and support a national e-purse for Scotland which will work on the basis of pay as you go similar to the Oyster Card system. Further developments will include the acceptance of contactless bank cards on bus.

This inter-operator, multi-modal capability is being made possible by the Scottish Government promoting one compatible system across all modes, the "ITSO" system, allowing integration to be delivered in phases as each mode implements its co-ordinated plans. Work to develop this system further is already underway to integrate the ITSO saltirecard system with smartphones and contactless bank cards.

The following questions received holding answers:

S5W-01348
S5W-01349
S5W-01350
S5W-01351
S5W-01352
S5W-01353
S5W-01354
S5W-01355
S5W-01356
S5W-01357
S5W-01402
S5W-01401