Financial Scrutiny Unit Briefing
EU nationals living in Scotland

03 November 2016

Nicola Hudson and Andrew Aiton

This briefing presents analysis of the characteristics of EU nationals living in Scotland, based on the 2015 Annual Population Survey. The briefing also reviews evidence relating to the economic contribution of migrants.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEFINITIONS USED</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COUNTRY OF BIRTH OR NATIONALITY?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW MANY EU NATIONALS ARE LIVING IN SCOTLAND?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW DOES SCOTLAND COMPARE TO THE UK?</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHERE HAS THE GROWTH IN THE SCOTTISH POPULATION COME FROM?</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHERE DO EU NATIONALS LIVE IN SCOTLAND?</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT IS THE AGE PROFILE OF THOSE FROM THE EU?</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW DOES THE ECONOMIC ACTIVITY OF EU NATIONALS COMPARE WITH THE SCOTTISH POPULATION AS A WHOLE?</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHICH SECTORS DO EU NATIONALS WORK IN?</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT TYPE OF JOBS DO EU NATIONALS HOLD?</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT QUALIFICATIONS DO EU NATIONALS HOLD?</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW MUCH DO EU NATIONALS EARN?</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW DOES THE PROFILE OF EU NATIONALS IN SCOTLAND COMPARE WITH THE UK?</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW MUCH DO EU NATIONALS CONTRIBUTE TO THE SCOTTISH ECONOMY?</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT IMPACT DO EU NATIONALS HAVE ON PUBLIC SERVICES IN SCOTLAND?</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNEXE</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Annual Population Survey</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationality definitions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOURCES</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- There are an estimated 181,000 EU nationals in Scotland; the majority (119,000 or 66%) are from EU accession nations
- Around half (86,000 or 47%) of the EU nationals resident in Scotland are Polish
- EU nationals make up 3.4% of the Scottish population compared to 4.9% in the UK as a whole
- Half of the net increase in the Scottish population between 2000 and 2015 has come from people born in EU countries.
- 80% of EU nationals in Scotland are of working age, compared to 65% of the Scottish population as a whole
- More than half (58%) of the EU nationals in Scotland are living in the cities of Edinburgh, Glasgow, Aberdeen and Dundee
- Those from EU accession countries have a higher employment rate than both other EU nationals and UK nationals in Scotland
- Around a third of EU nationals in employment in Scotland are working in the distribution, hotels and restaurant sector
- 20,000 EU nationals are working in accommodation and food services, and account for more than one in ten of all those working in this sub-sector
- The health and social work sector employs 12,000 EU nationals, accounting for 3% of total employment in this sector
- A fifth (20%) of EU nationals working in Scotland are managers, directors, senior officials or in other professional occupations; around a third (31%) are in unskilled 'elementary' occupations.
- Although they are more likely than UK nationals to hold degree level qualifications, around a quarter of EU nationals with degree level qualifications are working in unskilled occupations, compared to only 3% across the working age population of Scotland as a whole.
- EU nationals are, on average, earning less than Scottish employees (£8.60 per hour for EU nationals compared to £11.10 per hour for all employees in Scotland)
INTRODUCTION

This paper presents analysis of the characteristics of EU nationals in Scotland, based on the 2015 Annual Population Survey (APS). The analysis looks at individuals according to their stated nationality.¹

DEFINITIONS USED

Throughout this paper, the following definitions are used:

- **EU27**: all EU member states excluding the UK
- **EU14**: Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Portugal, Spain and Sweden
- **Accession**: Croatia, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, Slovak Republic, Slovenia, Romania and Bulgaria²

Further details of definitions used and of the APS can be found in the Annex.

COUNTRY OF BIRTH OR NATIONALITY?

Unless otherwise stated, the analysis in this paper is based on nationality rather than country of birth. This is because nationality is the criterion that determines eligibility for freedom of movement across the EU. In the APS, respondents self-report their nationality. Where respondents have dual nationality, the first one is recorded.

Country of birth and nationality will not always be the same. Nationality can change but country of birth cannot. There are 393,000 people in Scotland who were born outside the UK, representing 7.4% of the total population. Meanwhile, there are an estimated 295,000 people with non-UK nationality in Scotland (5.6% of the Scottish population). As noted by the Office for National Statistics (ONS), there is an incentive for non-EU nationals to acquire British nationality in order to benefit from membership of the EU (ONS, 2016). The same incentive does not exist for those who are already EU nationals. Figure 1 shows data according to both country of birth and nationality.

The Scottish Government has published detailed analysis of the Scottish population by country of birth, based on 2011 Census data (Scottish Government, 2016a). Their analysis also considers those born elsewhere in the UK and living in Scotland.

---

¹ For details of nationality definitions, see Annex
² Cyprus, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, Slovak Republic, Slovenia joined in 2004; Romania and Bulgaria joined in 2007 and Croatia joined in 2013
HOW MANY EU NATIONALS ARE LIVING IN SCOTLAND?

Of the 295,000 resident in Scotland with non-UK nationality, 181,000 (61%) are nationals of another EU country. The majority of these EU nationals (119,000 or 66%) are from EU accession nations. There were 113,000 non-EU nationals in Scotland in 2015.

Due to the sample size of the APS, it is not possible to provide a full breakdown of the non-UK nationals in Scotland as small estimates are not deemed to be sufficiently reliable. Figure 2 shows nationalities for those countries where the number resident in Scotland is estimated to be greater than 5,000.

By far, the single biggest group of EU nationals resident in Scotland is Polish nationals. There are an estimated 86,000 Polish nationals resident in Scotland, representing just under half (47%) of the EU nationals resident in Scotland. The next biggest grouping is Irish nationals
(16,000 or 9% of EU nationals in Scotland). In the APS, only one nationality is recorded, so those with dual nationality will only be recorded against the first nationality that they mention.

HOW DOES SCOTLAND COMPARE TO THE UK?

Scotland has a lower proportion of non-UK nationals than the UK as a whole. In Scotland, 5.6% of the population are non-UK nationals compared to 8.7% across the UK as a whole. EU27 nationals make up 3.4% of the Scottish population compared to 4.9% in the UK as a whole.

Figure 3: Scottish and UK populations by nationality, 2015

![Figure 3: Scottish and UK populations by nationality, 2015](image)

Source: SPICe analysis of ONS (2016)

WHERE HAS THE GROWTH IN THE SCOTTISH POPULATION COME FROM?

As a person’s country of birth will not change, but nationality can, country of birth statistics provide a better basis for looking at how the migrant population of Scotland has changed over time.3

Between 2000 and 2015, Scotland’s population increased by 283,000 which represents a 5.7% increase. Those born outside the UK accounted for the majority (86%) of this net increase. Over this period, the number of people born outside the UK living in Scotland has increased by 152% from 156,000 to 393,000. This compares with a 94% increase for the UK as a whole.

---

3 The figures presented in this section relate to population estimates from the Annual Population Survey; see Annex for definitions and coverage
In the UK as a whole, the growth in the population has been driven in equal measure by those born in the UK, EU and non-EU countries. By contrast, in Scotland, the population growth has been driven more strongly by EU net migration, with 50% of the net population growth accounted for by EU-born individuals. This is a higher proportion than in the UK as a whole, where those born in the EU accounted for only a third (32%) of the net increase over this period.

Figure 5 shows how the non-UK born population in Scotland has changed between 2000 and 2015. In 2003, ahead of the 2004 EU enlargement, the non-UK EU born population made up 29% of the non-UK born population; by 2015 it made up 48%. Much of this net increase appears to be the result of the expansion of the EU with 112,000 people born in accession countries living in Scotland in 2015.
WHERE DO EU NATIONALS LIVE IN SCOTLAND?

The sample size of the APS means that it is not possible to provide reliable estimates of the number of EU nationals living in each local authority in Scotland. Estimates can only be provided for those areas with larger numbers of residents with EU nationality.

There are four local authorities with more than 10,000 residents with EU nationality:

- City of Edinburgh – 39,000 EU nationals (8% of population)
- City of Glasgow – 31,000 EU nationals (5% of population)
- Aberdeen City – 25,000 EU nationals (11% of population)
- Dundee City – 10,000 EU nationals (7% of population)

Figure 6: Number of EU nationals in Scotland’s four biggest cities - 2015

Together, these four local authorities are home to 104,000 EU nationals, representing 58% of all EU nationals in Scotland. In all of these four local authorities, EU nationals account for an above-average share of the population (across Scotland as a whole, 3% of the population has EU nationality).

EU nationals are more likely to be resident in urban areas in Scotland. Across Scotland as a whole, 83% of the population is resident in urban areas. However, the proportion is higher for EU nationals, with 94% of EU nationals resident in urban areas in 2015 (Scottish Government, 2016b).

WHAT IS THE AGE PROFILE OF THOSE FROM THE EU?

The age profile of EU nationals in Scotland is quite different from that of the Scottish population as a whole (Figure 7). Just over half (57%) of EU nationals in Scotland are aged 25-49, compared with only a third (33%) across the Scottish population as a whole. Only 4% of EU nationals in Scotland are aged 65+ compared with 18% of the Scottish population as a whole.

Figure 7: Age profile of Scottish population by nationality, 2015

---

4 According to the Scottish Government’s urban-rural classification
There are also differences between different categories of EU nationals. Comparing the EU14 nationals with those from accession countries, the proportion aged 25-49 is the same for both groups (58%). However, there are proportionally fewer younger EU14 nationals: only 9% of EU14 nationals are under 16, compared with a fifth (20%) of those from accession countries. By contrast, 21% of EU14 nationals in Scotland are aged 50+, compared with only 6% of those from accession countries.

The younger age profile of the migrants has been seen as a positive factor for countries facing the challenges of an ageing population. The Oxford Institute of Population Ageing commented that:

“Migration has a potentially strong and long-lasting impact on population growth and structure through the interaction between the number of migrants, their relatively young age structure and their higher fertility. As a result, immigration has increasingly become perceived as a potential means to prevent population decline, maintain the size of the labour force and thus the support ratio, and slow down structural population ageing.

In terms of population size, while migration will not prevent the age-structural transition and demographic deficit of Europe, it will alleviate it." (Oxford Institute of Population Ageing, 2016)

In a recent study of the economic and demographic consequences of large-scale migration for the UK, Rowthorn commented that:

“The economic gains from large-scale immigration come mainly from its impact on the age structure of the population.”

However, he also noted that most of these gains could be achieved with a much lower rate of net migration than the UK is currently experiencing (Rowthorn, 2015). Furthermore, he noted that their net contribution would depend on the jobs they are able to get and whether they displace UK-born workers from the workforce.
HOW DOES THE ECONOMIC ACTIVITY OF EU NATIONALS COMPARE WITH THE SCOTTISH POPULATION AS A WHOLE?

The employment rate is the number in employment expressed as a percentage of the population. Figure 8 shows the employment rate for different nationality groupings for the population aged 16-64.

For the Scottish population of this age as a whole, the employment rate is 73.1%. Overall, EU nationals have a higher employment rate (78.9%). However, the picture is very different within this group: EU14 nationals have a much lower employment rate (68.0%), while those from accession countries have a much higher employment rate (84.9%). Non-EU nationals have the lowest employment rate of all the groups shown.

Figure 8: Employment rate by nationality (population aged 16-64), Scotland 2015

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS

The unemployment rate expresses the number unemployed as a percentage of the economically active population. Figure 9 shows unemployment rates for those of working age. EU nationals have an unemployment rate of 5.8% which is in line with the Scottish average of 5.9%. Non-EU nationals have a much higher unemployment rate (11.4%). Due to small sample sizes, it is not possible to provide reliable unemployment rate estimates for groups within the EU total.

Figure 9: Unemployment rate by nationality (population aged 16-64), Scotland 2015

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS

---

5 Economically active refers to those who are either in work, or out of work but actively seeking and available for work
6 Throughout this briefing, the term ‘working age’ refers to those aged 16-64
WHICH SECTORS DO EU NATIONALS WORK IN?

There are an estimated 115,000 EU nationals in employment in Scotland, representing 4% of the Scottish workforce in employment. Around a third (36,000) of these are from EU14 countries, with the remaining two-thirds (79,000) from accession countries.

Almost a third of EU nationals in employment in Scotland (33,000) are working in the distribution, hotels and restaurant sector. Figure 10 shows a breakdown by industrial sector of EU nationals in employment. The agriculture, forestry and fishing sector is not shown as the estimate is too small to be considered statistically robust. In addition, the seasonal and often casual nature of work in this sector may not be well reflected in the APS.

Figure 10: Employment of EU nationals by industry, Scotland 2015

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS

For the larger sectors, it is possible to provide a further split between EU14 and accession countries and this is shown in Figure 11. However, this is not possible for all sectors due to the sample sizes involved and the reliability of smaller estimates.

Figure 11: Employment of EU nationals in selected industries, Scotland 2015 (000s)

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS
Within the distribution, hotels and restaurants sector, the main area of employment is accommodation and food services, which employs 20,000 EU nationals. In this sub-sector, EU nationals represent 12% of all those in employment. The majority of the 20,000 working in accommodation and food services are from EU accession countries (15,000 of the total).

In the public administration, education and health sector, the largest area of employment is health and social work, which employs 12,000 EU nationals. However, because this sector is a large employer, EU nationals only account for 3% of total employment in this sector. Again, the majority of EU nationals working in this sector are from EU accession countries (8,000 of the total).

Research published by the Scottish Government notes that:

“Migrants, particularly recent EEA migrants, tend to be concentrated in hospitality and catering; in agriculture; and in food processing sectors. In general, migrants meet demand for low-skilled labour, and address sector-specific skills shortages at the higher end of the labour market. In addition, migrants act as a flexible supply of labour when demand exceeds local labour supply. However, in sectors such as agriculture, where employers find it difficult to source labour regardless of prevailing economic conditions, demand for seasonal migrant labour remains more constant.” (Scottish Government, 2016c)

WHAT TYPE OF JOBS DO EU NATIONALS HOLD?

The occupational profile of EU nationals working in Scotland differs from the overall pattern, as shown in Figure 12. EU nationals are less likely to be in managerial and professional occupations, but are more likely to be working in ‘elementary occupations’ which would include unskilled agricultural workers, unskilled construction workers, hospital and kitchen porters and cleaners.
In total, around a third of EU nationals in employment are working in jobs classified as elementary occupations (31% or 35,000). The majority of these workers (30,000) are from EU accession countries. They represent 12% of all those working in these occupations.

**WHAT QUALIFICATIONS DO EU NATIONALS HOLD?**

EU nationals are more likely to hold higher level qualifications than the Scottish working age population as a whole. Of EU nationals resident in Scotland, just over a third (35%) hold a degree level qualification or higher. By comparison, only around a quarter (26%) of UK nationals in Scotland are qualified to this level. There is a difference between those from EU14 countries and those from other EU countries. Of EU14 nationals in Scotland, more than half (54%) hold a degree level qualification or higher, compared to a quarter (24%) of those from other EU countries, similar to the proportion for UK nationals.

Just under a tenth (8%) of EU nationals have no qualifications, which is similar to the proportion seen across the working age population as a whole.

Research published by the Scottish Government notes that:

> “…qualifications are often not fully recognised or utilised in host countries and some migrants with higher level qualifications are working in jobs of low skill and minimum wage rates. At the UK level, there is some evidence that qualification/occupation mismatches are associated with country of origin, with migrants from countries that joined the EU from 2004 onwards doing less well than those from Northern Europe.” (Scottish Government, 2016c)

The Centre for Research & Analysis of Migration (CReAM) also notes that:

7 All figures relate to the population aged 16-64
“In the UK, research is suggestive that recently arrived immigrants, though typically highly qualified relative to British born workers, tend to work in jobs at lower wages than might be expected based on their qualifications.” (CReAM, 2014)

The APS data show that, of the EU nationals in employment in Scotland with qualifications of degree level or higher:

- 40% are working as managers, directors, senior officials or in other professional occupations. This compares with 59% across the Scottish working age population as a whole.

- A quarter (25%) are working in ‘elementary occupations’. The equivalent figure for the Scottish working age population as a whole is only 3%.

**HOW MUCH DO EU NATIONALS EARN?**

Table 1 shows average hourly earnings by nationality. Hourly pay is shown so that averages are not affected by the mix of full-time and part-time employees. The analysis shows that EU nationals are, on average, earning less than Scottish employees in general. The overall Scottish average is £11.10 per hour, compared to £8.60 for EU nationals working in Scotland.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Median hourly pay (£)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>11.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>8.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-EU</td>
<td>13.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11.10</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS

In its review of evidence relating to migration in Scotland, the Scottish Government noted that:

“Migration does not appear to have had a statistically significant impact on the average wages and employment opportunities of the UK-born population in periods when the economy is strong, although there is some evidence of labour market displacement when the economy is in recession. The available evidence indicates that any adverse wage effects of migration are likely to be greatest for resident workers who are themselves migrants. Evidence also suggests that displacement effects dissipate over time, as the labour market adjusts.” (Scottish Government, 2016c)

The Centre for Research & Analysis of Migration (CReAM) also notes that:

“The effects on wages may be different for different types of workers; those with whom immigrants compete most strongly may find wages depressed while others may find their productivity enhanced by working with new immigrants and therefore see their wages rise….It is by no means obvious that the effect of immigration needs to work through changes in wages. Economies can adjust to absorb increases in labour through mechanisms other than wage adjustments.” (CReAM, 2014)
HOW DOES THE PROFILE OF EU NATIONALS IN SCOTLAND COMPARE WITH THE UK?

Table 2 sets out some key characteristics of EU nationals in Scotland and compares these with the equivalent indicators for EU nationals in the UK as a whole.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
<th>UK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EU nationals as % of population</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% aged 16-64</td>
<td>79.8</td>
<td>75.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic activity rate (%)</td>
<td>83.8</td>
<td>83.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment rate (%)</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td>79.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate (%)</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median hourly earnings (£)</td>
<td>8.60</td>
<td>9.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPICe analysis of APS Jan-Dec 2015, ONS

In summary:

- EU nationals represent a smaller proportion of the Scottish population than the UK population
- A higher proportion of EU nationals in Scotland are of working age
- EU nationals in Scotland show similar characteristics in terms of economic activity
- EU nationals in Scotland are, on average, paid less than EU nationals across the UK as a whole

HOW MUCH DO EU NATIONALS CONTRIBUTE TO THE SCOTTISH ECONOMY?

Calculating the economic contribution of EU nationals is complex and relies on detailed research and analysis that is beyond the scope of this paper. Indeed, even defining what is meant by ‘economic contribution’ is not straightforward and can be interpreted in a number of ways. This section focuses on the fiscal contribution made by migrants i.e. the balance between the amount migrants contribute to public finances in taxes and other contributions, less the costs of the public benefits and services they receive.

A number of studies have looked at the ‘net fiscal contribution’ of EU migration on the UK economy as a whole, but as yet no similar research has been conducted for Scotland. The UK-based research studies have reached different conclusions and the estimates range widely from positive to negative impacts, depending on the methodology used, the assumptions made and the time periods considered. Findings differ in part because the results depend heavily on the assumptions made, particularly in respect of:

- how migration affects the costs of providing public services and what impacts it has on economic growth and unemployment
- which costs to attribute to migrants, such as the costs of educating the UK-born children of migrants, or the cost of things like defence spending that do not depend on the size of the migrant population
whether to take a snapshot of the fiscal impact in a given year or period based on historical data (the ‘static approach’), or attempt to consider impacts over migrants’ entire lifetimes.

Source: The Migration Observatory (2015)

In a summary of research studies on the fiscal impact of immigration, the Migration Observatory concluded that:

“The evidence suggests that the fiscal impact of migration in the UK is small (+/-1% of GDP) and differs by migrant group.” (Migration Observatory, 2015)

If these findings applied equally to Scotland, this would imply a net fiscal impact of between £1.6bn and +£1.6bn based on 2015-16 Scottish GDP. However, the fact that there is no conclusive evidence as to whether the overall effect is positive or negative limits the usefulness of the findings.

Research that has distinguished between the fiscal impact of migrants from different countries has typically concluded that the contribution of European Economic Area (EEA) migrants is more positive (or less negative) than that of non-EEA migrants. Table 3 summarises the UK results from a range of studies, highlighting the range of results and the lack of a consensus on the scale (or direction) of the contribution.

Table 3: Summary of research findings on the fiscal effects of immigration on the UK, £bn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All migrants</td>
<td>Recent migrants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>Non-EEA</td>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>Non-EEA</td>
<td>EEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-2011</td>
<td>+8.8</td>
<td>-104.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011</td>
<td>+9.0</td>
<td>-86.8</td>
<td>+22.1</td>
<td>+2.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-2011</td>
<td>+4.4</td>
<td>-118.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011</td>
<td></td>
<td>+5.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011 (A10 countries)</td>
<td></td>
<td>+4.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011 (Rest of EEA)</td>
<td></td>
<td>+15.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-2011</td>
<td>-13.6</td>
<td>-134.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011</td>
<td>-13.4</td>
<td>-116.8</td>
<td>-0.25</td>
<td>-27.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>-1.2</td>
<td>-15.6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-6.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2011</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>-29.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The Migration Observatory, The Fiscal Impact of Immigration in the UK

An assessment relating specifically to Scotland would need to take account of the characteristics of the Scottish migrant population which will differ from the UK migrant population.

---

8 Government Expenditure and Revenue Scotland 2015-16, table A.3 (including geographical share of North Sea)
9 In addition to EU countries, the EEA includes Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway
population as a whole. However, the bigger challenge is in deciding on the underlying assumptions to adopt. This includes factors such as:

- how migrants use public services and whether these patterns differ from the wider population
- how to treat the children of migrants (and their associated costs), especially where only one of the parents is a migrant
- how to apportion spending in areas such as defence, which is not directly linked to the size of the population

As the findings set out above highlight, these assumptions have a significant bearing on the final results.

**WHAT IMPACT DO EU NATIONALS HAVE ON PUBLIC SERVICES IN SCOTLAND?**

The Scottish Government has recently published a detailed review of available evidence (both UK and Scottish) on the impact of migration on Scotland (Scottish Government, 2016c). This covers a wider range of impacts, including the impact on public services, such as housing and education. It notes that there is limited evidence in relation to migrants’ use of public services or their contribution to the provision of public services. Much of the available research relates to the UK as a whole and often relates to migration in general rather than specifically to EU migration. Despite these limitations, some findings are presented including:

- **UK-wide analysis** suggests that the share of expenditure on state education and public services accounted for by migrants (12.5%) is broadly in line with their share of the population (13%).

- **There is evidence** that migrants from the European Economic Area (EEA) are less likely to claim out-of-work benefits, but more likely to claim in-work benefits, compared with people born in the UK.

- **Migrants from outside the UK are, in general, young and have low healthcare needs.** Consequently, there is little evidence of increased demand for health services resulting from migration into Scotland.

- **Recent migrants** are less likely than the UK-born population to be accommodated in the social housing sector.
ANNEXE

The Annual Population Survey

The Annual Population Survey (APS) combines results from the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the English, Welsh and Scottish LFS boosts. The LFS is a household survey of people in the UK. It includes those deemed resident at private addresses, so covers students in halls of residence with parents resident in the UK. However, it does not cover most communal establishments. Its purpose is to provide information on the UK labour market but it includes data on a variety of other variables such as country of birth and nationality.

The inclusion of boosts in the APS increases the size of the sample, meaning that more reliable estimates can be provided for small areas and groups of the population. APS datasets are produced quarterly with each dataset containing 12 months of data. There are approximately 320,000 persons per dataset.

The LFS excludes most communal establishments although it does cover most staff resident in National Health Service accommodation. Students in halls of residence are covered by proxy through their parents and thus foreign students living in halls of residence are not likely to be covered – though those living in private households will be. The impact of this coverage of communal establishments is that the number of foreign born migrants may be under-reported.

Nationality definitions

The following definitions of nationality have been used in this briefing:

**UK/British:** Includes the following overseas territories:
- Anguilla
- Bermuda
- British Indian Ocean Territory
- British Virgin Islands
- Cayman Islands
- Falkland Islands
- Gibraltar
- Montserrat
- Pitcairn, Henderson, Ducie and Oeno Islands
- South Georgia and the South Sandwich Islands
- St Helena
- Turks and Caicos Islands

**Cyprus** includes Cyprus (European Union) and Cyprus (not otherwise specified).

**Czech Republic** includes Czechoslovakia (not otherwise specified).

**Denmark** includes Faroe Islands and Greenland (nationality only).

**Finland** includes Aland Islands.

**France** includes French Guiana, French Southern Territories, Guadeloupe, Martinique, Mayotte, Reunion and St. Martin. French nationality additionally includes French Polynesia, New Caledonia, St. Pierre and Miquelon, and Wallis and Futuna.

**Spain** includes Canary Islands and Spain (not otherwise specified).
SOURCES

Centre for Research and Analysis of Migration (2014), *What do we know about migration?* [Accessed 01.11.16]


Oxford Institute of Population Ageing (2016), *Brexit and the Role of Migration for an Ageing UK*. Available at: [http://www.ageing.ox.ac.uk/blog/2016-Brexit-and-migration-ageing-BLOG](http://www.ageing.ox.ac.uk/blog/2016-Brexit-and-migration-ageing-BLOG) [Accessed 02.11.16]


Scottish Government (2016b), personal communication

Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe) Briefings are compiled for the benefit of the Members of the Parliament and their personal staff. Authors are available to discuss the contents of these papers with MSPs and their staff who should contact Nicola Hudson on extension 85458 or email nicola.hudson@parliament.scot. Members of the public or external organisations may comment on this briefing by emailing us at SPICe@parliament.scot. However, researchers are unable to enter into personal discussion in relation to SPICe Briefing Papers. If you have any general questions about the work of the Parliament you can email the Parliament’s Public Information Service at sp.info@parliament.scot.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in SPICe briefings is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware however that briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Published by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe), The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH 99 1SP

www.parliament.scot