Critical Comparison of Two Modern Architectural Projects

The Scottish Parliament, designed by Enric Miralles is one of the most significant architectural projects in Scotland in recent years. Other notable architectural projects which have been completed in Europe in the past ten years include Maggie’s Centre in Dundee, The Museum of Scotland in Edinburgh, The Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao and The Reichstag in Berlin.

Make a study in the form of an illustrated essay to compare and contrast the Scottish Parliament with another piece of architecture completed in the past decade.

• Begin by visiting the Parliament to take photographs and make drawings. Make a detailed description of the building, concentrating on the features/details that most interest you. You can also access many images of the parliament on the Scottish Parliament website www.scottish.parliament.uk/nmCentre/images/latest/index.htm

• Then make a similar study of the building that you wish to compare with the parliament. Again, describe the building in detail, collect photographs and make drawings. Here are some ideas:
  o The Reichstag in Berlin by Sir Norman Foster – www.fosterandpartners.com
  o Maggie’s Centre in Dundee by Frank Gehry – www.maggiescentres.org
  o The Museum of Scotland by Benson and Forsyth – www.nms.ac.uk/Scotland/visiting/building.asp?m=2
  o The Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao by Frank Gehry – www.guggenheim-bilbao.es

• Think about the similarities and differences in shape, form, line, colour, and texture. Consider the sources of inspiration for the design of each building and their social aims and context. What effect does the space have on the viewer? Is it overwhelming, constricting, quiet? How do these buildings fit into their sites? Do the materials used reflect or contrast with their surroundings?

• In your conclusion, say which building you prefer. Give reasons.

• Remember to include a bibliography of all the books, web sites and any other sources you have used.