

# CROSS PARTY GROUP on ARCHITECTURE and the BUILT ENVIRONMENT

## Notes of Meeting

“After Grenfell”

**Meeting on 21<sup>st</sup> September 2017, 6pm  
Committee Room 1  
The Scottish Parliament**

**Present:**

<b>Title</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Surname</b>	<b>Organisation</b>
Mr	Scott	Aitken	Scottish Parliament
Mr	Dave	Aitken	LABSS
Mr	Nick	Allan	RICS
Mrs	Marjorie	Appleton	RIAS
Mr	Keith	Baker	Glasgow Caledonian University
Mr	Neil	Baxter	RIAS
Mr	Colin	Campbell	Scottish Futures Trust
Mr	Donald	Canavan	Speaker - Hurd Rolland Partnership
Mr	Fraser	Carlin	Renfrewshire Council
Ms	Valérie	Decker	RIAS
Ms	Linda	Fabiani	MSP
Mr	Gordon	Gray	RIBA Enterprises
Mr	Nick	Groves-Raines	Groves-Raines Architects
Mr	Andrew	Haley	MAG Chair
Mr	Thomas	Hamilton	Hoskins Architects
Mr	Robin	Harper	
Mr	Vaughan	Hart	Speaker - Scottish Building Federation
Mr	Stewart	Henderson	RIAS
Ms	Carol-Ann	Hildersley	RIAS
Mr	Sandy	Killbourn	Speaker - Gartcarron Fire Engineering
Mr	Angus	Law	BRE Centre for Fire Safety Engineering
Mr	Euan	Leitch	BEFS
Ms	Sharon	Lobban	Avesta Group
Ms	Ailsa	Macfarlane	BEFS
Mr	Alan	Maxwell	President - Property Managers Association
Mr	Rick	McCluggage	Smith Scott Mullan Associates
Mr	Sean	McClure	Avesta Group
Ms	Alison	McDiarmid	CEO - Property Managers Association
Mr	Robert	McDowell	SURF
Mr	Ian	McKee	RICS and GLM
Mr	John	McKinnes	FSS Ltd.
Mr	Sean	McLaughlin	MAST Architects
Mr	Kevin	Murray	Kevin Murray Associates

Ms	Ann	Packard	
Mr	Bill	Pagan	BEFS
Ms	Courtney	Peyton	Changeworks
Mr	John Paul	Rennie	East Dunbartonshire Council
Mr	Derek	Richardson	Edinburgh Council
Mr	Steven	Robb	Historic Environment Scotland
Mr	Liam	Ross	Edinburgh University
Mr	David	Stewart	Scottish Federation of Housing Associations
Ms	Sara	Thiam	ICE
Mr	Andrew	Wightman	MSP
Mr	Tom	Young	

### Apologies:

Title	First Name	Surname	Organisation
Mr	Matt	Bridgestock	55 North Architecture
Ms	Natalie	Butler	Edinburgh Council
Mr	Tony	Cain	ALACHO
Ms	Jocelyn	Cunliffe	Gray, Marshall & Associates
Ms	Katy	Dickson	Scottish Land and Estates
Ms	Kelly	Forbes	ICE
Ms	Jean	Fourie	Building Services Consultant
Ms	Julia	Frost	PAS
Mr	Robert	Gray	Aberdeenshire Council
Mr	Alastair	Hackland	Hackland & Dore
Ms	Gill	Henry	Cruden Homes
Mr	Jonny	Hughes	Scottish Wildlife Trust
Ms	Lara	Kinneir	Lara Kinneir
Mr	John	Lawson	Edinburgh Council
Ms	Gloria	Lo	Oisa Designs
Mr	David	MacDonald	Scottish Futures Trust
Mr	Frazer	MacDonald Hay	Uniform November
Mr	Ingval	Maxwell	
Ms	Gillian	McCarney	East Renfrewshire Council
Ms	Suzanne	McIntosh	
Mr	Martin	McKay	Clyde Gateway
Mr	Craig	McLaren	RTPI
Ms	Pauline	McNeill	MSP
Mr	Andy	Milne	SURF
Mr	Eugene	Mullan	Smith Scott Mullan Associates
Mr	John	Pelan	Scottish Civic Trust
Mr	Colin	Proctor	Scottish Futures Trust
Mr	Peter	Riddoch	
Mr	Tavish	Scott	MSP
Mr	James	Simpson	Simpson and Brown
Ms	Karen	Stevenson	RIAS
Mr	Charles	Strang	
Mr	Myles	Thompson	aecom
Mr	Keith	Winter	Fife Council
Mr	Sinclair	Young	Edinburgh Council

## **Welcome**

Ms Fabiani welcomed the speakers and all those in attendance.

### **1. Sandy Killbourn, Managing Director, Gartcarron Fire Engineering**

Sandy Killbourn outlined his 14 years in fire safety consultancy and his degree in fire risk engineering, in addition to his long experience as a fire officer. He posed the simple question: Grenfell - what went wrong? He alluded to 10 other major tower block fires including:

1. Shanghai - where traditional bamboo scaffold and plastic protection has, predictably resulted in major fires and
2. Baku, Azerbaijan

Is there an inherent risk in high rise? 0.7% of fire deaths occur in standard dwellings and 0.5% in high rise fires.

Regarding procurement, questions arise on supervision of work/competency - the current review of fire safety and regulations is understandable.

Fire testing regime will change - UK regulations need to change.

### **2. Vaughan Hart, Managing Director, Scottish Building Federation**

Vaughan Hart spoke from the business modelling perspective.

He alluded to redundancy and 'outsourcing' since 2008 and asked if craft training is fit for purpose.

The cultural approach in the construction industry is survival mode.

Indenture model in Scotland is unique but being eroded.

Lack of management capability is a real issue as is the balancing of health and safety vs production vs quality.

Huge growth of outsourcing - reduction of core responsibility.

Need to manage employee competency.

He concluded that a return to a direct employment model would only be beneficial.

### **3. Donald Canavan, Architect and Expert Witness, Hurd Rolland**

Are the quality issues raised by Edinburgh schools and Grenfell exceptions or the rule?

Reduction in fees - how does this affect performance?

Fees decreasing = risks increasing.

Converging path - something needs to give.

Fragmentation of overview role.

It is ironic that Government's urge towards 'single point responsibility' has resulted in fragmentation.

Cost/quality/time dynamic - if controlled by architects = better buildings.

Best value - Government should take the lead.

Politicians are the first architects of change.

BRE - should be brought back into Government.

### **4. Discussion**

A lively discussion followed with general agreement around the need for improved site supervision.

There was also some discussion around the specific issues of retrofitting. The loss of clear lines of responsibility was real cause for concern. There was also some dissent from the notion of putting the architect back in charge - given the technical complexity of some sub-contracted design packages. However there was consensus that the current system has contributed to failures and must be revisited.

### **5. Date of Next Meeting**

14<sup>th</sup> November 2017 - 6pm, Committee Room 4 - Topic: "Brexit"

The Group is supported by:-

**Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland**

**Royal Town Planning Institute**