



# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 5, No. 88 Session 4

Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 8 March 2016

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

**1. Time for Reflection:** Reverend Monsignor Paul M. Conroy, PhL, STL, Parish Priest, Sacred Heart Parish Church, Bridgeton, Glasgow and Vicar General of the Archdiocese of Glasgow led Time for Reflection.

**2. Business Motion:** Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15851—That the Parliament agrees—

(a) to the following revisions to the programme of business for Tuesday 8 March 2016—

after

*followed by* Stage 3 Proceedings: Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill

insert

*followed by* Supplementary Legislative Consent Motion: Enterprise Bill – UK Legislation

delete

5.30 pm Decision Time

and insert

7.20 pm            Decision Time

(b) to the following revision to the programme of business for Thursday 10 March 2016—

delete

5.00 pm            Decision Time

and insert

6.00 pm            Decision Time

(c) and that Rule 2.2.5(a) of Standing Orders be suspended for the purpose of allowing the Parliament to meet beyond 5.30 pm on—

- (i) Tuesday 8 March 2016; and
- (ii) Thursday 10 March 2016.

The motion was agreed to.

**3. Business Motion:** Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15840—That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Amendment) (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limit indicated, that time limit being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended (other than a suspension following the first division in the stage being called) or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 4:    30 minutes.

The motion was agreed to.

**4. Business Motion:** Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15839—That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limit indicated, that time limit being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended (other than a suspension following the first division in the stage being called) or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 3:        1 hour  
Groups 4 to 6:        1 hour and 50 minutes  
Groups 7 to 9:        2 hours and 25 minutes  
Groups 10 to 13:    3 hours.

The motion was agreed to.

**5. Topical Questions:** Questions were answered by a Cabinet Secretary.

**6. Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Amendment) (Scotland) Bill - Stage 3:**  
The Bill was considered at Stage 3.

The following amendments were agreed to (without division): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 and 16.

Amendment 17 was disagreed to (by division: For 44, Against 66, Abstentions 0).

**7. Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Amendment) (Scotland) Bill - Stage 3:**  
The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Constitution and Economy (John Swinney) moved S4M-15837—That the Parliament agrees that the Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Amendment) (Scotland) Bill be passed.

After debate, the motion was agreed to (DT).

**8. Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill - Stage 3:** The Bill was considered at Stage 3.

The following amendments were agreed to (without division): 33, 35, 11, 36, 14, 15, 18, 20, 21, 22, 41, 42, 44, 45, 46, 47, 23, and 24.

The following amendments were disagreed to (by division)—

- 27 (For 20, Against 91, Abstentions 0)
- 28 (For 17, Against 94, Abstentions 0)
- 29 (For 19, Against 94, Abstentions 0)
- 1 (For 19, Against 93, Abstentions 0)
- 30 (For 19, Against 94, Abstentions 0)
- 31 (For 18, Against 92, Abstentions 0)
- 2 (For 21, Against 91, Abstentions 0)
- 3 (For 17, Against 95, Abstentions 0)
- 4 (For 17, Against 95, Abstentions 0)
- 13 (For 23, Against 89, Abstentions 0)
- 16 (For 17, Against 95, Abstentions 0)
- 5 (For 19, Against 93, Abstentions 0)
- 6 (For 18, Against 94, Abstentions 0)
- 7 (For 18, Against 93, Abstentions 0)
- 39 (For 5, Against 107, Abstentions 0)
- 19 (For 22, Against 87, Abstentions 0)
- 9 (For 13, Against 92, Abstentions 0)
- 40 (For 19, Against 91, Abstentions 0)
- 43 (For 30, Against 80, Abstentions 0)
- 48 (For 29, Against 80, Abstentions 0)
- 49 (For 30, Against 80, Abstentions 0)
- 25 (For 48, Against 62, Abstentions 0)
- 10 (For 18, Against 89, Abstentions 0)

Amendment 32 was moved and, with the agreement of the Parliament, withdrawn.

The following amendments were not moved: 34, 38, 17 and 8.

The following amendments were pre-empted: 12 and 37.

The Deputy Presiding Officer extended the fourth time-limit under Rule 9.8.4A(c).

**9. Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill - Stage 3:** The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning (Angela Constance) moved S4M-15838— That the Parliament agrees that the Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill be passed.

After debate, the motion was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 92, Against 17, Abstentions 0).

**10. Enterprise Bill - UK Legislation:** The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Constitution and Economy (John Swinney) moved S4M-15818—That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provision of the Enterprise Bill, introduced by amendment in the House of Commons on 2 February 2016, which relates to apprenticeships information sharing, so far as these matters fall within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament or alter the executive functions of the Scottish Ministers, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**11. Armed Forces Bill - UK Legislation:** The Cabinet Secretary for Justice (Michael Matheson) moved S4M-15761—That the Parliament agrees that the relevant provisions of the Armed Forces Bill, introduced to the House of Commons on 16 September 2015, relating to MOD firefighters, so far as this matter is within the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament, should be considered by the UK Parliament.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**12. Decision Time:** The Parliament took decisions on items 7, 9, 10 and 11 as noted above.

**13. Childcare Costs Spiralling in Scotland:** The Parliament debated S4M-15741 in the name of Cara Hilton—That the Parliament notes the annual childcare costs survey published by the Family and Childcare Trust; understands that the report provides the most comprehensive analysis of childcare costs and availability in Britain; is concerned at the finding that, while average childcare prices have risen only in line with inflation in the rest of the UK, with the cost of a part-time nursery place for a child under two up by 1.1%, in Scotland the price rose by 4.1%, with the average price of a part-time nursery place for a child under two and an after-school club for a five year old now costing £7,933 a year; is further concerned that, in Scotland, only 13% of local authority areas report having enough childcare for working parents and only 9% can provide childcare needed for disabled children and that the cost of childcare is rising at a significantly faster rate than anywhere else in the UK; welcomes the expansion of preschool early education and childcare in Dunfermline and across Scotland but recognises too what it considers the lack of

progress in ensuring that childcare is available that fits in with the lives of working parents and for children of all ages, and notes the calls of the Family and Childcare Trust for the Scottish Government to improve access and affordability for parents to ensure that parents and carers across Scotland have access to flexible, quality and affordable childcare for children of all ages.

The meeting closed at 7.52 pm.

**P E Grice**  
Clerk of the Parliament  
8 March 2016

**Appendix**  
**(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)**

**Other Documents**

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 4 March 2016 and is not subject to any parliamentary procedure

The Scottish Advisory Committee on Distinction Awards 2015 Annual Report:  
(SG/2016/21)

laid before the Scottish Parliament at the request of a member of the Scottish Government and not under any laying power.

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 8 March 2016 and are not subject to any parliamentary procedure

Scottish Information Commissioner Strategic Plan 2016-20 (SG/2016/24)  
laid before the Scottish Parliament under section 46A of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002

Standards Commission for Scotland: Strategic Plan 2016-2020  
(SCfS/2016/01)

laid before the Scottish Parliament under paragraph 10A to schedule 1 of the Ethical Standards in Public Life (Scotland) Act 2000 as amended by the Scottish Parliamentary Commission and Commissioners Act 2010

**Committee Reports**

The following reports were published on 8 March 2016—

Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 20<sup>th</sup> Report 2016 (Session 4): Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill as amended at Stage 2 (SP Paper 934)

Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 21<sup>st</sup> Report 2016 (Session 4): Subordinate Legislation (SP Paper 935)

Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 22<sup>nd</sup> Report 2016 (Session 4): Supplementary Legislative Consent Memorandum on the Scotland Bill (SP Paper 936)

Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 23<sup>rd</sup> Report 2016 (Session 4): Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Bill (SP Paper 937)



---

Published in Scotland by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.scottish.parliament.uk/documents](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000  
Textphone: 0800 092 7100  
Email: [sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk](mailto:sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk)

---

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - [www.scottish.parliament.uk](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk)  
or by contacting Public Information.