Ms Brenda Herrick  
Sandmill  
Harbour Road  
Castletown  
Thurso KW14 8TG

Our reference 2011080037  
Your reference

Dear Ms Herrick

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION REQUEST: 2011080037

Thank you for your original enquiry dated 02 August 2011 about a wind turbine incident at Raasay Primary School in Highland. Unfortunately, I have not been able to send you an electronic copy of our report because some parts needed to be redacted (blacked out).

I enclose the information available under the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The information enclosed is:

COIN Case report 4191038 – some parts of this document have been redacted under exemption 40 – personal information.

A formal report was not written following our investigations. Instead our inspectors have written their investigation findings in the above COIN document. Our specialist inspector, Mr Stuart Arnold reviewed the report by Highland Council (which you already have a copy of) and agreed with its conclusions.

This information can be disclosed and a copy is enclosed.

The information supplied to you continues to be protected by the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988. You may re-use this information (not including logos) free of charge in any format or medium, under the terms of the Open Government Licence. To view this licence, visit http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/ or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or e-mail: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk.

Information you receive which is not subject to Crown Copyright continues to be protected by the copyright of the person, or organisation from which the information originated. You must ensure that you gain their permission before reproducing any third party (non Crown Copyright) information.

If you have any queries about this letter please contact me quoting the reference number above in any future communications.

If you are unhappy with the decisions made by HSE in relation to your request you may ask for an internal review by contacting me.
If you are not content with the outcome of the internal review you have the right to apply directly to the Information Commissioner for a decision. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

The Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF
Tel: 01625 545700
Fax: 01625 524510

Email: mail@ico.gsi.gov.uk

Website: http://www.informationcommissioner.gov.uk

If you have any further inquiries please do not hesitate to contact me

Yours faithfully

[Signature]

Sarah Humphreys
Freedom of Information Officer
Problem Summary: AMBER-Highland Council-Concerns over Safety of Wind Turbines-25/11/09-FMU 01

Problem Description: There was a wind turbine that collapsed on 13/11/09 shortly after it was installed next to Raasay Primary School. The turbine collapsed in the playground but luckily, no one was hurt.

Other turbines have been installed at schools to reduce bills at the schools through the introduction of renewable energy source on the island.

The complainant is concerned as he has a grandchild who attends the school at the site address and he is worried that the same thing may happen to the wind turbine that is next to the school. The turbines are only 10 foot away from the school and he does not understand why they were installed so close to the school. He believes the turbines should be locked down.

He contacted Highland Council who appeared to be clueless about the situation.

He claimed the Highland Region put in these turbines.
02/12/09 - referred to Eddie Marshall (PI HSE Aberdeen) for advice on progressing complaint.

21/12/09 - Response from Eddie Marshall advising to add case to COIN and allocate to him.

6/1/10 - Allocated to KAW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note Summary</th>
<th>Date Note Added</th>
<th>Attachments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Specialist note</td>
<td>10/02/2010 01:45:47 PM</td>
<td>Rassay__turbine.htm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Raasay_wind_turbine_1.htm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RAASAY_WIND_TURBINE_INCIDENT_REPORT_27.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8/1/10 email (4191038 - Raasay - email) sent to KA Wilson, N Summers and V Cole (portfolio holder)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note Summary</th>
<th>Date Note Added</th>
<th>Attachments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visit Note</td>
<td>11/02/2010 02:52:21 PM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note Details


30/6/2010 Met [redacted] and [redacted] and took statements regarding their involvement in this and the training they received from Proven.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note Summary</th>
<th>Date Note Added</th>
<th>Attachments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investigation Note</td>
<td>11/02/2010 02:52:21 PM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A wind turbine at Raasay Primary School malfunctioned after commissioning and springs were ejected from the mechanism. This complaint followed that incident and refers to a turbine at another primary school in Tain of the same design. Sangster Electrical put up both turbines and have admitted to fitting some parts on the Raasay one the wrong way. Stuart Arnold has reviewed this report and agreed with its conclusions.

Highland council bought these turbines as they had been on a certified list from the Microrenewable certification scheme, which was a Department of Energy Climate Change project.

The turbines were bought by Scottish and Southern Energy on behalf of Highland Council and Highland Council contracted Sangsters to install two. Part of the contract was that they attend a course run by Proven, the manufacturer, on erecting this type of turbine. Two employees of Sangsters did that. The part that was fitted wrongly was able to fitted in this way. It was mentioned in the course as Proven have designed a solution to prevent it being fitted wrongly. Although the fix was available, the turbines that Sangsters were provided did not have the fix.

Highland Council have stored these turbines at the Highland Haulage yard in Inverness. No checks were made on whether these machines complied with the Machinery Directive and were, in fact, safe. Ian Whittles (Bristol Office) has a related investigation and he is looking specifically at this issue with Proven. He is also a member of the Product Safety Team.

Discussed ongoing options for ensuring safety with [REDACTED] sustainability Manager for HC. Their procurement procedure has changed completely since these were bought. They have used Hydro contracting to install the rest of the batch. Information from Proven regarding the installation instructions were not given to Sangsters. They received some info from Hydro Contracting who were given the info by the council.

Highland Council have now reviewed their procurement policies for renewables. Council have now committed to the following - Contractors will be appointed on a turnkey basis through public procurement. Contractors and equipment will be MCS registered. The contractor will supply and install all equipment. A maintenance regime is being put in place for checking and servicing in line with the manufacturers recommendations.

Ongoing investigation into CE marking of Proven Wind Turbines by Bristol, however this part of investigation concluded.
Service Orders Related to Master Case 4191038

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SO ID</th>
<th>SVC4161030</th>
<th>Provider Group</th>
<th>SG Mechanical - North</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date Created</td>
<td>06/01/2010</td>
<td>Assigned To</td>
<td>Arnold, Stewart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start Date</td>
<td>06/01/2010</td>
<td>Service Type</td>
<td>Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Complete</td>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Specialist Assistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note Summary
Turbine Failure - Raasay Primary School

Note Description
Request to initially look at report generated by Highland Council regarding the failure of a Proven Wind Turbine at Raasay Primary school where springs impacted the playground. Discussed with Stewart Arnold by phone 6/1/10.