Executive Summary:

Scotland can rightly be proud of its longstanding historical and cultural friendship with Malawi which sees 94,000 Scots and 198,000 Malawians working together each year in active and dignified people-to-people partnerships. This is a relationship in which both sides contribute and both sides benefit, with more than 300,000 Scots and 2 million Malawians benefitting each year. Today, more than 46% of Scots know someone actively involved with a link to Malawi.

The Scottish Government is to be applauded for its active involvement, and leadership, in recent years in the bilateral relationship with Malawi: we see this as an outstanding example of government working in synergy with people.

While aspects of Scotland’s International Framework provide valuable insight into some of the reasons for Scotland’s internationalism, it does not do full justice to the Scottish Government’s current activities and impact, or provide clear direction as to how such activities can be further strengthened in coming years.

The Scotland Malawi Partnership believes the 2015 framework could be greatly strengthened by:

1. including explicit references to the relationship with Malawi and the role of civic society;
2. not relying solely, or predominantly, on a narrative of economic benefit for Scotland to justify Scotland’s internationalism; and
3. including a commitment to policy coherence for development, and specifically exploring ways of aligning domestic procurement with Scotland’s commitment with Malawi.

These points are especially pertinent this year, as:

- In September 2015 the global Sustainable Development Goals will succeed the Millennium Development Goals in guiding all international development activities, worldwide, for the next fifteen years. It is now almost certain that this new global framework will include specific reference to developing “a new global partnership”. In this context, Scotland has the potential to be a global leader, championing its model of two-way dignified partnership with Malawi.
- In November 2015 Scotland and Malawi will mark the tenth anniversary of their inter-governmental Cooperation Agreement. This will be a key moment in reflecting on the impact of our shared efforts, celebrating our nations’ 157 of friendship, and committing to future cooperation together.
SECTION ONE: Background and evidence:

1.1 Core supporting evidence:

- Rev Prof Kenneth Ross (Oct 2014) ‘Malawi, Scotland and a Relational Approach to International Development’ – a qualitative analysis exploring what makes the Scotland-Malawi model distinctive and effective.

- Scotland Malawi Partnership (September 2014) ‘Public Awareness Study’ – a quantitative analysis of Scottish awareness of, engagement with, and attitudes towards the civic links with Malawi.

- University of Edinburgh (July 2014) ‘The value of Scotland’s links with Malawi’ – a quantitative analysis of the number of Scots and Malawians engaged in, and benefitting from, these links.

1.2 The Scotland Malawi Partnership:

The Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) is the national civil society network coordinating, representing and supporting the people-to-people links between our two nations. We represent a community of 94,000 Scots with active links to Malawi.

We have more than 700 member organisations and key individuals, including half of Scotland’s local authorities, every Scottish university and most of its colleges, 200 primary and secondary schools, dozens of different churches and faith-based groups, hospitals, businesses, charities and NGOs, and a wide range of grass-root community-based organisations. Our work permeates almost all aspects of Scottish civil society.

We exist to inspire the people and organisations of Scotland to be involved with Malawi in an informed, coordinated and effective way for the benefit of both nations. We do this by providing a forum where ideas, activities and information can be shared on our website, through our online mapping tool and through regular forums, training events and stakeholder meetings.

Our project is to build connections and collaboration, on a multi-sectoral basis, between two small nations in ways that are transformational for both. There is no template for doing this. So far as we know, we are the first to develop this model of partnership.

Like the Network of International Development Organisations in Scotland (NIDOS) and the Scottish Fair Trade Forum, we are core funded by the Scottish Government, as part of the International Development Fund, to coordinate and engage wider civic society. While we work closely with, and are core funded by, the Scottish Government we remain an entirely independent charity, external of government.

Our members’ work is underpinned by the historic bilateral civil society relationship which is based not on ‘donors’ and ‘recipients’ but on long-standing, mutually-beneficial community to community, family to family and people to people links. It is a 157 year old relationship built on mutual trust, understanding and respect.
This is a **new and innovative mode of international development** and we believe it is powerful force for change.

### 1.3 Distinctive features of the Scotland-Malawi relationship:

In his recent paper “Malawi, Scotland and a Relational Approach to International Development”, Rev Prof Kenneth R. Ross identified four distinct characteristics of the links between Scotland and Malawi:

(a) **The Priority of the Relational:**

“Promoting a people-to-people model of development, focusing on active relationships between individuals, communities, families, businesses etc to foster a shared understanding of the development challenges. This is an approach to development which not only addresses material considerations but also answers the cry for human dignity.”

(b) **The Mobilisation of civil society:**

“Ordinary people and local communities are mobilised to offer their time, energy, resources, experience and expertise to Scotland and Malawi’s shared effort. This is not to usurp the role of development professionals but it is to place their work in the context of strong popular ownership and involvement. It represents a vote of confidence in the people and in their capacity for active participation in the close relationship between two nations committed to working together for the common good.”

(c) **Government in synergy with people**

“A creative synergy has been forged between popular activism and Government engagement. The Government-to-Government relationship draws its vitality and finds its effectiveness from the multitude of links made by civil society—schools, universities, health boards, local government, community groups, faith-based organisations, and so on.”

(d) **A reciprocal partnership for development:**

“The Cooperation Agreement between Scotland and Malawi sets out the basis on which the two nations plan to work together: ‘Both countries share a wish to build upon this history by actively engaging through partnership. This is a reciprocal partnership based upon sharing experiences and skills.”

### 1.4 Popular awareness, support and engagement across Scotland:

In November 2010 the University of Edinburgh conducted an independent analysis of the scale and impact of the links represented under the Scotland Malawi Partnership umbrella. In July 2014, to mark Team Malawi’s arrival at the Glasgow Commonwealth Games, the university published updated figures, based on a repeat study, allowing them to observe trends through recent years. This updated study, found that an estimated:

- **94,000+ Scots are actively involved in links** with Malawi (an increase of 10.5% since 2010);
- **198,000+ Malawians are actively involved in links with Scotland** (an increase of 33.7% since 2010);
- **300,000+ Scots benefit from their links** with Malawi (an increase of 7% since 2010);
• 2 million+ Malawians directly benefit from their links with Scotland (an increase of 66.6% since 2010);
• **SMP members contribute more than £40 million** in finance and in-kind inputs to their Malawi links (an increase of 33.3% since 2010).

As a separate exercise, the SMP also commissioned a study to assess Scottish awareness of, engagement with, and attitudes towards these Malawi links, with 516 randomly selected Scots interviewed between June and September 2014. This study found that:

• There is four times greater awareness of Scotland’s links with Malawi than any other African country;
• 46% of Scots personally know someone actively involved in a link with Malawi;
• There is an incredible diversity in the links which exist, with more than 40 different types of engagements between Scotland and Malawi named by participants;
• 74% of Scots are in favour of links with Malawi (55.4% “strongly” in favour), and only 2.4% are against

1.5 The Scottish Government’s experience with Malawi:

The Scottish Government’s Malawi Development Programme, launched by Lord McConnell and enthusiastically continued under the SNP, is extremely small by DFID standards, with just £3 million a year ring-fenced for Malawi. However, by focusing on, building on, and working with, the efforts of wider civil society it has been extremely successful.

According to the University of Edinburgh, the Scottish Government lever more than tenfold what it puts in, unleashing a powerful and enviable multiplier effect. By doing this, as Rev Prof Ross says, it creates a virtuous circle between Government and people where popular support inspires Government efforts while Government support stimulates popular engagement. The result is that resources committed by Government are multiplied many times over by institutions and individuals within civil society.

At the most crude possible level of analysis, the ratio between pounds invested and positive media coverage is extremely impressive. This is not a triumph of some innovative communications department at Victoria Quay but rather an insight into the genuine enthusiasm which exists across Scotland for civic-led links with Malawi. At a far more meaningful level, awareness, reach and impact in Malawi is extremely enviable: entirely disproportionate with the relatively modest original investments made.

Those involved in the Scottish Government’s programme on the ground in Malawi have observed other, very telling, indicators which set this programme aside from others. The Scottish Government is, for example, we believe the only donor in Malawi to strictly forbid the paying of *per diems*. *Per diems* are endemic across Malawi and the region: almost every workshop, conference and training opportunity is absolutely reliant on discrete cash-in-hand payments made to individuals as a sitting allowance. Such payments distort all indicators on impact, buy-in and community engagement; they exacerbate and perpetuate a culture of dependency; undermine sustainability; and allow donors to write the agenda. Perhaps uniquely, not so with almost all Scottish engagements, where Malawians are not ‘recipients’ but partners - leading with the design of projects, investing time and energy in their implementation, and genuinely ‘owning’ the outcomes.
1.6 The Scottish Parliament’s experience with Malawi:

It is not just the people of Scotland and its Government who are invested in such people-to-people links with Malawi; the Scottish Parliament is itself also an active player.

The Scottish Parliament has a formal partnership with the Malawi Parliament through the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and also has an active and well attended Cross Party Group on Malawi. It is often commented in the Scottish media that no issue brings politicians of all stripes together in Scotland like the friendship with Malawi. Malawi’s President Muluzi was the first Head of State to visit the new Scottish Parliament when reconvened after 300 years and, indeed, when reconvening after its most recent summer recess, it was again to its friendship with Malawi that the Parliament turned for its first business.

A quick search through the Parliamentary records shows that the Scottish Parliament’s regular “debates” on Malawi see MSPs of all parties queue up to praise the people-to-people links, each trying to outdo each other with numbers involved in their constituencies. Indeed, such debates are not confined to Holyrood: as this submission is sent, we see active debates celebrating Scotland’s links with Malawi in both the Commons and the Lords, encouraging the development of similar people-to-people bilateral connections across the United Kingdom.

SECTION TWO: Strengths of Scotland’s International Framework

Scotland’s International Framework, first published by the Scottish Government in 2008 and updated in 2012, aims to outline the context and rationale for the Scottish Government’s international activities and is complemented by a series of individual country plans. The SMP agrees with, and welcomes, a number of points made in this framework, including:

2.1 References through the report to Scotland’s “positive international reputation”\textsuperscript{1}:

Listening to our friends in Malawi we can confirm that Scotland is indeed held in strong esteem and has developed a strong international reputation. For Malawi, this reputation comes from a shared cultural history and the warmth of continued affection for Dr David Livingstone as a Scottish cultural ambassador, a champion of dignified partnership, and a leading figure fighting the slave trade in Africa at that time.

There have been a great many studies in recent years, and at least five PhDs and Masters currently underway, looking at the relationship between Scotland and Malawi. To date, all have concluded that Scotland, rightly or wrongly, benefits from a very strong reputation: the culmination of a long shared history and the great many people-to-people links which unite our two countries. It is commonly observed that, in Malawi, references to Scotland by the government, the media and the public speak less of “donors” or “funders” and more of “partners” and “friends”. This anecdotal observation is currently being objectively tested through an ESRC-funded PhD with the University of Glasgow, with compelling data so far collected.

\textsuperscript{1}“Scotland’s International Framework”, October 2012, The Scottish Government, Section 3 and repeated through the framework
2.2 Reference to Scotland’s “distinctive and effective approach to international development”\textsuperscript{2}:

Over the past ten years Scotland has demonstrated, for example through its work with Malawi, new and innovative ways of approaching international development, fundamentally underpinned by the spirit of partnership working. This approach has indeed proven distinctive and effective, both in terms of the additional engagement and support it has garnered across civic society, and its overall impact.

As outlined in section one, for every pound invested by the Scottish Government on development work with Malawi in the past decade, ten pounds have been levered from the people of Scotland. According to the University of Edinburgh, Scotland’s links with Malawi directly benefit an estimated 2 million Malawians annually, and indirectly benefit more than 4 million.

We are not aware of any other north-south bilateral relationship comparable to that which exists between Scotland and Malawi: a relationship defined by mutual respect and understanding, in which both sides contribute and both sides benefit, and in which both governments work in synergy with many thousands of civic, people-to-people links.

2.3 Reference to Scotland having: “to play our part in the global fight against poverty by working in partnership with Scottish civic society”\textsuperscript{3}:

As outlined throughout this submission, while the Scottish Government should rightly be applauded for its innovative and effective work with Malawi, the great strength of the bilateral relationship stems from the myriad civic links, which the formal intergovernmental relationship compliments and works in synergy with.

The Scottish Government has seen remarkable impact and public support over the past decade precisely because it places these civic links at the centre of its work with Malawi, funding Scottish organisations to work in partnership with their counterparts in Malawi, and supporting the Scotland Malawi Partnership itself to coordinate, support and represent the wider civic links.

2.4 Reference to Scotland as a “place of innovation, of creativity”\textsuperscript{4}.

Innovation and creativity remain at the centre of Scotland’s friendship with Malawi. This can be seen in the dozens of Higher Education links between Scotland and Malawi\textsuperscript{5} which see every Scottish university working with Malawi on a number of different partnerships. It can also be seen in the countless links between our two nations which span culture.

\textsuperscript{2} Ibid., Section 6
\textsuperscript{3} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{4} Ibid., Section 3
\textsuperscript{5} See “Scotland-Malawi Further and Higher Education Linking: Forwards. Together” Scotland Malawi Partnership, 2012 (currently in the process of being updated with the inclusion of new FE/HE links developed since 2012);
and the arts, including, for example: the Lake of Stars Music Festival\(^6\), ‘I love Scolawi’\(^7\) and the ‘Football and the Three Cs’ exhibition\(^8\), to name just three.

**SECTION THREE: Recommendations for the 2015 update of Scotland’s International Framework:**

The Scotland Malawi Partnership observes a number of notable omissions and points of concern with regards Scotland’s International Framework. We therefore look to make three recommendations in the development of the 2015 update of the framework by the Scottish Government:

3.1 **Explicit inclusion of Malawi in the Framework:**

At present there is just one passing reference to Malawi in the Framework; as one of the four countries in which Scotland’s Climate Justice Fund operates. Furthermore, while Scotland has a formal inter-governmental Cooperation Agreement with Malawi and permanent joint governmental structures for its implementation, there is no formal Malawi Country Plan linked to the framework, as there is with Canada, China, Europe and the EU, India, Pakistan, South Asia, and the United States of America.

Given it is widely accepted that the unique historical and cultural relationship with Malawi is foundational to the Scottish Government’s involvement in international development, it seems a glaring omission that Malawi is almost entirely overlooked in this framework. Through the past decade, the Scottish Executive, then Government, has stood proudly alongside the people of Scotland talking about the great strength of our unique friendship with Malawi. It is therefore disappointing that this nearly 5,000 word document which aims to outline Scotland’s international relationships makes almost no reference to Malawi. We very much hope this is rectified in 2015 before questions are asked by our friends and partners in Malawi as to the sincerity of Scotland’s commitment to the partnership.

We suggest five reasons why it would strengthen the Framework to include specific reference to Scotland’s links with Malawi:

(i) Scotland’s Malawi Development Programme is the single largest component of its International Development Fund and it is where Scotland has greatest development impact.

(ii) It was Scotland’s historical and cultural links with Malawi that allowed the curious constitutional provision for Scotland’s government to have its own international development activity: an otherwise clearly reserved area. It is therefore foundational to the Scottish Government’s international agenda.

(iii) As outlined in section 1.4 there is unparalleled – and growing – public awareness, support and engagement in Scotland’s links with Malawi, with:

- 94,000+ Scots actively involved in links with Malawi (10.5% increase since 2010);

---

\(^6\) Malawi’s largest and most successful music and culture festival which builds on Scotland-Malawi links (see: www.lakeofstars.org);

\(^7\) Art produced by Scots and Malawians together in 2014, capturing the spirit of friendship and now raising funds for the Malawi floods. See: http://ilovescolwai.blogspot.com/

\(^8\) A 2014 exhibition at Hampden Park of photos by Malawian children celebrating Livingstone’s living legacy and Scotland-Malawi’s shared love of football
• SMP members contributing more than £40 million of inputs to their Malawi links (33.7% increase since 2010);
• 46% of Scots personally knowing someone actively involved in a link with Malawi;
• 74% of Scots in favour of links with Malawi (55.4% “strongly” in favour), and only 2.4% against.

(iv) With input from Scotland, including a great many young Scots with links to Malawi, it is now almost certain that the global Sustainable Development Goals which will succeed the Millennium Development Goals in September 2015 and guide all international development activities, worldwide, for the next fifteen years, will include specific reference to developing “a new global partnership”. The SDG’s will outline that such global partnerships should be built on “a new spirit of solidarity, cooperation, and mutual accountability” and “a common understanding of our shared humanity, underpinning mutual respect and mutual benefit in a shrinking world”. This is precisely the partnership Scotland has with Malawi, a model which will increasingly be emulated worldwide in the years and decades to come, and in which Scotland has the potential to be a world-leader.

(v) In November 2015 Scotland and Malawi will mark the tenth anniversary of their inter-governmental Cooperation Agreement. This will be a key moment in reflecting on the impact of our shared efforts, celebrating our nations’ 157 years of friendship, and committing to future cooperation together.

We therefore recommend that the 2015 update of Scotland’s International Framework includes explicit reference to the long-standing civic links Malawi and the continued commitment of the Scottish Government to its inter-governmental partnership with Malawi. We specifically recommend that the inter-governmental Cooperation Agreement be formally linked to the framework, as are the existing country plans with Canada, China, Europe and the EU, India, Pakistan, South Asia, and the United States of America.

3.2 An appreciation of the non-economic benefits of internationalism:

Throughout the framework it is heavily implied that the overriding reason for Scotland’s international engagements is economic gain, either through increased Scottish exports or increased foreign investment attracted to Scotland.

The fact that the Scotland-Malawi bilateral relationship is defined by partnership rather than charity (with its ‘donors’ on one side and ‘recipients’ on the other) is a great strength to the relationship, not least in terms of impact, sustainability and basic human dignity. This is a partnership in which both sides contribute and both sides benefit. Indeed, the University of Edinburgh estimates that more than 300,000 Scots benefit each year from their links with Malawi.

While Scotland clear benefits from its links with Malawi, and a great many other countries, it would be to sell these links short to assume that such benefits were solely financial in nature. Furthermore, there is a risk that it could jeopardise the strength and vitality of such partnerships if the Scottish Government looked to understand and justify its commitment to such internationalism in, predominantly, terms of economic gain.
We recommend the framework makes specific reference to the spirit of internationalism and partnership, with its myriad mutual benefits including social justice, solidarity and personal and societal development; shifting the predominant narrative away from a solely economic justification.

3.3 An increased commitment to Policy Coherence:

There is now increasing popular and cross-party commitment to the concept of policy coherence for development (PCD): that all government departments and policies should act coherently to comply with, and contribute to, the goal of equitable and sustainable global development.

In recent years the Scottish Government has shown increasing interest in this spirit of PCD, which we applaud. Furthermore, we have seen increasing involvement and coherence across government and its partners in the links with Malawi, for example:

- The recent formal MOU signed between Education Scotland and the Ministry of Education in Malawi;
- The commitment by the Scottish Government to fund Scotland’s six Development Education Centres;
- The involvement of Visit Scotland in supporting tourism links with Malawi;
- The work of Scottish Development International with the Malawi Investment and Trade Centre to develop business, trade and investment with Malawi;
- The continued partnership between the Scottish and Malawian Parliaments, with regular twinning and exchanges of both MSPs/MPs and staff.

We feel that it would be appropriate to include explicit reference to policy coherence in the 2015 update of the framework, setting down specific steps that can be taken in the coming years to embed PCD throughout government.

Here, to avoid duplication, we differ to NIDOS’ submission to the Committee which has a strong focus on PCD and makes specific recommendations. The SMP is a member of NIDOS and strongly supports its recommendations on PCD both as set out in its submission to this inquiry and its excellent 2014 report *Scotland’s Place in Building a Just World*.

We also flag up one specific opportunity for greater PCD that could greatly strengthen Scotland’s partnership with Malawi. This concerns the alignment of domestic procurement with Scotland’s international development priorities.

One of the four strands of the Scotland-Malawi inter-governmental Cooperation Agreement focuses on Sustainable Economic Development. Sadly, Malawi, as small land-locked country, continues to have a significant trade deficit rising from, *inter alia*: low production capacity (especially of export-quality produce), transport challenges, a chronic energy shortage, an over-dependence on tobacco as a cash crop, and fundamental injustices in the structuring of international trade. Climate change, recent floods and question-marks over governance have only exacerbated these challenges in recent years.

Scotland could greatly increase sustainable economic development in Malawi, without spending a penny more of the international development fund, simply by aligning procurement opportunities with international development strategy. For example, Malawi’s

---

9 The full report can be accessed [here](#) and the two page summary [here](#).
Mzuzu Coffee and its Kilobero Rice are both commercially available in Scotland. They are both highly acclaimed products, the sale of which is supporting livelihoods for thousands of the most vulnerable in Malawi. Furthermore, there are excellent examples Scottish Local Authorities committing to, for example, the purchase of Kilobero Rice as part of their educational programme within schools.

**We recommend the Scottish Government includes an explicit commitment to policy coherence for development in the 2015 update of the International Framework, and specifically explores how it can support and encourage procurement systems which are aligned to its Malawi Partnership.**

**Conclusion:**

The Scottish Government is to be applauded for its international activities since the formulation of its first International Framework in 2008. With specific regard to Malawi, the Scottish Government has transformed the lives of hundreds of thousands of the most vulnerable in Malawi, and it has done so by working in active synergy with the people of Scotland.

Scotland today attracts considerable international acclaim for its unique 157 year old friendship with Malawi which is able to achieve impact disproportionate to the relatively modest state investments by unleashing a powerful multiplier force from civic society. It has developed a model of two-way dignified partnership which can be emulated worldwide as the new Sustainable Development Goals come into force later this year. It has advanced our understanding of international development through its overriding focus on dignified Partnership.

While aspects of Scotland’s International Framework provide valuable insight into some of the reasons for Scotland’s internationalism, it does not do full justice to the Scottish Government’s current activities and impact, or provide direction for years to come.

The Scotland Malawi Partnership believes the 2015 Framework could be greatly strengthened by: including explicit references to the relationship with Malawi and the role of civic society; by not relying solely or predominantly on a narrative of economic benefit for Scotland to justify Scotland’s internationalism; and by including a commitment to policy coherence for development, and specifically ways of aligning domestic procurement with Scotland’s international agenda.

January 2015