Education and Culture Committee

Educational attainment gap

SUBMISSIONS ON ROLE OF THE THIRD AND PRIVATE SECTORS

The Education and Culture Committee invited comments on the role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest.

The following submissions were received—

- BEMIS Scotland
- CBI Scotland
- Centre for excellence for looked after children in Scotland
- Church of Scotland
- Creative Scotland
- Down's Syndrome Scotland
- Educational Institute of Scotland
- ENABLE Scotland
- Falkland House School
- Foster Care Associates Scotland
- GL Assessment
- Glasgow City Council
- iNCLUDEM
- John Muir Trust
- Kibble
- LGBT Youth Scotland
- musicALL project, hazelwoodVISION
- National Deaf Children’s Society
- NUS Scotland
- Renfrewshire Scotland
- Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland
- Scottish Chambers of Commerce
- Scottish Council of Independent Schools
- Scottish Film
- Scottish Outdoor Education Centres
- Scottish Youth Parliament
- Scouts Scotland
- The Duke of Edinburgh's Award
- UNISON Scotland
- Universities Scotland
- Voice
- Young Enterprise Scotland
- Youth Link Scotland
- Youth Scotland
**BEMIS Scotland** are the national Ethnic and Cultural Minorities led umbrella body supporting the development of the Ethnic Minorities Voluntary Sector in Scotland and the communities that this sector represents.

Our vision is of a Scotland that is equal, inclusive and responsive: A society where:

- people from the diverse communities are valued, treated with dignity and respect,
- have equal citizenship, opportunities and equality of life,
- and who actively participate in civic society.

---

**Introduction:**

Curriculum for Excellence has the potential to reflect the ingenuity and diverse skill set resplendent in Scotland’s mosaic of communities. Communities can be particularly influential and key partners in enhancing the educational experience of both ethnic minority pupils and the broader school community.

From our experience this is particularly apparent within the EM voluntary sector and increasingly prevalent within a cultural context including but not reserved to important characteristics such as language, music, sport, song and dance.

The preceding Education and Culture Committee review focussed on the ‘Development of Scotland’s Young Work Force’. In order to appropriately meet this challenge and utilise all of the opportunities at our disposal BEMIS support the committees review of the place of the voluntary and private sector and the key skills they can encourage and enhance in this context.

It is important to note that both sectors have particular skill sets and roles in the overarching process of raising attainment and fulfilling the potential of Scotland’s youth. Curriculum for excellence has the ability to adapt and make use of the opportunities available across sectors and in the spirit of this collaborative philosophy this submission will convey the experiences of diverse communities and potential for further collaboration between sectors.
Minority languages in Scotland:

Language is a key cultural characteristic and an important variable in both a cultural and educational setting for celebrating cultural diversity and promoting active citizenship. Language provision as a conduit for raising attainment and fostering a sense of belonging and engagement in Scotland has been identified by members and via work programmes as a crucial dynamic in progressing the educational attainment agenda.

For bilingual speakers and EAL learners a solid foundation in their heritage language, as research all over the world shows, is vital to effective acquisition of the language of the host country.

It supports cognitive development, development of literacy skills, attainment and affects positively the speakers’ self-esteem and emotional development.

Community languages should be supported within the education system with the specific purpose of developing them in all four skills (speaking, listening, reading and writing) as heritage languages and shouldn't be treated just as an interesting addition to the suite of languages offered as L3 within the “1+2 strategy” (cf. also the 486/EEC Directive of 1977*).

✓ Recommendation: The availability of national qualifications, at least for the most numerous community languages in Scotland, would be desirable. The qualifications are available for Urdu but not for Polish or any other of the main community languages.

✓ According to the 2011 Census, 7% of people over 3 years old living in Scotland use language other than English at home. In some local authority areas the numbers are considerably higher – 13% for both City of Edinburgh and Glasgow City, 15% for Aberdeen City, 20% for Shetland Islands and 47% for Eilean Siar.

✓ Scots and Polish (each 1%) and Gaelic (0.5 %) were, on the whole the most common languages other than English reported as being used at home. British Sign Language was used at home by 13,000 people aged 3 and over (0.2 % of the total population aged 3 and over).

✓ The Pupil Census Supplementary Data for 2014 published by the Scottish Government in February 2015 revealed that the children in Scottish publically funded schools speak between them 139 languages, the top five being Polish (11,582), Urdu (5,400), Gaelic (4,610), Punjabi (4,105) and Arabic (2,374).

✓ Scotland is a truly multilingual and multicultural country. This variety is often considered to be a challenge but it is also a fantastic resource and part of Scotland’s common heritage. When trying to lay down the route to the integration for the people of Scotland we should consider both perspectives.
Lack of consistency Education Scotland’s Parent zone encourages families to “speak English at home” while the evidence-based advice that EAL teachers are providing parents with is to speak the parent’s own language at home.

1) The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

1.1 Curriculum for Excellence affords us the opportunity to create, develop and implement unique and equitable responses to the needs of diverse school communities drawing on the expertise of community organisations in the provision of language needs and other cultural characteristics. Taking into consideration that;

✓ Local community organisations are in a position to enable the school to engage more successfully with families who are more likely to suffer from social isolation for cultural, social or economic reasons, such as new migrant, asylum seeker or refugee communities.

1.2 The relationship between the public sector and voluntary sector in the early engagement process should be one of mutual collaboration. On occasions the 3rd sector is better positioned to engage more directly with individuals or communities.

Example:

Wyndford Nursery, Glasgow approached Maryhill Integration Network for support to engage with parents who had English as an Additional language and needed support to learn key phrases. MIN were able to support the group to become a conduit for each other with parents being able to advise and guide each other. From this group the parents have a greater sense of belonging and are able to engage with their children’s school and learning - which in turn has helped their children to be more settled, engage with additional activities and shows them that their parents recognise the value of education.

2) Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

2.1 Some third sector organisations, including language schools and community groups, have experienced difficulties engaging with schools. It was highlighted that organisations needed the support of “higher” organisations such as the local authority or Education Scotland to be able to get into schools.

✓ Recommendation: Schools should be encouraged by local authorities and national education bodies to build sustainable relationships with local community organisations. The need for this can be evidenced via school roll
or ethnicity of demographics. Intermediary bodies such as BEMIS, Housing Associations, Local Area Committees or Community Planning Partnerships can be engaged to identify harder to reach communities or organisations.

2.2 **Where third sector organisations were able to work with the school the partnerships were often very positive**, bringing in additional skills and experience to the school and new opportunities for the children- for example in Scotland’s most ethnically diverse area, Govanhill, community projects such as Govanhill Youth Action, The Irish Heritage Foundation, Friends of Romano Lav and Sistema Scotland provide extra dimensions of educational provision in a variety of culturally sensitive formats for the benefit of the broader school communities.

2.3 Work between Schools and community organisations such as the provision of language, music or broader cultural educational experiences should be encouraged within a context of collaboration looking to sustain programmes legacy and outcomes. There should be a distinction made between organisations providing ‘services’ and ‘long term collaborations’ between schools and communities. In the former teachers and staff can also benefit from gaining a broader understanding of communities as opposed to 3rd sector interventions being interpreted as ‘separate’ from the core curriculum. In this scenario the Curriculum for Excellence can reflect the diversity of the school community and draw on this key asset, communities themselves in any relevant context.

- **Recommendation:** Further collaboration with community schools in terms of language provision would be an appropriate response, in some part, to the national ‘1+2 language’ strategy. Providing opportunity for all pupils to have access to an additional language opportunity¹.

- **Fully utilising then 1+2 approach:** the policy has the potential of becoming a powerful integration tool if the involvement of young people (including refugees and asylum seekers), parents and communities is encouraged and the diverse community/home languages of Scotland are fully recognised and valued. Curriculum for Excellence has the ability to adapt in relevant formats to reflect this progressive policy and fulfil its broader potential.

2.4 At a time of significant budget restrictions as evidenced by Glasgow City Councils decision to cut 7.5 EAL (English as an Additional Language)² the need to make full use of community school language teachers is significantly enhanced. In addition to the need for this engagement **ambiguity surrounds the steps taken to ensure the statutory obligations of the local authority** in the decision to cut EAL teachers in Scotland’s most ethnically diverse city.³

- **Recommendation:** At a time of significant budget restrictions all local authorities should be clear on their strategy for managing the diverse needs of language and educational provision for diverse citizens and their statutory obligations in this context. **EQIA’S are not tick box exercises for pre-**

---

¹ See Annex 2 – Scotland’s Language Forum Review
determined decisions. The provision of an equitable educational experience is a fundamental human right for all of Scotland's diverse citizens and budget decisions should be implemented within this context ensuring the longer term cultural and economic benefits in our social capital.

2.5 The Gathered Together Project\(^4\) has observed that in certain circumstances there has been a lack of natural engagement in the provision of English language classes which take place within the same physical location. For example, ‘Family English Classes’ administered by ‘Community Learning Dept.’ in certain cases have no formal relationship within the schools in which the classes are administered potentially undermining the full potential of the services i.e. lack of communication on vocabulary and lesson content covered in school and covered in evening class.

✓ Recommendation: BEMIS would encourage initially the development of standard guidance for local authorities administering dual services in educational to ensure a joined up approach across this area. In addition this should be developed to encourage broader recognition and engagement with 3rd sector in relevant circumstances. I.e. community schools and cultural organisations with an emphasis on language provision.

3) How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers, as much as formal qualifications;

3.1 The cultural diversity of Scotland’s communities are reflected in vibrant settings across cultural characteristics such as but not reserved to language, music, song, dance, religious and expressions of intangible cultural heritage. Curriculum for excellence provides the opportunity to broaden recognition of pupil’s achievements both within and outwith schools.

✓ Recommendation: There is no uniformed example of extracurricular achievement. For diverse communities there will be diverse examples of success. However, with greater collaboration between cultural (including religious), sporting and community organisations and schools the identification and celebration of such achievements can be enhanced. Curriculum for excellence should champion and encourage the engagement of the broader cultural community in highlighting the achievements of individuals and communities. Some of this good practice already exists in schools, particularly those with a higher ethnic and cultural diversity however a national ‘Multicultural celebratory day’\(^5\) within the schools calendar could provide an opportunity to develop relationships and celebrate the wider school communities achievements and the frameworks – in some circumstances international - in which these successes are recognised.

\(^4\) See Annex 1

✓ **Recommendation:** The intersectionality between local authorities and broader achievement via independently administered frameworks of recognition should **not be downgraded by local authorities as they do not fund them.** There have been varied experiences in the past in which local authorities refuse to carry success stories of individual and community achievements via official and relevant publications as they are not under their financial remit. The broader achievements of pupils identified in the developing relationship between schools and broader community should be championed via relevant mediums.

---

**Annex 1**

**GATHERED TOGETHER** is a pilot project working to support ethnic and cultural minority parents to become more involved in their child’s education and the school community.

**Cruinn Còmhla**

We are a joint venture between BEMIS and SPTC, funded by the Scottish Government through its Third Sector Early Intervention Fund, managed by the Big Fund. We have been working closely with parents, schools and local authorities to identify and build good practice in inclusion and equality. We are working in six local authorities- Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Falkirk, Fife, Glasgow and Stirling & Clackmannanshire.

We are working directly with parents and carers from all ethnic and cultural backgrounds, finding out about their experiences of involvement with their children’s school and education, barriers that they experience to getting more involved and giving them information about their rights as parents and the role of the Parent Council in being a voice for parents.

We also offer training that gives parent councils the chance to think about why parents aren’t getting involved in the school community and provide the opportunity to develop practical solutions to help to overcome any barriers. SPTC are working with us to deliver this training. We want to share your good practice and offer practical advice when it comes to involving parents.
12 March 2015

Clerk to the Education and Culture Committee
Room T3.40
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Dear David and Terry,

CBI Written Response to the inquiry into the Educational attainment gap - Role of the third and private sectors

I am pleased to respond on behalf of the CBI to the Committee’s inquiry on the educational attainment gap and in particular the role of the private sector. This week the CBI published a new report entitled “Delivering Excellence: A new approach for schools in Scotland”, which outlines the CBI’s position on the issue of attainment and the role of business in helping to support the education system. I have attached a copy of the report for information.

Evidence has shown that boosting educational attainment can significantly impact a nation’s economy, allowing it to grow at a faster rate. It has been estimated that raising achievement across all UK schools to the level of the best in Europe could add one full percentage point to growth every year. That would translate into £8 trillion added to GDP over the lifetime of a child born today.¹

Education is also a key tool to ensure that growth is felt by all and no one is left behind. The CBI report, First Steps, analysed the attainment gap between children from differing socio-economic backgrounds that is visible by age 3. Children from the poorest fifth of families have a 45% chance of being read to daily compared to an 80% chance for children from the wealthiest 20%.² The gap that emerges at the beginning of school continues to increase as children move through the education system. It is essential, therefore, that there is a concerted focus of both energy and resources on closing the attainment gap in a child’s early years to prevent an individual’s socio-economic background dictating their future.

The sharp focus on early years in Scotland sets an example to the rest of the UK. The aspiration to increase the number of free childcare hours to 30 for all 3 and 4 year olds by the end of the next Parliament has set the bar high. However, the CBI would like the government to go further and close the gap between free provision of childcare and statutory maternity pay. In England we have recommended the government offer 15 hours of free childcare to all children aged one and two whilst simultaneously extending statutory

¹ First steps: A new approach for our schools, CBI, 2012
² First steps: A new approach for our schools, CBI, 2012
maternity pay from 39 to 52 weeks. Scotland should look at how they could apply this model to ensure all children get the very best start.

From a business perspective, of course firms look to schools to foster young people with the competencies they need to function effectively at work. But they also fully recognise broader individual and social concerns as major reasons to push up standards of educational attainment. Enabling young people to lead fulfilling lives and minimising the risk of educational underachievement contributing to social breakdown both feature among the most important reasons given by employers to raise standards in schools.

There are many ways that businesses already support schools and colleges in Scotland – and it is encouraging that over the last year more employers have established links with education. At present the most common form of engagement between business and schools is in the provision of work experience with 82% of Scottish businesses providing placements for pupils.

First-hand experience of business is one of the best ways to inform and inspire young people about the world of work and help develop the competencies and behaviours needed in the modern workplace. It also enhances individuals’ employment prospects, as research shows that the more contacts young people have with the world of work, the better their employment prospects.

The CBI and our members would be happy to discuss the issues addressed by the inquiry with you in greater detail and look forward to working with you to ensure we continue to develop a Scottish education system that works for every student and enables Scotland to compete in an increasingly global economy.

Yours sincerely,

Lauren Paterson
Senior Policy Executive
CBI Scotland
160 West George Street
Glasgow
G2 2HD
lauren.paterson@cbi.org.uk

---

3 A better off Britain, CBI, 2014
4 It’s who you meet: why employer contacts at school make a difference to them employment prospects of young adults, Education and Employers Taskforce, 2012
Consultation 2: Role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest

Introduction

Established in 2011, CELCIS is the Centre for excellence for looked after children in Scotland. Our remit is to work with service providers (such as schools and colleges) to improve the experiences and outcomes of children and young people who are (or have been) ‘looked after’ by local authorities. For this reason our responses to the questions posed by the Committee are framed in consideration of the particular circumstances of looked after young people and care leavers.

Question 1: What is the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and what is the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities?

Due the relative autonomy of schools, and the range of national and local community groups relevant to education, establishing an accurate estimate of the scale of third and private sector involvement in mainstream schools will be challenging. However, as Education Scotland concluded in its report on the use of ‘external experts’ in schools, published in November 2012, their involvement is definitely widespread.

“In a review of recent inspection evidence, reference is made to external experts and/or partners in almost all secondary school records of findings and in the majority of those from primary schools.”

The Education Scotland report defines ‘external experts’ broadly, to include college and local authority staff, and concentrates on the contribution of external experts in working alongside teachers, in and beyond the school setting. The focus of the Committee’s question is on third and private sector partners, but even

---

1 Education Scotland (November 2012) *The Involvement of External Experts in School Education* (online resource), p.3
2 Ibid, p.4
with this more restricted group the scale of involvement is likely to be considerable. Much of the involvement of third and private sector partners may be linked to the provision of ‘extra-curricular’ and ‘pastoral’ activities, rather than direct ‘subject’ delivery (e.g. maths), but in line with Curriculum for Excellence such activities should not be seen as unrelated to a school’s plan for improving attainment and achievement. In fact for vulnerable and disengaged pupils, whose attainment is often lowest, we believe the provision of alternative educational opportunities (such as sport or the creative arts), combined with high-quality pastoral support within schools, is essential to improving attainment levels.

As a growing body of educational and biological evidence attests, an individual’s capacity for learning (and by association ‘attainment’) is contingent on their emotional wellbeing. For children who are experiencing instability at home, or who have suffered trauma, loss or neglect, activities and opportunities which help them to build relationships and regulate emotions are essential precursors to any meaningful engagement in learning. This demands a whole school approach, with class teachers suitably knowledgeable and skilled to respond to the needs of such children. However, third and private sector organisations can (and do) make a vital contribution, such as through the provision of physical activity options (e.g. Youth Sport Trust and Outward Bound Trust), mentoring (e.g. MCR Pathways), counselling services (e.g. Place2Be) or personal and skills development (e.g. Skills Force and The Princes Trust). Others also play an important role in upskilling the school workforce to meet the needs of vulnerable learners who may present (from the teacher’s point of view) challenging behaviour in the school setting.

A UK government report on third sector innovation identified a range of personalised education and learning services offered by third sector organisations to children and young people, including:

- providing alternative education for young people who have been excluded from or who are disengaged with mainstream education;
- supporting learners to maintain engagement with mainstream education;
- working with schools and colleges to offer out-of-school learning opportunities as part of a learning “package” for learners;
- working in schools on one-off or ongoing personalised learning projects; and
- providing advice and support to schools which are moving to more personalised learning provision.

The third sector was noted as being particularly important when it comes to reaching vulnerable groups and identifying unmet needs that may otherwise

---

remain unnoticed as it has developed expertise in working with the most disengaged and hardest to reach children and young people.

The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in delivering such services (and therefore in improving the attainment and achievement of school pupils) is likely to be a reflection of limited financial resources in schools, and an appreciation by school leaders of the value such organisations can bring in terms of new opportunities, people and perspectives. But in respect of vulnerable pupils, the use of third and private sector organisations may also be driven by a scarcity of necessary skills among school staff (particularly teachers). ‘Attachment aware’ and ‘trauma sensitive’ approaches to teaching and school management are not yet embedded as mainstream practice, so where school leaders have realised such skills are necessary to securing the engagement of vulnerable learners, third or private sector organisations are ‘commissioned’ to provide enhanced pastoral and education support (such as through nurture bases, school-based counselling and teaching assistants).

This leads us onto the second part of the Committee’s question, about the appropriate dividing line between third and private sector providers and education authorities. In respect of looked after children, it is important to note that some third and private sector agencies are education providers in their own right, operating residential and day school services. In its submission to the Committee’s earlier inquiry (2013) into the attainment of looked after children, the Scottish Children’s Services Coalition said that, in its view, there had been ‘inconsistent and inadequate implementation’ of the recommendations of the 2010 Audit Scotland report Getting it Right for Children in Residential Care. We think it is important to know, five years later, whether the Audit Scotland recommendation that ‘councils, in partnership with providers, identify intended outcomes for all children in residential placements, specify these in individual care plans and set out the actions required in a clear SMART action plan against which progress can be monitored’ has been satisfactorily implemented.

In relation to mainstream schools, we think the issue is not so much about ‘dividing lines’ and demarcation (which implies that education authorities contract out services), but rather about how we can encourage more ‘co-production’ between schools, local authorities and third / private sector organisations. In such a model all partners would work together to design, deliver and evaluate a service in response to a particular issue. The ownership and learning from such projects would accrue to all involved (rather than being retained just in the third / private sector provider), and initiatives would be less susceptible to sudden cuts in funding. Moreover, according to research by the University of Edinburgh, an

---

5 Scottish Children’s Services Coalition (2013). Education and Culture Committee Inquiry into the educational attainment of looked after children. [http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/S4_EducationandCultureCommittee/Inquiries/Scottish_Childrens_Services_Coalition.pdf](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/S4_EducationandCultureCommittee/Inquiries/Scottish_Childrens_Services_Coalition.pdf)
important feature of co-production in public services is involvement of users in the design stage.\textsuperscript{6} In this respect third sector agencies have a particular advantage, because of their expertise in engaging with young people and families.

An interesting example of co-production is the ‘Inclusion Plus’ partnership formed between Dundee City Council, Includem, Apex Scotland and Skillforce, aimed at young people in secondary schools who are at risk of exclusion.\textsuperscript{7} The interim findings of this study by the Robert Owen Centre at the University of Glasgow reported a 36\% fall in exclusions; a final report is due in summer 2015. In the area of further and higher education the Scottish Funding Council has played a critical role in facilitating the involvement of third sector organisations, enabling Buttle UK to work alongside colleges and universities, and the Who Cares? Trust in the development of resources designed to help care leavers access further and higher education.

Question 2: Have their approaches been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils? If so, could their methods be more embedded in the curriculum?

In its recent (2014) report on school education, Audit Scotland notes that a range of factors are important for improving attainment.\textsuperscript{8} The report identifies factors within the control of schools and local authorities (teacher quality, leadership and systems for tracking pupil data), and also factors where schools could collaborate with partners: increasing parental involvement, and developing pupil motivation and engagement. The third sector has particular strengths which can be harnessed in seeking to improve these latter factors. We are aware, for instance, of positive evaluations of the Place2Be model of pupil support, an approach which could be more embedded in the curriculum and mainstream school practice.\textsuperscript{9}

Schools often find it difficult to engage with parents who do not respond to traditional methods of reporting and monitoring pupils’ progress (e.g. at parents’ evenings). Given the importance of the home in consolidating learning, schools could exploit the trust with which third sector agencies are regarded, particularly in approaches which help parents and carers to support learning at home. For instance evaluations of ‘paired reading’ schemes involving carers have been shown

\textsuperscript{6} Osborne, S., and Strokosch, K. (2013) It takes two to tango? Understanding the co-production of public services by integrating the services management and public administration perspectives. \textit{British Journal of Management}, 24. \url{http://www.research.ed.ac.uk/portal/files/12492845/OSBORNE_It_takes_two_to_tango_Understanding_the_co_production_of_public_services_by_integrating_the_services_management_and_public_administration_perspectives.pdf}

\textsuperscript{7} \url{http://www.includem.org/content/inclusionplus/}

\textsuperscript{8} Audit Scotland (2014) \textit{School Education}. Accounts Commission. \url{http://wwwaudit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/local/2014/nr_140619_school_education.pdf}

to be effective in improving literacy rates and engagement in education. These are methods which could be more widely integrated into mainstream practice, with the support of third sector organisations.

Motivating pupils who have already disengaged poses particular challenges for schools and education authorities. The third sector has two particular strengths in helping to respond to this: specialist knowledge of the circumstances of children and families dealing with a diversity of difficult circumstances, and the capacity to tailor responses which suit individual children and their families. For instance Who Cares? Scotland has direct knowledge of the barriers looked after children face in education (both at a population and individual level), but also some of the solutions, having worked with many schools and colleges over the years. Other examples of relevant work include the Barnardo’s 16+ At Home Project in Edinburgh, and Includem’s Intensive Support Service for Vulnerable Young People.

Finally, an example of long-term collaboration between a local authority and a third sector agency, which attempts to realise aspects of the curriculum for certain sub-groups of learners, is the residential outdoor learning programme provided by Outward Bound Loch Eil and North Lanarkshire Council. Research by the University of Edinburgh examined the role of residential outdoor learning in raising pupils’ achievement in the context of Curriculum for Excellence. The findings reported are equivocal in establishing conclusively whether pupils who participated in a residential experience improved in ‘life effectiveness skills (e.g. achievement motivation) compared to control groups, but the qualitative findings in this study were more encouraging.

Our observation is that the most important aspect of this partnership is the willingness of the partners to develop a model which meets the needs of certain children, accepting that traditional school-based approaches to learning are not always appropriate. Robust evaluations of such initiatives should be undertaken and made available, including those of small-scale school-based activities. The work of the Scottish Government’s Raising Attainment for All (RAFA) team, supporting schools to develop ‘tests of change’, is relevant in this respect.

**Question 3: Is the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement being realised?**

Unfortunately the answer is probably ‘no’. Through our work across Scotland we have observed that the potential of the third and private sectors is not always

---


realised by national and local government, and positive examples tend to be associated with schools where individuals (or groups of key staff) have developed good relationships with the third and private sectors.

The failure to realise the full potential of the third and private sectors is linked to a number of issues. First among these is the way in which initiatives are funded. Short-term (1 or 2 year) funding arrangements, tied to broad objectives, put the sustainability of initiatives at risk. The ‘Reading Rich’ programme, involving the Scottish Book Trust and NCH Scotland, is a good example of this. The evaluation published by Scottish Government highlighted many positive features of the programme, but the programme was not sustained beyond the initial grant funding (although a number of local authorities have established similar programmes of their own). A better approach to maximising the potential of the third and private sectors in education would be to ‘commission’ services (rather than ‘procure’ or ‘grant fund’). Schools, having a clear understanding of what their school population needs, are often best placed to do this, and are in position to work alongside the external partners to develop and deliver a service over the long term.

A second reason why the potential of the third and private sectors is not realised relates to the attitudes of school staff. Where there is a suspicion about the role of third sector providers (interpreting their involvement as either unnecessary or a challenge to their day-to-day practice), or where support for ‘inclusive education’ is not widespread, the result can be a school environment uninterested (or even hostile) to certain forms of external involvement. Many looked after children require significant additional support if they are to engage with and succeed in school. Often managing considerable internal distress, some looked after children can present challenging and disruptive behaviour (particularly if teachers do not have an understanding of the impact of trauma, or use strategies for responding to its manifestations). The result can be, as we have recorded in our work with schools, staff attitudes that some young people are ‘unteachable’, only able to manage a limited ‘flexible’ timetable (sometimes just a few hours a week) or full-time support in a residential school. While it is certainly the case that some children (including some looked after children) require the intensive, specialist support provided away from mainstream schools by third sector or private providers, we believe that mainstream schools could do much more to learn from (and integrate into practice) the attitudes, techniques and approaches utilised by external partners. In doing so, many of our most vulnerable learners (most of whom remain full-time in mainstream schools) would benefit from what the third and private sector have to offer.

---


Question 4: How successful have schools been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver? Are such achievements valued by parents, employers and learning providers’ as much as formal qualifications?

In view of the fact that Scotland’s political discourse continues to privilege ‘attainment’ (and exam results especially), it is very challenging for schools (or local authorities) to report on the wider achievements of pupils. As the UK Parliament’s Children, Schools and Families Select Committee noted in 2009:

> ‘the data currently available is heavily weighted towards academic attainment, and while data which places pupil and student attainment and progress into context [...] is published by the Government, it is typically not reported by the press, or given much lower prominence than “raw” attainment scores.’

The predominance of ‘attainment’ over ‘achievement’ may be a reflection of wider parental and societal attitudes. For instance reports from the Association of Accounting Technicians (2013) and others suggest that parents do not understand or value apprenticeships, favouring paths which lead from school directly to University. In this context, efforts by schools to publicise their work around ‘wider achievement’ (often delivered in partnership with third and private sector organisations) may be met with limited enthusiasm by the public. Indeed for some sceptical parents a school’s focus on ‘achievement’ may seem like an effort to distract from poor performance in respect to ‘attainment’. Our contacts who work with young people, carers, teachers and families, report that it is not uncommon to hear the view that ‘achievement’ is related to a lower tier of education, reserved for children unlikely to obtain academic qualifications.

On a related point, Audit Scotland has highlighted the lack of information on overall pupil performance at both a local and national level. Current measures focus on attainment of secondary pupils at S4-S6 level, and there are no comparable measures of wider achievement (or the performance of pupils in P1-S3) available either at local authority (with some exceptions) or national level. As such, existing measures do not fully capture a pupil’s performance throughout their time at school, and this weights the national debate towards school-assessment based attainment scores. The achievements of pupils who take vocational courses at local colleges, for instance, are not typically captured by existing attainment measures, an omission which could be addressed if the Wood

---


15 AAT (2013) Two thirds of parents don’t understand apprenticeships [website accessed on 11 March 2015]

commission’s recommendation on developing school-College partnerships is accepted.

Audit Scotland also found that there are increasing opportunities for pupils to participate in activities that aim to improve ‘soft skills’ and employability skills such as confidence, and to help them develop the skills required as they leave school and move into employment, training or post-school education. We agree with Audit Scotland that schools and local authorities should ensure that they can scrutinise the outcomes of these activities to ensure that they meet the needs of pupils.

An example of an approach to assessing wider achievements gained through life experiences (often referred to as ‘recognition of prior learning’) is the My Skills My Future toolkit developed by the Scottish Credit and Qualifications Framework (SCQF) partnership. The toolkit, linked to SCQF level descriptors and Curriculum for Excellence ‘experiences and outcomes,’ represents a way to recognise the wider achievements of learners who are at risk of leaving school with no or few qualifications. CELCIS piloted the toolkit with looked after young people in West Lothian and East Renfrewshire. More recently, the approach has been utilised with looked after young people in Stirling/Clackmannanshire, and with vulnerable learners in East Renfrewshire. Findings suggest that the approach can lead to increase in resilience and engagement, and better recognition of skills and awareness of career choices.

**Question 5: Given the strong policy focus on the early years, have the third and private sectors been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages?**

We agree that a concerted focus on the early years is vital to raising the attainment of all school pupils. The third and private sectors play a very significant role at these stages, as providers of nurseries and other pre-school opportunities, and government (at all levels) must work collaboratively with these sectors to ensure quality is high across the country, and the needs of disadvantaged children adequately met.

In respect of school age children, transitions are particularly sensitive times, particularly for looked after children. Like the early years, it is important to focus efforts (including work with the third and private sectors) at these life stages too. For example, on average, fewer looked after children move on to post-school education than their peers in the general population. Compounding this issue is the fact that some widening access programmes only target students from low-income

---

households who have a high likelihood of attaining the required grades to go to college or university. 18 Similarly, the transition between primary and secondary school can be the start of a process of disengagement from education (which leads, for some, to becoming ‘looked after’). However support for vulnerable children at this transition is limited, and although some schools collaborate effectively to reduce risk, the statistics (on attendance and exclusions at early secondary stages) suggest that the needs of many children go unnoticed until it is too late. Enhanced involvement of the third and private sectors, offering ‘follow-through’ mentoring or therapeutic support, may reduce the anxiety and difficulty of such transitions, and have a positive impact on pupils’ engagement and educational achievement.

Thank you for this opportunity to contribute to this important inquiry. We would welcome any further discussions with Committee.

CELCIS Contact:
Dr Graham Connelly
Lead for Improving Educational Outcomes
g.connelly@strath.ac.uk
0141 444 8500

13 March 2015

Dear Terry,

Educational attainment gap – role of the third and private sectors: Response from Children in Scotland

Children in Scotland welcomes the opportunity to offer our comments to the Committee’s call for evidence. We are the umbrella body for the children’s sector, including education, health, social care, early years and childcare. We have over 430 members and our staff are delivering a wide range of projects and programmes in schools and other settings, with an array of public, private and third sector partners.

In Scotland today, too many children from deprived households and communities finish their formal education with significantly lower levels of attainment than their peers from more affluent areas. Similarly, if they are living in less well-off households and where families are headed up by either one or both parents who have few, if any, formal qualifications. Our universal, comprehensive education is one of the great strengths of Scottish society. Nevertheless, young people in school communities based in our most disadvantaged areas will tend to emerge from their school with fewer qualifications and youth awards than their more affluent peers. Equally disturbing, there is an attainment gap between the more and less affluent children and young people within the majority of all our schools – regardless of their geographical location.

In this context, we strongly support the current political priority to raise school attainment and work towards eliminating the attainment gap. Of course, this is not something that can be addressed in isolation of the wider social justice agenda and schools cannot be regarded as the sole solution. For example, we would highlight the high priority being given to improving outcomes and support in the early years and the important role played by third and private sector providers in minimising the attainment gap before children enter school, via community-based and pre-school services. Long-term, sustainable anti-poverty and health improvement strategies must also be implemented and sustained to improve every aspect of the lives of children and young people unfairly impacted by poverty, including as a consequence of welfare reforms.

Nevertheless, the shocking gap in attainment between richer and poorer children requires a far more ruthless focus on the specific requirements within learning settings of a strategic approach to improving educational attainment. An approach which is child-centred; builds on the strong principles and ethos of curriculum for excellence and which is directly rooted in evidence of how children learn and can apply their learning to secure improved achievement and attainment.

There is no doubt that there is excellent work underway within schools among a range of partners, including the third and private sectors to build the capacity of
children, young people, parents and the wider community. Much of this work focuses on a wider set of goals, which aim to tackle the causes of inequality and mitigate the impact of poverty. This is important work and it should continue. Nevertheless, if the third and private sectors are to make a significant contribution to eliminating the attainment gap, they must ensure their projects are designed for this purpose. Local authorities and learning settings must also commit to integrating fully their work into the wider school community (from early years through to the senior phase). Working in partnership and alongside staff in learning settings, the third and private sectors contribution to the continuum of learning, health and wellbeing and skills development for each individual child from 3-18 years should be welcomed and the effectiveness of their work assessed and evaluated in the same context as all those working in learning settings.

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation provides the most recent succinct and authoritative evidence base for the approaches which are effective in improving educational attainment (http://www.jrf.org.uk/publications/closing-attainment-gap-scottish-education ) We have used its framework to propose the following plan for securing a more effective contribution for the third and private sectors.

Our plan is based on 5 improvement proposals:

1. Curriculum for Excellence is updated to underline that it is Scotland’s approach to learning for all – from birth throughout adulthood. If we are to have an unrelenting focus on improving educational attainment we need to recognise formally within cfe that learning begins from birth and that the pre-formal learning experiences of a child before 3, together with the love, care and support provided by their parents, carers and professionals, provide the crucial pre-conditions for future effective learning.

   Formally extending cfe to start from birth rather than 3 years old, will also underline the value placed on the critical early years. It will recognise the role of families, professionals, particularly from health, and the third and private sectors which are the principal service providers for children and their families in the early years.

2. We welcome the proposal within the Scottish Attainment Challenge to develop a bespoke improvement plan tackling attainment inequality for a school or cluster of schools. However, we believe this needs to be set within a wider attainment strategy of a local authority and community planning area and, in particular, in the context of the school community based around primary schools and their partner secondary schools, special schools and early years settings. Making sure that the learning development of each child is planned from the early years through to transition in secondary, where improvement is sustained, will be critical to long-term achievement of goals.

   It is also essential if the contribution of the third and private sectors is to be harnessed and prioritised on greatest need and where it can work in effective partnership with the school and other learning staff. Equally, we must ensure that the work of schools, supported by the Scottish Government is also embedded within the local authority/community planning partnership area. This is critical if we are to maximise the resources available for tackling inequality and its causes and sustain improvement once SG funding comes to an end.
3. Equally, only an area-wide strategy can ensure that our most vulnerable children – those with additional support needs, including looked after at home and those who may need to move in and out of mainstream school or require specialist support – receive the resources they require, including support from the third sector or specialists such as educational psychologists.

4. We welcome the progress made by the literacy and numeracy hubs, which appear to have been effective in implementing evidence-based approaches within the classroom and the emphasis on parental engagement, often with the support of third sector partners. An area which we believe requires further attention and action is that effective engagement with families in the early years must address the literacy and numeracy needs of many parents. If parents are not sufficiently literate and numerate and if they cannot apply these skills with their children, such as in board games or talking about stories the children are reading for homework, then they cannot support effectively their children. It is a sensitive area but both schools and the third sector have experience which can be used. JRF’s analysis of the evidence suggests this is critical, given the importance of family engagement in a child’s attainment.

With this additional emphasis and unless there is evidence to suggest otherwise, we believe these hubs should be rolled out across the country and become the established improvement approach to improving literacy and numeracy. We are concerned with any diversion and potential time lost in children’s lives in effectively reinventing wheels. We hope the Attainment Scotland Fund will build on this existing good practice within literacy and numeracy.

5. We welcome the announcement that the Attainment Scotland Fund will also enable schools to develop out of school activities. This is a critical feature of the development of our children’s skills and our primary schools are seedbeds for the development of the critical skills of confidence, resilience, leadership and team work required for life and work in adulthood. Skills development is underpinned by the welcome and innovative approach we have in Scotland in our commitment to health and wellbeing. Out of school activities are critical but only if they are built on and complementary to, experiences in school and built on throughout their journey through primary and secondary. Too many out of school activities provide great experiences for children, such as a week’s outward bound course but if these are isolated and fail to build on a child or young person’s leadership skills development, then they are a wasted opportunity.

An example is where Children in Scotland provided funding from STV Hunter to Irvine Royal Academy to enable 22 S3 young people to go to Arran for 5 days on a leadership development course. The school, CiS and STV Hunter were clear that we would not fund a one-off experience for the young people. A condition of funding was that the school had to demonstrate its commitment to building and sustaining these young people’s skills. The young people committed to the need to follow-up on their week’s course and, to date and six months on from their course, they have completed a number of commitments to the school. This has included visiting their partner primary schools’ P7 parents’ nights to promote the school. In one school, they succeeded in 13/17 of the catchment children signing up to Irvine. Parent from this primary school had not sent children to Irvine for several years.
The development and embedding of skills is essential for a child’s future success in secondary school and, we would argue, is essential if the objectives in Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce, are to be achieved. Enabling the third and private sectors, including funders, to understand and contribute fully to the area’s attainment strategy, including the development of skills as part of a child’s wider health and wellbeing needs, will enable them to be even more effective as a partner in the work of the schools.

We hope this provides helpful thinking for the Committee’s future recommendations to the Scottish Government.

Annex A provides more detail on the wider approaches we believe are required on tackling inequality and examples of Children in Scotland’s work in this area.
ANNEX A

Children in Scotland welcomes the recent announcement of the new Scottish Attainment Challenge. The Attainment Scotland Fund of £100 million spread over four years will initially be targeted towards those schools in local authority areas where there is a large concentration of households in deprived areas. We hope that those on the frontline of education will also welcome this announcement, as the focus of some of the funding will be towards additional teachers to support schools and building or developing existing collaborative approaches with parents and community partners.

We are, however, very concerned by the regular reports of cuts to education funding by some local authorities and the on-going issue of certain local authority areas across Scotland finding it increasingly difficult to recruit and retain high quality teachers with consequent impact on children and young peoples’ education. We would urge politicians from all parties at national and local level to protect, and if possible, increase investment in our children and young people.

There is certainly scope to improve current arrangements to prepare children and young people for work. Whilst the third and private sectors already have a role in this however, we also believe there must be a balance between helping children and young people to think about the skills and attitudes needed to participate in the world of work and for them to enjoy their childhood and develop skills and knowledge in a wide range of areas. For example, the Scottish Government’s seven-year plan for youth employment refers to providing children at nursery and primary levels with a clear picture of employment choices that could be open to them and to start equipping them with the right skills needed for work. We question if it is appropriate and realistic to engage such young children in these complex issues.

Instead, we believe that the focus for young children should remain delivering the Curriculum for Excellence, which is designed to provide a wide range of personal experiences and development. We would hope too that full implementation of Getting it Right for Every Child (GIRFEC) will help children and young people to achieve their potential by supporting them in any wider issues that may be affecting their lives.

We also welcome the Scottish Government’s commitment to provide 30,000 new Modern Apprenticeships (MA) from 2020. While the intentions are laudable, we would highlight the current minimum wage for Modern Apprenticeships, which stands at £2.73 for a young person under 19 in their first year of apprenticeship. This very low level of pay, around a third of the living wage, £7.65, will be almost impossible for many young people but particularly those who have to relocate for the opportunity of a MA, who cannot depend on parents or carers for support and may have to live independently.

We recognise the positive impact that MAs can provide for young people while they are earning and learning. However, a cultural shift is indeed required in our attitude towards achievement and success, ie going beyond those who succeed academically and those who opt for other pathways, such as a vocational education. Pupils who choose this vocational pathway should be encouraged and celebrated for their achievements at the same standard we regard those attending university or further education. The third sector is already playing an important part in this area, however greater focus, earlier, on transitions for all pupils, especially looked after young people and those with complex additional support needs are areas the third sector has demonstrated successes and further improved outcomes could be
achieved with a strategic collaborative approach at both national and local community levels.

However, what we do lack in Scotland is sufficient, good quality work placements and work experience to offer young people a positive flavour of work environments. We know that this has been recognised but we remain concerned at the lack of progress for young people with additional support needs; those with disabilities; young carers; young people in or leaving the care system; and those from minority ethnic backgrounds. At local levels support with the process, protocols and regulation that can often make these placements more complicated, would also be beneficial.

Children in Scotland are delivering a nationwide LifeSkills programme, which has been developed by Barclays. LifeSkills is an education programme designed to give young people in the UK access to the skills they need to make the transition into work. As the Scottish charity provider for Barclays, Children in Scotland are delivering the programme to schools with a high Free School Meal (FSM) entitlement across secondary schools in Scotland.

The programme offers the key skills that many young people appear to lack for the world of work, such as people skills, work skills and money skills. It is not dissimilar to wider programmes provided by Skills Development Scotland. It is both alarming and depressing for us to see the lack of confidence and aspirations that so many children and young people have, despite the best efforts of teaching staff. At the same time, many of the young people we meet highlight the lack of opportunity in both deprived urban areas and more rural areas to access even basic or temporary employment. This supports our view that there has to be a cultural shift in the roles of public and private sector to offer genuine opportunities. Other third and private sector organisations provide other programmes focussed on successful transition into the work environment and a more cohesive, strategic approach across these programmes could strengthen outcomes at both national and local levels.

Finally, while we welcome the focus on raising attainment for our children and young people, it is vital that the role of parents and carers is also taken into account in supporting their children to become confident, aspirational and ambitious. While successful delivery of the National Parenting Strategy will go some way to achieving this, we believe that a powerful focus on supporting parents and carers in our most deprived communities is necessary if we are to break inter-generational cycles of unemployment and lack of hope and aspirations, coupled with the deeply harmful effects of poverty. The innovative and flexible approach of the third sector is well placed to support and facilitate the creative community driven approaches this requires. This is a broader task than improving educational outcomes for our children but one where the links with Scotland’s Economic Strategy and the range of social justice approaches must be made and reinforced.

Jackie Brock,
Chief Executive,
Children in Scotland
Children in Scotland is Scotland’s national agency for organisations and professionals working with and for children, young people and their families. It exists to identify and promote the interests of children and their families and to ensure that policies and services and other provisions are of the highest possible quality and are able to meet the needs of a diverse society. Children in Scotland represents over 470 members, including 90% of Scottish Local Authorities, all major voluntary, statutory and private children’s agencies, professional organisations, as well as many other smaller community groups and children’s services. It is linked with similar agencies in other parts of the UK and the European Union.

The work of Children in Scotland encompasses extensive information, policy, research and practice development programmes. The agency works closely with MSPs, the Scottish Government, local authorities and practitioners. It services a number of groups such as: the Cross Party Parliamentary Group on Children and Young People (with YouthLink Scotland) and the National Voluntary Children’s Forum. Children in Scotland also hosts Enquire - the national advice service for additional support for learning, and Resolve:ASL, Scotland’s largest independent education mediation service.
Official Response

SUBJECT: Educational attainment gap – Role of the third and private sectors
REQUESTED BY: Education and Culture Committee – Scottish Parliament
REFERENCE: OR-2015/03
DATE: Friday 13 March 2015
SUBMITTED BY: David Bradwell, Associate Secretary dbradwell@cofscotland.org.uk

This response has been prepared by the Church of Scotland’s Education Committee. The Committee would like to thank the Parliamentary Education and Culture Committee for undertaking this investigation and to encourage them in their work. We are grateful for the opportunity to share our views on this issue. Representatives of the Church’s Education Committee would be happy to give evidence or speak informally to MSPs or the Committee clerks if further information would be useful. The points made in this response reflect our wishes for best practice; it does not necessarily apply to every parish in Scotland. We begin with some introductory remarks, and the issues raised by the Education and Culture Committee are dealt with below.

Introduction

The aspiration of an excellent education for all is the goal which we must all keep in focus. Closing the attainment gap will undoubtedly unlock a great deal of potential. Some of the pressing questions of the day are relating to societal values and personal values and self-worth of young people and teachers. When we come to measuring ‘achievement’ and ‘attainment’, what is it that we really mean by these words, and are the tools we use to measure the outputs of the education system sufficient? The cross-party consensus that education is part of enabling young people to be the best kind of people they can be (responsible citizens, effective contributors, confident individuals, successful learners); how do we measure this? Who benefits from trying to measure it? And how do we prevent the easy return to the old way of thinking of looking at exam results and judging the quality of a school or the brilliance of a pupil?

Education Scotland’s slogan is now ‘transforming lives through learning’. How does this fit with a focus on raising attainment? At the heart of this is a question about what the purpose of education is all about. It is simpler to measure exam successes than a life which has been inspired and a soul which has a vision. This is a debate which we need wider input, and we hope that the Church would be able to offer a useful contribution.

Equality of access to opportunity in the context of achievement perhaps needs to be recognised as something distinct from attainment. With greater scrutiny of the attainment gap how do we ensure that achievement is equally recognised. There are concerns that achievement is often pursued in local communities as part of the extended curriculum, putting those who find access hard at a disadvantage; this could be through lack of funds, transport (perhaps an issue felt more acutely in rural areas), confidence of individuals, or support of the school and / or wider community. This is an area in which the Church could help by, for example, coordinating community based opportunities.
Education and Culture Committee: The scale of the third and private sector’s involvement in schools in terms of improving attainment and achievement and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities.

The Church of Scotland has been concerned with education since its foundation in the 16th century. The Church of Scotland still has a Gospel imperative to enable the voiceless to be heard. Its role in the 21st century is carried out principally by its Education Committee, by its representatives on local authorities and by its chaplains in schools and further education colleges.

In recent years, all reports of the Education Committee to the General Assembly have referred to the attainment/achievement gap and/or encouragement to congregations to support their local schools.\(^1\) Suggestions for how this can be done have been disseminated through conferences, throughout Scotland, for chaplains, teachers and faith representatives on local authorities as well as through publications and presentations to presbyteries. The Church of Scotland has also supported the development of ‘Serve Your Local School’ as a route for individuals and local congregations to be encouraged and supported in constructive and helpful engagement with their schools. In our recent engagement with politicians, both Ministers and opposition party spokespersons, we have been interested to find out ‘how the Church can help’ in partnership and delivery of positive outcomes for education. Serve Your Local School is, we believe, an excellent starting place for local congregations.

The Education and Culture Committee should may also be interested to reflect on the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report *Closing the attainment gap in Scottish education* (May 2014).\(^2\) There are good examples of church projects which contribute to the cross-sector approach to raise attainment. It has not been possible to gather a list of specific examples in the time provided for this inquiry, but if the Education and Culture Committee is interested in finding out more or visiting a project then the Church of Scotland would be happy to ingather more data or help with practical arrangements.

Our role may be summarised then as one of awareness-raising of the issues from the evidence based reports of the Education Committee and encouragement to provide support to practitioners at all levels of education at a local level. In addition, these are the issues raised by members of the Education Committee in their meetings with the education spokespersons of the political parties in the Scottish Parliament and with representatives of COSLA, Education Scotland, and others.

---


The role of chaplains has been one of support for staff at a time when morale is low, and effective intervention and development is dependent on the well-being of practitioners. The same applies to the support of families under stress, and school communities following a major incident.  

The role of Church of Scotland representatives is to keep priorities such as achievement for all at the forefront of their participation in local authority committees. At all times they work in partnership with local authorities.

_Education and Culture Committee: Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum._

We do not have the capacity at the level of the national Committee to collect or collate data when so much of the support work is done at a local level. We would encourage the Parliamentary Committee to consult with local Headteachers, chaplains and local authorities about the situation in particular areas and how good practice can be shared. We recognise the importance of mutual trust between a school and a church for there to be meaningful impact, and so stress the importance of open and positive relationships.

Two areas where the Church of Scotland Education Committee strives to improve achievement is through our two prize competitions. The Stevenson Prize promotes excellence in Religious Observance / Time for Reflection, and the Moderator’s Medal celebrates issues related to Religious and Moral Education and global citizenship. More information is available from the Church’s Education Committee – one suggestion we would make is for greater support in sharing news of the prizes and how schools and young people can take part.

_Education and Culture Committee: Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages._

The Church of Scotland supports the focus on early years and some local churches engage in projects to encourage the play and learning of pre-school children and to support their parents/carers to create the kind of home environment that helps children thrive. Often these projects concentrate on provision for children from poor backgrounds, or children who are part of families that need support with budgeting, health matters and home management. Many local churches provide accommodation and facilities for pre-school groups such as Mothers & Toddlers. At the other end of the age range chaplains work in Further Education Colleges. However, important though the period is from pre natal to the end of early years there is evidence collected in Scotland that the achievement/attainment gap between those from poorer families and others continues to widen throughout both primary and secondary years of schooling. It is important therefore that any initiative looks at the whole age range and that support is continuous and not part of a one off short-term project. Those who wish to plan and improve provision need to build up evidence of what works in general and what works in specific contexts and allocate resources appropriately, trusting partners that are building up experience, evaluating what is effective and what is not.

---

3 See, for example, the involvement of David McNeish, a probationer minister who served as Chaplain to Liberton High School following the death of a pupil. [http://edinburgh.stv.tv/articles/302111-keane-wallis-bennett-charity-single-in-itunes-top-100-chart/](http://edinburgh.stv.tv/articles/302111-keane-wallis-bennett-charity-single-in-itunes-top-100-chart/)
Response to Education and Culture Committee call for evidence

*Education Attainment Gap: Session 2 - Role of the third and private sector*

Submission date: 13 March 2015
Response to Scottish Parliament’s Education and Culture Committee work on attainment in Schools

As the public body that supports the arts, screen and creative industries, Creative Scotland is committed to increasing the quantity and quality of opportunities for everyone to extend their understanding of themselves through engagement with the arts, screen and creative industries. Creative Scotland believes this has huge benefits for individuals and society in terms of skills development and employability. Cultural participation and creative learning opportunities make significant contributions to our individual happiness and wellbeing.¹

Scotland’s Curriculum for Education centres on four capacities - to enable each child or young person to be a successful learner, a confident individual, a responsible citizen and an effective contributor.

Expressive arts is one of eight defined curriculum areas and creativity is highlighted as an important theme running throughout the whole curriculum.

There is much work to do to capacity build and strengthen Scotland’s education workforce to be confident to deliver against these goals at optimum level.

In partnership with Education Scotland, Creative Scotland leads on the development of the Creative Learning Plan (CLP)², a collaboration between Creative Scotland, Education Scotland, Skills Development Scotland, College Development Network, Association of Directors of Education, General Teaching Council Scotland, Association of Directors of Education and is endorsed by the Cabinet Secretaries for Education and Lifelong Learning and Culture, Europe and External Affairs. These organisations have agreed a common vision that states: ‘…Creative learning and teaching is the most fulfilling route to both deep learning and a rounded adulthood…’

As part of this work it is important to understand the skills required to deliver effectively across the creative curriculum. There is at present a shortage of teachers across Scotland able to deliver confidently across the curriculum for excellence. Careful thought should be given to how to address this through partnership working between the arts sector and education to strengthen our ability to realise our potential as a creative nation.

Third sector arts organisations can complement formal education provision and inspire young people to achieve in education through unique opportunities to create, engage and contribute, to challenge established ways of thinking, to gain in confidence and develop an enterprising mindset.³

Examples of recent arts projects in Scotland addressing raising attainment and achievement:
- Sistema Scotland, Big Noise Project, currently working in Raploch and Govanhill⁴
- Aspire project in Dundee, working in 9 schools in the most deprived areas⁵
- musicALL, Hazelwood School, Glasgow⁶

In addition Creative Scotland disseminates funding to arts and creative organisations and individuals to create more opportunities for young people to raise their achievement and attainment, for example:
• CashBack for Creativity distributes funds through Creative Scotland and has a particular emphasis creating access to inspirational experiences and routes for progression by developing training and learning opportunities. This programme invests £3m over 3 years.

• The implementation of the Youth Arts Strategy Time to Shine, aims to provide opportunities for over 40,000 young people over its 2 year current funding agreement and has created 11 youth arts hubs around Scotland. £5m investment over 2 years.

• The Youth Music Initiative provides the opportunity for every child to access a year’s free music tuition by primary 6 as well as many other in and out of school musical experiences. £10m pa investment.

• Creative Scotland has a portfolio of 119 Regularly Funded Organisations that are all committed to the ethos of access and creative learning.

Research into the positive benefits and impact of arts and culture in terms of attainment and achievement has been undertaken by a number of Scottish, UK and international organisations. Some examples are cited in the bibliography below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attainment level</th>
<th>Low SES, little/no arts experiences</th>
<th>Low SES, high levels of arts experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graduated from high school</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended college/university</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned an undergraduate degree</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chose professionally-oriented majors at university</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
<td>29.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipated professional careers by age 30</td>
<td>21.1%</td>
<td>49.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As a shift toward creative learning and creative approaches is gaining momentum (and evidence) in the Scottish educational system, and as Scotland has an international reputation for strength in this area, there is a clear role for arts and creative professionals in the third and private sectors to be at the forefront in fostering a dynamic learning environment, inspiring all students to engage, achieve and aim higher.


http://www.gov.scot/Topics/ArtsCultureSport/Sport/MajorEvents/Glasgow-2014/Commonwealth-games/Indicators/ASPIRE-Dundee


Dear Convener,

Call for Evidence: Educational Attainment Gap - Role of the third and private sectors

Down’s Syndrome Scotland welcomes the opportunity to respond to this call for evidence from the Education & Culture Committee of the Scottish Parliament.

Raising attainment for all children and young people is an objective strongly supported by Down’s Syndrome Scotland which works towards helping children with Down’s syndrome to reach their full potential. There will always be differences in educational attainment between children with Ds and their peers but it is important to acknowledge that ‘attainment gaps’ between pupils can be wider than they could be if we fail to provide the right support to children with Ds.

Children with a learning disability may come from a deprived background but this does not apply to all of them and yet these children are sometimes still being left behind in schools. Children with learning disabilities need extra support in school and not providing this support can only increase the educational attainment gap that does not solely stem from poverty.

Down’s Syndrome Scotland’s involvement in schools is twofold. On one hand, we offer a variety of training courses and formal consultation visits for professionals, on the other we support families and children with Ds with any enquiry they may have about education; from nursery through to college. Many children with Ds attend mainstream schools and benefit from such a learning environment. However it is important to recognise that children and young people with Ds will need support in class to help them ‘attain’ their goals.

A few years ago, ENABLE Scotland campaigned on teacher education. At the time, the campaign highlighted a ‘basic lack of understanding of learning disabilities by some classroom teachers and support staff as being a major barrier to inclusion and
a successful learning experience for children and young people with learning
disabilities’. ENABLE was then calling for ‘all staff involved in a child’s education,
from head teachers to learning support assistants, to participate in mandatory
professional development courses (CPD) on basic behaviour management
strategies, learning disability/autism awareness and communication skills, as well as
developing a general understanding of inclusion and equalities’. Through our
experience, it appears that the core elements of that campaign are still relevant
today.

As a result of our work, it is apparent that focusing on teachers’ training should be a
priority in any process aimed at solving the educational attainment gap. The new
Curriculum for Excellence aims to help every learner develop knowledge, skills and
attributes for learning, life and work but teaching staff need more help to be able to
meet these objectives. As far as Down’s syndrome is concerned, many professionals
still lack knowledge of the condition and what it means for a child to have Down’s
syndrome and their specific learning profile.

In order to fill this gap, Down’s Syndrome Scotland offers a variety of CPD
accredited training for teaching, non-teaching, play staff, health professionals, health
students and carers to meet the additional support needs of children and adults with
Down's syndrome as well as their families. As an example, our ‘improving
Communication Skills of Children with Down’s syndrome’ course is aimed at
teachers and support staff to help them achieve better communication with children
and young people with Down’s syndrome. The course will suggest techniques that
can easily be included in the school day and improve the communication skills of the
learner with Down’s syndrome, thus minimising frustration and avoidance behaviour.
Peers in both mainstream and ASN schools can easily be included in the
communication activities.

Information and advice provided by DSS to schools and families also focuses on the
importance of managing transition periods. Transitions are difficult times for all
children but these can be extremely challenging for pupils with additional support
needs. As an example, a transition may require multiple visits to the new classroom
so that the child get accustomed to his/her new environment. Teachers would have
to use photos and photograph books to encourage children to talk about the new
school/classroom. Extra resources thus need to be allocated for pupils to get familiar
with the changes and for the transition period to be handled in the most successful
way.

As well as teachers’ knowledge of Down’s syndrome, schools and education
authorities need to understand that transitions are key to help a child achieve his/her
full potential. A transition that is badly planned will not help towards raising the
attainment of a child, on the contrary it is likely to contribute to increased
difficulties/barriers that a child with Ds has to overcome when it could be a much
easier and rewarding process.

In theory, transitions should start to be planned at least year in advance. In practice,
every year Down’s Syndrome Scotland is supporting families with children with Ds
who are being told only a few days before the end of term or just before school starts
who their class teacher will be and who the support staff will be, transitions are the
big steps from nursery to primary and primary to secondary but each year the child’s transitions also needs to be considered.

With regard to the interaction between third sector and education authorities, an argument could be made on the need for third sector organisations like Down’s Syndrome Scotland to be involved in teacher’s training at an earlier stage. Developing stronger partnerships between third sector organisations and universities may offer opportunities to address some of the issues that increase the attainment gap by gathering knowledge and translating it into comprehensive training courses for future teaching/medical staff on specific conditions like Down’s syndrome. Education authorities should also promote and encourage staff to engage in training on learning disabilities not just as a one-off but on several occasions throughout their career as part of CPD.

One way to reduce the educational attainment gap is therefore to provide adequate training for teaching and non-teaching staff within a school on how to work with children with Ds and work to the strengths of children instead of too often focusing on what they cannot do. Schools should encourage all children to maximise their abilities and develop new skills. Some pupils’ attainment may be lower than others but what matters is that all pupils have been given the right support to perform their knowledge to the best of their abilities, have been helped to reach their full potential and are therefore ready for life and work.

We trust these comments assist the Committee with its enquiry. Please do not hesitate to contact our office on 0131 313 7452 or by email at rachel@dsscotland.org.uk should you have any questions.

Yours sincerely,

Rachel Le Noan
Policy Officer
Down’s Syndrome Scotland
EIS Written Evidence

The EIS has worked over many years to campaign against poverty and to highlight the impact it has on the achievements and attainment of the children and young people from families who are disadvantaged by living in poverty.

The EIS supports and promotes initiatives which redress the imbalance in achievement and attainment caused by poverty but we do not believe that educational initiatives alone will sufficiently and permanently close the pernicious and damaging attainment gap.

Teachers and lecturers support attainment for all but we believe it is important that extra support be provided to those who live, learn and study under conditions of economic and social disadvantage.

The EIS has welcomed the recent funding announcement of £100 million over four years to help tackle inequality. We hope that this money reaches the targets and is used directly in schools to support learners. The example of the London Challenge model is one that must be treated with caution. The elements within this of private/third sector input do not fit with the structures or values which are at the heart of the Scottish Education system.

Given the high value we all place on GTCS standards and the level of professionalism of the teaching profession of Scotland we do not consider the Teach First model, as found in England, to be appropriate or acceptable here. The EIS supports state funded, comprehensive education and sees no place for Academies or Free Schools within our school estate.

Any proposal for private sector involvement in Scottish Education must be very carefully evaluated. In any such evaluation the expertise and understanding of the teaching profession should be sought.
Flexibility of provision within a comprehensive, inclusive and democratically controlled system makes sense in Scotland and the introduction of possible fragmentation and competition could cause inefficiency and inconsistency.

Third sector organisations may add value to schools and can play a role in achievement. For example, Place2Be projects have been successful in providing support primarily for children but also for families and schools. Partnerships with the third sector can bring added value, whether in directly supporting children and families or in providing support and professional learning opportunities for teachers.

The involvement of organisations and individuals (from outwith the education service) in schools and colleges can have value but it must be controlled and monitored within existing systems. It would be to the detriment of all learners if the aim of such involvement was to diminish or undermine the central role of teachers and lecturers and the framework for professional standards.

The Committee has already heard evidence on the Development of Scotland’s Young Workforce and we welcome the opportunity to comment on this within our evidence. If the recommendations of the Wood Report were fully implemented the EIS hope is that the impact on both attainment and achievement in schools would be significant and all pupils would benefit from a breaking down of the barriers between “academic” and “vocational” education.

We support the increased provision of options for young people but there have to be safeguards against young people propelled along a route too soon or without other options being made available. For students to have the option of vocational or mixed pathways is positive but academic routes must remain open to all.

The currency of high level vocational qualifications in the labour market could be increased if the recommendations in the report are followed but such a change will take time and commitment from all stakeholders.

The re-organisation/organisation of relationships between schools, colleges and employers is not something that will just evolve. There will need to be resources, planning and provision of suitable motivation for all parties to ensure that this is successful.
A diverse and flexible provision is required but this will take financial and other resources to achieve. In the current financial situation with education budgets stretched and cut, we question how this resource will be provided.

As the Committee is soon to consider the role for parents (including guardians) in raising attainment, we would wish our view of their importance to be noted. We believe that parental support for schools is important and that the support of parents for their child’s learning is essential from Early Years through to Further and Higher Education. Parents need information and support to allow this to happen and the communication between parents and schools needs to be effective. Home-link teachers play an important role in bridging gaps in many communities.

In the area of support for families to promote achievement and attainment there may be scope for third sector involvement which can forge strong links with schools. Support for families and communities will have a positive effect on the achievement and attainment of the young people within them.

Tackling inequality and poverty is essential if the attainment and achievement gap is to be addressed. Raising attainment and achievement is a priority for the EIS and our members. Many teachers and lecturers already have experience of supporting children and young people to overcome the barriers that poverty creates. Additional resources are required to help develop approaches to support this work and for there to be a positive impact on the educational attainment gap.
About ENABLE:

ENABLE Scotland is the largest voluntary organisation in Scotland of and for children and adults who have learning disabilities and their families. We have a strong voluntary network with around 5000 members in 44 local branches and via individual membership.

Around a third of our members have a learning disability. ENABLE Scotland campaigns to improve the lives of people who have learning disabilities and their families and carers. ENABLE Scotland provides social care services to more than 2,000 people across Scotland who have learning disabilities or mental health problems.

ENABLE also delivers a range of programmes in schools and colleges across Scotland to support young people with additional support needs to make a successful post-school transition to a positive destination, for example our Stepping Up programme which is highlighted in the Wood report as an example of best practice. Please see Appendix A for a full list of all ENABLE Scotland’s transitions projects.

ENABLE Scotland would warmly welcome the implementation of recommendations in the Wood report, particularly those relating to young disabled people, for example:

- Rec 33 – Tailoring career advice and work experience for young disabled people who are still at school to help them realise their potential and achieve their career aspirations.
- Rec 34 - Funding levels to colleges and Modern Apprenticeship training providers should reflect the cost of providing additional support to young disabled people, and age restrictions should be relaxed for those whose transition may take longer.
- Rec 35 – numbers of young disabled people in Modern Apprenticeships should be increased.
- Rec 36 - Employers should be supported and encouraged to employ young disabled people.
Questions:

1. What is the scale of the third and private sectors' involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and what is the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities?

ENABLE Scotland, since 2009, have demonstrated that effective partnerships can be developed to both add value to curricular learning but also support transitions into employment from school/college. Working in 18 FE campuses and over 80 schools across Scotland, we have supported thousands of young people who have a learning disability to achieve positive destinations after their time at school or college.

These partnerships have been funded through a mixture of grant-giving organisation funds, Skills Development Scotland programmes, ESF, Scottish Funding Council, collegiate SUMS and the local authority themselves. What has remained consistent though is our focus on engaging businesses, supporting work experience and ensuring transitions into employment - something that the school/college is unable to do in their existing delivery models.

For example Stepping Up is ENABLE Scotland’s flagship schools service funded through Inspiring Scotland. We are based in schools across the country, taking referrals from teachers and education professionals and supporting young people aged 14-19 to take part in a comprehensive and individual employability programme.

This includes various elements such as developing new skills/confidence, taking part in vocational training, person centred planning, reviewing options for transition, extended work placements, visits to employers/colleges and aftercare to ensure that the young person have moved to a positive destination and maintains it. In addition, we support approximately 40 young people with autism in schools in Dundee and Renfrewshire, funded by local authorities via the Scottish Autism Strategy.

We consider that the roles and responsibilities of teachers/lecturers are necessarily distinct in our projects. They are responsible for planning and ensuring educational attainment, safeguarding and support for learning in one place of learning. This is a distinct skills set from our staff, working with businesses in the community, supporting workplace learning and negotiating employment.

2. Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum.

ENABLE Scotland’s Stepping Up programme has, since 2009, engaged with 743 young people, with 689 making a positive destination after school (93%) - 175 entered employment, 119 secured vocational training outcomes and 395 went into FE.

In order for the outcomes of the Wood Report to be implemented effectively, education authorities must make an appropriate allocation of resources to coordinate with local businesses and support effective workplace learning. This will require either a fundamental redesign of the teaching staff roles or dedicated resource to support partnerships with existing local employability pipeline provision.
3. **Is the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement being realised?**

   Across all local employability partnerships in Scotland, employability provision for people who have additional support needs is provided predominantly and most effectively by voluntary sector organisations.

   Access to Modern Apprenticeships for young people who have disabilities is extremely low at less than 1%, something Skills Development Scotland are turning to the voluntary sector to resolve.

   Through effective use of the Wood report outcomes and implementation of its recommendations, Partnership Matters legislation and links with employability pipelines, effective working can be established between schools and voluntary sector organisations for the benefit of young people who have disabilities.

4. **How successful have schools been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver?**

   ENABLE Scotland programmes have been incredibly successful in ensuring pupils and students who have a learning disability not only achieve positive destinations after school/college, but make meaningful transition into vocational training or work.

   In doing so, we have contributed significantly to Opportunities for All outcomes across Scotland and been instrumental in the redesign of collegiate skills courses for students with additional support needs at a time of national reform.

   Unfortunately, the progression of young people with additional support needs from school or college is not effectively measured or reported on locally or nationally, something we feel is critical to demonstrating progress and sharing effective practice.

5. **Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.**

   As noted in the answer to Q.1 above, ENABLE Scotland has been able to effectively support thousands of young people who have a learning disability to achieve positive destinations after their time at school or college.

**For more information contact:**
Linda Whitmore  
Development Officer: Children and Families  
ENABLE Scotland  
Email: linda.whitmore@enable.org.uk Tel: 07889 456 104  

OR:

Kayleigh Thorpe  
Campaigns and Policy Manager  
ENABLE Scotland  
Email: Kayleigh.thorpe@enable.org.uk Tel: 01698 737109
APPENDIX A

Stepping Up is ENABLE Scotland’s flagship schools service funded through Inspiring Scotland. We are based in schools across the country, taking referrals from teachers and education professionals and supporting young people aged 14-19 to take part in a comprehensive and individual employability programme.

This includes various elements such as developing new skills/confidence, taking part in vocational training, person centred planning, reviewing options for transition, extended work placements, visits to employers/colleges and aftercare to ensure that the young person have moved to a positive destination and maintains it.

In addition, we support approximately 40 young people with autism in schools in Dundee and Renfrewshire, funded by local authorities via the Scottish Autism Strategy.

16+ Learning Choices

In addition to our Stepping Up programmes, we also manage Activity Agreement coaches within North Lanarkshire council’s 16+ Learning Choices team. We engage pupils with learning disabilities who are determined as having no likely positive destination six months prior to leaving school. Engaging with them and their families, we support them to develop the skills and confidence required to engage with training, education or employment. We represent an expertise within this citywide service and support 30 clients annually.

Transitions to Employment (T2E)

This is our college based project, operating in 12 colleges across Scotland (Kelvin College, New College Lanarkshire, Fife College, SRUC, City of Glasgow College, Borders College, West Lothian College, Kilmarnock College, Forth Valley College, Aberdeen College, Dundee College and Perth College).

Our staff are part of the team in the college, taking referrals from the Support for Learning department and supporting students to plan for and implement an exit plan from further education. This includes a number of elements such as work placements, job search, marketing the person to local employers, benefits advice and guidance and one to one training and mentoring. The client group for this project are people who have learning disabilities or additional support needs.

Skills Development Scotland Employability programme

We offer the new Employability programme that is funded on an annual basis by Skills Development Scotland. From April 2014, we will offer a service for young people who have learning disabilities aged 16-24 in Edinburgh, West Lothian, Aberdeen, Angus, South Lanarkshire, Stirling, East Renfrewshire, Renfrewshire, East Dunbartonshire, West Dunbartonshire, South Lanarkshire, North Ayrshire, East Ayrshire and Glasgow. Each person receives skills for training and work experience for approximately 13 weeks before moving on to employment. Each year we support approximately 200 young people.

We also deliver a specific vocational skills service in Glasgow, South Lanarkshire, Renfrewshire, West Lothian, East Ayrshire and North Ayrshire. The client group are mainstream job seekers who are longer term unemployed and wishing to training for a career
in the care sector. As a major social care provider we are able offer work experience placements and jobs within our own organisation. Each year we support approximately 50 people to train for work.

**Employer Recruitment Incentive for Targeted Young People**

We offer £1500 and bespoke support to employers recruiting a disabled young person (16-24) for more than 16hrs a week as part of Skills Development Scotland’s wage incentive scheme. We are offering this across Scotland as part of Open Doors Scotland, a pan-disability consortium of RNIB, AoHL, Capability Scotland, SAMH and the Lennox Partnership.

**Certificate for Work Readiness capacity building**

We are leading on the development of the CWR for people with additional support needs, an exciting new accredited qualification for Scotland’s young jobseekers – developed in partnerships with SQA and Skills Development Scotland.

Additionally, we are developing an accessible training package for the Introduction to Workplace Skills for people with additional support needs at school or college.

**Community Jobs Scotland**

We deliver a small proportion of SCVO’s contract for this Scottish Government initiative for mainstream young people who are becoming long-term unemployed. This follows on from the UK governments Future Jobs Fund programme which was abolished by the coalition government. This is a very successful programme which gives young people 6 months paid work. We employ young people within our own organisation in a range of areas including social care, administration, finance etc and support them to look for a job during their time with us. Each year we recruit about 40 young people onto this programme.

**NB - Schools partnerships operate in:**

Edinburgh, Angus, Dundee, North Lanarkshire, South Lanarkshire, Renfrewshire, East Renfrewshire, Glasgow, West Dunbartonshire, Inverclyde, East Ayrshire and North Ayrshire.

(In addition to the above, ENABLE Scotland also runs a number of other supported employment services and 2 social enterprises – Darling’s Coffee Shop in Arbroath, Angus and Knightswood, Glasgow and Hazeldene Horticulture in North Ayrshire.)
Education and Culture Committee

Educational attainment gap inquiry

Role of the third and private sectors

Background

Falkland House School is an independent school located in the village of Falkland in Fife and specialises in the education and care of boys who require additional support for learning.

It provides special integrated education to boys with autism spectrum disorder (ASD), social, emotional and behavioural difficulties (SEBD), attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) and Tourette’s syndrome (TS), as well as a number of other conditions which makes it difficult for them to cope in a mainstream educational environment.

The school was established over 30 years ago and has a reputation for excellence, quality and achieving positive results. Indeed, it was one of the first independent schools in Scotland to be awarded Autism Accreditation by the National Autistic Society.

Falkland House School provides residential and day places to boys from early primary age through to 18 years old, taking referrals from all regions in Scotland and the rest of the UK. The school offers day, 39 week and 52 week placements to cater for as many different circumstances as possible.

Falkland House School is the highest rated educational establishment of its type in Scotland, having achieved excellent grades in every standard it was inspected in by the Care Inspectorate.

Falkland House School was shortlisted in the Times Educational Supplement School Awards 2014 Special Needs School of the Year category, the only Scottish school shortlisted.

Consultation response

- the scale of the third and private sectors' involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Since working on improving attainment and achievement should be holistic and have the child at the centre, there should be no dividing line between the third and private sectors’ involvement and the role of education authorities.

If, as was clearly defined in the very first draft of the National Framework for Residential Care and Education services, the local authority clearly defined who was responsible for each short and long term outcome, as happens in good quality Coordinated Support Plans, the roles of both education authorities and third and private sector schools would be seen as
a partnership (this was unfortunately deleted as the draft progressed). It does not seem cost
or resource effective to replicate quality provision that is already accessible.

The local authorities (not just education) should certainly have a significant role in gathering
appropriate information to assess progress in attainment and achievement (in education and
care) in individual provisions. These results should be shared with other authorities so best
practice and provisions can be identified.

- whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving
  achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods
could be more embedded in the curriculum;

Our success comes not from the approach but the structure. As well as having a social
environment which ensures a 24 hour curriculum, the staff to pupil ratio and management of
resources results in these methods being embedded in the curriculum. The Curriculum for
Excellence was a major advancement in examining the totality of experiences, ensuring all
the skills for living a fulfilled life are recognised and developed.

To be able to know if approaches are successful in any provision, we need to have an
assessment process which indicates where young people are at the start and the end of any
process, thus ensuring that the individual curriculum closely matches identified needs. There
are huge discrepancies in the statistics collated by the Scottish Government at the moment
which would make this process both transparent and worthwhile. The Scottish Government
published statistics in December 2013 showing an 89% increase in those identified with
additional Support Needs since 2010 (69,587 to 131,621). In a meeting with the Health &
Wellbeing Unit and Educational Analytical Services we were told there had not been an
increase and we should not use the present figures as a benchmark for future years as they
were not reliable. What is the point of gathering statistics if they have no meaning? How as
partnership can we know where we want to be if we don’t know where we are?

In Falkland House School the positive relationships within the school community are a result
of everyone (and most importantly young people) having lots of opportunities to have a
voice, get involved in the life of the school and to contribute to its development. Two of the
most recent (and ongoing) projects are outlined below:

Contract Services – Pupils have established a company that quotes for a variety of jobs in
and around the school. The process is informed by real life experiences. Pupils are (and
have been) interviewed for positions within the company, going through the normal
application and interview procedures you would expect in the job market. For certain jobs
(e.g. strimming around the grounds) industry standard courses (City & Guilds or Lantra
awards) need to be passed for pupils to be allowed to participate in the task (our current
insurers are fully informed for risk assessment purposes). The range of skills needed match
all abilities and aspirations. We are in the early stages of this project but eventually pupils
will be taxed so the company can either buy equipment or lease it from the school. If they
buy they will have to decide quality/cost over leasing the schools equipment etc. This project
can continue to be developed and improved for a number of years offering more experiences
in an ever widening job sector (e.g. catering for seminar participants, designing the school
website, painting rooms on a rotational basis, etc.).

Cabin Project – All subject areas are involved in an interdisciplinary project planning,
building and eventually using the cabin as a community resource in Falkland Estate grounds.
This project offers learning in a practical way with a real outcomes rather than sitting in a
classroom discussing ways it could be done.
• whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

The full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is not being realised for a number of basic reasons.

Firstly, as discussed in the first paragraph, there are very little or no stated expectations from placing local authorities on a short or long term basis for each individual placement. If no short or long term outcomes are stated, recorded and measured then it is difficult to realise the provision’s full potential. These short and long term outcomes must include the full range of experiences from the Curriculum Areas of the Curriculum for Excellence to ensure each learner is developing knowledge, skills and attributes for learning, life and work (the four capacities – successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors).

Secondly, the third and private sectors, as well as mainstream provision and education authorities, work in competition to each other rather than collaboratively. This is in direct contradiction to the working in partnership mentioned before, but given budget cuts and the number of third and private sector spaces available in comparison to the decreasing number of referrals, competition is inevitable. Most Local Authorities will only use the third and private sector as a last resort and that is usually irreconcilable to early intervention. Excellent quality practice is not shared with others in the sector (we currently have 9 ‘Excellent’ grades and 1 ‘Very Good’ grade, as well as having achieved Autism Accreditation but would not consider visits from other establishments to improve their quality of service).

• how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;

As stated before, the Curriculum for Excellence has given us all a much better overview of the variety of experiences and outcomes needed to help learners develop the skills they need for learning, life and work but most, including the Scottish Government when asking for statistics, still see achievements as certifiable awards of some description. Employers are much more interested in a level gained than an experience met and this is also true for parents.

At Falkland House we have a ‘Celebrating Success’ day with pupils, staff, parents and associated professionals. This day celebrates individuals’ attainments in the wider sense. Whilst it could be gaining Higher mathematics for one pupil, travelling independently might have been as big an achievement for another.
Educational attainment gap – role of the third and private sector.

Response from FCA Scotland.

Jane Alcorn, Service Manager jane.alcorn@thefca.co.uk

the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Our perception over a long number of years spent working in schools is that the provision of support from the Third Sector into schools remains still localised and ad hoc, and variable across primary and high schools. Whilst this remains the picture then it will fall to the substantive content of the curriculum delivered by the teaching staff to seek to improve achievement and attainment, if by that we mean examination results.

If we consider attainment and achievement in a wider context then all of us who have witnessed competent third sector delivery and involvement will testify to the power and positivity of this type of intervention. Not only can delivery of this kind enhance and deepen understanding it will often allow for involvement, achievement and credit from children who would not normally be the most prominent or involved if based only on academic ability.

Time pressures on school managers and teaching staff to deliver the formal curriculum will limit the involvement of the Third Sector particularly in high schools as external examinations and placement in league tables continues to define success. Conflict will often add additional stresses for young people who miss timetabled lessons whilst receiving support elsewhere.

whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum

There is clear evidence that both the attendance and attainment of looked after children who are accommodated is substantially ahead of those children who remain looked after at home.(LA)

There remains a gap in the academic attainment of LAAC against the whole school cohort although this shows small signs of closing. Early intervention should hopefully continue that trend.

Where it is clear YP are unable to engage with formal education at National Assessment level it is important that they have access to a vocational, amended curriculum or other alternatives to education. This is an important area for third and private sector providers.

Within each different group eg LAAC, looked after at home, not Looked after - there are YP with different attitudes to education. We offer our S4-6 pupils extra 1x1 subject support though not all take it up. Those who do evidence better academic outcomes. It is possible to target individual
pupils with individual support rather than more generic programmes aimed at all LAAC or all pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds as these are not always homogenous groups.

Third sector would appear to play a greater part in the delivery of achievement as opposed to attainment if we regard ‘attainment’ as exam results and progress through levels. There is research (G Connelly) which evidences that those pupils who engaged in activities outside of school were also more likely to achieve academically.

The methods and content used by the Third Sector to engage young people are as varied as methods and content found within the mainstream curriculum currently being delivered by teaching staff. There is not one single method which would hold the magic key for successful mainstream curriculum delivery. In fact the randomness of the input, deviation from the normal routine, and exposure to outsiders in the school will often engage young people and allow for more relaxed participation.

There appears to be a spread and level of involvement which is not quantifiable nor is it subject to an audit. Involvement appears to rely rather on the individual school and that will depend in turn on the culture and social mix of the school, the local environment and economy, parental involvement and staffing levels in the school, and links and ties with external agencies.

**whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised**

Finance will continue to be a problem here. Young people who become accommodated in a fostering environment where adequate supports are put in place evidence greater placement stability and better education outcomes. Attainment and achievement are not the exclusive gift of schools – they have a part to play. But the greater part is played by the home, peer group and social background. The third/private sector can be better placed to operate (Team Parenting) around the child and in circumstances where the ‘achievement/attainment’ gap is at its most noticeable.

Schools work hard to engage parents but will admit that it remains difficult to engage the parents of the most disadvantaged – and teachers, by and large and by workload, remained rooted in schools. More needs to be done to work with the most disadvantaged in a supportive, holistic and, if necessary, home and community based model.

**how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications; -**

There is still a need for greater emphasis on ‘wider achievement’ and if the third sector has a significant role in this then the full potential of the third/private sector is probably not being realised.

We do not recall seeing a ‘Wider achievements’ section in either primary or secondary reports. There are occasional mentions of contribution to assembly or singing in the choir but reporting on
exam results or academic performance to date is overwhelmingly the emphasis in secondary. In the primary sector CfE allows more emphasis on skills based learning but clear acknowledgement of ‘wider achievement’ is lost.

I feel schools value wider achievement and teachers understand its importance but there remains cultural blocks to how this information is gathered, stored and evidenced to others. 20 years ago there was great investment in the National Record of Achievement (commonly known as the wine list) but these initiatives have not stood the test of time. All pupils need to be supported and encouraged to engage in ‘outdoor learning/extra curricula activity/hobbies/clubs etc’ where lifeskills are honed, confidence, well-being and health raised, and academic attainment positively affected.

We have a system which has examinations squarely embedded at it’s core and to that end we must support our young people in achieving the best they can in that system.

At the same time we need to realise that in the real world values and qualities which make our society what it is and what we aspire to as members of that society will contain elements of knowledge and experience found outwith the confines of the examination system.

The Third Sector can assist greatly in providing access to that part of the curriculum, but only in conjunction with the ethos of the school itself. That ethos will mirror and reflect the community which the school serves. If a school seeks at all levels to support the widest breadth of achievement and attainment then third sector involvement will go hand in hand with the daily running of the school and will not be seen as marginalised or offering a second tier opportunity. If on the other hand Third Sector involvement is paid lip service to then it is likely that such opportunities will not be given chance to develop fully within the school.
GL Assessment is the leading provider of formative assessments to UK schools.

We specialise in literacy, numeracy, reasoning, SEN and attitudinal assessments, and have relationships with over a third of primary schools and over half of secondary schools in the UK. Our assessments provide teachers with the tools they require to help raise standards in education, especially for the most disadvantaged pupils.

Tests are nationally standardised, giving measures such as standard age scores, and include parental reporting where appropriate. GL Assessment has delivered over 7 million online tests to schools in the UK and worldwide and our assessments include the Cognitive Abilities Test (CAT), the New Group Reading Test (NGRT) and the new Progress Test Series for English, maths and science.

We provide training and continual professional development for teachers in the most effective use of formative assessments and the interpretation and analysis of assessment data. A particular emphasis is placed on the ‘triangulation’ methodology of assessment which is used by many schools that have good assessment practices. This methodology combines the use of summative and formative assessments alongside teachers’ experiences and views of pupils to most accurately assess the progress of pupils. It is our view that the comprehensive use of formative assessments underpins this process.

Over thirty years, we have established a supportive and trusted relationship with schools in Scotland and across the UK, as well as internationally. We regularly contribute to policy discussion and have provided advice to Whitehall and the devolved administrations on a range of assessment policy issues. Schools value our independent assessments because they provide a reliable, unobtrusive and cost effective means to best target educational interventions and therefore improve educational outcomes.

Philosophy of assessment

GL Assessment has a distinct philosophy of good assessment practice. We believe in a ‘whole pupil’ approach, examining an individual’s attitude, ability and attainment to provide a complete understanding of their needs. This enables schools and colleges to get to know each pupil as an individual, understanding their strengths, areas where they might need support and intervention, and removing any obstacles that are impacting negatively on attainment. Crucially, this philosophy places the individual pupil at the very heart of a school’s programme of assessment.

We view assessment as a continuous process that should include the use of formative assessments to monitor progress and inform the personalisation of teaching and learning for individual young people, helping to ensure the best possible educational outcomes in summative assessments. This process should include baseline checks to establish a pupil’s current and potential attainment, ongoing formative assessment and regular interventions from teachers to adapt learning strategies.
Raising standards and achievement for disadvantaged pupils: A comprehensive and consistent programme of assessment

GL Assessment warmly welcomes the Education and Culture Committee’s focus on addressing the educational attainment gap in Scotland. We have also welcomed the Scottish Government’s ongoing attempts to address this issue. GL Assessment is keen to play an active role in the discussions about the educational outcomes of disadvantaged pupils and bridging the attainment gap between them and their peers.

The private sector can play a significant role in this process, providing expertise and resources for schools that local authorities do not have the capacity to develop and supply. GL Assessment’s work in this area is particularly focused on the lowest attaining pupils and is based on the principle that if you can raise the performance of this group, all students in a class will benefit.

We do not believe that the third and private sectors should encroach on the responsibilities of local authorities, but rather support their work, much in the same way that formative assessments do not replace teacher observation and experience, but support it.

Comprehensive and consistent programmes of formative assessment from GL Assessment or other assessment publishers provide a means through which teachers can highlight factors which prevent, and target interventions to improve, educational attainment. These assessments should therefore form a cornerstone of any educational strategy to bridge the gap highlighted by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation in 2014. Schools should be encouraged to institute programmes of regular formative assessment to help their poorer pupils. Indeed, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report into bridging the attainment gap in Scottish education specifically highlights the value of “evidence-based approaches [to] reduce the attainment gap……based on timely, relevant data.”

For example, it is important that teachers are equipped to accurately measure the potential of pupils and to identify areas of strength and weakness. Reasoning assessments are already used by many schools in Scotland to achieve this. One such assessment is the Cognitive Abilities Test (CAT); the benefits of using CAT to track pupil progress were highlighted in the 2013 Welsh Government report Priority review: Effective pupil tracking, in which it was labelled an “[example] of effective practice”. CAT cannot be prepared for as it measures underlying reasoning abilities and therefore provides schools with a comprehensive profile of a pupil’s developed abilities through verbal, non-verbal, quantitative and spatial reasoning tests. It provides schools with a solid basis for introducing targeted interventions to improve pupil attainment and is often used in conjunction with other formative assessments. Results include statistically reliable indicators for a student’s future summative assessment results, helping teachers to set achievable but challenging targets and identify quickly if progress has halted.

This is particularly important regarding English and maths, as results in these subjects will have a significant bearing on a young person’s future employability. Regular formative assessments in literacy and numeracy should therefore be at the heart of any programme of assessment. Progress in Maths (PIM) and Progress in English (PIE) assess attainment as well as levels of ability. By comparing the results of these assessments to CAT scores, teachers can see if and where pupils are not yet achieving standards expected of them. They can then implement strategies to bring about improvements to help pupils achieve their potential.

In 2013, the Northern Ireland Education and Training Inspectorate Review of computer-based assessments in primary schools showed that many schools in the country felt that alternative assessments such as PIE and PIM

---

were more robust than the new Northern Ireland Literacy Assessment (NILA) and Northern Ireland Numeracy Assessment (NILA). Indeed, the report found that 91% of respondents were using PIE and 98% using PIM.

Holy Family Nursery and Primary School in Derry, Northern Ireland is an urban school, 64% of whose 450 pupils aged 3 to 11 years are on free school meals (FSM). Approximately 30% of pupils require additional support with their learning. Whilst not a Scottish school, its experiences of using CAT, PIM and PIE do provide a useful insight into the benefits of using a range of formative assessments to raise the educational attainment of disadvantaged pupils.

The school currently tests pupils in May each year using the three assessments. The teaching staff use their own experience and the assessments to identify aspects of the curriculum that the pupils have found challenging and the skills that need to be developed further. The school then sets targets and defines strategies to ensure these are met.

Holy Family has found that one of the most significant benefits of assessing all cohorts in this way is being able to spot school-wide issues. The school can then implement whole school action plans, professional development programmes for staff, invest in relevant text books and resources, and set targets in subsequent years related to the specific problem.

Starting early: Age-appropriate assessments

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation report into closing the attainment gap in Scottish education states that:

*The gap between children from low-income and high-income households starts early. By age 5, it is 10–13 months. Lower attainment in literacy and numeracy is linked to deprivation throughout primary school. By age 12–14 (S2), pupils from better-off areas are more than twice as likely as those from the most deprived areas to do well in numeracy.*

In the *Rise Review* of September 2013 (‘How intake and other external factors affect school performance’), one of three major considerations for policymakers was identified as 'equality in attainment on entry to school'. The paper states that 'the later that educational inequality is left, the more difficult it becomes to reduce.' Many of GL Assessment’s tests are specifically designed to be used with the very youngest age groups and provide a secure, age-appropriate way of anticipating and addressing issues which, if left unchecked, could severely damage a child’s development. The paper also highlights the need for baseline checks in or before Reception; assessments such as those offered by GL Assessment allow early years providers to take the first step towards comprehensive data collection and analysis.

Assessments should be tailored to the needs of the age group, focusing on capability rather than on learned ability. Because these are for such young children, we are careful to design assessments which, although thorough, are not too daunting or demanding. They involve informal interactions between child and adult, meaning that effective communication by the adult plays a vital role in the end result. The aim is not to subject the child to unnecessary tests, but to create a dialogue which the child can actively enjoy. One-to-one experiences like this can highlight difficulties in expression and communication; if these are not supported at this vital early stage, children can struggle in later education.

---


For example, the York Assessment of Reading for Comprehension (YARC) sound deletion and sound isolation tasks is a test of phonic awareness for non-readers that is widely used in Scotland. Assessments of this type have been shown to offer an early indication of whether a child will struggle with phonics at a later stage.

The YARC tests have been developed specifically for very young learners and are administered one-to-one. YARC has been used by The City of Edinburgh Council across its primary, secondary and special schools to support reading development, in partnership with key services, such as Speech and Language Therapists and Educational Psychologists. The Council’s interventions are aimed at meeting the needs of learners who require additional opportunities and support to succeed in reading and writing, in particular the lowest attaining 20% and the most disadvantaged learners.

**Identifying root causes of barriers to achievement**

As part of efforts to raise attainment for disadvantaged Scottish pupils, it is important that schools consider the barriers that some disadvantaged children face to doing well at school, beside the academic ones discussed above. Pupils’ home life, the support that they receive beyond the school gates and their self-esteem can all have a massive bearing on their performance in the classroom. The impact of many of these factors is more acute for disadvantaged pupils and so particular attention needs to be paid to ensuring that they are identified and addressed. GL Assessment places great emphasis on helping schools to identify these barriers, so that appropriate interventions can be made.

One such tool which we work with schools to use is the Pupil Attitudes to Self and School (PASS) attitudinal survey, which identifies the root causes of disengagement or behavioural problems amongst young people, and is widely used in England to demonstrate the impact of Pupil Premium funding for disadvantaged pupils. The survey is comprised of short psychometric statements that feed into nine attitudinal factors linked to key educational goals. These include how well a young person is responding to a programme of training or study, how prepared they are to learn and their attitude towards participation. A low score in any factor can accurately pinpoint negative attitudes that may not otherwise be apparent and allows education providers to identify the root causes of the poor behaviours that can lead to disengagement from education.

The Hereford Academy is based in an area with a high level of deprivation. 39% of students have a recognised special educational need and yet the school was rated ‘good with outstanding features’ by Ofsted in June 2011. The Academy is using the PASS attitudinal survey to gain an insight into any emotional obstacles holding their students back, to tailor effective interventions and then to measure their impact. The Academy assesses the whole school with PASS once a year, and in general can predict the 15 or so pupils that are likely to score poorly. The school’s Intervention Team holds a panel meeting every week and uses data from PASS to inform discussions of what needs to be done as well as measure the work in progress.

**Destination Guidance**

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation report highlights the fact that, “Children from deprived households leave school earlier” and “Low attainment is strongly linked to destinations after school, with long-term effects on job prospects.”

We place a strong emphasis on the need to support children from disadvantaged backgrounds children to stay in education and move into work, particularly through better careers advice. Again, this is an objective which can be

---

supported by the appropriate use of consistent and comprehensive formative assessments. Through accurate and granular educational assessment, young people with specific strengths can be identified and directed towards an appropriate academic or vocational route – perhaps one which they had not previously considered - ensuring that all pupils are given the advice and support to succeed.

**Monitoring and evaluating efforts to bridge the attainment gap**

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation calls upon school management teams to “Monitor how new initiatives affect the gap.” We wholly support this recommendation; it is crucial that schools understand the true impact of, and are held to account for, interventions that they make. Formative assessments allow schools and governors to measure the success of interventions introduced on the back of initial testing and to highlight the interventions that work best.

By using funding to establish a comprehensive assessment regime, schools are able to provide disadvantaged pupils with a guaranteed level of additional help whilst benefitting the whole school. Underachieving pupils can affect the attainment of all pupils as they require extra attention from teachers and more resources. By constituting an effective programme of assessment, both disadvantaged pupils and their peers can achieve better progress.

The data produced by the formative assessments which we offer can be broken down into different categories such as gender and, most pertinently, if a pupil is disadvantaged. Using this data, schools should be required to baseline, demonstrate the progress of and explain what they have done to assist disadvantaged pupils.

In February 2013 five schools across the UK with high rates of Free School Meal (FSM) eligible pupils took part in a trial of Connectors, a peer-to-peer reading programme developed by Scholastic Education designed to improve literacy. All five schools wanted to ensure that they were using interventions that helped to close the gap between FSM and non-FSM children. In order to evaluate their efforts effectively, the schools’ leadership team needed to know how well pupils could read at the outset. By using the *New Group Reading Test*, the schools were able to establish their pupils' reading ability at the start of the intervention and then monitor progress in the middle and at the end.

The NGRT is a screening and monitoring test for groups of pupils. It assesses reading and comprehension in a single test and it comprises three sections: phonics, sentence completion and passage comprehension. Test results provide teachers with a comprehensive overview of a pupil’s reading and comprehension ability while providing a wealth of diagnostic information identifying areas where they may be experiencing difficulties.

The schools undertook a repeat of the NGRT after three months and nine months of the trial to obtain a comprehensive overview of each pupil’s reading and comprehension ability, and see how that had progressed since the start of the intervention. The assessment also helped the school to identify how certain groups of children – such as those on free school meals or the seven per cent of pupils that have English as an additional language – were progressing with their reading.

**Conclusion**

GL Assessment fully supports the Education and Culture Committee’s focus on efforts to bridge the attainment gap between disadvantaged pupils and their peers. We want to assist where possible the Committee’s Inquiry into raising the attainment of pupils and would be delighted to discuss in more details the role that formative assessments can play in this process. Third and private sector organisations can play an important role in this
process, providing tools and advice to assist schools and ensure that all pupils are helped to maximise their potential.

Raising educational attainment, addressing the barriers to young people succeeding in education and ensuring that young people are directed towards the most appropriate academic or vocational path, are all vital elements of improving the educational outcomes of our most disadvantaged pupils. They are also all components which a consistent and comprehensive programme of formative assessment can help address. Therefore, we believe that, as part of any strategy, schools should be encouraged to institute such programmes.
1. The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Firstly, there needs to be clarity of definition for the terms, ‘attainment’ and ‘achievement’ and consequently how these are recorded and measured to reflect individual learning pathways. Frequently, activities which are easy to score and benchmark become our primary measures of success. This can lead to measures becoming more valued than the learning they are designed to underpin. They also fail to take into account the context in which learning is taking place and as such can only provide a very approximate measurement of individual capacity, development and skill.

Any kind of partnership work between schools and another organisation becomes necessarily more complex than any model involving a single delivery source. We have in the past often tended towards binary definitions of success and failure – particularly in respect of the traditionally held notion of ‘attainment’ – such that more complex delivery arrangements create risks and complexities which dilute the power of schools to effect success with pupils using these models of measurement. Schools and Local Authorities are increasingly forging partnerships with the third and private sector to better reflect the needs of pupils and their learner journeys. We need a more nuanced system of measurement to reflect this progressive approach to learning and teaching.

Schools must retain the lead responsibility for pupils’ learning journeys, however these need to be plotted in collaboration with relevant stakeholders to maximise value. For example, support from e-commerce / e-marketing organisations in delivering IT and Maths curriculum - based learning can provide context and practical applications for learning which stimulate and enthuse pupils to further engage in learning and explore potential new career pathways. There is not a single area of the curriculum which does not benefit from this collaborative approach to learning where it is managed by education professionals and links to the development of educational, career and / or personal goals.

Another way in which this collaborative approach to improving attainment / achievement can achieve real success is by creating opportunities for inter-disciplinary learning. By applying abstractions to practical circumstances, we are immediately required to address contingencies outwith the scope of purely theoretical learning. This creates huge opportunities for broader approaches to how the curriculum is delivered. The e-commerce example above, brings in applications of mathematics and IT as noted, but also require a focus on written work, research, communications, design, project management, concepts of profit and loss etc. At a macro-level pupils’ overall employability skills are enhanced as are their personal networks – two key elements and predictors of positive and sustained transition from secondary education.

Within this collaborative approach to learning we must retain schools as the lead organisation in supporting each pupil’s journey. The ‘lead organisation’ has responsibility for delivering learning, but as crucially facilitating others to deliver
where they are expert or can present applications of theory into business or community settings.

2. **Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;**

Collaboration across the third / private sectors with schools is often developed and delivered in an ad-hoc way, dependant on the availability of transient funding and political priorities. This scattergun approach to delivery can compromise the effectiveness of delivery. In particular, the short term nature of many collaborative approaches can reduce or remove opportunities to learn from mistakes and drive up quality.

All effective partnerships are defined by positive relationships, mutual respect, a common vision, a clear delineation of roles and responsibilities and an understanding of what success 'looks-like'. None of these success-factors can be fully realised without the necessary investment of time across a nascent partnership. Our current and most frequently applied models for funding new activities do not afford the requisite time to allow partnerships to grow and develop the capacity to demonstrate their effectiveness. The most recent example of this is through the allocation of 1-year funding to support the implementation of the national youth employment strategy. The step-change required in Scotland’s disparate cultures, Education and Industry, to meet the aims of the new strategy, requires a concerted, consistent and combined effort over the next 5-10 years. The strategy itself sets targets for 2020 – the allocation of a single year’s worth of funding sets a far less ambitious tone.

Where partnerships flourish – meeting the key criteria outlined above – their value exceeds significantly that which can be achieved by working in isolation. The current systemic factors around still mainly short-term public sector investment and changing political priorities limit our opportunities to fully embed collaborative design and delivery models within the curriculum. Longer term investment plans would substantially support many more collaborative models to become sustainable and successful and consequently to improve outcomes for our young people.

3. **Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;**

Neither the third nor the private sector is currently realising its full potential in improving children’s attainment or achievement in partnership with schools. The impediments here can be broadly divided into three categories financial, structural and cultural – many of the central issues cross over into more than one of these areas.

Some of the financial issues are explained in detail at point 2. As well as the need for longer term sustained investment planning from Scottish Govt we should also consider financial incentives for private industry to better support work in our schools. These could take the form of tax breaks based on the satisfaction of specific criteria – e.g. evidence of a working school partnership, x number of work experience placements supported, x number of business mentors provided etc.- potentially overseen by Local Authorities.
Another way in which we could encourage more support and involvement from both sectors would be to make additional ‘asks’ of businesses which use publicly funded employer recruitment incentives to support elements of their workforce. As a quid pro quo, terms of the financial arrangement could be developed to require involvement with local schools to some degree. These arrangements could pertain equally to the 3rd sector as they might with the private sector.

Structurally, the issues around measurement of success are discussed in detail at point 1. Other issues which create structural barriers to greater collaboration include the adherence in some schools to a rigidly organised school day and an equally inflexible timetable to support it. Across Glasgow and the rest of the country, there are many very good examples of where greater flexibility in timetabling, the length of school days and extended learning outwith school terms are paying huge dividends. Glasgow’s Scholarship Programme (a forerunner to the new Foundation Apprenticeship qualification), the city’s Advanced Higher Hub, and summer internships supported by projects like Career Academies are supporting pupils to greater successes than they had expected. Education Scotland has a key role here in sharing these positive stories and leading – along with Local Authority partners - the implementation of best practice as an entitlement for every young person across the country.

Culturally, Scotland lacks the traditions of school and business partnerships that drive the economy in countries like Germany and Switzerland along with the Nordic countries. The mixed economies across these countries have retained elements of their traditional industries as well as growing new service and technology based industries. Scotland has retained far less of its traditional manufacturing employer base and is almost wholly dependent on its service based industry. This new economy has had less time to develop a civic infrastructure than that which is apparent in much of the rest of northern Europe. Not surprisingly, youth unemployment remained lowest over the last 10 years where there was a broader range of industry and where there had been a greater retention of traditional industry than that seen in Scotland. More needs to be done therefore to stimulate the development of civic and cultural links between new industry and the school sector in Scotland. Partly this can be done through financial and taxation measures as described above, but it also needs a compelling and sustained narrative from the Govt., Local Authorities and key business leaders over a time period of 5-10 years – in line with the DYW strategy. Since 2006, starting with More Choices More Chances and Determined to Succeed, year on year, the Govt has introduced a range of initiatives and policy documents all based on improving attainment, achievement and sustained destinations through greater collaboration between disciplines. These have customarily been introduced as policy changes and/or new initiatives with new funding packages attached. This approach is counter-productive in fostering the culture change and partnerships required to fully draw out the potential across private, public and third sectors.

4. **How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;**

Annual employer surveys carried out, by among others UKCES and CBI, consistently highlight the importance that employers place on attitude and aptitude - capacities such as resilience, motivation and teamwork are fundamental. In all but the most
technical of job roles, these kinds of capacities are the ones most sought by employers.

We have a plethora of awards and frameworks designed to enable young people to develop and demonstrate their personal effectiveness. With the exception of a few well-established awards schemes however – most notably Duke of Edinburgh’s Award – these have little profile or currency within industry. This is largely due to the complexity and scale of the ‘wider achievement’ landscape. Consequently, attainment in traditional exams and evidence of social networks within relevant industries – usually fostered by a parent, family member or family friends - become far bigger determinants of a young person’s post school destination than the key capacities of attitude and aptitude which employers consistently say they need.

The lack of currency around ‘achievement’ awards extends to an extent into school and with parents. However, the challenge here is less about the awards themselves and more about how we use them in telling a more nuanced, accurate story about individual young people, their journeys and capacities. The first step in addressing this issue is to fundamentally review the current SCQF framework or at the very least the narrative that goes around it This review should be led by a consortium of employers, educationalists and parents with the express aim of generating credibility and currency in this area: the simpler the better. An overall, simple, credit based national achievement system, to recognise progress may be one way of developing a more streamlined approach. This should link directly into the evolving INSIGHT tool for performance measurement and analysis currently being rolled out nationally.

5. **Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.**

We have seen a significant increase in the involvement of the third sector in local authority early years services in Glasgow over the last 3 years, however, the primary focus of this has been work with parents and families, rather than with children. Third sector services have become key in supporting “family learning”, building parent confidence and self-esteem, supporting improved parenting skills and facilitating pathways for parents into further education, training and employment. Whilst not directly working with children, the positive impact for parents and wider family members leads to an improved experience for young children.

The third sector are particularly well placed to offer support of this nature, with greater capacity to spend time on building relationships with parents and to support the delivery of individualised programmes for families. They also often offer a route into mainstream statutory services which is less threatening for parents who may have a history of concerns arising from poor experiences in their own childhood – reaching families who the statutory services may struggle to engage.Long-term sustainability of such models, however, remains a significant issue as grant funders frequently focus on short-term 1-3 year funding with an expectation of new / innovative work being delivered. Whilst there is value in innovation, the core principles behind the delivery of quality family learning and support do not change and should be supported.

There has been almost no engagement with the private sector in early years settings to date. A first pilot programme is about to be established in the south of Glasgow with the charity Bedrock ([http://www.bedrockcharity.org/](http://www.bedrockcharity.org/)) who play a role in matching
up private sector organisations with early years services in their local area to explore what additionality may be found through such partnerships.
Summary of Includem’s evidence

Includem argues that young people are ready to learn when they are emotionally stable, with positive relationships in their lives and when they are encouraged and supported to attend school regularly. Based on our experiences we would encourage the Committee to look not only at interventions within school but at the targeted, home and family wraparound support that can be provided in addition to core school support for those young people who face the greatest barriers to active engagement with education. Attendance at school is inextricably linked to attainment.

About Includem

Includem is a charity which helps some of Scotland’s most vulnerable and challenging young people to achieve positive change in their behaviour and relationships and move towards leading fulfilling lives. We are there 24/7 and believe young people are never beyond help. By achieving better results for them, we also reduce public spending in the immediate and long term.

What Includem does

Includem is a specialist provider which works through commissioned arrangements to provide services for vulnerable young people and their families in their own homes and communities. We deliver targeted, personalised services out with school hours with one to one support at evenings and weekends alongside access to a 24 hour support framework.

Our work is focused on our experience that young people are willing to engage with education only when they are emotionally stable and they have positive relationships in their lives. By working in a targeted way not just with the young people but their families we can put in place a structure around school attendance and engagement.

The attainment gap in Scotland will not reduce with more in school interventions alone. To raise attainment resources need to be invested into improving child/parent relationships, child/school relationships and parent/school relationships. Identifying and addressing the underlying causes of why young people do not engage is fundamental.

The key elements of the programme are:

- Practical support to ensure school attendance such as reinforcing bed times, getting up routines etc;
- Proactive work with parents to set boundaries and manage difficult behaviour at home;
- Supporting young people to think about communication and relationships, managing their frustration, anger, emotions etc;
• Work with parents to access help for health, housing, finance and other problems which undermine their own parenting capacity and the young person’s family and home life;

• Work with parents on their attitudes to education and responsibilities – giving them the confidence to engage with education;

• Close working with pupil support services and other agencies and linking in with each school’s attainment and inclusion policy;

• Age and stage appropriate support for the child out with school hours which develops and reinforces attendance and engagement as well as confidence, motivation and ability to participate in school work.

A case study which highlights the importance of work ‘beyond the school gates’ to improve attainment is attached at the end of this briefing. Although the young person, Kenny, is 16 the lessons from his experience are relevant to interventions with children and young people of all ages.

Specific questions asked by the Committee

| The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities. | Our own experience is focused on providing tailored support outside the classroom. This is, in our view, an extremely important part of the scaffolding of support which is required for young people to engage with education and is often overlooked.

We believe young people will be willing and ready to engage in their education when their personal and family circumstances are in a healthy state, and this requires a change in thinking away from ‘dividing lines’ between parts of services towards a whole system approach. Attendance at school is inextricably linked to improving levels of attainment so this must be a policy priority.

Our work is completed in conjunction with schools complementing existing pupil support arrangements/approaches with appropriate information sharing across services. |

| Whether your approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, could your methods be more embedded in the curriculum. | For attainment to improve we need to consider more than simply the curriculum and resources within school and think about all the other aspects in young people’s lives which contribute to their learning journey.

Critical to the success of our work has been the referral process which ideally identify young people in need before the point of crisis. By getting behind previously closed doors we have been able to identify unknown problems which undermine crucial parental support for their child’s attainment. We would like to see all schools having access to this kind of service which builds on the work they are doing within the classroom. |

| Whether the full potential of the | The third sector should not be seen as a ‘top up’ to services |

The third sector should not be seen as a ‘top up’ to services
third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised.

provided by schools but rather as a sector which can provide specialist, targeted provision for young people most in need. Inevitably third sector organisations are limited in the scale of their projects by the funding available to deliver them. Our own project in Dundee currently has a waiting list with many more referrals than we are able to support.

Without funding for these targeted interventions, much of the experience and expertise in the third sector will not be fully utilised.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helpers deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications.</th>
<th>We cannot comment directly on how schools recognise wider achievement, however we would simply echo the points above, that achievement requires engagement, and without taking steps to engage young people in education they will not complete formal qualifications or engage in the wider education process.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Given the strong policy focus on the early years whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.</td>
<td>We support early intervention to avert crises and provide timely support to young people. However early intervention does not always mean early years, and we can evidence effective early intervention in young people of all ages which also has a significant impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**What Includem believes is required to close the attainment gap**

Whilst we would welcome any additional funding for and focus on raising attainment, it is important that the implementation of this policy focuses not just on the school experience but the whole approach taken to engaging children and young people in education.

What happens to a young person when they go home is fundamental and in Includem’s 15 years of experience working with families we know that a stable family life is critical to a young person’s personal development and to their educational achievement.

The June 2014 report¹ by the Social Mobility and Child Poverty Commission into the ‘Lessons from London’ research concluded that whilst the importance of encouraging early achievement in primary schools is evident, “we should not completely discount the role of secondary schools in sustaining achievements into post-16 outcomes”. We would echo this conclusion and in particular we would encourage more support for young people in the crucial and oftentimes challenging transition from primary school to secondary school and for services to recognise the importance of getting transitions right.

---

Finally, we would encourage the Scottish Government to **invest in measures at all ages** which will recognise and tackle the complexity and challenges of some young people who are most at risk of disengaging from education.

For further information please contact Michael Shanks, Communications and Policy Manager on 0141 427 0523 or michael.shanks@includem.co.uk.

**Case Study: Kenny’s Story**

Kenny was 16 when he was referred to Includem. He was a cause for concern for his school on account of his poor attendance (lower than 50%), frequent exclusions and a recent charge of breach of the peace in the local community.

Kenny was defeatist and unengaged. He believed he was never going to succeed at school and he had challenges at home – he was often the sole carer for his mum who had mental health problems and he had a challenging relationship with his dad. Neither of his parents offered him any encouragement to attend school.

Includem worked with Kenny to build up his confidence and to get him to think about his goals and ambitions. He worked through our cognitive toolkit, “A Better Life” and thought through all his relationships – good and bad – and what they meant to him. Through this work we supported Kenny’s mum and dad to think of ways they could engage better with him and both parents agreed to take more responsibility for his actions at home.

His negative behaviours were challenged head-on by encouraging his parents to set down boundaries. As a result of this Kenny started to get into more of a routine including thinking about homework, going to bed at reasonable times and getting up in time for school each morning. Both Kenny and his parents used our 24/7 helpline to reinforce these boundaries and to seek help before his behaviour escalated.

As his attendance at school improved we started to work constructively with the school to encourage him to become more involved in his classes and to take part in lessons. He prepared an exam timetable with our workers as part of thinking through his future plans.

After 38 weeks Kenny exited our services and he is now reengaged with education with much improved attendance and reduced late coming. He sat every exam he was enrolled in and has now attended a college interview showing his willingness to continue to engage in education beyond school. He has not picked up any further charges in the community.
Scottish Parliament's Education and Culture Committee

Sent by email: to ec.committee@scottish.parliament.uk

Session 2: Role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest

John Muir Trust response

Context

The John Muir Trust is the leading wild land conservation charity in the United Kingdom. Working with people and communities to conserve, campaign and inspire, the Trust is a membership organisation that seeks to ensure that wild places are protected and enhanced, and valued by and for everyone.

The Trust owns and works to improve some of the finest areas in the UK including Schiehallion, Ben Nevis and parts of the Cuillins on Skye. The John Muir Award was launched in 1997 as our main engagement initiative, helping people from all sectors of society to value wild places wherever they find them. Our core audience is aged from 10-16 (although all ages get involved), and the majority of organisations we work with – Award Providers – are schools (and outdoor centres).

The John Muir Award is an environmental award scheme focused on wild places. It helps people connect with nature, and enjoy and care for wild places. People use the John Muir Award to:

- help appreciate and value nature, urban greenspace and wild landscapes.
- encourage awareness, understanding and responsibility for wild places.
- promote personal development and well-being through outdoor experiences.
- recognise and celebrate achievements.

All of these aspects have been applied to school settings and to improving attainment. In particular, the John Muir Award is used effectively to support less academic pupils. A key rationale when it was set up was to help ensure that social or geographical circumstances don’t exclude people from opportunities to experience wild places. Every year, more than 25% of those who achieve the Award are from socially excluded backgrounds (this was more than 8,000 participants in 2014).
The John Muir Award is delivered in partnership through a number of diverse organisations and settings including schools, colleges, youth groups, adult learning and outdoor education centres.

Please answer some or all of the following questions and provide any other information you think may be relevant.

- the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Scale of involvement
The John Muir Trust produces an annual Education Report for HMie. This report highlights John Muir Award activity in Scotland’s schools. During Academic Year 2013-2014:
- 370 schools were involved in delivering the John Muir Award, including 13 special schools (increase from 284 schools last year)
- 12,494 Awards were achieved by pupils and teachers (24% increase from 10,108 last year)
- 3,080 pupils (25%) are from socially excluded backgrounds
(Ref: The John Muir Award Education Report - Scotland Academic Year 2013-2014)

The John Muir Trust is a member of the Awards Network – a forum of twenty three providers of non-formal learning awards in Scotland. We work together to raise awareness of the variety of awards available to young people aged 12 to 25 that use youth work approaches and are available throughout Scotland. Over 130,000 young people gaining recognised awards annually (www.awardsnetwork.org).

Improving attainment and achievement
Audit Scotland released an independent evaluation of school education, the School Education Report (June 2014) www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/work/all_national.php. The Report provides an assessment of pupil attainment over the last decade. The Report concluded that performance has improved against all ten of the attainment measures examined over the last decade. However, there is significant variation in attainment with regards to levels of deprivation. Closing the gap in performance between schools is likely to be critical to improving overall attainment levels.

The John Muir Award was referenced very favourably, particularly around pupil attainment and as an exemplar of wider achievement (Exhibit 13 & 14 - page 28).

Key School Education Report recommendations:
- develop more coordinated approaches to gathering and recording information on the range of wider achievement activities offered in schools.

The John Muir Trust is providing Award data directly to councils. Through the Awards Network the Trust is also involved with the development of Insight (senior phase benchmarking tool) with SQA, and other tools with Education Scotland to record attainment and achievement.
- fully assess the potential long-term impact on attainment and wider achievement of budget reductions

During 2015 we are evaluating the impact of the John Muir Award. This includes using the Scottish Government SHANARRI indicators on well-being, and measuring the impact the Award has on learning and teaching.
- develop and implement strategies to reduce the gaps in performance between the highest and lowest performing schools.

The John Muir Trust is proud that more than 25% of people who achieve their John Muir Award come from disadvantaged backgrounds. The Trust works closely with Scottish Natural Heritage and the Central Scotland Green Network targeting resources to areas highlighted by the Scottish Index of
Multiple Deprivation. The Trust has outlined how the Award is being used to engage young people from all backgrounds in ‘Inclusion, wild places and the John Muir Award’ report (2014) www.johnmuiraward.org.

The role of the John Muir Trust
The Trust administers the John Muir Award. The Trust offers advice and assistance to Award Providers – schools, youth clubs, Local Authorities, rangers, outdoor centres etc. – to help them integrate the Award structure with their own outdoor and environmental activities. This flexible, partnership approach is highly successful. We work alongside Local Authorities and charities in supporting 16+Learning Choices and Activity Agreements and are partnered with Community Learning and Development teams across 10 Local Authorities and confidently expect this to increase. We are referenced in, and support the emergence of, Outdoor Learning Strategies such as those developed by Edinburgh Council.

The John Muir Trust encourages people to connect with nature, and enjoy and care for wild places by aligning the framework of the John Muir Award with key social drivers, e.g.
- Curriculum for Excellence and the John Muir Award http://issuu.com/johnmuirtrust/docs/jma_curriculum
- Employability and the John Muir Award www.jmt.org/assets/john%20muir%20award/downloads/employability%20and%20the%20john%20muir%20award.pdf
- Five Ways to Wellbeing and the John Muir Award www.jmt.org/assets/john%20muir%20award/downloads/five-ways-to-wellbeing_a4_v3.pdf
- Inclusion, wild places and the John Muir Award www.jmt.org/assets/john%20muir%20award/downloads/inclusion,%20wild%20places%20and%20the%20john%20muir%20award.pdf

This alignment with National Policies and social drivers fosters a supportive partnership between the Trust, local and education authorities and other agencies.

- whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;

The partnership approach taken by the John Muir Award helps organisations and participants to engage, and have contributed to ‘improving achievement and attainment for school pupils’. The approaches used by the John Muir Trust are that the John Muir Award:
- is free to use (cost is a barrier to people getting involved) and inclusive
- is simple to use (by non-outdoor specialists too) and low on bureaucracy, and can be used alongside existing schemes, initiative, programmes and schools’ curriculum.
- offers a way of engaging with topics that some find daunting or inaccessible – sustainability, biodiversity, citizenship...
- can be used to link positive outdoor experiences to a range of themes – curriculum, healthy lifestyles, youth work, employability, wellbeing...

Teachers and educators embed the John Muir Award within curricular areas to deliver Experiences and Outcomes and to promote interdisciplinary learning. The Trust has provided examples of activity and topics that can help meet Award criteria in a dedicated resource, and supports practitioners with a series of on-line case studies.
• whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

The John Muir Trust values the support of a number of key agencies in Scotland, in particular Scottish Natural Heritage and the two National Park Authorities. These agencies recognise how the John Muir Award helps to improve and celebrate participant achievements.

The Trust continues to work with Education Scotland and individual Local Authorities to explore new and innovative approaches to grow John Muir Award activity and meet demand. The Trust predicts an annual increase of Award activity of 20% over the next three year period. Managing and supporting demand for the John Muir Award is a significant challenge for the Trust with its limited capacity.

The Trust notes the contribution of the members of the Awards Network to improving children’s attainment and achievement.

• how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;

The John Muir Trust agrees with Audit Scotland’s key School Education Report recommendations to:
- develop more coordinated approaches to gathering and recording information on the range of wider achievement activities offered in schools.

The John Muir Trust is providing John Muir Award data to councils through the annual John Muir Award Education Report.

Through membership of The Awards Network the Trust is involved with the development of Insight (senior phase benchmarking tool) with SQA. It should be noted that whilst the Awards Network welcomes the development of Insight as a tool that recognises a schools’ broad provision of learning beyond formal qualifications, the Network sees the limitations of this tool due to the requirement for learning programmes and awards to be the Scottish Credit and Qualifications Framework credit rated (Ref: letter from Awards Network ‘Insight for Excellence’ to Mr Michael Russell MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning, sent 24th June, 2014).

The Awards Network is encouraged to note that the Scottish Government and Education Scotland are developing Insight as “just one way in which information will be provided on wider attainment”.

• given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

The John Muir Award is open to all who understand and meet Award criteria. Generally this works best at upper primary level and above. The John Muir Trust sees growth in John Muir Award activity and outdoor learning in secondary schools and whole year groups.

All reports and references are available on request.

Yours sincerely

Toby Clark
John Muir Award Scotland Manager
John Muir Trust
Educational attainment gap - Role of the third and private sectors

Response from Kibble

The Committee will hold an evidence session on the role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest.

- the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;
- whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;
- whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;
- how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;
- given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages


The curriculum at Kibble has been designed to ensure all pupils get their entitlement in the Broad General Education up to S3, with appropriate personalisation to encourage depth of learning and motivation.

The four contexts of learning are promoted, delivered and celebrated - not just formal qualifications. This is visually demonstrated using a climbing frame from our Primary School service showing pupils climbing up through the curriculum across all four contexts – see attached.

As pupils make the transition from the BGE into the Senior Phase, individual plans/goals are set across the four contexts of learning which support the next transition from school into the workplace or further education. The positive destinations of Kibble School leavers are tracked.

Kibble has an array of integrated services from which pupils can benefit including KibbleWorks for vocational training, employability skills and work experience. All pupils – to a greater or lesser degree, depending on need – will access Kibble works during their Senior Phase.

Kibble recently opened ‘The Experience’ a leisure and hospitality facility which pupils will be able to access to support their transition into sustained, positive destinations.

Kibble has moved into the Primary sector with plans to increase its provision further in August 2015 with the opening of a new rural Primary School in addition to the present operational service.
Educational Attainment Gap
Role of the Third and Private Sectors

1. Introduction to LGBT Youth Scotland

LGBT Youth Scotland is the largest youth and community-based organisation for lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender young people in Scotland. Our contact details are noted at the back of the document. The evidence within this document comes from the organisation’s experience working with LGBT young people for over 25 years and from our consultation with LGBT young people.

2. Role of the third sector

The third sector complements formal learning by providing experiences and opportunities to young people that enable them to achieve: working directly with schools to support improved learning experiences and achievement, and outwith schools to prepare young people for achievement. The third sector’s role as an equal partner in the lives of children and young people is not fully recognised.

LGBT Youth Scotland has many partnerships with schools and education authorities and regularly provides support, guidance, and training for staff, as well delivering workshops and receiving referrals for pupils. When these activities are embedded into the school or local authority as proactive and preventative strategies: teachers benefit from increased knowledge of issues affecting LGBT young people; pupils receive more inclusive information; and, LGBT pupils have access to more integrated support. LGBT Youth Scotland’s Challenging Homophobia Together project ran from 2010-2013 and worked intensively in four local authorities to build their capacity to recognise, respond to, and prevent discrimination faced by LGBT young people. This approach included professional advisory groups, teacher training, a series of pupil workshops, improving connections with local youth groups, and youth-led initiatives. Evaluations evidenced positive change in LGBT young people’s experiences in the learning environment and increased staff capacity to deliver preventative work.
Strong partnership working, however, is not the norm across all local authorities. In many instances, schools only make contact when an issue arises: when young people need additional support or when staff do not have the confidence to deal with particular situations. Although our work in these instances benefits the individual young people and staff involved, there is unmet potential for improving the overall learning experience for pupils.

If pupils do not feel respected and included, they cannot be effective contributors, successful learners, confident individuals, or responsible citizens. Preventative work supports the goals of pupil engagement and achievement. The third sector has a clear role to play in preventative strategies within education.

Third sector youth work also supports young people who are disengaged from, or not thriving in, formal education. Experiencing homophobic, biphobic or transphobic bullying can lead to truancy or leaving education. More than half of the LGBT young people who had experienced homophobic and biphobic bullying believed that it had negatively impacted on their education, rising to more than 88% of those who had experienced transphobic bullying\(^1\). One in ten (10%) LGBT young people had left education as a result of discrimination in the learning environment. Fourteen percent (14.3%) of those who had experienced direct homophobic or biphobic bullying, and 42.3% of those who had experienced transphobic bullying, left education as a result.

Beyond the lack of qualifications, LGBT young people who have experienced discrimination can be less likely to seek further education, training or employment opportunities. This is a result of the impact of bullying on emotional, physical and mental health, as well as reduced confidence and fears of experiencing further discrimination. Our research shows that LGBT young people who had not experienced bullying were more likely to be seeking employment than those who had experienced bullying in education. This is also reflected in conversations with have with young people in youth groups and on a one to one basis; concern that potential employers will be discriminatory at the application, interview or employment stage. There are particular concerns raised by transgender young people in regards to

\(^1\) Lough Dennell, B.L. and C. Logan (2012). Life in Scotland for LGBT Young People: Education. LGBT Youth Scotland.
interviews and worries about being told to wear a uniform or clothing that does not reflect their gender identity.

‘I feel anxious about trying to one day find a job if I still do not look like I fit into the gender binary’.

Our work with LGBT young people in youth groups and participation projects creates a safe environment in which to develop skills—such as confidence and public speaking—that may be overlooked with a narrow focus on attainment, yet which are crucial in building a young person’s capacity and readiness for achievement in learning, training and employment. Third sector organisations work with young people to increase their resilience and skills, thus preparing them for further achievement. The value and scope of the third sector’s contribution comes across clearly in YouthLink Scotland’s written submission.

3. Focus on Equalities

A focus on equalities must recognise the impact that all forms of inequality will have on children and young people’s achievements and ensure that barriers are removed. Strong partnership between the public and third sectors should have a clear goal to address inequalities and explicitly mention each protected characteristic. This approach includes joint preventative work within education and building links with the third sector opportunities that increase engagement for disengaged or disadvantaged young people.

For more information, contact Brandi Lee Lough Dennell, Assistant Policy Director
0141 552 7425 brandilee.loughdennell@lgbtyouth.org.uk
• Our inclusive music project has tapped into the third sector through the charity attached to our school to fund music tuition and a music development officer post. This has had an undoubted impact on raising attainment. Children and young people with additional support for learning (ASL) needs now have access to many more high quality opportunities than they had previously. They have regular access to professional tutors and are learning drumming and singing, and regularly perform in public. Untapped talent is being realised and developed and this involvement in music is creating benefits and raising attainment not just in music, but in many other areas of the curriculum such as an increase in meaningful language and communication skills and improved health and wellbeing across many areas.

• The approach of many third sector organisations is useful in many ways in raising attainment because some ask for specific short and long term outcomes. This provides focus and requires careful thought and planning. They often require clear descriptors of the work to be carried out. Working in this way often helps to build a vision and framework for moving forward and can encourage ‘out of the box’ and innovative thinking. It is important however that these plans are not set in stone and that there is flexibility to respond to the lead of the young people involved.

• In my view the full potential of the third and private sectors in raising attainment is not being fully realised – there is much more to be done and gained from drawing on wider community experience, building partnerships and working together with external organisations. All the stakeholders can benefit from these partnerships and everyone’s horizons are widened.

• There is more to be done in recognising the value of third sector input in enabling pupils to have wider achievements other than exam results – this is especially crucial in the ASL sector of education where many talents and abilities are often missed and cannot be measured by examination. Just because a young person cannot sit a meaningful exam i.e. an exam that is going to lead to further education of their choosing does not mean they don’t have talent and ability that can be further developed as they enter adulthood. – leading to a meaningful adult life. Many of the parents of the children and young people involved in our project are appreciating that their child or young person has a talent and that their talent is being realised and developed through the opportunities afforded by the project - much of it funded by third sector organisations. Parents talk about the positive impact on extended families and the fact that they are seeing their child achieving things they never thought would be possible.

• We aim to ensure that our project reaches children from the age of two and a half right through to working with young adults after they’ve left school. Many young people with ASL needs only begin to realise their potential as
they are about to leave school. After school and as they enter their adult life the meaningful choices available to them are very limited.
Educational Attainment Gap
The role of third and private sectors
NDCS response to call for written evidence

The National Deaf Children’s Society (NDCS) welcomes the opportunity to contribute to this call for written evidence by the Committee on the issue of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest.

1. Background

1.1. The National Deaf Children’s Society (NDCS) is the leading charity in Scotland dedicated to creating a world without barriers for deaf children and young people. In Scotland, we have a dedicated team based in Glasgow led by Heather Gray, Director. The team has a strong focus on addressing the attainment gap that exists for deaf learners. This includes the work we do with our Young Campaigners who are a group of deaf young people aged 14-20 years old. They call for better services and campaign on issues affecting deaf children in Scotland.

1.2. Please refer to our submission dated 27 February for further background information about NDCS.

2. Context

2.1. Scottish Government data shows that there is a significant attainment gap for hearing impaired school leavers, and the attainment of this group is among the lowest of all pupils in Scotland.

2.2. In the 2012/14 year, the average tariff score of deaf school leavers was 289, while the average score for leavers with no additional support needs was 439. In the same year, almost 10% of deaf school leavers left with no school qualifications.

2.3. Deaf school leavers face a significant attainment gap in terms of their post school destinations and employability. According to Scottish Government data, 19% of deaf school leavers found employment upon leaving school last year compared with 25.5% of those leavers with no additional support needs. UK wide employment figures also suggest that only 58% of deaf adults are employed compared with 80% of the hearing adult population. As such, NDCS has worked in schools in ways to help raise employability of deaf young people.

2.4. The role of third sector organisations in understanding and meeting the unique needs of groups of pupils with additional support needs such as those who are
deaf can be valuable and their input can help make progress towards closing
gaps in attainment and achievement.

3. The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of
improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line
between their role and the role of education authorities; whether their
approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and
attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more
embedded in the curriculum;

3.1. The third sector may support schools and education settings to improve
attainment and achievement by delivering a number of projects, services and
programmes. The third sector can be particularly valuable with regards to
delivering these kinds of projects in relation to learners with additional support
needs, or where specialist knowledge or skills are required to meet their needs.

3.2. The National Deaf Children’s Society has worked closely with schools in a
number of areas on projects that contribute in different ways to improving
attainment and achievement for deaf learners. NDCS has works with schools to
deliver work experience opportunities for deaf young people at organisations
such as the Glasgow Science Centre and BBC Scotland. This has involved
NDCS staff supporting and preparing young people to attend, supporting travel
and offering organisations deaf awareness training so they gain basic information
and understand of the needs of young people on placement prior to their arrival.
The input of the third sector here increases opportunities for deaf young people
that may not have been possible otherwise and enhances their employability.

3.3. NDCS has also worked with schools to support post-school transitional planning.
In partnership with Skills Development Scotland and Donaldson’s School NDCS
developed the Template for Success Resource which is a toolkit for professionals
across sectors who are supporting deaf young people at the stage of their post
school transition. Professionals who have used this document have given
positive feedback about its value, however embedding the use of this document
consistently across schools is challenging and as a third sector organisation it is
difficult to ensure awareness of the document is raised. Promoting this resource
through formal channels such as Head Teachers Forums or staff in-service days
can be challenging. This is particularly the case given the raft of resources and
the competing priorities that teachers and schools are regularly faced with.

NDCS has sought a number of ways of engaging with schools such as building
relationships with teachers and professionals and packaging NDCS offers of
support through our Statement of Intent approach as previously outlined in our
evidence response dated 27.2.15. NDCS has sought endorsement of the
Statement of Intent at the highest level within local authorities in order to raise
awareness of the needs of deaf school leavers and embed good practice. The
impact of this endorsement can be very positive and there is scope to improve
how consistently this is achieved across Scotland.

3.4. Peer mentoring is an area where third sector organisations and schools could
work more closely together to support young people and help them achieve their
full potential. In terms of engaging with young people with additional support needs such as deafness, third sector organisations often possess the skills and expertise to take on peer mentoring roles, as well as facilitating opportunities for young deaf people to come together from across local authorities. This can offer young people a rare opportunity to develop a deaf peer group, which is particularly valuable given that many experience a level of social isolation within their own schools where they may be the only deaf young person. However, again, it can be challenging to develop and formalise opportunities to deliver peer mentoring opportunities. Where NDCS have been able to do so, for example through staff involvement in the MCR Pathways Programme for mentoring looked after young people, there are benefits for all involved including the schools and young people. There is scope to consider how to roll out programmes such as this one to other groups of disadvantaged young people.

3.5. The role of the third sector is valuable in offering education practitioners specialist training and information. NDCS offers teachers and practitioners a range of resources and training opportunities to help better support deaf learners. These include a range of quality standards in delivering deaf education in various education settings, an acoustics toolkit, a guide to assessments, phonics guidance, information about bullying as well as deaf awareness resources among others. NDCS also runs education workshops for education professionals on specialist topics such as morphology. Given their specialist nature these kinds of training opportunities and resources may not be available to education practitioners without the input of the third sector.

3.6. Another useful example of specialist training opportunities offered through the third sector is the NDCS Healthy Minds training programme. This programme was established in 2008 and aims to encourage young deaf people to use positive strategies for managing their deafness and developing their self-esteem and confidence. Since the resource was developed, over 3000 professionals and teachers have been trained. This is an excellent resource which when delivered to young people can enhance their emotional health and wellbeing. Those schools and teachers working with deaf young people have found this to be a useful training programme. However there is still much scope to embed the programme consistently into schools where there are deaf learners to ensure an equity of access of opportunity for deaf young people across Scotland. While the Healthy Minds programme has reached a large number of young people, there have been barriers in embedding the programme consistently across Scotland. In particular, it is difficult to include new material into an already full curriculum and where activities are extra-curricular, it is challenging to ensure young people are available and supported to engage.

3.7. The third sector can also provide impartial information and advice to schools, parents and young people which can promote better attainment and achievement. Through the NDCS support and advice services our support officers work regularly with families and young people to ensure they are informed and equipped to make the best decisions about their education. They can also work with education practitioners to consult of deaf awareness and distribute specialist education resources and guidance.
4. Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children's attainment and achievement is being realised;

4.1. As outlined above, there is much potential within the third sector to support the work of schools particularly in meeting the needs of groups of learners with additional support needs. There is a need to improve how schools work with third sector organisations in order to fully benefit from the services and programmes they have to offer young people and staff. In relation to recommendations within the Wood Report, NDCS recommends that schools are not only encouraged to develop ongoing partnership with private sector organisations an increased move towards more joined up working and partnership between schools and employers, it is logical to include third sector organisations within this recommendation from the Wood Report. This should be seen as part of a wider culture shift among schools where they are working in closer partnership across all sectors, drawing in the benefits these sectors can offer pupils in improving attainment and achievement.

4.2. Currently the structures by which third sector organisations can connect into local authorities are variable and could be strengthened. For example, Third Sector Interfaces (TSIs) are engagement platforms but the focus of their membership can often be on local organisations, as opposed to national organisations that deliver services locally. The extent to which education authorities engage is TSIs is also a variable picture across Scotland therefore they are not always the ideal engagement mechanism for the third sector to work consistently with schools and education services.

Children’s Hearing Services Working Groups are multi-sector groups which exist in every local authority to promote the best possible outcomes for deaf children. While these groups are recognised and endorsed by the Scottish Government they are inconsistent in their structures and membership across Scotland which makes them a variable planning and engagement tool for the third sector. Education Scotland’s Glow TV may offer opportunities in the future for the third sector to engage directly with schools however currently the understanding and opportunities to engage in this system are inconsistent. In order to maximise the partnership working and benefits the third sector can offer education services, it is critical that planning and engagement structures are strengthened so that clear pathways are understood and utilised by all partners.

4.3. The third sector can also play a valuable consultancy role whereby organisations can act independently and draw together best practice from across Scotland. NDCS is currently working in partnership with West Lothian Council through the re-design of its hearing impairment service. NDCS is able to contribute to this process by facilitating independent review of the service and collating best practice in the delivery of hearing impairment services from across Scotland to inform the Council’s decisions. The overall objective of this work is to ensure service delivery is meeting the best possible outcomes for deaf children and young people. This independent consultancy role of the third sector is one that could be further explored and embedded by education services in a way that will improve the attainment and achievement of pupils.
5. How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver.

5.1. Records of pupils' wider achievements are not consistently developed and monitored locally and nationally. The achievement of learners focus on exam results and qualification attainment – this is reflected at both national and local level. The only nationally comparative school attainment or achievement data that is routinely published is from S4 to S6. At any other level across school age children there are no comparative indicators consistently used across all local authorities or on a national level to monitor levels of attainment or progress being made on closing attainment gaps. This issue should be addressed on a national level as the data that is currently missing is critical to inform the national approach of Scottish Government in closing the attainment gap across all ages of learners. It will also be critical information for forthcoming Attainment Advisors in order to understand the progress being achieved in their local area in comparison to the national picture.

6. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;

No comments

7. Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

The strong policy focus in early years and early intervention can impact on the delivery of services in terms of education support being focused in those years. This is positive given the vital importance of support in the early years in promoting positive outcomes in a child’s life. In terms of support for deaf learners, NDCS has recognised that in some incidences hearing impairment services have to make difficult decisions with regards to allocating support within the context of limited budgets. In the context of a strong policy focus in the early years, support for deaf children and young people may be increasingly allocated in the early years, with less focus on for example post school transitions – which is another critical stage in the learner’s journey.

As outlined in the previous evidence submission dated 27.2.15, NDCS offers the Statement of Intent approach to local authorities to support better post school transitions for deaf young people. The Statement of Intent involves specific offers of NDCS support around three strands: promoting positive emotional health and wellbeing, improving post school transitional planning and facilitating effective partnership working. Not all schools and local authorities may have capacity and resource to work with NDCS to embed the Statement of Intent approach due to the allocation of resources at other stages in pupils’ progress through school. However, given the importance of post school transitions, and the current gap that exists for deaf learners in achieving positive post school destinations, this is clearly an vital area that requires further attention and increased partnership between education services and the third and private sectors.

For further information please contact:
Heather Gray
Director, Scotland
The National Deaf Children’s Society
2nd Floor, Empire House, 131 West Nile Street, Glasgow G1 2RX
Direct Dial: 0141 354 7857
Mobile: 07970 847398
Textphone: 0141 332 6133
Email: heather.gray@ndcs.org.uk
www.ndcs.org.uk
Educational attainment gap inquiry session 2:  
Role of the third and private sectors | NUS Scotland submission

Introduction
NUS Scotland welcomes this opportunity to submit evidence to the Education and Culture Committee’s ongoing inquiry into the educational attainment gap, focusing this time around on the role of the private and third sectors. For the purposes of this round of the committee’s inquiry we have focused on the general issues of educational attainment, including the role of the private sector and, specifically, our universities, each of whom in Scotland are registered charities, with one of their fundamental charitable aims being the advancement of education which we believe does not just extend to current students but also potential students.

In recent years, NUS Scotland and students across Scotland have achieved some extremely important campaigning and influencing successes, all of which contribute to ensuring that our post-16 education is more inclusive and equal. Tuition fees remain off the table for undergraduate students, university and college places have been protected (and indeed increased specifically for widening access and articulation), and we have seen significant improvements to student support, which we know plays a key role in supporting students into higher education and, perhaps more importantly, keeping them there. We have seen significant reversals of proposed college budget cuts, and maintained the Education Maintenance Allowance (EMA) for young people.

Most recently, outcome agreements, stemming from the Post-16 Education (Scotland) Act, have seen institutions required, as a condition of grant, to set ambitious targets for improving access and outcomes for students from our most deprived communities. In further and vocational education, there have been matched by a strong focus on improving the opportunities available to our young people through the work of the Commission on Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce. And, through the Scottish Government’s most recent legislative programme, we have seen a strong focus on the issue of inequality in Scotland, with clear proposals for how to ensure we do much more for those in poverty, with education at the heart of this. In particular, we have welcomed the creation of a Widening Access Commission.

However, while these developments are welcomed, more work needs to be done by the post-16 education sector, working in partnership with schools, sector agencies and, where appropriate, businesses, to ensure that young peoples’ education and employment destinations are not determined by their socioeconomic background. Ultimately, we want to see:

- Universities (and colleges) better fulfilling their legislation duties, through the Post 16 Education (Scotland) Act, by undertaking better targeted work on fair access, and ensuring that this is properly measured and evaluated to determine its impact.
- A clearer focus within education on not simply academic attainment, but also academic potential, with this recognised through alternative admissions processes.
• Increased articulation activity, with improved links and flexibility between schools, colleges and universities, as a means of offering alternatives pathways into higher education.
• A commitment to raising the minimum wage for apprentices across the UK and action from local authorities and businesses to pay a fair wage to all employees, including apprentices.
• Action from the businesses, local authorities and the Scottish Government on closing the gender pay gap within vocational education and apprenticeships.

The role of universities and colleges
In recent years, we have seen some encouraging developments in school attainment higher education entrants, and graduate outcomes—albeit at a slower pace than any of us should accept—supported in part by improving the flexibility between all parts of our education. This provides encouragement and support for the view that there is much more we can do across school, college and university to increase fair access for all of our young people, achieve by working in partnership. Across the period for which the most recent figures are available (2011/12-2012/13), for Scottish domiciled students, we saw:

• A 1% increase in university entrants from SMID 20% backgrounds (12.3%-13.3%)
• A 0.4% increase in university entrants from SMID 40% backgrounds (28.3%-29.4%)
• A 0.2% decrease in university entrants from SEC 4-7 (33.2%-33%)
• Modest, but encouraging increases in the proportion of school pupils from the most deprived backgrounds: staying on at S5 and S6; leaving with 3 A’s at levels 6 and 7; and, 5 or more A’s at level 6 and A-C at level 7.

This link between school attainment, destination and socioeconomic background is an injustice and a disadvantage to both individuals and the society at large. Our education system should tackle inequality, not simply reflect or entrench it. While much of the work to close the attainment gap will be undertaken in schools, this does not mean it needs to be schools themselves. We believe that further and higher education sectors also has a crucial role to play, working with schools. This would see even greater activity undertaken by universities and colleges with schools in this area than is carried out now.

The Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce (DSYW) report made useful recommendations regarding the need for an increasing overlap between further education and vocational training with schools. Too often employers, colleges and universities raise concerns that many school-leavers are not prepared for employment, or further or higher education. Thus, we welcome the call for increased involvement from colleges and employers in providing opportunities, information and support to school pupils. However, in order to mitigate the impact that the links between low attainment and socio-economic background has on education destinations, universities should match the increased engagement of colleges and employers by actively approaching school pupils and college students, with a particular focus on pupils from more deprived areas.

---

1 Scottish Funding Council, Learning for All: eighth update report on measures of success 2014
Universities in Scotland should be engaging more with their local schools and colleges, encouraging those that are displaying signs of potential to apply to the university and to engage with any bridging support on offer from the university. Going further, and giving a more formal, robust and automatic approach, to this could see schools, local authorities, colleges and universities working on a regional basis to share pupils’ exam results. This could work by students in each school within a local authority being ‘flagged up’ where they perform above a certain median point in exams, compared to their peers, especially where there is a cross match between higher levels of deprivation, judged either by free school meals or SIMD. This would serve to ensure they know their options and can engage with potential universities’ alternative admissions routes, bridging provision (summer school or access courses) or other widening access activity and equally to ensure universities proactively reach out to these students.

Key to achieving increased activity, and success, has been the creation of college and university outcome agreements; a key means of fair access being better talked about, targeted and, ultimately, evaluated. As NUS Scotland’s research report into fair access, Unlocking Scotland’s Potential², found, Scotland continues to have one of poorest rates of access to higher education in the UK for students from poorer backgrounds, with the progress we have seen largely coming as the result of increased numbers in college higher education. As such, a legislative standing for the outcome agreements was a key recommendation of Unlocking Scotland’s Potential. We have long believed that it is important to create a defined link between the public funding universities receive, and the public benefit they provide. All the evidence shows what happens to fair access when we don’t challenge ourselves to do more and go further. When we’re quite rightly investing hundreds of millions of public money into our universities, we must make sure they’re benefiting the whole of the public, and this is an opportunity none of us should squander.

The difference between attainment and potential
A key principle for NUS Scotland is that a gap in exam attainment does not mean the same thing as a gap in academic potential among school leavers. We believe young people need to be judged much more on their academic potential, not simply their academic attainment. We are very supportive of measures taken by universities to undertake differential offers through admissions systems, and to offer top-up of school grades, so that the underlying academic potential of people who have faced educational barriers is not masked by an exam results gap on paper. Contextualised admissions could go a long way to make universities admissions more equal.

Contextualised admissions are when universities take into account other life factors, usually including factors such geodemographic indicators, socioeconomic background, and school performance of the applicant. Ultimately, we believe that admission into higher education should be based on learning potential not solely on past performance. If we can improve our access rates, bringing those talented people into our institutions who are currently missing out on higher education—despite having the potential to succeed—this will be of huge benefit to our education sector, our country and our economy, ensuring that an individual’s talent not their school or background determines how far in education they can go.

For many institutions, differential and/or adjusted officers are a natural extension in the use of contextual data. Some institutions have prerequisites for making differential offers, such as participation in an access scheme, summer school, or the requirement to attend an interview. However, all institutions do this for the same reason: research has shown that those who have faced significant educational and social challenges can still hold the ability to succeed at university at the highest level, even when they have (comparatively) underperformed at school. Differential offers are clearly hugely important in ensuring those with the most academic potential gain places at our universities, adjusting offers to take into account the context in which grades were achieved.

It seems clear that Higher or A-Level grades cannot be seen in isolation from the school or the background of the applicant who achieved that grade, and this should be factored into admissions. Indeed if it is not, then we would argue institutions could be missing out on some of the most talented applicants. We want to see a higher education sector where access and success are based on genuine merit, so that it is those with the greatest academic potential who are given the precious opportunity of a place at university or college. It is our contention that there are large numbers of people with the talent, with the aspiration, and with the qualifications, that are missing out on a place at university, due to a lack of focus or best efforts. However, as Unlocking Scotland’s Potential showed, it is clear from best practice across the UK that by offering contextualised, differential, or adjusted, offers, we can ensure the recruitment of the most talented students and increase graduate attainment. Even more importantly, on the basis of existing evidence, far from lowering quality or being ‘social engineering’, alternative admissions processes can actually improve the attainment that a university’s students achieve.

Curriculum matching for smoother learning journeys

A key role for universities is to work with colleges to ensure that articulation agreements are working, that students can enter with previous education qualifications and access all courses. Articulation agreements have grown over the last couple of years between colleges and universities, which is a really positive indication of institutions beginning to work with each other, to ensure more individuals have an opportunity to access higher education. However, some universities are selective about the courses that students can articulate into. Through the regional hubs it has been identified that it is sometimes difficult to know what students have achieved in courses, and therefore limit courses to ones that make a direct match to courses offered at university; College Connect, at Glasgow Caledonian University, is an example of this. NUS Scotland’s Learning Journeys report found that students who entered through direct entry found settling into academic life the most challenging.3

To help avoid these challenges and to ensure that individuals have the most choice from the beginning of their studies, NUS Scotland believes that universities and colleges need to work even more closely together, so that higher national diploma and certificate (HNCs and HNDs) courses include core curriculum content that is transferable to other related subject matters. This is key to students who have not decided where their HN will take them when they complete the course. Some students who begin an HNC will know that they want to go to university, but many will not.

3 NUS Scotland 2013 ‘Learning Journeys students experiences in further and higher education’
It is critical, to keep in mind, when designing and delivering these courses that not all students are clear about their destination and need all options to be open to them.

With tens of thousands of students studying higher education in Scotland’s colleges, attracting greater numbers of college students to university should be a key way for all universities to improve their widening access rates. For many people taking a route straight from school into university simply won’t be the right one for them. We shouldn’t just accept that, but celebrate it and encourage it, as a distinctive element of Scotland’s diverse education system and an absolutely valid choice for the individual.

As our research report Unlocking Scotland’s Potential showed, students entering university through articulation were almost twice as likely to be from the most deprived communities in Scotland, compared to all university entrants. We can safely assume that many more of them could come from a looked after background, and provide those first steps towards a university degree. Just as importantly, the figure show clearly the much larger numbers of looked after young people who go on to further education college courses. Importantly, students who articulate also have a great record of success, as their drop-out rates have been shown to be lower on average than other students.

The above tables show the proportion of students entering university, via articulation, from the 20% most deprived communities, compared to all other entrants. Table 2 shows the retention rates for these two groups of students. Indeed, at times, retention rates have been higher for students from our most deprived communities. Clearly, if we’re going to get access right, we need to recognise that schools, colleges and universities all have a role to play. We’ve made huge ground on securing extra places and funding for fair access, and now we need to ensure the local efforts are in place to match that. Every university, from the newest to the oldest institutions, should recognise that working with colleges, and offering more chances to articulate, provides a huge opportunity to tackle our poor records on widening access.

**Table 1: Articulating students, by deprivation status**

![Table 1: Articulating students, by deprivation status](image)

*Source: Scottish Funding Council/NUS Scotland*
Fair pay in the private sector

Apprenticeships are a crucial part of the Scottish Government’s plan to improve life chances for young people in particular, but also for improving certain areas of the economy. The Scottish Government’s annual target for 25,000 modern apprenticeship new starts, is an extremely important one to focus on improving employment opportunities for our young people. In February 2015, it announced it was on target to exceed this target, with 78% of places filled at the end of the third quarter of 2014/15, with half the new apprentices aged 16-19, slightly up on the previous year. This is a very encouraging progress, and it is important that these apprenticeships deliver good quality experiences and, crucially, support for those undertaking them.

Apprentices get paid significantly less than the rest of those people in work, with the national minimum wage for apprentices is £2.73 per hour.\(^4\) We believe is hugely unjust, leaving far too many apprentices reliant on parental, guardian or friends’ support, working a second job in order to have enough money to live on, or taking on unreasonable amounts of commercial debt, as opposed to having their work and training commitments properly recognised and rewarded. Even more worryingly, official figures show that, in Scotland, last year 4.6% of apprentices were paid less than £2.49 an hour and 1.3% were paid less that £1.99 an hour.\(^5\) This culture of paying exceptionally low wages to apprentices has to change, so that apprentices are valued in their workplaces, and are able to pay for life expenses.

Equally, there are a number of worrying gender disparities within apprenticeships, and those which low pay are endemic are often those done by women. The difference in hourly pay between male apprentices and women apprentices in Scotland is £1.16 per hour (£6.61 per hour for men and £5.45 for women), meaning female apprentices earn 17.55% less per hour.

---

\(^4\) Business, Innovation and Skills Apprentice Pay 2014

\(^5\) Business, Innovation and Skills Apprentice Pay 2014

---
When we consider the inherent gender divide that remains within many apprentice fields, these figures are even starker. In the heavily male dominated field of Electrotechnical engineering, average pay is £10.10 an hour (£3.49 more per hour than the average pay of all apprenticeships). On the reverse of that, fields where women are more likely to apprentices, such as children’s care, average pay is £4.23 an hour; £2.38 less per hour than the average pay of all apprenticeships.

At the same time, those men dominated fields are more likely to see a pay rise. In the most recently available year, Electrotechnical apprentices saw a pay rise of 94%; children’s care apprentices saw a pay of 34%. Overall, Last year there were 462 apprentices in Scotland paid £1.99 P/H or less (1.3%) and 1636 apprentices in Scotland paid £2.49 P/H or less (4.6%). At the same time, 29% of women received a pay rise during their apprenticeship whereas 60% of males received a pay rise during their apprenticeship.

Similarly, there is a clear and pressing need on business and the private sector to do more to open up opportunities to all our young people, regardless of background or circumstances. One recurring and worrying example of where this too all often is not case is within internships. Internships are a valuable way for people who are at college or university to gain experience of the workplace and develop skills which enhance their CVs. NUS Scotland is firmly against unpaid internships, as unpaid internships require individuals to have money or family connections to survive while completing the internship. A recent YouGov poll showed that 53% of the population thought unpaid internships disadvantaged people from poorer backgrounds and the government should do more to ensure that these groups were benefiting equally from internships. A further 62% of people believe that interns should be paid at least the national minimum wage.

For more information, contact:
Philip Whyte, Senior press and policy officer
Philip.whyte@nus-scotland.org.uk

Megan McHaney, Policy and public affairs officer
Megan.mchaney@nus-scotland.org.uk

6 https://yougov.co.uk/news/2011/04/14/internships-are-unfair/
7 https://yougov.co.uk/news/2011/04/14/internships-are-unfair/
Dear Sir

Education Attainment Gap: Submission of Evidence
Section 2: The role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest

Please find below response from Renfrewshire Council in relation to the implications for schools, teachers and pupils of the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce.

Our response to the following questions were carried out in consultation with Engage Renfrewshire and the Renfrewshire Chamber of Commerce.

1. The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities:

The third and private sectors are involved in wide ranging engagement with Renfrewshire schools. The main purpose of this engagement is to inspire young people, provide information about progression pathways, to develop rounded individuals with the skills to contribute effectively in their communities and to adequately prepare young people for the world of work.

We must be clear that, although the private and third sectors can contribute to raising attainment and achievement, there is no accountability on their part when it comes to exam results. This responsibility currently lies solely with schools and local authorities. Therefore, although the third and private sectors can, and do, play an important part in the joint effort to raise attainment/achievement, it is done so by complementing the excellent work of teachers. Effective partnerships between schools and private and third sectors can help learners to make valuable links between their studies and the world of work. Learning is given meaningful context and purpose by role models who have the ability to inspire.

Renfrewshire Chamber of Commerce (RCoC) works with all 63 schools in Renfrewshire (primary, secondary, ASN and alternative provision), all schools are chamber members with access to events and curricular input.
Similarly the third sector involvement in schools is best illustrated by Engage Renfrewshire – the single access point for community action, volunteering and social enterprise in Renfrewshire – and member organisations. Engage Renfrewshire is engaged in the promotion of the value of volunteering and of voluntary opportunities and assistance with Saltire Awards (a national programme designed to recognise the achievements of young people).

2. Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils:

We have yet to explore the full impact of these activities, however there are some examples of young people moving to a positive destination as a direct result of these partnerships. There is a growing number of young people being involved in the Saltire Award, Youth & Philanthropy Initiative and Young Enterprise.

The approaches have been successful in preparing young people for the recruitment process i.e. CV building and interview practice and reinforcing the expectation of employers. However, there is no research to evidence a direct link between these activities and young people making the transition to positive destinations. The SLDR has increased by 1.8% as a result of many approaches, including partnership working.

3. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum; whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children's attainment and achievement is being realised;

Effective and relevant partnership working between schools and the third and private sectors should be embedded in the curriculum to help meet a series of aims. This enables learners to understand the importance and value of curricular activity and the skills they are developing; providing career and progression information; and helping young people to become responsible citizens with the ability to build positive relationships. The local authority continues to work with schools in improvement planning and involving partners in the planning and delivery of curricular activities that have a positive impact on achievement and attainment. In particular we are investigating how the third and private sectors could become more involved in mentoring and/or target setting based on ambition and aspiration. There is also the potential to demonstrate how CfE outcomes and experiences are used in everyday life and business.

In the context of community planning the third sector plays a vital role in supporting a range of curriculum support.

4. How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils' wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver:

Schools are committed to reporting on wider achievements and this is done using a variety of methods. Currently a local authority group is exploring positive engagement with parents, including all aspects of reporting and profiling. The RCoC magazine devotes column inches to wider achievements, especially where links to the world of work are a main feature i.e. Renfrewshire Recruit. Engage Renfrewshire recently requested that a school assembly be held to award an S6 learner with a Saltire Summit Award in recognition of this achievement. Local Authority Reviews and HMie inspections across establishments highlight good practice in this area.
5. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications; given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

We are developing a culture where parents, employers and learning providers value a combination of formal qualifications and wider achievements. Even those with a very academic focus require opportunities to develop their skills for life and work. A recent consultation with all learners in S3-5 and their parents on WCS' school/college courses has shown a move towards valuing more vocational options and HNC courses featured prominently. Work continues to be done in this area.

There are a number of ongoing opportunities for the third and private sectors to work with young people of all ages in Renfrewshire establishments. However, more like-minded role models are required to help inspire our youngest learners and advance the equalities agenda.

Opportunities are developing for extending and enriching work experience. In particular, pupils in S4 undertaking National 4 qualifications are given opportunities to work in a range of areas with employers and third sector organisations. These are proving to be valuable and helping to support transition to sustained destinations.

Our early years strategy works across community planning partners and includes a range of third sector organisations to work in partnership with us to deliver early years strategic outcomes.

I trust this is helpful to you.

Yours sincerely

[Signature]

Peter Macleod
Director of Children's Services
Submission of consultation notes to The Education and Culture Committee

‘Education and attainment gap’ in Scotland: Session 2 Role of Third and private Sectors

A response on behalf of Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland (RSE YAS) for consultation on the role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest

Specifically,

- the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;
- whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;
- whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;
- how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;
- given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

Note:

The authors would be happy to contribute in further detail at the follow-up focus meeting at the Committee’s request.

---

1 Director of Teaching and Learning, Glenalmond College; Contact via Lesley Campbell at Royal Society of Edinburgh (lcampbell@royalsoced.org.uk)
2 School of Social Work and Social Policy, University of Strathclyde
3 School of Physics and Astronomy, University of Glasgow
1.0 The Opportunities for the Third Sector

1.1 Poverty and the achievement gap

Much research has demonstrated the critical link between poverty, educational attainment and achievement, which significantly impacts on children’s opportunities and outcomes into adulthood. The so-called ‘achievement gap’ between children from poorer backgrounds and their more affluent peers is a major factor in hindering social mobility in the Scottish society. Currently, 1 in 5 children in Scotland or 220,000 children live in poverty, many in households in which at least an adult is working (McKendrick, 2014) Evidence from the Growing up in Scotland study (Bradshaw, 2011) shows a clear link between children’s social class and their educational achievement from the youngest age. At age 5, compared with children whose parents have no qualifications, those with a degree educated parent are around 18 months ahead on vocabulary and 13 months ahead on problem-solving ability.

At the age of 3, children whose parents have low or no qualifications, are already behind their more advantaged peers in terms of social and emotional development. Furthermore, the gap between children in the top and bottom social classes is getting wider as children grow older. These findings suggest that before children enter school, their chances of achieving well academically and securing well paid employment later on in life are already substantially different, depending on the social class they were born in.

Differences in parents’ education and disposable income also mean that, for children of school age, extra-curricular activities after the school hours or during holidays vary. More affluent children are again at advantage, as their parents can afford culturally and educationally enriching activities after school, such as visits to museums, sports activities or other leisure (Horgan, 2007). Support through involvement of parents in completing homework are more common in middle class families (Crozier and Reay, 2005) and homes become thus a natural extension of the school activities. At community level, areas of deprivation are often blighted by limited play spaces, unsafe parks and poor quality services. These discrepancies in the quantity and quality out-of-school activities children can afford and are available locally mean that educational opportunities that children from different social backgrounds have outside school are remarkably different.

Parents also differ in their aspirations and attitudes in relation to the value of education, often linked to their own experiences of education and educational achievement (Goodman and Greg, 2010). Research shows that middle class parents are more likely to demand good quality services and participate in school activities, while lower class parents feel less confident to do so (Crozier and Reay, 2005). This is despite the fact that parents and children of all social classes believe in the
importance of education and the opportunities it offers. However, parents from poorer backgrounds realise the multiple barriers that get in the way of their children’s success and their ability to help them (Sime and Sheridan, 2014).

The factors above mentioned may explain why the academic attainment of poor children at secondary school is much lower than that of their more affluent peers. In Scotland, for example, in the exams children take in their 4th year at secondary school, at the age of 15-16, the scores of children living in the most deprived areas are almost half of the tariff scores of children living in the least deprived areas (130, versus 238). Thus, children from more disadvantaged areas do less well academically and poverty is for many children the source of their academic underachievement. Low achievement has also an ethnic dimension, with certain ethnic groups (for example, Roma and Gypsy Travellers) scoring considerably worse in exams than other ethnic groups. Roma and Gypsy Travellers are also more likely to report incidents of bullying and racism at school. However, other ethnic minority groups, like Indian and Chinese children, do much better than all other groups, including White children, which suggests that ethnicity on its own is not a risk factor.

After young people leave school, the inequality in educational achievement leads to long-term limitations in terms of other opportunities, such as going into higher education or finding well paid employment. On average, poor children are more likely to leave school early and with no qualifications than their better off peers (Scottish Government, 2011b). Within the OECD countries, Scotland has one of the highest proportions (about 13%) of young people in the 15-19 age group not in education, training and employment (the so-called NEET group), with most of them coming from deprived backgrounds and having no qualifications. No overall progress has been made in the last decade in reducing the number of the ‘more choices, more chances’ (MC2) group, as they are known in Scotland (McKendrick, 2014). This also means that in terms of access to higher education and better employment prospects, children from better off families are again at advantage.

1.2 Some limitations of the education system for learning

Determinants external to the education system evidently have a significant contribution to the educational outcomes of young people and yet it is these very variables that the education system is relatively powerless to manipulate. The variable nature of the quality of teaching and learning in schools has received much attention and comment in the academic literature (e.g. Claxton, 2011), as have the curricula macro-structure and content of education (e.g. Peal, 2014; Mortimore, 2014).
Guy Claxton (2011) argues that the traditional model for educational systems, that of developing basic knowledge areas and predetermined competences along with leadership traits and morality, has been largely superseded by the ‘character curriculum’: “...countries around the world have recast the aims of their curriculum in terms of desirable skills and traits” for learning. This is particularly relevant in Scotland with the phased introduction of the *Curriculum for Excellence* and its implications for both classroom teaching and assessment at a national level. The *Curriculum for Excellence* explicitly states that the curriculum should promote the ‘value of learning’ and ‘promote high aspirations and ambition’ for its pupils, yet the mechanisms to achieve this in disadvantaged areas remain unclear.

Such structural changes to education cannot hope to redress the disparity caused by social inequality and the direct implications for young people’s learning. Some of the most notable implications of socioeconomic deprivation, other than the direct material limitations for schooling, include parents’ lack of knowledge, skills and confidence in supporting their children’s learning; young people’s lack of opportunities in deprived areas for engagement in educational enrichment and extra- or super-curricula education; families’ limited social, economic and cultural capital more generally and the ‘know-how’ to support young people in reaching positive destinations; disillusionment with education as a means to be ‘tested’ or ‘assessed’ (Audit Scotland, 2014). The outcome of these characteristics is low-level engagement and investment in education by those without the cultural capital to support it. As White (2007) notes “it [is] difficult for many children not from a middle-class background to adjust to a highly academic school culture”. The net effect of this maladjustment is often an attritional relationship with schools and teachers, that serves to provide a long term negative feedback in educational outcome.

1.3 What do we know about interventions that work in tackling the attainment gap and is there scope for increased third and voluntary sector involvement?

Closing the attainment gap for Scotland’s most disadvantaged children and young people is crucial to ensuring a more equal and fair society. However, the solutions and interventions that can lead to this are not straight forward, and interventions advocated by successive Governments are not always supported by evidence. A close examination of the London Challenge initiative, for example, shows ‘a complex mix of successes, missed opportunities and variable impact’ (Chapman, 2015).
Some of the approaches for which the evidence indicates more convincing results in helping overcome disadvantage include:

- **Leadership and highly trained staff**
  Investment in school leadership in disadvantaged areas and highly trained schools staff, preferably at Masters level, has been shown to translate into increased aspirations for children and young people’s attainment, more sustained and evidence-based interventions, teacher effectiveness and increased changes of overcoming disadvantage. Effective leaders have also been shown to work more successfully with community planning partnerships, local agencies and businesses to improve young people’s access to opportunities and address families’ needs more holistically (Hutchings et al., 2012). In this sense, there is scope for third sector collaboration and involvement in schools, for example, through models of successful leadership which could have transferable elements to schools and mentoring of school leaders.

- **Incentivising schools to take in pupils from disadvantaged families**
  Given that children and young people from disadvantaged backgrounds are more likely to be faced with complex barriers to learning, schools must be recognised for their substantial efforts in supporting children and families overcome disadvantage and engage successfully in learning. Investments such as a *pupil premium* fund which takes into account the number of children identified as coming from deprived backgrounds would provide schools with incentives and support required to develop interventions required. Reviews of successful initiatives show that all successful programmes were accompanied by targeted funding (Sosu and Ellis, 2014). The model of ‘catchment area’ recruitment currently promoted in Scotland has become divisive in many areas, as ‘good’ schools acquire a good reputation which trigger increased house prices in the area and thus lead to socio-economic segregation by place and postcode. Given the expertise and resources available in the third and voluntary sector, there is scope for schools to develop more sustained links with other organisations and increase sources of funding and partnership working to better support the most disadvantaged pupils.

- **Funding and giving schools freedom in using this for tailored interventions**
Context-specific, intensive interventions, which take into account individualised and localised needs have been shown to produce results in terms of helping tackle underachievement (Hutchings et al., 2012; Sosu and Ellis, 2014). These are not always transferable and generalised interventions may be counter-productive and resource-intensive. Schools should be supported in developing their own interventions, tackled at their own population needs and building on local strengths and resources. In this sense, third sector partners might be interested in sponsoring interventions or working with schools to pull expertise and resources to develop tailored initiatives.

- **Engaging parents early and whole-family approaches to learning**
  Despite some interventions aimed at raising pupils’ and parents’ aspirations, evidence is not convincing that initiatives aimed solely at tackling aspirations work. Parents and young people do not lack high aspirations, even when living in poverty. What they often need is increased confidence in their own skills and ‘know-how’ on supporting their children’s learning, for example, by reading and engaging in literacy activities together, making learning enjoyable from a young age and talking about learning as a positive feature of family life. Given the time and commitment required in gaining families’ trust and building confidence, there is clear scope for more involvement from third and voluntary sector in developing joint family programmes with schools to target interventions early and at the most vulnerable and prevent the need for complex interventions later on.

- **Giving parents confidence and skills in supporting their own children**
  Evidence suggests that interventions aimed at raising parents’ and children’s aspirations or changing parenting styles do not work in isolation. The vast majority of parents do not lack high aspirations, but they learn to adjust their children’s and their own expectations when confronted with difficult socio-economic circumstances (Sime and Sheridan, 2014). As parents from disadvantaged backgrounds often report poor experiences of schooling and low confidence in their own skills to support their children’s learning (Ghate and Hazel, 2004; Crozier and Reay, 2005), working with parents from early on to engage them in learning activities with their children can lead to increased confidence and more positive attitudes towards learning activities. There is clear scope here for collaboration with voluntary sector organisations, especially those with expertise in supporting families in a non-formal environment.
• **Challenging teachers’ attitudes and support their motivation to raise attainment**

It is important that teachers’ own attitudes are challenged when it comes to successes expected in areas of deprivation. The focus on improving teaching and learning at all levels should take into account teachers’ own core beliefs and understandings on how poverty impacts on children’s and families’ ability to engage with formal education. Judging and stereotyping families and young people is often reported as a major cause of disengagement by both young people and parents. Opportunities for teachers to engage in relevant training and joint programmes with third and voluntary sector organisations could be created through co-funded programmes and better mechanisms for sharing skills between sectors.

• **Interventions to support young people’s social and emotional learning**

Often, young people from disadvantaged backgrounds report social, emotional and behavioural (SEB) issues, which can pose significant barriers to learning. Initiatives such as counselling in schools, ‘nurture’ groups or mentoring can help young people overcome the significant challenges that SEB issues can pose when engaging in learning. With limited funds for targeted support in schools, for example through initiatives such as ‘nurture classes’, there is scope for more sustained involvement of volunteers and charitable organisations to support young people in and out of school and increase their resilience and self-confidence, to put them in a better position to achieve.

• **Mentoring for young people, as a source of role models and information on routes to higher education and other positive destinations**

There is some evidence that mentoring, especially by highly trained, experienced mentors, can help young people overcome barriers and challenge lack of confidence or self-doubt (Cummings *et al.*, 2012) and has been used successfully in other areas, for example rehabilitation of young offenders. Some interventions, which have matched mentors with young people, to improve their motivation, confidence, knowledge of a specific sector or general knowledge on accessing positive destinations, have reported significant results in increasing attainment. Third and voluntary sectors would be ideally placed to source mentors and engage with children and young people in schools and beyond.
1.4 Towards a role for the Third Sector in tackling the attainment gap

The challenges for the education system in terms of tackling the large disparities in outcomes are complex and require wider interventions and mechanisms for support. Systems are required to identify children who are at risk early in the education life cycle; there are still weaknesses in terms of data available to school staff, and local authorities should have to develop mechanisms of monitoring deprivation levels through Single Outcome Agreements and clear mechanisms to ensure that staff in schools and other services have access to accurate data and information. Staff often rely on their own professional intuition and informal knowledge of the area and families’ situation and they say ‘they know’ the families who are most vulnerable. This informal approach to identifying young people is commendable, but not always reliable, as families move in and out of poverty or hide their circumstances due to perceived stigma. Evidence suggests that the earlier the point of intervention provides greater scope for continued support and development. Families and young people can be provided resources and ‘know-how’ in relation to the learning support needs that are so prevalent in young people from disadvantaged backgrounds (Bradshaw, 2011). Much of this work can be achieved through schools and social support systems. Initiatives which have encouraged parents, for example, to read with their children from early on have been shown to reap results in terms of attainment in literacy and increased confidence later on in school.

In many ways, however, it is the relative deficit in social and economic capital that is harder for schools and teachers to respond to. As noted by Sime (2013), a key challenge for teachers and schools attempting to address the disparity in educational outcome is to find genuine ways for parental and pupil engagement and to challenge parents’ and children’s low confidence in their ability to succeed. Young people growing up in affluent regions benefit from sustained cultures of high aspiration and the continued reestablishment of the need for academic endeavour. High aspirations in disadvantaged areas, however, are undermined by histories of underachievement (Goodman and Gregg, 2010), material restrictions on involvement with extra-curricular activities, or even by a prevailing perception that school and home values are in direct conflict (Crozier and Reay, 2005). This difference in levels of engagement and aspiration can lead directly to the standards of both pupils and, in some cases, schools and teachers, being lowered until the ‘soft bigotry of low expectations’ (Gerson, 2014) becomes endemic.

The Curriculum for Excellence provides excellent opportunities for successful collaborations between schools and third and voluntary sector organisations. There is scope for experts to contribute to teaching in schools, not only in terms of curricular material, but also in terms of relevance of learning
to work-based practice and scope for applications beyond school. Third and voluntary sector representatives can also act as mentors for head teachers, teachers, parents and young people.

Schools also need more opportunities to develop their knowledge and expertise in developing evidence-based initiatives, sharing good practice and tapping into alternative sources of funding. Key agencies from the third and voluntary sector could share expertise and work with schools to build on existing good practice and develop a more collaborative, innovative and resource-effective approach to developing interventions.

One key aspect that third sector organisations can contribute to is the more effective use of modern technologies in making the curriculum even more relevant and accessible to young people and to help tackle the digital divide. Third sector organisations could help broker and support actions across fields such as school, work and community, and help young people use technologies in more effective ways to identify opportunities for learning, training and education beyond school. Although most young people have now direct access to mobile technologies, evidence suggests that young people in deprived areas tend to use these mainly for entertainment and communication purposes, rather than to access information for learning or work purposes (Facer, 2012).

The Third Sector also provides an opportunity to bridge the gap that exists between schools and the environments where education and learning is applied; to address the disconnect that limits many young people’s perception of education and stops them seeing how their learning can be usefully employed both for society and for their own benefit. The third sector can provide the framework to take disadvantaged young people with relatively limited opportunities in local communities and expose them to environments and workplaces that make clear their potential and the significance of their educational outcome. Some exemplar schemes that are currently being managed by the Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland are outlined below.
2.0  Case Studies from RSE YAS for Third Sector involvement

Below are four simple examples from a range of initiatives that have been designed and implemented by members of the Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland in recent months. The examples used focus specifically on how the third sector can contribute to nurturing educational aspiration and engagement in academic enrichment activities for the secondary education age group.

2.1  RSE YAS Journal – neonEidos

neonEidos is an open access, peer-reviewed online journal founded in 2014, currently managed by the Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland. It provides a publication forum for academically gifted young people and was founded to nurture potential and aspiration.

Many projects managed by neonEidos generate open dialogue between academic reviewers and school-age people on the research projects they have become involved in. This has often allowed neonEidos to establish university visits, invitations to use university facilities, such as laboratories or libraries, visits to commercial partners, collaborative follow-on research, work experience opportunities and many other chances for young people to establish links with higher learning and to raise the expectations and ambition in education.

The scheme is increasingly being used by teachers in a focused way to promote the work and aspirations of individual pupils from otherwise challenging backgrounds. In schools that do not have a culture of extra-curricular engagement or an aspirant outlook to tertiary education, schemes such as neonEidos have served to nurture belief in the application of their studies. This initiative has also been applied to good effect to develop young people’s confidence in their own potential and to establish links and experiences with universities and commercial environments from a relatively early point. In its first few months neonEidos has worked with over 25 schools to find ways to promote and develop the work of disadvantaged young people; this has included organising seminar events at major universities and in directing the work of three young people to the mainstream academic literature for publication. In effect, neonEidos serves to provide the mentoring support, the cultural and aspirational context, and the logistical means to access a wide range of extra- and super-curricular academic enrichment that schools cannot offer.
2.2 RSE YAS Aspirational advice campaign
Through an ongoing RSE YAS initiative, major commercial and academic institutions are using simple photo messages from high profile staff to share short aspirational messages and a hashtag to draw support for young people. The scheme is designed to open up young people’s horizons to opportunities that are available to them and to, specifically, impact a number of key areas: exam results and academic aspiration, employability, physical health, mental health, citizenship and community cohesion.

Between 5 January 2015 (the day schools return from holidays) and 28 April 2015 (the first day of Scottish schools exams), RSE YAS is asking all Scots to share a piece of advice to Scotland’s young people that will help them raise their academic and career aspirations as they enter the final stages of school level education.

Links:
Twitter #AspirationalAdvice @YoungAcademySco
Facebook: Young Academy of Scotland

2.3 RSE YAS Numeracy Counts initiative
Part of the remit of The Young Academy of Scotland’s Excellence in Education Working Group is to "draw upon YAS expertise to develop teaching resources that enable teachers to make full use of the interdisciplinary possibilities of CfE [Curriculum for Excellence]". The ‘Numeracy Counts’ initiative, working within the Numeracy curriculum area, utilises the broad multidisciplinary nature of the YAS membership to show how numeracy matters in the everyday lives and work of Scotland’s emerging leaders from the disciplines of science and humanities, the professions, the arts, business and civil society. The scheme was designed to focus on sharing knowledge and the dissemination of scholarly research (and its underlying data) to wider audiences, and the engagement between school pupils with industry and academia. A wide range of short films are now available on line which highlight the
role of numeracy in RSE YAS members’ daily work. These have been made available to teachers and students to support “Numeracy across Learning” within the CfE.

Through this resource learners and teachers can find out, for example, how Cardiologist Marc Dweck uses numeracy in the diagnosis and treatment of heart attacks, discover how astrophysicist Catherine Heymans uses spread sheets when buying a new mobile phone, or how Subramanian Ramamoorthy, Reader in robotics at the University of Edinburgh, uses mathematics to calculate the probabilities of events that help to guide autonomous robots through crowded streets.

The RSE YAS are currently expanding the range of videos to cover the areas of “Sciences” and “Technologies”, with the aim of expanding across all CfE areas. This will be enabled by the unique skills and capabilities of YAS members, which cuts across all areas of scholarly research, business and third sector organisations.

The ‘Numeracy Counts’ initiative provides a view for young people beyond their school context to understand the real value of mathematics and its everyday applications in the world of industry and academia. The largest user group of the service to-date has been teachers who want to contextualise the content of their lessons and demonstrate real-world application. This is an otherwise challenging aspect of teaching and represents a critical step in rationalising the importance of learning for young people in social contexts that are otherwise effectively culturally dislocated from academia and industry.

Links:
http://www.youngacademyofscotland.org.uk/numeracy.html

2.4 RSE YAS Research the Headlines

‘Research the Headlines’ is a blog managed by RSE YAS members that addresses the way in which research is discussed and portrayed in the media. Each post takes recent media coverage of a piece of research as a starting point, and allows readers to get to a better understanding of what was really done, and what it might mean for them, from an expert but independent position. The blog is intended to be of interest to those with and without any training in research.
The contributors to ‘Research the Headlines’ are all members of the Royal Society of Edinburgh’s Young Academy of Scotland. As with other initiatives, the largest single use group of this facility has been school teachers applying the knowledge and expertise to draw links between school education and its wider application. Again, this is a central challenge for schools and teachers dealing with young people who do not otherwise enjoy the enduring benefits of culturally-reinforced support for learning.

Link:

http://researchtheheadlines.org/
3.0 References

Scottish Chambers of Commerce (SCC) comprises some 26 local Chambers of Commerce across the length and breadth of Scotland, with a combined membership of around 11,000 businesses, of all sizes and from all sectors. With a local presence in every part of Scotland, Scottish Chambers of Commerce is the nation’s largest, most engaged and representative business network.

SCC welcomes the opportunity to contribute to the Education and Culture Committee’s inquiry into the educational attainment gap, focusing on the role of third and private sectors.

1.0 Chamber Engagement

1.1 The chamber network has been actively working alongside schools, colleges and local authorities, bringing forward a voice for business in their local communities. There is a clear requirement for a widespread overhaul of the linkages between the education system and business. 2014’s report by the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce is a starting point for this.

1.2 A step-change is required in terms of attitude and culture to move towards a more flexible and innovative system; one which works in collaboration with businesses to build and develop our workers of the future.

1.3 SCC believes there is a need for improvement in the delivery mechanism, and that the chamber network is best placed to take a lead in the regional Invest in Youth Groups which were outlined in the 2014 report by the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce, giving businesses both responsibility and accountability.

1.4 SCC is pleased with the establishment of the first two Regional Invest in Youth Groups led by Aberdeen and Grampian Chamber of Commerce, and Glasgow Chamber of Commerce.

2.0 Success of Private Sector Involvement

2.1 Within the chamber network there are various examples of strong programmes developing and proving to provide successful linkages within the Youth Employment and Skills Agenda topics. Some examples of which have been detailed below:
2.2 West Lothian Chamber of Commerce and Mitsubishi Electric have been working in partnership to bring closer together industry and schools with the aim of supporting young people in developing skills beneficial to their future development.

The ‘Pump It Up’ Heat Pump Design Challenge grew from Armadale Academy’s forward thinking approach to investing in their pupils, and their community, which has now been rolled out to all 11 high schools in West Lothian. This partnership enabled:

- Students get to work on a project related to environment and renewables.
- Students develop a better understanding of Science and Technology involved in “Green” Energy
- Students having an exposure to industry.
- Recognition of the brand Mitsubishi Electric
- Community visibility of Mitsubishi Electric supporting their schools and school children’s education
- Support in local community by using local marketing suppliers

2.3 Glasgow Chamber of Commerce facilitated the development of the Youth Employment Action Group (YEAG), which set out 13 recommendations to support an increase in the number of young people (age 16-24) accessing and sustaining employment, while improving the efficiency and competitiveness of the city’s business sector.

The blueprint was created by key representatives of the Glasgow Employer Board and included individuals from some of the city’s most well-known businesses and organisations, with Network Rail, Microsoft, The Weir Group, Boots, City of Glasgow College, GTG, NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde, LPL Telecom, Scottish Water, Marriott, Scottish Power, Two Fat Ladies, Laing O’Rouke, Gorbals Healthy Living Initiative and Murray Recruitment all taking party.

Divided into five main themes, the report made recommendations to combat the issues around youth unemployment. The city’s main stakeholders (Glasgow City Council, Jobs and Business Glasgow, Skills Development Scotland and Glasgow Chamber) were invited to make a response to the employers’ findings within six weeks, followed by a debate at the Glasgow Employer Board. The YEAG was formally acknowledged in the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce final report as an exemplar.

2.4 Ayrshire Chamber of Commerce were successful in setting up the Chamber Youth Academy (CYA), which provides support to 16 to 19 year olds who have faced barriers in the past to develop work-based skills and attitude. A key element of CYA is that local employers play a
leading role in the delivery of the programme elements and are able to impart young people their knowledge, giving them the skills and attitude employers are looking for.

During the two weeks the young people are exposed to various activities themed around team building, confidence, communications, goal setting, and customer services and through hands on ‘Apprentice’ style experiences entrepreneurial & real business challenges.

After completing the two weeks they are allocated a mentor for six months who will ensure the ‘wish’ list compiled over the two weeks is being progressed and therefore has a better chance of being achieved. At the closing celebration event the young people give a presentation on their experience and the ‘winning’ team presented with their awards.

Business challenges range from having stands at B2B exhibition selling products they have ‘pitched’ for to in store product promotions where sales are monitored.

Several companies have offered guaranteed interviews to young people who have completed CYA and we post their profiles on Chamber website for potential employers to view.

2.5 Renfrewshire Chamber of Commerce piloted the programme HireMe which adopted a Canadian Model designed to build the confidence that young people have about their ability to gain employment. The programme gave young people a better understanding of the core competencies identified by employers.

HireMe not only helped learners build a quality CV, but also aided their understanding of the often complex nature and demands of the interview process. Additionally, it aimed to develop a better understanding of the role social media plays within the recruitment process today.

3.0 Increased Private Sector Involvement- Work Experience

3.1 Work experience speaks volumes to employers. The optimum model sees students undertake work placements, relevant to their skills and accredited as part of their course, that also help the host business.

3.2 A new model of work experience should be adopted which offers a structured work experience programme, developed by both industry and education, in which the businesses offering work experience are given the opportunity to grade a pupils progress. This will give employers responsibility and accountability.

3.3 This model should include a modern standard which outlines the requirements which must be met to ensure high quality work experience placements. While many directly vocational courses have an ‘in industry’ element to them, this is not the case for other subjects; SCC is keen to work with the education sector to support expansion of this, whereby businesses
work alongside schools and universities to make young people more employable. Scotland’s businesses need the skills, whilst integration of work experience into the education system is essential for employers, young people and education providers.

3.4 The inclusion of an in-industry or business work experience programme starting from S1, which forms part of the pupil’s curriculum, and is recognised with an accreditation that has been created in collaboration with both business and education must be introduced. This would provide pupils with a qualification when leaving school which shows that pupils are work ready, and have had quality work experience.

4.0 Increased Private Sector Involvement - Vocational Education

4.1 As over 50% of Scottish school leavers do not go to university, it is essential that our education system is designed to support those young people who wish to pursue vocational training or education.

4.2 The recommendations by the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce highlight the need for schools and colleges to embrace a true partnership with business in order to ensure effective forward planning in terms of demand for skills that will deliver for both young people in terms of employment and businesses in terms of growth. This approach has the full support of the Scottish Chambers of Commerce.

4.3 SCC believes that in order to help close the educational attainment gap, the private sector must place a significant role in the development of vocational education which includes:

- A key focus being placed on ensuring that all levels of apprenticeships are promoted amongst young people, with an emphasis placed on skills shortages and economic need.
- Implementation of a Modern Apprenticeship incentive package, as recommended by the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce to reduce the cost of employing apprentices for smaller and micro businesses.

5.0 Private Sector Involvement - Careers advice

5.1 Despite a huge focus recently from both public sector policy makers and the business community, we still see some industries reporting recruitment difficulties due to skills shortages – notably ICT, energy, engineering and tourism. This indicates that we are not, in Scotland, doing enough to encourage young people into studying for qualifications in these disciplines – qualifications that would result in jobs with good career progression prospects.
5.2 We acknowledge the efforts being made by Skills Development Scotland on this agenda, but believe that more needs to be done to ensure that Scotland’s careers services fulfil the needs of young people and of business.

5.3 SCC believes that a reformed Careers Service in which business and Skills Development Scotland work closely to achieve effective forward planning that ensures skills shortages in STEM subjects are clearly understood and met. By working together, businesses and Scotland’s career service can help Scotland’s young people make informed career decisions. This reform should include:

- Increased number of business led class talks throughout the academic year.
- All teachers should complete an enterprise workshop delivered by business.

Scottish Chambers of Commerce
Economic Development Intelligence Unit
March 2015
Educational Attainment Gap—Role of the third and private sectors

The Scottish Council of Independent Schools (SCIS) welcomes the opportunity from the Education and Culture Committee to provide evidence on the role of the third and private sectors in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils within Scotland. Most SCIS member schools exist as charities or not-for-profit bodies so appreciate, and have first-hand knowledge of, the central role the third sector plays in raising educational attainment. Our schools are also active in their local communities in terms of sharing facilities and staff resources, and supporting partnership work. A number of member schools also provide early learning and childcare through nursery provision as partner providers to local authorities. Our member schools recognise that activities outside the classroom are an integral part of the overall educational experience of their pupils; these include sport, voluntary work and outdoor education. These will include the use of stand-alone outdoor facilities such as those offered by the Outward Bound Trust. Many independent schools offer opportunities in these areas which make a significant contribution to the attainment of pupils. These are embedded within independent schools’ curriculum and individual child development. Additionally, through the provision of access to school buildings for sports, learning and community groups at no cost, or nominal, non-commercial rates, our member schools assist others groups in raising attainment.¹

Opportunities in outdoor education provision allow pupils to excel and feel achievement in an area outside traditional school-based assessment. SCIS provides support in this type of education provision through the provision of Continuing Professional Development Courses which cover Outdoor Learning in both primary and secondary environments.

One area where member schools have focused on pupils’ wider achievements is in sport. Our schools provide a wide range of activities to pupils, and the many parents who regularly attend sporting events their children are involved in demonstrates that they value this too. The Scottish Government promotes increasing children’s involvement in exercise through its inclusion in the Curriculum for Excellence and the Active Schools programme. The value placed on sport within the independent school sector can be seen through, for example, sustained sporting activity in later life or the representation in sport at a national level by independent school pupils.

A further area in which independent schools promote achievement in partnership with the third sector is through voluntary work; both through pupils volunteering personally in the community and through fundraising activities undertaken by whole

¹ Our schools provide assistance within their communities in a wide range of ways. For more information on the wide range of activities supported by member schools see http://www.scis.org.uk/assets/Uploads/Facts-and-Statistics/Community-List.pdf
schools or year-groups. This work can take the form of fund-raising and providing equipment to causes overseas – including partner schools, or partnership work with local community care or additional support needs providers.

School trips are also one of the many ways in which pupils can feel achievement outside of academic exams. Whilst on trips pupils are fully supported by school staff but the experience on the trip will also increase the independence of a child and nurture their confidence and feelings of achievement. SCIS recognises that school trips play an important role in pupils’ attainment and recognises the importance of ensuring these are carried out in a safe and secure matter. SCIS therefore provides a number of Continuing Professional Development Courses which cover Schools Trips, their preparation and safeguarding.

SCIS schools welcome the opportunity to share views on the role of the third and private sectors in raising attainment and would be happy to debate any of the issues raised further, or welcome the Committee to individual schools.
Educational Attainment Gap - Role of the Third and Private Sectors

Parliamentary Inquiry

Response by Scottish Film

Scottish Film Ltd is a consortium of Scotland’s leading cultural cinemas, film festivals, and cinema development agency. It manages the Scottish Film Education Programme, which is working alongside Into Film in developing and delivering the Scottish component of the BFI’s UK-wide 5 to 19 Film Education Programme. This aims to transform the position of film education within formal and informal settings across Scotland. The Programme has the following aims:

- To put film and moving image education where it belongs on the learning agenda: in the curriculum (in principle and practice) and as an integral element of children and young people’s learning in both formal and informal settings;
- To ensure that every child and young person has access to film and moving image learning experiences: by increasing reach, depth and inclusivity of provision, including currently under-served communities across Scotland;
- To broaden young people’s experience of and appetite for a wide range of film, and contribute to audience development;
- To improve the quality of film and moving image education in every context;
- To ensure that the film and moving image education “offer” is as straightforward as possible for both educators and children and young people to understand, navigate and access.

The Scottish Film Education Programme is funded by Creative Scotland

The contributors to this submission have been involved for many years as part of a wider movement in developing the role of Film and Film/Moving Image Education within Scottish schools, colleges and universities not only to develop a wider concept of what it means to be literate in the 21st century, but also to overcome some of the constraints of what is still a heavily print-focused curriculum that can serve to stifle creativity, engagement, self-confidence, self-expression, achievement and attainment. This is particularly evident with respect to the less able and the least advantaged.

Much of the evidence base that this submission will refer to stems from the long term development work undertaken and/or supported by Scottish Screen, before it Creative Scotland.

In terms of the promoting greater engagement in Film Education and Moving Image Education, the third & private sectors are well represented in Scotland by a variety of bodies and groups, albeit presenting an often-confusing plethora of acronyms. There is a growing body of evidence that Film Education and Moving Image Education supports the ambitions and capacities of Curriculum for Excellence.

The list below gives an indication of the main agencies involved in promoting greater engagement in Film Education and Moving Image Education in Scotland:

The Scottish Film consortium members are:

- Centre for the Moving Image, (Filmhouse, Edinburgh; Belmont Filmhouse, Aberdeen; Edinburgh International Film Festival)
- Dundee Contemporary Arts (including Discovery Film Festival)
- Eden Court Theatre & Cinema
• Glasgow Film (Glasgow Film Theatre and Glasgow Film Festival)
• Regional Screen Scotland

Scottish Film Ltd is also responsible for managing the BFI Film Audience Network Programme in Scotland, which operates as Film Hub Scotland. This is also funded by Creative Scotland.

BFI Film Academies in Scotland are provided by;

• Screen Education Edinburgh (SEE): East of Scotland, Highlands & Islands and the Scotland Residential Academy
• Station House Media Unit (SHMU): Aberdeen, North East Scotland.
• Glasgow Media Access Centre (GMAC): Glasgow and West Scotland
• Dundee Contemporary Arts (DCA): Aberdeen and Tayside.

Scottish 5 – 19 Film Education Programme (Joint Delivery)

• Scottish Film Education: Funded by Creative Scotland
• Into Film: Funded by BFI.

In addition to the core staff of the above agencies, a body of Film & Moving Image Lead practitioners supports the teaching and learning in school, youth and CPD contexts. They are drawn from a mix of educational and film industry backgrounds and bring with them a wealth of relevant experience and insight. The majority of these individuals are self-employed and a number of them are running their own businesses in various branches of the creative industries. As such they inject an element of entrepreneurialism into the learning experiences they support.
Educational Attainment Gap - Role of the Third and Private Sectors

The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

- While we have an overview of the Third sector’s contribution to education within our own field, this does not extend to other spheres of activity and therefore we are unable to comment upon what overall impact that this broad and diverse sector may be having on attainment and achievement.
- In addition, we unaware of any systematic tracking and quantification of third sector involvement in schools. Perhaps this suggests that tracking the scale and impact of the third sector involvement is something that should be addressed.
- The suggestion that there may be an “appropriate dividing line between the third and private sectors’ role and the role of education authorities raises questions of its own. Does a shared vision of an appropriate dividing line, held in common across all 32 Local Authorities currently exist? If so, does it arise from a natural or reasoned demarcation or is it simply rooted in an historical context, perhaps harking back to earlier policies or attitudes?
- We would suggest that, in the current climate where public services such as education are under pressure and subject to significant cuts, it would seem logical that local authorities should be seeking to engage more widely with the third and private sectors to bolster provision in areas that they do not have sufficient in-house capability to deliver.
- This suggests that Local Authorities and individual schools, should be seeking alternative local solutions, based on their particular needs, rather than applying some notional norm.
- The recent report by Graham Donaldson “Teaching Scotland’s Future” (2010) pointed quite explicitly to the need to develop new and better models of partnership. The Donaldson report focused primarily on developing enhanced partnership arrangements between local authorities and the teacher education universities. However, while the report also made passing reference of the need for, and benefits of, involving other/national agencies, it did not go on to identify which agencies, and to what specific ends.
- Much of what Scottish Film aims to achieve through the CPD activity that forms the main thrust of the 5–19 Film Education Programme, has been designed to dovetail with the conclusions and subsequent ongoing implementation of the Donaldson report.
- Rather than seeking to provide a pre-planned national menu of set CPD offerings for each individual category of stakeholder e.g. primary teachers, subject specific groups of secondary teachers, classroom assistants, learning support teacher, specific cohorts of ITE students, and University ITE tutors, the programme team will negotiate locally an integrated approach to CPD within individual clusters of schools. Each cluster will comprise of a secondary school, and all its feeder primaries and engage the full range of stakeholders associated with that cluster as detailed above.
- This approach is less about dividing lines and more about the third sector engaging with schools at a local level, within existing local management structures to develop and extend their capability to support themselves a local level on an ongoing basis. The aim is to engage with such clusters over a two-year period to develop self-sustaining expertise and capability within communities of practice that will continue after cessation of programme funding.

Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;

- With reference to Film Education and Moving Image Education, the answer is a resounding yes, and this is not merely the view of those in the third sector who have taken it upon themselves to promote these new and exciting approaches to learning and teaching. Successive evaluations going back more than a decade provided by pupils, teachers, teacher educators, student teachers and Local Authority staff have consistently reported that Film Education and Moving Image Education, while not trying to establish itself in the curriculum as yet another subject, nevertheless offer a new set of pedagogical approaches that support the
learning of pupils from across the ability spectrum and provide routes to learning that chime very clearly with the aspirations of a Curriculum for Excellence.

- In 2009 Carey Bazalgette, formerly head of education at the British Film Institute, was commissioned by the then Scottish Screen to summarise existing research regarding the impacts of Moving Image Education. The executive summary of her subsequent report, now getting on for six years ago, still makes for persuasive reading in the context of this Parliamentary call for evidence. This being the case we are reproducing the executive summary in full as follows:

**Executive Summary**

Evidence about the impact of moving image education (MIE) is still emerging and is relatively limited. There has been no large-scale research on this topic, and although the research field is growing, the limitations of funding and the diversity of practice on the ground mean that making comparisons between different studies is risky.

Nevertheless, the 14 recent studies that form the basis of this summary do offer some useful indications about the distinctiveness of MIE and its potential to make a substantial contribution to learning and teaching. Each of these studies identifies four or more of the following seven ‘generic impacts’:

1. Learners’ enjoyment and sense of achievement.
2. Disaffected or underachieving learners showing engagement and concentration.
3. Increased motivation, confidence, and self-image.
4. Increased attainment in literacy.
5. Increased skills in collaboration and teamwork.
6. Increased knowledge about, and interest in, making moving images.
7. Increased interest in watching and talking about moving images.

However, these impacts closely mirror those found in a wide range of research and evaluation on cultural interventions in education. To make the case for MIE as a distinctive and worthwhile aspect of education, it is important to be able to identify impacts that are specific to MIE. Although most of the research that has the potential to offer these tends to be small-scale and short term, it has the advantage of depth and detail, and can thus offer important insights on the learning processes involved in MIE, which do indicate distinctiveness and a high level of relevance to other aspects of the curriculum, particularly literacy. Five ‘MIE-specific’ impacts are identified in this summary. It seems that MIE can:

A. enable access to a distinctive, culturally important, non-verbal mode of expression and communication (i.e. the moving image);
B. provide previously failing or excluded learners with access to the curriculum;
C. offer different routes into key literacy concepts;
D. give learners a sense of agency and autonomy that supports self-image and confidence;
E. build bridges between ‘home’ and ‘school’ cultures and knowledge.

A brief overview of the parallel but differently prioritised field of research into the impacts of ICT in education suggests that versions of MIE are frequently present in what is designated ‘ICT education’ but are misrecognised by both teachers and researchers in this field, due to their focus on technology rather than on texts and textual practices.

The summary concludes with recommendations on further research that Scottish Screen might wish to be involved in, and on changes to its education practice in order to ensure sustainability and larger-scale implementation.

© Scottish Screen 2009

The eight studies referred to above were as follows:

- An evaluation of a pilot project to place digital video editing equipment in selected schools in England.
- An evaluation of a pilot project to establish filmmaking in schools in Ireland.
- An evaluation of Scottish Screen’s Teacher Education Programme.
- An evaluation of Scottish Screen’s MIE Projects.
- An evaluation of the British Film Institute’s initiative to train MIE leaders in 60 local authorities in England.
- A study of learning outcomes from a BBC project to enable news production by 13/14 year olds in UK schools.
- An evaluation of a Scottish Screen MIE project for young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs).
In the intervening period since 2009 further research has been undertaken and further projects and initiatives have been evaluated, again with similar conclusions:

- E.g. (2010) “Investigating practitioner perceptions of moving image education in relation to a curriculum for excellence”, University of Glasgow. This piece of research led directly to a collaboration between Creative Scotland and Education Scotland to produce the on-line classroom literacy resource “Screening Shorts”, available via GLOW to all Scottish Schools, as is the growing on-line provision of digital Film and Moving Image resources that is accessible in classrooms and other places of learning across Scotland.

Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

- If no one is specifically tracking, quantifying and evaluating the level and impact of involvement then there is no ready answer to this question. However, given that Scottish schools are not currently awash with partners from the third sector, it is probably safe to answer, “probably not”.

- Something that should be kept in mind when considering the success of Film Education and Moving Image Education is that amongst those involved from Creative Scotland, the Cultural Cinema Venues and the Lead Practitioners, there is a core of individuals who have an education background and who have had years of experience working in partnership with schools, local authorities, and colleges. This represents a major difference in comparison to other third sector or private sector bodies, who would not have had this experience.

How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;

- The moving image, now firmly welded to digital technologies that facilitate copying, transmission and screening is a natural for wider public engagement. Researchers report regularly that “Outcomes are improved when filmmaking and analysis are closely integrated, and when filmmaking is for ‘real’ audiences.

- Pupil’s wider achievements in film and moving image are celebrated regularly in public with audiences of parents, employers and learning providers either in schools or else in actual cinema venues. This was the case in the Future Learning and Teaching Project centred around Brechin, Angus some years ago. That event was attended by the actor Brian Cox whose presence provided a real boost to the self-esteem of the young film-makers and also emphasized that household names were prepared to come out and give their time to recognise the achievements of young people. That approach is maintained by the BFI Film Academies at their annual celebration of pupils’ work on film. The Film Festivals and other events hosted in the cultural film venues also do this, for example, in relation to the Understanding Cinema initiative at CMI, Edinburgh.

- A more elaborate variant of this occurred, again at CMI, in 2014 in relation to “McLaren 2014”: a project celebrating the life and work of Norman McLaren through a range of public exhibitions, screenings, academic exploration, and public engagement. It explored his international impact and highlighted his legacy to Scotland through providing a series of animation workshops. It had been agreed that the best way to reach a wide audience for these workshops was to split between school workshops specifically designed for primary school children and public workshops opened to wider audiences, i.e. families, adults, teenagers, etc, working alongside each other.
Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

- While reference has been made to the 5 – 19 Film Education Programme, the decision to focus on that particular age range was made at a UK-wide level and not here in Scotland. It has already generated a degree of discussion as to why it was not cast as 0 – 26, but it stands, at least for the time being.

- In terms of the broad span of potential third and private sector partners, it may well be that many would not instinctively gravitate to the early years end of the spectrum. This tendency might arise from the viewpoint that potential employers are more interested in the senior phase as they are the young people who will be entering the employment market soonest.

- However, so far as the Film Education and Moving Image Education is concerned, the early years represent a fascinating stage of development when young children of pre-reading age can follow, enjoy and make perfect sense of moving image texts, with or without dialogue.

- Not only that, but there is also interest in investigating and researching the possibility that early level moving image education can have an enduring impact on very young learners.

- This was the hypothesis behind a piece of research carried out by Aberdeen University, which in 2011 followed up a previous intervention that had taken place in 2006 with a group of who had been in nursery/P1, and who were then in P5/6.

- This was a sizable undertaking and too rich to try to condense in this context however, one of the conclusions arrived at represents a neat way to end this submission:

  “The positive emotional responses displayed by the children [P5/6] and their ability to draw on and enthusiastically share a vast array of memories to successfully complete the project strongly suggests that their early years MIE experiences were key learning experiences for them, that they had retained skills and knowledge from them and they valued and treasured them.”

  (2011) Mairi Flood – Lead Practitioner in Moving Image Education in conjunction with Angus Council's Maisondieu Primary School and Creative Scotland. Evaluated by the University of Glasgow.
Submission to the Education and Culture Committee on the Attainment Gap – The Role of Third Sector Providers

Please find attached a report produced by the Association of Heads of Outdoor Education Centres (AHOEC) in Scotland. AHOEC membership includes Third Sector providers of residential experiences as well as private sector and local authority providers. The report was produced in large part to highlight the ways in which the residential experiences make significant contributions to both Attainment and Achievement.

Since the report was produced, recognition of the potential of the residential experience to improve attainment has continued to grow among teachers. This can be gauged from feedback, for example,

“The Royal High School has been using Dounans Centre to provide an outdoor residential learning experience with all our S1 pupils for the last five years. We keep going back as the people make it an outstanding experience. The leaders, instructors, cleaners and catering staff go out of their way to get it right for every child. In partnership with our school staff we are able to provide an experience which positively impacts on pupils’ skills for learning, life and work.” Residential course leader, Royal High School, March 2015

It may also be seen in emerging patterns of residential centre use by schools. For example, there is a significant increase in the number of Maths Study weekends. Some focus on their own revision and others intersperse their work with ‘chill-out’ activities. However this growth trend is occurring largely through word-of-mouth among teachers who attribute improvement in attainment to the study weekend.

We also have evidence of the effectiveness of the residential experience in triggering changes in behaviours away from those that impede learning. We can refer to a Social Return On Investment analysis (SROI) by independent consultants who looked at one class of 25 pupils in which two pupils had restricted their diet (eating only toast or crackers respectively) and one who was self-elective mute in school. During their residential stay, two started eating a wide range of healthy food options and the other started talking to teachers and singing in the shower; the teachers quipped they couldn’t shut her up if they wanted to.

Of course they didn’t because the pupils had been taken out of school on a regular basis to see either dieticians or psychologist over a period of 6 year with no noticeable improvement.
In fact, we see young people like this nearly every day at our Centres. We see the changes too. It is partly for this reason that the consultants undertaking the SROI determined that every £1 spent at SOEC results in over £11 of benefits. This is a high ratio.

However it also made us consider how SOEC, as a Third Sector organisation and Children’s Charity, can be instrumental in bringing about such remarkable changes. Our opinion is that we are able to combine 3 factors:

1. We develop specialist outdoor tutors, to identify and focus on the outcomes sought in CfE, and develop in young people the qualities, skills they need (such as confidence, team work, resilience etc.) both in the group and as individuals within the group;

2. We devise and deliver outdoor programmes and use adventure activities that are exciting and motivating for young people; and

3. We provide multi-day experiences in safe and nurturing away-from-home places – our residential Outdoor Centres.

In fact, there is a fourth factor – a young person’s innate ability to change. But it is the residential experience that can so effectively create the conditions in which young people feel confident enough to make their own changes.

These behaviours are barriers to learning and can be extremely tenacious. They concern both teachers and parents. The residential experience can help overcome them and in doing so, young people are in a much better position to focus on their studies; an essential precursor to addressing the attainment gap.

Yours sincerely

Dave Spence
Chief Executive
Inquiry on the Educational Attainment Gap - Role of the third and private sectors - Education and Culture Committee

Written Evidence from the Scottish Youth Parliament

Background to the Scottish Youth Parliament

The Scottish Youth Parliament is the democratically elected voice of Scotland’s young people.¹ Our vision is of a stronger, more inclusive Scotland that empowers young people by truly involving them in the decision-making process.

Among the strongest youth representatives structures of its type, we provide young people with a democratic platform to affect change, based on a mandate, by facilitating engagement with key decision makers.²

In working towards our aims, we support the following values:

- **Democracy** - All of our plans and activities are youth-led, and we are accountable to young people aged 12-25. Our democratic structure and the scale of direct participation across Scotland give us strength and set us apart from other organisations.

- **Inclusion** - We are committed to being truly inclusive. The Scottish Youth Parliament believes that all young people have a right to a voice; it doesn’t matter who we are or where we come from. We celebrate our diversity.

- **Political independence** - We are independent from political parties. Only by working with all legitimate political parties can we make progress on the policies that are important to young people.

- **Passion** - We believe that drive and energy are key to successful campaigning. We are passionate about issues and believe that young people are part of the solution, not the problem.

¹ The Scottish Youth Parliament is comprised of 160 Members of the Scottish Youth Parliament who meet three times a year in national sittings to represent the views of their constituents by selecting campaign priorities, formulating policy and participating in Subject Committees. In the last Scottish Youth Parliament national elections, 67,000 votes were cast. In addition, there were almost 43,000 responses to the consultation on your 2010 youth manifesto, “Change the Picture”. You can find out more information about SYP here: [http://www.syp.org.uk/who-we-are-W21page-66](http://www.syp.org.uk/who-we-are-W21page-66).

Summary of Recommendations

- The Scottish Youth Parliament places significant value on the involvement of the third sector and the private sector in relation to achievement and attainment. We believe that the third sector in particular provides significant opportunities for achievement and attainment outwith the formal curriculum.

- The Scottish Youth Parliament believes that, while there are excellent examples of best practice across Scotland, the relationship between the third sector and education authorities could be significantly strengthened, with the third sector having more involvement in schools for the purposes of improving achievement and attainment.

- The Scottish Youth Parliament believes that the implementation of the recommendations from the Commission for Strengthening Scotland’s Young Workforce presents a real opportunity for a strong partnership approach to delivery, which, we believe, will remove barriers to participation and achievement.

- The Scottish Youth Parliament believes that there is a need to address the perception of wider opportunities for achievement and attainment, and that such opportunities need to have a parity of esteem with the formal curriculum.

- The Scottish Youth Parliament would support the development of a robust system for reporting and measuring attainment and achievement through a wider range of opportunities, which we believe would have a positive effect on attainment.
Introduction

The Scottish Youth Parliament welcomes the opportunity to submit written evidence to the Education and Culture Committee’s inquiry into the educational attainment gap in Scotland. In addition, we further welcome the Committee’s decision to give specific focus to the role that the third and private sectors play in closing the educational attainment gap.

Educational attainment, and its impact on child and youth poverty, is a key area of focus for our current national campaign, POVERTY: See It Change It. 3 We fundamentally believe that addressing the current gap in educational attainment is crucial to eradicating child and youth poverty. 4

In our view, the nature of the relationship between education authorities and the third sector, including elements of youth work delivered through other local authority structures such as Community Learning and Development, should be one of collaboration and mutual respect. Young people need to be exposed to variety of opportunities and experiences alongside their formal education. Such experiences support their wider development, and have a positive impact upon attainment and achievement. 5 This was heavily emphasised in the School Education report from Audit Scotland that noted that the factors that impact on attainment and achievement have expanded considerably beyond formal education. 6

Fundamentally, we believe the third sector and the private sector play a significant role in the delivery of these opportunities, as well supporting the delivery of other elements of the formal curriculum. For example, we believe these sectors should play an important role in the delivery of the Wood Commission proposals.

We note the recent report published by Scotland’s Commissioner for Children and Young People, entitled “How Young People’s Participation in School Supports Achievement and Attainment,” which acknowledges the positive impact that pupil

---


involvement and participation have on achievement and attainment. This report provides an empirical evidence base to support the view that participation and involvement in a wider range of opportunities have a positive impact on attainment and achievement, particularly where strong links with the community, facilitated by the third sector, exist. However, deprivation can act as a significant barrier to the ability of young people to avail of these opportunities.

As such, we believe the third sector is well placed to work in partnership with education authorities and schools to tackle the educational attainment gap by providing more structured and effective links with the community. However, we believe the relationship between education authorities and the third sector could be significantly strengthened and made more systematic so that this potential is fully realised, especially in light of the challenging funding situation faced by local authorities.

**The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities**

It is difficult to assess the scale of involvement of the third and private sectors in schools given the decentralised nature of decision making and resource allocation in relation to education in Scotland. However, we note from the evidence submitted by YouthLink Scotland that National Youth Work Voluntary Organisations, including the Scottish Youth Parliament, work with 385,000 young people across Scotland, 53% of whom are aged between 11-25.

The level and the nature of engagement between schools and the third sector varies considerably across Scotland, ranging from national engagement programmes such as the Scottish Youth Parliament and the Social Enterprise Academy, to local authority commissioned services and formal partnerships with accreditation.

The Scottish Youth Parliament engages with schools and other institutions that provide informal education as a core part of our youth engagement and outreach programme, which involves delivering sessions around rights, participation, and citizenship. Young people who become Members of the Scottish Youth Parliament, most of whom stand for election due to their engagement with us through school or local youth services, have the opportunity to undertake an SQA accreditation through their work with us.

---

While there are many examples of good practice of strong partnerships between the third sector and schools, we believe there is significant scope to increase the scale, consistency, and quality of this engagement.

We do not necessarily believe that there is a dividing line between our role and the role of education authorities. Like many other organisations, our work feeds into the following National Outcome:

“Our young people are successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors, and responsible citizens.”

In addition, our work aligns with many of the principles outlined in the Curriculum for Excellence. While there is an obvious division of responsibilities in relation to the formal curriculum, there is scope for a more fluid partnership in relation to the delivery of the wider aspects of the learning experience, where the third sector is more likely to be involved. This should be based on the needs of the young people and the local community, as well as the education authority and the third sector organisations involved.

Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum.

The report from Scotland’s Commissioner for Children and Young People provides evidence that pupil involvement and participation in the “Extended Curriculum,” or opportunities outwith the formal curriculum, have a positive impact on achievement and attainment. This report, based on research with school pupils, highlights the positive impact of engagement with the community and wider development opportunities for increasing attainment and achievement.8

We are pleased that the opportunities for achievement, through various awards mechanisms such as Youth Scotland’s accredited Youth Achievement Awards and various other recognised awards from the Awards Network, have demonstrated an increase in uptake and successful completion.

We believe that awards of this nature should receive further recognition at a local level, and schools should be further supported to offer these opportunities to pupils on the grounds that such awards represent a much wider and holistic conception of attainment and achievement than that which is often portrayed. However, we are

8 SCCYP (2015), (n7)
aware that there needs to a corresponding increase in the value and currency of this achievement.

This parity of esteem between the formal curriculum and wider learning experiences was raised a key point in our submission to the Committee in relation to the implementation of the Wood Commission proposals as an issue that needs to be addressed.

Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised.

There are many examples of excellent practice across Scotland where a strong partnership between schools and the third sector deliver excellent opportunities for young people. However, we believe that this could be more widespread and more consistent across Scotland, affording such opportunities to all young people while appreciating the need for local flexibility.

The third sector provides considerable opportunities across a wide range of areas including employability and training, social enterprise, democracy and citizenship, and many others. More importantly, the sector is committed to removing any barriers to participation, including deprivation. For example, we note the exemplary work of our colleagues at Who Cares? Scotland, who are well placed to remove barriers to participation for care leavers.

Therefore, we believe there is further potential to expand the role of third sector in the delivery of opportunities that exist outside of the formal curriculum. We believe that this partnership working is crucial in a time where local authorities are facing budgetary pressures.

However, in order to realise the full potential of this work, there needs to be further recognition and value placed on the achievement and attainment outside of the formal curriculum by education authorities, employers, and colleges and universities.

There is a particular opportunity to involve the third sector and the private sector in the implementation of the recommendations made by the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce, an issue we highlighted in our submission to the Committee previously.

We wish to reiterate that the involvement of young people, and organisations in the third and private sectors that work with young people, in the implementation of the recommendations are crucial to their success. Indeed, successful implementation of the recommendations is important for reducing the educational attainment gap.
As mentioned previously, the third sector is an important stakeholder in reducing the barriers for participation that could arise from the Wood Commission recommendations, such as the burdensome cost of more vocational subject choices.

How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications.

We note the lack of comparable performance measures for assessing pupils’ wider achievements is mentioned as a key issue within the Audit Scotland report. In our view, the lack of a strong reporting system that supports opportunities for wider achievement is a key barrier to ensuring such achievements gain the credibility and recognition they deserve.

Furthermore, we share the concern raised by YouthLink Scotland in their evidence around the senior phase benchmarking tool, Insight, and its limited scope to sufficiently recognise the wide range of opportunities as an indication and measure of attainment.

The Scottish Youth Parliament would support the development of a robust system for reporting and measuring attainment and achievement through a wider range of opportunities. We believe this would have a positive impact on attainment.

We believe there is considerable potential to increase the value and standing of wider achievement and attainment among parents, employers, and learning providers. In our view, this involves fundamentally shifting perceptions of these achievements to create parity of esteem between these opportunities those within formal education.

This shift in culture is similar to that which we recommended was required in relation to vocational and academic pathways in our previous submission on the implementation of the Wood Commission.

However, as well as proactively changing and challenging perceptions, we believe that a better system for reporting and demonstrating the value and impact of these opportunities would also have a positive impact in this regard.

Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages.

---

9 Audit Scotland (2014), n6, pg. 17-18
As an organisation that works primarily with young people aged between 12-25, we are not in a position to comment on early years provision.

Although we welcome the Scottish Government’s focus on early years and prevention, we share the concern of other organisations that there is potential for the importance of older young people, especially those transitioning into the workforce, to be forgotten when it comes to resource allocation.

Concluding Remarks

In summary, the Scottish Youth Parliament places significant value on the involvement of the third sector and private sectors in relation to achievement and attainment. We believe that the third sector especially provides significant opportunities for achievement and attainment outwith the formal curriculum.

Although there are some excellent examples of best practice across Scotland, we believe that the relationship between the third sector and education authorities could be significantly strengthened. We believe that the implementation of the recommendations from the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce presents a real opportunity for a strong partnership approach to delivery and the removal of barriers to participation and achievement, particularly for young people from lower socio-economic backgrounds.

The Scottish Youth Parliament believes that there is a need to address the perception of wider opportunities for achievement and attainment. Such opportunities need to be valued so there is parity of esteem with opportunities within the formal curriculum.

Contacts

Louise Cameron MSYP
Chair of the Scottish Youth Parliament

Gareth Brown
Public Affairs Co-ordinator
Gareth.B@syp.org.uk
0131 557 0452

Visit us: www.syp.org.uk
Follow us on Twitter: @OfficialSYP
Educational Attainment Gap – Role of the Third and Private Sectors

Scouts Scotland

Scouts Scotland is the largest co-educational uniformed youth organisation in Scotland, with 44,373 members (2014) across all 32 Local Authority Areas. It is positioned as a key provider of non-formal education. Its Purpose is to actively engage and support young people in their personal development, empowering them to make a positive contribution to society.

Scouting originated in 1907 with an experimental camp involving a group of young people from quite different social and educational backgrounds. Since then Scouting has grown to become the world’s largest co-educational voluntary youth Movement, with over 31 million members in 216 Countries and Territories.

The programme for young people is delivered with the support of 7,614 adult volunteer members in Scotland and countless thousands more parents and supporters. The work of the volunteers is supported by a professional staff of 10 at Scottish Scout Headquarters.

As a leading third sector youth work organisation, Scouts Scotland is pleased to have the opportunity to respond to the call for Evidence from the Education and Culture Committee with respect to the Educational Attainment Gap – Role of the Third and Private Sectors.

Third Sector

In its Final Report ‘Education Working for All!’, the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce set out a number of important recommendations for action to develop the skill base of young people in Scotland and address concerns over unemployment amongst the young workforce.

There is much to commend in the Report, which identifies a range of actions for Government, the education sector and employers in particular. Disappointingly, the only explicit reference to a role for the Third Sector appears at Recommendation 37, that being with respect to Care Leavers.

We believe it would be helpful to acknowledge the important contribution that third sector organisations make to the support and development of young people, and in
particular the role of the youth work sector in connection with developing the soft skills that employers rightly regard so highly.

The contribution in this regard from Scouting is clearly evidenced through independent research conducted by Public and Corporate Economic Consultants (PACEC) into the Impact of Scouting\(^1\) on young people, adults and communities. Key findings of the research included:

- 91 per cent of volunteers and 88 per cent of youth members stated that Scouting had helped them develop key skills;
- 97 per cent of volunteers and 92 per cent of youth members stated that Scouting had helped with relationship-building;
- 89 per cent of Scouts identified that Scouting had helped them to build ‘key skills’ including social, team working and leadership skills;
- External organisations surveyed said that many of the key Scouting attributes such as respect for others, friendships, teamwork, character building and personal development were very important attributes for their staff or volunteers to have in the workplace.
- 41 per cent of employers reported that a job applicant’s involvement in Scouting would be a positive influence on their decision to employ them.

A more recent report from Demos\(^2\) stated that

> The ethos and activities of the Scouts – particularly at the Explorer age of between 14 and 18 years old – underpin the acquisition of a broad range of soft skills. Our research suggests that the Scouts can assist the development of team-working, leadership, resilience and problem solving, as well as demonstrating commitment and resolve.

We suggest that the above are the very skills that employers seek. The development of such skills and attributes in young people is a particular strength of organisations such as Scouting and of the broader youth work sector.

There has been encouraging growth in engagement between youth work and schools in recent years. However, the sector’s capacity to engage with the formal education sector has been limited both by the nature of its own workforce (which

---

\(^1\) A Study of the Impact of Scouting on the UK’s Young People, Adults and Communities, PACEC, 2011

\(^2\) Scouting for Skills, Jonathan Birdwell and Ian Wyborn, Demos 2014
includes large numbers of volunteers) and by the willingness or otherwise of schools to recognise the wider achievements of young people outside of the school setting.

**Reporting Attainment v Achievement**

Curriculum for Excellence has been welcomed by youth work organisations for its recognition of the importance of developing the whole person. It is not just about academic attainment but also about recognising the wider achievements of young people that largely happens through activity outside of the formal education sector.

Some of these wider achievements are recognised by the range of awards identified in the publication 'Amazing Things' - A guide to youth awards in Scotland'. Young people in Scouting value the badges and awards they achieve through our progressive non-formal curriculum. Our top awards in each of our youth sections, and most particularly the Queens Scout Award, the highest youth award in Scouting, are highly prized by our youth members and their parents. As reported above, employers too value the skills that young people develop as they progress through our programme.

However, the currency of such awards is reported to vary considerably from school to school and Authority to Authority. Some awards can be achieved through school activities and these seem well received by the formal education sector, but there remains a challenge for schools to uniformly recognise the wider achievements of young people beyond the school gates. HMI inspections may help to focus minds. There has been some engagement with Scouting locally, e.g. in the context of schools inspections requiring a wider learning community focus. To date, however, this has been patchy, and too often it is inspection driven rather than reflecting a greater openness towards external engagement and recognition of wider achievement.

A tendency of some local authorities to limit recognition to levelled and accredited awards points to the easy option of recording attainment. It is more challenging to provide the space and opportunity for young people themselves to demonstrate their personal achievements by way of awards and experiences that do not lend themselves to a simple tick box approach. The CfE Senior Phase 'Insight' benchmarking tool only records SCQF credit rated awards and thus fails to record achievement of e.g. The Queens Scout Award or the Duke of Edinburgh Award, both of which are generally highly regarded by employers.

It might be hoped that P7 and S3 profiling will provide an opportunity to capture wider achievement. There is a challenge here for award providers and the youth

---

work sector in general to help young people to more clearly articulate such achievements and the skills developed as a consequence. By way of example, The Scout Association has provided a helpful resource for members aged 14 to 25 to develop their CV and identify relevant skills. ‘Get Ahead – Scouting and Employability. A guide for Explorers and Network members’ helps members to ‘map’ the skills and personal qualities developed and demonstrated through their Scouting experiences.

One of the important skillsets that young people have the opportunity to develop through Scouting is that of leadership. We are aware of a number of Explorer Scouts being presented by their schools for the SQA Leadership Award, building on the Young Leader training and experience available to them through Scouting. However, such instances remain rare and generally arise from an approach from local Scouting to a school rather than as a consequence of specific actions of a school to recognise and harness wider experiences and achievements of their pupils.

In general there remains a disconnect between schools and a youth work sector whose workforce is predominantly made up of trained and committed volunteers whose time is limited usually to out of school hours. To be serious about a commitment to recognising the wider achievements of young people more resources will have to be found to bridge the gap between formal and non-formal education provision, helping to ensure that achievements and skills acquired out of school are properly captured in themselves, but also, as with the SQA Leadership Award and the Explorer Scout Young Leader Scheme, channelled appropriately to secure recognised qualifications.

Age Ranges

Scouting’s youth programme is tailored across 5 age bands, from 6 to 25. Youth work in general is seen as aimed at young people aged 12+. However, there is growing recognition within the youth work sector of the importance of provision for 8 to 12s, spanning the critical years of transition from P7 to S1 education. Indeed the Smith Group Report whilst recognising that ‘the pre-school years represent perhaps the greatest opportunity in determining future destinations for young Scots’ also pointed to the ‘importance of the transition from primary to secondary school’.

Through its National Activity Centres, Scouts Scotland provides support to this transition cohort through a range of residential and non-residential outdoor learning experiences designed to support aspects of CfE, providing opportunities for young people to also develop important skills in teamwork, leadership and problem-solving.

---

There is a need for wider recognition of the quality and impact of such provision, not just from Scouting but also from a number of third sector youth work organisations that seek to provide similar opportunities through their programmes. There is a large body of research evidencing the positive impact that residential outdoor learning experiences can have on young people, no matter their background and academic skills. Indeed the origins of Scouting, the outdoor focus of much of its programme and its growth into the world’s largest youth Movement, testify to the attraction and value of such experiences and approaches. The benefits are such that we believe all our young people should have the opportunity to participate in residential learning experiences at some point during their time in school.

**Conclusion**

The recently published CBI Scotland Report on Scottish schools makes the following opening remarks: ‘Business is clear – we need an education system which develops rigorous, rounded and grounded young people. This means a system which focuses as much on the development of key attitudes and attributes – such as confidence, resilience, enterprise, ambition – as on academic progression and attainment.’

There is little we can disagree with in this statement. Our schools, and employers, must not only focus on academic achievement but also promote and facilitate recognition of wider achievement. To that end, however, they must recognise that our ‘education system’ is not just schools and colleges, but embraces a wide array of non-formal learning provision, epitomised in particular by that provided by the youth work sector.

Youth work organisations such as Scouts Scotland make a significant, but often under-acknowledged contribution, to the development of the whole young person. With the support of business and government they could do so much more, reaching out and engaging with more young people, helping them secure life changing skills and opportunities.

Resourcing improved collaboration between schools and the youth work sector will reap dividends for young people, schools and employers, helping young people to better articulate their achievements; schools to fully record these alongside attainment; and employers to see a more rounded picture of their future workforce.

James A Duffy  
Chief Executive  
Scouts Scotland

For further information contact:  
jimduffy@scouts.scot; 01383 419073; Fordell Firs, Hillend, Dunfermline, KY11 7HQ

---

6 Delivering Excellence - A New approach for Schools in Scotland, CBI Scotland, March 2015
Executive Summary
- DofE and wider achievement more broadly have a significant role in developing employability skills in young people
- DofE develops skills for life and work in young people from all backgrounds and abilities, across over 320 secondary schools in Scotland
  - 1 in 6 young people aged 15 and 16 are undertaking a DofE programme
- Employers, learning providers, young people and parents recognise the value of achieving a DofE Award
- Schools and teachers need time and resources to deliver wider achievement programmes within the flexible framework of Curriculum for Excellence

The Duke of Edinburgh’s Award
The Duke of Edinburgh's Award (DofE) is a voluntary, non-competitive programme of activities for anyone aged 14-24. Doing their DofE gives young people the opportunity to develop skills for life and work.

In Scotland:
- There are 42,000 active DofE participants
- 89% of Secondary Schools have an active DofE group
- 1 in 6 young people aged 15 and 16 years old are undertaking a DofE programme
- 13% of all activity is with young people from the lowest 30% SIMD areas.

Doing a DofE Award
There are three progressive levels of programmes which, when successfully completed, lead to a Bronze, Silver or Gold Award. Young people create their own DofE programme by choosing a volunteering, physical and skills activity, going on an expedition and, for their Gold, taking part in a residential activity.

Delivery of DofE
A wide range of organisations are licensed to run DofE programmes including, local authorities, businesses, voluntary youth organisations and independent schools.
Question: the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities

The DofE is unique in the third sector in the ability to collect and analyse participation records. DofE statistics reveal the significant reach of the programme across Scotland, currently **1 in 6 young people aged 16 and 15 are doing their DofE Award**.

The DofE is currently offered by 825 groups across the country. This includes,

- 89% (327) of all secondary schools in Scotland, across all 32 local authorities
- 37 Additional Support Needs units
- 6 Further Education institutions
- 4 Higher Education institutions

Work with diverse backgrounds:

- 13% of all participants from lowest 30% Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation areas
- 6% of new entrants from Ethnically and Culturally Diverse (ECD) backgrounds, equivalent to the ECD representation in Scotland’s population.

Adults who run the DofE, both teachers and volunteers, contribute over **1,660,420 hours each year** to help young people achieve their DofE Award. **Over 2.9 million hours of positive activity** is undertaken by young people each year through their DofE. The contribution that the young people make by their own volunteering hours is £1,502,646 based on rate of £6 per hour.

**Dividing line**

Schools and other organisations run the DofE by licence. **Built into our licence agreements are very clear roles for all involved.** It is the local authority that is responsible for the running of the whole of the DofE programme for participants. The DofE runs quality checks and supports adults involved in the running of the DofE through running training courses and addressing any questions or issues that may arise.

The DofE is generally managed within Community Learning and Development departments. The increased financial pressure on these departments within Local authorities challenges the capacity of CLD to deliver the DofE.

**Partnership Working Case Study: ScottishPower Foundation funding**

Employers work with the DofE to help young people develop employability skills. This partnership working takes many forms, including everything from offering DofE to Modern Apprentices to funding.

Thanks to ScottishPower Foundation funding support, the DofE Award in Glasgow has grown by over 500% with 55 centres across the city now offering the programme, up from 10 centres in 2010.
The importance of this support is most evident in the Enhanced Vocational Inclusion Programme (EVIP). Through EVIP, young people who come from financially disadvantaged backgrounds, are brought back into the educational system with vocational training and DofE activities and develop their skills for life and work.

Pupils work towards their DofE Award and their attainment of 5 SQA national qualifications at level 3 or above.

EVIP Development Officer Nicola McKenzie said that after going through the DofE and volunteering in their community, the young people “gain a feeling of being worthy, of being equal to their peers, of being able to help people in their community”.

Nicola said of the ScottishPower Foundation support: “The fact that an organisation, a huge organisation, like ScottishPower, has faith in looked after children makes our faith in the wider business community more positive”.
**Question:** whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised

DofE Scotland does not believe that the third sector has reached its potential to help improve attainment in Scotland.

**Despite a high percentage of young people doing DofE programmes in some areas of Scotland, in others the DofE is not an option at all for young people hoping to further their employability skills.**

In South Ayrshire, 1 in 3 young people 15 and 16 years old are doing a DofE programme. In Fife however it is less than 7%, a difference of over 26%.

This **achievement gap** offers a significant opportunity for local authorities to commit to Scotland-wide provision of wider achievement for young people. **In order to deliver consistent opportunities for all young people, schools and councils should prioritise their delivery of wider achievement and enable groups to access resources to support it.**
The DofE has had great success with increasing wider achievement within schools which offer DofE programmes. The DofE framework complements Curriculum for Excellence (CfE) and delivers a programme that is personalised, progressive, challenging and enjoyable.

Traditionally, the DofE was something to be done outwith school hours, but the design of CfE has brought it within the scope of the curriculum and has changed the way the programme is viewed and delivered by learning communities.

In response to the curriculum changes, the DofE has provided guidance on what can be delivered within school time. There are numerous examples of how DofE adds value to a school, improves teacher/student relationships and broadens the activity offer with greater community links. In addition to providing meaningful interdisciplinary learning for pupils that achieves CfE targets, the DofE also provides an internationally recognised award that helps them stand out in a competitive labour market.

**If schools are fully committed to closing the achievement gap, resources should be allocated to support it.**

If the measure of attainment is focussed merely on what level of credit young people are achieving, rather than their learning, there is a danger that wider achievement can get left behind. Also, with the emphasis that employers are putting on the skills DofE develops, there is a potential disconnect between what education offers and what employers need.

**Case Study: Firrhill High School, Edinburgh**

Firrhill High School offers the Bronze DofE within the curriculum. Participants attend two teaching periods during the week to cover activities such as First Aid training and expedition planning. Teachers are given the time to oversee sections completed outwith school, assist with inputting evidence into the online record-keeping system eDofE and to develop DofE capacity.

Running the DofE in the school has been a way for Firrhill to build positive relationships with parents and the wider community. Sarah Brown, Head Teacher at Firrhill explains that “parents support the DofE and recognise the great things that it develops in their child”. Additionally, through their volunteering in the community Sarah believes that pupils become more independent and start to recognise their responsibility to the community and are “better prepared for life beyond school”.

Further information on the DofE in Mainstream Schools can be found at [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Taa-uqW0Lf4](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Taa-uqW0Lf4)
**Question:** how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications.

**Reporting and value to Learning Providers**
The Duke of Edinburgh’s Award occasionally receives favourable mentions in Education Scotland inspection reports suggesting that schools do consider their DofE provision a mark of quality in their offerings to pupils.\(^1\)

The benefits of DofE are clear to teachers. Paul, a teacher and DofE Leader said: “It makes them independent. It ticks every box of Curriculum for Excellence. Also it looks great on a CV, so if they’re going for a very competitive course in university it makes them different. It makes them stand out”.

The DofE is also valued by higher and further education institutions. According to World Challenge research\(^2\):

- 27.7% of universities believe that DofE adds the most value to a personal statement of all non-academic activities.
- 97% of universities and students say that it is important for prospective students to demonstrate their involvement in extra-curricular activities in their personal statement.

The DofE provides its own detailed reporting to local authorities on how many of their young people are doing the DofE and in which learning communities. In addition, school and local authorities can collect their own data through our online achievement system eDofE.

It is therefore disappointing that there is no formal way for schools to benchmark wider achievement other than through levelling on the SCQF. This is particularly true of the Insight Benchmarking tool. Without a way to capture the benefits of all wider achievement learning it is in danger of being marginalised within the education system.

**Value to Young People, Parents and Carers**
Achieving a DofE programme can be a life-changing adventure for young people. According to World Challenge research 39.32% of young people think the DofE Award adds the most value to their personal statement of all non-academic activities.\(^3\)

\(^1\) Recent examples of Education Scotland reports mentioning DofE include Stirling High School, Knightswood Secondary School and Craigroyston Community High School.
\(^2\) Giving You the Edge: What is the real value of extra-curricular experience in the university application process? 2014. [http://www.world-challenge.co.uk/university](http://www.world-challenge.co.uk/university)
\(^3\) Giving You the Edge: What is the real value of extra-curricular experience in the university application process? 2014. [http://www.world-challenge.co.uk/university](http://www.world-challenge.co.uk/university)
Neil, a pupil, Firrhill High School said: “It’s helped me gain some more confidence as well. How to interact with people better and also work in sort of more of a work environment when I was volunteering. And in the future I think it will help me to get the job I want and also into the university I want”.

When they have completed their DofE Award, young people can create an Achievement Pack, which contains information about their DofE activities. It gives them an official record that they can show off to potential future employers.

Parents also see the value of the DofE to their children. Jayne Kennedy, parent of a participant said: “Since signing up for her Bronze DofE Award, Ellen’s confidence and maturity have increased 100%. Ellen has learning difficulties and is on the Autistic spectrum. She has always found developing relationships difficult and prefers her own company. With DofE she has met a new group of girls who accept her as she is.”

Jenny St John, parent of an Award holder said: “The skills learned are like a rehearsal for life, developing communication skills, teamwork, commitment and meeting personal goals… There is simply nothing to lose and everything to gain”.

**Case study: Polmont Young Offenders Institute**

The DofE at Polmont Young Offenders Institution (YOI) is run in partnership with Barnardos Scotland and the PE department. The Physical Section is run by the Physical Education team and it ties into the Volunteering and Skills sections run by Barnardos.

One young person took part in the contemporary dance project in Polmont as part of his Physical Section. He had no previous experience with dance, but fell in love with it. Now that he’s left the YOI he’s still involved with dance and has taken it so far as to join a college course in dance and performing arts.

He said the DofE “has given me the confidence and belief in myself that I can achieve. It was a fantastic experience and has helped me enrol in a college as well as helping me gain employment when I was released”.

Lisa Hogg, DofE Coordinator at Polmont YOI sees the difference that the DofE makes to the participants. She said that getting involved with sport and developing their skills “gets them feeling confident and trying new activities”. They then are able to take that experience back into the community when they are released and continue that positive involvement, as did the young person involved in the dance project. Doing their DofE opens them up to different forms of learning, but also different ways of developing themselves.

**Value to Employers**

Completing a DofE programme can improve young people’s employment prospects. It requires resilience and commitment. It enables young people to see how their efforts add value and impact others as well as themselves; it adds to their motivation and positive attitude. Young people are able to demonstrate the essential skills and commitment desired by employers, citing real life examples of transferrable soft skills.

In a recent survey, The Duke of Edinburgh’s Award was chosen by UK HR professionals in a Charted Institute of Personnel and Development (CIPD) survey as the most recognised
volunteering experience a candidate can demonstrate during the recruitment process. **37% of UK-wide companies look for a DofE Award in applications when they recruit, above other recognition programmes.**

In a recent **CBI Scotland** report, the characteristic, values and habits that make young people employable include: confidence and ambition, resilience, self-control and emotional intelligence. The DofE delivers on all of these capabilities through a whole of person approach to learning and development.

The DofE works closely with a variety of employers to offer the programme to their Modern Apprentices. Additionally, the **DofE works in partnership with employers, to provide career information and advice to young people through our careers platform, The LifeZone.**

The LifeZone is an exclusive and free site for DofE Award holders and participants designed to help them describe the skills they develop through their DofE on their CVs and applications and learn how to talk about them at interviews. It helps them make the most of the skills they gain through doing their DofE: leadership, teamworking and initiative demonstrated as part of their expedition; or the commitment, communication or positivity showcased through their volunteering and other activities.

The LifeZone also gives young people access to companies that actively believe in the DofE and look for Award holders when they recruit.

**Case Study: First ScotRail DofE Modern Apprentices**
First ScotRail has been running an award-winning Modern Apprenticeship in Customer Service since 2011. This programme gives young people aged 16 to 23 the chance to achieve their Gold DofE Award, get their Level 2 SVQ in Customer Service and train as a ScotRail employee.

Achieving a Gold Award is a main objective of the programme which trains apprentices in key customer service roles: ticket examiner, station staff and hospitality. Steve Montgomery, Managing Director of ScotRail, explained that the programme: “**gives the apprentices the skills and confidence they need to be a part of a highly skilled and loyal workforce.**”

The apprentices themselves also see how completing the rigorous programme adds value to their CV and benefits their future employment prospects. Sarah Graham, who lives in Barrhead with her partner and young daughter, said: “**The apprenticeship is a great way to learn on the job, develop skills and secure a better future for me and my family, particularly during a time when so many young people are unemployed. I have been wearing my uniform with pride.**”

For more on this case study please see our DofE and Employability film: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cw37NXPpIaM](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cw37NXPpIaM)

---

4 CIPD Learning to Work survey results, 2015.
6 Companies offering DofE to employees include: First ScotRail, Amey, Lloyds Banking group and more.
Conclusions
The DofE is recognised the world over by young people, parents, employers and educators as a mark of excellence.

The reach of the DofE in Scotland is significant with 1 in 6 young people 15 and 16 undertaking a programme which develops their employability skills.

It is frustrating that there is no formal way for schools to benchmark and celebrate wider achievement other than through levelling on the SCQF.

Delivery of wider achievement in general, and DofE in particular, is not consistent across local authorities.

Councils should consider the achievement gap in conjunction with the attainment gap and seek ways to increase capacity to deliver wider achievement to more young people.
Educational attainment gap – Role of the Third and Private Sectors

Response to the Call for Written Evidence from the Scottish Parliament Education and Culture Committee

The UNISON Scotland Submission to the Scottish Parliament’s Education and Culture Committee

March 2015
Introduction

UNISON is Scotland’s largest public sector trade union. UNISON members deliver a wide range of services across every sector in education including nurseries, primary schools, and secondary schools, further education colleges and universities as well as careers advisors in Skills Development Scotland. Our members are also midwives, health visitors and social workers. UNISON is able to analyse and collate their experience as service users and staff to inform the policy making process. UNISON therefore welcomes the opportunity to provide evidence to Education and Culture Committee.

Evidence

UNISON welcomes the committee’s inquiry into closing the attainment gap. There is widespread agreement that children from low income households do significantly worse at school than those from better-off households and that this gap starts early and continues. There is also widespread agreement in Scotland that this gap needs to be tackled, that investment in support in children’s early years will be the most effective route to enabling children from all backgrounds to achieve their full potential and that education in both schools and nurseries have an important role to play. There is though less agreement (and action) on implementing specific and targeted policies to achieve this aim.

UNISON firmly believes that comprehensive education provides the best route to achieve the aim of high educational attainment for all. There is plenty of evidence to support this.

Finnish schools top the world rankings not only for achievement but also for equity. In Finland they ensure: fair funding for all schools; school readiness through universal childcare and pre-school; focus on individual’s well-being in schools and prevention rather than repair. Even writers in the free market champion The Economist accept that it is “Finland’s no-choice, teacher knows best version of schooling that beats the world. That poses challenges, both for my orthodox free market beliefs and for other countries desperate to both bottle the magic and explore it” In Finland, like Scotland, most education institutions are maintained by local authorities or joint municipal boards. There are no private schools, no grammar schools, no religious schools no academies.

While many countries have recently focused on more testing, extra hours in class and more school choice Finland has taken the opposite route. Children have less school hours, less homework and less testing than most other countries. Children go to their local state school. There is no “choice”. Finland focuses instead on collaboration, personalisation, equity and trust based professionalism. Teachers and their students are not constantly tested and inspected: wasting hours on form filling and exam prep. There are very few exams. Schools are not in competition. Finnish children do consistently well across all schools.

Those, like the Conservative party, who favour strategies which take public money and give it to private companies often promote what they like to call “diversity and choice”. This is because privatisation is unpopular. The free school model, like academies are all though privatisation. But fifteen years after they were introduced Swedes are concerned that their schools are slipping down league tables. Not only is their education performance falling it is also slipping back on measures of social mobility and equity.
UNISON’s experience of academies and the loosening of local authority control in general in England make us very concerned about moving in that direction. Despite the vast amount of money poured into academies there is no evidence that they raise attainment any faster than maintained community schools.

There is insufficient evidence to show that academies are a model for school improvement.” The academies programme has created a new centralised bureaucracy to provide the advice and support previously provided by the local authorities (as has the Free School programme). The current 203 academies are supported by 70 civil servants. This moves schools further from their communities. It is easy to see why heads may be tempted by the carrot of keeping the 10% of funding that currently sits with local authorities in England and Wales. Schools though then have to buy in services from the local authority or an alternative provider. That money goes very quickly.

Head teachers have to become procurement professionals sourcing materials, school meals and support such as educational psychologists. This can lead to reluctance by schools to take any pupils who may incur extra costs such as children with a additional support needs of challenging behaviour. Schools in England are now employing HR and business mangers because of the work involved in purchasing and staff recruitment. Savings to pay for this are being made through cutting other jobs or taking staff out of national pay agreements and pushing down the wage. Support staff bear the brunt of the wage cuts.

UNISON’s UK wide experience also shows that “parent led” schools are a myth. They are a stalking horse for edu-business. SERCO, VT Education, GEMS are running schools not parents. Funding through local authorities, far from being a drain on schools budgets, provides economies of scale for procuring goods and services and allows a pooling of the costs of those pupils who for a variety of reasons require extra spending. They are also able to manage the modernising of school buildings/building new schools.

In Sweden the Free Schools far from being well funded modern establishments tend to be housed in old office blocks. They have little in the way of modern equipment, many don’t even have libraries. In England Free Schools teachers don’t have to have a recognised teaching qualification.

The OECD policy priorities to improve educational attainment are
• Emphasise teacher quality over teacher quantity
• Ensure teachers have the best skills by making entry more flexible and making the criteria for selection more rigorous.
• Ensuring strong leadership within schools
• Continual development of teacher’s skills
It was also indicated that for those children who were struggling, home visits, social workers in schools and more educational psychologists may be more effective ways to improve their outcomes. These can be accessed cost effectively via the local authority. Glasgow City Council found “nurture classes” to be effective. These give focused attention, including their social and emotional needs, to those who are struggling.

It is important to note though that Finnish success in world education rankings is not just about their school model. It is a country that values social cohesiveness, Finns pay relatively high taxes which provide the money for high quality services which all contribute to the well-being of their children. Their investment in early years and childcare also means that
when children start school aged 7/8 they start on a much more equal footing that their Scottish peers.

While the current focus on childcare is welcome UNISON is concerned that it is currently little more than a discussion round extra hours rather than how to deliver a comprehensive universal service that supports child development, reduces the attainment gap and enables families to combine work and childcare. There is still a early years education and childcare split in much of the discussion that takes place and for many families particularly those on lower incomes or seeking work there is no access to a service that is either affordable or has hours that mean they can go to work.

Childcare should be provided free at the point of use by the public sector. The current system is patchy, complex and expensive. Parents in Scotland pay 27% of their household income on childcare, compared to the OECD average of 12%. We need a radical overhaul of childcare provision to ensure that it provides what families actually want: a safe nurturing environment for their children doesn't cost the earth.

It’s not just the high cost of childcare which creates a barrier for women trying to return to work. The system is patchy and hard to navigate. Places are hard find. Until you know what specific childcare is available then it’s impossible to say what hours you will be able to work and vice versa. This is hard for those hoping to negotiate changing working patterns returning to their job and almost impossible for those trying to find new work.

There is no one place to go to find out what’s available: local authorities don’t even have to keep a list of what childcare is available, what it costs or monitor what demand for care is in their areas. The Scottish Government has no information on demand for childcare or what places are available. There is no statutory obligation to provide/organise childcare for under-threes except for those whose parents are in receipt of certain benefits or are “looked after”. Many working parents use private sector nurseries not out of choice but because this is the only sector that has the places available at hours that enable parents to go to work.

Public delivery is the most cost effective way forward: money won't be lost to profit, and is where we will be best able to ensure a coordinated and comprehensive service. Public delivery also makes it easier to ensure that the workforce is properly paid and well qualified. Public delivery also gives better protection to childcare workers who need all the same rights and opportunities, for example flexible working, as other workers. Good terms and conditions are how you attract and keep skilled workers.

Evidence suggests that that having well qualified staff, particularly staff with a degree level qualification working in a nursery is key to good outcomes for the children. Since 2011 managers and lead practitioners of a day care of children’s service in order to register with the SSSC have to have or be working towards a level 9 qualification. The Education Scotland Report Making the difference: the impact of staff qualifications children's learning in the early years (2011) shows that of the nursery centres they had inspected: 27% of local authority centres, 28% of private centres and 13% of voluntary centres had one member of staff with a BA in Childhood Practice. In local authority centres 87% had access to a teacher, 39% of private sector nurseries and 32% in the voluntary sector. Those who are able to access nursery services in the public sector have substantially more access to staff with degree level qualifications.
The childcare workforce, particularly in the private sector, is not well paid. The knowledge and skills required, as with much work traditionally done by women, are not widely recognised or rewarded in the market. This needs to be challenged. Pay must reflect the skills, knowledge and reflective practice required to do the job. There is a substantial pay gap between the sectors. A brief survey of vacancies showed that the public sector is offering jobs at approx £11 per hour while the range in the private and voluntary sector was £7 to a high of £8.50. Where jobs were offered with an annual salary the public sector range was £19 to £23,000 a rate more in line with that being offered for managers in the private sector where some posts offered a £16,000 to manage a nursery. Only public delivery paid for via taxation can support appropriate wages for the skills required to deliver high quality childcare.

Developing the right childcare cannot be separated from improved maternity leave and flexible working rights. Families need time to look after their own children and a fair work/life balance. Supporting families to spend time supporting their children is also key to closing the attainment gap. If Scotland is to be the best place in the world to bring up a child then it is essential that we give parents the time to parent.

UNISON believes that the voluntary sector has an important role in the design and delivery of public services. In particular they can articulate the needs of many groups who are often ignored by policy makers. This will be important in terms of closing the attainment gap. This is though not the same as handing over the delivery of education to voluntary groups. Private schools, which we believe play a key role in embedding inequality, should no longer be allowed charitable status. Allowing some children scholarships to elite institutions will not break down structural inequalities.

Being able to undertake educational enhancing activities is a key indicator of educational attainment. It is clear that better off parents have the financial resources to allow children to participate in a wider range of activities than their less well-off peers. Genuine charities can though, alongside schools, offer an equitable route to ensuring that children from less well off backgrounds get more opportunities to participate in these types of activities. There are a huge range of activities supported by the voluntary sector from school visits to theatre and historical/ educational sites, bringing activities like sports coaching and arts and drama or groups like Nil By Mouth and Show Racism the Red Card who bring expertise to particular areas of the curriculum. These opportunities are vital for children’s personal development and educational attainment. Going to see a live play makes it much easier to get good marks in English than just reading it in a book or out loud in the class. Those who have the least opportunity to undertake these activities out of school because of lack of money need to have these opportunities through school. The key to closing the gap is to ensure that participation is free at the point of use. Cuts in local authority funding, compounded by the council tax freeze, mean that the cost of so-called extracurricular activities like school trips, whether for a day or a week, and sports clubs are increasing borne by parents. These charges mean that far from narrowing the gap will see it grow.
**Conclusion**
UNISON is the largest public sector trade union in Scotland. We are able to analyse and collate members' experiences of the sector, as service users and staff, to provide evidence to the committee. UNISON believes that tackling inequality and its consequence, like the gap in educational attainment, are vital. This will require resources. There is no indication that the resources needed are being calculated far less allocated. UNISON welcomes the opportunity to provide evidence to the committee.

**For further information, please contact:**

Dave Watson  [d.watson@unison.co.uk](mailto:d.watson@unison.co.uk)
Kay Sillars:  [k.sillars@unison.co.uk](mailto:k.sillars@unison.co.uk)

Mike Kirby, Scottish Secretary
UNISON Scotland,
UNISON House,
14, West Campbell Street,
Glasgow
G2 6RX

---

1 The Economist Our Friends in the North 6th June 2008 [www.economist.com](http://www.economist.com)
Educational attainment gap – role of the third and private sectors: Universities Scotland response

- Universities Scotland welcomes the opportunity to provide evidence on the role of the third and private sectors in improving pupil attainment and closing the educational attainment gap.
- For the purposes of this submission we include universities as part of Scotland’s third sector.
- We have followed the format of the questions posed, answering only where we have a relevant contribution to make.

1. The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities

- Scotland’s 19 higher education institutions (HEIs) have significant involvement in and relationships with schools across the country.
- As can be seen from the examples below, a close partnership between the University and the relevant local Council(s) is often integral to the establishment and success of a project. This reinforces Universities Scotland’s call for Scotland to take a joined-up and system-wide approach to widening access which recognises the role of all players in improving attainment.

Engagement with schools

- The national programme for school and university relationships, called the Schools for Higher Education Programme (SHEP), operates in four regions across Scotland through Focus West, the Lothians Equal Access Programme for Schools (LEAPS), Lift Off (Fife and Tayside) and Aspire North.¹
- SHEP targets schools which have less than a 22 per cent rate of progression to higher education.
- SHEP has evolved into a national programme with Scottish Funding Council (SFC) involvement from regional partnerships that started over twenty years ago.
- Across the country SHEP works with over 100 schools with low progression to HE rates to provide additional support, guidance and encouragement for pupils from S3 upwards. Local Councils are also key partners in these regional initiatives.

Support for curriculum delivery

- Many higher education institutions now play a direct role in supplementing or supporting the provision at Higher and/or Advanced Higher level which is available to Senior Phase pupils within a certain area.
- The additional choice ensures that pupils can study subjects which directly relate to their post-school ambitions and also helps to improve their attainment. As this model involves delivery on university campuses it can serve as an intermediary step towards higher education.
- Glasgow Caledonian University’s Advanced Higher Hub, in partnership with Glasgow City Council and the SFC, enhances provision for around 120-200 Senior Phase pupils each year by offering Advanced Higher subjects that could not be accommodated within school timetables. 60 per cent of the first year’s intake of pupils were from SIMD20.²
- Dundee University runs the Dundee City Campus project with Dundee City Council and local schools to address a Council challenge of falling demand for some subjects at Higher level by delivering them at the University. Around one-fifth of Dundee city’s S6 roll engages with the Dundee City

² Glasgow Caledonian University Outcome Agreement 2014-15
Campus at any one time. If some schools had lost the capacity to offer pupils Maths and English at Higher level then this would have limited the progression opportunities of their students.

- The University of Aberdeen runs S6@Uni across Aberdeen City and Aberdeenshire schools to complement or supplement choices in S6 and lead to UCAS accreditation that can help with progression to HE.
- The Queen Margaret University Edinburgh Academy Model, the University of the Highlands and Islands and the Open University in Scotland’s Young Applicants in School Scheme (YASS) are additional examples of HEIs delivering supplementary provision at S5/S6 level.

Raising aspiration as well as achievement and attainment

- The ECC inquiry understandably places its emphasis on improving attainment and achievement. However, raising the levels of aspiration amongst Scotland’s young people is also an important part of widening access to university.
- The motivational influence of this can have a major impact on the young people involved, and on their families. An important strand of universities’ outreach work is to build confidence, expand horizons and break down self-imposed barriers with the goal of motivating and supporting pupils and their parents to develop and achieve higher ambitions. Various evaluative studies have also shown that of all the work universities do to widen access and raise aspiration and attainment, this outreach work may be particularly effective.

2. Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils and, if so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum

- There is a lot of evidence to suggest that universities’ widening access programmes are successful in improving achievement and attainment for the school pupils they are able to reach. As the goal of university outreach is most typically to widen access to HE, universities most commonly use progression to HE as the metric by which to judge success. However, there will be other positive impacts resulting from university activity that are captured less easily, like improved exam performance, achievement of a greater number of (or more relevant) Highers/Advanced Highers.
- We know that the attainment gap between Scotland’s most and least deprived pupils remains stark and is evident as young as five years of age. This is why Scotland needs a concerted and coordinated effort involving all partners in education.

Success with SHEP

- SFC tracks progress of SHEP at a national level. Last year over 1,400 entrants to undergraduate studies in Scotland’s 19 HEIs were from SHEP schools, which equates to 4.5 per cent of all Scotland-domiciled entrants, up from 4.3 per cent the previous year.
- The impact felt at a regional level is more interesting. Focus West has increased the progression rate to HE across its seven core schools by an average of seven per cent, which is all the more significant when many secondary schools started with progression rates below 10 per cent. Similarly, Lift Off has seen an average of 39 per cent of its pupils progress to HE over the last three years compared to an average 17 per cent progression rate across the 13 schools it works with.

---

3 See for example [http://www.universities-scotland.ac.uk/uploads/WideningAccessToHE-CREID.pdf](http://www.universities-scotland.ac.uk/uploads/WideningAccessToHE-CREID.pdf) and [http://www.hefce.ac.uk/pubs/rereports/year/2013/wplitreview/](http://www.hefce.ac.uk/pubs/rereports/year/2013/wplitreview/) (e.g. p19)

Each of the regional SHEP initiatives provide detailed analysis of their impact on an annual basis, which can be found on their respective websites and in SFC reports.

Improvements in achievement and attainment

- Evaluations of university-run summer schools and similar initiatives have proven to be highly effective at improving achievement in that there are high progression rates into higher education for pupils who successfully complete these activities.
- Evaluations of the University of Glasgow’s taster weeks, a spin-off from the summer school, found them highly successful in positively influencing the attitudes of participants. 84 per cent of participants in the 2013 programme said they were more likely to apply to university and around one third of applicants actually did go on to enter the University.
- The University of Edinburgh’s Pathways to the Professions programme offers structured support and insight into highly selective courses such as medicine, law and architecture. Of the 2012 cohort of participants 96 per cent of Pathways Plus participants that applied for a Pathways subject entered university, with 72 per cent starting one of the professional courses.
- However, analysts have questioned whether the success of this type of intervention is simply easier to measure as it has a more immediate outcome than longer-term interventions.\(^5\)

Determining success – the importance of evaluation

- Universities are now much more effective at monitoring and evaluating the success of their widening access initiatives than they were ten or twenty years ago.
- Universities Scotland’s evidence-based assessment of what works in widening access recommended that HEIs should ensure that all widening access initiatives have appropriate and sufficiently rigorous processes of evaluation built into their design. This is important for performance monitoring purposes, but also for improving the possibility of objectively determining what actually works in widening access. Where appropriate, suitable elements of these evaluations should be published, at intervals, as a matter of public interest.\(^6\)

Evaluating success longitudinally

- Where university initiatives engage with pupils at a young age it is difficult to identify causal links between the project and post-16 destinations because of the generational time factor and because of the amount of variables that shape a young person during this time.
- Glasgow Caledonian University has established a longitudinal survey to track the journey of young people through the Caledonian Club to 2030; evaluating numeracy, literacy and communication skills as well as levels of self-confidence and self-esteem. Numbers are small at the current time but intermediate indicators suggest that young people are not only more likely to go on to higher education having been in the Club, but also more likely to stay on their courses.\(^7\)
- Determining what constitutes ‘success’ should be an important consideration. A widening access initiative run by one university may have been a success for an individual student if it encouraged them to post-16 learning in an FE college or at a different university rather than the institution

---


\(^7\) Glasgow Caledonian University Outcome Agreement 2012-13.
which ran the initiative. This is why tackling attainment and widening access at an all-Scotland level is important rather than pitting institutions against each other to compete on performance.

3. Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised

- Looking at the higher education sector we see a well-established track record of partnerships with schools and local authorities focussed on increasing achievement, with the measure of achievement being progression into higher education. LEAPs and other programmes which form part of the SHEP programme have been in existence for 20 years.
- We also note a recent increase in innovative and collaborative initiatives between universities, colleges, schools and local councils to address challenges in attainment and achievement (many of which are listed above) including the Academies model at Queen Margaret University and the Advanced Higher Hub at Glasgow Caledonian. This would indicate that the potential is there and is being realised in many cases.
- Projects to raise attainment and achievement work best when they are borne out of a clear need and have been developed to address the specific context in which they operate. It is not always possible or desirable to transplant a successful initiative in one place to a different school or university to try and replicate that success. Scotland should look to learn from best practice but should avoid a one-size-fits all approach to this highly complex challenge.
- It is worth saying that the establishment and subsequent success of innovative initiatives to raise attainment and achievement can often rest in the strong motivation of particular individuals as the driving force and the openness and enthusiasm of certain local councils. This is not always found uniformly across Scotland.

4. How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications

This answer focuses on the latter half of the question and does so from the perspective of universities as learning providers.

Wider achievements

- At present, UCAS personal statements are the main way in which pupils report their wider achievements to universities. Universities consider the content of these statements alongside academic qualifications, references, portfolios, auditions or interviews, contextual data and, in some cases, information gleaned from admissions tests (such as the UK Clinical Aptitude Test) and interviews, so that they can consider applications in an holistic way.
- Whilst prior attainment is by far the most important single factor determining academic potential and success, universities do not admit students on the basis of grades alone. The personal statement, therefore, provides an important opportunity for applicants to demonstrate their individual suitability for admission.
- There is an important equality issue with regards to the opportunity to acquire a wider set of experiences and achievements and also in the presentation of that information in a UCAS personal statement. Evidence by Jones for the Sutton Trust found “carefully crafted” statements packed with “high status, relevant activities” from independent school pupils compared to statements from pupils at state schools, who “appear to receive less help composing their statement, often
struggling to draw on suitable work and life experience” and contain three times as many writing errors.\(^8\)

- This is why information, advice and guidance forms a major part of universities outreach activity to students in the Senior Phase. Significant levels of pre-application support and guidance are made available to pupils (and sometimes their parents) from underrepresented groups, including help with applications and mock-interview preparation.
- The Senior Phase of Curriculum for Excellence (CfE) puts a stronger emphasis on extra-curricular activity and skills development, and whilst this is positive it is important to recognise that not all pupils have an equal opportunity to participate in extra-curricular activities. Universities Scotland addressed this issue to some extent in 2012\(^9\) when looking ahead to CfE Senior Phase implementation and suggested that in order to report on pupils’ wider achievements fairly a school-level record of achievement might be useful to universities. It could help institutions to understand the particular Senior Phase models implemented by different schools; it could capture pupils’ achievements more broadly than the grades they obtain (and in a more objective way than personal statements); and provide additional contextual information that could assist universities in fair decision-making.

Diverse routes

- All 19 higher education institutions recognise and welcome the increased diversity of pathways through learning provided by the Senior Phase of CfE. This can involve the achievement of Highers over two years instead of one as well as the acquisition of a broader range of achievements in addition to academic qualifications.
- Every HEI has published a statement on the senior phase on its website.
- Universities also have policies and practices to recognise prior learning. This is where applicants can get credit for their prior learning when that learning may not have come with a formal qualification – e.g. it might be experiential learning. This is part of universities’ life-cycle approach to widening access – it provides second chances for mature entrants who were perhaps did not achieve the grades necessary to go to university (for whatever reason) when they were at school.

Contextualised admissions

- Universities do not just consider wider achievements in addition to exam results, they also use contextual information as part of their admissions processes to consider the context in which applicants have achieved. In doing so they help to level the playing field for applicants, recognising that not everyone has an equal opportunity to demonstrate their potential because of circumstance.
- 17 of the 19 higher education institutions in Scotland now operate systems of contextualised admissions.\(^10\) Data used to help contextualise achievement in admissions decisions can include geodemographic data, deprivation levels of the postcode area in which a person lives or attends school, progression rates of the person’s school, care leaver or looked-after status, whether

---


\(^9\) Universities Scotland (2012) Beyond the Senior Phase. P.17. A record of achievement in schools would complement the Higher Education Attainment Record (HEAR) in universities which documents students’ co-curricula and extra-curricula activities as well as academic attainment.

\(^10\) The Open University in Scotland has an open admissions policy, so the use of contextual data and information in the admissions process is unnecessary. The other university which does not make direct reference to contextual admissions already has the most diverse student body in terms of SIMD. Different institutions are at different stages of contextualised admissions use.
someone has participated in a widening access programme and/or summer school. In some cases it enables institutions to make adjustments in the selection and/or offer-making parts of the admissions process for applicants whose individually strong performances are achieved in challenging circumstances, which may include (for example) differential offers at lower rate (though applicants will still have to meet minimum entry requirements).

5. **Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages**

- Historically, the emphasis of university widening access activity has been concentrated on the later years of secondary school, typically S3 onwards.
- More recently, Scotland has seen the development of a number of university-run initiatives that look to engage with younger pupils, even including pre-school age children. Examples of this include Glasgow Caledonian University’s Caledonian Club, which works with pupils from nursery right up to S6, and the Children’s University run by Queen Margaret University.
- The University of Strathclyde also offers a Children’s University aimed at promoting social mobility and raising aspirations by giving children the opportunity to visit university, attend special lectures and engage in other educational activities. It involves children aged 7 to 14 (and 5 and 6 year olds with their families), who gain credits for taking part in activities such as after-school clubs, drama groups, sports teams or learning experiences at museums, parks and community centres. Strathclyde’s Children’s University Glasgow now has 19 member schools with over 900 pupils participating upwards.
- The University of Strathclyde Students Association’s StrathGuides – winner of NUS Scotland’s Community Relations Award – also encourages and trains University students to offer one-to-one mentoring to school children

ENDS

Further information:

Susannah Lane, Head of Public Affairs, Universities Scotland (susannah@universities-scotland.ac.uk / 0131 225 0701)
Submission from Voice

The Committee invited views on the role of the third sector and the private sector in improving attainment and achievement for all school pupils, particularly those whose attainment is lowest. The following views are offered from Voice the Union in Scotland. They are offered in response to the questions as raised. Views were invited as follows:

1. the scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Voice comments – We know there are some good examples of involvement within schools but it seems quite an ad hoc picture often depending on the relationship some staff have with family and friends working in those sectors and inviting them into the school to work with the pupils. It is unclear however from a national perspective the exact scale of involvement across the country and it would therefore be helpful if this could be established. This would help to ensure that any future national initiatives do not duplicate effective arrangements already in place within some schools. Gathering information on this would also help to enable best practice examples to then be shared more widely. The involvement of third sector organisations should complement rather than overlap with the role of education authority staff - third sector organisations, over whom education departments have no direct authority, cannot have responsibility in education matters. Additional requirements, such as GTCS/SSSC registration further confirm the necessity to ensure that third sector organisations do not undertake the role of education staff.

2. whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum;

Voice comments - Consideration requires to be given to what is meant by "attainment and achievement" and how this is to be measured. Many organisations will be achieving a positive impact upon attainment in an indirect way. For example, there are third sector organisations that help to support the development of positive relationships in schools and pupil's engagement with education as delivered by the authority, which then leads to improved outcomes for those pupils. Further embedding methods in the curriculum is less of a priority than ensuring that adequate resource is provided to fund successful initiatives and the support of sharing of good practice - to date SAGRABIS have seen many good examples of positive behaviour strategies within schools, sometimes involving third sector or private sector organisations. The work and experience of this group should also be drawn upon as part of this exercise.

3. whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

Voice comments - Until a clear picture of current involvement across the country as a whole is established, it is not possible to answer this conclusively. It will also be
dependent upon individual school budgets - one school might be able to set aside greater funds than another to pursue a particular project involving a third/private sector organisation. Both would arguably be realising the full potential of involving third/private sector organisations within the context of their budget. Ensuring sufficient resource is available to schools to support working with third sector organisations is essential.

4. how successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications;

Voice comments - Only anecdotal views from parents. In terms of value to employers, it will depend on the context and work needs to be done to raise the status of achievement beyond formal qualifications e.g. vocational education. However, concerns are also expressed by employers about the work-readiness of school leavers. It would therefore appear desirable to employers for skills as well as formal qualifications to be focused upon in school.

5. given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages

Voice comments – again a difficult thing to measure both in scale and value. Some suggestion that the relevance of such involvement has more value with older children. And it is hard to say whether any involvement is effective without knowing the measure for this - the expected outcomes would presumably not be the same.

That concludes the Voice views on this theme of the exercise.

Many thanks

Dougie Atkinson
Professional Officer (Scotland)

Voice
Submission from Young Enterprise Scotland

Scale of third/private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities;

Young Enterprise Scotland endeavour to offer the opportunity in schools for young people to participate in active, collaborative and practical learning; available to all young people and such that takes account of interdisciplinary learning. However, without clear, open and ‘real’ partnership working and effective relationships with education authorities, we can only provide good quality enterprise and entrepreneurial learning to a few schools where we have genuine partnerships. We would like to be able to provide pan-Scotland opportunities, available to all young people, complimenting other learning activity but only with buy-in and partnership. The chance to engage all young people and not just those who present as amber on the matrix means that we could contribute to prevention rather than being seen as a stop-gap or quick fix. Feedback from YES interventions is powerful, positive and alludes to a need and a want for this type of partnership learning opportunity. However, it is not enough to say it needs to happen, it needs to be funded and promoted to happen.

Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be further embedded in the curriculum;

Genuine Collaboration – where we are able to forge genuine partnerships we have had great success in delivering programmes and working with the schools to fine tune and adapt programmes to suit their circumstances. Collaboration develops enhanced outcomes as well as giving teachers a level of support in specific subjects they might otherwise not have. In some schools where we have had a presence for several years we become valued and opportunities for us to improve our delivery and to expand our work with the schools are improved.

Honesty – School/education authorities need to be honest with external partners. It is impossible for us to make progress with young people if we do not have a realistic starting position. This has ranged from unrealistic expectations for groups through to failing to disclose additional support needs and behavioural issues. It is not a question of not working with particular groups or young people, it is about being prepared and being able to prepare accordingly. Genuine partnerships cannot exist without honesty. In at least one case we encountered a school that had several different vendors all delivering similar programmes to a group of young people on different days. The school actively sought to keep this a secret in case one or more vendors pulled out and they were left with time to fill. The effect on the young people was demotivating and a waste of resources.

Commitment – Without commitment from both parties progress cannot be made. We can deliver training regularly but if there is no follow up and no consistency in how the programmes are integrated with the rest of the young person’s learning it will quickly be forgotten. The schools that are most effective in their work with us look at inter-disciplinary approaches to learning and the links that they can generate between our programmes and their curriculum.

Again with strong, reliable partnerships and omitting any ‘petty bureaucracy’ of unreasonable, unrealistic targets there is potential to have real impact and add value to school education. We
are talking about people not numbers. However, without the buy-in and recognition at strategic level any 3rd/private sector input is mostly meaningless. A stressful baby-sitting service for the most at risk is a case of too little, too late.

Whether the full potential of the third/private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

We have worked with a secondary school in Glasgow that from S1 works to build links with local businesses and provide a range of different enrichment activities. They are an exemplar of what can be achieved through actively seeking out partnerships and working in good faith and with real commitment.

A significant number of the schools we encounter are operating piecemeal trying to put together whatever they can get. Often this is driven by the letter of law in terms of what they should be doing rather than the spirit. Thus, we have encountered numerous schools with an agenda to ‘tick boxes’. Teachers we meet have the best interests of their students at heart and are doing the very best they can in the midst of cuts and ever decreasing resources. They need and deserve encouragement and support.

Our experience has been that forming genuine partnerships with schools is very difficult. There is often an unwillingness to commit to working with us in any real way, and many schools see external bodies as a way of reducing their workload rather than a positive partnership. Short term-ism and cynicism can taint some of our dealings with schools.

Funding: In 2014 we were able to get part funding for a 40 hr programme around enterprise and employability. The funder agreed to pay the bulk of the cost with a nominal contribution from the schools. Few schools we talked to were willing to contribute that money. Several were shocked that they were being asked to pay anything, and seemed to genuinely believe that we would be willing to give them something for nothing if they just held out. While we understand that education faces monetary challenges, private and third sector companies cannot operate on goodwill alone.

How successful schools have been in reporting in pupils wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the 3rd sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers’ as much as formal qualifications;

There can often be a clear division on what schools and parents see as valuable and what employers see as valuable. Academic achievement is seen as the most important factor by schools and F.E. institutions whereas our experiences with employers have shown repeatedly that social skills, life skills and attitude are key to employers. A balance needs to be reached, with the understanding that schools may be unlikely to have neither the infrastructure nor time to deliver the non-academic skills that are being sought.

We do not require academic excellence to take part in our programmes. Either consciously or unconsciously many schools see our programmes as a second class form of learning, only for those who cannot achieve academically. This has an effect on the makeup of our groups, barring young people who might be both academic and interested in enterprise as well as creating stigma for those who attend.
Are such achievements valued by parents, employers and learning providers? How is non-academic development learning measured? What means something to one person is meaningless to another. Wider access learning has to be recognised but saying it is not enough, a huge sea-change is required, with real commitment, to get that message across. That enterprise learning is a great-leveller is an opportunity. That a similar 3rd/private sector opportunities may be perceived as second class by schools because there is no real recognition of the value, or funding at a strategic level.

Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the 3rd and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages;

Given the backing, enterprise is suitable for all ages, styles and abilities. It should be embedded in the curriculum; we can support the recognition of enterprise learning and support the development via champion teachers. Given real support and not lip service at strategic level.

There are huge challenges in terms of working effectively with pupils across all years.

We have found that at S2 and beyond it is very difficult to find space in the already crowded curriculum and to find teachers willing to support consistent intervention.

Support and funding is required to enable partnerships to positively flourish for the benefit of the young people we care so deeply about. All young people have the potential to thrive through the creativity and imagination that is experiential enterprise learning. They should also have the opportunity. YES have the products, the knowledge and drive.
Response to
Scottish Government Education and Culture Committee
Educational attainment gap - Role of the third and private sectors

About Youth Scotland
Youth Scotland is a national youth work membership organisation in Scotland and delivers quality youth work programmes, information, resources, training and support to community-based youth work.

Youth Scotland’s membership comprises over 1,100 youth groups, 59,000 young people and 7,000 youth workers, of which almost 70% are volunteer workers.

The context for Youth Scotland’s interest in this area
Youth Scotland celebrated its 80th anniversary of ‘opening doors for young people’ last year, and reflected on the exciting range of opportunities that we have offered young people through the changing environment since 1933. Over that time, the common feature has been an approach to valuing the impact of non-formal learning to the lives of Scotland’s young people, and how that has opened doors for them.

In 1998, Youth Scotland recognised that the majority of young people’s achievements in youth work went unaccredited and much of it was also unrecognised. This resulted in the introduction of the Youth Achievement Awards to capture the achievements of young people aged 14 and over through existing good quality youth work. The unique aspects of need that Youth Achievement Awards addressed was in providing a framework, not a programme of activities, to capture young peoples’ achievements. By 2002 we identified that the under 14 age group were also missing an Award that could capture achievement in existing quality youth work practice. Youth Scotland developed the Dynamic Youth Awards for 10 to 14 year olds and, in 2004, opened access to the Awards up to all learning providers in Scotland. The Youth Achievement Awards were placed on the SCQF by SQA in 2007 and Dynamic Youth Awards in 2011. Together, these Youth Scotland frameworks have provided SCQF credit rated and levelled recognition for the achievements of over 35,000 young people in Scotland.

From April 2015, the Youth Achievement Awards will become an SQA Customised Award and the results will be recorded in young peoples’ Scottish Qualifications Certificate.

Youth Scotland, Balfour House, 19 Bennington Grove, Edinburgh, EH6 4BL
T: 0131 554 2651  F: 0131 554 3438  W: www.youthscotland.org.uk  E: office@youthscotland.org.uk
A company limited by guarantee. Registered in Scotland No. 35426; Scottish Charity No SC006071; Affiliated to UK Youth.
In response to the 2007 Youth Work Strategy, Youth Scotland developed the Awards Network in 2008, with Scottish Government support, and has brought together 23 non-formal learning awards providers that use youth work approaches to recognise and accredit young peoples’ achievements throughout Scotland. This group has grown from strength to strength and is now developing the fourth iteration of the guide to non-formal learning awards in Scotland, Amazing Things.

Youth Scotland has led the youth work sector in capturing and accrediting achievement and in bringing non formal learning awards providers together to work collaboratively in the interests of young people and of those who work with them.

**The scale of the third and private sectors' involvement in schools**

Youth Scotland has valued the implementation of Curriculum for Excellence and the approach that the policy takes in valuing the breadth of contexts in which learning happens and the diversity of learning providers. *Building the Curriculum 3* very clearly aspires to an equal valuing of youth workers alongside teachers as deliverers of the Experiences and Outcomes of CfE. Youth Scotland’s Dynamic Youth and Youth Achievement Awards are extensively used in both school and youth work settings and through using youth work approaches in school.

**Successes in improving achievement and attainment**

Youth Scotland’s registration for delivery of Awards within schools extends to 60 Schools and 4 Colleges delivering 22% of our Awards. Youth Scotland’s experience of involvement of the Third Sector has been very positive and the measurement of improving attainment and achievement is quantifiable in the number of awards that have been delivered. The development of STACs into the INSIGHT tool also provides a quantifiable means of identifying which schools are delivering Dynamic Youth and Youth Achievement Awards.

**Looking beyond counting achievement and attainment in schools**

What is becoming very clear to the Youth Work sector is the need for youth workers to be seen, in the spirit of curriculum for excellence, as equals amongst education providers. Given that the way that this question is asked, the value of the 78% of the delivery of high quality youth work accredited and placed on the SCQF seems to be less valued than the 22% that is delivered through youth work approaches in Schools.
Solution focused approaches to capturing attainment and achievement

The Awards Network has recognised the need to look beyond Pupil Profiling and INSIGHT as the only means of capturing attainment and achievement for young people in Scotland and set up two Sub Groups in December 2014 to consider how the Awards Network members can demonstrate their collective output of Awards made in Scotland. The brief for the Data Collation Working Group is attached as Appendix A. The brief for the Capturing Achievement Working Group is attached as Appendix B. Youth Scotland is grateful for the support of staff within Scottish Government and Education Scotland who have assisted in this process through people resources as well as funding.

Barriers that get in the way

In the spirit of Curriculum for Excellence, Youth Scotland shares Scottish Government’s views on the value of collaboration and partnership working. Partnership working forms one of Youth Scotland’s five Strategic aims. A key message of Building the Curriculum 4 is:

“Curriculum for Excellence can best be delivered through partnership working. All establishments should work with partners and share a common understanding and language around skills development and application. Together, they should plan and deliver learning and other experiences which meet the needs of individual children and young people.”

Building the Curriculum 4 – Skills for learning, skills for life and skills for work. p2

Delivery of this partnership approach is often hampered by terminology that is not in the spirit of Curriculum for Excellence. If Scottish Government are seeking stronger Third Sector/schools partnerships then referring to young people as “school pupils” in the framing of these questions has the tendency to disengage the Third Sector from seeing themselves as the agencies being referred to as potential partners. From young people’s perspective, they spend 855 hours per year in Secondary Education. That’s 15% of the total waking hours in the year, yet when we refer to young people in an education context, we refer to them as “pupils”. This does not seem to reflect the intentions of Curriculum for Excellence in valuing a more holistic approach to learning.

The problem of terminology extends to how young people’s achievements out with school are referred to. Youth Scotland is supporting thousands of young people to gain SCQF credit rated and levelled accredited recognition for their achievements both within and out with the school curriculum at SCQF levels 3 to 7. Youth Scotland does not feel that the SCQF Level 7 Platinum Youth Achievement Award, comparable to an Advanced Higher or HNC qualification, is fairly described as a “wider achievement” or as a “wider award” and certainly is not considered “wider” than anything else at the time of receiving it by the young person. Youth Scotland
calls for the term “wider” to be dropped as a way of describing young peoples’ achievements.

**Bringing the achievement and attainment story to life**

The stories of young people that have experienced life changing opportunities through youth work is heard anecdotally on a daily basis and Youth Scotland has attached some case study examples that capture a range of opportunities offered by Youth Scotland across the range of programmes that we offer.

Kirsten’s story is attached as **Appendix C** and Stuart’s as **Appendix D**.

**Contact**

Youth Scotland would be pleased to provide further information on any aspect of this response.

Please contact:

Steven Greig  
Depute Chief Executive (Youth Work Manager)  
Youth Scotland  
Balfour House  
19 Bonnington Grove  
EDINBURGH  
EH6 4BL  
[steven.greig@youthscotland.org.uk](mailto:steven.greig@youthscotland.org.uk)  
0131 554 2561
Awards Network
Data Collation Working Group Remit
This group is a working group of the Awards Network in Scotland.

Background

The Awards Network met on 4th December, 2014, to consider the opportunities for the Network to develop tools that would capture young people’s achievements in a way that would complement the existing Insight and Pupil Profiling Tools. Two groups were agreed to be established as a result of these discussions. One part to collate and present awards hard data on a geographic basis, and the other to support young people to recognise their achievements gained through Awards Network members’ programmes that are not necessarily certificated.

Data Collation Working Group Remit

The Data Collation Working group was tasked with setting up a system that would collect and present the certificated awards that are described in Amazing Things. Suggestions from the event were that the resource should be available online and would allow browsers to filter information by the geographic areas to give a cumulative total of the collated awards achieved in that area. The resource could also filter information by Award to present just the selected awards data for Scotland or for filtered geographic areas. The group agreed that data should be collated for the extended age range of 10 - 25 to ensure that the transition stage from Primary to Secondary was included. It was recognised that there would be a large variance in the geographic boundaries collected by Awards Network members and that the resource would need to embrace this challenge. Consideration should be given to present data as a % of appropriate age range population.

Membership

The group would include:
Alex Cumming, DofE (Chair)
George Cherrie, Youth Scotland
Peter Donachie, Scot Xed
Heather Aitken, ASDAN
Alan Hunter, Boys’ Brigade
Martin Passmore, CVQ
Nicola Sykes, Education Scotland

The group would be welcome to recruit additional members from within and outwith Awards Network membership as they saw fit to deliver their brief.
Awards Network
Capturing Achievement Working Grp
This group is a working group of the Awards Network in Scotland.

Background
The Awards Network met on 4\textsuperscript{th} December, 2014, to consider the opportunities for the Network to develop resources that would capture young people’s achievements in a way that would complement the existing Insight and Pupil Profiling Tools. Two groups were agreed to be established as a result of these discussions. One part to collate and present awards hard data on a geographic basis, and the other to support young people to recognise their achievements gained through Awards Network members’ programmes that are not necessarily certificated.

Capturing Achievement Working Group Remit
The Capturing Achievement Working Group was tasked with setting up a system that was designed to support young people to value their youth work achievements as part of their educational successes. The group recognised that only a small percentage of Scotland’s youth work successes were represented in the membership of the Awards Network and that we should actively promote the work of this group to other groupings so that this work complements similar approaches elsewhere in the sector. The group was tasked to include young people in its membership, as the target audience for the resource was young people. Format of the resource was suggested to be an App but other formats should not be discounted. The group agreed that information should be collated for the extended age range of 10 - 25 to ensure that the transition stage from Primary to Secondary was included. A suggestion was to approach the work as a Junior Amazing Things in App format. Written using an Award by Award thematic approach that addressed young people to support them to recognise their non-formal learning experiences achieved through Awards Network members’ services and to record these achievements in their Pupil Profiles, on CVs or just to recognise them as part of their holistic learning achievements.

Membership
The group would include:
Steven Greig, Youth Scotland (Chair)
Graeme Luke, Scouts Scotland
Mandy Toogood, Education Scotland
Heather Aitken, ASDAN
Laura Wright, Girlguiding Scotland
Janice Anderson, SQA
Katherine McNab, Scottish Government

Appendix B
Youth Scotland’s Girls on the Move project is funded by the Scottish Government and is part of the Active Girls programme, supported by sportscotland. It aims to increase the physical activity levels of girls and young women across Scotland, but the project’s outcomes are much more than just getting girls active.

Increased levels of confidence, leadership skills, community development and increased employability for participants are only some of the additional benefits for young people. Read Kirsten’s story to learn more about how youth work and Girls on the Move opened up opportunities:

“Hi there, my name is Kirsten. I left school when I was 15 with two Highers, and left home at 16 to study dance. I started that course with high hopes, but even though I passed my attendance was terrible and I didn’t make any friends. I started again with something different and began a course in childcare. It began well but I ended up failing. I got depressed and developed anxiety issues that made things like walking down the street really difficult. When I attended the GOTM course my self-esteem was shaky and I was starting to think: ‘I’m going to be one of those people who fail everything.’

“So what was the GOTM dance leadership course like? Five days of dance workshops in different styles, lessons on planning and leading dance sessions and how to go about setting sessions up your community.

“The first thing that struck me was how it felt very relaxed. Staff didn’t try to talk down to us, as many people do when they’re working with young people. We weren’t forced to play terrifying icebreaker games. We were given a picture of a tree with little jelly baby people sitting on different branches and we were asked to colour in the figure we related to most. I coloured in a jelly person near the bottom of the tree.

“The course gave us the challenge of having to lead a dance session on our own. We built up to that with smaller challenges, like leading a warm up in pairs. It gave us something to aim for and made us feel like we could all do it. I felt there was the expectation that we could do something. That is very special attitude to have towards young people, as I think most people don’t expect anything from young people, except maybe trouble.

“Another thing I found helpful was how the course was in a week and you achieved a leadership award. This was so satisfying for me after two years of college without much to show for it. The award is on my CV. We also did a Youth Achievement Award, which took into account all the hours we put in. We listed all our activities, showing that everything we did added up to an achievement.
“Before we went home we were given the tree picture with the jelly people in it again and this time I coloured in a person smiling and sitting near the top of the tree. I felt on top of the world and I also felt like I’d been given a kick up the backside to go and do something.

“Over summer I used my new confidence to start dance sessions in my hometown. When I was putting up posters and getting a venue I wanted to give up, but looking at my GOTM folder and remembering all the lovely comments reminded me I could do it. So I did and about ten girls came. They seemed to enjoy it and it was very exhilarating for me.

“Since then I’ve led dance sessions at holiday clubs, camps and youth clubs, in between studying a HND in Dance. I’m employed as a cover teacher for a dance school in Edinburgh and I’ve been given the chance to start teaching there permanently. I’m beginning to feel that I am getting to where I want to be.

“The last thing I wanted to mention was how on one of the evenings of the course the staff had arranged a massage workshop. I enjoyed that workshop so much that I’m studying Clinical Reflexology part-time at Dundee University. I feel really lucky to have found another thing that I love to do and I’m now a self-employed massage therapist.

“I owe a lot to my involvement with GOTM. I wonder how much of the dance teaching I would have done if I hadn’t been to the course. I don’t think it would be much, if any. And likewise if I hadn’t attended that massage workshop would I now be self-employed in the two things that I love to do?”
From Participation to Leading - One Young Person’s Youth Work Journey

There is no doubt that youth work changes lives. Through a vibrant Scottish youth work sector, young people have access to opportunities that complement and build on formal education. Youth Scotland and its membership support young people though their youth work journey, capturing their achievements and helping them to develop their skills and confidence. Read one young person’s journey to get a flavour of how youth work opens doors.

Youth group participation

Stuart had been a member of his local Falkirk youth club when, at about 13 years’ age, he asked if he could help out as a volunteer. He also attended training courses and workshops. One time he went to a summer activities session, but when the leaders didn’t turn up he stepped up to take the session. Since then there has been no going back.

“When I first started I was quite shy, less confident and saw myself as a quiet person. Through involvement in youth work I have learnt new skills; how to deal with issues and problems that crop up; how to adapt a session to meet the kids’ needs and ability. It is very rewarding – seeing the kids’ faces makes all the difference.”

Contact with the Falkirk project led to more opportunities, including some part-time paid work offering games workshops around clubs in the Falkirk area. Stuart used this experience to accredit activities where he was responsible for planning and delivering sessions with young people, and was awarded a Platinum Youth Achievement Award for his efforts.

Youth Work in Sport Traineeship

In 2012, Youth Scotland made a successful application to The Rank Foundation and The Robertson Trust to participate in their Youth Work in Sport Initiative (YWtS). This led to the three year appointment of Stuart as Youth Active Trainee (2012-2015).

“The traineeship] was my next step. It was a missing part of my jigsaw. I wanted to be a youth development worker and I wanted to be able to help young people have the opportunities that I had.”

As part of the traineeship, Stuart was involved in the Diploma in Youth Work Practice which is a distance learning programme run by the YMCA George Williams College in London. At first, he had concerns about the Diploma:

“Having to write essays, being like ‘school’, going to college down in London. I kept thinking – can I do this? It was a struggle at first, especially with the written assignments. I have dyslexia so the written work was particularly hard. The college allowed me to complete my course work by speaking the words while someone else did the typing. Gradually, as I got more confident, I went from talking to typing it myself. It was all my own words. I just needed help with organising it all. What really helped was the support and encouragement I got from family, friends and the Falkirk project manager.”
Overcoming challenges

After the first year, Stuart was given the choice of whether to continue on an academic degree route or a more practical sports coaching route. After careful decision, he decided to go with coaching. However, just as he began this training he faced his biggest challenge.

“A knee injury saw me off work for six months, and when I did get back to work I was limited physically in what I was able to do. This was a difficult time. I lost direction, I lost contact, I lost my motivation. I was really nervous about doing my first session back but I was surprised. Getting back into it helped me to remember why I do it. Also, I found that because I was more limited physically, I had to get better at communicating and I started to get young people to do the demonstrating. This was a really positive aspect which I had not thought about.”

Taking the lead

The third year of the programme focused more on putting the learning into practice with young people and supporting local youth clubs. Stuart took responsibility for the StreetGames project, leading and supporting a team of 12 young leaders as they followed their own Platinum YAA journey through the volunteering opportunities that were available to them.

Stuart supported young leaders to join young people from other groups to organise events like girls’ football fives. The Falkirk young leaders also enjoyed opportunities to volunteer at big events like the Commonwealth Games, the Great Scottish Run and the Great Scottish Swim. A highlight was the Youth Active Festival – a multi-sports event with over 500 young people attending.

What the future holds

Now at the end of his time as a trainee in the YWiS Initiative, Stuart is looking to secure a new youth work post. He has acquired many qualifications and skills through his youth work experience, including the Diploma in Youth Work Practice, the PDA in Youth Work, Sports Leaders UK, Trail Cycle Leader, a Platinum Youth Achievement Award and Gold Duke of Edinburgh Award.

He is working on building his CV, developing interview skills, attending ‘Job Club’ training and applying for jobs. His aspiration is to be a youth development worker, in a more concentrated area, developing a whole youth work programme more in depth.

“For me, youth work means giving every young person or child chances and opportunities: helping them to develop skills; to meet new people; and to enjoy life. Youth work is about learning informally and leads to young people achieving their potential.

“As a role model for other young people I hope they see me and my journey as something they can learn from and aspire to their own goals. A good youth worker is also someone who is there for young people, supportive, encouraging but also challenging.”
Introduction
YouthLink Scotland welcomes the opportunity to submit written evidence to the Education and Culture Committee on the Educational Attainment Gap, Role of the Third and Private Sectors. In our evidence we highlight the contribution of and challenges for third sector youth work organisations to improve attainment for all school pupils.

Background to YouthLink Scotland
YouthLink Scotland is the national agency for youth work. It is a membership organisation and is in the unique position of representing the interests and aspirations of both the third sector and statutory sector.

YouthLink Scotland champions the role and value of youth work, challenging government at national and local levels to invest in the development of the sector for the benefit of our young people. Our vision is of a youth work sector for Scotland which offers sustainable, dynamic and accessible youth work opportunities that support young people to become successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors, and responsible citizens.

National Youth Work Strategy
Youth work is an educational practice contributing to young people’s learning and development. Youth work engages young people as learners in their community and when appropriate within their school.

The National Youth Work Strategy 2014-18 is clear in its ambition for the Scotland to be the best place to grow up – but to achieve this ambition it states that “strengthening partnerships between school staff and youth work practitioners remain a priority for Curriculum for Excellence.” Further to this it recommends that we continue to build on the “many good examples where schools and youth work are working collaboratively to plan and deliver personalised learning opportunities.”

---

1. The scale of the third and private sectors’ involvement in schools, in terms of improving attainment and achievement, and the appropriate dividing line between their role and the role of education authorities.

The Scale of Third Sector Youth Work
Youth work makes a positive impact upon the lives of young people, by building skills and confidence. The youth work sector supports the experiences and outcomes of Curriculum for Excellence.

- National Voluntary Youth Work Organisations are working with over 385,000 young people across Scotland
- This amounts to 31% of the overall population of 5-25 year olds AND 53% of young people
- The majority of these young people 92% are of school age (17 and under).  

The relationship between third sector and schools is a variable picture across Scotland. Relationships may be of the following nature:

- National Programmes e.g. Young Scot, Scottish Youth Parliament, NSPCC Childline Schools Project
- Local Authority Commissioned Services (Specialist/Targeted) e.g LGBT Youth
- Formal Partnerships with Accreditation, delivered by third sector youth work services within school either with or without the transfer of financial resources e.g. SQA Awards delivered by uniformed organisations and regional/local youth projects
- Informal Partnerships e.g. promotion of opportunities, adhoc input to PSHE curriculum, assemblies etc.

Youth work enables young people to learn in a different way and extends young people’s appetite for learning beyond the formal curriculum. This is achieved through the delivery of targeted interventions such as youth work in schools programmes, the delivery of outdoor education, youth awards programmes, employability, leadership and citizenship education.

The Relationship between Youth Work and the Education Authority/School
HMIe inspections have identified that where schools are working in partnership with voluntary youth work organisations and with their own local authority youth work services, then the school and the pupils within it are greatly enriched. Third sector youth work contributes and is reported on within the Learning Community inspection process which currently runs concurrently to secondary school inspections.

The role of the Youth Worker is as an educator, supporting the learning of a young person for the following purpose:

---

• Build self-esteem and self-confidence
• Develop the ability to manage personal and social relationships
• Create learning and develop new skills
• Encourage positive group atmospheres
• Build the capacity of young people to consider risk, make reasoned decisions and take control
• Develop a world view which widens horizons and invites social commitment.

The purpose of Youth Work, a sector which spans both statutory and voluntary, shares the ambition of Scotland’s national outcome – of being the best place to grow up; and more specifically the Raising Attainment for All ambition: “Scotland should be the best place to learn. We want each child to enjoy an education that encourages them to be the best they can be and provides them with a full passport to future opportunity.” There is a commonality of purpose between youth work and the wider role of the education authority: that is to provide, recognise and celebrate the learning and achievements of all our young people wherever they take place.

Curriculum for Excellence and in particular the responsibilities of all: literacy, numeracy, and health and wellbeing, is a framework which is utilised and supported by the youth work sector. Where formal partnerships are in place there will be agreement between the school and the youth organisation as to the role of the professionals within that partnership and the outcomes that will be worked towards. Effective monitoring and evaluation which is carried out in partnership should contribute to this agreement.

**Case-Study: TD1 Youth Hub and Galashiels Academy**

TD1 Youth Hub works in partnership with Galashiels Academy. Working with an identified group of learners in the school the youth work approach is used to improve skills in working together and problem solving. The learners all have additional support needs, and attend a timetabled session as part of their school week. All the learners in the programme work towards the Silver Youth Achievement Award. This is funded by the RS Macdonald Trust, and Youth Achievement Award costs are met by the local authority CLD Service. The activities that the group have undertaken have included: organising charity events, work experience at Borders Animal Welfare Kennels, Mary’s Meals backpack collection, and assisting their peer group. Achievement is recorded by the school and the learners are presented with their certificates during an annual awards ceremony for pupils, parents and community members. The project has the opportunity to meet the needs of learners through quarterly multi-agency review and planning meetings. Senior Phase Pastoral Principal Teacher from the school said: “I have worked on several projects with TD1 and have been very impressed by the very collaborative multi-agency approach which TD1 adopts. Right from the start TD1 is involved in the planning process of our joint programmes, and during the delivery of the

---

programmes they continuously liaise with school, CLD and other partners about progress and outcomes. Thanks to their pro-active and extremely flexible engagement of TD1, measurable and meaningful outcomes for the young people are achieved.”

Challenges for Third Sector Youth Work
Despite the good practice example from TD1 Youth Hub, the third sector youth work still faces challenges to being able to contribute to attainment and achievement. There is in places a feeling within the youth work sector that there is not yet parity of esteem, despite the youth work sector having professional qualification, a code of values and ethics, and more recently voluntary professional registration through the CLD Standards Council. This perception of lack of parity of esteem may be experienced by youth workers in the following ways:

- questioning of the individuals professional competency by school staff and management
- poor or limited information sharing about the needs of learners
- expectation of delivering services for free

Many of our members report that their greatest challenge is to find an ‘in road’ within the school to discuss their offer, contribution, and opportunities for young people as learners to attain and achieve. In some schools, and for some youth workers they simply feel gratitude at ‘being let in’ to work with young people. These experiences create an unequal power dynamic, with the youth work organisation contributing time, resources and innovation; often directly contributing to the timetabling and curriculum of the school with little or no funding for the services provided.

YouthLink Scotland knows that the most successful programmes are the result of effective partnerships, often with teachers and youth workers joint planning and co-delivering interventions. We are concerned that reduction in real terms to the schools budget could well put programmes such as these at risk. As an organisation we aim for “all young people to have access to high quality youth work; and that Scotland’s ambition for its young people is supported by sustainable investment in youth work.” We therefore call on the Scottish Ministers to support local education authorities to take cognisance of the contribution that youth work in both the third sector and their own youth services makes to the attainment and achievement of young people alongside and to ensure that funding is allocated accordingly and that time for planning and recording is supported and valued.

2. Whether their approaches have been particularly successful in improving achievement and attainment for school pupils. If so, whether their methods could be more embedded in the curriculum.

The Youth Work approach has three definitive features:

- Young people choose to participate
- The work must build from where young people are

---

Youth work recognises the young person and the youth worker as partners in the learning process.

YouthLink Scotland is a member of The Awards Network, an independent forum of providers of non-formal learning wards from across Scotland. The Network has published Amazing Thing which identifies the suite of recognised awards which recognise achievement by young people using a youth work approach.

Increasingly these awards are delivered within the school environment, either wholly as part of the school curriculum for identified cohorts of learners, or as part of a wider extra-curricular learning spanning youth work and school. For example, the Participatory Democracy Certificate has been delivered within school timetable to accredit the learning of young people who are involved in Pupil Council activity. Whilst the Duke of Edinburgh’s Award blends contribution of young people’s time both in school and out with the school day. As an indicator the Duke of Edinburgh’s Award is currently available in 90% of Scotland’s secondary schools.

Youth Scotland, who lead on the accreditation of achievement using the Youth Achievement Awards have reported increased growth in the uptake of the award by young people in recent years. In 2014, 1290 Youth Achievement Awards were completed. This award offers personalisation by the young person by enabling them to individually set their own challenge and learning targets. This make a significant contribution to the success of the awards, as it increases ownership of the learning and the achievement by the young person. Again this award facilitates young people’s learning both within school, out with school or a combination of both environments.

Case Study: 83rd Fife (Cairneyhill) Explorer Scout Group
We offer a full and varied programme of activities including several international opportunities each year. Each year we offer “Driving for Success” courses, British Red Cross First Aid courses, REHIS Elementary Food Hygiene and Community Sports Leadership. We support our members to complete various achievements including SQA Personal Development, Leadership, and Volunteering awards – in which Scouting provides all the practical experiences and opportunities required for successful completion by the learner, whilst our local secondary school verify the learners’ portfolios and pay the SQA fees. Our Scouts can also progress on to the Duke of Edinburgh’s Award.
3. Whether the full potential of the third and private sectors in helping to improve children’s attainment and achievement is being realised;

Audit Scotland\(^5\) recognised in their *School Education* report that the learning experience of young people has broadened, this is in part due to the contribution of the third sector learning providers who have an offer to make to young people which supports greater personalisation and choice. There report includes the following data set:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Council’s Providing Data</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Duke of Edinburgh’s Award</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1195</td>
<td>1153</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>2202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASDAN</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>512</td>
<td>1277</td>
<td>1417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Muir Award</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>454</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>788</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Youth Work in the third sector can continue to grow if the conditions and environment are right – and would then be able to fully reach its full potential to improve children and young people’s attainment and achievement.

The conditions required to achieve this potential include:

- National recognition of the role youth work plays in Curriculum for Excellence – with a clear message from Education Scotland to all education authorities and schools in support of this.
- Parity of esteem between teachers and youth work professionals
- Commitment to long-term funding to deliver programmes of learning by the third sector within the school timetable
- Strategic local and national commissioning of third sector services
- Opportunities for joint planning ahead of the school year and planning for improvement
- Strengthening the contribution of third sector youth work to the Raising Attainment for All programme
- Appropriate information sharing on learner needs and achievements
- Appropriate access to systems such as SEEMiS and Insight to ensure that achievement and attainment is being recorded
- Widespread dissemination of good youth work practices as evidenced by HMIE to schools and teachers

\(^5\) Audit Scotland (2014), *School Education*, Edinburgh: Audit Scotland
The strength of youth work is its ability to be innovative, creative, personalised and to meet the learners’ needs whilst directly contributing to the achievement and attainment of each individual. Learning in a youth work environment, even within the school, can change young people’s attitudes to learning, improve their behaviour and give the young person an increased sense of value and purpose in their contribution to the life of the school.

Case-Study: Yipworld
Yipworld, are funded by Inspiring Scotland 14:19 Fund. They offer a 16-week programme for secondary school pupils, and which complements Curriculum for Excellence to ensure that each young person is provided with a programme of learning to suit their capabilities, and challenge them to the next level. The programme which is centred on employability uses different approaches by incorporating music and media; art therapy and youth work in each double-period session. The sessions encourage pupils to consider their current involvement in school work and how to aspire to achieve awards and qualifications. The programme includes the learner compiling evidence for their Youth Achievement Award. The organisation told YouthLink Scotland that 1:1 and small group literacy work in school had seen a direct benefit to a young person’s behaviour and his willingness to participate in other classes as he felt empowered to lead his own learning following the intervention of the Yipworld youth worker.

4. How successful schools have been in reporting on pupils’ wider achievements (i.e. not just examination results) such as those the third sector helps to deliver. Whether such achievements are valued by parents, employers and learning providers as much as formal qualifications.

The recognition and reporting of pupils achievement in youth work is an area of priority for our sector. The sector is currently engaging with Education Scotland nationally and with education authorities locally for the use of the Insight benchmarking tool, and also for P7 and S3 profiling. However this is not without its own set of challenges.

Case Study: Experience of Girlguiding Scotland
“From working with schools across Scotland our experience of reporting pupils’ achievement has been varied. Many celebrate students’ success in an informal way, but only if the student tells the school what they have achieved. This is often perceived by the young person as not a very ‘cool’ thing to do. Some of the young people we have spoken do not yet have an S3 profile and few can explain how they are able to record their achievements as they progress through school. We are finding throughout our organisation, youth leaders support young people to articulate the learning undertaken in Girlguiding to form part of their UCAS applications or CV”

The availability and use of the senior phase benchmarking tool, Insight, is limited in its effectiveness to record the full range of achievement opportunities as indicators of attainment. The system can only record SCQF credit-rated awards, which means that awards such as the Duke of Edinburgh’s Award, Queen’s Guide, and Queen’s Badge which are valued highly by employers are not recorded
by schools.

The individual Profiling Tool is an exciting opportunity for the youth work sector – the approach to achievement follows the individual learner and therefore makes it easier for a young person to record their ‘latest and best’ achievements. However, this approach needs to support young people to articulate their learning – giving regular opportunities to reflect and record. There needs to be a sense of ownership of the portfolio by the learner to ensure that they see this is a valuable tool for their progression. Local partnership between schools and third sector organisations will be crucial to its success to ensure that the learning and achievements recorded are holistic to all aspects of a child’s life.

5. **Given the strong policy focus on the early years, whether the third and private sectors have been able to work equally effectively with pupils of all ages**

YouthLink Scotland represents the interest of the youth work sector. The work that is undertaken is with young people aged 11 – 25, and with early intervention programmes and provisions which focus on children aged 8-11 years old. The evidence we provide is only representative of the third sectors work with these age groups – and we are unable to comment on the third sectors contribution to work with other ages. However we have a concern that there has been an over-emphasis on the early years and work with under-8’s at the expense of the 8-15 year olds who are at key periods of transition in the lives and who require support from youth workers to help them achieve their potential and make this a positive journey.

**Closing Remarks**

Youth work changes lives, in particular those for whom formal education has not inspired or reached them. We believe that youth work makes and can continue to make a contribution to improving attainment and achievement for all of Scotland’s young people. For this reason the Scottish Government’s ambition to make Scotland the best country to grow up in is one that we as a sector want to see realised.

*For further information please contact Susan Hunter, Senior Policy and Research Officer.*

[shunter@youthlinkscotland.org](mailto:shunter@youthlinkscotland.org) or 0131 313 6815.